

RECEIVED

Sep 12 2022

SC Court of Appeals

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA

In the Court of Appeals

APPEAL FROM RICHLAND COUNTY

Court of Common Pleas

The Honorable Doyet A. Early, III, Circuit Judge

Appellate Case No.: 2021-000518

Adele J. Pope.....Appellant,

v.

Alan Wilson, in his capacity as Attorney General of South Carolina.....Respondent.

**Record on Appeal
Volume I (Pages 1-474)**

Adam T. Silvernail
Law Office of Adam T. Silvernail, LLC
Post Office Box 7995
Columbia, South Carolina 29202-7995
Telephone: (803) 779-1770

Attorney for Appellant

Alan Wilson, Attorney General
Robert D. Cook, Solicitor General
J. Emory Smith, Jr., Deputy Solicitor
General
Post Office Box 11549
Columbia, South Carolina 29211-1549
Telephone (803) 734-3596

*Attorneys for Respondent
Attorney General of South Carolina*

INDEX

VOLUME I (pp. 1- 474)

I. ORDERS

Order of Hon. Marc Westbrook , *Lominack v. Meyers*, 2002-1889, Oct. 25, 2002.....*See* 518
Order of Hon. Casey Manning Denying Motion to Change Venue, Richland County
Case No. 2010-CP-40-4900 (Richland 4900), Nov.9, 2010..... ***See* 600**
Order, of Hon. Frank Addy, Nov. 22, 2011 (FOIA 1¹).....1
Form 4 Order of Hon. Frank Addy, Jan. 11, 2012 (Venue to Richland Cty.).....10
Order of Hon. Casey Manning, (Continue, Richland 4900, FOIA 1 and
FOIA 2²), July 5, 2012..... 12
Order of Hon. Eugene Griffith, *Summer v. Wilson*, July 8, 2014.....***See* 728**
Order, South Carolina Supreme Ct. Assigning R4900 & FOIA 1, Mar. 24, 2016.....15
Order of Hon. Doyet Early, June 14, 2016 (Dismissal).....16
Order of Hon. Doyet Early, June 20, 2016 (Dismissal, Legacy Trust)19
Form 4 Order of the Hon. Doyet Early, July 22, 2016 (Deny. Reconsid. of Dismiss).....22
Decision of Court of Appeals, June 19, 2019.....24
Order of Court of Appeals, August 22, 2019 (Denying Rehearing).....32
Order of Supreme Court, April 1, 2020 (Denying Cert).....33
Order of the Hon. Clifton Newman, May 14, 202034
Order of the Hon. Clifton Newman, April 1, 2021.....36
Order of the Hon. Clifton Newman, (Deny. Mot. Alt., Am., April 23, 2021).....41

II. PLEADINGS AND MOTIONS

Complaint, August 3, 2011, with Exhibits..... 43
Exhibit A: FOIA request (Attorney General), June 30, 2011.....52
Exhibit B: FOIA request (Legacy Trust), dtd. June 30, 2011.....54
Exhibit C: Statement from Attorney General, dtd. October 2, 2009.....56
Exhibit D: Affidavit of Pope Supp. Prod.of Fee Contract, etc., Aug. 1, 2011.....59
Exhibit A: Pinnacle Prospectus.....71

¹ FOIA 2 is Richland County Case No. 2010-CP-40-4900 (FOIA portion), formerly Newberry County Case No. 2011-CP-32-379, filed August 10, 2010.

² FOIA 1, this case, refers to Richland County Case 2012-CP-40-350, formerly Newberry County Case 2011-CP-32-00364, filed August 3, 2010.

