

**THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
IN THE COURT OF APPEALS**

---

**RECEIVED**

**Jan 18 2023**

**SC Court of Appeals**

**APPEAL FROM NEWBERRY COUNTY  
Court of General Sessions  
Benjamin H. Culbertson, Circuit Court Judge**

---

**Appellant Case № 2021-000982  
Lower Court Case Nos. 2019GS3600356, 2019GS3600357, 2019GS3600359**

---

**The State ..... Respondent,**

**vs.**

**Xzavier Sharif Davis ..... Appellant.**

---

**RECORD ON APPEAL  
VOLUME I**

---

**Alan McCrory Wilson  
TOMMY EVANS, JR.  
S.C. Attorney General's Office  
PO Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211  
S.C. Bar 65282  
tommyevansjr@scag.gov  
(803) 734-6305**

**C. RAUCH WISE  
Attorney at Law  
305 Main Street  
Greenwood, SC 29646  
S.C. Bar # 6188  
(864) 229-5010  
rauchwise@gmail.com**

**Attorney for Appellant**

## INDEX

|                                                            |     |
|------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Transcript of Record excluding pages 13-84 and 98-168..... | 1   |
| Indictments and Sentencing Sheets.....                     | 687 |
| Notice of Intent to Appeal .....                           | 703 |
| Letter of Representation .....                             | 704 |
| Certificate of Counsel.....                                | 705 |

State of South Carolina ) In the Court of General Sessions  
County of Newberry ) Eighth Judicial Circuit  
2019-GS-36-00356  
2019-GS-36-00357  
2019-GS-36-00359

State of South Carolina, )  
vs. ) Transcript of Record  
Xzavier Sharif Davis, )  
Defendant. )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

August 23-26, 2021  
Newberry County Courthouse  
Newberry, South Carolina

B E F O R E:

The Honorable Benjamin H. Culbertson, Judge; and a  
jury

A P P E A R A N C E S:

David M. Stumbo, Solicitor  
Taylor W. Daniel, Assistant Solicitor  
Attorneys for State of South Carolina

Stephen D. Geoly, Esquire  
Attorney for Defendant

Maryann S. Nevers, CVR-M-CM, RVR, RVR-M  
Circuit Court Reporter  
Certified Verbatim Reporter - Master  
Certificate of Merit  
Realtime Verbatim Reporter - Master

I N D E X

|                                              |     |
|----------------------------------------------|-----|
| Proceedings . . . . .                        | 5   |
| Introduction by the Court . . . . .          | 193 |
| Opening Statement by Mr. Daniel . . . . .    | 201 |
| Opening Statement by Mr. Geoly. . . . .      | 212 |
| TRIAL TESTIMONY - WITNESS                    |     |
| Lee Foster,                                  |     |
| Direct Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . .   | 226 |
| Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . .     | 243 |
| Redirect Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . . | 246 |
| Vinnie Ray Hunter,                           |     |
| Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . .   | 252 |
| Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . .     | 268 |
| Redirect Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . | 277 |
| Wallace Hunter,                              |     |
| Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . .   | 279 |
| Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . .     | 285 |
| Redirect Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . | 294 |
| Shawn Carnes,                                |     |
| Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . .   | 298 |
| Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . .     | 307 |
| Michael Stribble,                            |     |
| Direct Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . .   | 313 |
| Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . .     | 319 |

I N D E X

## TRIAL TESTIMONY - WITNESS

Indigo Davis,

Direct Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . . 323

Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 355

Redirect Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . . 368

Matthew Ryan Dickert (Proffer),

Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 380

Odell Schumpert,

Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 420

Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 442

Redirect Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 446

Ryan Dickert,

Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 447

Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 503

Redirect Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 514

Dalila Cirencione,

Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 516

Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 521

I N D E X

TRIAL TESTIMONY - WITNESS

Ila Simmons,

Direct Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . . 525

Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 527

Redirect Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . . 529

Recross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 533

Redirect Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . . 535

Michele Eichenmiller,

Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 536

Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 554

Jaclynn McKay,

Direct Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 557

Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 597

Redirect Examination by Mr. Daniel . . . . . 606

Kelly Rose,

Direct Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . . 610

Cross-Examination by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 625

Redirect Examination by Mr. Stumbo . . . . . 626

Closing Argument by Mr. Stumbo. . . . . 729

Closing Argument by Mr. Geoly . . . . . 752

Charge of the Court . . . . . 771

Verdict of the Jury . . . . . 816

Sentence of the Court . . . . . 828

Certificate Page. . . . . 830

E X H I B I T S

|    | <u>NO.</u> | <u>DESCRIPTION</u> | <u>I.D.</u> | <u>EVID.</u> |
|----|------------|--------------------|-------------|--------------|
| 1  |            |                    |             |              |
| 2  |            |                    |             |              |
| 3  | C-1        | Jury Note          | 169         |              |
| 4  | C-2        | Jury Note          | 789         |              |
| 5  | C-3        | Jury Charge        | 792         |              |
| 6  | C-4        | Jury Note          | 804         |              |
| 7  | S-1        | Autopsy Report     | 186         | 614          |
| 8  | S-2        | Receipt            | 186         | 486          |
| 9  | S-3        | SLED Report        | 186         | 553          |
| 10 | S-4        | SLED Diagram       | 186         | 340          |
| 11 | S-5        | SLED Diagram       | 186         | 567          |
| 12 | S-6        | SLED Report        | 186         | 531          |
| 13 | S-7        | GSR Kit            | 186         | 319          |
| 14 | S-8        | Gun                | 186         | 346          |
| 15 | S-9        | Gun                | 186         | 439          |
| 16 | S-10       | Fired Bullet       | 186         | 542          |
| 17 | S-11       | Fired Bullets      | 186         | 544          |
| 18 | S-12       | Cartridge Casings  | 186         | 546          |
| 19 | S-13       | Fired Bullet       | 186         | 521          |
| 20 | S-14       | Aerial Photo       | 186         | 481          |
| 21 | S-15       | Bullets            | 186         | 548          |
| 22 | S-16       | Cartridge Casings  | 186         | 551          |
| 23 | S-17       | Bullets            | 186         | 552          |
| 24 | S-18       | Photograph         | 186         | 619          |
| 25 | S-19       | Photograph         | 186         | 258          |

E X H I B I T S

|    | <u>NO.</u> | <u>DESCRIPTION</u> | <u>I.D.</u> | <u>EVID.</u> |
|----|------------|--------------------|-------------|--------------|
| 1  |            |                    |             |              |
| 2  |            |                    |             |              |
| 3  | S-20       | Photograph         | 186         | 562          |
| 4  | S-21       | Photograph         | 186         | 461          |
| 5  | S-22       | Photograph         | 186         | 451          |
| 6  | S-23       | Photograph         | 186         | 472          |
| 7  | S-24       | Photograph         | 186         | 462          |
| 8  | S-25       | Photograph         | 186         | 464          |
| 9  | S-26       | Photograph         | 186         | 467          |
| 10 | S-27       | Photograph         | 186         | 468          |
| 11 | S-28       | Photograph         | 186         | 473          |
| 12 | S-29       | Photograph         | 186         | 470          |
| 13 | S-30       | Photograph         | 186         | 472          |
| 14 | S-31       | Photograph         | 186         | 463          |
| 15 | S-32       | Photograph         | 186         | 475          |
| 16 | S-33       | Photograph         | 186         | 476          |
| 17 | S-34       | Photograph         | 186         | 518          |
| 18 | S-35       | Photograph         | 186         | 518          |
| 19 | S-36       | Photograph         | 186         | 518          |
| 20 | S-37       | Diagram            | 186         | 347          |
| 21 | S-38       | Photograph         | 186         | 468          |
| 22 | S-39       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 23 | S-40       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 24 | S-41       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 25 | S-42       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |



E X H I B I T S

|    | <u>NO.</u> | <u>DESCRIPTION</u> | <u>I.D.</u> | <u>EVID.</u> |
|----|------------|--------------------|-------------|--------------|
| 1  |            |                    |             |              |
| 2  |            |                    |             |              |
| 3  | S-43       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 4  | S-44       | Photograph         | 186         | 470          |
| 5  | S-45       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 6  | S-46       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 7  | S-47       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 8  | S-48       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 9  | S-49       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 10 | S-50       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 11 | S-51       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 12 | S-52       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 13 | S-53       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 14 | S-54       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 15 | S-55       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 16 | S-56       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 17 | S-57       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 18 | S-58       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 19 | S-59       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 20 | S-60       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 21 | S-61       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 22 | S-62       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 23 | S-63       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 24 | S-64       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 25 | S-65       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |

E X H I B I T S

|    | <u>NO.</u> | <u>DESCRIPTION</u> | <u>I.D.</u> | <u>EVID.</u> |
|----|------------|--------------------|-------------|--------------|
| 1  |            |                    |             |              |
| 2  |            |                    |             |              |
| 3  | S-66       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 4  | S-67       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 5  | S-68       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 6  | S-69       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 7  | S-70       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 8  | S-71       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 9  | S-72       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 10 | S-73       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 11 | S-74       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 12 | S-75       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 13 | S-76       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 14 | S-77       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 15 | S-78       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 16 | S-79       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 17 | S-80       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 18 | S-81       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 19 | S-82       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 20 | S-83       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 21 | S-84       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 22 | S-85       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 23 | S-86       | Photograph         | 186         |              |
| 24 | S-87       | Photograph         | 186         |              |
| 25 | S-88       | Photograph         | 186         |              |

E X H I B I T S

|    | <u>NO.</u> | <u>DESCRIPTION</u> | <u>I.D.</u> | <u>EVID.</u> |
|----|------------|--------------------|-------------|--------------|
| 1  |            |                    |             |              |
| 2  |            |                    |             |              |
| 3  | S-89       | Photograph         | 186         |              |
| 4  | S-90       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 5  | S-91       | Photograph         | 186         | 258          |
| 6  | S-92       | Photograph         | 186         | 258          |
| 7  | S-93       | Photograph         | 186         | 258          |
| 8  | S-94       | Photograph         | 186         | 258          |
| 9  | S-95       | Photograph         | 186         | 258          |
| 10 | S-96       | Photograph         | 186         | 258          |
| 11 | S-97       | Photograph         | 186         | 306          |
| 12 | S-98       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 13 | S-99       | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 14 | S-100      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 15 | S-101      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 16 | S-102      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 17 | S-103      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 18 | S-104      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 19 | S-105      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 20 | S-106      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 21 | S-107      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 22 | S-108      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 23 | S-109      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 24 | S-110      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 25 | S-111      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |

E X H I B I T S

|    | <u>NO.</u> | <u>DESCRIPTION</u> | <u>I.D.</u> | <u>EVID.</u> |
|----|------------|--------------------|-------------|--------------|
| 1  |            |                    |             |              |
| 2  |            |                    |             |              |
| 3  | S-112      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 4  | S-113      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 5  | S-114      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 6  | S-115      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 7  | S-116      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 8  | S-117      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 9  | S-118      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 10 | S-119      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 11 | S-120      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 12 | S-121      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 13 | S-122      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 14 | S-123      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 15 | S-124      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 16 | S-125      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 17 | S-126      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 18 | S-127      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 19 | S-128      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 20 | S-129      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 21 | S-130      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 22 | S-131      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 23 | S-132      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 24 | S-133      | Photograph         | 186         | 426          |
| 25 | S-134      | Photograph         | 186         | 327          |

E X H I B I T S

|    | <u>NO.</u> | <u>DESCRIPTION</u> | <u>I.D.</u> | <u>EVID.</u> |
|----|------------|--------------------|-------------|--------------|
| 1  |            |                    |             |              |
| 2  |            |                    |             |              |
| 3  | S-135      | Photograph         | 186         | 426          |
| 4  | S-136      | Photograph         | 186         | 427          |
| 5  | S-137      | Photograph         | 186         | 435          |
| 6  | S-138      | Photograph         | 186         | 435          |
| 7  | S-139      | Photograph         | 186         | 437          |
| 8  | S-140      | Photograph         | 186         | 440/565      |
| 9  | S-141      | Photograph         | 186         | 596          |
| 10 | S-142      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 11 | S-143      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 12 | S-144      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 13 | S-145      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 14 | S-146      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 15 | S-147      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 16 | S-148      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 17 | S-149      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 18 | S-150      | Photograph         | 186         | 428          |
| 19 | S-151      | Photograph         | 186         | 430          |
| 20 | S-152      | Photograph         | 186         | 431          |
| 21 | S-153      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 22 | S-154      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 23 | S-155      | Photograph         | 186         | 565          |
| 24 | S-156      | Photograph         | 186         | 432          |
| 25 | S-157      | Photograph         | 186         | 433          |

E X H I B I T S

| NO.   | DESCRIPTION     | I.D. | EVID. |
|-------|-----------------|------|-------|
| S-158 | Photograph      | 186  | 565   |
| S-159 | Photograph      | 186  | 484   |
| S-160 | Photograph      | 186  | 437   |
| S-161 | Photograph      | 186  | 438   |
| S-162 | Photograph      | 186  | 565   |
| S-163 | Photograph      | 186  | 441   |
| S-164 | Photograph      | 186  | 565   |
| S-165 | Photograph      | 186  | 565   |
| S-166 | Photograph      | 186  | 565   |
| S-167 | Photograph      | 186  | 565   |
| S-168 | Photograph      | 186  |       |
| S-169 | Photograph      | 186  |       |
| S-170 | Photograph      | 186  |       |
| S-171 | Photograph      | 186  |       |
| S-172 | Autopsy Diagram | 186  | 172   |
| S-173 | DVD             | 387  |       |
| S-174 | DVD             | 416  | *502  |

**\*Note:** Only a portion of State's Exhibit 174 was  
admitted into evidence.\*

1 generally do, is I'll look over these; I'm sure I'll ask  
2 some of them; some of them, I won't. Those that I don't,  
3 you just know that I denied ---

4 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

5 THE COURT: --- asking them. All right?

6 MR. STUMBO: Just one last brief thing before we  
7 break for lunch, Judge: In the indictments, because --  
8 just because we're going to be calling these after lunch,  
9 in the attempted murder indictment -- and just for the  
10 record, that's 2019-GS-36-0359. And I mentioned this to  
11 Mr. Geoly this morning.

12 The language in there includes either express or  
13 implied on the attempted murder. Of course, I think  
14 that's appropriate in the -- certainly appropriate, based  
15 on recent case law the murder indictment. I -- I guess,  
16 based on the current state of the law talk and the *King*  
17 case and *Smith* -- and there's several others recently --  
18 that talk about specific intent in attempted murder  
19 cases.

20 Judge, we don't mind it. And we would ask and move  
21 the Court to alter or amend that indictment just to  
22 strike the phrase "either express or implied," just to  
23 not raise any confusion on that and as to your  
24 instructions to the jury. I don't know what Mr. Geoly's  
25 position on that is, which ---

1 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I -- I mean, I -- I expect that  
2 I'll be making a motion for directed verdict at the end  
3 of the case, based on -- on *State v. King*, that, you  
4 know, as you know, has come out and basically said -- I  
5 think their theory of the case is such that it's not  
6 going to support an attempted murder that gets by the  
7 *State v. King* case.

8 MR. STUMBO: Well, Judge, I think will have evidence  
9 that this ---

10 THE COURT: Well, I mean, any -- any objection to  
11 amending the indictment to ---

12 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

13 THE COURT: --- delete express and implied? Is  
14 there any objection to that?

15 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

16 THE COURT: Okay.

17 MR. GEOLY: I -- I would object to that. I think  
18 that they're stuck with the indictment that's been true-  
19 billed by the grand jury. And I think, for us at this  
20 point, to take -- I think a problem they've got  
21 additionally, Your Honor -- and -- and I will -- I'll  
22 bring this up at the appropriate time, I think, as you  
23 call the case. But I think they may have issues with the  
24 murder indictment as well. It certainly doesn't include  
25 the word "did," and I -- I think --



1 MR. STUMBO: Judge, I'm ---

2 MR. GEOLY: --- it doesn't ---

3 MR. STUMBO: --- getting to that, if he would ---

4 THE COURT: Okay.

5 MR. STUMBO: --- let me talk.

6 MR. GEOLY: Well, all right. But I don't think it  
7 includes the ---

8 MR. STUMBO: But ---

9 MR. GEOLY: --- words "express or implied." And  
10 certainly, we're not going to agree to amending that to  
11 allow that to be added to the murder warrant now.

12 THE COURT: All right.

13 MR. STUMBO: If we could please handle the first one  
14 first, Judge. If -- if Mr. Geoly is not -- doesn't have  
15 a problem with this language and -- and ---

16 MR. GEOLY: Oh, I think that the Court should have a  
17 problem with it. I just ---

18 MR. STUMBO: Then I --

19 MR. GEOLY: --- I'm not agreeable ---

20 MR. STUMBO: --- then I don't ---

21 MR. GEOLY: --- or amenable ---

22 MR. STUMBO: --- I don't have ---

23 MR. GEOLY: --- to ---

24 MR. STUMBO: --- a problem with Stephen ---

25 MR. GEOLY: I'm -- I'm not amenable to amending it.

1 THE COURT: Well ---

2 MR. GEOLY: I -- I think it's ---

3 MR. STUMBO: Just so you know, Judge, one of our  
4 theories will be specific intent to kill as to this  
5 indictment and this particular defendant.

6 THE COURT: Okay.

7 MR. STUMBO: However, we believe that the language  
8 could potentially be contradictory to the -- to the  
9 charges. And quite honestly, Judge -- but if Mr. Geoly  
10 doesn't object to it, I don't think there's any prejudice  
11 that -- that is going to be to -- attached to the  
12 defendant here.

13 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I -- I -- I guess maybe I'm --  
14 and -- and the solicitor, in fairness to him, has  
15 mentioned that he may not go -- I -- I -- he's -- two  
16 different things: One, we're going forward on the  
17 murder, three attempted murders, and a possession of  
18 pistol during ---

19 MR. STUMBO: That -- that's ---

20 MR. GEOLY: --- violent crime.

21 MR. STUMBO: --- not correct. We're just ---

22 MR. GEOLY: Okay.

23 MR. STUMBO: --- going to go forward on one count of  
24 attempted murder.

25 MR. GEOLY: All right. But -- but clearly, we're --

1 we're -- we're acknowledging that this was all done at  
2 once and jeopardy is attaching to -- he wouldn't be then  
3 facing, if he gets acquitted or convicted, two additional  
4 attempted murder.

5 MR. STUMBO: No. No. But let's ---

6 MR. GEOLY: Okay.

7 MR. STUMBO: --- not -- not conflate that. We can  
8 get to that in a second.

9 MR. GEOLY: Okay.

10 MR. STUMBO: Correct, Judge. We're calling three  
11 indictments: for murder, for attempted murder ---

12 THE COURT: Which indictments are you calling? Give  
13 me the numbers.

14 MR. STUMBO: We're -- we're calling 2019-GS-36-0356.  
15 That's *State v. Xzavier Davis*, indictment for murder.

16 THE COURT: All right.

17 MR. STUMBO: We are calling Indictment 2019-GS-36-  
18 0357. That's an indictment for possession of weapon  
19 during the commission of a violent crime. And then, one  
20 of the attempted murder indictments, which is 2019-GS-36-  
21 0359, it's Xzavier Sharif Davis -- *State v. Xzavier*  
22 *Davis*, indictment for attempted murder of Indigo Penny  
23 ---

24 THE COURT: All right.

25 MR. STUMBO: --- is the named victim in that

1 indictment.

2 THE COURT: So what are you going to do with 2019-  
3 358 and 2019-360?

4 MR. STUMBO: We are going to resolve those as part  
5 of this trial, Judge. So we're not going -- we -- we  
6 would agree ---

7 THE COURT: I mean, how ---

8 MR. STUMBO: --- that we ---

9 THE COURT: --- are you ---

10 MR. STUMBO: --- can't call -- call those cases  
11 later.

12 THE COURT: So are you dismissing them?

13 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

14 THE COURT: Okay.

15 MR. STUMBO: Reason we're doing that today, quite  
16 honestly, Judge, is state of the case law has -- we  
17 believe the recent cases confused the issues. Quite  
18 honestly, the -- probably the more appropriate charge or  
19 the one that would survive DV for a nonspecific-intent  
20 victim, which these two other children in the car, a  
21 3-year-old, and a 1-year-old, we don't believe there's  
22 any specific intent by this defendant to kill them. But  
23 if there is a general-intent crime, it -- where they're  
24 not hit, it's probably an A& -- assault and battery,  
25 first degree, is what -- I think there was -- there was

1 a recent case actually out of Laurens, and we tried to  
2 address that, Judge.

3 So quite honestly, one of the reasons why we're  
4 paring this down is because the recent case law, we  
5 believe, throws some of these issues in confusion. We  
6 indicted this case two years ago. And we believe these  
7 three indictments, based on the facts and evidence in the  
8 case, are well supported by the facts and evidence, and  
9 we're going to forward on these three.

10 Judge, so that -- that would be the first one. If  
11 we -- I'll withdraw my motion if Mr. Geoly doesn't have  
12 any objection to either express or implied in the  
13 indictment.

14 THE COURT: All right. Well, he's moving to amend  
15 it. So you can either consent to the ---

16 MR. GEOLY: I object.

17 THE COURT: All right. You object to amending it?

18 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

19 THE COURT: Well, I'll deny your motion.

20 MR. STUMBO: All right.

21 THE COURT: We'll leave it in there.

22 MR. STUMBO: If -- yes, sir.

23 THE COURT: All right.

24 MR. STUMBO: Second one would be just that there's a  
25 scrivener's error in the murder indictment. The word

1 "did" -- I don't know it got -- it got left out. But it  
2 reads currently that (as read): "Xzavier Sharif Davis,  
3 on or about April 20th, 2019, in Newberry County,  
4 willfully, feloniously, and with malice aforethought,  
5 killed one Iven James Caldwell by means of shooting and  
6 that Iven James Caldwell did die as a proximate result on  
7 or about -- on or about April 22nd, 2019, in violation of  
8 Section 16-3-10 of the South Carolina Code of Laws 1976,  
9 as amended."

10 Judge, we believe that just word "did" -- again, it  
11 -- it's -- would ---

12 THE COURT: Where ---

13 MR. STUMBO: --- make this more grammatically  
14 correct.

15 THE COURT: You're talking ---

16 MR. STUMBO: We would ---

17 THE COURT: --- about "did willfully" ---

18 MR. STUMBO: Did willfully ---

19 THE COURT: Okay.

20 MR. STUMBO: --- feloniously, and with malice  
21 aforethought.

22 THE COURT: All right.

23 MR. STUMBO: We'd just ask this for -- motion to  
24 just alter or amend to add the word "did."

25 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Geoly?

1           MR. GEOLY: Judge, I -- I don't want to belabor the  
2 point. But I -- I don't think we should be the business  
3 of going behind the grand jury to make changes to what's  
4 been submitted to them. I -- I think that they have  
5 ruled. I think at this point it would be impossible to  
6 ask this grand jury, you know, what they meant. And it  
7 -- the word "did" is not in there.

8           It -- it's -- it's interesting enough that while in  
9 the attempted murder, there actually is express or  
10 implied malice is, I think, probably not correct in an  
11 attempted murder warrant, but that's what they got.  
12 That's the indictment they got.

13          THE COURT: And that's ---

14          MR. GEOLY: It says that ---

15          THE COURT: --- why he was trying to correct it.

16          MR. GEOLY: Well, but ---

17          THE COURT: --- but you objected to the correction.

18          MR. GEOLY: Well, and I -- I agree, Judge. Because  
19 that's what the grand jury has done. I don't think it's  
20 for me or the Court or -- or the solicitor to go back  
21 behind the grand jury. He submitted this to the grand  
22 jury, and they -- they did what they did with it.

23          THE COURT: So your argument is that an indictment  
24 can never be ---

25          MR. GEOLY: I -- I'm ---

1           THE COURT: --- amended after it's been true-billed  
2 by a grand jury.

3           MR. GEOLY: I'm not saying that, Judge. If it's  
4 clear it's a scrivener's error, which I -- I'll admit,  
5 Your Honor, you know, not trying to talk out of both  
6 sides of my mouth, that "did" is very close. I think I  
7 have a lot bigger problem with both express or implied  
8 being in the attempted murder, which I -- and realize  
9 that my -- my -- my failure to -- to acquiesce and agree  
10 with the solicitor doesn't mean we won't have a motion to  
11 quash that -- before this trial begins. And I -- I --  
12 you know, and I'll look at that over lunch, Judge.

13           But I think as to the murder charge, not having the  
14 word "did" is -- is -- could be fatal, depending upon  
15 what Your Honor decides. But I think they obviously then  
16 have issues, too, if they're going to try and argue  
17 implied malice. It's not listed as part of this.

18           And surely, you know, we're not going to amend to  
19 include language now if -- you know, if -- if -- the  
20 "did," I could see. I certainly couldn't see Your Honor  
21 adding "express or implied" at this point. So ---

22           THE COURT: All right. Well, we're just dealing  
23 with the motion to amend to include "did." I'm going to  
24 allow that.

25           MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.



1 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

2 THE COURT: All right.

3 MR. STUMBO: Thank you. And I can pass that up to  
4 Your Honor, if -- if you need to add the word and initial  
5 it.

6 THE COURT: I can do that.

7 MR. STUMBO: Thank you, Judge.

8 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Your Honor.

9 MR. STUMBO: And just -- just to -- for the record,  
10 Judge, on the attempted murder indictment, it tracks the  
11 statute 16-3-29, which includes the phrase "either  
12 express or implied." We tracked the statute when we did  
13 the indictment, Judge. We just were trying to -- to ---

14 THE COURT: Well, and ---

15 MR. STUMBO: --- essentially ---

16 THE COURT: --- I understand. And if you want to go  
17 forward ---

18 MR. STUMBO: Yeah. I -- I don't ---

19 THE COURT: --- you ---

20 MR. STUMBO: --- think it's fatal to the indictment.

21 THE COURT: Well ---

22 MR. STUMBO: I think ---

23 THE COURT: -- and I'm ---

24 MR. STUMBO: --- we're trying to ---

25 THE COURT: --- I'm not making ---

1 MR. STUMBO: --- clarify ---

2 THE COURT: --- that decision ---

3 MR. STUMBO: --- things ---

4 THE COURT: --- right now. But I ---

5 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

6 THE COURT: --- do know that you moved to amend it

7 ---

8 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

9 THE COURT: --- to correct it, if you will, by your  
10 argument, even though you didn't think it needs  
11 corrected. He objected.

12 I'm going to be honest with you. I'm -- I'm -- if  
13 you move to quash, based upon the fact that they didn't  
14 correct it when they want to correct it, I don't know how  
15 that's going to play out later. But ---

16 MR. STUMBO: Well, and -- and --- and quite  
17 honestly, Judge, you know, I -- I -- I wouldn't even say  
18 that -- that it's -- it's incorrect. Because according  
19 to the statute, it is correct.

20 THE COURT: Right.

21 MR. STUMBO: Quite -- quite frankly, we just saw it  
22 as a -- an opportunity before the jury hears the -- the  
23 -- the -- it read that it's an unnecessary language, I  
24 guess, more than anything else. We don't believe it  
25 affects the validity of the charge itself it's --

1 particularly under *State v. Gentry* as a notice document  
2 to put this defendant on notice of what he's facing.

3 THE COURT: I understand.

4 MR. STUMBO: And we don't think it's a fatal error.  
5 Thank ---

6 THE COURT: All right.

7 MR. STUMBO: --- you, Judge.

8 THE COURT: Anything else we need to address before  
9 we break for lunch?

10 MR. STUMBO: That's all from the state, Judge.

11 THE COURT: All right.

12 MR. GEOLY: Nothing from the defendant, Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: All right. I'll look over the *voir*  
14 *dire*, as I said. Whatever I ask, I granted. Whatever I  
15 don't ask, I'm denying. We'll do it ---

16 MR. GEOLY: I understand

17 THE COURT: --- that way.

18 All right. So come back at two o'clock.

19 MR. GEOLY: Yeah. Judge, I guess we've agreed in  
20 terms of the situation. We're just going to turn this  
21 back as defense table?

22 THE COURT: Well, I'm going to leave up to y'all  
23 straighten out. As long as -- I mean, when we get  
24 everybody satisfied as to everybody can see everybody ---

25 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

1 go looking through the newspaper; don't go looking on the  
2 Internet; don't try to find out anything about the case.  
3 Whatever you need to make a decision in this case will be  
4 presented to you during the trial of this case.

5 I hope everybody has a good evening. Enjoy your  
6 evening. We'll see you back 9:15 tomorrow morning.  
7 Thank you very much.

8 (Whereupon, the jury exited the courtroom at 3:51  
9 p.m.)

10 (Off the record briefly.)

11 THE COURT: All right. They did send out a sheet of  
12 paper that had "24 Peter Hill" on it. That was their  
13 foreperson who they selected as the foreperson, Juror No.  
14 24, Peter Hill.

15 I'm going to have the court reporter mark this as  
16 Court's Exhibit 1?

17 THE COURT REPORTER: Yes, Your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Thank you.

19 (Whereupon, Court's Exhibit 1 was marked for  
20 identification.)

21 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state  
22 before we recess for the evening?

23 MR. STUMBO: Just to -- I don't want to beat a dead  
24 horse, Judge. But just to clarify the record from right  
25 before lunch: Over lunch, I look at some of the jury

1 charges on attempted murder. And what I'd asked the  
2 Court to do on that motion to alter or amend, it -- it  
3 appears as if we've had jury charges that the Court has  
4 given since the *King* case that includes that language,  
5 "either express or implied." And it's in the statute,  
6 Judge.

7 So I -- I probably should've looked at those charges  
8 before I even made that motion. But just to make the  
9 record clear, I don't believe it's an incorrect statement  
10 in the indictment itself. We believe it to be ---

11 THE COURT: Yeah. There's a difference ---

12 MR. STUMBO: --- correct.

13 THE COURT: --- between -- the indictment basically  
14 puts the defendant on notice as to what the charge is.

15 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

16 THE COURT: That's separate from what you charge the  
17 jury on the law in the case. As I understand ---

18 MR. STUMBO: Correct.

19 THE COURT: --- the *King* case basically says  
20 attempted murder is a specific-intent crime ---

21 MR. STUMBO: Yes.

22 THE COURT: --- and that the Court cannot charge the  
23 jury that it's a general-intent crime.

24 MR. STUMBO: Right.

25 THE COURT: So that's the way I read the *King* case.

1 MR. STUMBO: And -- and I read Judge Hocker's charge  
2 in one of our cases right after that. And he included  
3 the language "with specific intent, either express or  
4 implied" ---

5 THE COURT: All right. Yeah.

6 MR. STUMBO: --- to -- to comport with the *King*  
7 case, which I think will be appropriate here ---

8 THE COURT: Well, and I haven't seen anything that  
9 ---

10 MR. STUMBO: Right.

11 THE COURT: --- distinguishes express or implied  
12 versus specific intent.

13 MR. STUMBO: Correct.

14 THE COURT: I'm going to keep ---

15 MR. STUMBO: So ---

16 THE COURT: --- looking at it. I'm not saying it's  
17 not out there. But I'm going to keep looking to see --  
18 you know, and quite frankly, I'll probably check with  
19 some other judges and say: "How are you charging  
20 attempted murder now?" ---

21 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

22 THE COURT: --- and see what they say. All right?

23 MR. STUMBO: So I -- I apologize for even ---

24 THE COURT: All right.

25 MR. STUMBO: --- maybe confusing that issue prior to

1 lunch. I ---

2 THE COURT: That's not ---

3 MR. STUMBO: We're ---

4 THE COURT: --- a problem.

5 MR. STUMBO: --- perfectly comfortable with the  
6 indictment as written ---

7 THE COURT: All right.

8 MR. STUMBO: --- right now. Yeah.

9 THE COURT: Anything further from the state before  
10 we recess?

11 MR. STUMBO: That's all from the state, Judge. We  
12 -- you know, there's a couple of issues that I think will  
13 probably come up during the trial. I'd -- I'd -- I don't  
14 think we need to handle them pretrial. There's a hearsay  
15 statement that may -- may come in that Mr. Geoly and I --  
16 we can talk about it maybe at sidebar or in chambers.  
17 And I'm sure we'll argue it on the record. I think it's  
18 probably premature to talk about it ---

19 THE COURT: I mean ---

20 MR. STUMBO: --- tomorrow.

21 THE COURT: --- do we have any *Jackson v. Denno* or -  
22 --

23 MR. STUMBO: We -- we ---

24 THE COURT: --- *Biggers* ---

25 MR. STUMBO: --- do not.

1 THE COURT: --- or anything like that?

2 MR. STUMBO: There's no -- there's no statement  
3 after *Miranda*, Judge, by the defendant. So there's no  
4 *Denno*. No *Neil v. Biggers* as to ID issues; all the  
5 people know each other here involved ---

6 THE COURT: Okay.

7 MR. STUMBO: --- in this case. So ---

8 MR. GEOLY: Judge, just for you information purposes  
9 as we go forward tomorrow, this -- this is not some  
10 whodunit. I mean, I -- I -- I expect to probably stand  
11 up in my opening statement and say: "Listen, this is  
12 about, you know, malice aforethought and *mens rea* and  
13 Judge is going to tell you about *mens rea*. And, you  
14 know, I -- and -- and that's was this is going to be  
15 about. It's not going to be some whodunit. It's -- you  
16 know, hide the ball or somebody -- you know, some Plan B  
17 phantom defendant that, you know, isn't here."

18 THE COURT: All right.

19 MR. GEOLY: We're -- we're going to stand up,  
20 probably acknowledge that the death of a young man was  
21 the result of some actions and that we don't think it  
22 rises to murder because it lacks the -- the *mens rea* for  
23 what happened.

24 So it's very much going to be a nuanced case, not  
25 where we're trying to hide the ball, but it's going to be



1       there. I -- you know, our position is going to be their  
2       decision to -- to determine whether or not this was done  
3       with malice aforethought.

4           THE COURT: Okay. All right.

5           MR. GEOLY: Just to give you an idea of ---

6           MR. STUMBO: And -- and ---

7           MR. GEOLY: --- you know ---

8           MR. STUMBO: --- Judge ---

9           MR. GEOLY: --- what we're ---

10          MR. STUMBO: --- probably the only issue I could see  
11       with us: There -- there is a -- a hearsay statement that  
12       we believe may be an excited utterance or other reasons  
13       why it's admissible through a child in the case, when  
14       she's in the ER, one of the daughter -- the children who  
15       was in the car at the time of the shooting. That's  
16       something I think we can argue maybe *in limine* during the  
17       trial, instead of doing that alone.

18          THE COURT: Well, just -- just ---

19          MR. STUMBO: Well, we'll give you a heads-up ---

20          THE COURT: Yeah. Give me ---

21          MR. STUMBO: --- before ---

22          THE COURT: --- a heads-up ---

23          MR. STUMBO: --- it's coming.

24          THE COURT: --- if you want it.

25          MR. STUMBO: Yeah. Yes, sir.

1 THE COURT: Who -- who's in -- who's going to object  
2 to it, you think, the defense ---

3 MR. STUMBO: I --- I ---

4 THE COURT: --- or the state?

5 MR. STUMBO: --- would think Mr. Geoly would object  
6 to it ---

7 MR. GEOLY: Well, I -- I'm ---

8 THE COURT: Okay.

9 MR. GEOLY: --- not sure what ---

10 MR. STUMBO: --- you know. But ---

11 THE COURT: Okay.

12 MR. STUMBO: --- I -- I ---

13 MR. GEOLY: --- he's even ---

14 MR. STUMBO: --- he hasn't ---

15 MR. GEOLY: --- talking about.

16 MR. STUMBO: --- told me ---

17 MR. GEOLY: But ---

18 MR. STUMBO: --- that yet.

19 MR. GEOLY: --- if they're ---

20 MR. STUMBO: But ---

21 MR. GEOLY: --- talking about some statement that a  
22 3-year-old makes at the hospital that night, which is  
23 what I think he's getting into, certainly not going to be  
24 any -- I -- I don't know how they're ---

25 MR. STUMBO: Well, we ---

1 MR. GEOLY: --- going to ---

2 MR. STUMBO: --- could -- yes.

3 MR. GEOLY: --- portray it ---

4 MR. STUMBO: I think ---

5 MR. GEOLY: --- to excited utterance of my client.

6 But I'll -- I'll deal with it when he lets me know about  
7 it, Judge.

8 THE COURT: All right. Well, if -- so if it's  
9 something that you're going to get in, you think he might  
10 object to, let's go ahead and give him the heads-up, what  
11 it is ---

12 MR. STUMBO: Oh, yes ---

13 THE COURT: --- you're trying ---

14 MR. STUMBO: --- sir. I'll ---

15 THE COURT: --- to get ---

16 MR. STUMBO: --- do it ---

17 THE COURT: --- in. And ---

18 MR. STUMBO: --- tonight.

19 THE COURT: --- then, that'll ---

20 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

21 THE COURT: --- give you overnight. You can come  
22 back tomorrow morning. And if you want to address it  
23 before we even start anything, we'll do it ---

24 MR. STUMBO: Right.

25 THE COURT: --- then. Or if you want to wait until

1 the appropriate time, however you want to try your case.

2 MR. GEOLY: I'm ---

3 THE COURT: But let's ---

4 MR. GEOLY: --- I'm ---

5 THE COURT: --- go ahead and put him on notice what  
6 it is.

7 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

8 MR. GEOLY: I'm -- I'm ---

9 MR. STUMBO: We ---

10 MR. GEOLY: --- a go through ---

11 MR. STUMBO: --- we would ---

12 MR. GEOLY: --- those 176 exhibits first ---

13 THE COURT: Yeah.

14 MR. GEOLY: --- Judge. And then I'll get to that

15 ---

16 THE COURT: They ---

17 MR. GEOLY: --- right after.

18 MR. STUMBO: Well ---

19 MR. GEOLY: So ---

20 MR. STUMBO: --- and -- and ---

21 THE COURT: All right.

22 MR. STUMBO: --- to -- to be fair, I will say that  
23 the vast majority of those are photographs.

24 MR. GEOLY: Okay.

25 MR. STUMBO: So ---

1 THE COURT: Okay.

2 MR. GEOLY: Good.

3 THE COURT: All right.

4 MR. GEOLY: I'm glad to hear that.

5 THE COURT: Yeah.

6 MR. STUMBO: Judge, but I -- yes. We will give Your  
7 Honor a heads-up before we put the witness on the stand  
8 that would ---

9 THE COURT: Okay.

10 MR. STUMBO: --- elicit the -- the testimony.

11 THE COURT: All right.

12 MR. STUMBO: So we can put it before Your Honor; you  
13 can make a ruling on it. We'll know which direction to  
14 go.

15 THE COURT: All right. That sounds good.

16 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

17 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the defense  
18 before we recess?

19 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I -- I think you've pretty much  
20 got a good handle on it. If anything comes up, we'll  
21 handle, you know, real-time in the -- the courtroom.

22 The one thing I don't know yet, Judge, apparently,  
23 you're getting, I think, realtime, kind of like they do  
24 in federal court. I don't practice in federal court.  
25 But it's my understanding that the court reporter is

1 making available to us a unique kind of situation where,  
2 I think, she does a -- a transcript on -- on a realtime  
3 basis daily that you would get it.

4 It -- and we do want to take advantage of that and  
5 give her whatever funds I need to do to -- to make that.  
6 So I just want to make sure I -- I -- I'm effectually  
7 doing whatever we need to do to take advantage of that  
8 realtime court reporter.

9 THE COURT: All right. Can you produce a transcript  
10 like that or ---

11 THE COURT REPORTER: Yes, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: Okay. I mean ---

13 THE COURT REPORTER: I can produce ---

14 THE COURT: --- this is a new one for me too, so ---

15 THE COURT REPORTER: I can produce a rough draft  
16 right now of today's proceedings.

17 THE COURT: Okay. So whoever wants to take  
18 advantage of her capabilities and what she's willing to  
19 do, let's get with her before tomorrow morning ---

20 MR. GEOLY: Okay.

21 THE COURT: --- get whatever needs to be taken care  
22 of, taken care of so she knows what to expect and you  
23 know what you can get.

24 MR. STUMBO: I was just ---

25 MR. GEOLY: Thank you.

1 MR. STUMBO: --- reminded, Judge. One more thing,  
2 just the defendant's bond: He's been out on bond for  
3 about three weeks. He had been detained the rest of the  
4 time in this case. My practice, just as solicitor -- and  
5 this isn't anything personal with this defendant -- has  
6 always been that during the trial, bond is -- is  
7 suspended for the duration of the trial.

8 THE COURT: All right. Has there been any failures  
9 to appear or anything ---

10 MR. STUMBO: Well ---

11 THE COURT: --- of that nature?

12 MR. STUMBO: --- there hasn't been an opportunity,  
13 Judge. Today is the first time he has been ---

14 THE COURT: Okay.

15 MR. STUMBO: --- set to appear since he was released  
16 a few weeks ago.

17 THE COURT: What I typically do, we haven't taken  
18 any testimony; we haven't done anything. I will allow  
19 him to go home, come back tomorrow.

20 You need to let your client know, if he does not  
21 appear, the trial goes forward in his absence. All  
22 right?

23 MR. GEOLY: I've explained that him, Judge.

24 THE COURT: You understand that, Mr. Davis?

25 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

1           THE COURT: All right. The trial will go forward in  
2 your absence.

3           Now, I reserve the right to change my mind at any  
4 point in time.

5           MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

6           THE COURT: Okay?

7           MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

8           THE COURT: Typically, depending on what happens  
9 during the trial, we'll -- you know, I'll let him go  
10 home. If he doesn't come back, we'll continue with the  
11 trial. Something might happen during the trial that  
12 might make me change my mind. I don't know that.

13           Typically, also, once we've completed all testimony  
14 and all evidentiary portions, if the jury is still  
15 deliberating or has not begun deliberations, then I  
16 generally do hold the defendant then. Because -- there's  
17 nothing else to be presented. So a lot of times, say, if  
18 we finish the -- the testimony and the evidence but we're  
19 going to wait until tomorrow to do the closing arguments,  
20 jury charges, and things of that nature, a lot of times,  
21 I will go ahead and hold him then, just simply because  
22 there's nothing left ---

23           MR. GEOLY: Judge, he -- this is very much a -- a  
24 family-oriented group.

25           THE COURT: All right.



1 MR. GEOLY: At the bond hearings, you know, that  
2 we've had -- there were several before bond eventually,  
3 you know, got put off, that if it doesn't get tried by  
4 this date, then, you know, we'll set a bond. But that's  
5 how he came to -- to making bond just, as they said,  
6 about three to four weeks ago. He's had no problems  
7 since then, Judge.

8 If you'll see right behind him, this is his  
9 grandmother and grandfather. Well, he's staying at their  
10 house. He has an ankle monitor. So, I mean, I'll  
11 address all that with you at the time. But I don't ---

12 THE COURT: Okay.

13 MR. GEOLY: --- I certainly don't expect a problem.

14 He's been a great client; done everything I've asked  
15 of him. And even since he's been out, every time I tell  
16 him to come to my office, he does. If I say, "Hey, I'm  
17 coming your way; meet me in such and such" ---

18 THE COURT: All right.

19 MR. GEOLY: And -- and I don't think that you're  
20 going to have anybody from the victim's family ---

21 THE COURT: Well, we'll go ahead and we'll -- I'll  
22 let him -- let him go home this evening. Keep the ankle  
23 monitor in place.

24 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

25 THE COURT: And we'll ---

1 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

2 THE COURT: --- proceed that way. But ---

3 MR. GEOLY: I understand ---

4 THE COURT: --- because I've ---

5 MR. GEOLY: --- your ruling.

6 THE COURT: --- had this happen before, I can change  
7 my mind at any time.

8 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

9 THE COURT: Okay?

10 MR. GEOLY: He understands that too, Judge.

11 THE COURT: All right.

12 MR. STUMBO: And -- and we ---

13 MR. GEOLY: Thank you.

14 MR. STUMBO: --- would ask, obviously, no contact  
15 tonight with any of the witnesses or victims ---

16 THE COURT: Yeah. No ---

17 MR. STUMBO: --- in the case.

18 THE COURT: --- contact with any -- are there any  
19 codefendants or anything?

20 MR. GEOLY: No ---

21 THE COURT: Okay.

22 MR. STUMBO: No, sir.

23 MR. GEOLY: --- codefendants, Judge. But -- but ---

24 MR. STUMBO: No, sir.

25 MR. GEOLY: --- I will ---

1 THE COURT: All right.

2 MR. GEOLY: --- let Your Honor know: His wife is  
3 the alleged victim. I mean, her -- you know, I -- we'll  
4 get into the name stuff, I guess, tomorrow. But this  
5 Indigo is actually Indigo Davis, who's been married to  
6 him for a couple years. They have three children  
7 together: two that were alive when this happened. She  
8 was actually pregnant when this occurred.

9 THE COURT: But, I mean, are they in contact with  
10 each ---

11 MR. GEOLY: They are.

12 THE COURT: --- other now?

13 MR. GEOLY: She -- she talks to him daily, I think.  
14 It -- there is not -- there wasn't a prohibition of it.  
15 It's -- I think she's talked to him. I think she saw  
16 him, you know, at -- at a -- like, out and about.

17 I -- so it -- there has been contact. She does call  
18 him. I think she'll probably expect to call him today.  
19 So we certainly will follow the Court's guidance. But  
20 there wasn't anything I -- in my knowledge to -- that  
21 prohibited that in the -- the order.

22 MR. STUMBO: What -- do you have Judge Addy's order?

23 MR. GEOLY: Yeah.

24 MR. STUMBO: Okay. I -- I thought it had a no-  
25 contact in it. But I can ---

1 MR. GEOLY: Well, I'll ---  
2 MR. STUMBO: --- pull it.  
3 MR. GEOLY: --- I'll double-check it. But ---  
4 THE COURT: Well, check ---  
5 MR. GEOLY: --- and again ---  
6 THE COURT: --- what it ---  
7 MR. GEOLY: --- it's not ---  
8 THE COURT: --- even though ---  
9 MR. GEOLY: --- him going ---  
10 THE COURT: --- though the ---  
11 MR. GEOLY: --- to her.  
12 THE COURT: --- bond is not in place now, whatever  
13 conditions were there ---  
14 MR. GEOLY: Right.  
15 THE COURT: --- let's leave the conditions there.  
16 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.  
17 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.  
18 THE COURT: That just means that the bondsman's ---  
19 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.  
20 THE COURT: --- now off the bond. Okay?  
21 MR. GEOLY: Okay.  
22 THE COURT: All right. All right. Anything else?  
23 MR. GEOLY: No, sir.  
24 MR. STUMBO: Nothing from the state, Judge.  
25 THE COURT: Y'all get with the clerk, whatever y'all

1 need to do as far as getting the courtroom arranged to a  
2 way that is satisfactory with everybody, okay?

3 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

4 MR. STUMBO: I think we are going to use the witness  
5 stand here. And Mr. Daniel and I are going to move to  
6 this table. We're going to move Mr. Geoly here so he can  
7 see the witness and all the jurors and ---

8 THE COURT: Okay. Well, however -- y'all get it  
9 worked out and I can ---

10 MR. STUMBO:

11 THE COURT: --- work with whatever y'all -- y'all  
12 choose to do, okay?

13 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

14 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

15 THE COURT: All right.

16 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

17 MR. STUMBO: Thank you, Judge.

18 THE COURT: All right. Thank y'all. We'll be in  
19 recess until 9:30 tomorrow morning.

20 (Whereupon, the proceeding adjourned at 4:03 p.m.)

21 (Whereupon, State's Exhibits 1 through 172 were  
22 marked for identification while off the record.)  
23  
24  
25

1 TRIAL DAY 2 - 08/24/21

2 (Whereupon, the proceeding resumed at 9:42 a.m.)

3 THE COURT: All right. First thing we need to  
4 address is the clerk of court got a call this morning.  
5 Juror No. 31, Vanessa L. Matthews, she has a coworker who  
6 she was around last week or Sunday or sometime. The  
7 coworker started feeling bad. She called in this morning  
8 and said the coworker tested positive for COVID  
9 yesterday.

10 She says she's been vaccinated. She doesn't have  
11 any of the symptoms. However, she said, with the  
12 questioning, she has now been in contact with someone  
13 even though the person hadn't tested positive when we  
14 qualified the jury. She was in contact with somebody who  
15 has now tested positive for COVID.

16 My suggestion, unless there's a strenuous objection  
17 from someone, is to go ahead and excuse her and seat one  
18 of the alternates. She's on standby. She's not here.  
19 She said, "I didn't want to come in, having been around  
20 somebody who now has tested positive for COVID." And we  
21 told her just stick by the phone; we'll let her know.