Exhibit B: Witness Lists (Richland 4900), Nov. 12, 2010.....	73
Exhibit C: Ltr. of Black to Pope, July 15, 2011.....	75
Exhibit E: Ltr. of Black to Pope, July 15, 2011.....	78
Motion of AG to Dismiss/Strike September 6, 2011.....	80
Exhibit A: Order Deny. Mot. Change, Venue, (R. 4900), Nov. 9, 2010.....	84
Exhibit B: Mot. (Buchanan/Pope) to Compel Disc., (R.4900), June 7, 2011.....	91
Exhibit C: Pl. Mot. for Prot. Order, (Richland 4900), July 1, 2011.....	97
Exhibit D: Ltr. Silvernail to Gende, re: R.4900 Discovery, June 15, 2011.....	101
Exhibit E: Ltr. of Gende to Silvernail, re: R. 4900 Discovery, June 17, 2011.....	103
Plaintiff's Return to Mot. of Defendant James Brown Legacy Trust to Dismiss, Sept. 12, 2011.....	106
Motion of Attorney General to Strike, September 14, 2011.....	110
Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment, September 21, 2011 w/ Exhibits.....	112
Exhibit A: <i>Wilson, Loftis spar over hiring law firms</i>	116
Exhibit B: <i>AG's Promise to release contracts may resolve Newberry James Brown FOIA case, <u>The Observer</u>, Sept. 21, 2011.....</i>	118
Motion of Attorney General to Strike, September 27, 2011.....	121
Motion of Attorney General to Strike or Exclude, October 13, 2011.....	123
Motion to Strike (Legacy Trust) October 18, 2011.....	125
Mot. of AG to Strike/Exclude Additional Affidavits, Jan. 9, 2012	126
Motion of Attorney General to Consolidate, Richland 4900 & FOIA, Feb.1, 2012.....	128
Exhibit A-1: Form 4 Order, Hon. Frank Addy (Venue), Jan.11, 2012.....	132
Exhibit A-2 Order, Hon. Frank Addy, Nov. 22, 2011.....	135
Exhibit B: Mot. to Compel Discovery, Richland 4900, June 7, 2011.....	145
Exhibit C: Pl. Mot. Protective Order, Richland 4900, July 1, 2011.....	151
Exhibit D: Ltr. of Silvernail to Gende, re: Richland 4900, June 15, 2011.....	155
Exhibit E: Ltr. of Gende to Silvernail, June 17, 2011 re: Richland 4900.....	157
Mot. of AG to Amend Motion to Dismiss, December 20, 2012.....	160
w/Amended Motion to Dismiss and Alt. Mot. to Strike.....	162
Exhibit A: Affidavit of Meyers, October 20, 2011.....	166
Exhibit B: Mot. to Comp. Discovery, R 4900, June 7, 2011.....	169
Exhibit C: Pl. Mot. Protective Order, R4900, July 1, 2011.....	175
Exhibit D: Ltr. of Silvernail to Gender, June 15, 2011.....	179
Exhibit E: Ltr of Gende to Silvernail, June 17, 2011.....	181
Brief and Return in Opposition to Motion to Strike and/or Dismiss and Supporting Summary Judgment, January 10, 2012.....	184
Answer of Attorney General, March 7, 2013.....	190
Affidavit of Sr. Asst. AG Meyers, October 20, 2011.....	199
Ltr. of Sr. Asst. AG Meyers to Pope, dtd. August 5, 2011.....	201
Ltr. of S. Summer to AG Wilson & Keeper of Records, AG, June 10, 2012.....	203
Ltr. of Sr. Asst. AG Meyers to Summer, July 10, 2012.....	205

ROA (portion) <i>Wilson v. Dallas</i> , pp. 516 – 533, VOL II.....	206
James Brown Legacy Trust Unsigned, 2008	207
Schedule B to Legacy Trust,	224
James Brown Legacy Trust, Unsigned, 2009,.....	225
Schedule A, Assets contributed to Legacy Trust.....	240
Motion of Attorney General for Judgmt. on Pleadings, March 7, 2013.....	241
Motion to Stay of James Brown Legacy Trust, March 15, 2013.....	244
Mot of Attorney General to Strike Additional Affs., March 28, 2012.....	248
Motion of AG to Strike Addl. Affidavits, March 29, 2012.....	250
Plaintiff’s Status Report, filed April 1, 2013.....	252
Exhibit A: Conf. & Amendment (Legacy Trust), Jan. 4, 2011.....	257
Plaintiff’s Motion to Alter, amend Vacate Order, June 27, 2016.....	263
Appellant’s Petition for Rehearing, Ct. Appeals, June 28, 2019.....	267
Resp. Attorney General’s Petition for Rehearing, July 16, 2019.....	299
Petition for Certiorari, September 19, 2019.....	307
Response of AG In Opposition to Pope’s Prop. Order, etc., January 19, 2021.....	321
Return of AG to Plaintiffs’ Mot to Alter April 16, 2021.....	325
Amended Mot. of Plaintiff to Alt. Amend, April 13, 2021.....	327
Exhibit A: Order, April 1, 2021.....	349

III. TRANSCRIPTS

Transcript of Hearing , September 14, 2011, Richland 4900	354
Transcript of Hearing held January 11, 2012.....	360
Transcript of Hearing held May 17, 2016.....	368
Portions, Transcript of Hearing, Aug. 29, 2016, Richland 4900, pp. 1, 102–105.....	766
Transcript of Hearing held November 19, 2020	391
Argument of Asst. Solicitor General Smith.....	392
Reply Argument of Mr. Silvernail.....	406
Statement by Mr. Hayes (Sweeny, Wingate, & Barrow).....	447
Response of Mr. Silvernail to Statement by Mr. Hayes.....	448
Transcript of Hearing held April 16, 2021.....	449
Argument of Mr. Silvernail.....	451
Argument of Asst. Solicitor General Smith.....	463
Argument of Mr. Silvernail.....	466
Statement of Mr. Gende	471

VOLUME II (pp. 475-879)

IV. EXHIBITS AND OTHER MATERIALS OR DOCUMENTS

Ltr. Meyers to Pope, August 5, 2011.....475
Ltr. Pope to Meyers, August 7, 2011.....477
Ltr. of Pope to Legacy Trust Custodian of Records, June 30, 2011.....480
Affidavit of Pope, Sept. 12, 20[11].....481
 Exhibit A – Pet. to Remove Bauknight (*Dallas v. Bauknight*) Feb. 5, 2009.....491
 Summons, *Dallas & Bradley v. Bauknight*.....496
Affidavit of Pope in Further Support of...Relief, Expedited Hearing, and In Camera
 Review, October 6, 2011.....497
 Ex. A: AG’s Litigation Retention Agreements, from website..... 505
 Ex B. Pls’ Mot. Protective Order Concerning Fee Agrmt., Aug. 9, 2011.....506
 Ex. C Ltr. Pope to Meyers and Custodian of Records, Office of AG
 Re: Request for Documents under FOIA, October 5, 2011.....509
 Exhibit D, Form 4 Order Jg..Manning , Sept. 28, 2011 “continued”.....514
Filing Ltr. to Newberry Clerk of Ct., AG, Oct. 21, 2011,
 filing the following:.....515
 Affidavit of Meyers dtd. October 20, 2011.....516
 Order of the Hon. Marc Westbrook, *Lominack vs. Meyers*.....518
Affidavit of W. J. Smith Supporting Release of Docs. Under FOIA, Dec. 9, 2011.....520
 Exhibit A: *Private Foundations, Copyright Heirs and Musical Millionaires:
 Why the James Brown “I Feel Good” Trust doesn’t...(4/11)*.....524
 Exhibit B: Affidavit of Thomas R. Young Supporting Release of Contract to
 Sue Buchanan and Pope, December 2011.....537
 Exhibit C: Affidavit, D. Spence, Ask. for FOIA Release, December 8, 2011... 539
 Exhibit D: Affidavit of T. Pope, Supp. Immediate Release of McMaster/
 Wingate Contract to Sue Buchanan and Pope Dec. 8, 2011.....543
 Exhibit E: Affidavit of S. Summer, December 2011.....545
Affidavit of Pope Opposing Striking or Disregarding Affidavits and Article of
 Smith and other Affidavits; Opposing Dismissal; and Supporting In Camera
 Review and Summary Judgment, Jan. 3, 2012.....547
 Exhibit A: Affidavit of Vic MacDonald Supp. FOIA Release, 12/9/11.....554
 Exhibit B: Affidavit of Steven Farrar, Esq/ 1/4/2012.....556
Affidavit of Daryl Williams, Attaching Ltr. to Meyers , Jan. 6, 2012.....558
 Exhibit: Ltr. of D. Williams to Meyers. Jan. 6, 2012, re: Ltr. of January
 5, 2012 of Meyers to Ms. Sue Summer559
Affidavit of Pope Supporting In Camera Review and Immediate Release of Docs.
 Requested under S.C. FOIA and for Expedited Ruling, filed Jan. 9, 2012.....560
 Exhibit A - Ltr of Meyers to Ms. Sue Summer, January 5, 2012.....564
 Exhibit. B Ltr. of Meyers to Pope, Re: Request for documents under the