22 What's the state's position?

23 MR STUMBO: We don't have any objection to just  
24 seating the alternate, Judge. I mean ---

25 THE COURT: All right.

1 MR. STUMBO: --- that's why we have them.

2 THE COURT: All right. As I understand in general  
3 sessions, unlike common pleas, you have the two  
4 alternates; they'll be put -- names put in a cup.  
5 Somebody will draw the name, and that'll be it. You  
6 don't necessarily go to the first one and the second one.

7 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I apologize. Could you give me  
8 the name again of the juror we're discussing?

9 THE COURT: The juror was Juror No. 31, Vanessa L.  
10 Matthews. She's No. 2 on the jury strike sheet.

11 MR GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence, just a  
12 moment.

13 THE COURT: That's fine.

14 MR GEOLY: I got -- got all these different lists,  
15 Judge, if you . . .

16 (Off the record briefly.)

17 MR GEOLY: Judge, am I right in that she is not  
18 feeling any symptoms and ---

19 THE COURT: She said she's been vaccinated; she does  
20 not feel any symptoms; but she has been in contact with  
21 somebody who has tested positive as of yesterday for  
22 COVID. It was a coworker.

23 MR GEOLY: Judge, as you know, I had a issue with  
24 the jury yesterday. I -- I felt good with our jury as  
25 impaneled, so I withdraw all of that. And -- and I feel

1 good with the -- the jurors we have.

2 If -- if she's got no ill effects whatsoever, I'd  
3 ask that we proceed as -- as we are. I'm certainly not  
4 to the point ---

5 THE COURT: All right.

6 MR. GEOLY: --- I would ---

7 THE COURT: That's fine.

8 MR. GEOLY: --- object to ---

9 THE COURT: That's fine. All right. Let's call Ms.  
10 Matthews; tell her to go ahead and get here. We'll wait  
11 for her to get here.

12 CLERK OF COURT: Yes, sir.

13 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir, Your Honor.

14 (Off the record briefly.)

15 THE COURT: All right. While we're waiting on her,  
16 anything we need to address from the state before we get  
17 started?

18 MR STUMBO: It may give us a -- a moment, Judge ---

19 MR. GEOLY: I'll look ---

20 MR. STUMBO: --- to take ---

21 MR. GEOLY: --- right now.

22 MR. STUMBO: --- a look at these exhibits and ---

23 MR GEOLY: Yes, sir. I'll be ---

24 MR. STUMBO: --- we'll -- we'll ---

25 MR. GEOLY: --- looking ---



1 MR. STUMBO: --- know what ---

2 MR. GEOLY: --- right now ---

3 MR. STUMBO: --- at's -- at ---

4 MR. GEOLY: I -- I feel ---

5 MR. STUMBO: --- issue.

6 MR. GEOLY: --- like we -- we're -- we're good with  
7 most of it, Your Honor, just a couple ---

8 THE COURT: All right.

9 (Off the record briefly.)

10 MR STUMBO: Yeah. Judge, this may be felt helpful  
11 so as we don't have to pass stuff up for you to look at.  
12 But we have all the exhibits -- Taylor ---

13 MR GEOLY: I -- I have ---

14 MR. STUMBO: --- has them ---

15 MR. GEOLY: --- no objection ---

16 MR. STUMBO: --- on the ---

17 MR. GEOLY: --- to you looking at ---

18 MR. STUMBO: --- thumb ---

19 MR. GEOLY: --- them, Judge.

20 MR. STUMBO: --- thumb drive.

21 THE COURT: Well, I mean ---

22 MR. GEOLY: It's only ---

23 THE COURT: --- if I can -- I just didn't want to  
24 download them onto my computer. If I could just view  
25 them through the flash drive, we can do that.

1 MR. STUMBO: That -- that's fine.

2 MR. GEOLY: Certainly.

3 THE COURT: Okay.

4 MR. DANIEL: Yes, sir.

5 MR STUMBO: I think, as -- as long as you just --  
6 you can pull up, you know your files ---

7 THE COURT: Yeah.

8 MR STUMBO: --- up on the computer. You don't have  
9 to download them to view it.

10 THE COURT: All right.

11 MR. STUMBO: You can just look at them through the  
12 flash drive.

13 (The Court went off the record at 9:47 a.m.)

14 (The Court went on the record at 9:52 a.m.)

15 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state  
16 before we bring the jury in?

17 MR STUMBO: We're ready.

18 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the defense?

19 MR GEOLY: No, sir, Your Honor.

20 THE COURT: All right.

21 (Off the record briefly.)

22 THE COURT: All right. We'll bring the jury in.  
23 I'll let the clerk swear the jury. I'll do opening  
24 charges, opening statements, and then -- then we'll  
25 proceed. Okay?

1 MR STUMBO: Yes, sir.

2 (Off the record briefly.)

3 (Whereupon, the jury entered the courtroom at  
4 9:55 a.m.)

5 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen,  
6 welcome back. Hope everybody had a good evening. We're  
7 getting ready to start the trial of this case.

8 First of all, I want to thank you for being prompt  
9 and returning on time. I apologize for keeping you in  
10 the jury room as long as we did. But there are some  
11 things that we had to tend to. Again, thank you for  
12 being prompt.

13 I remind you, if you inadvertently brought any cell  
14 phones or pager devices into the courtroom, make sure you  
15 turn them off completely at this time.

16 As I said, we're getting ready to start the trial of  
17 this case. But just like I told you in qualifications  
18 and during *voir dire*, jurors, just like witnesses,  
19 constantly take oaths. So I'll need all members of the  
20 jury to jury to please stand and raise your right hand  
21 while the clerk of court administers the oath for you to  
22 serve as jurors on this particular case.

23 (Whereupon, the trial jury was duly sworn at 9:57  
24 a.m.)

25 THE COURT: Thank you very much. Please be seated.

1 JURORS: (Complied.)

2 THE COURT: Excuse me. Now, is there any member the  
3 jury that did not respond to the oath by saying "I will"?  
4 If so, please stand.

5 (Whereupon, no juror stood.)

6 THE COURT: Very well. Also, as another  
7 housekeeping matter, we have put some hand sanitizers on  
8 the rails there. Because I don't know whether you'll be  
9 actually physically touching any exhibits or not.  
10 Sometimes in trials you do; sometimes you don't.

11 But you're at liberty to get any hand sanitizer  
12 whenever you want. They are there for you. So it makes  
13 you feel more comfortable or whenever you want to use  
14 some, just grab some hand sanitizer and that won't be a  
15 problem.

16 INTRODUCTION BY THE COURT

17 Now, we're getting ready to start the trial of the  
18 case the *State of South Carolina v. Xzavier Sharif Davis*.  
19 Now, before we begin the trial, I want to tell you that  
20 the trial will probably be a little bit different than  
21 what you're accustomed to. When you watch movies, TV  
22 shows, read books, trials are often full of a lot of  
23 suspense, a lot of action.

24 While that might be the case in this trial, it  
25 probably won't be. In reality, trials are often slow,

1 deliberate, repetitive processes, the exact opposite of  
2 what you might be accustomed to when you watch trials for  
3 entertainment purposes or read about trials for  
4 entertainment purposes. But I hope you do find the trial  
5 entertaining. I hope you find it educational. And I  
6 want to thank you from the outset for serving as jurors  
7 in this case.

8 The attorneys appearing before you are advocates for  
9 the parties they represent. But first and foremost, they  
10 are officers of the Court. They are sworn to uphold the  
11 integrity and the fairness of our judicial system and to  
12 help you in a search for the truth. You should expect  
13 them to be professional, competent, and ethical in the  
14 representation of their clients' interests.

15 Now, what I now say is intended to serve as an  
16 introduction to the trial of this case. These remarks  
17 are not a charge on the law this case. I will instruct  
18 you on the law applicable to this case at the end of the  
19 trial before you retire to consider your verdict. This  
20 is merely an explanation of the procedure that we will  
21 follow in the trial of this case so that you may better  
22 understand what is happening.

23 Now, the defendant is charged by indictments filed  
24 in this Court with the crime of murder, attempted murder,  
25 and possession of a weapon during the commission of a

1 violent crime. These are the indictments. And I'll  
2 explain the elements of those crimes to you at a later  
3 time. Excuse me one second.

4 (Off the record briefly.)

5 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen, I  
6 understand someone needs to use the restroom. We're  
7 going to excuse to the jury room. We'll bring you back  
8 out just a minute, okay?

9 THE COURT: All right. Let's excuse them to the  
10 jury room.

11 (Whereupon, the jury exited the courtroom at  
12 10:00 a.m.)

13 (Off the record briefly.)

14 THE COURT: All right. I apologize. The bailiff  
15 just came and told the clerk of court that one of the  
16 jurors, on the way in, said she had to use the restroom.  
17 Why they went ahead and brought them in, I don't know.  
18 But I don't want anybody sitting up there, having to use  
19 the restroom and not paying attention to what's going on.

20 (The Court went off the record at 10:01 a.m.)

21 (The Court went on the record at 10:09 a.m.)

22 THE COURT: All right. Let's go ahead bring them  
23 back in.

24 (Whereupon, the jury entered the courtroom at  
25 10:10 a.m.)

1           THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen,  
2 welcome back. I'll continue with my opening remarks.

3           As I told you before we broke, this is not a charge  
4 on the law. I'll instruct you on the applicable to this  
5 case at the end of the trial before you return to  
6 consider your verdict. This is just an explanation of  
7 the procedure that we will follow in the trial of this  
8 case so that you may better understand what is happening.

9           Now, as I was telling you before we took our break,  
10 the defendant has been charged by indictments. These  
11 indictments charge the defendant with murder, attempted  
12 murder, and possession of a weapon during the commission  
13 of a violent crime. I'll explain the elements of those  
14 crimes to you at a later time when I charge you with the  
15 law to be applied in this case.

16           Now, these indictments are simply the charges by  
17 which this case is brought into this Court. They are  
18 not, in any sense, evidence of any of the allegations  
19 contained in them. The defendant has pled not guilty to  
20 these indictments. The state, therefore, has the burden  
21 of proving each of the elements of all indictments beyond  
22 a reasonable doubt. It will be your duty, ladies and  
23 gentlemen, to decide whether or not the state has met  
24 that burden.

25           Your purpose as jurors is to find and determine the

1 facts of this case. You are the sole judge of facts of  
2 this case. If, at any time, I make any comment regarding  
3 the facts of this case, you must disregard my comments.  
4 You are to determine the facts from the testimony you  
5 hear and the other evidence introduced during the trial  
6 of this case.

7 It is up to you to determine the inferences which  
8 you feel may properly be drawn from that evidence. It's  
9 especially important that you perform your duty of  
10 determining the facts diligently and conscientiously,  
11 because ordinarily, there is no way to correct an  
12 erroneous determination of the facts by a jury.

13 Now, on the other hand and with equal emphasis, the  
14 same law that makes you the judge of the facts makes me  
15 the judge of the law. The law as given to you by the  
16 Court is the only law that you may consider. You must  
17 accept and follow the law as I give it to you, even  
18 though you may disagree with it.

19 Just as I cannot tell you what the facts of this  
20 case are, you cannot disagree with me about the law to be  
21 applied in this case. Your job is to take the law as I  
22 give it to you and to apply it to the facts as you find  
23 those facts to be from the testimony of the witnesses and  
24 any other evidence that is introduced during the trial  
25 this case. After doing that, you will render your



1 verdict, a true and just verdict under the solemn oath  
2 that you just took as jurors.

3 Now, until I advise you to begin your deliberations,  
4 you must not discuss this case with anyone, including  
5 your fellow jurors. Don't discuss it with any friends,  
6 family members, or anyone involved in the case. After  
7 the case is submitted to you, you can then discuss the  
8 case, but only in the jury room with your fellow jurors.

9 The attorneys and parties in the case have been  
10 advised that they are not to talk to you at all about the  
11 case, so they're not being rude. They're just follow the  
12 instructions of the Court.

13 Now, during the trial you're not to read or listen  
14 to or watch any news reports about the case. This  
15 includes anything that may be in the newspaper, on the  
16 Internet, radio, or television. You must not consider  
17 anything you may have read or heard about the case  
18 outside of the courtroom, whether that be before or  
19 during the trial of this case.

20 It's important that you keep an open mind and not  
21 decide any issue in this case until all of the evidence  
22 has been presented, the parties have made their closing  
23 arguments, and I have instructed you on the law to be  
24 applied in this case.

25 It is your solemn responsibility to determine the

1       guilt or innocence of the defendant. And your verdict  
2       must be based solely on the evidence as it is presented  
3       to you in this trial and on the law as I instruct you  
4       during and at the close of the trial.

5               Now, in just a moment, the solicitor will make what  
6       is called an opening statement in which the solicitor  
7       will explain to you the issues in this case or at least  
8       what the solicitor thinks the issues in this case are.  
9       The attorney for the defendant may also make an opening  
10      statement, although he is not required to do so.

11             What the attorneys tell you during their opening  
12      statements is not evidence in this case. It is only  
13      their contention as to what they feel the issues in this  
14      case are. The evidence in this case will be presented to  
15      you by testimony of sworn witnesses from the witness  
16      stand and any other exhibits that may be introduced into  
17      evidence.

18             Now, in determining what the true facts are in this  
19      case, you must decide whether or not the testimony of the  
20      witnesses are believable. It is my responsibility to  
21      rule as a matter of law as to whether or not certain  
22      testimony is admissible at all or not. However, once the  
23      testimony is admitted into evidence, whether or not you  
24      believe it is solely for you to determine.

25             In deciding whether to believe a witness, you have

1 the right to consider the interest of any witness, the  
2 bias of any witness, the prejudice of any witness, the  
3 opportunity for the witness to have seen the matters and  
4 things about which the witness may testify, and the way  
5 the witness acts on the witness stand. You have the  
6 right to consider anything that is in the record that  
7 will help you evaluate the testimony of the witnesses.

8 That means that it is your duty to pay close  
9 attention to these witnesses, to observe the witnesses,  
10 to listen to the witnesses, and to pay close attention to  
11 the attorneys and to the Court. Don't let your thoughts  
12 wander, but give strict attention to the testimony in  
13 this case so that at the end of all of the testimony,  
14 after arguments of counsel and a charge on the law by the  
15 Court -- excuse me -- Court, you will then be in a  
16 position to determine what the true facts are and to  
17 apply the law to those facts and thus render a true and  
18 just verdict.

19 Now, are there any additional charges or  
20 challengings -- challenges to the opening charges by the  
21 state?

22 MR STUMBO: None from the state, Judge.

23 THE COURT: Any by the defense?

24 MR GEOLY: None from the defendant, Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen, we

1 will now begin the trial this case with the attorneys'  
2 opening statements. And as I told you during these  
3 charges, these opening statements are not evidence in  
4 this case. It is simply the attorneys' contention as to  
5 what they think the issues in this case are and the law  
6 to be applied.

7 All right. Mr. Stumbo?

8 MR STUMBO: Mr. Daniel, Your Honor, is going to  
9 deliver the opening for ---

10 THE COURT: That'll be fine.

11 MR. STUMBO: --- for the state. Yes, sir.

12 THE COURT: All right, sir.

13 MR DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor. May it please  
14 the Court?

15 THE COURT: Yes, sir.

16 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. DANIEL

17 MR DANIEL: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen, Mr.  
18 Foreman. I'm Taylor Daniel; I'm assistant solicitor in  
19 Newberry. And I work for your elected solicitor, David  
20 Stumbo, who I'm trying the case with.

21 And it's our job

22 -- we represent the State of South Carolina in these  
23 proceedings. And it's -- it's our job to attempts to  
24 attempt to secure a conviction against Xzavier Davis, who  
25 stands before you on trial, charged with three offenses:

1 the murder of Iven Caldwell, 7-year-old -- and Iven  
2 Caldwell was the stepson of this defendant, Xzavier Davis  
3 -- also, the attempted murder of Indigo Penny. That's  
4 Mr. Davis's wife. And then, lastly, the third charge is  
5 possession of a firearm during the commission of a  
6 violent crime.

7 And these three charges stem from April 20th, 2019,  
8 incident that took place early-morning hours, still dark,  
9 Saturday morning, [REDACTED]. And this is in the  
10 Helena section of Newberry County, just outside the city  
11 limits of Newberry: Drayton Street/Brown Chapel Road  
12 area, just a few miles from the courthouse.

13 And I want to apologize to you for having to expose  
14 y'all to the facts of this case, because the facts are  
15 grim. Anytime is a murder case, it's going to be  
16 difficult. Someone's life has been taken. But in this  
17 case, we're dealing with life of a child.

18 And so this is not your occupation. This is not  
19 your job. It's my job to be here. It's Solicitor  
20 Stumbo's job to be here. Mr. Geoly, the defense  
21 attorney, it's his job to be here. His Honor's job to be  
22 here -- we're all getting paid. We're all on the clock,  
23 so to speak.

24 You guys aren't the clock. You're not getting paid  
25 in the traditional sense for your jury service. You

1        didn't volunteer for this. You didn't ask for this.

2            You were drafted. You're here out of a sense of  
3        civic duty. You answered the call. You got that summons  
4        in the mail. You guys reported to the courthouse.

5            And your presence is necessary for our criminal  
6        justice system. Because under the Constitution, state  
7        and federal Constitution, anytime someone is charged with  
8        a serious crime such as murder, they have a right to  
9        enter a plea of not guilty and demand to be tried by a  
10       jury of their peers. That's residents of Newberry  
11       County; that's you guys.

12           Only you guys can pass judgment on this case.  
13        Issues of fact are for the jury. That means guilt or  
14        innocence. It's going to be your call. And I know it's  
15        unfair. You're thrust into this position. You didn't  
16        ask for this. You did not ask this.

17           And I know it's a tall order. It's asking a lot.  
18        But again, our system, our criminal justice system  
19        demands that we resolve this case by means of a jury  
20        trial.

21           His Honor has nothing to do with y'all's verdict.  
22        That is entirely your call. And it's an enormous  
23        responsibility. And you're to apply the law to the  
24        facts.

25           But again, we're not asking you to be robotic.

1 There's not a sign at the courthouse that says: "Check  
2 your humanity at the door."

3 We know a 7-year-old was killed. That's undisputed.  
4 Shot in the head at the hands of his stepfather. There's  
5 no way around it. It is difficult. But it's part of  
6 what we do is, to go back, look at the facts, and for you  
7 guys to make that call. And I submit to you, the  
8 evidence is compelling and overwhelming by any objective  
9 measure. This is a strong case suggesting that Mr. Davis  
10 is guilty of all charges. I'll say that from the outset.

11 But it's our process that he gets to have a jury of  
12 his peers actually make that call. So I can say he's  
13 guilty till he's blue in the face. My opinion doesn't  
14 matter. All I can do is present the case from my  
15 respective position.

16 So there's no hope for a better yesterday. We can't  
17 bring Iven back to life, obviously. But what we can do  
18 is have a sense of justice.

19 But before you can do that, there is a process of  
20 fairness. And I want to be fair to Mr. Davis; I do. He  
21 has his day in court; he's getting it. He's allowed to  
22 present a defense if he so chooses. But ultimately, the  
23 burden is on the state to prove every element of the  
24 offense -- the offenses with proof beyond a reasonable  
25 doubt.

1           So what are you doing here? You're answering one  
2 question: Are all of you firmly convinced that Mr. Davis  
3 is guilty of those three crimes that he's charged with?  
4 You're to answer that one question. So if you find  
5 yourself intimidated by your surroundings, go back to  
6 that one question.

7           All this is for your benefit. All the testimony  
8 from the witness box, all the exhibits, it's all to help  
9 paint a picture of what transpired on that fateful early-  
10 morning hours of April 20th, 2019, over two years ago.

11           So I'll briefly just go over the facts of the case,  
12 just a -- kind of a -- a blueprint, road map of the case.  
13 April 20th, 2019, Mr. Davis lives at [REDACTED].  
14 His stepson, Iven Caldwell; his wife, Indigo Penny; and  
15 then, they have two children together as well at the  
16 time: a Penelope Davis, 3-year-old; and Xzavier Davis,  
17 Jr. He was an infant. I think he was about nine months  
18 old at the time.

19           So all four of them -- or excuse me -- all five of  
20 them lived at this trailer on [REDACTED] together.  
21 And that weekend, Mr. Davis had been out at a social  
22 gathering, really, that Friday night, April 19th, and  
23 didn't come home until the early-morning hours of April  
24 20th. And this is probably 2:30 a.m./3 a.m., that kind  
25 of time, on April 20th.



1           So at that point, Indigo, she's with her kids.  
2       She's with her three children. She has the doors locked  
3       at that point. And Mr. Davis, when he comes home from  
4       this social gathering he was at, he's knocking on the  
5       door. She can't -- she won't let him in; he can't get  
6       in, for whatever reason.

7           She's mad at him, clearly. He'd been out too long,  
8       been drinking, things of that nature. Will not let him  
9       in. Eventually, Mr. Davis had to break the glass window  
10      of the front door to gain entry into the house.

11          So at that point, as you can imagine, an argument  
12      ensues, a -- a very tense argument. Indigo Penny, as any  
13      mother would, at this point, once things become heated,  
14      at some point she makes the decision to take her children  
15      -- Iven, 7 years old; Penelope, 3 years old; and Xzavier,  
16      Jr., 9 months old -- she makes the decision to get all  
17      three of them, put them in the car, and -- and vacate the  
18      premises, just leave, get away from this man. He's  
19      broken the window.

20          At that point, in the process of getting the  
21      children to flee from the scene to avoid this  
22      confrontation with her and her husband, that's when he  
23      pulls out a firearm, brandishes a firearm -- and she'll  
24      describe that when she testifies, Indigo will. And once  
25      the kids are in the car, she is backing out to -- to

1       leave. He opens fire.

2               And it's a 9-millimeter pistol. Empties that  
3       9-millimeter pistol, all eight bullets. That's the  
4       capacity of this gun. Empties that 9-millimeter pistol  
5       in that car with four souls in that car: his own  
6       children, his stepson, his wife. Empties that  
7       9-millimeter pistol into that car.

8               And I said it had eight bullets. Six of the eight,  
9       as we'll show you with the physical evidence, strikes the  
10      vehicle. It's a 2001 Toyota Camry.

11              And Indigo, his wife, she's hit in the left-lower  
12      leg/ankle area. At then, the kill shot to 7-year-old  
13      Iven hits him right in the head, just above his left ear.  
14      And ultimately, the bullet nearly comes out the other  
15      side of his head, just to give you an idea of the  
16      velocity of the shot.

17              And when the crime scene is processed at [REDACTED]  
18      [REDACTED], you'll see the shell casings, eight shell casings  
19      for an eight-round gun. Six bullets holes -- or excuse  
20      me -- six -- I'll call them bullet defects -- three of  
21      them of them penetrating bullet defects, so three holes  
22      in the car. But ultimately, six -- six bullet defects in  
23      the car. You'll see photographs of that as well.

24              And we'll be able to match it to the gun. At the  
25      autopsy they -- they pull out the -- the -- the fired

1 bullet; send it to South Carolina Law Enforcement  
2 Division for forensic testing. It matches the  
3 9-millimeter gun. But Ms. -- Ms. Penny, she was able to  
4 flee, even though she's hit the left ankle. She is able  
5 to go to the hospital, which is a few miles away to the  
6 ER, drive herself there.

7 And it's really not -- not until she actually pulls  
8 into the possible hospital that the gravity of the  
9 situation comes to full realization. She's struck by a  
10 bullet. Her son's fatally wounded in the head. And on  
11 April 22nd, he -- he's actually -- Iven is officially  
12 pronounced dead at that point. No brain activity, but he  
13 died of a fatal gunshot wound to the head.

14 And I -- I wish I could tell you that there was more  
15 to it than that. I mean, it -- it's -- it's an  
16 unspeakable crime. I -- it's just a good thing we don't  
17 have to prove why somebody does something. We don't have  
18 to prove motive. Because there can never be any motive  
19 for why somebody would empty a pistol into a car full of  
20 kids and their wife. So the facts are very grim, and --  
21 and -- and we understand that.

22 But that's the nature of the case. I don't know  
23 what, if anything, Mr. Geoly will say in terms of his  
24 state of mind, his client. He -- again, he doesn't have  
25 to. It's our case to prove.

1           But I think a big part of this trial will come down  
2 to intent, criminal intent. And one thing you have to  
3 realize: It's clear that the two of them, Ms. Indigo  
4 Penny had her husband, had argued prior to this incident.  
5 They had a argument.

6           And as you'll see from the diagram of the car that  
7 was struck by bullets, most of the bullets are centered  
8 at the driver door. And Ms. Penny was the driver the car  
9 when she's attempting to flee. But there was that one  
10 fatal bullet that struck Iven towards the backseat area,  
11 the driver-side backseat area. And we'll will talk about  
12 the positioning of everybody.

13           But all three kids were in the backseat of that car.  
14 And -- and we'll show you the trajectory, the flight  
15 path, of this bullet. And all these kids were in harm's  
16 way. Iven just happened to be in the middle of the  
17 backseat and the tallest kid and catches a bullet in the  
18 head.

19           And do we think that he had the specific intent to  
20 kill Iven? Well, when someone empties a pistol into a  
21 car, what can you say to their intent? Because at that  
22 point, a bullet has no name. And he showed, by his  
23 actions, his conduct, he consciously disregarded a risk  
24 to human life here.

25           He demonstrated what we used to call in law school

1       -- I first learned about malice. And that's the  
2       operative word, malice. If someone acts with an extreme  
3       indifference to the value of human life by doing  
4       something so dangerous that it just shows a total  
5       disregard for human life, that's malice. And I think, at  
6       a minimum, his actions demonstrate that. And that'll be  
7       a big part of this trial.

8               Whether it's claimed that he had no intent to kill  
9       Iven, it's irrelevant. You know, Oktoberfest, they close  
10      down Main Street, crowd of people. If you had somebody  
11      during Oktoberfest drive their car down Main Street going  
12      a hundred miles an hour, hit multiple people, and die,  
13      the -- the -- awful scene, right, in this hypothetical --  
14      and they were to say that -- the driver of that car to  
15      say, "Well, I was just trying to get from Point A to  
16      Point B; I had no intent to kill anybody," would that not  
17      just an absurd position? Indeed it would.

18             And -- and that is the proposition here: criminal  
19      intent. Why else would you empty a pistol into a car  
20      full of children and your wife?

21             And that's the issue that's going to be litigated.  
22      And I think -- I've -- I've kind of crystallized and  
23      pinpointed some the issues at play here. But again,  
24      those are issues that we have to prove.

25             We have quite a few exhibits to show you because

1       there -- there's two different scenes, essentially: one  
2       scene at the house; and then, the car at the hospital.  
3       So there's -- there's two phases in this investigation.  
4       But we have a story to tell. And think it's important  
5       that we do it methodically and do it with respect,  
6       because this is at the top of the food chain, this kind  
7       of case. This is the most serious crime we deal with,  
8       clearly.

9               And so we're -- we're leaving no stone unturned.  
10       We're not getting into the -- to the specific dynamics of  
11       their relationship. It's clear there was an argument  
12       that happened night, and that's what precipitated these  
13       events.

14              But ultimately, it'll be your call, once the judge  
15       explains the law to you. And all we ask is that you  
16       render a verdict that's consistent with the evidence and  
17       speaks the truth. And I submit to you, it'll be a  
18       verdict of guilty. And it is the verdict that makes  
19       sense and that is logical.

20              And we look forward to -- to presenting this case to  
21       you. Thank you.

22              THE COURT: All right. Mr. Geoly, does the defense  
23       wish make an opening statement?

24              MR GEOLY: We do, Your Honor.

25              THE COURT: All right.

1 MR GEOLY: Please the Court, Judge?

2 THE COURT: Yes, sir.

3 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. GEOLY

4 MR GEOLY: Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, my name  
5 is Stephen Geoly. I'm a defense attorney. This is what  
6 I do for a living. I've been doing it for about 26 years  
7 now.

8 And this brings back a lot of memories. I -- I cut  
9 my teeth in this courtroom 26 years ago. Miss -- Miss --  
10 your -- your clerk of court was a -- I think a deputy  
11 clerk back then. Might not have been a deputy yet.

12 But right out of law school, I actually worked for  
13 Townes Jones, who was the solicitor here a couple of  
14 solicitors ago. And this is where I came. I would drive  
15 from Greenwood and I'd come over here and kind of do what  
16 Taylor's doing for Solicitor Stumbo.

17 It's been a long time getting back here. I -- 26  
18 years, I've been running a law practice over in  
19 Greenwood. And I -- I try all kinds of cases.

20 The eighth circuit, which is what Newberry is part  
21 of, the Eighth Judicial Circuit, is part of a four-county  
22 circuit. It's Greenwood, Newberry, Laurens, and  
23 Abbeville. A lot of you probably know that; some of you  
24 maybe didn't. I -- I don't think I realized that, you  
25 know, till I got out of law school.

1 But since leaving the solicitor's office 25 or so  
2 years ago and opening my own practice, I've tried murders  
3 and attempted murders in every -- every county in this  
4 circuit, but here. I have a lot of respect for -- for  
5 Newberry County. You have a top-notch sheriff. Lee  
6 Foster is as good as they come. I think he might be the  
7 longest-serving sheriff in the of South Carolina at this  
8 point.

9 And he does a good job of representing the people of  
10 Newberry County. They make good cases is here. It's  
11 probably why I don't come back a whole lot. You know,  
12 the officers here work hard at what they do. They take  
13 pride in it.

14 But here -- the solicitor just told you, "We're  
15 going to attempt to secure in this courtroom a verdict."  
16 And then he tried to guess, kind of, what I'm going to  
17 do.

18 Well, I -- I'm a tell you, this is different than  
19 any case I've ever tried. This is not, you know, sadly  
20 for y'all, some, you know, big entertaining thing that  
21 you're going to come to court and it's going be some some  
22 big whodunit. This is a tragedy on all counts. He's  
23 right about that; it's a tragedy at all levels.

24 But what they have my client charged with -- and --  
25 and -- and let me back up a couple steps. I apologize.



1 I'd like to introduce to you, this is Ellie. She just  
2 graduated college. She's helping me as a paralegal.  
3 She'll be here and you'll see her this week kind of  
4 trying to help me with videos and keep up with, you know  
5 -- the solicitor's told you, he's got a lot of exhibits.

6 And we're both here on behalf of Xzavier Davis.  
7 This is Xzavier Davis, my client. He's Indigo's husband.  
8 There's going to be some confusion maybe a little bit  
9 about Indigo Penny. But -- but she's married to Mr.  
10 Davis. And were they married or were they boyfriend-  
11 girlfriend?

12 There's no question; they're married. They have  
13 kids together. Today they have three kids together. At  
14 the time -- and they -- they want to be quick to point  
15 out -- this is his stepchild. You know, Iven Caldwell is  
16 his stepchild.

17 Well, that's certainly not the way that Xzavier  
18 Davis looked at it. Xzavier Davis was his son -- I mean,  
19 excuse me -- Xzavier Davis' son was Iven Caldwell. That  
20 was his boy. He was the older brother to his daughter  
21 and son. And he cared about that boy as much or more  
22 than anybody but maybe Indigo Penny, the boy's mother.

23 He -- he raised him. He was the older brother to  
24 his -- his young boy and girl. You're going to learn  
25 that that morning, he'd taken him for a haircut early

1 that morning because he was going to be going to his  
2 papa's for a -- for a birthday party, a surprise birthday  
3 party the next day. And he knew that.

4 And they had a fish fry they were going to that  
5 night -- or he thought they were going to that night.  
6 And he was to going to get me a haircut. And these are  
7 things a father and son do together. This wasn't just  
8 some stepson to Xzavier Davis.

9 And here's going to be the big, hard part, if you  
10 want to call it that, for you, as a jury. They've  
11 already told you, there's two judges in this courtroom.  
12 The judge is the judge of the law. And he, at the end of  
13 this case, is going to tell you the applicable laws that  
14 apply. And that's where he's going to talk to you about  
15 what's required for murder and what's required for  
16 attempted murder and what's required for possession of a  
17 pistol during the commission of violent crime.

18 The bottom line is -- and they know it; he's already  
19 hit on it -- there has to be an intent, not just an  
20 intent. We learned about law school -- way back when,  
21 when I went to law school, there was what was called a  
22 *mens rea*. And that's a Latin term. And I didn't know  
23 what it meant.

24 But what, comes to find it means, *mens rea* is like  
25 your mental outlook or -- or your -- your state of mind.

1 And to commit a crime like murder, you have to have an  
2 evil *mens rea*, or an evil state of mind. What we call it  
3 in our case law is malice aforethought. You have to have  
4 malice aforethought.

5 And these are these words that people use. And it's  
6 almost like abracadabra, you know, get to confusing me.  
7 It -- it -- it's a very specific thing. People talk  
8 about premeditation. And you'll hear about first-degree  
9 murder and second-degree murder. We -- we don't have all  
10 that in South Carolina. We just got murder.

11 But to somebody -- every killing's not a murder.  
12 Killings happen. That doesn't mean murder somebody.  
13 What they've charged my client with is not killing Iven,  
14 but murdering him. To murder him, you have to find  
15 beyond a reasonable doubt -- this -- these aren't just  
16 word that get thrown around; these are important things.

17 And -- and we've asked you to come today. And you  
18 -- you -- you know you all went through this process with  
19 us yesterday, is we tried to make sure we got a good,  
20 fair jury that will consider this completely and weigh  
21 all these things. But at the end of the day, we're going  
22 to ask you to make determinations, not just, "Oh, I think  
23 it could be," but beyond a reasonable doubt. They have a  
24 heavy burden to prove, not the just that a boy died, but  
25 that a boy died while somebody was, with malice

1       aforethought, killing him.

2               It means they have to have the intent. They'll talk  
3       about express or implied or -- they have to have the  
4       intent to kill beforetime with malice. It's not just,  
5       "Oh, I'm in the heat of a passion; oh, I'm in a fight  
6       because she wouldn't let me in the door." It's not that.

7               It -- it's that I have the intent to kill you.  
8       That's what they're going to be trying to say with Iven.  
9       Or they're going to back off a little bit and go, "Well,  
10      or we can do this applied malice, where we don't have to  
11      prove he was trying to kill anybody. We can prove to you  
12      he's so reckless, over the top, that that's going to  
13      substitute that."

14              I submit to you, it's not. Malice aforethought is  
15      just that: malice aforethought. What do those words  
16      mean? It means before it happened. That's the  
17      aforethought part.

18              I mean, you think about people talking about  
19      premeditation. It's not exactly premeditation. And I'll  
20      tell you, courts have limited it down to -- aforethought  
21      can be like this (gestured). I mean, it doesn't have be:  
22      "I thought about it for an hour; I thought about it for  
23      15 minutes, or I thought about it for two minutes."

24              It can be kind of almost instantaneous. But it has  
25      to happen. That intent to kill, that evilness, that --

1 that badness where I want to kill somebody, has to exist.  
2 And if it doesn't, if you find that it doesn't, then a  
3 murder didn't happen, plain and simple. That's what we  
4 think you're going to realize, at the end of the day,  
5 that -- that a murder didn't happen -- or at the end of  
6 -- of this week, by the time this case is over, we think  
7 you'll realize that there certainly was no attempt to  
8 kill Indigo Penny; there certainly was no transferred  
9 intent or intent to kill Iven.

10 I think you're going to have testimony that my  
11 client was right in front of Indigo Penny and unloads a  
12 gun into the air. This is after, you know, won't be let  
13 in the house and -- let me back up again. I apologize.  
14 I don't want to get ahead of myself, I want to make sure  
15 I -- I tell you y'all all the relevant stuff.

16 Going back to the respect I have for Newberry  
17 County, I -- I'm not to beat up on the sheriff's  
18 department or -- or try to attack the things they did.  
19 As I said, this is not some whodunit. At the end of the  
20 day, the evidence is going to show that a gun got fired  
21 and that, when that gun was fired, a bullet ended up  
22 hitting a young boy, 7 years old.

23 I think Ms. Penny's going to give -- or excuse me --  
24 Ms. Davis, that they're going to call Ms. Penny, is going  
25 to give you the best evidence of how all that occurred.

1 But before that, she's going to tell you that they walk  
2 out the house and he's as close, you know, as I am to the  
3 solicitor right now and unloads a gun into the air. He  
4 could've pointed at her and killed her right then, if --  
5 if he was trying to kill Indigo Davis, his wife.

6 He wasn't trying to kill anybody. He was upset.  
7 And the bottom line is: At the end of all this, you're  
8 going to get evidence that he shoots at a car. He's  
9 shooting at a tire. They tell you about eight shots, six  
10 of which are the tire or below. She gets hit in the  
11 ankle, where he's shooting at a tire. I think Ms. Indigo  
12 is going to tell you, she knows he isn't trying to kill  
13 her, because he had multiple opportunities to kill her.

14 That's not what this is about. They're in a fight  
15 because he went to a fish fry and he was at his daddy's  
16 at a fish fry, not out carousing at some bar; not out  
17 living it up with some girl. He's at a fish fry with his  
18 brother, his cousins. Some of them are sitting in the  
19 courtroom today.

20 But you'll hear testimony that that's what's going  
21 on. So when he gets home, door is not open. So he beats  
22 on the back door. Then he goes to the front door. You  
23 know, usually, he goes in the back and it's always open.  
24 So it's not open.

25 Now he goes to the front door and knocks, looks. He

1 can tell somebody's standing there in the living room.  
2 Knocks again; ends up breaking his window to get into his  
3 house. Of course there's a fight. That's what happens  
4 then. There's a fight going on; she's not listening.  
5 They're back and forth with each other, and things get  
6 out of control with the gun.

7 But the bottom line is -- and I think Indigo is  
8 going to be the one to tell you -- he certainly didn't  
9 mean to kill anybody. That's not what this was about.  
10 And that's what's going to be for y'all to ultimately  
11 determine: Was there malice aforethought with this  
12 case?; not, "Hey, was there a killing?" I'm telling you  
13 that now: There was a killing. It was a tragic,  
14 terrible night.

15 And -- and going back to your police department,  
16 your sheriff's department, you know, there's video of  
17 Sheriff Foster out there at 3:30 in the morning, trying  
18 to console these kids, trying to console this mother,  
19 grandmother. Law enforcement does a good job here.  
20 That's why I'm not often in this courtroom.

21 I am now, because this boy didn't mean to kill a  
22 soul. And in the state of South Carolina, that still  
23 matters. We have deteriorated and taken what you mean to  
24 do kind of out of the law. But there are places where  
25 intentions still do matter.

1           And if he didn't have malice aforethought, if he  
2           didn't have that *mens rea*, that "I'm going to kill  
3           somebody," then that's not sufficient. If they don't  
4           prove that *mens rea*, that malice aforethought, they  
5           haven't proven their case.

6           Now, there's other things with a killing. And  
7           again, I -- I direct you to follow the judge. Judge is  
8           way smarter than I am. I've been doing this a while, but  
9           I -- I think he's probably been doing it -- it just as  
10          long.

11          But he's going to tell you what the law is. And the  
12          facts -- what I say is not testimony. What Taylor and  
13          Solicitor Stumbo say, that's not testimony. You're going  
14          to hear a lot of us talking over the next couple days.

15          What comes from the witness stand, that's the  
16          testimony. At the end of this, the judge is going to  
17          take the law and explain it to you and say: "Now you, as  
18          a whole, you're the judge of these facts."

19          And you have to these facts and determine: Has he  
20          violated the law? And where they're going to fall short,  
21          I'll you right now, is malice aforethought. So they're  
22          going to talk to you about other ways you could come up  
23          with malice aforethought. The bottom line is: He has to  
24          have malice aforethought prior to killing somebody.

25          Again, terrible, tragic situation. But there was



1 never any intent. And intent, in this state, still  
2 matters when it comes to trying to convict somebody for  
3 killing somebody, for murder.

4 There is a name for -- for killing somebody when you  
5 don't mean to do it, where it's not intentional, where  
6 you don't have that evil mindset. It's manslaughter;  
7 sometimes involuntary manslaughter. But that'll be a  
8 thing that, when the judge tells you the law, whether it  
9 fits or doesn't fit or might not even be an option. It  
10 might be murder or not guilty.

11 And I'd submit to you then, if that's the case,  
12 you're going to realize, there's no malice aforethought.  
13 It cannot be murder.

14 I want to thank you for being here. You know, I had  
15 a old man tell me one time -- and I just I kind of  
16 brushed it off. But it's -- it's come back to me several  
17 times. You know how sometimes you just have a little  
18 encounter, but then, you'll think about it after the  
19 fact?

20 But -- but the guy was telling me -- he goes, "You  
21 know, jury duty is one of the most important -- two most  
22 important things you'll ever do for your country. You  
23 can serve during a time of war in the military, or you  
24 can serve on a jury."

25 Because we ask you to come here, take away from your

1 day. It's like -- like Taylor was telling you. You're  
2 not getting paid for -- well, you might get paid 10/12/15  
3 dollars a day. It's not worth your time, is what I'm  
4 saying. You're not getting paid in that sense.

5 You have to come here. This is your civic  
6 obligation. Because as an American, you're entitled to a  
7 trial, a jury of your peers. It doesn't have to be okay  
8 that the solicitor says it, the sheriff says it.  
9 Sometimes as good as they are, they -- they maybe get it  
10 wrong.

11 And that's why you're the -- the factfinder that he  
12 gets to come in front of for you to determine these  
13 facts. And here is the most equal, American place in the  
14 world. You're all equal.

15 It doesn't matter if you got a trust fund and you  
16 get a check every month or you work hard at the Piggly  
17 Wiggly every day and stock. The bottom line is: In this  
18 jury everybody's equal. And it takes a beyond-a-  
19 reasonable-doubt, unanimous conviction.

20 And at the end of this, I just don't think that can  
21 happen. And my client doesn't either. He's been waiting  
22 over two years to clear his name because, while somebody  
23 might've died out there that night, it certainly wasn't  
24 his intention. And like I said, at this point,  
25 intentions do matter.

1           We're going to be here for the next couple of days.  
2           Going back to those Latin words, *mens rea* means evil  
3           mindset, kind of. That's my understanding of it. I  
4           never really took Latin, but, you know, you learn these  
5           words.

6           Verdict is another one. It comes from the Latin  
7           *verdicto*. What that means is to speak the truth. At the  
8           time of this case, when y'all speak the truth, I think  
9           it'll be clear.

10          Xzavier Davis might be a lot of things. And I'm  
11          going to tell you: It's going to be tough for not to  
12          dislike Xzavier Davis over the course of the next few  
13          days. Because what they're going to present is that this  
14          7-year-old boy -- precious, beautiful young man -- died  
15          as a result of his actions.

16          Large part, that's true. But there was no malice  
17          aforethought here. He certainly didn't mean to kill him.  
18          It was a terrible tragedy. And -- and it continues to  
19          affect Indigo and her children, his little brothers and  
20          sisters. And now he has a -- a -- another sibling that's  
21          been born since this happened.

22          These are a precious family that's already been  
23          ripped apart once. And -- and to speak the truth and say  
24          that he didn't murder anybody and send this young man  
25          home to his family to continue being a husband and a

1 father, that's what we're going to be asking you to do.  
2 And that's what we think a true verdict -- *veredicto*, or  
3 verdict, speaking the truth, will be: that he certainly  
4 didn't mean to kill anyone, especially his son, Iven.

5 We thank you for your time and attention. I -- I  
6 hope you'll pay attention and see things the way I do,  
7 which is this young man that they're going to paint a  
8 picture of as a monster is certainly not that. When you  
9 hear from the people that know him, you're going to hear  
10 he was full of love for this boy, for his wife, and for  
11 his children. He has a respect for himself and his  
12 family.

13 You'll hear about his employment history. This is a  
14 good man that a terrible thing occurred. And he's been  
15 paining with it ever since. And -- and we hope that  
16 y'all will help see it for what it was, which was a  
17 terrible, terrible tragedy, but not a murder. Thank you  
18 very much.

19 THE COURT: All right. All right. Ladies and  
20 gentlemen, we'll now begin the evidentiary portion of  
21 this trial with the state's case. Mr. Stumbo, Mr.  
22 Daniels, state can call your first witness.

23 MR STUMBO: Thank you, Your Honor. If it please the  
24 Court, the state would call Sheriff Lee Foster to the  
25 stand.

1 THE COURT: All right.:

2 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

3 LEE FOSTER, having been first duly sworn,  
4 testified as follows:

5 DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Have a seat and state your  
6 name for the record.

7 THE COURT: Yes. You can remove your mask, please.

8 THE WITNESS: (Complied.)

9 THE COURT: Thank you.

10 THE WITNESS: James Lee Foster. I'm the sheriff of  
11 Newberry County.

12 DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Okay. Thank you.

13 DIRECT EXAMINATION

14 BY MR. STUMBO:

15 Q Thank you for being here this morning, Sheriff.

16 A Good morning.

17 Q Some of the younger ones on this jury may not know  
18 when you were first elected. Can you tell us when you  
19 were first elected sheriff here in Newberry?

20 A I was sworn in, in 1989.

21 Q And I think Mr. Geoly referred to in the opening.  
22 You may, I believe, now be the longest-serving sheriff in  
23 -- in the state at this point; is that correct?

24 A That is correct. I -- I am the longest-serving  
25 sheriff in the state right now.

1 Q Now, I -- prior to 1989 and -- '88 when you ran, '89  
2 when you were sworn in, what was your experience in law  
3 enforcement? When did you start your law enforcement  
4 career?

5 A I began my full-time law enforcement experience in  
6 1978 with the Town of Little Mountain. And then I  
7 completed college at the University of South Carolina  
8 while I was working at Town of Little Mountain. Then I  
9 became employed at Newberry County Sheriff's Office,  
10 where I worked myself through the ranks, reaching captain  
11 over investigations. And then, for a five-year period,  
12 from 1984 to 1989, I worked at the South Carolina  
13 Criminal Justice Academy, where I was primarily a  
14 firearms instructor and tactics instructor. And I ran  
15 for sheriff and was fortunate enough to become elected  
16 and have served as sheriff ever since.

17 Q Since 1970 -- I think you said '78 or '79 when you  
18 started the amount?

19 A Seventy-eight.

20 Q Okay. Since 1978 to today, is it fair to say that  
21 you or those under your supervision have investigated  
22 thousands of cases?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q Okay. That would be everything from murders, all  
25 the way down to, you know, B&E-autos and possession of

1 drugs or whatever, correct?

2 A From murders to people running over mailboxes to  
3 getting cats out of the tree. We -- we do it -- we do a  
4 full-service job with the sheriff's office.

5 Q One -- one of those --- Sheriff, one of those  
6 thousands of situations that you've dealt with is the one  
7 we're here for today, correct?

8 A Unfortunately, yes.

9 Q And that was early-morning hours of April the 20th,  
10 2019; is that correct?

11 A On 20 April 219 [sic].

12 Q And, Sheriff, you ended up at the emergency room  
13 that night at Newberry Hospital, correct?

14 A That's correct. At approximately 3:16 that morning,  
15 I was -- I actually heard it on the radio that there was  
16 two gunshot victims at the Newberry County Memorial  
17 Hospital. At that time I called our shift supervisor,  
18 which is Lt. Carnes and got a briefing from him that he  
19 had two gunshot victims that -- that had arrived at the  
20 Newberry County Memorial Hospital Emergency Department.  
21 And the -- one was a child, and the other was the adult  
22 mother of the child. I then proceeded to go to the  
23 Newberry County Memorial Hospital to the emergency room.

24 Q And what time did you arrive at the -- at the  
25 hospital, Sheriff?

1 A After getting the briefs and getting ready, I got  
2 there about 3:30, 3:33 in the morning.

3 Q Okay. But the initial call had gone out over the  
4 radio that there was gunshot victims at the hospital at  
5 3:16; is that correct?

6 A Approximately 3:16. Yes, sir.

7 Q All right. So within 17 minutes, you were able to  
8 get up and get ready and get to the ER?

9 A I -- I got a briefing first, because I wanted to  
10 make sure I understood where it had happened and was it  
11 in the jurisdiction of the sheriff's office, in which  
12 they said it had happened in the Helena section over on  
13 [REDACTED]. I did a -- a -- just a situational briefing  
14 about what was going on. So I -- I knew what we would  
15 have to respond.

16 Q That's correct. And when -- and actually, I think  
17 you mentioned this maybe before. But the Hospital ER  
18 actually in the city limits, correct?

19 A The hospital and the emergency department are all in  
20 the city limits of -- of -- of Newberry, South Carolina.  
21 But it's in the county of Newberry. It's on Kinard  
22 Street in -- in Newberry. Yes, sir.

23 Q Okay. So between the time the call went out, that  
24 17-minute time before you get there -- obviously, there's  
25 uniform deputies and uniform officers with the city that



1 are working that night, and they get -- they -- they  
2 respond to the ER first, correct?

3 A That is correct. In addition to the medical teams  
4 that were there, there were some deputies and there were  
5 city police officers that were there as well ---

6 Q Okay.

7 A --- that had arrived prior to my coming.

8 Q And you were able to speak, I'm assuming, with them  
9 and get a -- more briefing from them before you walked  
10 into the ER?

11 A Yes, sir. I was able to speak to two of the  
12 deputies and got a briefing. And then I entered the  
13 emergency department at that time.

14 Q Okay. Well, if you could, Sheriff, explain to this  
15 jury and describe for them what you experience and see  
16 when you walk into the ER?

17 A Well, I entered into the emergency department and it  
18 was a beehive of activity. Newberry County's certainly a  
19 small county. We got a wonderful hospital. But the ER  
20 is not a full trauma center, like you would have at  
21 Richland or Greenville. But they were busy, trying to  
22 get the patients attended to.

23 I got a briefing -- a brief briefing from the nurse  
24 was charge that night who had advised me that they had a  
25 -- a child, approximately 7 years old, that had been shot

1 in the head and that the condition was very grave, and  
2 the mother was shot as well.

3 Q Okay. And so when you into the ER, were the mother  
4 and the 7-year-old child, Iven, were they in different  
5 rooms?

6 A The 7-year-old who was later identified as Iven  
7 Caldwell was in the trauma room. They have a -- of the  
8 several rooms they have at the emergency department in  
9 Newberry, the one room that's always at the back is  
10 classified as the major traumas. So if someone was  
11 having a heart attack or stroke or -- or a gunshot wound,  
12 they would take them in there. And there was doctors and  
13 several -- a doctor -- pardon me -- and several nurses,  
14 who -- who were tending to him and trying to render  
15 lifesaving measures.

16 Q At that time, Sheriff, he -- he was -- Iven was  
17 unresponsive, though. You -- you saw him on the -- the  
18 bed?

19 A Yes. He was unresponsive.

20 Q And had what was apparently a -- a -- a gunshot  
21 wound in his head?

22 A The charge nurse is Phifer Suber. And she said he  
23 had a gunshot wound to the left side of his head that had  
24 traveled across and was coming out at that point on the  
25 right side.

1 Q Sheriff, at -- at that point, one -- one of the, I  
2 guess, first things as a law enforcement officer is to --  
3 to secure safety, correct, at the scene?

4 A Well, we actually had -- crime scene was there at  
5 the hospital. The trauma room where Iven was, was a  
6 crime scene because the person was there.

7 The room where his mother, who was identified to us  
8 as Indigo Penny, that was a crime scene because she was  
9 shot and wounded as well. And her vehicle was parked  
10 outside in the sally port at the hospital. She had  
11 driven herself and the child and children -- the other  
12 two children were there as well -- to the hospital. So  
13 they were -- all those places were considered a crime  
14 scene.

15 But we also another crime scene on [REDACTED] over  
16 in the Helena section, which it's where the incident took  
17 place. So it was important to get that crime scene  
18 secured as well.

19 Part of my job is certainly to assist in the  
20 investigation. But it is also to coordinate assets to  
21 come do the investigation. And so at that point in time,  
22 I was calling the State Law Enforcement Division and  
23 other assets within the Newberry County Sheriff's Office  
24 to come out to investigate this crime.

25 Q So -- and -- and, Sheriff, the two primary crime

1 scenes, as you say, are the ER where the car has pulled  
2 in and -- and the victims are. The other one is where  
3 this took place, which, you were being told at that time,  
4 was [REDACTED].

5 A That is correct. The -- the hospital is a crime  
6 scene and also the residence of Indigo Penny.

7 Q So, Sheriff, did you deploy assets to [REDACTED]  
8 [REDACTED]?

9 A I did. Of course, we had deputies in the -- on the  
10 scene outside the home. But we also asked for the State  
11 Law Enforcement Division to send their crime scene unit.  
12 We're capable at the sheriff's office of processing crime  
13 scenes. But when you have so many different crime scenes  
14 and the circumstances behind there, where you had a 7-  
15 year-old and the mother shot, we need additional assets,  
16 or additional people, to come in and help us.

17 The State Law Enforcement Division maintains the  
18 state crime lab. And it's -- as with most places, they  
19 send evidence technicians and forensic technicians to a  
20 crime scene to help the local government.

21 Q And -- and, Sheriff, just to back up a little bit  
22 from the -- the SLED -- you know, I -- you call them in.  
23 It takes them a little bit to get from Columbia, right?  
24 Because a lot of your SLED crime scene folks are going to  
25 be coming ---

1 A Most of ---

2 Q --- from outside the county?

3 A That's correct. Most of the crime scene people do  
4 live in the Columbia area because the statewide lab is  
5 there. And so it takes a -- a while for them to go  
6 through the procedure of getting their on-call person up,  
7 briefed to -- to let them know what kind of equipment  
8 they would need to bring here, and then, in the process  
9 of transitioning from wherever they live to our location.

10 Q Right. Before they get here, you have [REDACTED]  
11 [REDACTED] -- you mentioned Lt. Carnes earlier. Did he respond  
12 out there to the scene?

13 A Lt. Carnes was at the scene and maintained presence  
14 there at the scene on 633 while we were at the emergency  
15 department. I had called in the investigator on-call for  
16 the sheriff's office. And the investigator on-call was  
17 Sgt. Ryan Dickert of the sheriff's office. And he  
18 responded to my location at the -- at the sheriff's  
19 office.

20 Q And Lt. Carnes -- I mean, at -- at -- at the time,  
21 they get to [REDACTED] -- of course, he's on our  
22 witness list and will be on the witness stand to describe  
23 this. But part of his job to go there is to secure that  
24 scene and make sure the suspect's detained, correct?

25 MR. GEOLY: Objection to leading, Your Honor.

1 A It -- his ---

2 THE COURT: All right. Let's ---

3 MR. STUMBO: Well ---

4 THE COURT: --- don't lead.

5 MR. STUMBO: That's fine.

6 THE COURT: Sustained.

7 Q Well, what -- what -- what is Lt. Carnes' duties at  
8 that point, Sheriff?

9 A Lt. Carnes mission would be to protect the crime  
10 scene and if -- make sure that no evidence was disturbed;  
11 that it stayed in the condition that had happened when  
12 the crime occurred. And he's also -- his job would be to  
13 apprehend or contain anybody that may have been involved  
14 in the crime.

15 Q And did he do that -- and his team?

16 A The apprehension was not until later. But he did  
17 secure the crime scene with he and the other duties on --  
18 on his shift.

19 Q Okay. At what time did -- was -- were you informed  
20 that he was in custody?

21 A It was not on -- it was -- it was on into the  
22 morning. We were still at the emergency department. I  
23 would -- I'm -- I'm looking at the CAD sheet. And it is  
24 approximately 4:07 a.m. ---

25 Q Okay.

1 A --- is when ---

2 Q And so ---

3 A --- he was detained.

4 Q And you -- you're at the -- even when you're at the  
5 ER, you -- you are communicating with your radio with --  
6 will all your guys?

7 A Communicating with the radio or either via cell  
8 phone.

9 Q Okay. Now, you said you -- you -- you pulled in, I  
10 -- I believe -- Investigator Dickert, who was the lead  
11 investigator in the case that -- do you have a victim  
12 advocate that works at your office?

13 A Yes. Connie Johnson. I had called her in as well.  
14 We had the mother, who was shot. And then, we also had a  
15 child that was shot, although the child was in a  
16 condition that -- comatose, I guess, would be the great  
17 word that I would use. It was not responsive.

18 And then, we also had two small children there that  
19 she had brought to the emergency room as well. And the  
20 emergency department staff, in addition to taking care of  
21 our two victims -- and other people that were in the  
22 emergency department that night -- in addition to that,  
23 they were helping take care of these two small children,  
24 who obviously were upset because they had just gone  
25 through trauma themselves and witnessed trauma themselves

1 and seen their mother injured and their brother in a  
2 horrific state. They were upset too.

3 And so Connie -- initially, her primary goal was to  
4 try to take care of those children that survived. And --  
5 but she also assisted when we tried to talk to Ms. Penny.

6 Q And you say some of the things she might to take  
7 care of physical needs. Just immediate physical needs?

8 A Take of immediate physical needs; consoling. We --  
9 would have to try to find some kind of placement for the  
10 other two children, because they were minors, very young  
11 children. And we'd have to find placement for them.

12 You know, obviously, like I -- the mother was  
13 incapable of taking care of them at -- in her condition.  
14 So it would've been Ms. Johnson's responsibility to find  
15 somebody to help take care of the children. And she --  
16 she proceeded to do that. But we also have to work the  
17 Department of Social Services when something like this  
18 happens, because we have to make sure that if we transfer  
19 custody of a child to whomever, we have to make sure that  
20 it is legal and appropriate.

21 Q And so you did notify DSS to come to the scene?

22 A Yes, sir. We notified DSS. Because under our  
23 guidelines and the -- and the state laws, DSS, in these  
24 situations, are responsible for helping make those  
25 decisions of where the children would go once they could



1 be released from the hospital.

2 Q Okay. And, Sheriff, Investigator Dicker did arrive  
3 after you did, correct?

4 A Shortly after I arrived, Investigator Dickert ---

5 Q Okay. And he's equipped with, you know, body cam  
6 and cameras and that sort of thing?

7 MR. GEOLY: Objection to leading again, Your Honor.  
8 Just if ---

9 Q Is he equipped with ---

10 THE COURT: I'll ---

11 Q --- those things ---

12 THE COURT: --- allow that. Go ahead.

13 A He is equipped with body-worn camera, which is a  
14 videotaping device that they wear and are required to  
15 have it on when they're interviewing or working a crime  
16 scene.

17 Q And to your knowledge -- you were there -- he -- did  
18 he have it on?

19 A He did.

20 Q Okay.

21 A He did. And as well as some of the other duties.  
22 But Investigator Dickert had his on when he arrived at  
23 the ED, emergency department.

24 Q Okay. And you've been able to review some of those  
25 body cameras before you've come to court this week?

1 A I did.

2 Q Okay. And are you in those body cameras and in that  
3 footage?

4 A Yes, sir. I -- I was in the footage.

5 Q Okay. Anything else, Sheriff -- your involvement  
6 involved assisting with the investigation. I believe you  
7 said that before; is that correct?

8 A That is correct. And in addition to trying to get  
9 the assets to come in to help, in addition to trying to  
10 help the two children that were there, I also attempted  
11 to help talk to Ms. Indigo Penny. At the time she was in  
12 -- in a state -- emotional state that she really wasn't  
13 talking a lot. We were able to get her mother, Ms.  
14 Hunger, to come in the room with her. And we began  
15 trying to get information from Indigo about what had  
16 happened.

17 At first, Indigo was -- was just not in a state of  
18 mind to talk. But between her mother talking to her and  
19 me talking with her, we got her to begin to open up and  
20 start to tell us what had happened. At that point there  
21 was a -- a -- a pause because they were going to attempt  
22 to move Iven to a trauma center. And they wanted to give  
23 her an opportunity to see her child and the grandmother  
24 to see the child before they transferred the child.

25 Q Okay. And were you able to assist with the

1 grandmother and the mother during the middle of this?

2 A Well -- well, I -- obviously, it was a extremely  
3 emotional situation. The -- the -- the visual of it is  
4 very graphic. Not only to the grandparents or -- and the  
5 mother, but the visual of it is very graphic to those of  
6 us that do it every day. It's not every day that you see  
7 a 7-year-old with a bullet wound to the head. And it's  
8 not difficult to see parents and grandparents -- it is  
9 difficult to see parents and grandparents suffering.

10 So it was a very emotional situation. Plus, your  
11 emergency department staff, I mean, it's emotional for  
12 them too. We -- we do it every day. And, you know, you  
13 get a little -- you get a little hardened to it. But you  
14 don't become impervious to it.

15 So everybody was quite emotional at the time. It --  
16 once the -- the medical staff was able to move the child,  
17 we were then able to go back and Investigator Dickert was  
18 able to start to get her to open up and start to tell the  
19 events that happened that night -- or this morning, the  
20 morning that it happened.

21 Q Okay. Sheriff, you were able to stay on scene at  
22 the hospital until -- what time did you leave the ER?

23 A I left the emergency department roughly 9:05 a.m.

24 Q Okay. And you have a little of people to work for  
25 you, Sheriff. How many people work in your department at

1 the sheriff's office?

2 A Well, Newberry County's unique. And the sheriff's  
3 office manages a number of different departments. We got  
4 the jail; we got the sheriff's office that's law  
5 enforcement. We got the court division that protects the  
6 courts. We got the school-resource division.

7 So -- and then, we've got a section that's assigned  
8 to the clerk of court that serves papers. So all told,  
9 we have about a hundred employees, not all of them in law  
10 enforcement but ---

11 Q Right. And did you have people you needed to have  
12 in play, your assets that night, in this investigation?

13 A Yes, sir. We -- we called out people that we knew  
14 from our agency that were trained and capable of handling  
15 what turned out to be a homicide or a murder and a  
16 wounding, a shooting, of another party.

17 Q And, Sheriff, you did, at some point, make your way  
18 to [REDACTED] ---

19 A I -- I ---

20 Q --- or ---

21 A --- did. I did. It -- it was -- Investigator  
22 Dickert was taking the statements. She had already told  
23 us that -- she called him "Xzay," but I -- his name is  
24 Xzavier Davis -- that he had -- he had done the shooting.  
25 She had told us about one of the guns that he had had

1 that had a laser sight on it. And she had told us  
2 basically that he had shot into the car and shot at them,  
3 preventing them -- trying to prevent them from leaving.

4 After that happened, Investigator Dickert was  
5 documenting that, not only with a body camera, but he  
6 also was documenting it by writing it down, taking notes.

7 Q Okay.

8 A I then went to the scene of the crime, where I met  
9 Lt. Carnes, Lt. Odell Schumpert -- who had come on from  
10 the morning shift -- and the SLED forensic science  
11 technicians.

12 Q Okay. And the -- so at that point, when you get to  
13 [REDACTED], SLED is there investigating the crime  
14 scene?

15 A That's correct. SLED had a team that -- that was at  
16 the hospital that took evidence there at the hospital and  
17 took evidence from the car that Ms. Penny drove up in.  
18 But they also had a team that was working at the  
19 residence over on [REDACTED].

20 (Off the record briefly.)

21 Q Sheriff, thank you for being here this morning.  
22 Please answer any questions Mr. Geoly may have for you in  
23 cross.

24 THE COURT: Cross-examination?

25 MR. GEOLY: Please the Court, Judge, thank you.

## CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. GEOLY:

Q Sheriff Foster, how you doing?

A I'm doing well. Thank you.

Q Yes, sir. Did you have occasion to know Xzavier before this night?

A I did not.

Q Did you happen to know Indigo before this night?

A I probably had seen her, but I -- I do not know her -- did not know her professionally or through any social contact. I probably had seen her. I -- I -- I knew her grandmother.

Q Okay. This wasn't a troublesome-type household prior to this night on April 20th, 2019, right? It wasn't somewhere that the cops were consistently responding to or anything like that, right? It wasn't a household that you would call a troublesome home?

A Not to my knowledge.

Q Okay. When -- you -- you describe some of the process and that your officers wear body cams. When -- when they're investigating something like this is it every appropriate for them to take that off?

A It would kind of depends on the circumstances. I mean, you wouldn't want to continue to -- like, Investigator Dickert, for instance, he wouldn't want to

1 run the body camera from the hospital to [REDACTED]  
2 [REDACTED], unless, of course, he was doing something  
3 that was ---

4 Q Relevant to the case or something, right?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Okay.

7 A Yes.

8 Q Now -- now, on this night do you recall talking to  
9 Officer Dickert and him taking his body camera off and  
10 setting it down while he talked to you?

11 A I do not,

12 Q You don't recall that?

13 A I do not.

14 Q Okay. Could that have been appropriate if he was  
15 talking to you about something, like, confidential or  
16 about the case? Is that something that would -- maybe  
17 would be typical?

18 A I -- I can't answer that, because I don't know the  
19 circumstances. I do not recall that.

20 Q Okay. If I -- if -- if ---

21 MR. GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence one minute,  
22 Your Honor.

23 (Off the record briefly.)

24 MR. STUMBO: Judge, I don't -- I don't believe what  
25 Mr. Geoly wants to show is in evidence yet. I mean, it

1 -- it may ---

2 THE COURT: If it's not ---

3 MR. STUMBO: --- be at ---

4 THE COURT: --- in evidence ---

5 MR. STUMBO: --- some point. But I ---

6 MR. GEOLY: That's probably true.

7 THE COURT: All right. If it's not in evidence, you  
8 can't publish it.

9 (Off the record briefly.)

10 THE COURT: I mean, let me -- let ---

11 MR. GEOLY: Yeah.

12 THE COURT: --- me see ---

13 MR. GEOLY: Yeah. I ---

14 THE COURT: --- attorneys for a second.

15 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

16 (Whereupon, a bench conference was held off the  
17 record in the presence of the jury, but out of the  
18 hearing of the jury.)

19 Q So you don't recall him taking it off?

20 A I do not ---

21 Q But that ---

22 A --- recall ---

23 Q --- and that's not something you'd normally really  
24 be necessarily paying attention to, right?

25 A No.



1 Q Okay. You didn't happen to see or -- or any of the  
2 interaction, obviously, between Xzavier and Indigo that  
3 night?

4 A Would you ---

5 Q Prior ---

6 A --- repeat ---

7 Q --- prior to this happening, I mean.

8 A Would you repeat that, please?

9 Q You -- you didn't happen to see any, obviously,  
10 interaction that night between Indigo and Xzavier prior  
11 to this event occurring?

12 A No, I didn't see that. I saw the aftermath.

13 Q Right. So you wouldn't have know, though, what was  
14 going on as it was happening. The only people out there  
15 were Indigo and -- and Xzavier -- is that right -- and  
16 the kids?

17 A I -- I saw the aftermath. And I saw what she had  
18 told us had happened.

19 Q Right.

20 MR. GEOLY: No further questions, Your Honor.

21 THE COURT: All right. Redirect?

22 MR. STUMBO: Just one, Your Honor.

23 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

24 BY MR. STUMBO:

25 Q Sheriff, how often have you seen have you seen the

1 -- the -- the events before a crime happened in your  
2 career?

3 A Rare occurrence.

4 Q Okay.

5 A Because I doubt seriously, if I had been there, it  
6 would've happened. We usually have to pick up the  
7 pieces, just like we did in this situation. You see the  
8 aftermath, which is not pleasant.

9 Q Yes, sir. Thank you, Sheriff. Thank you for being  
10 here this morning.

11 MR. STUMBO: No further questions, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

13 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

14 (Off the record briefly.)

15 THE COURT: All right. All right. Ladies and  
16 gentlemen, we're going to take a short break; give you an  
17 opportunity to stretch your legs, use the restroom,  
18 whatever the case may be.

19 I direct you to not discuss the case, even among  
20 yourselves. It's too early for deliberations. Don't  
21 conduct any independent investigations.

22 We'll take about a ten-minute break and bring you  
23 back in just a minute. Thank you very much.

24 (Whereupon, the jury exited the courtroom at 11:23  
25 a.m.)

1 (The Court went off the record at 11:23 a.m.)

2 (The Court went on the record at 11:44 a.m.)

3 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state  
4 before we bring the jury in?

5 MR STUMBO: No, sir.

6 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

7 MR GEOLY: We're good, Your Honor.

8 THE COURT: All right. Let's go ahead and bring the  
9 jury back in.

10 (Off the record briefly.)

11 MR GEOLY: Judge, if it please the Court, just it's  
12 difficult from here to see that screen.

13 THE COURT: Okay.

14 MR GEOLY: So if could maybe just -- if he's  
15 publishing there, maybe just go right here?

16 THE COURT: Whatever you need to do, as long as it  
17 doesn't disrupt the ---

18 MR. GEOLY: Yeah. I won't go over ---

19 THE COURT: --- witnesses ---

20 MR. GEOLY: --- back by ---

21 THE COURT: --- or the jury or anything, that'll be  
22 fine.

23 MR GEOLY: Thank you, Your Honor.

24 (Off the record briefly.)

25 (Whereupon, the jury entered the courtroom at

1 11:46 a.m.)

2 THE BAILIFF: They just need to be able to see the  
3 -- they want the witness to turn a little bit more  
4 towards the jury in the chair.

5 THE COURT: Okay. They're having trouble seeing the  
6 witnesses?

7 THE BAILIFF: I think the end.

8 THE COURT: Okay.

9 THE BAILIFF: Just if they turn to the side a little  
10 bit, I think ---

11 THE COURT: Well, I mean, can they turn to the side?

12 THE BAILIFF: Well, yeah. I mean, they've put a new  
13 chair here, so ---

14 THE COURT: Okay. So if ---

15 THE BAILIFF: --- it can be ---

16 THE COURT: --- you tilt ---

17 THE BAILIFF: Yeah.

18 THE COURT: But we'll need to turn the microphone so  
19 they can still speak into the microphone. So let's turn  
20 the chair and -- all right. That -- all right.

21 THE BAILIFF: Turn it that way?

22 THE COURT: If that's what's they need. But, I  
23 mean, they're still in place. I don't know if that's  
24 going to change the position.

25 THE BAILIFF: Does this help?

1 JURY FOREPERSON: Yeah.

2 THE BAILIFF: If -- if it's sideways?

3 JURY FOREPERSON: Could he turn his chair?

4 THE BAILIFF: Oh, you want to turn your chair?

5 JUROR: Yeah.

6 THE COURT: Oh, yeah.

7 THE BAILIFF: Oh.

8 THE COURT: Yeah.

9 THE BAILIFF: Yes, sir.

10 THE COURT: You can ---

11 THE BAILIFF: Of course you ---

12 THE COURT: Yes.

13 THE BAILIFF: --- can.

14 THE COURT: So that'll be fine.

15 THE BAILIFF: Yeah.

16 THE COURT: That'll be fine. Matter of fact, I  
17 think we can still maintain some social distancing if you  
18 want to slide yours back a little bit in that direction  
19 to give you a more direct view. You -- whichever --  
20 whichever is better for you. That's fine. Is that --  
21 can you see better there?

22 JUROR: Yeah.

23 THE COURT: All right. Is that good enough for  
24 everybody? All right.

25 All right. Ladies and gentlemen, welcome back.

1 We're ready to resume with the state's case.

2 The state can call your next witness.

3 MR DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor. The state calls  
4 Vinnie Ray hunter.

5 THE COURT: All right.

6 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

7 MR. DANIEL: Ma'am -- Ms. Hunter, can you walk  
8 around to that -- come to this area.

9 THE WITNESS: (Complied.)

10 (Off the record briefly.)

11 CLERK OF COURT: Ms. Hunter, raise your right hand.

12 THE WITNESS: I don't swear, ma'am, do to my  
13 religion.

14 CLERK OF COURT: She doesn't swear, Judge.

15 THE COURT: Okay. You can -- can you affirm?

16 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

17 THE COURT: All right. If you would raise your  
18 right hand, please.

19 VINNIE RAY HUNTER, having first duly affirmed,  
20 testified as follows:

21 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am. You may be seated.

22 CLERK OF COURT: All right. State your name for the  
23 record.

24 THE WITNESS: (No audible response.)

25 THE COURT: Your name, please?

1 THE WITNESS: Vinnie Ray Penny Hunter.

2 THE COURT: All right.

3 DIRECT EXAMINATION

4 BY MR. DANIEL:

5 Q Ms. Hunter, you go by Vinnie Ray?

6 A Yes, sir.

7 Q Okay. And, Ms. Hunter, where do you live?

8 A 631 [REDACTED].

9 Q Okay. And -- I'm not trying to get in trouble or  
10 anything, but how old are you, ma'am?

11 A Fifty-seven.

12 Q Okay. And are you born and raised in Newberry?

13 A I was born in Washington, D.C. And we moved here in  
14 South Carolina. But I been here most of my life.

15 Q Okay. And are you married?

16 A Yes.

17 Q All right. Who you married to?

18 A Wallace E. Hunter, the young man that has a clean-  
19 shave head.

20 Q Okay. And do you have children, ma'am?

21 A Yes, sir.

22 Q Okay. How many children do you have?

23 A I have five children.

24 Q And Indigo Penny, is that your daughter?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. And how old is she?

2 A Indigo should be about -- about 30, 31 maybe.

3 Q All right. So early 30s?

4 A Right.

5 Q And is Indigo born and raised in Newberry?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Okay. And you said you lived -- or you currently  
8 live at [REDACTED], correct?

9 A Yes, sir.

10 Q In Newberry?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And that's Helena?

13 A Right.

14 Q And how long have y'all been living there at that  
15 address?

16 A I been living at 631 about 33 years.

17 Q So that's where Indigo was born and raised?

18 A Right.

19 Q And where does Indigo live?

20 A Indigo live right next to me.

21 Q Okay. So what -- what address is that?

22 A [REDACTED].

23 Q Okay. [REDACTED]?

24 A Uh-huh.

25 Q So she's your neighbor?



1 A Right.

2 Q Okay. And is Indigo married?

3 A Yes, she is.

4 Q Okay. And who's she married to?

5 A Xzavier Davis.

6 Q Is Xzavier Davis present in the courtroom, ma'am?

7 A Yes, he is.

8 Q Would you please identify him for the jury?

9 A Sitting right there in the blue-and-white shirt with  
10 the T -- white T-shirt.

11 MR. DANIEL: And, Your Honor, I'd just ask the  
12 record reflect that -- that the witness has identified  
13 the defendant.

14 Q She's married -- so Indigo's married to Xzavier  
15 Davis. How long have they been married?

16 A About three -- about three years.

17 Q Okay. And are they still married?

18 A Yes, they are.

19 Q Okay. Now, are you a grandmother?

20 A Yes, I am.

21 Q Okay. And Indigo has children, correct?

22 A Yes.

23 Q All right. Who are her children?

24 A Iven, Penelope, and little Xzavier. And now she has  
25 a -- well, I call her Caroline, but her name is -- she

1 has another girl.

2 Q Okay. So since this incident happened that we're  
3 here to discuss, which is April 20th, 2019, Indigo's had  
4 another child?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Was she -- would she have been pregnant at the time  
7 of this incident we're here to discuss?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Okay. Iven -- Iven is deceased, correct?

10 A Right.

11 Q Who was Iven's father?

12 A Iven father was Travis Wright.

13 Q All right. So Xzavier Davis is not the biological  
14 father of Iven?

15 A No, sir.

16 Q All right. Would you consider to be a stepfather to  
17 Iven?

18 A Yes.

19 Q All right. So y'all both live on [REDACTED] and --  
20 and your neighbors with Indigo, correct?

21 A Right.

22 Q Okay. I want to take you back to April 20th, 2019,  
23 which in the date in question, correct?

24 A Right.

25 Q Early-morning hours, it still would've been dark.

1 Do you have a recollection of that particular time  
2 period?

3 A Yes, sir.

4 Q All right. Tell us what, if anything, you remember.

5 A Well, me and my husband was in the bed. We were  
6 sleeping. And it seemed like it was right outside my  
7 bedroom window. I heard about maybe six or seven  
8 gunshot.

9 And I woke Wallace. I said, "Wallace," I said,  
10 "somebody is shooting out there." I said, "It seem like  
11 it's right here at our window."

12 He say, "Well, I ain't heard no shots."

13 I said, "Wallace, I got no reason to lie." I said,  
14 "But I done heard Indigo car, you know, speed off in the  
15 -- go out in the road." I said, "Something done happen."  
16 I said, "Call and see have Indigo shot Xzay or Xzay shot  
17 Indigo." I said, "But some bad done happen."

18 So he got up. I told him. I said, "I'm scared,  
19 honey."

20 He said, "Come on."

21 So we always talk with our speakerphone, you know

22 ---

23 Q Let -- let me stop you, ma'am. All right. So you  
24 awoke to the sound of gunshots early-morning hours of  
25 April 20th ---

1 A Right.

2 Q --- correct?

3 A About 2:30.

4 Q And then you heard what sounded like a car?

5 A Right.

6 Q What -- why did -- how did you hear a car? Was  
7 there anything distinct about this car?

8 A Indigo muffler need to have been fixed. And when  
9 she mash on that gas, that muffler sound loud. The car  
10 sound loud from the muffler.

11 Q Okay. And let me show you some ---

12 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'm going to offer seven  
13 exhibits through this witness. And I believe the defense  
14 does not have objections. They're 91 through 96 and No.  
15 19. They've been premarked for state's ID purposes. I'd  
16 -- I'd offer to admit those into evidence if the defense  
17 has no objections.

18 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 19 and  
19 State's Exhibits what?

20 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, it would be 91 through 96;  
21 those are six exhibits. And then, it would just be No.  
22 19, which would make the seventh exhibit.

23 THE COURT: All right. Any objection to State's  
24 Exhibit 19 or State's Exhibits 91 through 96?

25 MR. GEOLY: No, sir, Your Honor.

1 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 19 and  
2 State's Exhibits 91, 92, 93, 94, 95, and 96 are admitted  
3 into evidence without objection.

4 MR. DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor.

5 (Whereupon, State's Exhibits 19 and 91 through 96  
6 were entered into evidence.)

7 MR. DANIEL: I -- and at this time, I would publish  
8 91.

9 THE COURT: All right.

10 Q And, Ms. Hunter, if you could, if you need situate  
11 yourself where you can see the TV, we're going to walk  
12 through some of these photographs.

13 All right. What are we looking at there in State's  
14 91?

15 A That's my house.

16 Q Okay. That's your house. That's [REDACTED]?

17 A Yes, sir.

18 Q All right. And that mailbox in there also says [REDACTED],  
19 correct?

20 A Right.

21 Q Do you share a common driveway, your property and  
22 Indigo's property?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Okay. All right.

25 MR. DANIEL: 92, please, Walter.

1 Q That's the common driveway?

2 A Yes, sir.

3 Q And that would be Indigo's house to the right?

4 A Yes, sir.

5 Q Okay.

6 MR. DANIEL: 93, Walter.

7 Q What is that?

8 A That's Indigo's house.

9 Q Okay. That's Indigo's house.

10 MR. DANIEL: 94.

11 Q Okay. That's just another -- whose vehicle was that  
12 -- there's a vehicle in that driveway. Do you know who  
13 that belongs to?

14 A Indigo and Xzavier. He drove that vehicle.

15 Q Okay. Now, you were describing hearing multiple  
16 gunshots followed by the sounds of what you believed to  
17 be Indigo's car, correct?

18 A I heard the car leaving out the yard.

19 Q And that's what -- you heard the sound of a car  
20 accelerating, which ---

21 A Right.

22 Q --- you believed to be from the yard?

23 A Uh-huh.

24 Q And what -- what car are you referring to?

25 A I don't -- it's not there. It's a -- a Toyota

1 Camry, kind of like a green four-door.

2 Q All right. But who is that car -- who drives that  
3 car primarily that we're looking at there?

4 A Xzavier.

5 Q Okay. Would that be a 2005 Buick Rendezvous SUV?

6 A It's a SUV, but I don't know what the name of it.

7 MR. DANIEL: 95, Walter.

8 Q All right. That's just another angle of Indigo's  
9 house?

10 A Right.

11 MR. DANIEL: 96.

12 Q That's just a closer-up of the vehicle I just  
13 described?

14 A Yes.

15 Q All right.

16 MR. DANIEL: And then, finally, 19, Walter.

17 Q All right. Is that the car associated with Indigo,  
18 the -- the car with the -- the loud-muffler-type sound?

19 A Yes, sir.

20 Q Okay. And what kind of car is that?

21 A Toyota Camry.

22 Q Okay. So when -- all right. Now let's go back to  
23 what -- after you hear the sound of the car, which you  
24 believed to be leaving the property, what happens next?

25 A I woke my husband up; told him. And after I told

1 him, he said, "I didn't hear no gunshots."

2 I said, "Wallace, something went on." I said,  
3 "Indigo car done sped away from the driveway." I say,  
4 "I'm telling you." So he got up. And I told Wallace,  
5 "I'm scared." I said, "I'm really scared."

6 So I said, "Get your cell phone" -- because I call  
7 -- I took my phone, was calling Indigo. Indigo was not  
8 picking up. And I told him to take his phone and call  
9 Xzay phone, Xzavier phone. So Xzavier turn around and  
10 picked his phone up.

11 Q All right. Let me stop you. Xzay -- y'all call  
12 Xzavier Davis -- he goes by "Xzay"?

13 A Yeah. We -- we call him "Xzay."

14 Q All right. So your -- you get Wallace to call  
15 Xzavier's cell phone?

16 A Right.

17 Q And is that -- you said that was on speakerphone  
18 that your husband made that call?

19 A Yeah. We always talk on speakerphone.

20 Q All right. Tell us what happens next.

21 A And my husband said, "Xzay, what's going on over  
22 there? I heard some gunshots. What done went on?"

23 He said, "Mr. Bo" ---

24 MR. GEOLY: I'm going ---

25 A --- "I ain't no" ---



1 MR. GEOLY: --- to object, Your Honor.

2 THE COURT: All right. This is his -- if this was  
3 something said to the husband and not to her directly,  
4 that's hearsay.

5 MR. DANIEL: Well, Your Honor, she -- she testified  
6 that it was on speakerphone and she also recognizes the  
7 voice to be Xzavier Davis. So she's hearing this.

8 THE COURT: Okay.

9 MR. DANIEL: She's in the same room with her  
10 husband, who's on speakerphone, calling the defendant.

11 THE COURT: All right. Then, I'll allow it.  
12 Overruled. Go ahead.

13 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

14 MR. DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor.

15 Q All right, Ms. Hunter. Please -- please continue.  
16 Start from where your husband calls Xzay.

17 A So my husband called Xzay on his phone. And he  
18 said, "Mr. Bo, I ain't no fucking chap. Nobody gone play  
19 with me. Don't play with me. Ain't nothing to play  
20 with." And he hung the phone up.

21 Q Okay. Let me stop you. So your husband asked him.  
22 He said, "Xzay, what's going on?"

23 A Right.

24 Q And Xzay's response to that question was what,  
25 again?

1 A He's not a fucking chap. Don't -- he ain't nothing  
2 to play with.

3 Q And then immediately hangs up on your husband?

4 A And he hang up on my husband.

5 Q And you heard this because it was on speakerphone;  
6 is that correct?

7 A Right.

8 Q And you recognized that person's voice to be Xzavier  
9 Davis?

10 A Right.

11 Q All right. Anything about -- did Xzay say anything  
12 about trying to shoot out tires?

13 MR. GEOLY: Objection, Your Honor: leading.

14 THE COURT: No. I'll allow that. Go ahead.

15 Q All right. And this phone call -- I just want to be  
16 clear. That first phone call, did -- did Xzay tell your  
17 husband, Wallace, that he tried to shoot out the tires of  
18 Indigo's car?

19 A No.

20 Q You never heard that?

21 A He never said that.

22 Q All right.

23 A So when he hung up on my husband, I told him to call  
24 him back again. And he called him back again on  
25 speakerphone. He said, "Like I said, Mr. Bo, I ain't no

1       fucking chap. I ain't no chap. Ain't going play with  
2       me." And he hung up again.

3               So I said, "Okay, Wallace. This is what I'm finna  
4       do." I called all my children and my sisters and things.  
5       And I told them -- I said, "You got to get" -- I'm  
6       scared. I'm -- I stayed in the house, but my husband  
7       went outdoors.

8               And I said, "We got to look and see. You know,  
9       like, she might run into a gutter and something. We  
10      don't know, you know, what's going on." I said, "You got  
11      to think."

12              And I called my sisters. And I ---

13      Q       All right. Let me stop you there. All right. "I  
14      ain't no effing chap. Don't play with me."

15              What -- did that have any special significance to  
16      you? What -- what does that mean? How -- how did you  
17      ---

18              MR. GEOLY: Objection ---

19      Q       --- and your husband ---

20              MR. GEOLY: --- Your Honor: asking her what he  
21      means by making a comment.

22              THE COURT: Yeah. I'll sustain that objection.

23              MR. DANIEL: All right.

24      Q       Are you on good terms with Xzay, speaking terms with  
25      Xzay?

1 A Well, sometime. He be, like, a some-of-time person.  
 2 If he in a good mood, he'll jive and, you know, with you.  
 3 But he mostly stay sleep all day till time for him to go  
 4 to work. I didn't hardly get to see him like that,  
 5 unless it be on the weekend.

6 Q But -- all right. So there are just two phone calls  
 7 your husband made right after hearing shots and you --  
 8 and you -- what you thought was Indigo's car pulling out.  
 9 And each time your husband's asking him, "What's going  
 10 on?"

11 A Right.

12 Q And did he ask any other questions beyond that ---

13 A Well, he ---

14 Q --- your husband?

15 A --- he couldn't cause he hang the phone up on him.

16 Q But it was clear he was referring to the gunshots?

17 A Right.

18 Q Your husband?

19 A He's -- yes.

20 Q And -- and also, trying to figure out Indigo and her  
 21 children's whereabouts, correct?

22 A Right.

23 Q And essentially, you're saying you heard, on  
 24 speakerphone, Xzay make those comments to your husbands  
 25 [sic], not once but twice?

1 A Yes, sir.

2 Q Two different phone calls?

3 A Yes.

4 Q All right. So eventually -- and you tried to call  
5 Indigo's phone multiple times; is that correct?

6 A Yes, I did.

7 Q What -- did it ring?

8 A The phone rung, but she never answered it.

9 Q Okay. And did you look outside at this point in  
10 time?

11 A No. I didn't -- what you call it? I didn't look  
12 out no window. What I did, my husband took and turn  
13 around and said, "Come on."

14 We went to the front porch because we was trying to  
15 see, you know. And I told him, "Don't go all way out  
16 there on the porch." And I left the screen door -- you  
17 know how you prop your door open? -- and left the big  
18 door open. So we was trying to peek around, you know, on  
19 the outside.

20 Q Eventually, though, did you go to the Newberry  
21 County Hospital?

22 A Well, before I went to the hospital, like I said, I  
23 calling my sister and my children and thing. And I had  
24 some of my younger grandkids. I called they mother and  
25 told them that it was an emergency; to get over there; I

1 need a ride. Because my husband just went out and just  
2 left me, going -- say he going to the hospital.

3 So my daughter come. And just as we got on Drayton  
4 Street to cross over 121, my daughter called me,  
5 hollering and screaming. Say, "She at the hospital,  
6 Mama? Yeah. She been shot. She been shot, Mama."

7 And I'm like, Oh, my God. What am I going to do?  
8 And I said, "Okay. Just stay right there." And she was  
9 just hollering.

10 Q At this -- what -- approximately what time did you  
11 hear these shots that -- that woke you?

12 A About 2:30 in the morning.

13 Q Okay. But you're not exactly sure of the precise  
14 time?

15 A No, I'm not sure. But I know it was, you know, over  
16 the morning, like 2-something. I remember looking at the  
17 clock. If I'm not mistaken, it was like 2:19.

18 Q Okay. And did you have an idea of Xzay's  
19 whereabouts at this point in time?

20 A No, I didn't. I'm thinking, when he answer his  
21 phone and the truck was there, that he was at the house.

22 Q Okay. So you were -- you were operating on the  
23 assumption, when -- when your husband Wallace made that  
24 phone call to Xzay, that he was at the house -- Xzay was?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. All right, Ms. Hunter. Thank -- thank you.

2 Please answer any questions Mr. Geoly has for you.

3 THE COURT: All right. Cross-examination.

4 MR. GEOLY: Please the Court.

5 THE COURT: Thank you.

6 CROSS-EXAMINATION

7 BY MR. GEOLY:

8 Q Hey, Ms. Hunter. How you doing?

9 A Fine. What about yourself?

10 Q Good. We've talked before, right?

11 A Yes.

12 Q But we never really met ---

13 A No.

14 Q --- face to face, have we?

15 A Unh-unh.

16 Q Have you ever met with the solicitor before today?

17 A The solicitor?

18 Q The solicitor. Solicitor Stumbo and Solicitor  
19 Taylor, have you met with them before today?

20 A Yeah. Uh-huh.

21 Q To talk about this case?

22 A I come to talk to him about this case -- what name  
23 -- Stumbo?

24 Q Stumbo, yeah.

25 A Uh-huh.

1 Q You did talk to him about it?

2 A Yeah.

3 Q Okay. Did you get much input?

4 A Did I do what?

5 Q Get much input in how the case was going be handled?

6 A No. He didn't really tell me how it was going be  
7 handled.

8 Q Okay.

9 MR. DANIEL: Your -- Your Honor, objection, just to  
10 the relevance of that -- that question. I don't know ---

11 THE COURT: Okay. Overruled. Go ahead.

12 Q You said Xzay is married to your daughter; is that  
13 right?

14 A Right.

15 Q Well, did -- and you said Xzay would sleep a lot  
16 when he wasn't working.

17 A Right.

18 Q Did he work a good bit?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Where did he work?

21 A Georgia-Pacific.

22 Q Okay. Was he full-time at Georgia-Pacific?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Did he have any kind of leadership out there, do you  
25 know?



1 A I don't know about that, now.

2 Q Okay. He's pretty young though, right?

3 A Yeah.

4 Q Well, at the time that this occurred, I think he was  
5 about 26; is that right, to your recollection?

6 A I think so.

7 Q Okay. How'd he do as far as taking care of the  
8 family? Was he a good provider?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Okay. Took care of the children's needs? Took care  
11 of your wife's needs -- I mean, took care of your  
12 daughter's needs?

13 A He took care of everything he need to take care.

14 Q Okay. And they asked you -- they said -- now, Iven  
15 was his stepson. If -- if you would see Xzay and Iven on  
16 an ordinary day, there was no way to tell that -- that  
17 Iven was his stepson, was it?

18 A No, not ---

19 Q I mean ---

20 A --- really.

21 Q --- as far as Xzay was concerned, that was his boy,  
22 right?

23 A Yeah.

24 Q I mean, and -- and as far as the boy was concerned,  
25 this was his dad, right?

1 A Right.

2 Q And they -- they had that kind of love for one  
3 another, wasn't it?

4 A Uh-huh.

5 Q Okay.

6 THE COURT: I'm sorry. You need answer "yes" or  
7 "no."

8 THE WITNESS: Oh. Yes.

9 THE COURT: Thank you.

10 Q They did have ---

11 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

12 Q --- that love for one another didn't they, a ---

13 A Yes.

14 Q --- father-son love?

15 You've certainly -- I know a lot happened this  
16 night. And -- and I think you said at the beginning,  
17 "Wallace, get up, honey. There's something bad done  
18 happened. Either she shot him or he shot her."

19 A Uh-huh.

20 Q You didn't know at first, right?

21 A No, I didn't.

22 Q Okay. They're not the kind of couple to have  
23 trouble, really, like that, right?

24 A They had a few little problems here and there.

25 Q Kind of tit for tat?

1 A No. I think, like, one time the baby was jumping on  
2 the bed.

3 Q Uh-huh.

4 A And she fell off. And she had got a knot on her  
5 head. And Xzay wanted to call the ambulance, and my  
6 daughter said, "No. I'll just take her." And he --  
7 they, you know, kind of dispute about something like  
8 that.

9 Q But no fisticuffs, no hitting, no fighting in the  
10 house?

11 A No. Unh-unh.

12 Q None of that kind of stuff?

13 A No.

14 Q No abuse of these children going on in that house?

15 A Not that ---

16 Q You live ---

17 A --- I know.

18 Q --- right next door. You'd have known if it was  
19 happening, right?

20 A Yeah. Because Penelope would tell me if something  
21 wrong.

22 Q She's a cute, precious, little child, isn't she?

23 A Uh-huh.

24 Q She's 5 now. I think she was 3 when this happened;  
25 is that right?

1 A Right.

2 Q And that's who you see in the videos with you and  
3 Indigo, right?

4 A Right.

5 Q Indigo loves her husband, doesn't she?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Okay. Now, that night, when you get him on the  
8 phone -- or excuse me -- when Mr. Wallace gets him on the  
9 phone, you didn't ask him what he was shooting at, did  
10 you?

11 A No.

12 Q When Taylor says, "Hey, he didn't say he was  
13 shooting at tires," that's not what he said. But nobody  
14 asked him either, right?

15 A He -- my husband told him -- say he heard some  
16 shooting went on over there and asked him what's going  
17 on. And he said he was no fucking chap to play with.

18 Q Right. Now, do you know why that happened? Do you  
19 know how that kind of all happened?

20 A I don't know. He sound like he mad. That what I  
21 told my husband.

22 Q And -- and -- and they kind of got into it probably  
23 because he had been at his fish fry over at his daddy's  
24 folks' house, right?

25 A I don't know.

1 Q You hadn't talked to anybody about that since  
2 either?

3 A Unh-unh.

4 Q Okay. Did you ask -- since then, have you talked to  
5 Indigo about what happened that night?

6 A No. Because I been having trouble with Indigo.

7 Q Okay.

8 A You know, she have, like -- she tells me sometimes  
9 she's, like, having, like, a nervous breakdown or  
10 something.

11 Q And she still loves her husband, doesn't she?

12 A Yeah.

13 Q Want to stand by him, doesn't she?

14 A I guess.

15 Q She doesn't believe that he was shooting at her to  
16 kill, does he ---

17 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, objection. That ---

18 Q --- does she?

19 THE COURT: Sustained.

20 Q She's never said to you that she thinks that ---

21 MR. DANIEL: Objection to the hearsay, Your Honor.

22 THE COURT: Sustained.

23 Q Has she ever expressed to you that she ---

24 THE COURT: That's hearsay. I ---

25 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir, Your Honor.

1 THE COURT: --- sustained the objection.

2 Q You don't believe Xzay was trying to kill her that  
3 night, do you?

4 A In my mind?

5 Q Yes. Do you ---

6 A Yes.

7 Q --- think he -- you think he set out to kill your  
8 daughter that night?

9 A I -- I can't say, you know, that he set out to kill  
10 her. But you think about it. There was a revolver  
11 involved. She's a lady, and every man can beat a lady.  
12 You know what I'm saying?

13 Q Right. But you ---

14 A So it didn't take a gun.

15 Q In -- in -- but he didn't hit on her, does he?

16 A I don't know that. She never told me that.

17 Q Okay. Well, you know about -- that -- that he had  
18 plenty opportunity to shoot her and didn't, right, that  
19 night? Like ---

20 A I ---

21 Q --- admission.

22 A I don't know. I ---

23 Q You don't ---

24 A --- don't know.

25 Q --- know?

1 A I don't know.

2 Q Because you weren't there?

3 A That's right.

4 Q You was in the house?

5 A Sleep.

6 Q So in ---

7 A Yes.

8 Q --- terms of whether or not he had any malice  
9 aforethought or whether he intended to shoot your  
10 daughter or not or if he intended to shoot Iven or not,  
11 you don't know?

12 MR. DANIEL: Your -- Your Honor, objection. That's  
13 -- that's -- that's a question for the jury whether  
14 there's malice ---

15 THE COURT: Overruled. I'll allow it. Go ahead.

16 Q I think you were saying you don't know, right?

17 A I don't know.

18 Q So you don't have anything to tell the jury about  
19 that?

20 A No.

21 Q Prior to this happening, did you have a loving  
22 grandson, Iven? Was he a loving grandson?

23 A Yes. He was marvelous. He was excellent. He was  
24 ---

25 Q And ---

1 A --- everything you want in a child.

2 Q And he and all those other kids love Xzay, didn't  
3 they?

4 A Yeah.

5 MR. GEOLY: No further questions, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: All right. Redirect?

7 MR. DANIEL: Very briefly, Your Honor.

8 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

9 BY MR. DANIEL:

10 Q Ms. Hunter, I think Mr. Geoly asked you about  
11 whether you knew of any marital difficulties between Xzay  
12 and -- and your daughter Indigo. And I think you  
13 indicated you didn't know, correct?

14 A I didn't know.

15 Q Because you don't know what happens behind closed  
16 doors?

17 A That's right.

18 Q And as far as anything that was in Xzay's mind at  
19 the time he fired that weapon, do you know what was in  
20 his mind at the time he fired the weapon?

21 A To kill her.

22 Q Thank you.

23 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

24 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

25 THE COURT: All right.



1 (Off the record briefly.)

2 THE COURT: All right. The state can call your next  
3 witness.

4 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, my apologies. The state  
5 calls Wallace Hunter.

6 THE COURT: All right.

7 (Off the record briefly.)