South Carolina [FOIA], October 3, 2011.....	566
Ltr. of Pope to Meyers & Records Custodian, AG’s Office, re: Request, Docs. under FOIA, Oct. 5, 2011.....	568
Ltr. of Pope to Custodian of Records, AG’s Office Re: Request for Docs.under S.C. [FOIA], David G Cannon, AG, Oct. 17, 2011.....	573
Email Chain among David Cannon, Sherri Lydon, Asst. AG R. McNair, others, Re: Proposed Felon Plea of David Cannon, Oct. 26-27, 2011.....	575
Exhibit C – Motion to Strike Pope & Buchanan’s Brief, <i>ex parte</i> David G. Cannon, v. <i>Ex parte</i> : Georgia AG’s Office et al, Jan. 31, 2011.....	578
Affidavit of Russell Bauknight, January 10, 2012.....	582
Exhibit A: Final Reply Brief, Appellants, <i>Wilson v. Dallas</i> , May 2011.....	586
Final Brief of Appellants, <i>Wilson v. Dallas</i>	590
Exhibit B: Freedom of Information Act.....	598
Exhibit C: Order Denying Buchanan Pope Motion to Change Venue, Richland 4900, Nov. 9, 2010.....	600
Memorandum of AG in Supp. of Mot. Dismiss/Strike/Opp. SJ, Jan. 11, 2012.....	606
Affidavit of Pope Opposing Motion to Consolidate Richland 4900 and FOIA case and Supporting Expedited Release of Documents under FOIA, Feb. 22, 2012.....	621
Exhibit A. Stipulation of Facts, Admissibility of Exhibits, <i>Lewis & Babcock, vs. Estate</i> , 2008-1551, w/ notes, Nov. 24, 2008.....	631
Exhibits List, Trial, Nov. 25, 2008.....	639
Exhibit B – Chart – <i>State vs. Cannon</i> , Payments to Cannon, 1999-2006.....	640
Affidavit of S. Summer dtd. March 26, 2012, with handwritten notes to Exhibits	641
Exhibit Ltr. of Summer AG Keeper of Records, Dec. 6, 2011.....	647
Exhibit B: Ltr. of Summer to Sr. Asst. AG Meyers, Jan. 8, 2012.....	648
Exhibit C: Ltr. Ltr. of Summer to Sr. Asst. AG Meyers, Jan. 20, 2012.....	651
Exhibit D., Ltr. of Summer to Sr. Asst AG Meyers, dtd. 1/29/2012.....	653
Ex. E. Ltr of Summer to AG Wilson & Keeper of Record, March 1, 2012.....	655
Exhibit F., Article <i>Wilson’s Dodge of FOIA suggests: Wingate Sued James Brown trustees without valid contracts (SC)</i> , Jan. 24, 2012.....	656
Exhibit G. Article : <i>Wilson Denies FOIA request in James Brown Suit, The Observer</i> , March 26, 2012.....	659
Ltr. of Smith to Manning dtd. 3/7/2013 w/ List of pending motions.....	663
Ltr. of Smith to Clerk dtd. 3/13/2013.....	666
Ltr. of Smith to Manning dtd. 3/28/2013.....	667
Emails of Smith to Silvernail, and Others May 8, 2013.....	668
Emails, Smith to Silvernail, Others, May 7, 2014	670
Email chain Smith to Silvernail, Others, November 13 2014.....	671
Emails Smith to Manning, Others, Jan.27-29, 2015.....	673
Plaintiff’s Reply to Memoranda of Defendants, May 16, 2016.....	675
Exhibit A, Motion of AG Wilson and Others to Supplement Record on Appeal, or in the Alternative, to take Judicial	