8 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

9 WALLACE HUNTER, having first duly affirmed,  
10 testified as follows:

11 THE WITNESS: I don't swear, but I'll tell the  
12 truth.

13 THE COURT: All right. Thank you very much.

14 CLERK OF COURT: State your ---

15 THE COURT: You ---

16 CLERK OF COURT: --- name ---

17 THE COURT: --- may be ---

18 CLERK OF COURT: Sorry.

19 THE COURT: That's fine.

20 You can take off your mask. State your name for the  
21 record.

22 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

23 THE COURT: Your name?

24 THE WITNESS: Wallace -- Wallace Hunter.

25 THE COURT: All right.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. DANIEL:

Q All right. Mr. Hunter -- where are you from, Mr. Hunter?

A Huh?

Q Where you from, Mr. Hunter? Where you live?

A [REDACTED] Newberry, South Carolina.

THE COURT: I'm sorry. You're going to need to speak up and into the microphone, okay?

A Now, what that you were saying?

Q All right. Where you live, sir?

A Where do I live?

Q Yes, sir.

A [REDACTED], Newberry, South Carolina.

Q Okay. And you lived there for a long time; is that correct?

A Yes, sir.

Q And your wife is Vinnie Ray Hunter, correct?

A Yes, sir.

Q She just testified, right?

A Yes, sir.

Q And Indigo Penny is your daughter, correct?

A Yes, sir.

Q Okay. And she has kids, correct, Indigo does?

A Yeah.

1 Q So you -- you're a grandfather to Indigo's kids,  
2 correct?

3 A Yeah, right.

4 Q All right. I'm going to go back, Mr. Hunter, to  
5 April 20th of -- of 2019, the early-morning hours. Do  
6 you have a recollection of that time period?

7 A Well, like I said, my wife woke me up; said she hear  
8 some gunshot. So I said, "I ain't no -- hear no  
9 gunshot."

10 And she's, "Well, call over there to Xzay and see  
11 what's going on."

12 So when I called over there, that when he told me --  
13 he said, "I ain't no chap. I ain't nothing to be played  
14 with."

15 Q All right. Let me get this straight, because it was  
16 a little difficult hearing you. I don't know if all the  
17 jurors necessarily hear you, because the air's going up  
18 there.

19 You said your wife woke you up?

20 A Yes, sir.

21 Q All right. And said she heard -- and your wife said  
22 she heard gunshots, correct?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q And your wife told you to tall Xzay?

25 A Yes, sir.

1 Q That's Xzavier Davis?

2 A Yes, sir.

3 Q All right. So you called, correct?

4 A Right.

5 Q And did you put it on the speakerphone?

6 A Well, my phone, when I usually call, I put it on  
7 speakerphone.

8 Q And that's so your wife can hear the conversation as  
9 well?

10 A Yeah.

11 Q All right. So when you called Xzay to find out  
12 what's going on next door with gunshots ---

13 A Right.

14 Q --- Xzay answers the phone. And -- and tell me:  
15 What, if anything, does he say?

16 A "I ain't no chap." He said a curse word, but -- you  
17 want to say what he told me?

18 Q Please.

19 A He said, "Mr. Bo, I ain't no damn chap. I ain't  
20 nothing to be played with."

21 Q So he -- he -- he -- Xzay calls you "Mr. Bo"?

22 A Yeah. He always do.

23 Q All right. So you -- so when you said, "What's  
24 going on," he said: "Mr. Bo, I ain't no damn chap; don't  
25 play with me," something like that?

1 A Yeah. Yes, sir.

2 Q Okay. And then, did he say anything after that?

3 A He hung the phone up. So my wife told me, "Call him  
4 back." So I called him back. And he repeated the same  
5 thing.

6 Q Almost the identical thing ---

7 A Yes ---

8 Q --- he said ---

9 A --- sir.

10 Q --- the first call?

11 A Yes, sir.

12 Q Did -- did -- did Xzay sound angry when he said  
13 this?

14 A I can't tell you that.

15 Q I mean, how was -- what was the tone of his voice?  
16 Was he yelling? Was he crying? Could you tell?

17 A Well, to me, he might've been angry.

18 Q You would describe his voice as -- as having an  
19 angry tone to it?

20 A The way he said with the tone of voice he had.

21 Q All right. And at any point in time, did you ever  
22 hear Xzay tell you anything to the effect about firing a  
23 gun and someone actually getting hit, anything ---

24 A No. I ---

25 Q --- of that ---

1 A --- never heard ---

2 Q --- nature?

3 A --- that.

4 Q Say that again, sir?

5 A I said I never heard that. You said about a gun.

6 Q You're essentially saying all he told you was: "I  
7 ain't no bleep chap; don't play with me."

8 A That's right.

9 Q And you're questioning him about what just happened,  
10 related to the gunshots and all that, right?

11 A I guess -- gunshot was already been shot.

12 Q Well, you're asking about -- you heard gunshots or  
13 "What's going on? Are you okay?" kind of thing, right?

14 A Right.

15 MR. GEOLY: Objection, Your Honor. I'm not sure  
16 what the question was there myself. I mean, I -- I'd ask  
17 that he ask a question ---

18 THE COURT: All right.

19 MR. GEOLY: --- and quit testifying.

20 THE COURT: Ask it again.

21 Q All -- all right. Mr. Hunter, what did you -- what  
22 question did -- did you ask Xzay on both phone calls?

23 MR. GEOLY: I'd object to ---

24 A I asked ---

25 MR. GEOLY: asked and ---

1 A --- him what ---

2 MR. GEOLY: --- answered ---

3 A --- was going on.

4 MR. GEOLY: --- to that.

5 THE COURT: Overruled. Go ahead. Ask ---

6 A I asked ---

7 THE COURT: --- it again.

8 A --- him what was going on.

9 Q You -- you just simply asked what was going on?

10 A Yeah. What had happened over there.

11 Q And -- and there ---

12 A And ---

13 Q --- was just two phone calls, correct?

14 A Right. Yes, sir.

15 Q And -- and his response both times were ---

16 MR. GEOLY: Objection, Your Honor. He's ---

17 A Yes, sir.

18 MR. GEOLY: --- said this four times. I mean ---

19 THE COURT: Overruled. Go ahead.

20 Q Just one last time, so we can be clear: Both phone  
21 calls, Xzay only made two statements in response to your  
22 question about what's going on, correct?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q And that was what, one more time?

25 A Uh-huh. It was two time. I called him two time.

1 Q And he said what both times?

2 A "I ain't no chap. I ain't nothing to be played  
3 with."

4 Q "I ain't no chap. Ain't nothing to be played with."  
5 Right?

6 A Yeah.

7 Q All right. Thank you, Mr. Hunter.

8 THE COURT: All right. Cross-examination.

9 MR. GEOLY: Please the Court, Judge.

10 THE COURT: All right.

11 (Off the record briefly.)

12 CROSS-EXAMINATION

13 BY MR. GEOLY:

14 Q Had you gotten a call from Indigo that night, Mr.  
15 Hunter?

16 A Do I have what?

17 Q Had you gotten a call from your daughter that night?  
18 Indigo, had you gotten a call from Indigo that night?

19 A No. Indigo didn't call me.

20 Q Indigo did not call you?

21 A No.

22 Q Did you ---

23 A My wife ---

24 Q --- ever check ---

25 A --- woke me up.



1 Q Did you ever check to see if you had any phone  
2 called you missed from her?

3 A No. I went out to the hospital.

4 Q Have you ever talked to Indigo about what he was  
5 talking about that night?

6 A No.

7 Q No -- never have?

8 A No. I don't tell -- get in they business.

9 Q Don't get in their business?

10 A No, sir.

11 Q Okay. But if she was calling you about things going  
12 on at the house that night, he might consider it, if you  
13 got involved, that you're treating him like a chap. Is  
14 that fair to say?

15 A Unh-unh. I don't know nothing about that.

16 Q Okay. Are you sure she didn't try to call you  
17 earlier that evening, or you don't know?

18 A I -- how can she call me if she's shot?

19 Q Huh?

20 A She went to the -- she had got shot and went to the  
21 hospital.

22 Q I'm talking about before anybody was shot.

23 A Well ---

24 Q I'm talking ---

25 A --- I'm just ---

1 Q --- about when she won't let him in the house.

2 A I -- I can't understand that.

3 Q You can't ---

4 A Because ---

5 Q --- understand ---

6 A --- I was ---

7 Q --- that she might've ---

8 A --- I was ---

9 Q --- called you?

10 A --- sleep. I was sleep when my wife woke me up.

11 Q So you don't know -- prior to your wife waking you  
12 up, you don't know what was happening?

13 A She woke me up because she said she heard gunshot.

14 Q Right. And you didn't hear those shots, right?

15 A No. I was sleep.

16 Q Okay. You and Xzay get along pretty good, right?

17 A Oh, yeah.

18 Q Okay. Do you think he tried to kill Indigo?

19 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, objection.

20 THE COURT: Overruled. Go ahead.

21 A Yeah.

22 Q That's what you think?

23 A I ---

24 Q I don't ---

25 A Repeat ---

1 Q --- want you ---

2 A --- that.

3 Q --- to say what ---

4 A Repeat that questions to me.

5 Q Do you think he tried to kill Indigo that night?

6 A Well, I -- to me, I don't think he -- I don't think  
7 he meant to kill her.

8 Q You don't think that, do you? That's what Ms.  
9 Vinnie thinks. But you don't think that, do you?

10 A That what Ms. Vinnie said.

11 Q But that's not what you think. I know what Ms.  
12 Vinnie said. I'm asking you.

13 A Well, I said no. I don't ---

14 Q Right.

15 A --- really think ---

16 Q Now -- now ---

17 A --- he meant to ---

18 Q --- don't ---

19 A --- kill anybody.

20 Q Xzay loved -- Xzay loved Iven, didn't he?

21 A Yeah. But once you ---

22 Q It's okay.

23 A --- make a -- once you make a mistake, you got to  
24 pay for it.

25 Q I -- I get that. But -- but part of this is whether

1 or not he had malice aforethought, whether he had this  
2 evil intention to kill your grandson. And -- and you  
3 just said you don't believe that, really, do you?

4 And I know you're in a tough spot with your wife and  
5 your daughter. Now, Indigo doesn't believe that either,  
6 does she?

7 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor ---

8 A I have no ---

9 MR. DANIEL: --- objection ---

10 A --- idea.

11 MR. DANIEL: --- to the -- that -- that's pitting, I  
12 believe.

13 A I can't tell you what ---

14 THE COURT: I'll ---

15 A --- Indigo thinking.

16 THE COURT: --- I'll sustain the objection. Go  
17 ahead and ask your next question.

18 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

19 Q You -- you've known that they've been married for a  
20 few years, right?

21 A Yes, sir.

22 Q She switched her name to Indigo Davis back then,  
23 right?

24 A Yeah. They married.

25 Q Do you -- you realize they're still trying to call

1 her Indigo Penny, but she goes by Indigo Davis, doesn't  
2 she?

3 A I think she still do.

4 Q Okay. As terms of -- of providing, were you happy  
5 with your son-in-law in terms of what kind of provider he  
6 was?

7 A Yeah.

8 Q Did he go to work every day?

9 A Yeah.

10 Q Work six days a week, every week?

11 A I don't know about no every week, now. But I know  
12 he working a lot.

13 Q Okay. Worked a lot. Where -- where is he working?

14 A Georgia-Pacific.

15 Q Okay. Had a good job, right?

16 A I don't know.

17 Q You don't know if he had a good job?

18 A I don't know, now.

19 Q He took care of all the bills next door at 633,  
20 though, right?

21 A Well, that's right.

22 Q Okay. But part of a contention maybe between he and  
23 -- and Indigo, you actually -- is name is on that house,  
24 right?

25 A My name on the house?

1 Q I'm asking.

2 A Yeah.

3 Q Okay. But who put down the down payment on that  
4 house?

5 A Xzay did. Xzay and Indigo. I don't know. They --  
6 they told me to go with them over there and -- and they  
7 were going have to get a trailer.

8 Q And you basically helped them get a trailer by  
9 putting it in your name, right?

10 A Yeah.

11 Q Who -- but who paid the down payment?

12 A Whose name it was in?

13 Q No. I ---

14 A It's in my name.

15 Q Well ---

16 A That the ---

17 Q --- but you ---

18 A --- way ---

19 Q --- didn't ---

20 A --- they got ---

21 Q --- pay the down payment, right? You didn't take  
22 that out of your bank account to pay the down payment,  
23 right?

24 A Yeah. That what they did. Q

25 A

1 Q All right. So -- so Xzay did that, right?

2 A (No audible response.)

3 Q And when the monthly payment would come up for the  
4 mortgage every month, who would pay that?

5 A (No audible response.)

6 Q You would pay it or Xzay would pay it?

7 A Well, Indigo -- I told the lady out there to turn  
8 everything over to Indigo.

9 Q Okay. And that's what's happened, right?

10 A That what happened.

11 Q All right. You don't pay those bills. He pays  
12 those bills, right?

13 A Well, I have help.

14 Q So if you're calling -- she's calling over to put  
15 him out the house and telling him, "You can't come in the  
16 house," that might elicit a reaction like: "Mr. Bo, I  
17 ain't no chap. I ain't nothing to be played with,  
18 putting me out of own house that I pay the bills for.  
19 Lock me out at 2:30 in the morning when I'm coming home.  
20 I'm the bill-payer here." Right? I mean, you understand  
21 where he was coming from with that, don't you?

22 A Yeah. You got to have understanding. If you can't  
23 come in the house at a certain time of night that y'all  
24 done agreed on ---

25 Q I -- I ---

1 A --- that day ---

2 Q --- understand the ---

3 A --- you shouldn't have it.

4 Q I understand that too, which is probably why they  
5 were fighting, because he'd been drinking at his -- at  
6 his aunt's a little bit with his dad ---

7 A I don't ---

8 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor ---

9 Q --- right?

10 MR. DANIEL: --- objection.

11 A --- what he ---

12 MR. DANIEL: This is ---

13 A --- was drinking.

14 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, this ---

15 A I can't ---

16 MR. DANIEL: --- is testimony ---

17 A --- say nothing about that.

18 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, this -- this is testimony  
19 that would need to be elicited from Indigo, not -- not  
20 Mr. Hunter. I don't ---

21 THE COURT: Well, if he knows. If he doesn't know,  
22 he doesn't know. I'll allow it. Go ahead.

23 Q You like Xzay, don't you?

24 A Yeah. I loved Xzay. He was my son-in-law, wasn't  
25 he?



1 Q Right.

2 A That's right.

3 Q And he likes you, doesn't he?

4 A I guess he did. You know, me and him have no  
5 problem.

6 Q Right. And he was a good dad, wasn't he?

7 A I -- yes, sir. I'll say yes, sir.

8 Q And this was a terrible tragedy ---

9 A Yeah. It ---

10 Q --- all the ---

11 A --- was a ---

12 Q --- way around.

13 A --- terrible -- yeah. All around, it was a terrible  
14 situation.

15 Q But some things -- sometimes bad things happen that  
16 aren't meant to happen. You agree with that?

17 A Yeah.

18 Q No further questions.

19 A All right.

20 THE COURT: Redirect?

21 MR. DANIEL: Briefly, Your Honor.

22 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

23 BY MR. DANIEL:

24 Q And Mr. Geoly asked you about Xzay's love for Iven,  
25 correct?

1 A Say ---

2 Q Is that ---

3 A --- what, now?

4 Q --- correct, Mr. Hunter?

5 You were asked on -- by the defense about Xzay's  
6 love for -- for Iven, right?

7 A Yeah. I reckon he did.

8 Q All right. But -- but you had a love for Iven;  
9 still do; is that correct?

10 A Correct.

11 Q And you had a decent relationship with Xzay at -- at  
12 some point in time; is that right?

13 A Oh, yeah.

14 Q Up until he opened fire on your daughter ---

15 A Uh-huh.

16 Q --- is that correct?

17 MR. GEOLY: Objection, Your Honor. Is he asking a  
18 question or is he testifying again?

19 THE COURT: Sustained.

20 MR. DANIEL: Nothing further, Your Honor.

21 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

22 THE WITNESS: All right.

23 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

24 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen, it's  
25 12:30. I think we're going to go ahead and break for

1 lunch.

2 I'm going to allow you to go to lunch on your own.  
3 I remind you, while you're at lunch or during this break,  
4 do not discuss the case, even among yourselves. It's too  
5 early for deliberations. Don't conduct any independent  
6 investigations.

7 Hope everybody has a good lunch. It's 12:30. I'm  
8 going to ask that you please be back at two o'clock. And  
9 we'll get started at two o'clock. Have a good lunch, and  
10 we'll see you then.

11 (Whereupon, the jury exited the courtroom at 12:28  
12 p.m.)

13 (Off the record briefly.)

14 THE COURT: Anything from the state before we recess  
15 for lunch?

16 MR. STUMBO: Nothing from the state, Judge.

17 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

18 MR. GEOLY: Nothing from the defendant, Your Honor.

19 THE COURT: All right. We'll be in recess till two  
20 o'clock.

21 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

22 (The Court went off the record at 12:30 p.m.)

23 (The Court went on the record at 2:12 p.m.)

24 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state  
25 before we bring the jury in?

1 MR STUMBO: Nothing from the state, Judge.

2 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

3 MR GEOLY: No, sir, Your Honor.

4 THE COURT: All right. Let's go ahead and bring the  
5 jury in.

6 (Off the record briefly.)

7 (Whereupon, the jury entered the courtroom at 2:14  
8 p.m.)

9 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen,  
10 welcome back. We're ready to proceed with the trial of  
11 the case.

12 The state can call your next witness.

13 MR DANIEL: May it please the Court, Your Honor.  
14 The state calls Deputy Shawn Carnes.

15 THE COURT: All right.

16 (Off the record briefly.)

17 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

18 SHAWN CARNES, having been first duly sworn,  
19 testified as follows:

20 DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Have a seat and state your  
21 name for the record.

22 THE WITNESS: My name is Shawn Carnes. Spelling on  
23 that last name is C-a-r-n-e-s.

24 THE COURT: All right. And how do you spell Shawn?

25 THE WITNESS: S-h-a-w-n.

1 THE COURT: All right. Thank you.

2 All right, sir.

3 MR DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor.

4 DIRECT EXAMINATION

5 BY MR. DANIEL:

6 Q All right. Deputy Carnes of the Newberry Sheriff's  
7 Office, correct?

8 A Yes, sir.

9 Q How long have you been with the Newberry Sheriff's  
10 Office?

11 A A little over 19 years.

12 Q Roughly two decades with the sheriff's office and  
13 you're on road patrol; is that correct?

14 A Yes, sir. Patrol division.

15 Q Okay. And I want to go back to April 20th of 2019,  
16 so over two years ago. Were you working early-morning  
17 hours, night shift, on that particular date?

18 A Yes, sir.

19 Q All right. And did you have an occasion to become  
20 involved in a -- a shooting investigation that occurred  
21 out in the Helena area of Newberry County?

22 A Yes, sir.

23 Q All right. Tell us how that came about.

24 A Initially, at about -- from what I'm looking at from  
25 my incident supplemental report, we got a report at about

1 3:08 in the morning of emergency, shots fired in the Giff  
2 Street/Upper Lane area. That's how we initially became,  
3 you know, aware of the shooting incident.

4 Q Okay.

5 A Shortly thereafter, we were notified something else  
6 at the hospital.

7 Q All right. Let me stop you there. So approximately  
8 3:08 a.m., you're dispatched out to Giff and -- Giff  
9 Street and Upper Lane area due to ---

10 A That's ---

11 Q --- to reports ---

12 A Yes, sir. That's where the initial -- that's where  
13 the -- whoever called in the complaint, that's where they  
14 said that the shots may have been coming from.

15 Obviously, shots can carry and they're heard at different  
16 locations.

17 Q Is Giff Street/Upper Lane area -- is that -- would  
18 that be in close proximity to [REDACTED]?

19 A Yes, sir.

20 Q How close?

21 A Way the crows fly, less than a tenth of a mile.

22 Q Okay. So maybe just a block or two over?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q Okay. All right. And what happened next after you  
25 received that, I guess, anonymous call about shots fired?

1 A Yes, sir. At about 3:16, so eight minutes later, we  
2 got -- we were notified by -- I was notified by  
3 communications about two victims at the hospital with  
4 gunshot wounds.

5 Q So you're dispatched to then go to the Newberry  
6 County Hospital?

7 A I sent some -- I send units as well as the Newberry  
8 City Police Department to respond that way as well, since  
9 we -- we didn't know, like, the initial location of the  
10 actual incident, the scene, would be.

11 Q Okay. So you personally then -- you go out to the  
12 hospital as well to further investigate?

13 A I -- I -- yes, sir. I responded to the hospital  
14 first before running -- going over to Helena area.

15 Q Okay. So approximately what time do you arrive at  
16 the Newberry hospital?

17 A I would say just a few minutes thereafter, because I  
18 don't actually have a documented time stamp in this  
19 report to show -- I can pull from the CAD, but I'd say a  
20 few minutes after, not -- not far after 3:16.

21 Q All right. So when you arrive at the hospital, what  
22 -- what, if any, information do you learn about the --  
23 the location of the -- the shooting?

24 A I was able to get information from there that the  
25 incident location or where the shots were fired were at

1 [REDACTED]. And I was told that the shooter was  
2 Xzay.

3 Q Okay. So you are able to develop a suspect who's  
4 involved in this shooting; is that correct?

5 A Yes, sir.

6 Q And who was that suspect?

7 A Xzavier Davis.

8 Q And so then, at that point, then you go out to [REDACTED]  
9 [REDACTED]; is that correct?

10 A Yes, sir.

11 Q All right. Approximately what time do you go out to  
12 [REDACTED]

13 A It would be between the 3:16 and 4:06. I don't have  
14 a time-stamped reference in the actual report, as far as  
15 -- so between there.

16 Q Okay.

17 A I'm not sure, though, exactly.

18 Q All right. And so you and -- you go out there. Are  
19 you the only unit that then goes out to [REDACTED]?

20 A No, sir. I have Deputy De'Quan Mitchell and I know  
21 Deputy Gary Seibert -- all three of us responded there.  
22 I actually had sent Deputy Mitchell there to that general  
23 area at first to try and locate the source -- source of  
24 the gunshots.

25 Q Okay. And did you take extra precautions, as it was



1 a shooting investigation?

2 A Yes, sir, absolutely.

3 Q All right. So when you -- when you personally  
4 arrive at [REDACTED] -- and I'm going to show you  
5 ---

6 MR. DANIEL: Mr. Bentley, if you could please pull  
7 up 93 -- State's 93.

8 It's already in evidence.

9 Q Deputy Carnes, do you recognize that on the computer  
10 screen?

11 A No issue with stepping down so I can see?

12 Q Please, if you need -- need to.

13 A Yes, sir. I recognize that as [REDACTED].

14 Q Okay. And so at that point what do you when you and  
15 other units arrive at this location?

16 A We take a tactical position around the house,  
17 meaning we set up a perimeter behind vehicles. I used my  
18 P.A. system to try and establish contact with him.

19 Q So you use your -- your microphone system -- it's a  
20 part of your patrol car -- to call out Xzavier Davis; is  
21 that correct?

22 A Yes, sir.

23 Q Okay.

24 MR. DANIEL: Mr. Bentley, please go to 95.

25 That's in evidence.

1 Q All right. So are you staged around the front of  
2 the house per that picture?

3 A Yes, sir.

4 Q Okay. All right. And ---

5 A We're ---

6 Q -- eventually ---

7 A --- I mean, we're able to view the -- we're able to  
8 view the back of the house as well. But primarily, it  
9 was in the front of -- of the house.

10 Q Okay. So units were covering the -- the back of the  
11 house as well?

12 A And we'd -- we were able to see, in -- in case  
13 somebody were to try to jump out a window or go out the  
14 back door.

15 Q All right. And so are you -- tell us exactly what  
16 you're saying on this P.A. system.

17 A Just trying to, you know, like I said, establish  
18 contact with him to get him to come out of the house, you  
19 know, peacefully so there's no threat to him getting hurt  
20 or any threat to us getting hurt.

21 Q Okay. And approximately how long did it take for  
22 Mr. Davis to -- to come out of the house?

23 A Like I said, I don't have exact -- any time stamps.  
24 It wasn't very long, because it's referenced in the  
25 report that at about 4:06, I actually took him into

1 custody.

2 Q All right. So 4:06 a.m. per -- and you -- I know  
3 you probably don't have an independent recollection of  
4 the time. But you're saying 4:06 is when he's taken into  
5 custody?

6 A That's what I'm referencing from the incident report  
7 that I have, which would've been -- those times would've  
8 been obtained from communication, who keeps a CAD log of  
9 all documented incidences in our radio traffic.

10 Q So as soon as you're able to get Mr. Davis to come  
11 out of the house, you notified dispatch he's in custody  
12 and that's how you know exactly what time he was taken  
13 into custody?

14 A Uh-huh. Per their log. Yes, sir.

15 Q Okay. So there's a computer log that keeps track of  
16 that?

17 A (No audible response.)

18 Q All right. And describe Mr. Davis's demeanor and  
19 whether he was compliant or not, things of that nature.

20 A Calm and compliant and gave no issues. Did not  
21 resist or anything. I had him come toward us, turn  
22 around, and he -- he obeyed all commands.

23 Q And so he's handcuffed immediately?

24 A Was a search and then handcuffed. Yes, sir.

25 Q Did you note any injuries to Mr. Davis, anything

1 like that?

2 A Not a recollection, I didn't note any injuries.

3 Q Did Mr. Davis appear to be intoxicated in any way?

4 A I can't recall. I mean, it's been over two years.  
5 But, I mean, I'm not -- can't recall.

6 Q But if that -- if that were something you would've  
7 noted, would you have put that in a report?

8 A (No audible response.)

9 Q Things of ---

10 A It's ---

11 Q --- that nature.

12 A It's possible. But I -- I didn't put it in the  
13 report ---

14 Q Okay.

15 A --- on this particular report.

16 Q And then ---

17 MR. DANIEL: And, Your Honor, I'm a offer State's 97  
18 into evidence and -- it's without objection, according to  
19 ---

20 THE COURT: Any ---

21 MR. DANIEL: --- Mr. Geoly.

22 THE COURT: --- objection to State's ---

23 MR. GEOLY: No objection ---

24 THE COURT: --- Exhibit ---

25 MR. GEOLY: --- Your Honor.

1 THE COURT: --- Number 97?

2 State's Exhibit 97 admitted into evidence without  
3 objection.

4 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 97 was entered into  
5 evidence.)

6 Q All right. And, Deputy Carnes, what are we looking  
7 at there, just . . .

8 A We're looking at a view of the front of the house  
9 from looking at the side of the house. I guess that's --  
10 you can see tire tracks is the -- where a car would  
11 usually have been parked ---

12 Q And ---

13 A --- or something.

14 Q --- when you arrived on scene, there was no car  
15 parked in that area; is that correct?

16 A No, sir.

17 Q And that crime-scene tape, did y'all set up a  
18 perimeter there?

19 A We would have set up the crime-scene tape to try to  
20 keep people -- personnel that did not need to be in the  
21 scene so you could keep from contaminating the scene.

22 Q So once Mr. Davis is taken into custody, then y'all  
23 set up a -- the crime-scene perimeter to -- to preserve  
24 the scene; is that correct?

25 A As best as possible. Yes, sir.

1 Q Okay. All right. Thank you, Deputy Carnes. Please  
2 answer any questions that Mr. Geoly has for you.

3 A Yes, sir.

4 THE COURT: All right. All right. Cross-  
5 examination.

6 MR. GEOLY: If it please the Court, Your Honor.

7 THE COURT: All right.

8 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

9 CROSS-EXAMINATION

10 BY MR. GEOLY:

11 Q Is it -- is it Lt. Carnes now?

12 A Yes, sir.

13 Q Lieutenant, thank you for being here today.

14 A Thank you, sir.

15 Q And -- and thank you for the way you treated my  
16 client that night.

17 A Yes, sir.

18 Q I know this was a difficult situation and the way  
19 y'all handled it professionally, I -- I'm sure.

20 Do you recall him that night and as you sit here and  
21 look at him? I know you deal with a lot of people. But  
22 do you recall Mr. Davis?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q Okay. That night, I know you responded. And it was  
25 a tense situation and -- and maybe not everybody knew

1 what was going on.

2 When you got to the house and communicated him with  
3 the -- the loudspeaker system, y'all already had the back  
4 covered, right, before you -- you made contact, so to  
5 speak or tried to make contact?

6 A I had a deputy that was supposed to be having  
7 covered the back. Yes, sir.

8 Q Right. A couple of them, right?

9 A Initially, there was three of us on scene.

10 Q Okay. And -- and -- the -- the -- is it Da'Quan  
11 Mitchell, I think, had -- had gotten there first maybe  
12 and ---

13 A He was ---

14 Q --- and did ---

15 A --- he should've been the first -- he was in the  
16 area, so, you know, he would probably had been the first  
17 on scene. Yes, sir.

18 Q And then, when y'all get there, y'all decide to make  
19 contact. When you made contact, do you recall whether or  
20 not it was pretty quickly that he responded or did there  
21 seem to be a lot of, you know, movement in the house or  
22 did -- did you get a response pretty quickly from the  
23 occupant?

24 A I know I document in the report that I did see  
25 movement, as far as passing by the window, like a shadow.

1 But like I said earlier, I don't have an exact time stamp  
2 as far as when I tried to establish contact with the P.A.  
3 system and he came out.

4 Obviously, you're looking at here you -- information  
5 about victims at the hospital about 3:16. And I -- and  
6 we actually take him into custody at 4:06. So you're  
7 looking at a 50-minute time frame. So even if it was 50  
8 minutes, that's -- in this type of incident, that's not a  
9 lot of time.

10 Q That's pretty quick, isn't it?

11 A Yes, sir.

12 Q And -- and when he got out, he was cooperative,  
13 right?

14 A Yes, sir.

15 Q Obeyed commands?

16 A Yes, sir.

17 Q Didn't give you any trouble whatsoever?

18 A No, sir.

19 Q Did it seem like he even knew, really, exactly what  
20 was going on or -- or did you have any kind of way to  
21 gauge that at that point?

22 A Like I said, I -- I took him into custody. And I  
23 read him his rights. And after that, we were done.

24 Q Okay.

25 A So ---



1 Q Now, he was out there for a while. And it was  
2 pretty cool that night. Do you remember? Even though it  
3 was April, wasn't it pretty cool that evening?

4 A Recollection, I believe, looking at some of the body  
5 cameras, so people had on some jackets. For me, usually,  
6 a bigger guy ---

7 Q I understand.

8 A --- it takes a lot of something to be, like, colder  
9 for me to get cool so ---

10 Q I got you. Do you remember that he was in shorts  
11 and maybe didn't have shoes on, I think?

12 A I don't recollect what exactly he was wearing. No,  
13 sir. I'm sorry.

14 Q No. No, not at all. I was just going point out --  
15 I'm not trying to be funny. But while y'all were out  
16 there, I don't know if you -- do you recall allowing him  
17 to use the restroom ---

18 A I do.

19 Q --- in the ---

20 A I have that actually documented in my report that I  
21 actually let him use the restroom.

22 Q And -- and there was no problem; he complied with  
23 everything and then ---

24 A Yes, sir.

25 Q --- went and cooperated with y'all, right?

1 A Like I say, he -- he was compliant with everything  
2 on the scene, as far as I know. And with my interaction  
3 with him, I had no issues.

4 Q Not -- and I know this sounds ridiculous. But just  
5 to get it out and make sure: You had no dealings with  
6 Mr. Davis prior to this happening, right?

7 A Not that I recall.

8 Q Okay. And you -- you -- you didn't certainly have  
9 any kind of dealings with him and Indigo or him and Iven  
10 that night, right?

11 A With that -- you talking about that night?

12 Q Right. Like, you -- what I'm saying is: You have  
13 no idea what went on before the incident occurred?

14 A Other than what I was told. But ---

15 Q Right.

16 A No, sir. I don't -- I didn't respond to a domestic  
17 call for service earlier in the night or anything like  
18 that.

19 Q Okay. And -- and as far as what you were told, I  
20 think you testified to -- to Taylor that you developed  
21 the suspect based on your investigation. In fact, Indigo  
22 told you, "He's at the house," and -- and that's --  
23 that's how this all happened, right?

24 A I was -- yes, sir. I was -- I was told.

25 Q So Indigo Davis told you. And then you went out.

1 And sure enough, he was there, kind of waiting, and y'all  
2 took him into custody?

3 A Yes, sir.

4 Q Without -- without incident?

5 A Without incident.

6 Q Okay. No further questions.

7 THE COURT: All right. Redirect?

8 MR. DANIEL: No, Your Honor.

9 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

10 THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.

11 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

12 (Off the record briefly.)

13 THE COURT: The state can call your next witness.

14 MR. STUMBO: Thank you, Judge. The state calls Lt.  
15 Michael Stribble to the stand.

16 THE COURT: All right. If you'd hold for just a  
17 second and let us get the witness stand wiped down.

18 (Off the record briefly.)

19 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

20 MICHAEL STRIBBLE, having been first duly sworn,  
21 testified as follows:

22 CLERK OF COURT: Have a seat and state your name for  
23 the record.

24 THE WITNESS: My name's Michael Stribble.

25 THE COURT: All right.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. STUMBO:

Q Good afternoon. You're Lt. Michael Stribble, correct, sir?

A Yes, sir.

Q Okay. And ---

A It's just a title.

Q Lt. Stribble, what division do you work at, at the Newberry Sheriff's Office?

A I'm currently assigned to the investigations division.

Q Okay. And how long have you been in law enforcement?

A I began in 2001, so a little over 20 years.

Q All right. And you've done road patrol and other stuff in that ---

A Yes, sir. I worked road patrol to begin with. I did a little time here at the courthouse. I spent some time as a school resource officer. I worked narcotics for a long time. And now I'm the lieutenant over investigations.

Q Okay. Would it be fair to say you've worked hundreds, thousands of cases since you've been there?

A Yes, sir.

Q Okay. One of those cases the one we're here on this

1 week, Lt. Stribble?

2 A Yes, sir.

3 Q And take you back to April the 20th, which was  
4 early-morning hours on a Saturday, 2019. Were you  
5 working?

6 A No, sir.

7 Q Okay. And what were you planning to do that -- that  
8 was the weekend.

9 A Yes, sir. I was actually planning to go fish a bass  
10 tournament.

11 Q Okay. Did you end up responding to a call early-  
12 morning hours that night, though?

13 A Yes, sir.

14 Q Okay. Were you lead investigator on this case?

15 A No, sir. Not on this case.

16 Q Okay. Who was that?

17 A Investigator Dickert.

18 Q All right.

19 A Ryan Dickert.

20 Q Ryan Dickert, who's ---

21 A Yeah.

22 Q --- been in the courtroom here? Okay.

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q But you did respond. Where did you respond to that  
25 night?

1 A The first place I responded was the hospital, the  
2 emergency room.

3 Q Okay. Sheriff Foster was there?

4 A Yes, sir. I live, like, two minutes away ---

5 Q Okay.

6 A --- right around the corner from my house. So  
7 that's where I went first.

8 Q Okay. What -- if you could explain to the jury,  
9 what -- what was your role after you get briefed at the  
10 hospital? Where did you go from there?

11 A Once I got briefed, I was the one that was tasked  
12 with getting the search warrant for the residence. I  
13 also -- I know this is fast-forwarding, really, but when  
14 -- once I left the hospital is when I'm talking about.  
15 So I had to start working on the search warrant for the  
16 residence then for SLED's crime scene unit.

17 And then, also, once I got to the scene, Lt. Carnes  
18 had already had the suspect in custody. He was already  
19 Mirandized. And then we transported him to the jail.

20 And Sgt. Henderson and I were at the jail with him.  
21 And we then did a GSR kit, which is a gunshot-residue  
22 kit, on Xzavier's hands.

23 Q Okay. I'm going to, through the clerk here, hand  
24 you -- so I don't have to walk around this way -- what's  
25 as ID, State's 7.

1 MR. STUMBO: Would you hand that to . . .

2 Q Okay. What -- what's been marked for ID as State's  
3 7, what's inside that package?

4 A Inside here is the -- the gunshot-residue kit that I  
5 collected.

6 Q And how do you know it's -- it's the one you  
7 collected?

8 A On the outside of it, it's labeled Xzavier Sharif  
9 Davis. The officer's name is Michael Stribble, which is  
10 me; my badge number, Sierra 11; the agency name, Newberry  
11 County Sheriff's Office; and the agency case number,  
12 which is 19-03447.

13 Q Okay. And -- and you've said "collected GSR kit."  
14 Could you just briefly explain to the jury how you  
15 collect a ---

16 A Yes.

17 Q --- gunshot-residue ---

18 A Yes, sir.

19 Q --- kit?

20 A It's -- inside this packet are two small cylinder-  
21 type containers that have, for lack of a better term, a  
22 blotting-type instrument inside it so -- so that able to  
23 collect the residue off someone's hands or if you took it  
24 off a car or whatever. You take it and you blot one --  
25 they're labeled, one for your right hand, one for you

1 left -- or one for your right hand, one for your left  
2 hand. And you actually use the one that's labeled for  
3 that particular hand.

4 You then put gloves on yourself and then start to do  
5 the GSR kit on the suspect. And once you complete that,  
6 you seal it. It seals itself. It's got a -- a --  
7 through -- it twists like a -- a regular -- I don't know  
8 how to explain it but just like a -- a Coca-Cola bottle,  
9 so to speak. It twists so it -- it's -- does not get  
10 contaminated.

11 And then once I do both of those on his hands, you  
12 see the red tape that's around it. I seal it. And then  
13 I mark it where it -- my initials are on the front side  
14 of it. And that shows that it has not been tampered with  
15 when SLED gets it.

16 Q Okay. So SLED gets it and it -- it's not cut open,  
17 hopefully, until the analyst at SLED gets it.

18 A That's correct.

19 Q Okay. And so you did collect this -- what's in  
20 State's 7 off of the defendant, Xzavier Davis's, hands?

21 A Yes, sir.

22 Q Okay. And you recognize him? He's in the  
23 courtroom?

24 A Yes, sir.

25 Q Okay. And you said you were going fishing, a bass



1 tournament that day. So assuming you didn't take this  
2 with you to the bass tournament.

3 A No, sir. It was then placed into our evidence. And  
4 then on April the 22nd, 2019, it was turned over to  
5 Jaclynn McKay with SLED and -- for her to have it  
6 processed.

7 Q Okay. And you -- you've got a documentation of the  
8 time you gave it to her?

9 A That's correct. It was April 22nd, 2019, at 10:40  
10 a.m.

11 Q Okay. And Agent McKay with SLED was the one who had  
12 done the crime scene out at [REDACTED] as well?

13 A That's correct.

14 Q Okay.

15 A This -- this form is the chain-of-custody form.

16 Q Right. And it documents that did give it to her to  
17 take down to the lab in Columbia.

18 A That's correct.

19 Q All right.

20 MR. STUMBO: Beg the Court's indulgence, Your Honor.

21 THE COURT: All right.

22 (Off the record briefly.)

23 MR. STUMBO: Okay. Judge, we, without objection, I  
24 believe, from Mr. Geoly, will go ahead and put State's 7  
25 into evidence at ---

1 THE COURT: All right.

2 MR. STUMBO: --- this time.

3 THE COURT: Any objection?

4 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

5 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit No. 7 is  
6 admitted into evidence without objection.

7 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 7 was entered into  
8 evidence.)

9 Q Okay. After a GSR kit was put into -- given to the  
10 SLED agent, for the most part, your involvement with the  
11 case was done?

12 A Yes, sir.

13 Q Okay. That's all the questions I have, Lt.  
14 Stribble. Please answer anything Mr. Geoly may have.

15 A Yes, sir.

16 MR. GEOLY: If it please the Court, Judge.

17 THE COURT: All right, sir.

18 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

19 CROSS-EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. GEOLY:

21 Q Lt. Stribble, you -- you been this 20 years?

22 A Yes, sir.

23 Q Both getting kind of old.

24 A Yeah. I can tell.

25 Q I understand. This basically -- the gunshot residue

1 that you get ---

2 A Yes, sir.

3 Q --- that's sent in, and they analyze it. And that  
4 basically tells you if a weapon was fired, right?

5 A That's -- that's correct.

6 Q And -- and -- and that's all you know and did with  
7 -- with -- with my client, right?

8 A That's correct.

9 Q And -- and all that's showing is whether or not he  
10 fired a weapon, right?

11 A That's correct.

12 Q Do you have any knowledge about what he was firing  
13 at or -- or what was going on that night? Or it -- was  
14 that all before you got involved?

15 A I mean, of course, I knew a little bit about what  
16 was going on. But, I mean, it's what has been stated  
17 earlier.

18 Q Okay.

19 A But no. I mean, I wasn't involved in that part of  
20 the investigation.

21 Q Right. And -- and so in terms of what was going on  
22 with him and Indigo or what motivated this whole thing,  
23 you don't really have any knowledge of that. Your --  
24 your involvement came where you actually helped transport  
25 him with -- with ---

1 A --- Sgt. Henderson.

2 Q I'm sorry. Didn't it?

3 A Yes, sir.

4 Q Okay.

5 A That's it.

6 Q Do -- do you recall anything kind of funny about the  
7 situation with his handcuffs?

8 A Yeah. The key broke.

9 Q Okay. And he got stuck in the handcuffs.

10 A Yeah.

11 Q Do -- do you typically do a GSR while the guy is  
12 still in cuffs?

13 A No. I mean ---

14 Q But -- but you did this time, right?

15 A Yeah.

16 Q And there was no trouble and ---

17 A Oh, no ---

18 Q --- and that ---

19 A --- no.

20 Q --- shouldn't mess with the test or anything ---

21 A No ---

22 Q --- right?

23 A --- no, no, no.

24 Q And -- and he was cooperative the whole time. But  
25 the -- actually, the handcuffs broke ---

1 A It did.

2 Q --- and -- and you couldn't get them off of him for  
3 a ---

4 A Yes, sir.

5 Q --- minute, right?

6 A The key -- the end of the key of the handcuff key  
7 broke inside the handcuff and ---

8 Q Right.

9 A --- I could not get them off.

10 Q But going ---

11 A So ---

12 Q --- back to -- all of your involvement was after  
13 this event had already happened; you don't ---

14 A Yeah.

15 Q --- have any idea about malice aforethought or any  
16 of that, right?

17 A No, sir.

18 Q No further questions. Thank you.

19 THE COURT: All right.

20 MR. STUMBO: Nothing from the state, Your Honor.

21 THE COURT: Redirect?

22 MR. STUMBO: Nothing in redirect, Judge.

23 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

24 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

25 (Off the record briefly.)

1 THE COURT: All right. The state can call your next  
2 witness.

3 MR STUMBO: Thank you, Judge. The state calls  
4 Indigo Penny to the stand.

5 THE COURT: All right.

6 (Off the record briefly.)

7 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

8 INDIGO DAVIS, having been first duly sworn,  
9 testified as follows:

10 DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Okay. Come on up. Have a  
11 seat and state your name for the record.

12 THE COURT: All right. Excuse me. You need to  
13 remove your mask while you testify.

14 THE WITNESS: (Complied.)

15 THE COURT: Thank you. All right.

16 THE WITNESS: Indigo Davis.

17 THE COURT: I'm sorry. Your last name?

18 THE WITNESS: Davis.

19 THE COURT: Ms. Davis?

20 THE WITNESS: (No audible response.)

21 THE COURT: All right.

22 DIRECT EXAMINATION

23 BY MR. STUMBO:

24 Q Okay. And was Penny your last name at some point?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. Yes?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Okay.

4 THE COURT: All right. I need you to speak up loud  
5 and clearly into the microphone.

6 THE WITNESS: It -- it's just that my voice keep  
7 going in and out.

8 THE COURT: Okay. But if you get closer to the  
9 microphone, I think we can pick you up good.

10 THE WITNESS: (Complied.)

11 THE COURT: Thank you.

12 Q Indigo, thank you for being here this week. I know  
13 this is not a -- this is a difficult week for you. So  
14 I'm going try to make this as brief as we possibly can  
15 for you.

16 The defendant, Xzavier Davis, is your husband; is  
17 that correct?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Okay. When'd y'all get married?

20 A April the 29th, 2017.

21 Q Okay. And y'all have how many biological children  
22 together?

23 A At that time we had two.

24 Q Okay. You have two?

25 A (Nodded head up and down.)

1 Q Now?

2 A At the time that the accident happened, we had two  
3 biological kids.

4 Q Okay. And tell me: At the time of the accident,  
5 who your biological children with Mr. Davis were.

6 A Penelope ---

7 Q Okay. How old is ---

8 A --- Davis.

9 Q --- how old is Penelope?

10 A Five.

11 Q How old was she at the time of this ---

12 A Three.

13 Q Three?

14 A (No audible response.)

15 Q And who's the other one?

16 A Xzavier, Jr.

17 Q Okay. How old was Xzavier, Jr., at the time this  
18 happened?

19 A About 8/9 months.

20 Q Okay. And you had another son who's no longer with  
21 us, correct?

22 A Yes.

23 Q What was his name?

24 A Iven.

25 Q Okay. Iven?



1 A (Nodded head up and down.)

2 Q Was how old when he passed away?

3 A Seven.

4 Q Okay. And who is Iven's biological father?

5 A Travis Wright.

6 Q Okay. And -- but his last name -- he went by went  
7 by Iven Caldwell?

8 A Uh-huh.

9 Q Okay. He [sic] said he was seven. Where -- was he  
10 in school at -- at the time?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Where was he in school?

13 A Gallman.

14 Q Which one?

15 A Gallman Elementary.

16 Q Okay. And what grade was he in?

17 A (No audible response.)

18 Q First grade, would ---

19 A First.

20 Q --- that be fair to say?

21 Okay. So this was April, so end his first grade  
22 year?

23 A Right.

24 Q All right.

25 MR STUMBO: If you could, Walter, pull up State's 30

1 -- 134.

2 (Off the record briefly.)

3 MR STUMBO: Judge, we'd ask for State's 134. I  
4 don't believe there's any objection to the family  
5 picture.

6 MR GEOLY: I'm sorry, Solicitor.

7 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

8 (Off the record briefly.)

9 MR GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

10 MR. STUMBO: Okay. Could ---

11 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit No. 134 is  
12 admitted into evidence without objection.

13 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 134 was entered into  
14 evidence.)

15 Q Okay. Indigo, I'm just going to have you just turn,  
16 if you could see the screen at all. If you need to lean,  
17 that's fine. This is a family picture of y'all before  
18 this incident occurred, correct?

19 A Yes, sir.

20 Q And just so the jury has a reference point here:  
21 You are in this picture, holding a baby. Was at Xzavier,  
22 Jr.?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Okay. And then, standing down at the bottom, the  
25 little girl is -- that's Penelope?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Okay. And in the middle there is a picture -- is --  
3 is Iven, correct?

4 A Correct.

5 Q All right. And his birthday was when? When was his  
6 birthday?

7 A April 13th, 2012.

8 Q Okay. So this picture, he's probably 6 in this  
9 picture, just judging by -- well, it was probably  
10 sometime before his seventh birthday?

11 A Correct.

12 Q Okay. And so he turned 7 on April the 13th, 2019,  
13 correct?

14 A Yeah.

15 Q Okay. All right.

16 MR STUMBO: Walter, you can take that down now.  
17 Thank you.

18 Q Indigo, you have since had a fourth child -- is that  
19 correct? -- it's my understanding.

20 A Correct.

21 Q Okay. And it's a girl?

22 A Yes.

23 Q What's her name?

24 A Ivory.

25 Q What -- say that again?

1 A Ivory.

2 Q Ivory?

3 A (No audible response.)

4 Q Okay. Is that who your mother referred to earlier  
5 as Caroline -- is what she called her?

6 A Yes, sir.

7 Q Okay. Is that her middle name?

8 A No.

9 Q Okay. She just calls her Caroline?

10 A Nickname.

11 Q Okay. But her -- her given name is -- is Ivory?

12 A Correct.

13 Q Okay.

14 Q When -- what's her birthday? When was she born?

15 A October the 31st.

16 Q Of 2019?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay.

19 A Yeah, during that.

20 Q So was she full-term when she was born it, or was  
21 she a preemie? I mean, was it ---

22 A She ---

23 Q --- she nine ---

24 A --- full-term. She was fine.

25 Q Okay. And she's healthy?

1 A Yes.

2 Q The night of the incident we're here for this week  
3 was April the 20th -- 19th into the early-morning hours  
4 of the 20th, 2019, correct?

5 A Correct.

6 Q So you were pregnant with Ivory the -- the day this  
7 happened?

8 A Correct.

9 Q Okay. And if my math's correct, if she was born  
10 full-term, you were about three to four months pregnant?

11 A Might be off a little bit.

12 Q Okay. But you were in towards the end of maybe  
13 first trimester; is that -- is that fair to say?

14 A You could say that, first trimester.

15 Q Okay. All right. You knew you were pregnant at  
16 that point, correct?

17 A Yes, sir.

18 Q Okay. And did Xzavier know that y'all's fourth  
19 child, or third child together, was -- was on the way at  
20 that time?

21 A Yes.

22 Q I'm going to take you to the afternoon of April the  
23 19th, which would have been a Friday, before this  
24 happened that night. Can you tell the jury what you were  
25 doing that day with -- with -- did you have the kids with

1 you?

2 A No, I didn't have my kids with me. I was giving my  
3 dad a surprise birthday party.

4 Q Okay. When --

5 A So I was ---

6 Q --- was ---

7 A --- at the Helena Community Center.

8 Q All right. I'm sorry. I cut you off.

9 A No. Go ahead.

10 Q The party was -- was that Friday, or was it going to  
11 be the next day?

12 A It was going to be the next day.

13 Q Okay. So you were there, getting the party ready  
14 for your daddy?

15 A Correct.

16 Q Okay. And who had -- at that point, who had the  
17 children?

18 A They father, Xzavier.

19 Q Okay. At what point -- and I'm assuming, at some  
20 point, you get them back from him?

21 A Correct.

22 Q About what time did you get the three kids back from  
23 him?

24 A I can't remember.

25 Q Daylight? Night?

1 A It was ---

2 Q I mean, just ---

3 A --- daylight.

4 Q Okay. It was during ---

5 A During ---

6 Q --- the day?

7 A --- the day.

8 Q All right. At -- did y'all have some discuss at  
9 that point of where he was going to go and where you were  
10 going to go?

11 A We already knew where. He knew where he was going;  
12 I knew what I was doing. And he knew what I was doing.  
13 I -- ain't that why he watching the kids, so they  
14 wouldn't be running around.

15 Q Okay. Where did he go, then, when -- when he left  
16 you? Where -- where did you understand that he was going  
17 to?

18 A To his dad's fish fry.

19 Q Okay. A fish fry at his dad's house?

20 A I just know his dad was giving it. I don't know who  
21 house it was.

22 Q Say that again?

23 A I don't know who house it was. I just know that he  
24 said his dad was giving a fish fry.

25 Q Okay. So going to a fish fry. In Newberry or

1 somewhere else?

2 A Somewhere else.

3 Q Okay. Clinton? Is it fair to say? He went to a  
4 fish fry up in that area?

5 A Uh-huh. Yes, sir.

6 Q Okay. After he left you with the kids to go to the  
7 fish fry, what was the plan for you for the rest of the  
8 day with the kids?

9 A I had to go right on back to the Helena Community  
10 Center to make sure that she had -- the lady had the  
11 decoration and stuff right. Then I left; went to the  
12 store. Then after we left the store, I went and me and  
13 my kids got something to eat. We came back to the house.

14 Q Okay. You go get something -- go out to eat ---

15 A Yes.

16 Q --- that night?

17 Okay. You go through a drive-through, I believe,  
18 Zaxby's? Does that ---

19 A Yes.

20 Q --- sound right?

21 Okay. After you -- you take the -- the kids and get  
22 something to eat at Zaxby's, where do you go after that?

23 A Home.

24 Q Okay. And home is where -- what's the address?

25 A [REDACTED].



1 Q Okay. Now, what'd y'all do that night? You had  
2 already eaten, so did you put the kids to bed when you  
3 got home?

4 A No. We stayed up and watch a little bit of TV.

5 Q Okay. TV out -- just in the living room area, I'm  
6 -- I ---

7 A Right.

8 Q --- guess?

9 Okay. And that's a yes, that ---

10 A Yes.

11 Q --- in the living room?

12 And at what point did the kids go to sleep? They go  
13 to sleep in the living room, correct?

14 A Yeah. They'll sleep on the -- in the living room on  
15 a little pallet.

16 Q Okay. And where you sit in the living room?

17 A I was laying on the chair.

18 Q Okay. So you're on the chair, and you said they're  
19 on a little pallet on the floor?

20 A Uh-huh.

21 Q And that was ---

22 A Yes.

23 Q --- all three kids?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And they fall asleep there?

1 A Yeah. They'll go to sleep watching TV.

2 Q Okay. When did Xzay come home?

3 A I guess over in the morning.

4 Q Okay. Were you asleep ---

5 A Yes.

6 Q --- when he got home?

7 A He got home.

8 Q All right. What -- what happened when he got home?

9 A He was knocking at the back door. He left the back  
10 door, came to the front, and bust the glass. And he  
11 opened the door from the, you know, outside from where he  
12 bust it.

13 Q Okay. So bust the glass -- the -- were the doors  
14 locked?

15 A Yeah, the doors was locked.

16 Q And you said he went to the back and then back to  
17 the front and was ---

18 A Correct.

19 Q --- was banging on the door?

20 A Yeah. He knocking on door.

21 Q Okay. And, Indigo, why didn't you let him in? Did  
22 you hear him knocking on the door?

23 A Yeah. But I had done took two Benadryls prior to,  
24 because I a party to deal with. So I'm just, like,  
25 really just waking up.

1 Q Okay. Okay. And he busted the class and opened the  
2 door himself and came in; is that what you said?

3 A Yeah.

4 Q Okay. Can you describe that for us? What -- what  
5 -- what's he saying or doing when he comes inside,  
6 Indigo?

7 A Then he come in and he went to the room. He just  
8 asked me why I ain't opened the door. I said, "Why you  
9 want to argue with me?" like that, and he just went on  
10 back there. He had a jacket on. He took his jacket off.  
11 He came up to the through the front part of the house.

12 "You could've opened the door."

13 I said, "I don't feel like arguing with you, you  
14 know, about no door being open."

15 Q Okay. Was he calm, or was he angry?

16 A Well, you could say he was mad.

17 Q Okay. He was mad?

18 A (Nodded head up and down.)

19 Q Anything else he said to you at that point?

20 A No.

21 Q Okay. Anything he say about going to jail and if --  
22 "if I'm going to jail tonight, nobody's going to be in  
23 this house or this trailer?"

24 A Hmm.

25 Q You don't remember saying that?

1 A I can't remember. I mean, you talking about two  
2 years ago.

3 Q Okay. Okay. But if you said that to law  
4 enforcement in a statement, you wouldn't that you told  
5 him that? Do you admit or -- that or did you not tell  
6 him that?

7 A I admit to it.

8 Q Okay. You did tell law enforcement that, that he  
9 said: "I -- if I'm going to jail tonight, ain't -- ain't  
10 nobody staying here, if I gotta" ---

11 A Right.

12 Q --- "go to jail tonight"?

13 A Right.

14 Q Okay. So he did say that?

15 A Yeah.

16 Q Okay. Okay. What about the kids at this point?  
17 Are they still asleep when this conversations is going  
18 on?

19 A No. The kids are up.

20 Q Okay. They woke up?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Okay. And what'd you do next?

23 A Well, I mean, he would -- we would -- he would want  
24 to argue and I was saying something back to him. And I  
25 said, "Look, we'll just leave." And I got the kids up

1 off the pallet and stuff like that. And after that, I  
2 left, going out the back door. I put my kids in front of  
3 me, and we left, you know, trying to get away from the  
4 arguing and stuff.

5 Q Okay. So you're trying to get away from -- from  
6 him, right?

7 A Just -- just get away, period, from arguing.

8 Q All right. And it's, at this point, around three in  
9 the morning? Is that fair to say?

10 A I can't recall the time.

11 Q Okay. But it's in the middle the night?

12 A Right.

13 Q Okay. All right. Well, where is he standing at  
14 that point when you make the decision to get the kids up  
15 and -- and leave?

16 A He's standing in the front.

17 Q Okay. Close to the front door?

18 A Correct.

19 MR STUMBO: Walter, if you could pull up -- let's  
20 see -- State's -- State's No. 4. That's not in evidence  
21 yet.

22 But is there any objection to State's 4?

23 (Off the record briefly.)

24 MR. GEOLY: Judge -- Judge, I have no problem with  
25 her looking at this. It's not to scale. I mean, so long

1 as it's coming in with the understanding it's -- it's not  
2 to scale and let her describe or -- or whatever the  
3 differences that that has. I have no problem using that  
4 as a reference. I just don't want to agree that it's  
5 accurate. Is -- is that ---

6 THE COURT: Okay. Well, I mean, do you object to it  
7 coming into evidence?

8 MR GEOLY: I -- I don't, so long as with the  
9 exception that I can ask her questions about it and that  
10 I think they're admitting that, obviously, it's not  
11 accurate. Because ---

12 THE COURT: Well ---

13 MR. GEOLY: --- it says right there not to ---

14 THE COURT: I mean, you can always cross-examine.

15 MR GEOLY: Yes, sir.

16 MR STUMBO: The crime scene investigator that  
17 produced this item will be on the stand tomorrow.

18 MR GEOLY: I -- I have no problem admitting it for  
19 her to use, Judge, just with the idea that I certainly  
20 get to -- to question the veracity, I guess, of the --  
21 the ---

22 THE COURT: Well, yeah. You can always do that.

23 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir. So no ---

24 THE COURT: All right.

25 MR GEOLY: --- no objection to it ---

1 THE COURT: All right.

2 MR. GEOLY: --- coming in.

3 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 4 is admitted into  
4 evidence without objection.

5 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 4 was entered into  
6 evidence.)

7 MR STUMBO: Okay. If you could pull up 4, just so  
8 the jury can see it better, Walter. This is kind of a  
9 small drawing here.

10 Q All right. Indigo, just so you have kind of an idea  
11 of -- of what we're talking about here, this here would  
12 represent your house, the trailer, this rectangle. And  
13 this car here is the -- the Buick Rendezvous, the -- the  
14 red car. And by the way, who -- who drove the -- which  
15 car were you driving that day?

16 A A Toyota Camry.

17 Q You were driving the Camry, the green Camry, right?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Okay. And this -- this here, which was parked at  
20 the house, was the car that Xzay was driving?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Okay. And what -- what kind of car was he driving  
23 that day?

24 A A Buick Rendezvous.

25 Q Okay. Got you. All right. And this is the car

1 parked on that corner -- back corner of the house. The  
2 front door would be where these stairs are here and the  
3 -- that are sticking out of the front, and the back door  
4 would be where these back stairs are. Okay.

5 So if you could just -- and if -- if you could just  
6 get down from the stand briefly, and I'm going to ask for  
7 you to give me an idea of where your Camry was parked  
8 before you left that night with the kids and where Xzay  
9 -- where -- when Xzay got home, where had you parked the  
10 Camry?

11 A In the front.

12 Q Okay. So it was parked -- if this thing where it  
13 says "[REDACTED]," it was parked kind of between  
14 there and -- and here right in front of the house?

15 A It was in front of the park in front of the house

16 ---

17 Q Okay.

18 A --- by the ---

19 Q Which ---

20 A --- stairs.

21 Q --- direction was it pointed when it was parked,  
22 Indigo? Towards the front steps or ---

23 A Right.

24 Q --- away from the front steps?

25 A Forward.



1 Q Okay. So you pull in. When you park the car,  
2 you're looking at kind of the -- the front steps or out  
3 ---

4 A Right.

5 Q --- in front of -- okay.

6 All right. Which door did you say you took the kids  
7 out of?

8 A The back door.

9 Q Okay. And you parked in front of the house. Why'd  
10 you decide what the back door to take the kids?

11 A It was glass.

12 Q What's that?

13 A It was glass.

14 Q It was -- there was glass. Okay. So there was  
15 glass in -- at the front door where Xzay had busted the  
16 front glass out, right?

17 A Correct.

18 Q Okay. Glass can cut you, right, I mean, if you step  
19 on it with bare feet, correct?

20 A Correct.

21 Q All right. Indigo, while you're taking the kids out  
22 -- could Xzay, Jr., walk at that point?

23 A No.

24 Q Okay. Were you having to carry him?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. Was Xzay trying to help you out the door?  
2 get you in the car? Was he carrying any of your kids?

3 A No.

4 Q What was he doing?

5 A He was talking to me.

6 Q He's following you out the back door.

7 A Uh-huh.

8 Q What did he have, if -- did he have anything in his  
9 hand?

10 A At the time I ain't know what he had.

11 Q Say that again?

12 A At the time I didn't know what he had.

13 Q Okay. At any point when you're getting the kids out  
14 and around the house to the -- your car, which is around  
15 the front of the house ---

16 A On the pavement?

17 Q --- did he have anything his hand?

18 A Oh, yeah.

19 Q What did he have?

20 A He had a gun.

21 Q Okay. What -- anything to describe this gun?  
22 Anything that made it distinct to you?

23 A Well, it had a laser.

24 Q What'd you say it had?

25 A A laser.

1 Q Okay. It had a laser?

2 A Uh-huh.

3 Q Like a laser -- red laser pointer ---

4 A Right.

5 Q --- on it? Okay.

6 All right. Because this is zip-tied to this box for  
7 now.

8 MR STUMBO: Judge, what's been marked for ID as  
9 State's No. 8. And I don't really want to walk it  
10 around, you know, with the jury being right here.

11 Q But ultimately, Indigo ---

12 THE COURT: Well, now ---

13 Q --- does that ---

14 THE COURT: --- you're ---

15 Q --- look like ---

16 THE COURT: --- the jury can see this, and it's not  
17 in evidence yet.

18 MR STUMBO: Yes. Yes, sir. It's for ID purposes.  
19 And I know this is kind of awkward. I normally ---

20 THE COURT: Well, but ---

21 MR. STUMBO: --- would walk ---

22 THE COURT: --- it's -- still, you're ---

23 MR. STUMBO: --- to her.

24 THE COURT: --- we're not supposed to publish  
25 anything to the jury until it's ---

1 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

2 THE COURT: --- admitted into evidence. So it's  
3 going to require you to come around and show it to her  
4 ---

5 MR. STUMBO: Okay.

6 THE COURT: --- without allowing the jury ---

7 MR. STUMBO: I can ---

8 THE COURT: --- to see it.

9 MR STUMBO: --- do that.

10 THE COURT: Okay.

11 MR STUMBO: I'll put my mask on, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: All right.

13 (Off the record briefly.)

14 Q Indigo, I'm going to ---

15 MR STUMBO: Your Honor, if may I approach ---

16 THE COURT: All right.

17 MR. STUMBO: --- the witness?

18 THE COURT: That's fine.

19 Q This is what's been marked for ID at this purposes  
20 as State's No. 8. Okay. And it's got a gun lock on it,  
21 so it's not able to be shot so -- for court purposes.  
22 But do you recognize what's in this box?

23 A What you mean, recognize?

24 Q Have you ---

25 A If it ---

1 Q --- ever seen ---

2 A --- was the gun?

3 Have you ever seen this ---

4 THE COURT: I'm sorry.

5 Q --- before?

6 THE COURT: You're going to need to speak into the  
7 microphone. I can't hear you.

8 Q Have you ever seen what's in this box before?

9 A Yeah. I done seen the gun before.

10 Q Okay.

11 (Off the record briefly.)

12 MR GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: All right. We're putting that into  
14 evidence now?

15 MR STUMBO: Yes, sir.

16 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit No. 8 is  
17 admitted into evidence without objection.

18 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 8 was entered into  
19 evidence.)

20 Q Indigo, you indicated that that that gun, you  
21 recognize as State's 8. That's the gun that Xzay had in  
22 his hand when he followed you out the door?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Okay. And at any point, did he fire that gun?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. To get that gun that's in State's 8 that we  
2 just saw in the box here, where did he shoot that gun?

3 A in the air.

4 Q Okay. One time or more than one time?

5 A More than one.

6 Q Okay. Is he saying anything to you at that point?

7 A I can't recall.

8 Q And he's shooting the gun at the air as you're  
9 loading -- loading the kids -- getting the kids to the  
10 car and loading them in?

11 A No, not while I'm loading them in. He wasn't  
12 shooting no gun.

13 Q Okay. Were you able to get the kids into the car?

14 A Yes.

15 MR STUMBO: Beg the Court's indulgence, Your Honor.

16 THE COURT: All right.

17 (Off the record briefly.)

18 MR STUMBO: Judge, we'd move State's 37 in without  
19 objection ---

20 MR GEOLY: Yes, sir, Your Honor.

21 MR. STUMBO: --- photograph.

22 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit No. 37 is  
23 admitted into evidence without objection.

24 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 37 was entered into  
25 evidence.)

1 Q Okay. Indigo, if you could, where were the kids  
2 sitting in your vehicle when you got them in the car?

3 A Behind the driver's seat was Xzavier, Penelope in  
4 the middle, and Iven on the far-right side.

5 Q Okay. So were there any car seats in that backseat  
6 at that point?

7 A No.

8 Q Okay.

9 A It wasn't.

10 Q And so behind the driver's seat, you had Xzavier and  
11 Penelope?

12 A It was Xzavier, Penelope, and then Iven.

13 Q Okay. So Iven was sitting where? Where was he  
14 positioned? I mean, you -- right in the middle or all  
15 the way on the -- by the door on the passenger's side?

16 A On the door by the passenger's side.

17 Q Okay. He was the furthest over -- if you're sitting  
18 in the backseat, the furthest to the right ---

19 A Correct.

20 Q --- side?

21 Okay. Can you explain to the jury what happened  
22 next once you got them in the car?

23 A I was backing back to leave out the driveway, and  
24 Xzavier was shooting.

25 Q Okay. At -- did he briefly go back in the house at

1 any point? I mean, what -- how -- when you were putting  
2 the kids in the car?

3 A Yeah.

4 Q Okay. And you indicated you're parked facing the  
5 door, so did you have to put it in reverse to get into  
6 the driveway to get out?

7 A Correct.

8 Q Okay. And Indigo, where -- where was Xzay when he  
9 was shooting at you? I mean, just approximately, where  
10 was he?

11 A On the porch.

12 Q Okay. So right out -- right outside the front door  
13 on the steps ---

14 A Yeah. I was ---

15 Q --- of the ----

16 A --- backing ---

17 Q --- front door.

18 A --- back. I wasn't really trying to pay him no  
19 attention of what he was doing, you know, by what he was  
20 saying then. I'm just trying to get out the way.

21 Q Right. And the shots are coming, though, from that  
22 -- the steps right there at the front door, correct?

23 A Yeah. The car parked ---

24 Q Okay.

25 A --- by the front.



1 Q Tell me what you felt physically when the shots were  
2 fired. Did -- did you get hit?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Where did ---

5 A I got ---

6 Q --- you get ---

7 A --- struck.

8 Q Okay. Where'd you get hit?

9 A Lower part of my -- by my ankle.

10 Q Okay. What'd you say when you -- you got hit?

11 Anything or were you just communicating with the kids?

12 A Yeah. I said, "Oh, sh--. I got hit."

13 Q Okay. Were you telling them anything when he was  
14 shooting?

15 A No. I just telling them to stay down. "Y'all just  
16 stay down."

17 Q What was the kids -- your three children, was their  
18 demeanor like when you're loading them in the car and  
19 then the shots are coming? What -- were they calm? Were  
20 they upset? What -- what was it like?

21 A Nothing ---

22 Q Were they ---

23 A --- because they did what I told them.

24 Q Were they crying?

25 A No, they wasn't crying.

1 Q So you didn't tell law enforcement at any point that  
2 they were crying?

3 A No, not that I recall that I told him they were  
4 crying.

5 Q Okay.

6 A I was just trying to, like, hurry up and get them in  
7 the car.

8 Q If you told them that they were crying, you wouldn't  
9 dispute that?

10 A I don't think they were crying.

11 Q Okay.

12 A I mean -- because, I mean, Iven ---

13 Q fair enough

14 A --- he was on the far right, Penelope in the middle  
15 -- well, and Xzavier was on -- by the left door.

16 Q All right.

17 A Now, on the -- at the hospital they, you know, were  
18 crying. Yeah. That was stated. But when I got them in  
19 the car -- they couldn't be crying then. We were -- me  
20 and Iven trying to talk and I told them to stay down.

21 Q All right. You told Iven to -- to stay down?

22 A Yeah. Because Penelope and Xzavier, they was  
23 already low.

24 Q Did Iven -- was he able to -- able to respond to  
25 you?

1 A Yes.

2 Q What did he say?

3 A He said, "Mama, it's going be okay. It's going be  
4 all right, Mama."

5 Q Okay. And at what point did you realize he was  
6 shot?

7 A When Penelope was saying, "Mama," saying, "Iven, go  
8 over. He won't go over, Mama."

9 And I looked back. And when I looked back, he was  
10 laying over. And I had to drive to the hospital because  
11 I wanted to save my baby.

12 Q So, Indigo, I -- just to follow up on that, I  
13 believe you said when you looked back, Iven was laying  
14 over on -- on Penelope?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And was she saying anything at that point?

17 A She just said, "Mama, tell Iven go over. He won't  
18 go over."

19 Q He won't go over?

20 A (No verbal response.)

21 Q How long does it take you to get to the hospital? I  
22 mean, just an estimate. That -- that's not a far drive,  
23 is it?

24 A No. Newberry County Hospital we went to.

25 Q So five minutes -- no more -- five/ten minutes?

1 That -- is that fair to say, about -- it takes that long?

2 A Yeah.

3 Q You went straight to the hospital?

4 A Correct.

5 Q Indigo, did you have any concerns, when you were at  
6 the hospital, that Xzavier was still out there somewhere  
7 with a gun?

8 A I don't -- no.

9 Q You ever ask law enforcement where is he or where --  
10 where's he at?

11 A Yeah, I did ask ---

12 Q Okay.

13 A --- where he was.

14 Q Okay. And they were able to tell you, before they  
15 talked to you, that they had him in custody; that we got  
16 him ---

17 A Right.

18 Q --- that ---

19 A Correct.

20 Q Okay. And after that, you told them what -- what  
21 had happened that night, correct?

22 A Correct.

23 Q What kind of relationship did you have with Iven?

24 A What kind of relationship I had with Iven, it's  
25 undescrivable.

1 Q Undescribable? Is that what you said?

2 A Correct.

3 Q Was Iven a good boy?

4 A Yes.

5 Q He get along with his -- his sister and his little  
6 brother?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Was he protector, big brother of little sister, kind  
9 of?

10 A Uh-huh. Yeah, just say.

11 MR STUMBO: Beg the Court's indulgence, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: All right.

13 (Off the record briefly.)

14 MR STUMBO: No further questions at this time, Your  
15 Honor.

16 THE COURT: All right.

17 MR. STUMBO: Thank you, Indigo.

18 THE COURT: Thank you.

19 Cross-examination?

20 MR GEOLY: If it please the Court.

21 THE COURT: All right.

22 MR GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence just a moment,  
23 Your Honor.

24 THE COURT: All right.

25 (Off the record briefly.)

## CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. GEOLY:

Q Ms. Indigo, you've been married for a few years; is that right?

A Correct. Four.

Q Do you remember the first time I saw you?

A Correct.

Q Standing in this courtroom?

A Yes.

Q Do you remember what they said Xzay was to you?

A Correct.

Q And what they said say was you?

A Correct.

Q They didn't call him your husband, did they?

A No.

Q What'd they say he was?

A My boyfriend.

Q And y'all have been married how long?

A Four years.

Q Okay. You -- you've talked to victim witness advocates during this whole process, right?

A No.

Q Well, did you ever talk to a victim witness advocate?

A Only person I ever talked to was Connie.

1 Q And she ---

2 A And that was the beginning.

3 Q She's the ---

4 A Anybody else from prior, no.

5 Q She's the victim witness advocate for sheriff's  
6 department, right?

7 A Correct.

8 Q Did you ever get notified by any victim witness  
9 advocate with the solicitor's office?

10 A No.

11 Q Did anybody ever ask you or -- or seek your input  
12 about how you wanted this case handled?

13 A No.

14 Q Okay. I don't think you ever that night said that  
15 Xzay was shooting at you. Did you ever tell an officer  
16 Xzay shooting at you?

17 A No.

18 Q Do you think Xzay was shooting at you?

19 A No.

20 Q Do you think Xzay was shooting at Iven?

21 A No.

22 Q I'm sorry for your loss. Next to you, who loved  
23 Iven as much as anybody?

24 A Xzavier.

25 Q Did you consider that to be a stepson-stepdaddy

1 relationship or a father-son relationship?

2 A Father-son relationship.

3 Q Solicitors talked about the fact that there was a --  
4 a birthday party or that he just turned 7 years old the  
5 week before this happened. Do you remember that?

6 A Correct.

7 Q Did Iven have a party that day?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Was it a little party, like a little 7-year-old  
10 birthday party; or was it one of those over-the-top,  
11 you're-turning-7 birthdays?

12 A Over the top.

13 Q Okay. You remember what all was there?

14 A Yes. Spider-Man, Shimmer Shine, anything a kid  
15 could ask for.

16 Q Did he have fun that day?

17 A Oh, yeah.

18 Q And -- and this was the 13th. I think this all  
19 happened on the 20th, right? So we're talking about  
20 literally a week later?

21 A Right.

22 Q Is that right?

23 A (No audible response.)

24 Q Who threw that party?

25 A Xzavier.



1 Q He's the one did it?

2 A Correct.

3 Q Well, like, you were getting one ready the next day  
4 for your dad. He did for his son, didn't he?

5 A Correct.

6 Q Any doubt in your mind whether or not he was trying  
7 to shoot you?

8 A No, ain't no doubt in my mind. He was ---

9 Q What ---

10 A --- not trying to ---

11 Q --- what ---

12 A --- shoot me.

13 Q What was he trying to shoot?

14 A Well looking at the pictures, he was trying to shoot  
15 at the tires.

16 Q When you went out the back door -- and he asked you  
17 about this laser on this gun -- you said Xzay followed  
18 you out the door, right?

19 A Right.

20 Q Did he ever threaten you ---

21 A No.

22 Q --- at that point?

23 Y'all were in an argument, right?

24 A Right.

25 Q And let's just be real. Y'all -- y'all kind of in a

1 fight over he's home at 2:30 in the morning and wanting  
2 to come in after he's been drinking a little bit; is that  
3 fair enough to say?

4 A Fair enough.

5 Q And you didn't want him to come in. And his  
6 attitude is: "This is my house; I paid for this house;  
7 why is my door locked?"

8 A Correct.

9 Q Is that pretty much right?

10 A Correct.

11 Q Well, let -- let me talk about that for a second,  
12 because some people don't, you know, live in a community  
13 where they're surrounded by the mom and the family and  
14 the -- typically, is that door locked?

15 A Well, it -- it don't normally be locked. But it  
16 was, like, a break-in, like, right behind on the other  
17 road. So we start locking the doors.

18 Q Right. But the point I'm getting at: Typically,  
19 for that two/three years y'all been living there together  
20 ---

21 A Right.

22 Q --- the door is open when he gets home, right?

23 A Right.

24 Q He usually comes and the door is wide open?

25 A Correct.

1 Q He just turns the door and walks right in?

2 A Uh-huh.

3 Q This day -- and he typically parks where y'all have  
4 ---

5 MR GEOLY: Mr. Bentley, if you don't mind, if you'd  
6 pull up the -- the picture -- is it 134? With -- with  
7 the house and with the ---

8 MR. STUMBO: That's ---

9 MR. GEOLY: --- the vehicle parked there?

10 MR STUMBO: That's No. 4.

11 MR GEOLY: Four. I'm sorry.

12 MR. BENTLEY: That's a picture of the diagram.

13 MR. GEOLY: No, not the diagram. The picture with  
14 the house with the car parked. Okay.

15 MR STUMBO: You may be ---

16 MR. GEOLY: Keep ---

17 MR. STUMBO: --- referring to 96.

18 MR GEOLY: --- keep -- go -- keep going to -- yeah,  
19 that one right there.

20 Q That's around typically where he would park, right?

21 A Correct.

22 Q Okay. So he pulls up there. And then, it's easier  
23 for him to just walk to the back door?

24 A Correct.

25 Q That's how he typically would come in?

1 A (Nodded head up and down.)

2 Q So this day, the door is not open. Do you hear him  
3 at the back door?

4 A I heard him knock.

5 Q Okay. Then he walks to the front door.

6 A (Nodded head up and down.)

7 Q Maybe looking in to see if anybody there and he's  
8 knocking on the front door, right?

9 A Right.

10 Q Eventually, nobody answers and he breaks the glass  
11 to open the door, right?

12 A Right.

13 Q Now, this glass, it -- it's more like one of those  
14 door glasses, right, where it's -- it kind of runs along  
15 the -- the side of the door. It's not a full, like, six  
16 or eight ---

17 A Oh, no, no, no.

18 Q --- windows. It's one little skinny window right  
19 there kind of by the door handle, right?

20 A Correct.

21 Q Or above the door handle, I guess.

22 A Yeah.

23 Q So he knocks that in and then reaches in?

24 A Uh-huh.

25 Q And then y'all get to, I guess, arguing?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Okay. When you walk out the back door and he walks  
3 out with the gun, is there anything to stop him from  
4 putting it to your head or shooting at you?

5 A No.

6 Q If he'd have wanted to kill you, he had every  
7 opportunity, didn't he?

8 A Correct.

9 Q Did he try to?

10 A No.

11 Q Did he threaten you with any words like ---

12 A No.

13 Q --- "I'm going to shoot you"?

14 Was it maybe typical -- I -- my understanding is  
15 y'all didn't really have a hostile relationship, right?

16 A No, we didn't.

17 Q No putting hands on each other?

18 A No.

19 Q Not that kind of relationship?

20 A No.

21 Q When y'all would get to arguing, though, sometimes  
22 you'd want to leave, right, just ---

23 A Right.

24 Q --- to avoid the confrontation?

25 A Correct.

1 Q To the point, I've actually been a told a story  
2 where, you know, he'd call and plan a trip then ---

3 A Right.

4 Q --- to say, "Well, we going to" -- and -- and I'm,  
5 you know, probably wrong about this, but whatever --  
6 "Pigeon Forge. You can't leave Pigeon Forge. We're  
7 going finish talking about that."

8 Is it that kind of thing ---

9 A Right.

10 Q --- y'all would do?

11 A Yeah.

12 Q But you'd ---

13 A He would ---

14 Q --- never ---

15 A --- rather talk it out.

16 Q You'd never get physical with each other?

17 A No.

18 Q But there'd be a "Well, I'm leaving; I'm not talking  
19 about it" kind of thing.

20 A Right.

21 Q And that's what -- kind of what was happening that  
22 night?

23 A Right.

24 Q And he wanted you to stay and talk it out, right?

25 A Right.

1 Q And in your mind, what was he doing when he was  
2 shooting at the tire?

3 A He was trying to stop me from leaving with the kids.

4 Q So y'all could talk it out?

5 A So we could talk it out.

6 Q You think he ever intended to kill anybody that day?

7 A No.

8 Q Did he have a hatred in his heart for you that day?

9 A No.

10 Q Do you think he ever had an appreciation for how  
11 reckless it was to be shooting at that car?

12 A Say that again.

13 Q Do you think he had an appreciation of how reckless  
14 -- do you think he even imagined this could've happened,  
15 where his son died?

16 A Oh, no, he couldn't imagine that.

17 MR STUMBO: Judge, I'm going to object to that  
18 question about imagining and I -- I mean, she -- that's  
19 -- it's calling for speculation, I think.

20 THE COURT: I'll sustain.

21 Q Not imagine. Real-world, do you think there's any  
22 chance he intended to cause what happened?

23 A No.

24 Q Do you love your husband?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Do you feel like your husband loves you?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Did he love Iven?

4 A Yes.

5 MR GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence for one  
6 moment, Your Honor.

7 THE COURT: All right.

8 (Off the record briefly.)

9 Q And you were aware that this night he was going to a  
10 fish fry with his father's family, right?

11 A Right.

12 Q Now, you don't know if that was at his dad's house  
13 or not. And -- and actually, I think it was at his  
14 aunt's house. Would -- that wouldn't surprise you,  
15 right?

16 A No, that wouldn't surprise me.

17 Q Okay. And it's your understanding, he was with  
18 family, right -- his cousins, his brothers? I mean,  
19 that's the kind of thing it was. It was kind of like a  
20 family event?

21 A Right.

22 Q Did he want you to go?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Asked you to go, right?

25 A Right.



1 Q But you kind of were: "Well, look, I got this thing  
2 for my dad tomorrow." Is that ---

3 A Right.

4 Q --- kind of how it -- so he had his thing he wanted  
5 to do with the family with the fish fry, but you were "We  
6 need to get ready for this thing tomorrow." So there was  
7 kind of a thing about watching the kids a little bit,  
8 right?

9 A Right.

10 Q But he had the kids earlier in the day, right?

11 A Correct.

12 Q Were -- do remember him -- why he got up that  
13 morning, what the first thing he did that morning was?

14 A Yeah. He went to a car dealership, but it's out of  
15 business now.

16 Q Uh-huh.

17 A He was going go get me a Tahoe.

18 Q Okay. Do you remember him going to the barbershop  
19 that morning?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Who'd he go to the barbershop with?

22 A Iven.

23 Q Okay. Getting Iven a cut, right, to ---

24 A Right.

25 Q --- to go to the -- the -- the birthdays.

1 A Correct.

2 Q This is hard on you, isn't it?

3 A Yes.

4 Q I -- I see you kind of at odds with your mom. She  
5 said y'all having a problem or -- or she had a problem  
6 with you. Y'all ---

7 A Yeah.

8 Q --- actually get along pretty good, don't you?

9 A Yeah.

10 Q You live right beside each other?

11 A Correct.

12 Q She doesn't have any special knowledge of what  
13 happened that night, right?

14 A No, she don't.

15 Q The people that know what happened are -- are you  
16 and Xzay; is that right?

17 A Correct.

18 Q You want your husband to come home?

19 A Yes.

20 MR. GEOLY: I don't have any further questions,  
21 Judge.

22 THE COURT: All right. You can step down.  
23 Cross -- redirect examination?

24 MR STUMBO: Just briefly, Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: All right.

REDIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. STUMBO:

Q Indigo, Mr. Geoly asked you if -- if anyone from the solicitor's office had talked to you, and you said no.

That's not correct, though, is it?

A When you talked to me?

Q Okay. So you --

A I mean ---

Q --- you don't ---

A --- might've been miscommunication because they -- first I didn't have a phone. But the only out we knew was one time to come down here was due to someone calling for my mom to tell her. And then, that's when they told me.

Q Now, but a couple weeks after this all happened, there was a meeting at the sheriff's department and -- and I was there personally. You remember we sat at the table and ---

MR. GEOLY: Objection ---

A Yeah.

Q --- Judge Addy ---

MR. GEOLY: --- Your Honor ---

Q --- was there?

THE COURT: Hold for ---

MR. STUMBO: He opened ---

1 THE COURT: --- a second.

2 MR. STUMBO: He opened the door to it.

3 THE COURT: Well, let him get his objection ---

4 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

5 THE COURT: --- on the record.

6 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

7 THE COURT: Go ahead.

8 MR GEOLY: Leading.

9 THE COURT: All right. Let's don't lead. Just ask  
10 your question.

11 MR. STUMBO: Okay.

12 Q Did you ever have a meeting with me at the sheriff's  
13 department?

14 A Yes, I had meeting with you.

15 Q Okay. And was your father there?

16 A Yes.

17 Q All right. Was Penelope there?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Okay. And wasn't just me; it was my staff with me.  
20 Is -- is that correct?

21 A Correct.

22 Q Okay. Mr. Bentley, who's sitting behind you over  
23 there, was he there?

24 A I can't remember.

25 Q Okay.

1 A all I know is it was you that came in, Sheriff  
2 Foster, me, Penelope, my daddy ---

3 Q Dickert, was he there?

4 A Yeah, he was there. And Connie sitting at the  
5 table. I can't remember everybody.

6 Q All right. And you wouldn't dispute, if my victim  
7 advocate Rhetta was there, that that -- that if I had a  
8 body camera of my victim advocate there, that's correct.  
9 Are you -- do you admit that?

10 A I know you said your staff was there, but ---

11 Q Uh-huh.

12 A --- I can't recall everybody sitting around the  
13 table.

14 Q Okay. And -- and we had a -- a big discussion about  
15 how you were doing, your injury. Do you remember talking  
16 about that?

17 A Yeah. We talked about my injury.

18 Q Okay. And how you were recovering?

19 A Yeah.

20 Q Okay. We talk about Iven?

21 A Yeah, we talk about Iven.

22 Q And we talked about how we were going to progress  
23 and -- and what things were going to happen in this case,  
24 potentially.

25 A Yeah. We talked about that.

1 Q Okay. So I ---

2 A But I'm ---

3 Q --- just want ---

4 A --- saying just to -- to -- to notify me, they  
5 didn't. Nobody notified me. We only had a meeting one  
6 time.

7 But I'm talking about to notify me, as in what  
8 Geoly's saying, or talking to me, you know, coming by. I  
9 mean, this been over two years, and ain't nobody really  
10 stopped to talk to me about this whole situation. We  
11 only had one meeting.

12 Q That meeting that you had with me personally ---

13 A Right.

14 Q --- right? Okay.

15 A That's the only one.

16 Q And we gave y'all phone numbers and contact  
17 information, all you needed to contact us, right, that  
18 day?

19 A Right.

20 Q Okay. So when you told Mr. Geoly that you didn't  
21 talk to anybody in my office, that -- you -- you did,  
22 correct? Just wanted to clarify that.

23 A What -- what you mean, sitting at the table?

24 Q Yes.

25 A Oh, okay. If you clarifying that, yeah, we talked.

1 Q Okay.

2 A But I just thinking Geoly might've been saying,  
3 like, have anyone called me or something like that.  
4 Because we -- we ain't never get notification of a phone  
5 call due to my mom just one time, saying we got to go to  
6 the courthouse.

7 Q Okay.

8 MR. STUMBO: No further questions, Your Honor.

9 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

10 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

11 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen, I  
12 think it's a good time for us to go ahead and take our  
13 afternoon break. I'm going to let you go to the jury  
14 room to stretch your legs, get something to drink, use  
15 the restroom, whatever the case may be.

16 Do not discuss the case, even among yourselves.  
17 Don't conduct any independent investigations. We'll take  
18 about a 10- or 15-minute break, and then we'll come back  
19 and resume the trial.

20 Everyone else, please remain seated while the jury  
21 is excused. Thank you.

22 (Whereupon, the jury exited the courtroom at 3:33  
23 p.m.)

24 (Off the record briefly.)

25 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state

1 before we take a break?

2 MR STUMBO: Nothing from the state, Judge.

3 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

4 MR GEOLY: Nothing from the defendant, Your Honor.

5 THE COURT: All right. We'll go ahead and let's  
6 take about a 10- or 15-minute break.

7 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

8 MR. STUMBO: Thank you, Judge.

9 (The Court went on the record at 3:34 p.m.)

10 (The Court went on the record at 3:51 p.m.)

11 THE COURT: All right. Before we get started back,  
12 the clerk said Juror No. 5, Shalyne Bradwell, told her  
13 that she realized, after Officer Stribble -- when Officer  
14 Stribble took the stand, that she went to school with  
15 him; it was about 25 years ago; but that she said she was  
16 in school with him. Another that's going to make a  
17 difference.

18 I don't know that that's going to make any  
19 difference. I didn't know if we wanted to bring her in,  
20 question her whether or not it affects her ability to be  
21 fair and impartial. If it does, we'll excuse her and  
22 seat an alternate. If it doesn't, we'll leave her in  
23 place.

24 I mean, she just -- made it sound like she didn't  
25 recognize the name; she didn't recall him. But once he



1 took the stand, she recognized him as someone she went to  
2 school with about 25 years ago.

3 MR STUMBO: Judge, I don't have a problem with her  
4 staying on, just in the sense that Lt. Stribble's  
5 testimony was pretty short. His involvement with the  
6 case was pretty minimal.

7 THE COURT: Well, do ---

8 MR. STUMBO: We don't ---

9 THE COURT: --- you want ---

10 MR. STUMBO: --- have a problem with it ---

11 THE COURT: All right. So you ---

12 MR. STUMBO: --- with her ---

13 THE COURT: --- don't even need -- want me to bring  
14 her in and question her?

15 MR STUMBO: Not -- not from ---

16 THE COURT: Okay.

17 MR. STUMBO: --- our perspective ---

18 THE COURT: What does the ---

19 MR. STUMBO: --- Judge.

20 THE COURT: --- defense prefer?

21 MR GEOLY: Judge, I apologize. What -- what is her  
22 name again? Because I ---

23 THE COURT: It was Juror No. 5.

24 MR. GEOLY: Yeah. I got three different 5s, Judge.

25 CLERK OF COURT: Bradwell.

1 THE COURT: Shalyne -- S-h-a-l-y-n-e ---

2 MR. GEOLY: Okay. Bradwell?

3 THE COURT: --- Bradwell, B-r-a-d-w-e-l-l.

4 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir. One second, Judge.

5 (Off the record briefly.)

6 MR GEOLY: Your Honor, I -- I defer to your  
7 judgment. I -- I don't -- I -- I'm fine with her not  
8 being brought in, brought in and asked the relevant  
9 questions that you feel are necessary, but we certainly  
10 are not -- we're not making a motion for you to ---

11 THE COURT: All right.

12 MR. GEOLY: --- do anything.

13 THE COURT: All right. Well, if nobody wants me to  
14 bring her in and question her, we'll just let it ---

15 MR. GEOLY: Yeah. I'm ---

16 THE COURT: --- go as is.

17 MR GEOLY: --- I'm fine.

18 THE COURT: All right. Thank you very much.

19 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

20 (Off the record briefly.)

21 THE COURT: Anything from the state before we bring  
22 the jury in?

23 MR DANIEL: Judge, our next witness, Investigator  
24 Ryan Dickert, he's the lead investigator in this case  
25 with Newberry Sheriff's Office. We -- we would move to

1 play a portion of his body-camera interview of Penelope  
2 Davis, which is Indigo Penny's 3-year-old daughter, at  
3 the Newberry hospital on the date in question. We'd like  
4 to proffer his testimony and perhaps also play a portion  
5 for His Honor to determine whether it's admissible under  
6 a hearsay exception. I know Mr. Geoly's obviously going  
7 to object to that. So we -- we would ask maybe to -- to  
8 proffer that -- that particular testimony.

9 THE COURT: All right. Well, let me ask this. How  
10 long do you think it's going to take? Because it's four  
11 o'clock. Do we want to go ahead and send the jury home  
12 while you do the proffered testimony?

13 MR DANIEL: Judge, it would probably be about three-  
14 minute clip or so, give or take, of -- of actually  
15 watching, a three-minute portion; and then, obviously,  
16 the preliminary foundation testimony before we play it;  
17 and then, legal arguments that I don't -- I'm trying to  
18 budget for time here, however the Court wants to do that.

19 THE COURT: Well, I mean, is it something -- if it's  
20 going to take us an hour, I say let's let the jury go  
21 home. Or if it's going to take 30 minutes; but then,  
22 when you call him to the stand, his testimony is going to  
23 be an hour/hour and a half between direct/cross/redirect,  
24 I mean, I -- I think you see. I don't want to be keeping  
25 a jury here until six o'clock.

1 MR DANIEL: Yes, sir.

2 MR STUMBO: Right. Yeah. I -- Judge, I would -- I  
3 would say that the clip itself's probably not the issue.  
4 We proffer the clip. Then, we got to make legal  
5 arguments; then Your Honor has to make a ruling. And  
6 then, by that time, that's probably 30 minutes -- 20 to  
7 30 minutes.

8 And then, we have, you know, I -- Investigator  
9 Dickert's the next -- next witness. He's the lead  
10 investigator. So it will take some time to -- to plow  
11 through some of the exhibits. It might not be a bad idea  
12 for us to proffer this; argue it; whether it comes in or  
13 not, you can make a ruling; and then, we start fresh in  
14 the morning ---

15 THE COURT: Okay.

16 MR. STUMBO: --- in front of the jury. That may  
17 not be a bad idea.

18 MR. GEOLY: Your Honor, I ---

19 THE COURT: How does that ---

20 MR. GEOLY: --- defer -- I -- I have ---

21 THE COURT: Okay.

22 MR. GEOLY: --- no preference.

23 THE COURT: All right. Well, let's go ahead, then,  
24 and we'll bring the jury in and I'm going to go ahead and  
25 cut them loose for the evening; have them be back, I

1 guess -- start at the same time as we did today: have  
2 them back at 9:15; start at 9:30. And then, once we  
3 excuse them, you can go ahead and proffer and we'll make  
4 a decision on that.

5 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

6 THE COURT: Okay?

7 All right. Anything from the state before we bring  
8 the jury in?

9 MR. STUMBO: No, sir.

10 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

11 MR. GEOLY: No, sir, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: All right. Let's go ahead and bring the  
13 jury in.

14 (Off the record briefly.)

15 (Whereupon, the jury entered the courtroom at 3:58  
16 p.m.)

17 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen,  
18 welcome back. We're ready to proceed with the trial.  
19 However, the next witness is going to take some time. So  
20 given the time of day, the attorneys have discussed that  
21 it's probably a good time, rather than keeping you here  
22 late tonight, it's a good time to go ahead and break for  
23 the day.

24 So I'm going to go ahead and allow you to go home  
25 for the day. Please be back again at 9:15 tomorrow

1 morning. And we'll be starting soon thereafter.

2 Again, I caution you: Don't discuss the case.  
3 Don't conduct any independent investigations. I hope  
4 everybody has a good evening, and we'll see you back at  
5 9:15 tomorrow morning. Thank you very much.

6 Thank you. If everybody remain seated while the  
7 jury is excused.

8 (Whereupon, the jury exited the courtroom at 4:00  
9 p.m.)

10 (Off the record briefly.)

11 THE COURT: All right. The state want to go ahead  
12 and proffer the testimony?

13 MR DANIEL: Yes, Your Honor. We -- we'd proffer  
14 Investigator Ryan Dickert's testimony. He's the lead  
15 investigator in this case.

16 THE COURT: All right.

17 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

18 THE COURT: All right. Let's go ahead and put him  
19 under oath.

20 RYAN DICKERT, having been first duly sworn,  
21 testified as follows:

22 THE COURT: And your name?

23 THE WITNESS: Ryan Dickert.

24 THE COURT: All right.  
25

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. DANIEL:

Q All right. Investigator Dickert, you are -- you were the assigned lead investigator as it pertains to the investigation of the shooting death of Iven Caldwell; is that correct?

A That's correct.

Q Okay. So April 20th of 2019, were you dispatched out to the Newberry County Memorial Hospital?

A That's correct.

Q Okay. Approximately what time did you arrive at the hospital?

A Looking at the CAD report, it'd be sometimes between 3:50 and 4 a.m.-ish.

Q Sometime after 4 a.m., you arrived at the hospital?

A Sometimes between 3:50 and 4.

Q Okay. All right. And when you arrive at the hospital, what do you -- what do you observe?

A I observe a greenish-blue-in-color Toyota Camry parked in the emergency entrance.

Q Okay. And had you identified any potential victims of this shooting?

A I was aware that there was two victims that were in the hospital being treated, but didn't have much information on who they were at the time.

1 Q All right. But eventually, who did you learn those  
2 two gunshot victims were?

3 A One was Iven Caldwell; the other was Indigo Penny.  
4 And I was made aware that there were two juvenile  
5 children also in the vehicle with her and Iven.

6 Q Okay. And did you learn of any other occupants of  
7 that vehicle?

8 A Yes, that's correct. It would've been Penelope and  
9 Xzavier, Jr. They would've -- they were in the back-  
10 passenger seat of the vehicle.

11 Q Okay. And did you check on the welfare status of  
12 the other two children, Penelope Davis and Xzavier Davis,  
13 Jr.?

14 A We did.

15 Q Okay. All right. So tell us -- I want to focus --  
16 and first of all, you were -- you were wearing your body  
17 -- your body-worn camera. Is that how you refer to it?

18 A That's correct.

19 Q All right. You were wearing that on your person; is  
20 that right?

21 A Correct.

22 Q All right. So it was activated the entire time at  
23 the hospital -- well, not the entire time, but you had it  
24 activated when you did a welfare check on Penelope Davis  
25 and Xzavier Davis, Jr.; is that correct?



1 A That's correct.

2 Q All right. Who else was with you that assisted you  
3 in -- in checking on the welfare of these two children?

4 A Our victims advocate, Connie Johnson, would've been  
5 present.

6 Q Okay. And where exactly were they located, these  
7 two children?

8 A They were located in Room 1 in the emergency room --  
9 department area, which is typically the first room that  
10 you come to.

11 Q And were they in there with medical personnel, those  
12 two children?

13 A There was a nurse that was in the room when we  
14 entered the room who apparently had been taking care of  
15 them.

16 Q Okay. And at that time when you enter the room, did  
17 you know what, if any, injuries Xzavier Davis, Jr., and  
18 Penelope Davis had at that time?