Notice of Records Filed in a Related Proceeding	See 871
Plaintiff's Brief Regarding Issues for 11-2-20 Hearing.....	681
Exhibit A: Email, D. Black to Sr. Asst. AG Jones, Asst. G Jowers, A. Medlin, cc: F. Kingsmore, Dec. 17, 2010 Subject: Forward Appraisal Footnote, w/ Email of Wilkins to D. Black, F. Kingsmore,.....	686
Exhibit B: Legacy Trust Confirmation and Amendment, Dec. 31, 2010.....	689
Affidavit of Pope Opposing AG's Motion to Strike Affidavits, Oct. 27, 2020.....	695
Exhibit A: Ltr. of SWB to Bauknight, dtd. 1/5/11, with redactions by AG, Copies to AG Jones, AG Jowers, others.....	704
Exhibit B: Ltr. of SWB to AG, dtd. 1/20/12.....	705
Exhibit C: Order, <i>Summer v. Wilson</i> , dtd. 9/19/14.....	713
Exhibit D: Ltr. of SWB to AG, dtd. 3/25/13 re: Urgent Meeting Request	721
Exhibit E: Ltr of SWB to AG, dtd. 4.12/13 re: Proposed Termination of Representation Agreement.....	723
Exhibit F: Termination of Legal Representation (unsigned), AG & SWB.....	725
Exhibit G: Order Requiring Production of Public Records, <i>Summer</i> , 7/8/14...728	
Exhibit H: Ltr, SWB to AG McIntosh, dtd. 4/23/13.....	734
Exhibit I: Ltr. of McIntosh to SWB, dtd. 4/24/13.....	736
Exhibit J: Order Granting Atty. Fees, <i>Summer</i> , dtd. 8/19/15.....	738
Exhibit K: Ltr. of AG Smith to Silvernail, dtd. 5/20/20.....	741
With Agreement for Legal Services.....	742
Memorandum of Attorney General for 11-2-20 Hearing, Nov. 2, 2020	745
List of Exhibits to Brief of Attorney General.....	757
Exhibit E-1 Affidavit of Sr. Asst. AG Meyers, October 20, 2011.....	758
Exhibit E-3: Ltr. of Sr. Asst. AG Meyers to Pope, August 5, 2011.....	760
Exhibit E-6: Record on Appeal, Appellate Case No. 2017 -001899 Coverpage, Volume II of V.....	762
Exhibit E-7: Return and Opposition to Request for Stay and Request for Expedited Hearing, Scheduling and Related Relief, Richland 4900, 2013, p. 1 – 2.....	763
Exhibit E-8:Coverpage, Vol. III of V, Ct. Appeals, 2017-001899.....	765
Exhibit E – 9: Portions, Transcript of Hearing, August 29, 2016 Richland 4900, pp. 1, 102 – 105	766
Exhibit E-13: <i>Summer v. Wilson</i> , Reply to Memorandum in Opposition to Amended Motion to Alter or Amend, July 28, 2014.....	770
Exhibit E-16: Confirmation and Amendment of Legacy Trust/Settlement Entity, December 31, 2010, signed by AG Henry D. McMaster.....	773
Exhibit E-22 Ltr. of Summer to AG Wilson & Keeper of Record, June 10, 2012.....	779
Exhibit E-24: Ltr. of Sr. Asst. AG Meyers to Summer, July 10, 2012: Regarding your FOIA request June 10, 2012.....	781
Plaintiff's Supplemental Memorandum in Support of Relief, Dec. 18, 2020	

w/ Proposed Order Requiring Production of Public Records (not signed).....	782
Affidavit of Pope opposing Participation of Wingate Firm, Dec. 18, 2020.....	795
Exhibit A: Article <i>AG Responds to Article on Open Records Lawsuit</i>	825
Exhibit B: Declaration of Peter Afterman, September 2, 2020.....	827
Exhibit C: Affidavit of Peter Afterman, October 29, 2019.....	830
AG’s Response to Pope’s Propose Order, Supp. Memo and Affidavit, 1/19/2021.....	834
Plaintiff’s Response to Attorney General’s Response to Proposed Order, Supplemental Memorandum, and Affidavit, Jan. 29, 2021.....	838
Exhibit 1- Final Order, <i>Sumner v. Wilson</i> , Sept. 19, 2014.....	842
Exhibit 2 – Order, <i>Sumner v. Wilson</i> , January 16, 2015.....	852
V. CERTIFICATE OF COUNSEL.....	880