19 A No, we weren't.

20 Q Okay. So first and foremost, you wanted to see if  
21 they were injured in any way, as it pertains to that  
22 shooting incident; is that correct?

23 A That -- that's correct.

24 Q All right. So walk us through -- when you enter  
25 that room, you said you and Deputy Connie Johnson entered

1 that room?

2 A Yes, the victims advocate.

3 Q Okay. All right. Tell us what -- what happens  
4 next.

5 A We went into the room. If I remember, Xzavier, Jr.,  
6 was on the -- the bed closest to the door; Penelope was  
7 closer to the inside of the room. And we just asked her  
8 if she was okay.

9 Q You asked Penelope and -- correct me if I'm wrong.  
10 She's 3 years old at this time, right?

11 A That's -- that's correct.

12 Q And you -- you're simply asking her a generic "Are  
13 you okay"-type question?

14 A That's correct.

15 Q All right. And she's verbal, this -- this child?

16 A That's correct.

17 Q All right. And what was her response?

18 A "My had shoot my mama and she in there," as she  
19 pointed over to Room 2, which would be where Indigo was  
20 located.

21 Q Okay. And what else -- what, if anything, else was  
22 asked of -- of this Penelope?

23 A I believe my follow-up to that was: "What happened  
24 to Mom?" I think it was a -- trying to figure out  
25 exactly what she said.

1 And her response was: "Um, my daddy had shoot my  
2 mama. And then you need to come."

3 Q All right. Did y'all ask any other questions about  
4 Penelope's medical condition?

5 A Yes. Victims advocate confirmed the statement that  
6 she made about her daddy shooting her mom and us needing  
7 to come. And she asked if she had any boo-boos, any  
8 injuries. And she referred to a scratch that she had on  
9 her right ankle. I believe it was the back of her right  
10 ankle.

11 Q Okay. And did she elaborate on how she got that  
12 scratch, Penelope?

13 A Give me just a second, please.

14 When she was asked how she got that scratch, her  
15 response was that Iven was pinning her in the car.

16 Q Okay. So when you're -- when you're asking -- or --  
17 did you ask or did -- did your victims advocate ask that  
18 question, "How'd you get that scratch?"

19 A I think Connie asked that -- that question  
20 specifically.

21 Q All right. And Penelope said something to the  
22 effect of Iven pinned her in the car?

23 A Right.

24 Q And did you visibly see an injury to ---

25 A I did not. I believe the -- the victims advocate

1 photographed her.

2 Q And did hospital staff hand over the clothes that  
3 Iven and Penelope were wearing at the time of this  
4 incident?

5 A Yes. And we got Iven's clothes, and I believe it  
6 was a T-shirt that Penelope had on.

7 Q And did you know what, if any, type blood-type  
8 evidence was on any of these articles of clothing that  
9 were handed over to you by hospital staff?

10 A I don't know that I opened the bags. I think, when  
11 they gave them to me, I left them like they were, since  
12 SLED crime scene was en route, and then turned those  
13 items over to them.

14 Q But the primary purpose for going in there and, I --  
15 I'm going to call it interview of this 3-year-old,  
16 Penelope, was to assess what, if any, injuries she may  
17 have sustained in this shooting incident; is that  
18 correct?

19 A Correct. But I -- I wouldn't refer to it an  
20 interview. But it was more of a less concern for her  
21 well-being, her safety, make sure she wasn't injured.  
22 Because all we had heard at that point in time was about  
23 Iven and Indigo. So ---

24 Q So you already knew that two people had confirmed  
25 gunshot wounds, Iven and Indigo. So you were determining

1 whether the two other occupants of the car had injuries  
2 themselves; is that correct?

3 A Yes. That was the purpose.

4 Q And you also said a nurse was present in the room at  
5 the time you asked these questions of Penelope?

6 A That's correct.

7 Q Okay. Is there any specific reason for making sure  
8 the nurse is in the room while you're asking these  
9 questions?

10 A If she was going to give us -- if she had an injury  
11 or something that needed to -- to be addressed, then,  
12 obviously, the nurse would need to be the one to do that.

13 Q All right. So -- so it would not -- will -- will --  
14 was it for purely purposes of your criminal investigation  
15 or more so a welfare check of these two children?

16 A Honest to God, it wasn't for any other reason than  
17 I'm a father and I wanted to make sure that the other two  
18 kids were okay.

19 Q All right. And State's 173 is a -- have you had a  
20 chance to watch your body cam interview ---

21 THE COURT REPORTER: Your Honor ---

22 Q --- of Penelope Davis?

23 THE COURT REPORTER: --- I haven't marked that yet.  
24 Do you want it marked?

25 MR. DANIEL: This is -- we'll -- we'll mark this,

1 Your Honor, as State's 173 for purposes of this hearing.

2 THE COURT: Is that the correct identification?

3 MR. DANIEL: For ID only. Yes, sir.

4 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 173 was marked for  
5 identification.)

6 Q And, Investigator Dickert, you've had a chance to  
7 watch that interview that -- that we're referring to with  
8 Penelope Davis?

9 A That's correct.

10 Q All right.

11 MR. DANIEL: And, Your Honor, I -- at this time I  
12 would ask permission to play that for purposes of  
13 determining its admissibility.

14 THE COURT: All right. Any objection to the Court's  
15 in-camera review of State's Exhibit 173?

16 MR. GEOLY: Judge, obviously, we object to it coming  
17 in. But we certainly have no problem with you watching  
18 it, Your Honor.

19 THE COURT: All right. Let's go -- you can go ahead  
20 and -- for purposes of this proffered testimony, I'll  
21 allow you to -- to play it.

22 MR. DANIEL: Yes, sir. And -- and, of course, we --  
23 we do -- we -- we believe this could be construed as a  
24 excited-utterance statement for purposes of medical  
25 diagnosis under 803 for the hearsay exceptions. It's

1 nontestimonial in that sense as well, Your Honor, as  
2 Investigator Dickert said it's -- more or less, it was  
3 for purposes of a welfare check. So we're going to go to  
4 ---

5 THE COURT: So I guess I need to step down there and  
6 take a look at it?

7 MR. GEOLY: It's right behind ---

8 MR. STUMBO: I think you've ---

9 MR. GEOLY: --- you, Judge.

10 MR. STUMBO: --- got it behind you, Judge.

11 THE COURT: Oh, it's ---

12 MR. STUMBO: We can ---

13 THE COURT: --- right here.

14 MR. DANIEL: Oh, yes.

15 MR. STUMBO: --- turn the ---

16 THE COURT: Okay.

17 MR. DANIEL: Yes.

18 MR. STUMBO: --- volume up.

19 THE COURT: All right. Good. Thank you.

20 MR. STUMBO: Walter, can you make sure the volume's  
21 up?

22 (Off the record briefly.)

23 MR. GEOLY: That's not it.

24 MR. STUMBO: Oh, yeah, it is. That's where it  
25 starts, when they walk in.

1           (Whereupon, a portion of video was played for in-  
2 camera review by the Court.)

3           MR. DANIEL: And, Your Honor, that -- that is the  
4 extent of the testimony we would elicit as it pertains to  
5 Penelope's statements to -- to law enforcement and  
6 medical staff, as you can see, as to the source of her  
7 injuries. If -- if you'll note, her -- her question --  
8 or that law enforcement's question, I believe, that  
9 Connie Johnson, the victims advocate, you can see with  
10 the sheriff's office, asked: "How you doing?"

11           And Penelope's response is -- is almost -- it's  
12 nonresponsive to the question. He just -- or she brings  
13 up: "My mommy got shot by my daddy, and then y'all had  
14 to come," something to that effect. I -- I'd have to  
15 play it back.

16           But again, it was -- it was kind of a very  
17 spontaneous statement. Further, she describes how she  
18 got the injury to her left ankle -- or her ankle area  
19 with the scratch and how Iven had pinned her down,  
20 presumably in the backseat, after Iven had sustained the  
21 -- the gunshot wound to the head.

22           THE COURT: Okay.

23           MR. DANIEL: And that's -- that -- that's the extent  
24 of it, Your Honor, that we ---

25           THE COURT: All right.



1 MR. DANIEL: --- would play under the hearsay ---

2 THE COURT: Mr. Geoly?

3 MR. DANIEL: --- exceptions.

4 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I don't think it's an exception  
5 to hearsay. I don't think it's a spontaneous statement.  
6 If you'll follow, you know, right after the -- Connie  
7 Johnson says that, the next question is: "What happened  
8 to your mama?" I mean, that's what they asked her.

9 I mean, it -- it's -- it's -- it does not sound like  
10 a spontaneous excited utterance to me. I think they're  
11 asking the child stuff. That -- you know, Judge, she --  
12 she's very verbal. I mean, she's about as impressive a  
13 5-year-old as you're going to come across.

14 You know, I -- I don't know Your Honor's position in  
15 terms of putting her on the stand. But it seems like:  
16 (1) they're trying to get evidence, Your Honor, that's  
17 cumulative, number one.

18 It -- it certainly would be, I think, prejudice to  
19 my client because you see the baby. I mean, the -- the  
20 scene starts with the -- actually Xzavier, Jr., crying.  
21 They're just -- the fact that they're having to deal with  
22 all this, I think, is obviously -- becomes prejudicial to  
23 inflame the -- the passions, basically, of the jury of  
24 the children being involved with this, is their -- their  
25 plan, because there's no question in this case that Daddy

1 shot Mommy.

2 I mean, it's not even like it's -- it's not proving  
3 anything that wouldn't be cumulative proof of what's  
4 already there. But it is hearsay. And I don't think  
5 that this is an exception to the rule, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: All right. Yeah. I'm not going to --  
7 I'm not going to allow it.

8 The -- the problem I have with it is I can't  
9 understand what she's saying. But then, you have the  
10 officer and nurse or whoever repeating what she's saying.  
11 So it's almost like they're giving the testimony; they're  
12 interpreting what she's saying.

13 If you just played what she said without them  
14 repeating what she said, then you might have a better  
15 thing. But I couldn't -- I mean, I think it's  
16 inadmissible to say -- you know, to come in. "How are  
17 you doing?"

18 And then she says something that I don't understand.  
19 But then, the officer says: "Your daddy shot your mama?"

20 And so that's -- that's the problem I have with it,  
21 is them -- because the jury's not going to be paying  
22 attention to what the little girl says. The jury's going  
23 to be listening to them repeating what they say the  
24 little girl said.

25 MR. STUMBO: Judge, I -- I would just say -- and

1       this is just kind of a big picture with hearsay. And it  
2       was one of the reasons why we believed that this was  
3       admissible. And I completely respect ---

4               THE COURT: All right.

5               MR. STUMBO: --- what Your Honor's saying. I think  
6       purpose for hearsay rules is -- you know, and I -- I  
7       remember way back, Professor Flanagan in law school  
8       telling us the reason why we have these is to make sure  
9       there's a sufficient indicator or indicia of reliability  
10      in ---

11              THE COURT: Well ---

12              MR. STUMBO: --- whatever the declarant says.

13              THE COURT: And I agree with that.

14              MR. STUMBO: Right.

15              THE COURT: So let's -- if you can, I'll readdress  
16      this if you go back and let me listen to it again, but  
17      you delete what the officer and the others in the room,  
18      where they repeat the little girl says, where all we hear  
19      is his initial comment when he walks in and then what she  
20      says without them repeating what she says.

21              MR. STUMBO: Okay.

22              THE COURT: That's the biggest problem I have with  
23      this, is them saying -- I couldn't tell what the little  
24      girl was saying. But I could understand, when the  
25      officer said -- Officer Dickert, when he said: "Your

1 daddy shot your mama?" I could understand him clearly.

2 I could understand what the other person in the room  
3 said clearly when they are purportedly repeating what the  
4 little girl says. But I can't verify that that's what  
5 the little girl said or not, because I couldn't  
6 understand it.

7 MR. STUMBO: Yeah. Could ---

8 THE COURT: So ---

9 MR. STUMBO: --- Judge, if we play it again and you  
10 listen to it and we stop it before anything comes out of  
11 -- I mean, I know you've already heard what he said now.

12 THE COURT: Yeah. That's ---

13 MR. STUMBO: But ---

14 THE COURT: --- what ---

15 MR. STUMBO: --- by -- but -- but -- but if you can  
16 listen again, I -- I -- just -- first time I ever heard  
17 this, I heard what she said, Judge. And why -- it's why  
18 I thought it was important, because we believed it to be  
19 spontaneous ---

20 THE COURT: Well ---

21 MR. STUMBO: --- really is what -- what's on her  
22 mind. I mean, clearly, she's very distraught. I think  
23 under ---

24 THE COURT: I think ---

25 MR. STUMBO: --- I just ---

1 THE COURT: --- that initial comment when he walks  
2 into the room is spontaneous. But then, when he says,  
3 "What happened," after that, that's in response to his  
4 question. That's not spontaneous.

5 MR. STUMBO: Okay. Yes, sir.

6 THE COURT: So everything after that, no. That  
7 initial comment she makes, when he walks into the room  
8 and says: "Oh, pizza. How are y'all doing?" And then  
9 she says something, whatever it is she says -- let me  
10 watch it again -- that might be spontaneous. But I don't  
11 know -- certainly, you can't get in where he repeats ---

12 MR. STUMBO: Well, if -- if ---

13 THE COURT: --- what she says.

14 MR. STUMBO: We -- we can redact the audio when he  
15 said -- he and/or ---

16 THE COURT: Well, let me take ---

17 MR. STUMBO: --- Johnson ---

18 THE COURT: --- a look at ---

19 MR. STUMBO: --- says ---

20 THE COURT: --- it again.

21 MR. STUMBO: --- anything, if you need ---

22 THE COURT: And let ---

23 MR. STUMBO: --- us to.

24 THE COURT: --- me see.

25 MR. STUMBO: Okay.

1           THE COURT: But stop -- I mean, from when he walks  
2 into the room and that -- just that first comment she  
3 makes, and then stop it after that. Let me just take  
4 another look at it.

5           MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

6           (Whereupon, a portion of video was played for in-  
7 camera review by the Court.)

8           THE COURT: Okay. About that -- "What happened to  
9 Mama" -- everything -- that's the only thing that may be  
10 admissible.

11          THE COURT: When he says, "What happened to Mama?"  
12 everything after that is not spontaneous. That's in  
13 response ---

14          MR. STUMBO: Right.

15          THE COURT: --- to his ---

16          MR. STUMBO: I think ---

17          THE COURT: --- question.

18          MR. STUMBO: --- the only -- yeah. She does  
19 afterwards. And I agree, Judge. After she -- he says,  
20 "You said your daddy shot your mama?" and then she said  
21 the same thing, but then said, "And then you had to  
22 come." That was what she added, I think, the second  
23 time, which, quite honestly, I think her identifying just  
24 her utterance of here's what happened ---

25          THE COURT: Well ---

1 MR. STUMBO: --- "My daddy shot my mama and she's in  
2 there." I -- I mean, I think that's important ---

3 THE COURT: Well ---

4 MR. STUMBO: --- in this ---

5 THE COURT: --- I mean ---

6 MR. STUMBO: --- case.

7 THE COURT: --- that -- I still can't understand  
8 what she's saying.

9 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

10 THE COURT: I don't know. I mean, I -- I can't  
11 understand it. I understand she's verbal. But -- back  
12 it up and play it one more time and stop it after the  
13 little girl makes her comment, okay?

14 (Whereupon, a portion of video was played for in-  
15 camera review by the Court.)

16 THE COURT: All right. I understand "my daddy" and  
17 "she" and I see her pointing.

18 MR. STUMBO: I think "Daddy" ---

19 THE COURT: I'm not ---

20 MR. STUMBO: --- "shot Mama" ---

21 THE COURT: Well, that's what you're saying ---

22 MR. STUMBO: Okay.

23 THE COURT: --- she said.

24 MR. STUMBO: I know.

25 THE COURT: I didn't ---

1 MR. STUMBO: Okay ---

2 THE COURT: --- hear that.

3 MR. STUMBO: --- Judge.

4 THE COURT: Yeah.

5 MR. STUMBO: I ---

6 THE COURT: I didn't hear that.

7 MR. STUMBO: I understand your ruling.

8 THE COURT: Yeah. So ---

9 MR. GEOLY: Judge, and just to make the record  
10 complete, Your Honor, I -- even if it is spontaneous --  
11 and I get your point --- I -- I don't think it's  
12 necessarily an excited utterance, under the rules.

13 THE COURT: Well -- and I'm -- I'm thinking that  
14 might be. But I'm still finding that it's hearsay; it's  
15 cumulative. I don't know that it's credible -- I mean,  
16 that it's going to assist the jury any, because I  
17 certainly can't understand what she's saying.

18 And I think it's more prejudicial than probative for  
19 them to hear that and then y'all argue: "This is what  
20 she said," rather than just letting a jury decide on  
21 their own what she said. So I'm going to sustain the  
22 objection ---

23 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

24 THE COURT: --- as to ---

25 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.



1 THE COURT: --- the -- as to -- what's the little  
2 girl's name?

3 MR. STUMBO: Penelope.

4 MR. GEOLY: Penelope.

5 THE COURT: Penelope. Especially the fact that it  
6 is cumulative, I mean, the defendant is admitting that he  
7 shot ---

8 MR. STUMBO: Well ---

9 THE COURT: --- in the ---

10 MR. STUMBO: --- Judge ---

11 THE COURT: --- argument ---

12 MR. STUMBO: --- I -- I have no statements that it  
13 -- it -- if -- if he takes the stand, he admits it.

14 THE COURT: I see.

15 MR. STUMBO: But I ---

16 THE COURT: Well, in ---

17 MR. STUMBO: --- I don't ---

18 THE COURT: --- opening arguments ---

19 MR. GEOLY: And let ---

20 THE COURT: --- they admit it.

21 MR. GEOLY: --- me say ---

22 MR. STUMBO: So ---

23 MR. GEOLY: --- our ---

24 MR. STUMBO: --- for the ---

25 MR. GEOLY: --- his entire defense, Your Honor,

1 we've taken the position that he shot ---

2 THE COURT: Yeah.

3 MR. GEOLY: --- the gun and everything in terms of  
4 their -- their evidence, the -- the -- everything they've  
5 presented, we've taken the position: "Look, this isn't a  
6 whodunit." I said it in opening statement: "This isn't  
7 a whodunit."

8 You know, but we've taken the -- the -- the position  
9 of we fired the weapon but there was no -- and I've made  
10 this clear -- his defense is: There was no *mens rea*;  
11 there was no malice aforethought. And that ---

12 THE COURT: All right.

13 MR. GEOLY: --- what we're relying on, not the rest  
14 of it.

15 THE COURT: Well, as -- for purposes for right now,  
16 I'm going to rule that it's inadmissible. As I said, my  
17 primary ruling is based upon the fact that the only way I  
18 know what she said was based upon the witness repeating  
19 what she said and not any -- me being able to decipher  
20 what she said. All -- I mean, the only thing I really  
21 understood her say is "my daddy." And I saw her pointing  
22 the finger. So ---

23 MR. STUMBO: Judge, and just -- I -- just to follow  
24 up, because Mr. Geoly ---

25 THE COURT: Yeah.

1 MR. STUMBO: --- I -- I -- I -- we're not trying to  
2 -- to do a bridge too far here. Our position was: It  
3 was extraordinarily probative because the only person  
4 that identified who shot the gun in Mr. Dickert's case  
5 was Indigo, who's testified. But, you know, if I have  
6 one witness that says she's shot, I -- I'm assuming he --  
7 he's going to get on the stand and admit that he shot the  
8 gun. But he never gave a statement to law ---

9 THE COURT: Well, I mean ---

10 MR. STUMBO: --- enforcement ---

11 THE COURT: --- if you want ---

12 MR. STUMBO: --- so ---

13 THE COURT: --- to tell the little girl in testify  
14 ---

15 MR. STUMBO: I ---

16 THE COURT: --- we can do that. I'm just ---

17 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

18 THE COURT: --- not going ---

19 MR. STUMBO: Which I ---

20 THE COURT: --- to allow ---

21 MR. STUMBO: --- which I can go ahead and tell Your  
22 Honor, I'm not going to do.

23 THE COURT: Okay.

24 MR. STUMBO: Because she's 5. I don't want to put  
25 her through that. I -- I -- we did believe that the

1 video showed her still under the stress of the incident  
2 and describing an injury, which we thought -- there  
3 again, and I understand ---

4 THE COURT: Yeah.

5 MR. STUMBO: --- Your Honor's ruling. I'm not  
6 trying to ---

7 THE COURT: And I ---

8 MR. STUMBO: --- continue ---

9 THE COURT: --- understand that.

10 MR. STUMBO: --- to argue.

11 THE COURT: I understand ---

12 MR. STUMBO: But ---

13 THE COURT: --- that. But yeah. Number one, it is  
14 clearly hearsay. It's whether ---

15 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

16 THE COURT: --- or not it comes in under the  
17 excited-utterance objection ---

18 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

19 THE COURT: --- and -- and I'm -- I'm going to rule  
20 that it's not; it doesn't come under that exception. All  
21 right?

22 Anything else before -- now, as far as -- does that  
23 knock out that body cam entirely or is there other  
24 portions that you're going to be playing on it?

25 MR. STUMBO: Judge ---

1 THE COURT: Or is there anything else we need to  
2 proffer before we get the jury back tomorrow?

3 MR. STUMBO: We may need to proffer Indigo's --  
4 Indigo's interview with Mr. Dickert. She did deny one  
5 thing that she said. And I -- I -- you know, to not have  
6 the confusion of a body cam that he took that's not in  
7 evidence yet with her on the stand, I do believe she --  
8 she talked about the kids crying and describing the event  
9 a lot differently.

10 And I asked her: "Were the kids crying?"

11 And she said: "No."

12 My intention was to play that portion of her  
13 interview with Detective Dickert, his body cam, just as a  
14 -- coming in as a prior ---

15 THE COURT: Okay. So ---

16 MR. STUMBO: --- prior inconsistent statement.

17 THE COURT: So what was her testimony?

18 MR. STUMBO: I -- I -- I asked her what were -- was  
19 the -- were the kids crying was her -- you know, what  
20 were their -- their demeanor when she's getting them in  
21 the car and leaving. And she had said to law enforcement  
22 in her interview that they were crying; they were upset.

23 And her description today was not that. And I said:  
24 "So you're saying they weren't crying?"

25 And she said: "No."

1           And I asked her: "Well, did -- did you -- do you  
2 admit or denying saying that to law enforcement?" And  
3 she said she didn't remember that.

4           So I -- I did think that was important, the kids'  
5 demeanor. We believe that's probative. We believe it's  
6 a prior inconsistent statement under Rule 801 that can be  
7 -- now that she's testified and denied saying it.

8           So I -- that was the -- the primary thing, Judge. I  
9 ---

10          MR. GEOLY: Your Honor ---

11          THE COURT: Okay.

12          MR. GEOLY: --- my recollection is that she  
13 testified she didn't remember; it'd been two years ago.  
14 So I don't know that she actually denied it, so much as  
15 said: "I don't remember; that was two years ago," is the  
16 -- what I recall. But certainly, you know, I -- I'm not  
17 necessarily opposed to them playing some of that either,  
18 if -- if I can get the total context of it in. You know,  
19 I'm ---

20          THE COURT: All right.

21          MR. GEOLY: --- not -- not saying that I necessarily  
22 object. But, I -- I think it ---

23          THE COURT: Well, I mean, as I understand prior  
24 inconsistent statements, you have to -- it has to be an  
25 inconsistent statement that differs from their testimony

1 and you have to ask them, did they make this, your prior  
2 inconsistent statement. And if they said, "No, I never  
3 said that," then it comes in.

4 MR. STUMBO: Right. And I recall that. I believe  
5 -- and we can look at the transcript. I ---

6 THE COURT: Yeah. We're ---

7 MR. STUMBO: --- I do ---

8 THE COURT: --- going to need to look at the  
9 transcript ---

10 MR. STUMBO: I do remember asking her, Judge:  
11 "Didn't you tell law enforcement they were crying?" I  
12 think that's how ---

13 THE COURT: Well ---

14 MR. STUMBO: --- I asked ---

15 THE COURT: --- and I didn't recall it at -- at all  
16 until -- I do recall her saying something about: "That  
17 was two years ago. I don't remember."

18 I don't know if that was the same testimony ---

19 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

20 THE COURT: --- or not. But we'll need to look that  
21 ---

22 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

23 THE COURT: --- up.

24 MR. STUMBO: I -- I ---

25 THE COURT: Do we want to address that now or ---

1 MR. STUMBO: I -- I guess we could to just save us  
2 some time in the morning. But, Judge, I -- I -- I  
3 believe when she said I -- referring to two years ago, I  
4 think she was talking about -- she said -- she talked to  
5 Investigator Dickert two years ago. That was my ---

6 THE COURT: Well ---

7 MR. STUMBO: --- recollection ---

8 THE COURT: --- that's okay.

9 MR. STUMBO: --- but we can ---

10 THE COURT: We've got ---

11 MR. STUMBO: --- look at it.

12 THE COURT: --- realtime transcript? How long would  
13 it take you to take a look at that?

14 THE COURT REPORTER: I mean, I can start looking now  
15 and let you know when I find it.

16 THE COURT: Well, I mean, would you rather come back  
17 tomorrow morning or -- how about ---

18 MR. STUMBO: Judge, my ---

19 THE COURT: --- let's just ---

20 MR. STUMBO: --- daughter has a volleyball game at  
21 six o'clock in Greenwood. So I -- I -- I didn't know if  
22 I'd make it tonight. But it -- it wouldn't ---

23 THE COURT: Well ---

24 MR. STUMBO: --- disappoint me if I could make it to  
25 that if we did it in the morning. That's fine.



1 THE COURT REPORTER: How about if we do it in the  
2 morning, Your Honor?

3 THE COURT: Do what?

4 THE COURT REPORTER: How about if we do it in the  
5 morning?

6 THE COURT: Okay. Give you an opportunity -- okay.

7 What she's going to do is she's going to take a look  
8 at it. And I think we all -- I mean, the law is pretty  
9 clear. If she says, "I didn't say that," and the prior  
10 statement shows she did say it, then it comes in.

11 MR. STUMBO: Yes, sir.

12 THE COURT: If it's a case of she said, "I don't  
13 remember saying that; I may have said that; I don't  
14 remember what I said earlier; I do remember talking to  
15 him," then I don't know that that's a prior inconsistent  
16 statement. Because the purpose of letting the prior  
17 statement in is to impeach the testimony of the witness.

18 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I ---

19 THE COURT: So ---

20 MR. GEOLY: --- certainly could be faulty. But --  
21 but my recollection is that she initially kind of says  
22 no. He kind of browbeats -- "You sure you didn't?"

23 And then I think she corrects it and says: "Well, I  
24 certainly don't recall saying it."

25 THE COURT: Okay.

1 MR. GEOLY: "That was two years ago."

2 THE COURT: Well, let's -- I'm going to let the  
3 court reporter overnight take a look at it, and then  
4 we'll come back tomorrow morning and we'll readdress that  
5 issue. Okay?

6 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

7 THE COURT: All right.

8 All right. Anything else before we break for the  
9 evening?

10 MR STUMBO: Nothing from the state, Judge.

11 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

12 MR GEOLY: No, sir, Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: All right. Thank ---

14 MR GEOLY: Well, Judge, I -- I certainly don't want  
15 to be the one to bring this up and -- and would be  
16 remiss. But yesterday you mentioned that once the jury  
17 is sworn, if something changed -- I think you gave us  
18 kind of your indication. But I would certainly beg that  
19 you allow my client to stay out ---

20 THE COURT: Yeah.

21 MR. GEOLY: --- tonight. He'll be ---

22 THE COURT: He can ---

23 MR. GEOLY: --- here in ---

24 THE COURT: --- right now.

25 MR. GEOLY: --- in the morning.

1 THE COURT: Yeah. He can -- certainly can right  
2 now, as long as he knows that there will be a trial in  
3 his absence if he doesn't appear -- come back. But I'm  
4 going to allow him to go home this evening as well.

5 MR GEOLY: Thank you, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: All right.

7 MR STUMBO: Thank you, Judge.

8 THE COURT: All right. Thank you.

9 (Whereupon, the proceeding adjourned at 4:31 p.m.)  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1 TRIAL DAY 3 - 08/25/21

2 (Whereupon, the proceeding resumed at 9:44 a.m.)

3 THE COURT: All right. Good morning, everyone.  
4 Anything we need to address before we bring the jury in?

5 MR STUMBO: I believe, Judge, the way we left  
6 yesterday, and one of our witnesses -- our first witness  
7 is actually Mr. Schumpert, who with -- was -- found the  
8 firearms in the house and the search warrant. He should  
9 be very a short witness.

10 THE COURT: All right.

11 MR STUMBO: The next witness will be Investigator  
12 Dickert, who's the lead investigator.

13 And I believe we left it with this, you know, could  
14 -- could extrinsic evidence of a prior inconsistent  
15 statement that Indigo denied making on the stand as to  
16 whether the children or crying or not. If -- if I could  
17 just cite a couple of cases for the Court in support of  
18 our position.

19 THE COURT: Well, I mean, I -- I think understand  
20 the law. But, I mean, I'm trying -- I guess the critical  
21 question in my mind was: Did she deny making the  
22 statement or what ---

23 MR. STUMBO: Yes.

24 THE COURT: --- I guess ---

25 MR. STUMBO: And -- and I ---

1 THE COURT: --- what I need -- what did she say --  
2 read her testimony in its entirety from -- from when she  
3 started it. Don't just -- that one thing, where she  
4 said, "No, I didn't make it."

5 Because you continued to question her: "Mr. Davis  
6 you tell the police . . . "

7 What did -- what was her testimony?

8 MR STUMBO: I -- Judge, I haven't gotten the  
9 transcript. Just based ---

10 THE COURT: Okay.

11 MR. STUMBO: --- on what the court reporter relayed  
12 to us, kind of, at sidebar yesterday afternoon, I asked  
13 her: "Were the children crying?"

14 She said: "No" -- when -- when she was loading them  
15 into the car.

16 THE COURT: Right.

17 MR. STUMBO: I said: "But do you recall making a  
18 statement to law enforcement where you explained that the  
19 children were crying and said that they were upset,  
20 crying?" And she said no; she didn't make such a  
21 statement or didn't recall that.

22 But Judge, I think the law says if she equivocates  
23 at all, she's not admitting it. And if she admits in --  
24 and there were several times yesterday where I confronted  
25 her with stuff and said: "Well, you said this to law

1 enforcement."

2 And she said: "Yeah, I did."

3 But at that one point, she still said "no" or "I  
4 don't remember" or -- and -- and still denied recalling  
5 whether the kids were crying or whether she said that,  
6 both. And to me, the -- the case *Caymack* [sic] and *State*  
7 *v. Blalock* say that the admission must be unequivocal.  
8 And I -- there's -- I don't see under any circumstances  
9 where her admission to the statement that she made to law  
10 enforcement that the kids were crying when she was  
11 putting them in the car, that was an unequivocal  
12 admission.

13 I mean, I -- I think she really denied it. And  
14 then, she kind of -- she said: "No, no," and then, "I  
15 don't remember that. That was two years ago."

16 And, Judge, I think, under the law, that's a --  
17 that's a -- it's -- it's -- under Rule 613, that triggers  
18 the admissibility of extrinsic evidence of the prior  
19 inconsistent statement. So, Judge, we have it on body  
20 camera. It -- it's a short part of the body-cam  
21 interview that Investigator Dickert did with Indigo. We  
22 got it -- the -- the time and place of it.

23 I -- I believe the law admit -- it would -- would  
24 say it's admissible, Judge ---

25 THE COURT: All right.

1 MR. STUMBO: --- based on what she said. But that  
2 -- that would be our position, based on *Caymack* [sic] and  
3 *State v. Blalock*, which is 357 S.C. 74. That's a Court  
4 of Appeals case from 2004.

5 Court said (as read): The witness must admit to  
6 making to making the prior statement unequivocally and  
7 without qualification." And I -- Indigo's response to me  
8 was -- was far from unequivocal.

9 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Geoly?

10 MR GEOLY: Please the Court, Judge. I'm not sure  
11 exactly what part of the video they're saying is -- is  
12 prior inconsistent. But I think she was very clear on  
13 the stand that she said: "Well, I -- I'm not sure what I  
14 said to law enforcement; I -- I don't really recall; this  
15 was two years ago."

16 But then, it was like she -- she took count and  
17 thought in her mind and said: "But I don't think they  
18 were crying." I mean, so I think she, under oath,  
19 addressed thinking back to -- to -- to the moment to  
20 recollect, Hey, were they crying?

21 Now, I don't know what she said. I don't know what  
22 they're going to put forward. There was a lot of video,  
23 Judge, you know, probably over 30 hours' worth that -- so  
24 I -- I'm not sure what they're -- they're claiming.

25 But a lot of things could've happened when she was

1 making that statement. Even if you're going to call the  
2 statement, I don't think it was in -- it certainly wasn't  
3 a sworn something. I don't think it was any kind of  
4 waiver of rights.

5 I don't think there's any kind of -- you -- not that  
6 -- that she necessarily had any, but I -- I -- I think  
7 what you're talking about is a conversation that happens,  
8 at -- at the very best. And -- and I'm not sure of the  
9 language. But I -- I don't recollect her saying whether  
10 they were crying while I got them in the car.

11 Now, if it was that specific, "Yes, they were crying  
12 while I get them in the car," she says, I think,  
13 yesterday under oath, you know, when she is under oath  
14 from the stand, I -- I took it to mean: "I'm thinking  
15 now, and I just don't remember them crying."

16 So I -- I think she's cleared up any kind of  
17 misunderstanding. She did say no; then said: "No, I  
18 certainly don't recall them crying." And then, I -- you  
19 know, kind of like, "I'm thinking about it, and I just  
20 don't remember them crying, Solicitor."

21 I think that's the testimony. I don't think there's  
22 anything that -- that they're going to be able to show  
23 that says much different. So now, for the solicitor to  
24 impeach his own witness like this, I just think is -- is  
25 -- I doubt it's going to be very specific to -- to be:



1 "Oh, I'm a liar." You know: "Oh, this guy did versus  
2 me."

3 I think you've quoted the seminal case yesterday,  
4 where you've got a guy who goes: "No, no. That not it.  
5 I lied." That's far different from her being able to  
6 remember as she's, you know, dealing with this horrific  
7 circumstance, admittedly, and getting the kids in the car  
8 for her to think back and recall.

9 It's not like she was making a huge shift to her  
10 story. I think, at -- at best -- and again, I'm not sure  
11 what reference the -- what they're referencing. But I --  
12 -- I can't imagine it's a -- a affirmative --  
13 affirmative: "Oh, yes, my kids were crying; they were  
14 bawling."

15 You know, I -- I guess I'll look at like you will,  
16 Judge. But I can't imagine that what she said yesterday  
17 was really much substantially different. Because it  
18 seemed like she was very earnest in her attempt to  
19 remember yesterday and said: "I just don't think they  
20 were crying then when I was putting them in the car."

21 She -- she relates some conversation that they have  
22 with her. You know, some talking is going on between her  
23 and the kids. And -- and she doesn't discuss them  
24 crying. So that -- that's -- that's our position, Your  
25 Honor.

1           THE COURT: All right. Well, I think her testimony  
2 was that they weren't crying and then she just doesn't  
3 remember. If the statement was she told police, "Yeah,  
4 they were crying," then yeah, that comes in as a prior  
5 inconsistent statement. Because it is directly contrary  
6 to what her testimony was.

7           MR STUMBO: Judge, and I believe there's -- there's  
8 about a 30-second -- probably where she's explaining to  
9 the investigator this -- when this is going on. When  
10 she's trying to get them in the car, he's got a gun,  
11 shooting in the air.

12          THE COURT: But it's just the -- the prior  
13 inconsistent statement is what comes in.

14          MR STUMBO: Right.

15          THE COURT: You can't put up any hearsay from her  
16 that bolsters the facts of this case.

17          MR STUMBO: Right. And -- and I -- I -- I think we  
18 can do the best we can to just narrow it down to that  
19 phrase. I mean, I -- I think -- or sentence where she --  
20 she talks about getting the kids in the car ---

21          THE COURT: Well, that's ---

22          MR. STUMBO: --- that were crying.

23          THE COURT: Wherever -- wherever it is that she  
24 says, "they're crying," that's the inconsistent  
25 statement.

1 MR. STUMBO: Okay.

2 THE COURT: You can't get in anything that she  
3 could've testified to here as to what happened, the  
4 course of events. I mean, as -- as I understand, you're  
5 claiming basically that her testimony on the stand was  
6 different than her prior testimony, to the extent that  
7 then she said the children were crying; now she's saying  
8 the children were not crying.

9 MR STUMBO: Right.

10 THE COURT: So that what comes in.

11 MR STUMBO: Correct. When -- when they're getting  
12 in the car. And I think ---

13 THE COURT: Right.

14 MR STUMBO: --- that sentence and -- and when she's  
15 talk about that. And I think it's at -- just for the  
16 record, it was at 5:10. I believe we found it this  
17 morning at 5:10 of -- and -- and I'm going to just --  
18 we'll offer it as State's 174 for ID purposes, which  
19 would be a new exhibit for the court reporter.

20 THE COURT: Well, let's get it marked.

21 MR. STUMBO: We can go ahead and get it marked.

22 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 174 was marked for  
23 identification.)

24 MR. STUMBO: So it would be the -- the 5:10 point of  
25 the video on State's 174.

1 MR GEOLY: Judge, we're just taking -- I think that  
2 this video -- I mean, can we review this in-camera to --  
3 to see if it actually is a ---

4 THE COURT: Well, that's why we broke earlier ---

5 MR. GEOLY: Yeah.

6 THE COURT: --- yesterday, is for y'all to do it and  
7 to get ready as to what we needed to do.

8 MR GEOLY: That -- and this is the first I've heard,  
9 you know, as ---

10 THE COURT: Well, I mean, you knew it was out there.  
11 We ---

12 MR. STUMBO: Judge ---

13 THE COURT: --- could've taken a look at it. But, I  
14 mean, he's certainly entitled to see it before it's  
15 presented.

16 MR. STUMBO: Well, I -- I ---

17 THE COURT: So I'm not going to watch it in-camera.  
18 But if ---

19 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

20 THE COURT: --- you have never seen it before, then  
21 you're ---

22 MR. GEOLY: I -- I ---

23 THE COURT: --- entitled ---

24 MR. GEOLY: Judge ---

25 THE COURT: --- to see it.

1 MR GEOLY: --- I've -- I've looked at all the  
2 videos. I'm sure I've seen it. But for me to -- I -- I  
3 certainly don't know what video it's on or -- or where I  
4 would find this.

5 THE COURT: Okay. Well, if they provided it to you  
6 ---

7 MR. STUMBO: It's ---

8 THE COURT: --- then they've ---

9 MR. GEOLY: It's -- it's ---

10 THE COURT: --- done what they needed to do. All  
11 right?

12 MR. GEOLY: Well, but ---

13 THE COURT: So I'm not going to review it in-camera  
14 ---

15 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

16 THE COURT: --- if this is something that has been  
17 presented to you.

18 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I ---

19 THE COURT: No.

20 MR. GEOLY: --- have about -- I -- between 30 and 40  
21 hours, I think, of video.

22 THE COURT: I understand ---

23 MR. GEOLY: For me to ---

24 THE COURT: --- that.

25 MR. GEOLY: --- know where a ---

1 MR. STUMBO: Judge, I just ---

2 MR. GEOLY: --- three-second ---

3 MR. STUMBO: --- gave him the minute ---

4 MR. GEOLY: --- you know ---

5 THE COURT: I'm ---

6 MR. GEOLY: --- statement that she -- yes, sir. But  
7 -- and -- and again, I -- surely, this wasn't testimony.  
8 I mean, there's no testimony that I've reviewed. So this  
9 isn't prior testimony. This is a prior conversation with  
10 an officer, at best.

11 THE COURT: Okay.

12 MR STUMBO: This is the statement she gives to Ryan  
13 Dickert at the sheriff's department on April the 29th,  
14 2019. And it is at five minutes and ten seconds of that  
15 video, which you've had a discovery for months.

16 MR GEOLY: So it's when she's on pain pills one week  
17 after being shot is when he says this and then ---

18 MR STUMBO: I'm done, Judge.

19 MR GEOLY: All right. I -- yes, sir, Judge.

20 THE COURT: All right. All right. Anything else?

21 MR STUMBO: We're ready, Judge.

22 THE COURT: All right. Let's bring the jury in.

23 (Off the record briefly.)

24 (Whereupon, the jury entered the courtroom at 9:56  
25 a.m.)

1 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen,  
2 welcome back. I hope everybody had a good evening. I  
3 remind you, if you brought any cell phone or pagers into  
4 the courtroom, please make sure you turn them off  
5 completely at this time.

6 We're ready to resume with the trial of the case.  
7 We're still in the plaintiff's case.

8 The state can call -- excuse me -- not plaintiff,  
9 state's case. The state can call your next witness.

10 MR DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor. May it please  
11 the Court. The state calls Deputy Odell Schumpert.

12 (Off the record briefly.)

13 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

14 ODELL SCHUMPERT, having been first duly sworn,  
15 testified as follows:

16 DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Have a seat and state your  
17 name for the record.

18 THE WITNESS: Odell Caldwell Schumpert.

19 DIRECT EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. DANIEL:

21 Q All right. And you're Deputy Odell Schumpert with  
22 the Newberry Sheriff's Office, correct?

23 A Lieutenant, sir.

24 Q Okay. Lt. Odell Schumpert with the sheriff's  
25 office. How long have you been employed with the

1 sheriff's office?

2 A As of today?

3 Q Yes, sir.

4 A Twenty-five years, ten months, and fourteen days.

5 Q Oh, wow. That's great.

6 And you are a lifelong resident of Newberry; is that  
7 correct?

8 A That's correct.

9 Q All right. And -- and where do you live, Deputy --  
10 or Lieutenant? Excuse me. I'm sorry.

11 A [REDACTED]. That's here in Newberry.

12 Q Okay. So you actually -- you live on [REDACTED],  
13 which is in close proximity to the scene of this crime;  
14 is that correct?

15 A That's correct.

16 Q And would that be walking distance to [REDACTED]  
17 [REDACTED] from your house?

18 A That's correct.

19 Q Okay. All right. Well, I want to take you back to  
20 the incident in question, April 20th of 2019. Were you  
21 working early-morning hours on that date?

22 A My shift was scheduled to start at 6 a.m.

23 Q Okay. And let me ask you this: Did you hear any  
24 gunfire that night from your house?

25 A No, sir, I did not.



1 Q Okay. In any event, do you respond to this -- this  
2 particular incident location at [REDACTED]?

3 A Yes, I did.

4 Q Okay. Approximately what time as that?

5 A That's approximately about a quarter till six that  
6 morning.

7 Q Okay. About 5:45 a.m.?

8 A Yes, sir.

9 Q Okay. And what was -- what was your reason for  
10 responding? What was your -- your function there?

11 A Lt. Carnes called me and told me that they were down  
12 the street, and my shift went to relieve that night  
13 shift.

14 Q Okay. And was the crime scene -- had it been  
15 secured at that point -- taped off? things like that?

16 A It was in the process of being done, sir.

17 Q Okay. And do you know if any search warrants had  
18 been obtained to search the premises for anything of  
19 evidentiary value?

20 A A search warrant was later obtained.

21 Q Okay. So did you -- did you stay on the scene to  
22 help execute that search warrant/participate in the  
23 search?

24 A Yes, I did.

25 Q Okay. And who all, if you recall, helped search the

1 -- the -- the house?

2 A It was myself, Sgt. Ryan Dickert, Sgt. Ran  
3 Henderson, Sgt. Rusty Fulmer.

4 Q Was there assistance from -- from the South Carolina  
5 Law Enforcement Division? Do you recall ---

6 A Yes.

7 Q --- that? Okay.

8 A SLED crime scene unit did respond.

9 Q And what, if anything, were you trying to locate --  
10 [REDACTED]? What kind of evidence were you looking  
11 for?

12 A Anything that was pertinent to the incident.

13 Q Okay. Firearms-related evidence?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Okay. All right.

16 MR DANIEL: Mr. Bentley, if you could, pull up 93.  
17 It's in evidence.

18 Q Okay. And Lt. Schumpert, if you need to -- to  
19 adjust your seat to -- to see the TV screen -- all right.  
20 That's [REDACTED], correct?

21 A That's correct.

22 MR DANIEL: And, Your Honor, without walking past  
23 the jury -- and I don't think Mr. Geoly has -- has agreed  
24 to the admissibility. But I want to show State's 133 so  
25 Deputy Schumpert can -- can look on Mr. Bentley's

1 computer without the -- the jury being able to see the  
2 image.

3 THE COURT: All right. And they can't see this one,  
4 can they?

5 MR DANIEL: No, sir. I don't think they can. Oh --  
6 I'm being told he can't disconnect.

7 THE COURT: Okay. Have you got the paper ---

8 MR. DANIEL: I -- I do ---

9 THE COURT: --- exhibit?

10 MR. DANIEL: --- Your Honor.

11 THE COURT: All right. Well, let's use the paper  
12 exhibit, then. Show it to him. You can do it through  
13 that.

14 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, if -- to be more efficient,  
15 may I just pass forward my computer screen to the deputy?

16 THE COURT: That'll be fine.

17 MR. DANIEL: And he can navigate through the  
18 corresponding numbers.

19 THE COURT: That'll be fine.

20 (Off the record briefly.)

21 MR. DANIEL: You can just use the arrows.

22 THE WITNESS: The arrows?

23 MR DANIEL: And, Your Honor, I'm just instructing  
24 Lieutenant, he can use the arrows to shift back to the --  
25 to the numbers for ID.

1 Q All right, Deputy Schumpert. Do you recognize  
2 State's 133?

3 Q Yes, sir, I do.

4 Q Okay. And what is that?

5 A That is the living room, once you enter the front  
6 door, along with the kitchen area.

7 Q Okay. And you entered that -- you entered the  
8 living room to search for, essentially, firearm-related  
9 evidence?

10 A Yes, sir.

11 Q Okay. All right. And that's a fair and accurate  
12 representation of what you observed when you entered the  
13 633 residence; is that correct?

14 A Yes, sir.

15 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 133 for  
16 admission into evidence.

17 THE COURT: Any objection?

18 MR GEOLY: Yes, sir, Your Honor.

19 THE COURT: All right. Grounds for ---

20 MR GEOLY: Relevance.

21 THE COURT: All right.

22 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, this is the crime scene. I  
23 ---

24 THE COURT: Okay. State's 133 is admitted into  
25 evidence over defendant's objection.

1 MR. DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor.

2 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 133 was entered into  
3 evidence.)

4 Q All right. Deputy Schumpert, if you could, go to --  
5 to 135. You recognize that image?

6 A Yes, sir.

7 Q Okay. And describe what you're seeing.

8 A That is the kitchenette area of the residence.

9 Q Okay. And -- pardon me. All right. Did you find  
10 anything of evidentiary value in the living room, you  
11 personally?

12 A Not in the living room. No, sir.

13 Q Okay. All right.

14 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 135 for  
15 admission into evidence.

16 THE COURT: Any objection?

17 MR GEOLY: Without objection, Your Honor.

18 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 135 admitted  
19 into evidence without objection.

20 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 135 was entered into  
21 evidence.)

22 Q All right. On the left side of that -- that  
23 photograph, 135, Lt. Schumpert, was that that we see on  
24 the left side?

25 A It's, like, a green storage container, something

1 like what they call Tupperware which you have stored your  
2 clothes or something in like that.

3 Q Okay. And in the middle of that image on -- looks  
4 like kitchen table, what are we looking at there?

5 A Look like a old birthday cake.

6 Q Okay. All right. At this green storage container,  
7 did you further search the contents of that green storage  
8 container?

9 A Yes, sir, I did.

10 Q Okay. If you could, Lt. Schumpert, go to 136. All  
11 right. What are we looking at there?

12 A The storage container.

13 Q All right.

14 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 136 for  
15 admission into evidence.

16 THE COURT: Any objection?

17 MR GEOLY: Without objection, Your Honor.

18 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 136 admitted  
19 into evidence without objection.

20 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 136 was entered into  
21 evidence.)

22 Q All right. That's just another vantage point of the  
23 green storage container?

24 A Yes, sir.

25 Q All right. Go to 150, Lt. Schumpert. Do you

1 recognize that?

2 A Yes, sir.

3 Q Okay.

4 A That is the back door with a cooler and a storage  
5 container.

6 Q All right. That green storage container is right  
7 near the back door; is that correct?

8 A That's correct.

9 Q Okay.

10 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 150 for  
11 admission into evidence.

12 THE COURT: Any objection?

13 MR GEOLY: Objection, Your Honor: relevance and  
14 cumulative.

15 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 150 admitted  
16 into evidence over defendant's objection.

17 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 150 was entered into  
18 evidence.)

19 Q All right. 151, Lt. Schumpert, if you could, look  
20 at that. All right. Do you recognize that?

21 A I do, sir.

22 Q All right. And tell us -- tell us what we're  
23 looking at.

24 A That is a black-in-color .22 eight-shot revolver.

25 Q Okay. And did you personally discover that .22

1 pistol?

2 A I did.

3 Q Okay. And it was located just as it's portrayed in  
4 that particular image, 151; is that correct?

5 A That is correct.

6 Q All right.

7 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 151 for  
8 admission into evidence.

9 THE COURT: All right. That's -- there must be  
10 something wrong with what you gave me.

11 MR GEOLY: Is that 151?

12 MR DANIEL: No. We haven't -- it hadn't been  
13 admitted in evidence ---

14 THE COURT: Oh, I see. Okay. Let me take a look at  
15 it again.

16 All right. I see. Any objection to State's Exhibit  
17 151?

18 (Off the record briefly.)

19 MR GEOLY: Your Honor, I would object to relevance  
20 and cumulative. This is the third picture we have of  
21 this green container.

22 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 151 is  
23 admitted into evidence over to defendant's objection.

24 MR GEOLY: Thank you, Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: Thank you.



1 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 151 was entered into  
2 evidence.)

3 MR DANIEL: And, Your Honor, the -- the -- the  
4 picture at 152, I'll -- I'll -- is just a closer-up image  
5 of that. I'd -- I'd offer 152 for admission into  
6 evidence as well.

7 THE COURT: Well, you're going to have to lay some  
8 foundation. You can't just say -- unless there's an --  
9 is there an objection?

10 MR GEOLY: Yes, sir, Your Honor.

11 THE COURT: Okay. You're going to need to lay a  
12 foundation for it.

13 MR DANIEL: All right.

14 Q Lt. Schumpert, if you look at 152, do you recognize  
15 that image?

16 A Yes, sir, I do.

17 Q And -- and what is that image of?

18 A It is a .22 revolver which was located in a crate  
19 and is in the exact position is I found it.

20 Q Okay.

21 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 152 for  
22 admission into evidence.

23 THE COURT: All right. Objection?

24 MR GEOLY: I'd object, Your Honor. By the state's  
25 own words, it's just a -- basically a closer-up picture

1 of the last picture they've admitted into evidence. We'd  
2 argue it's cumulative.

3 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 152 admitted  
4 into evidence over defendant's objection.

5 MR GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

6 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 152 was entered into  
7 evidence.)

8 THE COURT: Yeah.

9 Q And, Lt. Schumpert, this is in evidence already as  
10 State's No. 8.

11 MR DANIEL: I'll -- I'll ask the clerk to pass that  
12 to the witness, Your Honor.

13 Q Do you recognize State's No. 8?

14 A Yes, sir, I do.

15 Q Okay. And that is -- and what is that?

16 A This is the Ruger .22 eight-shot revolver that was  
17 located in the crate.

18 Q Okay. And that was right near the back door; is  
19 that correct?

20 A That is correct.

21 Q Okay. All right. Lt. Schumpert, if you could go to  
22 156 for ID purposes and -- and tell us if you recognize  
23 that image.

24 A I do.

25 Q All right. And -- and what is that?

1 A When I moved the -- a couple of the things that were  
2 on top of the crate, that bag is a paper bag which had  
3 what appeared to be a box of ammunition.

4 Q Okay. So that was -- a box of ammunition was right  
5 next to the .22 pistol that you discovered?

6 A Yes, sir.

7 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 156 for  
8 admission into evidence.

9 THE COURT: Any objection?

10 MR GEOLY: Yes, Your Honor.

11 THE COURT: All right.

12 MR. GEOLY: Objection to relevance and cumulative.

13 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 156 admitted  
14 into evidence over defendant's objection.

15 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 156 was entered into  
16 evidence.)

17 Q And then, 157, Lt. Schumpert, if you could look at  
18 that. Tell us what -- tell us if you recognize State's  
19 157.

20 A Yes, sir. That's the box of ammunition.

21 Q Okay?

22 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 157 for  
23 admission into evidence.

24 THE COURT: Any objection?

25 MR GEOLY: Your Honor, I object twofold: (1) It's

1 cumulative; and (2) I believe it would be confusing to  
 2 the jury inasmuch as you just have a -- a box of -- of  
 3 ammunition that we've got another box of ammunition we  
 4 just admitted a picture to. I don't know how we're going  
 5 to differentiate; don't know whether that establishes  
 6 it's the same box or a different box. And so I believe  
 7 that would also tend to confuse the jury, Your Honor, as  
 8 well as being cumulative again.

9 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit No. 157 is  
 10 admitted into evidence over defendant's objection.

11 MR GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

12 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 157 was entered into  
 13 evidence.)

14 Q All right. And 157, Lt. Schumpert, that is a -- a  
 15 box of ammunition; is that correct?

16 A That is correct.

17 Q What kind of ammunition is that?

18 A 9-millimeter.

19 Q Okay. And is that ammunition consistent with any  
 20 physical evidence located at the scene?

21 A Yes. It's consistent with the shell casings that  
 22 were located outside.

23 Q Okay. So that 9-millimeter shell casings -- there  
 24 were 9-millimeter spent shell casings on the premises --  
 25 front -- front of the premises; is that correct?

1 A That's correct.

2 Q And that's a box of 9-millimeter ammunition?

3 A That is correct.

4 Q Okay. All right. Tell us why -- all right. So we  
5 -- we've covered the green -- green storage container; is  
6 that correct, Lieutenant?

7 A That's correct.

8 Q All right. So tell us what you do next as part of  
9 your search?

10 A I go down the hall to the master bedroom.

11 Q Okay. If you could, Lieutenant, look at State's  
12 137. Do you recognize that?

13 A That's correct.

14 Q All right. And what is that?

15 A That is looking down the hall, past the back door to  
16 the master bedroom.

17 Q Okay. So the green storage container was right near  
18 the back door, correct?

19 A That's correct.

20 Q So if you keep walking towards that direction,  
21 that's the entry way up to the master bedroom?

22 A Yes, sir. To the left.

23 Q Okay.

24 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 137 for  
25 admission into evidence.

1 THE COURT: Any objection?

2 MR GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

3 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 137 admitted  
4 into evidence without objection.

5 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 137 was entered into  
6 evidence.)

7 Q All right. 138, Lt. Schumpert, do you recognize  
8 that?

9 A Yes, sir.

10 Q And what is that?

11 A That is standing at the doorway of the master  
12 bedroom ---

13 Q Okay.

14 A --- looking into it.

15 Q All right. And then, you did make entry into that  
16 master bedroom to continue your search, correct?

17 A That is correct.

18 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 138 for  
19 admission into evidence.

20 THE COURT: Any objection?

21 MR. GEOLY: Objection, Your Honor. It's literally  
22 almost the same exact photo; cumulative.

23 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 138 admitted  
24 into evidence over defendant's objection.

25 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 138 was entered into

1 evidence.)

2 Q All right. And upon entering the master bedroom,  
3 did you locate anything of evidentiary value?

4 A I did.

5 Q All right. What did you -- what did you first  
6 locate in the ---

7 A Up underneath ---

8 Q --- master bedroom?

9 A --- the mattress was a semi-automatic 9-millimeter  
10 pistol.

11 Q Okay. I'm -- I think I may have cut you off a  
12 little bit. Tell us what you first discovered?

13 A When I went into the bedroom, I raised the mattress.  
14 And underneath the mattress was a semi-automatic 9-  
15 millimeter pistol.

16 Q All right. So if you'd take a look at 139 and also  
17 take a look at 160. You recognize 139 and 160,  
18 Lieutenant?

19 A Yes. 139 is the bed itself. And 160 is with the  
20 mattress with the pistol where I found it.

21 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer 139 and 160 for  
22 admission into evidence.

23 THE COURT: Any objection?

24 MR. GEOLY: Without objection, Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibits 139 and

1 State's Exhibit 160 admitted into evidence without  
2 objection.

3 (Whereupon, State's Exhibits 139 and 160 were  
4 entered into evidence.)

5 Q All right. So 139, that's the -- the bed in the  
6 master bedroom you just described?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And you lifted -- you lifted up the mattress; is  
9 that correct?

10 A That's correct.

11 Q And then, that's when you located a -- a firearm; is  
12 that correct?

13 A That is correct.

14 Q All right.

15 MR. DANIEL: 160, Walter.

16 Q All right. And is that what you observed when you  
17 lifted up the mattress, what's in 160?

18 A That is correct, sir.

19 Q Okay. And that was -- what type of firearm was it?  
20 Do you recall?

21 A 9-millimeter.

22 Q All right. 161, you recognize that?

23 A Yes, sir. That is a closer picture of the 9-  
24 millimeter with serial number.

25 Q All right.



1 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer 161 for admission  
2 into evidence.

3 THE COURT: Any objection?

4 MR. GEOLY: Without objection.

5 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 161 admitted  
6 into evidence without objection.

7 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 161 was entered into  
8 evidence.)

9 Q And, Lt. Schumpert, I'll pass -- pass what's been  
10 marked for ID purposes as State's No. 9. I ask the clerk  
11 to pass that to you. Tell us if you recognize that.

12 A Yes, sir. This is ---

13 Q Okay.

14 A --- the firearm that was located under the mattress.

15 Q But you were the first officer -- you actually were  
16 the first officer to actually located that 9-millimeter  
17 pistol; is that correct?

18 A Correct, sir.

19 Q All right.

20 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's No. 9 for  
21 admission into evidence.

22 THE COURT: That's No. 9?

23 MR. DANIEL: Yes, sir.

24 THE COURT: All right. Any objection?

25 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

1 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit No. 9  
2 admitted into evidence without objection.

3 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 9 was entered into  
4 evidence.)

5 MR. DANIEL: And, Your Honor, I'll represent to the  
6 Court that that firearm has been inspected by the  
7 sheriff's office. It's been cleared for safety, and it  
8 has a trigger lock on it.

9 THE COURT: All right.

10 Q All right. Lt. Schumpert, still on this master  
11 bedroom, did you locate any other items of evidentiary  
12 value in this master bedroom?

13 A Yes, I did.

14 Q Okay. What'd you -- what else you locate?

15 A In the dresser drawer, the second one closest to the  
16 door of entry, it was cracked open. So I pulled it open  
17 further.

18 Q Okay. Go to 140, Lt. Schumpert. You recognize  
19 that?

20 A Yes, sir. That is the drawers that was slightly  
21 open, and I pulled it open.

22 Q Okay. And what was located in that drawer?

23 A Several rounds, unspent rounds.

24 Q Okay. Several, I guess I'll call it, live rounds or  
25 unfired rounds of ammunition?

1 A That's correct.

2 Q All right.

3 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 140 for  
4 admission into evidence.

5 THE COURT: Any objection?

6 MR. GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence one moment,  
7 Your Honor.

8 THE COURT: All right.

9 (Off the record briefly.)

10 MR. GEOLY: Your Honor, without objection.

11 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 140 admitted  
12 into evidence without objection.

13 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 140 was entered into  
14 evidence.)

15 Q All right. If you could, go to 163, Lt. Schumpert.  
16 You recognize that?

17 A Yes, sir, I do.

18 Q Okay. And what is that?

19 A Those are the live rounds which were located in the  
20 drawer.

21 Q Do you know the exact count of those live rounds, or  
22 did you -- did you personally count them?

23 A I have to look back at my report to get the actual  
24 ---

25 Q Okay.

1 A --- number.

2 Q All right.

3 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 163 for  
4 admission into evidence.

5 THE COURT: Any objection?

6 MR. GEOLY: Your Honor, no objection.

7 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 163 admitted into  
8 evidence without objection.

9 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 163 was entered into  
10 evidence.)

11 Q All right. And that's just a closer image of what  
12 you observed when you pulled out that drawer, correct?

13 A That is correct, sir.

14 Q And each time you would something of evidentiary  
15 value -- like the .22; the box ammunition; the 9-  
16 millimeter; and then, of course, what's in the drawer  
17 that we're looking at on -- on State's 163 -- what would  
18 you do upon discovering the -- these items?

19 A It was left in place until after it was  
20 photographed.

21 Q Okay.

22 A Uh-huh.

23 Q Okay. Who did you -- who -- who did you notify that  
24 you had located these items, firearms-related evidence?

25 A I notified the technician from SLED. And they

1 photographed it, along with Investigator Sgt. Ryan  
2 Dickert and Sgt. Ren Henderson.

3 Q Okay. So then you notified SLED crime scene agents  
4 of the items that you located and they took it from  
5 there; is that correct?

6 A That is correct.

7 Q All right, Lt. Schumpert. Was that the --  
8 essentially, the extent of your role in this  
9 investigation?

10 A That is correct, sir.

11 Q All right. All right. Thank you, Lieutenant.  
12 Please answer any questions Mr. Geoly has.

13 THE COURT: All right. Cross-examination.

14 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir. If it please the Court?

15 THE COURT: Yes.

16 CROSS-EXAMINATION

17 BY MR. GEOLY:

18 Q If you could pull up that last photo you have.

19 A 163?

20 Q I'm sorry?

21 A Is it 163? It's the last photo?

22 Q Yes, sir, that one right there.

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q Can you see that okay from where you're sitting?

25 All right. I guess you've got it on the computer as

1 well, Lieutenant?

2 A Yes, sir.

3 Q Okay. Lt. Schumpert, that -- that right there, that  
4 -- that's basically from the box, right, that you found?

5 A I'm not for sure, sir.

6 Q Okay. Isn't that typically what a box, like that  
7 green box that you -- you were looking at just a minute  
8 ago, that's the kind of thing it would hold to then hold  
9 the bullets within that green box, wouldn't it?

10 A Yes, sir. They're in a Styrofoam or plastic ---

11 Q Okay.

12 A --- which may have five or so in a row.

13 Q So -- and it looks like that that -- I -- I don't  
14 even know what to call it. But -- but the bullet holder,  
15 let's call it, that would typically be in that box,  
16 that's still in that drawer, right?

17 A No, sir. I didn't see it.

18 Q Well, do you see the bullet holder right there -- I  
19 mean, the -- the -- the -- beside the bullets, isn't that  
20 from the box?

21 A Oh, the gray thing. Yes, sir.

22 Q Do you see what I'm saying? I mean, that's from  
23 that green box, isn't it?

24 A I'm not for sure.

25 Q All right. The green box that you found in -- in

1 the -- the green tub, the -- the green bullet box,  
2 ammunition box, do you -- do you remember on ---

3 A Yes, sir.

4 Q --- the photo before?

5 A Well ---

6 Q All right.

7 A --- I can't ---

8 Q Did ---

9 A --- speculate.

10 Q --- did it have one of those in it? Or is that from  
11 the same box of bullets?

12 A I'm not sure, sir. I can't ---

13 Q Okay.

14 A --- speculate because I did not move the box of  
15 rounds that were in the container. I left that and other  
16 people moved it ---

17 Q Okay.

18 A --- after ---

19 Q Do you know ---

20 A --- they brought ---

21 Q --- if anybody else moved it?

22 A I'm not sure who moved it ---

23 Q Okay.

24 A Or who ---

25 Q Is the ---

1 A --- collected it.

2 Q Is there a chance it got moved from that drawer to  
3 that box by somebody other than you and other than my  
4 client?

5 A I can't answer that. I can't speculate.

6 Q So you don't know?

7 A No, sir.

8 Q Okay. Let me ask you, just because you indicated  
9 you live in this neighborhood; is that right?

10 A That is correct.

11 Q And your -- your middle name, is that a family name?

12 A That is correct.

13 Q All right. And the defendant -- or excuse me -- the  
14 -- the victim, the young man in this case, the 7-year-  
15 old's actually last name was Caldwell. Are you some  
16 relation to him?

17 A No, sir, I'm not.

18 Q Okay. Are you some relation to the Hunters? I know  
19 they got a lot of family that lives there ---

20 A No, sir, I'm not.

21 Q You're not a cousin or distant relation to the  
22 Hunters at all?

23 A No, sir, I am not.

24 Q Okay. What time did you get out there on the scene  
25 that day?



1 A Roughly about a quarter till six.

2 Q Okay. So this had all happened before you got  
3 there?

4 A That is correct.

5 Q Okay. You -- you don't have anything to offer this  
6 jury in terms of with all these pictures and the evidence  
7 that you have to offer, this was kind of the aftermath,  
8 right?

9 A Yes, sir.

10 Q You don't have anything to testify regarding my  
11 client's intent?

12 A No, sir, I ---

13 Q You ---

14 A --- do not.

15 Q --- you don't know what was going on at this house  
16 that night?

17 A No, sir, I did not.

18 Q Okay.

19 MR. GEOLY: No further questions, Judge.

20 THE COURT: All right. Redirect?

21 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

22 BY MR. DANIEL:

23 Q Your -- Lt. Schumpert, you'd have no way of knowing  
24 what -- what transpired prior to getting on the scene at  
25 -- at a particular incident location, would you?

1 A No, sir. I would have no idea.

2 Q Thank you.

3 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

4 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

5 (Off the record briefly.)

6 THE COURT: All right. The state can call your next  
7 witness.

8 MR DANIEL: Your Honor, the state calls Investigator  
9 Ryan Dickert.

10 THE COURT: All right.

11 (Off the record briefly.)

12 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

13 RYAN DICKERT, having been first duly sworn,  
14 testified as follows:

15 DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Have a seat and state your  
16 name for the record.

17 THE WITNESS: Ryan Dickert.

18 DIRECT EXAMINATION

19 BY MR. DANIEL:

20 Q All right, Investigator Dickert. I've already said  
21 it. You're an investigator with the Newberry Sheriff's  
22 Office; is that correct?

23 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

24 Q Okay. How long have you been employed by the  
25 Newberry Sheriff's Office?

1 A This year will make 18 years.

2 Q Okay. So 15 years with the sheriff's office. Any  
3 other law enforcement agencies prior to going to the  
4 sheriff's office?

5 A I started at the detention center back in 2003, if  
6 -- but it's still with the same agency.

7 Q Okay. All right. And so you've been -- you've been  
8 in investigations for some time, though, correct?

9 A Yes, sir.

10 Q All right. I want to go back to the incident in  
11 question, April 20th, 2019. Now, I looked at my  
12 calendar. That was a Saturday; is that correct?

13 A That's correct.

14 Q Okay. Do you -- were you working as the weekend  
15 investigator on that particular date?

16 A Yes, sir. I would've been the on-call investigator.

17 Q Okay. And if you could, just speak up just a little  
18 bit ---

19 A I'm sorry.

20 Q --- Investigator Dickert.

21 All right. So you were the on-call investigator  
22 that weekend. And so y'all rotate amongst other  
23 investigators who's the -- the weekend on-call  
24 investigator?

25 A Well, we actually rotate by week. So you'd get it

1 for seven days at a time.

2 Q Okay. All right. Well, I'll get right to it. Did  
3 you have an occasion to respond out to the Newberry  
4 County Hospital on the early-morning hours of April 20th,  
5 2019?

6 A Yes, sir.

7 Q Okay. And tell us: What was the nature of that --  
8 that call that you responded to out there?

9 A I had received a call from our dispatch center,  
10 advising that the two -- county had two gunshot victims  
11 that were at the Newberry Hospital. They couldn't  
12 provide much more information, other than I was being  
13 requested to -- to respond at that time.

14 Q Okay. Approximately what time -- what time are you  
15 dispatched out there -- or -- or should I say: What time  
16 did you actually arrive at the hospital?

17 A According to our CAD record, it would've been, I  
18 believe, 3:49 a.m.

19 Q Okay. All right. So when you respond out to the  
20 hospital, what's the first thing that you observe,  
21 relevant to this investigation?

22 A I parked at the emergency entrance for the general-  
23 public side. It was a greenish-blue-in-color Toyota  
24 Camry. I believe that all the doors were open, which was  
25 odd.

1 Q Okay. And just like with the last witness,  
2 Investigator Dickert, I'm going to hand you my computer.  
3 That way I'm not back and forth ---

4 A Taylor ---

5 Q --- in this area ---

6 A --- I'm good.

7 Q --- with the jury.

8 A I've got mine.

9 Q You can look at them on the -- my computer.

10 A I got my photos, if ---

11 Q Okay.

12 A --- that'll help you.

13 Q Well, go ahead and take my computer, just ---

14 A Okay.

15 Q --- in case.

16 All right. If you could, look at -- you just  
17 described a Toyota Camry at the front of the emergency  
18 room entrance, is what you observed?

19 A That's correct.

20 Q All right. Do you recognize State's 22, then?

21 A I do.

22 Q All right. And what is that?

23 A That would be the vehicle that Indigo Penny drove to  
24 the hospital that morning.

25 Q Okay.

1 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 22 for  
2 admission into evidence.

3 THE COURT: Any objection?

4 MR. GEOLY: Judge, having a computer glitch, if --  
5 bear with me one moment, please.

6 THE COURT: All right.

7 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

8 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 22 admitted  
9 into evidence without objection.

10 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 22 was entered into  
11 evidence.)

12 Q All right. So that's one of the first things you  
13 observe when you responded to the hospital a little  
14 before 4 a.m.; is that correct?

15 A That's correct.

16 Q Okay. Take us through what you did next.

17 A I was briefed, I believe, by Deputy Longshore in the  
18 -- in the parking area with what was being dealt with in  
19 the ER, as far as victims were concerned. Kind of gave  
20 me an idea that there was a -- a child that had been  
21 involved in this, as well as the -- the mother of the  
22 child.

23 Q Okay.

24 MR. DANIEL: Go to 19, Walter. That's in evidence.

25 Q All right. And did you take that photograph?

1 A Yes, sir. I believe I did.

2 Q Okay. And did you note anything else as it pertains  
3 to -- to the vehicle at that point in time?

4 A On the hood of the vehicle ---

5 THE COURT: I'm sorry, sir. If you -- you're going  
6 to need to speak into the microphone. I can't really  
7 hear you.

8 THE WITNESS: I -- I am. I'm trying.

9 THE COURT: Okay.

10 A On the hood of the vehicle, there is a -- a bullet  
11 defect almost in the center of the vehicle, the hood of  
12 it.

13 Q Okay. And then, also, right underneath the driver's  
14 side door on the ground, what do we note -- do you note  
15 anything there?

16 A Yes. It -- it appeared to be an entry hole where a  
17 bullet went into the vehicle.

18 Q No. On the ground. I'm sorry.

19 A Oh, on the ground. I'm sorry. Yes. It was bloody  
20 footprints.

21 Q Okay. And was that bloody footprint, was that  
22 leading into the entrance of the Newberry ER?

23 A That's correct. You can tell from the photograph  
24 that they started at the -- the car and actually come up  
25 onto the curbing and go towards the entrance.

1 Q Okay. All right. So those are your first  
2 impressions upon arriving at the scene; is that correct?

3 A That's correct.

4 Q All right. So then, take us to when you actually go  
5 into the hospital. I think you said you were briefed by  
6 one of the responding officers?

7 A That's correct.

8 Q All right. Go ahead. Take it from there.

9 A Well, upon entering the -- the hospital ER  
10 department, you could tell it was very chaotic. There  
11 was a lot of activity, which is not normal for Newberry.  
12 The nurses all seemed to be very concerned about what  
13 they were dealing with.

14 Room 4, which would be the -- the trauma room, had a  
15 lot of activity: doctors and nurses and equipment coming  
16 and going. And I believe that's where -- where Iven was  
17 -- was being treated. And then, Ms. Indigo was in, I  
18 think, Room -- I believe it's Room 2 or 3.

19 Q Okay. So at that point in time, what -- it's your  
20 understanding you had identified the two gunshot wound  
21 victims?

22 A Yes, sir.

23 Q Okay. And what was Iven's condition at that point  
24 in time when you first arrived?

25 A According to the hospital staff, it was grim.



1 Q Grave condition?

2 A Yeah.

3 Q Okay. All right. So obviously, you're unable to  
4 speak with him. Do you go talk to Indigo at some point?

5 A Yes, sir. We attempted to -- to speak with her.  
6 The hospital advised that they were going to transfer  
7 Iven to a trauma center so that hopefully they could  
8 provide better service. And we took time to allow Ms. --  
9 Ms. Indigo and Ms. Vinnie to -- to see him prior to  
10 leaving the -- the hospital.

11 Q Okay. So -- so Newberry Hospital does not have the  
12 capacity to treat somebody, well, with -- with serious  
13 injuries such at what Iven had sustained?

14 A That's correct.

15 Q Okay. All right. So at that point had y'all  
16 developed any type of suspect, as it pertains to the  
17 shooting, at this point in time?

18 A I had received limited information from the deputies  
19 on scene that it may have been her husband that committed  
20 this. But I had not spoken with her directly and -- and  
21 gotten that information.

22 Q Did you have a location of the actual shooting  
23 incident at this point in time?

24 A Yes, sir. It'd have been [REDACTED] in -- in  
25 the Helena section of -- Helena Community of Newberry

1 County.

2 Q Okay. And so once you go speak with -- so you  
3 obviously, at this point in time, want to do a follow-up  
4 with Indigo, because she's conscious and alert; is that  
5 correct?

6 A Correct.

7 Q All right. And who else was -- did you -- were you  
8 recording all this? I -- I know you're equipped with  
9 body cams; is that correct?

10 A Yes, sir. I had my -- my body cam activated and on.

11 Q Okay. Were there other law enforcement present when  
12 you go to Indigo Penny's room?

13 A Yes, sir. Sheriff Lee Foster was present, as well  
14 as our victims advocate, Connie Johnson with the  
15 sheriff's office, and -- and numerous medical staff was  
16 in and out of the room.

17 Q What -- what injuries did you observe Indigo had  
18 sustained?

19 A She sustained a gunshot to the lower-left leg, just  
20 above her ankle. It appeared to be through and through.

21 Q All right. That was a through-and-through gunshot  
22 wound to the lower-left leg ---

23 A Yeah.

24 Q --- lower-left leg/ankle area?

25 A Yes, sir.

1 Q Okay. And was -- what was her condition at that  
2 point when you interview her?

3 A Obviously, based off the circumstances, she was  
4 extremely upset. I don't know that she knew the  
5 condition of her -- her child at that point in time. I  
6 know that she understood that it wasn't good. And she  
7 was obviously in some pain from -- from the gunshot.

8 Q Okay. Did Indigo identify the source of her  
9 injuries?

10 A She did.

11 Q Okay. And who did she identify as -- as -- as the  
12 shooter?

13 A She identified Xzay as being the shooter and was  
14 asking who Xzay was. And she identified Xzavier Sharif  
15 Davis as being the person who shot her.

16 Q Okay. Being the person who shot her?

17 A Shot into the vehicle.

18 Q Okay. All right. So at that point in time, do you  
19 proceed to -- to interview her fully about what  
20 transpired -- of what let up to the shooting and so  
21 forth?

22 A Yes, sir. We attempted to try to gain as much  
23 information as we could to try to understand why this  
24 took place. She couldn't really advise that a whole lot  
25 went on: that he had gone to some kind of fish-fry

1 gathering and she had stayed home; she'd been out  
2 preparing for a surprise birthday party for her father,  
3 which would've been, I guess -- I think it was --  
4 would've been given to him on the 20th of April.

5 Q Okay. Did you -- at this point in time, when she's  
6 disclosing all this information, at what point in time  
7 was Xzavier Davis taken into custody?

8 A According to the CAD notes, it would've been  
9 approximately 4:06 a.m.

10 Q Okay. And according to -- and your body cam comes  
11 with time stamps; is that correct?

12 A That's correct.

13 Q And so when you're interviewing Indigo Penny, did  
14 you go back and look at the -- the time stamp of -- of  
15 when you actually talked to her about the shooting at the  
16 hospital?

17 A I honestly can't recall what time it was. I would  
18 say it would -- if I've gotten there at ten till four, it  
19 would be the 4-to-4:15 time range.

20 Q But at the time you're talking to her, was that  
21 before or after Xzavier Davis had been taken into  
22 custody?

23 A I believe it was after.

24 Q Okay. All right. What about the other two -- were  
25 there other victims associated with this incident that

1 you interviewed?

2 A Yes, sir. There were two other children that were  
3 in the vehicle, along with Indigo and Iven. And that was  
4 3-year-old Penelope and 8 -- I think he was either 8 or 9  
5 months old, but Xzavier, Jr.

6 Q Okay. So there was a -- a -- 3-year-old Penelope;  
7 and then, an infant, 9-month-old Xzavier, Jr.?

8 A Yes, sir.

9 Q Okay. What, if any, injuries did they have?

10 A Penelope complained about a scratch or advised on a  
11 scratch that was on the back of her -- her right ankle, I  
12 believe.

13 Q And was a nurse present when Penelope disclosed this  
14 injury?

15 A Yes, sir.

16 Q Okay. What -- what -- what was the emotional  
17 condition of these children at that time?

18 A You could tell that they had experienced something  
19 very traumatic. It -- it was definitely difficult.

20 Q And were Xzavier, Jr., and Penelope -- were they --  
21 were they crying, things like that?

22 MR. GEOLY: Objection to leading, Your Honor.

23 THE COURT: No. That's not leading. I'll allow it.  
24 Go ahead.

25 A Truthfully, he -- he seemed to be in good spirits

1 with the nurse that was in there. She was doing a -- a  
2 fantastic job. And I spoke to him, and he cried. But I  
3 -- I think overall, for him, he was happy with -- with  
4 the treatment that he was getting from the nurse.

5 Penelope, having a child that was much her age -- I  
6 think they're just a couple months apart -- you could  
7 tell that she knew something bad had happened, because  
8 she just sat there.

9 Q Uh-huh. And what about the clothing? Because there  
10 was, as we saw in that photograph that we're looking at  
11 right there, State's -- is that -- is that 20? -- there's  
12 blood leading into the hospital. Were there blood on the  
13 clothing that the occupants of this vehicle had, things  
14 like that

15 A When we went into the room, there wasn't any blood  
16 on the clothing that she had. But we were advised that  
17 she had been given a shirt by medical staff -- Penelope  
18 -- due to her shirt having blood on it.

19 Q Okay. So at the time you are, I guess, assessing  
20 Penelope's injuries, she had had a change of clothes?

21 A She had been given a new shirt. Yes, sir.

22 Q Okay. Did hospital staff transfer the clothing  
23 items to you that these kids had on, these three  
24 children?

25 A Yes, sir. I received two bags. One had a T-shirt

1 that Penelope had on. And the other bag contained  
2 clothing that Iven would've been wearing.

3 Q And Indigo's condition -- I mean, she had just been  
4 shot, correct?

5 A Correct.

6 Q What -- was she given pain medication, to your  
7 knowledge?

8 A I'm not a medical doctor. But I would assume so.

9 Q Okay. Did her -- her condition -- when you  
10 interviewed her, did she appear to be under the influence  
11 of some type of anaesthesia? morphine? that kind of  
12 thing?

13 A I honestly couldn't tell you whether she was or  
14 wasn't.

15 Q Okay. All right. Now let's go back out. SLED  
16 crime scene -- Sheriff Foster testified that he notified  
17 SLED. Is that correct?

18 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

19 Q And they were called to assist in the investigation?

20 A That's correct.

21 Q All right. But you were the lead investigator for  
22 the Newberry Sheriff's Office, correct?

23 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

24 Q All right. I want to go back to the vehicle. Did  
25 you photograph the vehicle prior to SLED arriving on

1 scene?

2 A Yes, sir. I had -- I photographed it prior to their  
3 arrival.

4 Q Okay. Let's go to -- if you could, just,  
5 Investigator Dickert, look at 21.

6 A Okay.

7 Q You recognize that?

8 A Yes, sir.

9 Q Okay. What is that?

10 A That is a photograph of the driver's side of the  
11 vehicle. The door is open. There's a large amount of  
12 blood in the driver's floorboard, along with a pair of  
13 sandals; and then, the bloody footprints that lead from  
14 the car to the hospital.

15 Q Okay.

16 MR. DANIEL: I'd offer State's 21 for admission into  
17 evidence, Your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Any objection?

19 MR. GEOLY: No objection.

20 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 21 admitted into  
21 evidence without objection.

22 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 21 was entered into  
23 evidence.)

24 Q And then, if you could, Investigator Dickert, go to  
25 24. You recognize that?



1 A Yes, sir.

2 Q Okay. What is that?

3 A That is a photograph of the hood of the Toyota  
4 Camry.

5 Q Okay. And why is that significant to your  
6 investigation?

7 A There appears to be a defect in the middle of the  
8 hood from a bullet strike.

9 Q Okay.

10 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 24 for  
11 admission into evidence.

12 THE COURT: Any objection?

13 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

14 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 24 admitted into  
15 evidence without objection.

16 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 24 was entered into  
17 evidence.)

18 Q All right. Now, when you say "bullet defect," do  
19 you mean -- just can it be a hole or does it -- or an  
20 indentation or anything?

21 A It -- it appeared to be a glancing blow, where it  
22 struck the hood and ricocheted off/bounced off.

23 Q Okay. All right. If you could, look at State's 31,  
24 Investigator. You recognize that?

25 A Yes, sir, I do.

1 Q All right. What is -- what is that?

2 A In this photograph it -- it appears that there is  
3 also a defect in the A post or A pillar, depending on who  
4 you're speaking with about it. But there's a bullet  
5 defect where it appeared as though a bullet had struck  
6 the A post of the vehicle.

7 Q All right.

8 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I offer State's 31 for  
9 admission into evidence.

10 THE COURT: Any objection?

11 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 31 admitted  
13 into evidence without objection.

14 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 31 was entered into  
15 evidence.)

16 Q All right. And then, so we just saw a bullet  
17 defect, kind of an indentation in the hood. Now we're  
18 seeing another indentation? You're calling it a bullet  
19 defect on the A post?

20 A That's correct. It actually starts on the driver's  
21 side door just above the mirror.

22 Q Point to the -- if you could, step down and just  
23 point to it with your finger, just to make sure all the  
24 jurors can see exactly what we're talking about.

25 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

1 A This area right here and right here.

2 Q Okay. All right.

3 (Whereupon, the witness resumed the witness stand.)

4 Q Look at -- next, look at 25 -- State's 25, please.  
5 What are we looking at there?

6 A This would be the front-driver's side quarter panel.  
7 And there were bullet deflect -- defects, as well as a  
8 hole ---

9 Q So ---

10 A --- in the lower portion of the -- the fender  
11 between the tire and the door.

12 Q Okay. So we're looking at three different bullet  
13 defects in this particular photograph?

14 A Yes, sir.

15 Q Okay.

16 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I offer State's 25 for  
17 admission into evidence.

18 THE COURT: Any objection?

19 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

20 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 25 admitted into  
21 evidence without objection.

22 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 25 was entered into  
23 evidence.)

24 Q All right. If you could again, just step down for  
25 the jury and point to each bullet defect that's

1 highlighted in this photograph, please, for the jury.

2 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

3 A You have the -- the one on the A post. You have a  
4 -- a defect here, here, as well as the one on the  
5 driver's door.

6 Q Okay.

7 (Whereupon, the witness resumed the witness stand.)

8 Q So actually, really, you can see four bullet defects  
9 in that photograph.

10 MR. GEOLY: Objection, Your Honor. Is that a  
11 question or testifying?

12 THE COURT: Sustained.

13 Q How -- how many bullet defects do you see in this  
14 photograph?

15 A Four.

16 Q Okay. Because I know -- I think I -- my question  
17 earlier, I think, maybe three bullet defects, but you  
18 just actually just counted four; is that correct?

19 A That's correct. I believe you were referring to the  
20 -- the fender and the actual door panel ---

21 Q Okay.

22 A --- at that point in time.

23 Q All right. And so are they all concentrated on the  
24 driver's side door?

25 A Yes, sir. They appear to be.

1 Q Okay. And so two of them are -- are lower-level  
2 bullet defects, correct?

3 A Yes, sir. On the fender. Yes.

4 Q Okay. So those are tire-level?

5 A Yes, sir.

6 Q But then, there are also two that are well above the  
7 tire level; is ---

8 A Yes, sir.

9 Q --- that correct?

10 A The one on the hood and the one above the mirror on  
11 the A post.

12 Q Okay. If you could, look at 26, Investigator  
13 Dickert. All right. What -- what is that?

14 A That's a -- an entry hole ---

15 Q Okay.

16 A --- into the driver's side door.

17 Q All right. That's actually a bullet hole.

18 A Yes, sir.

19 Q All right. And then, underneath that, on the  
20 ground, is -- is that suspected blood?

21 A Yes, sir. Those are what appear to be bloody  
22 footprints.

23 Q All right.

24 MR. DANIEL: I offer State's 26, Your Honor, for  
25 admission into evidence.

1 THE COURT: Any objection?

2 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

3 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 26 admitted into  
4 evidence without objection.

5 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 26 was entered into  
6 evidence.)

7 Q Okay. If you could, go to 38, please, Investigator.  
8 All right. You recognize that?

9 A You said 38?

10 Q 38, yes, sir.

11 A Yes, sir.

12 Q Okay. And what is that?

13 A That's a hole in the fender -- lower-fender area of  
14 the driver's side door -- not door -- but driver's side  
15 of the vehicle ---

16 Q That's ---

17 A --- just behind the wheel well.

18 Q Okay. And that's just a closer image of what we've  
19 already seen; is that correct?

20 A That's correct.

21 Q Okay.

22 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, 38 I'd offer for admission  
23 into evidence.

24 THE COURT: Any objection?

25 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

1 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 38 admitted into  
2 evidence without objection.

3 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 38 was entered into  
4 evidence.)

5 Q All right. And so you continued to search beyond  
6 just the driver-door area. You -- you've seen bullet  
7 defect on the hood and the driver-door area. Did you  
8 look elsewhere on the vehicle for more suspected bullet  
9 defects?

10 A Yes, sir. I checked the entire vehicle and located  
11 one area on the C post, which would be the area that is  
12 behind the rear door. So if you're looking at a vehicle,  
13 you have your front door and your back door. And it's  
14 typically that strip of metal is commonly referred to as  
15 a C post. There was a -- a hole present there as well.

16 Q Okay. Look at 27 for me, Investigator. Is that  
17 what you just described?

18 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

19 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 27 for  
20 admission into evidence.

21 THE COURT: Any objection?

22 MR. GEOLY: Without objection, Judge.

23 THE COURT: State's Exhibit No. 27 is admitted into  
24 evidence without objection.

25 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 27 was entered into

1 evidence.)

2 Q All right. If you could, just step down and point  
3 to the bullet defect that you just described.

4 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

5 A It's -- it's in this area right here.

6 Q That's what you call a C post?

7 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

8 Q And that's the driver's side rear-seat area?

9 A Yes, sir. That's -- that's correct.

10 Q That's an actual hole in the car?

11 A Yes, sir. That's -- that's a hole.

12 Q Not just a indention or imprint?

13 A No, sir. It's a hole.

14 Q Okay.

15 (Whereupon, the witness resumed the witness stand.)

16 Q If you could, look at State's 44, Investigator. Is  
17 that just another vantage point of the same -- same  
18 bullet hole?

19 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

20 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 44 for  
21 admission into evidence.

22 THE COURT: Any objection?

23 MR. GEOLY: Objection: cumulative, Your Honor.

24 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit No. 44  
25 admitted into evidence over defendant's objection.



1 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 44 was entered into  
2 evidence.)

3 Q All right. And did you actually -- did you search  
4 the interior of the vehicle?

5 A Yes, sir. Myself and the SLED crime scene  
6 technicians ---

7 Q Okay.

8 A --- searched the inside of the vehicle.

9 Q All right. State's 29, if you could look at that  
10 for me. And what -- do you recognize that?

11 A Yes, sir. That's a closer image of what we  
12 previously viewed as far as the -- the shoes and the  
13 blood. And just on the inside of the driver's side door,  
14 you can actually see where the plastic panel was broken.

15 Q Okay.

16 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I offer State's 29 for  
17 admission to evidence.

18 THE COURT: Any objection?

19 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

20 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 29 admitted into  
21 evidence without objection.

22 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 29 was entered into  
23 evidence.)

24 Q All right. And that is the driver's seat  
25 floorboard, correct?

1 A Yes, sir, that's the driver's seat floorboard.

2 Q Okay. And you described a -- a hole in the interior  
3 of the vehicle in ---

4 A Yes.

5 Q --- this photograph?

6 A Yes. You can see there. In the door the -- there's  
7 a piece of plastic that is broken away.

8 Q Please step down and just point to that for the  
9 jury.

10 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

11 A It's right here in this area.

12 (Whereupon, the witness resumed the witness stand.)

13 Q And that -- would that -- would that be consistent  
14 with the -- the shot that would've struck Ms. Indigo in  
15 the leg?

16 A Yes, sir. I -- I felt that it was consistent.

17 Q All right. State's 30, recognize that?

18 A Yes, sir. That's a -- a photograph of the actual  
19 door panel itself.

20 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I offer State's 30 for  
21 admission to evidence.

22 THE COURT: Any objection?

23 MR. GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence one moment,  
24 Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: All right.

1 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Judge.

2 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 30 admitted into  
3 evidence without objection.

4 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 30 was entered into  
5 evidence.)

6 Q All right. Did you go to the backseat area to  
7 document anything?

8 A Yes, sir. We did. We photographed everything.  
9 There was -- appeared to be two children's coats on the  
10 back there. There was blood on the seat as well as the  
11 coats as well.

12 Q Okay. Do you recognize State's 23?

13 A Yes, sir.

14 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 23 for  
15 admission to evidence.

16 THE COURT: Any objection?

17 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

18 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 23 is admitted into  
19 evidence without objection.

20 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 23 was entered into  
21 evidence.)

22 Q Okay. And you described children's coats and blood  
23 being in the backseat area?

24 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

25 Q Excuse me. All right. Go to 28, Investigator. Do

1 you recognize that?

2 A Yes, sir. That's just a -- it's a more direct  
3 photograph of the back seat.

4 Q All right.

5 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I -- I'd offer State's 28  
6 for admission into evidence.

7 THE COURT: Any objection?

8 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

9 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 28 is admitted into  
10 evidence without objection.

11 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 28 was entered into  
12 evidence.)

13 Q All right. Go to 32, please. You recognize that?

14 A I do.

15 Q And what is that?

16 A It's a picture from the rear window of the vehicle,  
17 looking back towards the driver's side C post. And you  
18 can see a hole in the plastic. It would be on the  
19 interior of the vehicle.

20 Q And why did you document that?

21 A Because at that point in time, I felt that -- that  
22 hole there corresponded with the -- the hole that was on  
23 the exterior of the vehicle.

24 Q And do you believe -- and -- and you had spoken to  
25 Indigo and ascertained the seating arrangements of the

1 children; is that correct?

2 A Yes, sir. The best that she could provide.

3 Q Okay.

4 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I offer State's 32 for  
5 admission to evidence.

6 THE COURT: Any objection?

7 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir, Judge. May we approach, Your  
8 Honor?

9 THE COURT: All right.

10 (Whereupon, a bench conference was held off the  
11 record in the presence of the jury, but out of the  
12 hearing of the jury.)

13 Q All right. I may have -- I may have jumped ahead.  
14 I'm sorry.

15 MR. DANIEL: Did I offer State's 32 for admission to  
16 evidence, Your Honor?

17 THE COURT: You did.

18 MR. DANIEL: Okay.

19 THE COURT: And he raised -- raised the objection,  
20 which I sustain at this point in time.

21 MR. DANIEL: All right.

22 Q State's 32, you -- you recognize that to be a bullet  
23 hole in the interior of the -- the back seat, correct?

24 A Yes, sir.

25 Q Above the C post?

1 A Up -- on the C post.

2 Q On the C post. Excuse me.

3 A Correct.

4 Q And you believe that interior, suspected bullet hole  
5 corresponded to a photograph we've already seen on the  
6 outside of the C post ---

7 A Yes, sir. That is correct.

8 Q All right.

9 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 32 for  
10 admission in evidence.

11 THE COURT: Any objection?

12 MR. GEOLY: No -- no, sir, Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: Okay. All right. State's Exhibit 32 is  
14 admitted into evidence without objection.

15 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 32 was entered into  
16 evidence.)

17 Q All right. Investigator, if you could, just step  
18 down and identify the suspected bullet hole in the  
19 interior of the C post.

20 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

21 A It's in this area right here.

22 Q And why is that significant to this investigation?

23 (Whereupon, the witness resumed the witness stand.)

24 A Based off the information that we had received from  
25 Indigo in the hospital; and, obviously, the -- the

1 children being in the back seat, the -- the injury to  
 2 Iven being a -- a -- a shot that was fired from a gun to  
 3 -- and it ended up striking him in the head that it was  
 4 important. Because it would at least show where he was  
 5 sitting and where the bullet came from.

6 Q So -- so you believe that was the corresponding  
 7 bullet hole to the -- to the gunshot wound of the head  
 8 that Iven sustained?

9 A That's correct.

10 Q Okay. All right. If you could, look at State's 33.  
 11 And that -- and what is that?

12 A It's just a closer view of the -- the -- the hole.

13 Q All right.

14 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer 33 for admission  
 15 to evidence.

16 THE COURT: Any objection?

17 MR. GEOLY: Objection to cumulative, Judge. It  
 18 looks like it's the same photo.

19 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 33 admitted  
 20 into evidence over defendant's objection.

21 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 33 was entered into  
 22 evidence.)

23 Q There we get a better -- better picture.

24 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

25 Q Okay. And then, I want to go to 37. It's already

1 been admitted into evidence. All right. Describe this  
2 for us, this -- did you produce this -- this diagram of  
3 the seating arrangements in the Toyota Camry?

4 A Yes, sir.

5 Q Okay. Describe this for us.

6 A Based off the information that we were able to  
7 obtain from Indigo at the time, trying to, more or less,  
8 reconstruct where the children were sitting in the  
9 vehicle, I used this diagram to -- to at least help, in  
10 my mind, lay out where the children would've been  
11 located.

12 Q Okay. Step down and -- and -- and outline for us  
13 the parties and where they're seated.

14 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

15 A Indigo would've been in the driver's seat.  
16 According to the information that we had received at that  
17 time, Penelope Davis and Xzavier Davis, Jr., would've  
18 been behind the -- the driver's seat. And Mr. Iven  
19 Caldwell would've been somewhere in the -- the middle of  
20 the -- the rear seat.

21 (Whereupon, the witness resumed the witness stand.)

22 Q All right. And you documented with your photographs  
23 of the back seat. You said there was -- there was  
24 suspected blood in the -- the backseat area?

25 A That -- yes, sir. That's correct.



1 Q Where was the most concentration of that blood in  
2 the back seat?

3 A The center area of the seat.

4 Q And according to that diagram, that -- that's where  
5 Iven was seated?

6 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

7 Q Okay. All right. If you could -- it's already in  
8 evidence. I will -- excuse me. Let me stop myself  
9 there.

10 All right. So at that point in time, SLED  
11 eventually arrives at the hospital -- is that correct? --  
12 to help process the crime scene?

13 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

14 Q Or process the -- the vehicle, which is at the  
15 hospital; is that correct?

16 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

17 Q All right. But eventually, do you go out to [REDACTED]  
18 [REDACTED]?

19 A Yes, sir. Once we completed processing the vehicle  
20 at the hospital, we did respond to [REDACTED].

21 Q All right. So Phase I of the investigation is just  
22 processing the Toyota Camry at the hospital; is that  
23 correct?

24 A Would probably -- more Phase III, because I and II  
25 were the victims that were in the hospital and the

1 vehicle would've potentially been Phase III, if you want  
2 to title it with something. And then, the house would've  
3 been a -- a Phase IV.

4 Q Okay. But -- but phase -- I guess I'm -- Phase I is  
5 everything that happened at the hospital, right?

6 A Okay. Yes, sir. That's correct.

7 Q And Phase II of your investigation is going out to  
8 the actual scene of the shooting at [REDACTED]?

9 MR. GEOLY: Objection ---

10 A Yes, sir. That ---

11 MR. GEOLY: --- Your Honor.

12 A --- would be correct.

13 MR. GEOLY: He just testified that that was Scene  
14 IV, not -- or -- or -- I mean, not II, and now he's  
15 asking was it II. I mean, he -- he testified contrary to  
16 that.

17 THE COURT: All right. Overruled. I'll allow that.  
18 Go ahead.

19 Q All right, Investigator. I want to show you 91  
20 through 94. It's already been admitted into evidence.

21 MR. DANIEL: So, Mr. Bentley, just start with 91.

22 Q All right. And just take us through these  
23 photographs, Investigator Dickert.

24 A This is a photograph of the residence of actually  
25 631 [REDACTED] with the mailbox for [REDACTED]

1 being present and a shared driveway between the two  
2 residences.

3 Q Okay. 92 just shows the common driveway?

4 A It shows the residence of 631 and 633 now, as well  
5 as the common driveway.

6 Q All right. 90 -- 93?

7 A The same photograph. It actually shows the -- more  
8 of the residence of [REDACTED].

9 Q All right. 94?

10 A The shared driveway between the two residences.

11 Q All right. All right. And if you could, look at  
12 State's 14. You recognize that?

13 A Yes, sir. That's an aerial photograph of [REDACTED]  
14 [REDACTED]. And 633 is actually circled.

15 Q Okay. That's an aerial of the -- of the crime  
16 scene?

17 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

18 Q All right. And that's a fair and accurate  
19 representation of the crime scene from an aerial vantage  
20 point, correct?

21 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

22 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 14 for  
23 admission to evidence.

24 THE COURT: Any objection?

25 MR. GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence one moment,

1 Your Honor. No objection, Judge.

2 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 14 is  
3 admitted into evidence without objection.

4 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 14 was entered into  
5 evidence.)

6 Q All right. And just -- and based on your  
7 understanding -- if you could, step down, Investigator.

8 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

9 Q And point to 631 [REDACTED] -- or excuse me -- [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED].

11 A [REDACTED] would be this residence right here.

12 Q All right. And where is 631 [REDACTED]?

13 A This residence right here.

14 Q All right. Who lives at 631 [REDACTED]?

15 (Whereupon, the witness resumed the witness stand.)

16 A Mr. Wallace and Ms. Vinnie Hunter ---

17 Q Okay.

18 A --- her parents -- Indigo's parents.

19 Q All right. And based on your information, Indigo  
20 Penny and Xzavier Davis lived at [REDACTED].

21 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

22 Q And there's that common driveway.

23 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

24 Q And based on your investigation, where is your  
25 understanding -- the Toyota Camry that you photographed

1 at the hospital, where was that originally parked on the  
2 date in question?

3 A In front of the residence. There was an -- an area  
4 that you could tell that vehicles had been previously  
5 parked. The grass hadn't really grown there.

6 And I think we had gotten some rain earlier in the  
7 day. So it was somewhat muddy, and you could see some  
8 tire impressions there.

9 Q Okay. Point to -- point to that where the car  
10 would've been parked, based on your understanding.

11 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

12 A It would've been in this area right -- right here at  
13 the front of the house.

14 Q Okay. All right. If you could, go to 156. That's  
15 in evidence, I believe. Do you recognize that  
16 photograph?

17 A Yes, sir. I do.

18 Q Now, I know I'm jumping ahead. But SLED crime scene  
19 agents, they did a bulk of the -- the processing of the  
20 scene -- photographs, collecting forensic evidence -- is  
21 that right?

22 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

23 Q All right. Tell us what 156 is. It's already in  
24 evidence, so ---

25 A 156 is a photograph of the green storage container

1 that was located at the back door. There was a brown  
2 paper bag that had -- I would -- it's -- it was a yellow  
3 piece of paper, a receipt, and -- as well as a -- an  
4 ammunition box and a gun lock.

5 Q Okay. So you examined the contents of that bag?

6 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

7 Q All right. And there was an empty box of  
8 ammunition?

9 A Honestly, I -- I don't know.

10 Q Okay. All right. I want to go to -- look at 159,  
11 Investigator. Do you recognize that?

12 A Yes, sir, I do.

13 Q What is that?

14 A It's a receipt from th Village Pawnshop for the  
15 amount of \$223.63 from a purchase that was made July 16,  
16 2018.

17 Q Okay. And where was that located?

18 A Village Pawnshop, which would be on Wilson Road in  
19 Newberry city's ---

20 Q Okay. And they're a firearms dealer?

21 A Yes, sir.

22 Q But where did you locate that actual receipt?

23 A That receipt was in the brown bag that was in the  
24 green container that was located at the back door.

25 Q Okay. So it's in that picture right there, that

1 receipt?

2 A Yes, sir, that receipt right there. Yes.

3 Q All right.

4 MR. DANIEL: Well, then, Your Honor, I'd offer  
5 State's 159 for admission to evidence.

6 THE COURT: Any objection?

7 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

8 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 159 is  
9 admitted into evidence without objection.

10 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 159 was entered into  
11 evidence.)

12 MR. DANIEL: And -- and, Mr. Bentley, if you could,  
13 just zoom in on the receipt.

14 Q All right. And that just -- that has Xzavier  
15 Davis's name on it, correct?

16 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

17 Q A \$223 purchase, right?

18 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

19 Q And it says Village Pawnshop?

20 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

21 Q All right. Did you follow up on -- did you  
22 investigate anything as it pertained to that receipt?

23 A Yes, sir. I actually called the -- the pawnshop and  
24 spoke with the -- the manager, Katie, about this receipt  
25 to see what information they could provide in reference

1 to what was purchased and get a copy of that receipt as  
2 well.

3 Q Okay. So you -- you -- you contact an employee at  
4 Village Pawnshop by the name of Katie?

5 A Yes, sir.

6 Q Do you have her full name?

7 A Katie Perry.

8 Q Not -- not the singer.

9 A No, sir.

10 Q Okay. All right. So Katie Perry. Was -- and she  
11 was able to furnish you a transaction receipt?

12 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

13 Q All right. I want to show you -- or excuse me -- I  
14 want you to look at State's No. 2. Do you recognize No.  
15 2?

16 A Yes, sir. It's a copy of the sales receipt from  
17 7/16/2018 where Xzavier Davis purchased a firearm.

18 Q Okay. What kind of firearm did he purchase?

19 A It was a Taurus 709 Slim, a 9-millimeter handgun.

20 Q Okay. And this is a -- a business record that  
21 Village Pawnshop maintains in their regular course of  
22 business to maintain these type of records.

23 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

24 Q All right.

25 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's No. 2 for



1 admission to evidence.

2 THE COURT: Any objection?

3 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

4 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 2 is  
5 admitted into evidence without objection.

6 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 2 was entered into  
7 evidence.)

8 Q All right. So you said that -- it indicated the  
9 handgun was purchased in July of 2018?

10 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

11 Q All right. That's on the receipt. It says Xzavier  
12 Davis was the purchaser of the 9-millimeter firearm?

13 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

14 Q Does it provide the serial number of the firearm?

15 A Yes, sir. It does.

16 Q Did that serial number match what's in evidence  
17 already as State's No. 9?

18 A Yes, sir. It did.

19 Q All right. And that's the 9-millimeter handgun?

20 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

21 Q Okay. All right. And defense attorney alluded to  
22 this in opening statements and his questioning of  
23 previous witnesses. But Indigo Penny and Xzavier Davis,  
24 they're married; is that true?

25 A Yes, sir. That's my understanding.

1 Q Okay. And the fact that we're referring to her as  
2 Indigo Penny, we're not questioning the validity of their  
3 marriage, are we?

4 A No, sir.

5 Q So why was -- what do we still have Indigo Penny in  
6 the records?

7 A All our records from the hospital showed Indigo  
8 Penny. DMV record showed Indigo Penny. And then, our  
9 in-house records all show Indigo Penny. So my  
10 assumption, based off the DMV, is that she hasn't gone  
11 through the process to change her last name.

12 Q Okay. So she could still have the marriage license;  
13 she just hadn't changed her name with DMV, Social  
14 Security, things like that?

15 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

16 Q Okay. So that's all that is; that's why we're  
17 referring to her still as Indigo Penny.

18 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

19 Q All right. And how far is it from [REDACTED]  
20 to the Newberry Hospital?

21 A Approximately 3.1 miles.

22 Q Okay. So it was very close.

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q And how old -- and you have information-database  
25 access. How -- how old are -- is Xzavier Davis?

1 A His date of birth is 3 -- 3/5 of '93, so that  
2 would've made him 26 at -- you talking about the incident  
3 ---

4 Q Yeah. How ---

5 A --- date?

6 Q --- old was Xzavier Davis on the -- the date of the  
7 incident in question?

8 A Twenty-six, I believe.

9 Q And you -- you said his birthday was when?

10 A 3/5 of '93.

11 Q So he's 26 years old?

12 A That's correct.

13 Q How old was Ms. Indigo Penny on the date in  
14 question?

15 A Her date of birth was 4/22 of '91. So that would've  
16 made her 27, I believe, almost 28.

17 Q Okay. 4/22/91 was Indigo Penny's?

18 A Yes, sir.

19 Q Okay. So she was just shy of 28. And did -- did  
20 --- both records indicate that they both lived at [REDACTED]

[REDACTED], correct?

22 A Yes, sir. I believe -- which records are we talking  
23 about?

24 Q Just it -- your records for your database, DMV.

25 A Yes, sir. That's ---

1 Q Okay.

2 A The records from our database, yes.

3 Q Okay. All right. Please answer ---

4 MR. DANIEL: Beg the Court's indulgence.

5 (Off the record briefly.)

6 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, may we approach?

7 THE COURT: All right.

8 (Whereupon, a bench conference was held off the  
9 record in the presence of the jury, but out of the  
10 hearing of the jury.)

11 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen, we've  
12 been at it a little while. I'm going to go ahead and  
13 we're going to take our morning break. I'm going to  
14 excuse you back to the jury room for about 10 or 15  
15 minutes; give you an opportunity to stretch your legs,  
16 get something to drink, whatever the case may be.

17 Do not discuss the case, even among yourselves.  
18 Don't conduct any independent investigations. We'll take  
19 about a 10- or 15-minute break, and then we'll bring you  
20 back in just a minute.

21 Everybody else, please remain seated while the jury  
22 is excused.

23 (Whereupon, the jury exited the courtroom at 11:15  
24 a.m.)

25 (Off the record briefly.)

1 THE COURT: All right. Yeah. If anybody needs to  
2 be excused from the courtroom, they can go ahead and be  
3 excused now. That'll be fine.

4 All right. Do we want to go ahead and review a  
5 portion right now?

6 (Off the record briefly.)

7 (Whereupon, a portion of video was played for in-  
8 camera review by the Court.)

9 (Off the record briefly.)

10 THE COURT: Just show me what you want introduced.

11 MR. DANIEL: I think that's all she says, in terms  
12 of actually the kids were crying ---

13 THE COURT: Give me ---

14 MR. DANIEL: --- that four second.

15 THE COURT: Give me the portion. If I granted your  
16 motion and introduced everything you wanted introduced,  
17 show me what you'd want to do.

18 MR. DANIEL: Yes, sir.

19 (Off the record briefly.)

20 (Whereupon, a portion of video was played for in-  
21 camera review by the Court.)

22 MR. DANIEL: That was about four seconds, Judge.

23 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I -- I mean, now -- now that  
24 we've heard this, I'd -- I'd like to make the record a  
25 little more complete. They asked her was she crying

1 they're getting in the car. She's describing there out  
2 the back door when he shoots the gun. There -- there's  
3 some lapse between there and her actually putting them in  
4 the car.

5 Because where she's talking about there, she's in  
6 the back; he's shooting in the air; and the kids are  
7 crying and whatnot, she says. Then she has to continue  
8 around the house, the driveway to the front -- well, you  
9 know, she's at the back porch when all that's happening.  
10 Then she get the car -- kids in the car in the front.

11 And what she said yesterday was: "I'm remembering  
12 now. I don't remember them crying when they're getting  
13 in the car," is -- is what I recall her saying. This is  
14 talking about out the back of the house, she says they're  
15 crying. I don't think that's a prior inconsistent  
16 statement.

17 THE COURT: All right. Well, let's go back a little  
18 bit further, because I -- I didn't pick up on that. Let  
19 me -- let's go back a little bit before that so we can  
20 talk about what she's talking about.

21 (Off the record briefly.)

22 (Whereupon, a portion of video was played for in-  
23 camera review by the Court.)

24 MR. STUMBO: Judge, I think the -- the -- the --  
25 what -- the scene that she described there is

1 extraordinarily inconsistent with what she described on  
2 the stand yesterday, which is why I asked her: "Did you  
3 tell law enforcement before that they were crying and  
4 upset?" And I -- there again, I -- I can't remember word  
5 for word what Ms. Nevers told us yesterday when she said:  
6 "No. I don't remember that; that was two years ago" or  
7 something to that effect.

8 And I said: "So you're denying you told law  
9 enforcement that she was -- when they -- the kids were  
10 crying?"

11 And she said -- I -- I think, there again, just --  
12 just kind of a equivocation of it. I don't -- I can't  
13 remember exactly how she responded. But she didn't admit  
14 to it, for sure.

15 THE COURT: Well, see, that's -- that's the critical  
16 point, is how did she respond to it? Is this a prior  
17 inconsistent statement? You're saying she said they were  
18 not crying. He's saying that I don't remember.

19 MR. STUMBO: Well, I think Mr. Geoly just said --  
20 and I -- I -- my recollection would be correct too. The  
21 last question was: "So you deny that they were crying?"

22 And she said: "No. They weren't crying," which,  
23 there again, is very inconsistent with what she said in  
24 this interview. So I ---

25 THE COURT: I mean ---

1 MR. STUMBO: --- I think she certainly equivocated;  
2 did not admit to the statement that she made before,  
3 which ---

4 THE COURT: Can you ---

5 MR. STUMBO: --- was certainly inconsistent with the  
6 kids were crying.

7 THE COURT: Hold for a second.

8 Madam court reporter, can you get us what her  
9 testimony was?

10 (Off the record briefly.)

11 THE COURT: All right. Y'all listen up.

12 Start with his question, the solicitor's question.

13 (Whereupon, the court reporter read back the  
14 requested portion of testimony.)

15 THE COURT: All right. Well ---

16 MR. GEOLY: If I might, Judge, the difference in --  
17 in the two statements: When she's talking in the  
18 interview on the body cam, she's talking about right as  
19 they walk out the door. He's asking about their demeanor  
20 as they're in the car.

21 We're literally talking about at least a 20-second  
22 different from her when she's out the house and he's  
23 saying he shoots -- remember, she talks about where the  
24 crumbling concrete or whatever, that's on the back side.  
25 She has to walk all the way around the trailer to the --



1 I don't think that that is necessarily an inconsistent  
2 statement at all.

3 THE COURT: Well, and you might be right. But I'll  
4 let you address that on cross-examination.

5 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: I mean, so that's something you can  
7 definitely bring out on cross-examination.

8 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

9 MR. STUMBO: And that ---

10 THE COURT: So ---

11 MR. STUMBO: --- would be my argument, Judge. It  
12 goes to weight, rather than the admissibility, what he's  
13 arguing at this point.

14 THE COURT: Well, I mean, I'm going to allow you to  
15 go to the part where she's saying that he goes bang and  
16 the children are crying. That's it.

17 MR. STUMBO: Okay.

18 THE COURT: Now, you know, and then, on cross-  
19 examination, they're arguing it's a prior inconsistent  
20 statement. You can show that it's not a prior  
21 inconsistent statement by you're talking about two  
22 completely different times.

23 I can't tell. That's going to be up for the jury to  
24 decide.

25 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

1 THE COURT: All right?

2 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

3 THE COURT: All right. Anything before we take a  
4 break?

5 (Off the record briefly.)

6 MR. STUMBO: Yeah. So what I think -- what -- what  
7 His Honor is saying is when she says that he was -- had  
8 the gun in his hand, bang -- so when ---

9 THE COURT: When he ---

10 MR. STUMBO: --- she's saying ---

11 THE COURT: --- fired in the air.

12 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

13 THE COURT: Yeah.

14 MR. STUMBO: When he ---

15 THE COURT: When he -- when -- that kind of gives  
16 you the context.

17 MR. STUMBO: Yeah.

18 THE COURT: That -- it's like -- I think it was,  
19 like, he came out the back door, bang -- or whatever you  
20 said right before he held the gun and went bang and the  
21 kids were crying.

22 MR. GEOLY: Right.

23 MR. STUMBO: And then, just pause it there.

24 THE COURT: Yeah.

25 MR. STUMBO: Okay.

1 THE COURT: All right.

2 MR. GEOLY: Thank you, Judge.

3 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state  
4 before we take about a 10-minute recess?

5 MR. STUMBO: Nothing from the state, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

7 MR. GEOLY: Judge, just in anticipation of us  
8 potentially having to argue some law this afternoon, this  
9 is Mike Gambrell. He's a lawyer out of Greenville.  
10 We've had a lot going on. So I just brought him to  
11 assist me, if -- if we get that far. I don't know that  
12 we will. But -- but he may end up assisting, if -- if we  
13 get in a position of having to argue some law Your Honor.  
14 But otherwise, he -- he's not involved.

15 THE COURT: Okay. As long as he's not participating  
16 in front of the jury ---

17 MR. GEOLY: He's not, Judge.

18 THE COURT: --- or anything. Okay.

19 MR. GEOLY: No, sir.

20 THE COURT: That's good. Thank you.

21 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

22 THE COURT: All right. Let's take about a 10-minute  
23 recess.

24 (The Court went off the record at 11:28 a.m.)

25 (The Court went on the record at 11:44 a.m.)

1 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state  
2 before we bring the jury in?

3 MR STUMBO: Nothing from the state, Your Honor.

4 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

5 MR STUMBO: Nothing for the defendant, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: All right. Let's bring the jury in.

7 (Off the record briefly.)

8 (Whereupon, the jury entered the courtroom at 11:46  
9 a.m.)

10 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen,  
11 welcome back. We're ready to continue with the trial of  
12 this case.

13 Mr. Daniel, you can continue with your direct  
14 examination.

15 MR DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor.

16 DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED

17 BY MR. DANIEL:

18 Q All right. Investigator Dickert, I think we left  
19 off on the sales receipt for the purchase of that 9-  
20 millimeter handgun; is that correct?

21 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

22 Q Okay. And lastly, so SLED assisted with the crime  
23 scene investigation, correct?

24 A That's correct.

25 Q And going back to Iven Caldwell, he had to be

1 transferred from Newberry Hospital to another hospital to  
2 treat his injuries?

3 A Yes, sir. I believe he was transported to  
4 Richland's Children.

5 Q Okay. When was he officially pronounced deceased?

6 A Give me just a second. According to my notes, I  
7 received a phone call on 4/22/2019 at approximately 2:54  
8 p.m., advising that he was no longer alive.

9 Q All right. And -- and speak up just a little bit.  
10 But you -- you said that you received notification that  
11 he had been pronounced deceased April 22nd, that  
12 afternoon?

13 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

14 Q So -- okay. Early-morning hours on April 20th of --  
15 that's when he sustained the -- the shot to the head,  
16 correct?

17 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

18 Q And then, April 22nd -- that would be on a Monday at  
19 that point, correct?

20 A Yes, sir. I believe you're right.

21 Q That afternoon he is pronounced deceased at the  
22 Columbia hospital?

23 A Yes, sir. I believe it's Richland but ---

24 Q Okay. And when was his body examined by a  
25 pathologist to determine cause of death?

1 A I would have to look back at my notes. But I would  
2 assume it was probably the 23rd.

3 Q And did you attend the autopsy?

4 A I did not.

5 Q Did SLED attend the autopsy?

6 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

7 Q Okay. And this is going back, I know. Well, it's  
8 actually -- in terms of your investigation, did you ever  
9 -- did you follow up with Indigo Penny once she was  
10 discharged from the hospital to interview her about the  
11 events at April 20th?

12 A Yes, sir. We spoke with her on a couple different  
13 occasions: either went to her house and spoke with her  
14 or asked her to come to the office to speak with us.

15 Q Okay. Do you -- according to your records, did  
16 Indigo Penny ever come in to the sheriff's office after  
17 the incident for a follow-up interview?

18 A Yes, sir. Like I said previously, we had a couple  
19 different meetings with her at -- at the office.

20 Q All right. Does April 29th of 2019 -- do you have  
21 any indications that Indigo came to the sheriff's office  
22 for a follow-up interview?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q Okay.

25 A According to body-cam footage.

1 Q All right. You conducted that interview with  
2 Indigo?

3 A Yes, sir.

4 Q All right. And where was that?

5 A It would've been in the investigations suite at the  
6 sheriff's office.

7 Q And it was recorded with your body-worn camera?

8 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

9 Q Okay. And when Indigo testified, Solicitor Stumbo,  
10 on his direct examination, asked her a question related  
11 to the condition of her children, whether they were  
12 crying at some point just prior to -- to the -- to the  
13 shots being fired; is that correct?

14 A I believe that's correct.

15 Q Okay. So at some point in time, when she's leaving  
16 with the children, Solicitor Stumbo asked her about  
17 whether the children were crying; is that correct?

18 A Yes, sir. I believe ---

19 Q All right. And ---

20 A --- yeah.

21 Q --- she indicated on the witness stand that no, her  
22 children were not crying; is that correct?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q All right. But on April 29th, 2019, interview at  
25 the sheriff's office that you conducted, did Indigo

1 indicate that her children were crying at that point in  
2 time when she's fleeing the scene in the car?

3 A Yes, sir. She indicated that her children were  
4 crying as she was exiting the residence and going around  
5 to the her vehicle.

6 Q Okay. But she denied on the witness stand ever  
7 telling y'all that her children were crying at that point  
8 in time; is that correct?

9 A I believe you're correct.

10 Q All right. And I'm going to show you what's been  
11 marked for ID purposes as State's 174. It's a disc. Do  
12 you recognize this?

13 A Yes, sir.

14 Q All right. And what is that?

15 A It would be a disc that contains either multiple  
16 body cams or this particular body cam on -- just depends  
17 on the size.

18 Q Okay. Does it contain that portion of the interview  
19 discussing on April 29th her kids crying?

20 A Yes, sir.

21 Q Okay.

22 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, at this time, I -- I'd ask  
23 for permission under Rule 613 to play that portion of  
24 this interview related to the prior inconsistent  
25 statement.



1 THE COURT: Well, first, you're going to have to  
2 introduce it into evidence.

3 Any objection to it coming into evidence?

4 MR. GEOLY: I have no objection to the part coming  
5 into evidence that he's intending to play, Judge. I -- I  
6 -- my understanding is there's several things --  
7 apologize to the Court.

8 THE COURT: I understand. I understand. Okay. So  
9 that brief portion we'll admit into ---

10 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

11 THE COURT: --- evidence. Okay.

12 MR. DANIEL: Yes, sir. Subject to the -- the motion  
13 in limine, that particular portion, and we would offer  
14 that into evidence.

15 THE COURT: All right. Without objection.

16 (Whereupon, a limited portion of State's Exhibit 174  
17 was entered into evidence.)

18 MR. DANIEL: All right. Mr. Bentley, if you could,  
19 play that particular portion.

20 (Whereupon, a portion of video was published in open  
21 court.)

22 Q That was very brief, right?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, could everybody in the jury  
25 hear that? I -- I don't know if ---

1 THE COURT: Well, you've already played it. Let's

2 ---

3 MR. DANIEL: Okay.

4 THE COURT: --- go ahead.

5 MR. DANIEL: Okay.

6 Q All right.

7 MR. DANIEL: Beg the Court's indulgence.

8 Q All right. Investigator Dickert, please answer any  
9 questions Mr. Geoly has.

10 A Okay.

11 CROSS-EXAMINATION

12 BY MR. GEOLY:

13 Q Hey, Investigator Dickert. How are you?

14 A Good.

15 Q You've been here the entire time, right? I mean, I

16 ---

17 A Yes.

18 Q --- people have been coming and going from the --  
19 the courtroom, but -- but you're the lead investigator;  
20 you've been here this whole time to listen to everybody,  
21 right?

22 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

23 Q Okay. And I guess this last little video part was  
24 to clarify that at some point Ms. Indigo had told you --  
25 or I guess she testified yesterday the kids weren't

1 crying as they were being put in the car; is that  
2 correct?

3 A Yes, sir. I believe you're correct.

4 Q Okay. Now, when she's describing what's happening  
5 right there, she's actually talking about as they go out  
6 the back door and he unloads the -- the first pistol into  
7 the air; is that correct?

8 A It would be at the point where they're going to the  
9 car. Yes.

10 Q But clearly, when she says they're crying, they're  
11 not to the vehicle yet, right? They're out the back door  
12 kind of at the corner of the trailer ---

13 A Your speculation is as good as mine. I just know  
14 ---

15 Q Well ---

16 A --- that they ---

17 Q --- she actually ---

18 A --- were ---

19 Q --- says in that tape, doesn't she, that it's by the  
20 crumbled little concrete area that's -- that's along the  
21 side, right?

22 A Around -- or going to the house ---

23 Q Right.

24 A --- running around the house.

25 Q Right. And she got to walk past that to the

1 driveway, around to the front where the front porch is,  
2 b. to get to the car, right?

3 A I would agree to that.

4 Q Okay. So if she thinks back and thinks to as she's  
5 getting them in the car and they're not crying and that's  
6 what she did yesterday, that's not necessarily  
7 inconsistent at all, is it?

8 A From the point that they were ---

9 Q The fact they're ---

10 A --- crying when they ---

11 Q --- crying in ---

12 A --- went out ---

13 Q --- the back ---

14 A --- the house?

15 Q --- when they come out and shoots a gun in the air  
16 does ---

17 A Right.

18 Q --- not mean when she has them -- putting them in,  
19 as she says, the vehicle. They're listening to her. At  
20 that point she said they weren't crying. That's not  
21 necessarily inconsistent at all, is it?

22 A If that's your belief.

23 Q Well, what about your belief? Isn't your belief  
24 that ---

25 A I ---

1 Q --- he could be crying in the back but not crying by

2 ---

3 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor ---

4 Q --- by the time they're in the car?

5 MR. DANIEL: Objection to the form of that question

6 ---

7 MR. GEOLY: Your Honor ---

8 MR. DANIEL: --- Your Honor.

9 MR. GEOLY: --- he -- he ---

10 THE COURT: Overruled. Go ahead. Ask it.

11 A I would have a hard time believing that if the  
12 children were crying as she left the back of the house  
13 after a gun was fired, that they were -- just suddenly  
14 stopped crying as they got to the car.

15 Q Did you see how suddenly Xzavier started crying when  
16 you walked in the room and asked him how he was?

17 A I do.

18 Q And then ---

19 A I do.

20 Q --- he -- when the nurse grabbed him, he immediately  
21 stopped, didn't he?

22 A You're right. Because that was his -- that was his  
23 comfort.

24 Q Can happen in an instant, can't it?

25 A (No audible response.)

1 Q Can't it?

2 A I wouldn't agree ---

3 Q It's ---

4 A --- to that.

5 Q --- all right. I mean ---

6 A Not -- not in that situation. I wouldn't ---

7 Q All right.

8 A --- agree ---

9 Q But ---

10 A --- to that.

11 Q --- and -- and from the back of that trailer to the  
12 front, putting them in the car, that's certainly not in  
13 an instant, is it? It's longer than an instant.

14 A A couple seconds, I -- I would say.

15 Q Couple? To walk from the back to the front and get  
16 three kids in a car? Couple of seconds?

17 A If you're being shot at, I would assume that she was  
18 ---

19 Q Okay. Well, she wasn't being shot at. She told you  
20 clearly she wasn't being shot at; he ---

21 A If ---

22 Q --- shot in the air, right?

23 A If a gun was fired behind me, I ---

24 Q Right.

25 A --- would assume ---

1 Q No.

2 A --- that ---

3 Q And -- and into ---

4 A --- she would be ---

5 Q --- the air.

6 A --- hurrying.

7 Q Didn't recover any of those bullets, right?

8 A The bullets?

9 Q Right.

10 A No.

11 Q Okay. Don't think they were shot at her. She  
12 testified that they weren't, right?

13 A Right.

14 Q Okay.

15 MR. GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence one moment,  
16 Your Honor.

17 THE COURT: All right.

18 (Off the record briefly.)

19 Q Have -- have you reviewed these videotapes in  
20 preparation for your testimony today?

21 A I've reviewed some.

22 Q Okay. The -- this one that we just went to, that  
23 that's a portion of, I mean, do -- do you remember that  
24 one? Have you reviewed that one?

25 A I'm sure at some point in time. Yes.

1 Q And -- and that is actually nine days after this  
2 incident occurred, right?

3 A That would be correct. Yes.

4 Q Okay. Did you inquire, when you're interviewing her  
5 or debriefing her, whatever y'all would call that, as to  
6 whether or not she was on any pain medication at that  
7 time for her injuries?

8 A I'm sure she was probably on antibiotics and maybe  
9 something for the pain. But no, we didn't expressly ask  
10 her.

11 Q You didn't ask her whether she was under the  
12 influence of any narcotics that were prescribed by a  
13 doctor at that point?

14 A No, sir. We didn't.

15 Q Okay. She seem coherent to you?

16 A She did.

17 Q Okay. Do you remember, at some point in the  
18 investigation, she's asking you about -- or y'all are  
19 talking about -- you just talked her, I think, actually,  
20 about that at some point he may try for a bond? This was  
21 nine days after this happened. Do you remember that?

22 A I don't remember that particular point. No, I  
23 don't.

24 Q Do you remember talking to her about DSS?

25 A I'm sure that we did. Yes.



1 Q And the fact that you wouldn't necessarily have a  
2 problem, but that DSS would be liable to try and take  
3 custody of her kids if she visited with Xzavier?

4 A Yes, sir. It was possible, since they were  
5 involved.

6 Q So essentially, you -- you kind of threatened her  
7 that: "DSS could come try and take your kids if -- if  
8 you visit your husband or you allow you kids to visit  
9 with him"?

10 MR. DANIEL: Objection, that's a ---

11 Q They're not ---

12 MR. DANIEL: --- a little argumentative, Your Honor,  
13 that ---

14 THE COURT: Overruled.

15 MR. DANIEL: --- they threatened ---

16 THE COURT: Go ahead.

17 A No, sir. I wouldn't call it a threat.

18 Q Just making her aware?

19 A I -- well, yes. I wanted her to be aware that these  
20 are the possibilities, should you choose to do this.

21 Q Because she was the victim of an alleged murder at  
22 that point; her -- her 7-year-old was dead, right?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q She's been ---

25 A That's correct.

1 Q --- shot by herself. You bring her in for a meeting  
2 debriefing, and then discuss with her that potentially,  
3 if she tries to visit her husband, she's liable to lose  
4 her kids to DSS.

5 A She wouldn't have been allowed to visit her husband  
6 by jail policy anyway. So ---

7 Q Okay. But that's what you talked about: that if  
8 you did, you could lose custody of your kids to DSS?

9 A I don't believe that mentioned, that she would lose  
10 -- I -- that DSS would obviously be looking into it.

11 Q You don't ---

12 A Yes.

13 Q --- believe that was said?

14 A I -- it's possible. But -- but I don't control what  
15 DSS does.

16 Q All right.

17 MR. GEOLY: If we could, Judge, on that same video,  
18 if we could bring it to -- at 14:42:37.

19 (Off the record briefly.)

20 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, is this being offered as a  
21 defense exhibit? Because I believe it was only  
22 admissible for our four-second portion.

23 THE COURT: Are you putting the ---

24 MR. GEOLY: Judge, I -- I'm asking him about his  
25 body cam. He said that he didn't recall it. So I'm --

1 I'm ---

2 THE COURT: And ---

3 MR. GEOLY: --- playing this to refresh his memory.

4 THE COURT: He moved into evidence and you said only  
5 that portion.

6 MR. GEOLY: I -- I'm ---

7 THE COURT: So this ---

8 MR. GEOLY: --- not necessarily ---

9 THE COURT: --- other portion is not in. Are you  
10 putting it into evidence?

11 MR. GEOLY: I'm -- I'm -- I'm not seeking to put it  
12 in at this time, Your Honor.

13 MR. DANIEL: I don't object ---

14 THE COURT: Well, you ---

15 MR. DANIEL: --- if he ---

16 THE COURT: --- can't play it to the jury, then.

17 MR. GEOLY: Okay.

18 MR. DANIEL: I don't object if he wants to put in,  
19 Your Honor. That's fine.

20 MR. GEOLY: Just this limited portion, I'm ---

21 THE COURT: No. You can put it in or you can keep  
22 it out, whichever you prefer.

23 MR. GEOLY: Beg the Court's indulgence one moment,  
24 Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: All right.

1 (Off the record briefly.)

2 THE COURT: I need -- hold for one second. Let me  
3 see the attorneys on the sidebar.

4 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir.

5 (Whereupon, a bench conference was held off the  
6 record in the presence of the jury, but out of the  
7 hearing of the jury.)

8 Q So -- so let me be clear: You do remember talking  
9 to her about DSS and what they may do, or you don't?

10 A I know we had several discussions with her. And I'm  
11 sure that at some point in time during those meetings,  
12 that DSS was brought up. Because they were actively  
13 involved in ---

14 Q And ---

15 A --- this case from the early onset.

16 Q And when you talked about DSS, do you remember  
17 talking about the fact that potentially, they would try  
18 and take her kids from her if she allowed a visit or if  
19 she visited?

20 A Now, say that again?

21 Q That -- that DSS -- you said that you wouldn't  
22 necessarily have a problem with it, but that DSS would  
23 probably try to take custody of her children if she  
24 visited Isaiah or allowed the kids to.

25 A Isaiah?

1 Q I'm sorry. Xzavier. I just ---

2 A I'm sorry.

3 Q Is that -- Xzay.

4 A I mean, it's possible ---

5 Q He's called Xzay.

6 A --- I mean, honestly.

7 Q Okay. No further questions. Thank you.

8 THE COURT: All right. Redirect.

9 MR. DANIEL: Briefly, Your Honor.

10 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

11 BY MR. DANIEL:

12 Q Investigator Dickert, what -- what is a mandatory  
13 reporter? What does that mean?

14 A We're mandated by law to notify -- we would have to  
15 notify DSS -- a mandated reporter could be a nurse, a  
16 doctor, counselors -- of any type of abuse. They're --  
17 they're required by law -- state law to notify DSS and/or  
18 law enforcement.

19 Q All right. So -- so police officers, like yourself,  
20 are notified or -- or are required to notify DSS if a  
21 child is -- is -- basically, if their health, safety, and  
22 welfare is put in jeopardy -- or potentially put in  
23 jeopardy; is that correct?

24 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

25 Q All right. So you were simply notifying Indigo

1 Penny, if she were to have contact with her husband, who  
2 is alleged to have just emptied a pistol into her, that  
3 potentially puts her kids in jeopardy. That -- that's  
4 all you were doing; is that correct?

5 A Yes, sir. That's correct.

6 Q All right. Thank you.

7 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

8 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

9 (Off the record briefly.)

10 THE COURT: All right. Let me see the attorneys for  
11 one second.

12 (Whereupon, a bench conference was held off the  
13 record in the presence of the jury, but out of the  
14 hearing of the jury.)

15 THE COURT: All right. The state can call your next  
16 witness.

17 MR DANIEL: Thank you, Your Honor. The state calls  
18 Dalila Jazic.

19 (Off the record briefly.)

20 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

21 DALILA JAZIC, having been first duly sworn,  
22 testified as follows:

23 DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Okay. Have a seat and state  
24 your name for the record.

25 THE WITNESS: Thank you. Dalila Cirencione. At the

1 time of the case, it was Jazic.

2 THE COURT: All right. And could you spell your  
3 name, please?

4 THE WITNESS: Cirencione is C-i-r-e-n-c-i-o-n-e.

5 DIRECT EXAMINATION

6 BY MR. DANIEL:

7 Q Cirencio?

8 A Cirencione.

9 Q Okay. All right. Ma'am, would you -- and -- and  
10 please speak into that microphone as well. There's air  
11 going above you. But -- so at the time of this  
12 particular investigation, April -- April of 2019, you  
13 were Dalila Jazic, correct?

14 A That's correct.

15 Q And you were -- you were then and now employed by  
16 the South Carolina Law Enforcement Division, SLED.

17 A That's correct.

18 Q All right. And what was your job at SLED?

19 A My job was and still is -- I'm a special agent,  
20 assigned to the crime scene unit. And at that time I  
21 attended an autopsy for this case.

22 Q Okay. And tell us how that came about.

23 A I was notified by Special Agent Jaclynn McKay to  
24 attend an autopsy on April 23rd for the victim, Iven  
25 Caldwell.

1 Q Okay. And where -- where was that autopsy  
2 conducted?

3 A The autopsy was at the Newberry County Memorial  
4 Hospital.

5 Q Okay. And -- and what was the purpose of -- of your  
6 attendance at this autopsy?

7 A To attend the autopsy. I collected any evidence by  
8 the pathologist that could've been taken from the victim  
9 himself. And I documented the victim with digital  
10 photographs.

11 Q Okay. And so your job was to collect anything of  
12 evidentiary value that was extracted from Iven Caldwell  
13 at this autopsy?

14 A That's correct.

15 Q And what, if anything, was extracted?

16 A The pathologist recovered one fired projectile from  
17 the right side of the victim's head.

18 Q Okay. And it's your understanding that was a 7-  
19 year-old boy; is that correct?

20 A Yes, sir.

21 Q Okay. All right. If you could -- Agent Cirencione  
22 now --- on that computer, can you pull up 34, 35, and 36?

23 A This is exhibit -- or this is Item 34?

24 Q Yes, 34. What -- what are those, starting with 34?

25 A 34 is a digital photograph of a fired projectile,



1 the one that was collected from the right side of the  
2 victim's head.

3 Q Okay. And the pathologist would've actually --  
4 who's examined the body, have actually collected that  
5 personally while using medical tools, correct?

6 A Yes, sir. The pathologist collected it.

7 Q All right. And then -- then, 35?

8 A 35 is a closer photo with a scale of the fired  
9 projectile recovered from the victim's head.

10 Q And 36?

11 A 36 is another close-up photograph of a fired  
12 projectile with a scale, recovered from the victim's  
13 head.

14 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer those three  
15 exhibits, 34 through 36, for admission into evidence.

16 MR. GEOLY: No objection ---

17 THE COURT: Any ---

18 MR. GEOLY: --- Your Honor.

19 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 34, State's  
20 Exhibit 35, and State's Exhibit 36 are admitted into  
21 evidence without objection.

22 (Whereupon, State's Exhibits 34, 35, and 36 were  
23 entered into evidence.)

24 Q All right. All right. There's 34, Agent  
25 Cirencione. And that just has measurements of the

1 extracted projectile?

2 A Yes, sir.

3 Q Okay. And then, 35 -- well, what is the -- well,  
4 what is the -- the measurements there? Can you tell?

5 A I would say approximately 1 centimeter.

6 Q Okay. That would be the diameter across?

7 A From what I could tell. But ---

8 Q All right.

9 A --- I'm not sure.

10 Q Go to -- I'm sorry. What?

11 A It looks like it. Yes.

12 Q Okay.

13 MR. DANIEL: 36, Mr. Bentley.

14 Q And then, what would the actual length be, according  
15 to that measurement?

16 A According to the measurement, 1 1/2 centimeters.

17 Q Okay. All right. So once that's extracted by the  
18 pathologist from the head of -- of -- of Iven Caldwell,  
19 what do you do? What's your involvement at that point?

20 A I received the fired projectile from the pathologist  
21 via chain-of-custody form. And then I responded back to  
22 the SLED Forensic Services Laboratory, where I did  
23 another chain-of-custody and transferred any evidence  
24 collected from the victim to the lead agent, which was  
25 Special Agent Jaclynn McKay.

1 Q Okay. And where -- where is the headquarters or  
2 your office where you would've transferred custody of  
3 this projectile to Agent McKay?

4 A 4416 Broad River Road, Columbia, South Carolina.

5 Q All right. Would that be assigned -- would this  
6 piece of evidence be assigned a -- a case number?

7 A Yes. Every piece of evidence is submitted into our  
8 system and assigned a -- an item number and it has a lab  
9 number associated with it.

10 Q Okay.

11 A But that only would've been done through Special  
12 Agent McKay.

13 Q All right. I'm going to hand you what's been marked  
14 for ID purposes through the clerk here as State's No. 13.  
15 Do you recognize that?

16 A Yes, sir. I do.

17 Q All right. And what is that?

18 A This is the fired projectile, or Item 33, as it was  
19 logged in by Jaclynn McKay.

20 Q Okay. And that's what you just described getting  
21 from the ---

22 A It is.

23 Q --- autopsy in Newberry, taking it to SLED, and  
24 giving it to Agent McKay?

25 A Yes, sir. It is.

1 Q All right.

2 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 13 for  
3 admission into evidence.

4 THE COURT: Any objection?

5 MR. GEOLY: Without objection, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 13 is  
7 admitted into evidence without objection.

8 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 13 was entered into  
9 evidence.)

10 Q It's your understanding, Agent, that's the -- that  
11 is the -- the fatal bullet, correct?

12 A Yes, sir.

13 Q All right.

14 A It is.

15 Q All right. Thank you. Please answer any questions  
16 Mr. Geoly has for you.

17 MR. GEOLY: Please the Court, Judge.

18 THE COURT: All right.

19 CROSS-EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. GEOLY:

21 Q Ms. Dalila, what -- what's your current last name  
22 again?

23 A Cirencione.

24 Q All right. Nice to meet you.

25 A Nice to ---

1 Q And this ---

2 A --- meet you.

3 Q --- is the first time we've talked, right?

4 A Yes, sir. It is.

5 Q This pretty much a ordinary, cheap bullet?

6 A I'm sorry?

7 Q Is this pretty consistent with an ordinary, cheap  
8 bullet, for lack of a better word?

9 A Cheap?

10 Q Cheap.

11 A I am ---

12 Q Like -- like ---

13 A --- not a firearms examiner. I don't know what a  
14 cheap bullet is.

15 Q All right.

16 A So I can't testify to that.

17 Q Just a typical bullet, then?

18 A It is a bullet.

19 Q Okay. And -- and that is the bullet, as far as you  
20 know, that is in those three pictures?

21 A Yes, sir. This is.

22 Q Okay. Do you have any other information to give us  
23 in terms of malice aforethought or what was going on when  
24 -- when this event actually occurred?

25 A No, sir. I do not. Only thing I did was attend an

1 autopsy and collect and evidence that was recovered from  
2 the victim and then transfer it to Special Agent McKay.

3 Q So you have nothing to offer regarding guilt or not  
4 guilt of my client as to this matter. You just ---

5 A No, sir.

6 Q --- collected the bullet?

7 A Yes, sir.

8 Q No further questions.

9 THE COURT: All right. Redirect?

10 MR. DANIEL: No, Your Honor.

11 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

12 THE WITNESS: Do you want me to leave this here?

13 THE COURT: Hand it to the court reporter, please.

14 Thank you.

15 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

16 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

17 (Off the record briefly.)

18 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and gentlemen, I  
19 think we're going to go ahead and break for lunch. Like  
20 yesterday, I'm going to allow you to go to lunch on your  
21 own.

22 I direct you again: Do not discuss the case with  
23 anyone, even among yourselves. Don't conduct any  
24 independent investigations.

25 It's 12:15. I'm going to ask that you please be

1 back at 1:45, about a quarter to two. That'll give you  
2 an hour and a half to eat lunch and get back. Hope you  
3 have a good lunch, and we'll see you back at 1:45.

4 Keep your seats while the jury is excused, please.

5 (Off the record briefly.)

6 (Whereupon, the jury exited the courtroom at 12:15  
7 p.m.)

8 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state  
9 before we recess for lunch?

10 MR. STUMBO: Nothing, Your Honor.

11 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

12 MR. GEOLY: Nothing, Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: Well, all right. We'll be in recess  
14 until 1:45.

15 (The Court went off the record at 12:15 p.m.)

16 (The Court went on the record at 1:53 p.m.)

17 THE COURT: All right. Anything from the state  
18 before we bring the jury in?

19 MR STUMBO: Nothing, Your Honor.

20 THE COURT: Anything from the defense?

21 MR GEOLY: No, sir, Judge.

22 THE COURT: All right. Let's go ahead and bring the  
23 jury in.

24 (Off the record briefly.)

25 (Whereupon, the jury entered the courtroom at 1:55

1 p.m.)

2 THE COURT: All right, ladies and gentlemen.  
3 Welcome back. Hope everyone had a good lunch. We're  
4 ready to resume the trial of the case.

5 The state can call your next witness.

6 MR STUMBO: Thank you, Judge. The state calls Ila  
7 Simmons to the stand.

8 THE COURT: All right.

9 (Off the record briefly.)

10 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

11 ILA SIMMONS, having been first duly sworn,  
12 testified as follows:

13 DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Have a seat and state your  
14 name for the record.

15 THE WITNESS: My name is Ila Simmons.

16 DIRECT EXAMINATION

17 BY MR. STUMBO:

18 Q Good afternoon, Ms. Simmons. Where do you work?

19 A I am currently not unemployed.

20 Q Okay. Where did you work before back in 2019?

21 A At the South Carolina Law Enforcement Division, also  
22 known as SLED, in the forensic laboratories trace-  
23 evidence department.

24 Q Okay. And what was your background that gave you  
25 any training and education, if you could explain to the



1 jury, what you went through to become a trace evidence  
2 analyst.

3 A I had received a bachelor's of science degree in  
4 chemistry. After completing that, I came to work at  
5 SLED, where, for the first three years, I went through  
6 the trace-evidence training program with a certified  
7 trace-evidence examiner. I had to take written and  
8 practical examinations and complete them with 100 percent  
9 efficiency. And after that, I was deemed to be competent  
10 in trace evidence.

11 Q Okay. And during your time in SLED in that unit,  
12 how -- how many cases, estimated, did you work on in that  
13 time?

14 A I probably analyzed 100,000 gunshot-residue samples  
15 and as long as -- as well as paints; probably 25,000  
16 cases in general.

17 Q And how many cases -- or how many years did you work  
18 in that department?

19 A About 16.

20 Q Did you ever testify in court as an expert during  
21 those 16 years?

22 A Yes, sir. Over 300 times.

23 Q Okay. Over 300 ---

24 A Yes, sir.

25 Q --- you said?

3 || A Yes.

4 Q Okay.

10 THE COURT: All right. Any questions or challenges?

13 THE COURT: Yes.

14 CROSS-EXAMINATION

15 BY MR. GEOLY:

|    |   |                      |
|----|---|----------------------|
| 16 | Q | Where did you study? |
|----|---|----------------------|

17 | A At Columbia College.

18 Q Okay. And you indicated your unemployed now; is  
19 that right?

20 | A Yes, sir.

21 Q Did -- did that have anything to do with your work  
22 performance at all or ---

23 A No, sir.

24 Q --- was it ---

25 | A I retired.

1 Q You retired?

2 A Yes, sir.

3 Q Okay. So you're not really unemployed; you're  
4 retired?

5 A Yes, sir.

6 Q Okay.

7 MR. GEOLY: Your Honor, I have no further questions.  
8 And we agree that she is an expert in firearms -- or  
9 trace evidence or whatever they offered ---

10 MR. STUMBO: It's traced evidence and gunshot  
11 residue.

12 MR. GEOLY: Yes, sir ---

13 THE COURT: All right.

14 MR. GEOLY: --- Your Honor.

15 THE COURT: All right. I'll find this -- I find  
16 this witness to be an expert in the field of trace  
17 evidence and gunshot-residue analysis.

18 Now, ladies and gentlemen of the jury, I'll charge  
19 you on the law regarding expert testimony when I charge  
20 you on the law to be applied in this case. But all you  
21 need to know for right now is, ordinarily, a witness can  
22 only testify as to her or her personal observations:  
23 what they saw, what they tasted, what they smelled, what  
24 they felt, things of that nature.

25 There is an exception for witnesses who are

1 qualified as expert, which means that in addition to her  
2 personal observations, this witness will be allowed to  
3 give an opinion in the field in which she is qualified as  
4 an expert.

5 All right, sir.

6 MR. STUMBO: Thank you, Judge.

7 DIRECT EXAMINATION

8 BY MR. STUMBO:

9 Q Ms. Simmons, I'm going to pass you what's in  
10 evidence as State's Exhibit 7 through the clerk.

11 MR. STUMBO: If you could pass that to ---

12 Q If you could take a look at that, that's State's 7,  
13 Ms. Simmons?

14 A Yes, sir.

15 Q Okay.

16 A This is a gunshot-residue kit that was submitted to  
17 my department, and I analyzed it.

18 Q Okay. And how do you know? Do you have any  
19 writings or markings on it?

20 A Yes, sir. It -- every -- every case that comes in  
21 to our laboratory is given an -- unique identification  
22 number. Each piece of evidence that comes in each case  
23 is given an item number. That is all present here, as  
24 well as my initials. And it would be handwritten and --  
25 as well as the date that I opened it to begin my

1 analysis.

2 Q Okay. And after you -- did you analyze the contents  
3 of this package?

4 A Yes, sir. I did.

5 Q Okay. And when you get done with your analysis --  
6 and I believe it's sealed up now, so you seal it back?

7 A Yes, sir. I do.

8 Q Okay. And that's your initials on there on the  
9 place where it's sealed back?

10 A Yes, sir.

11 Q Okay. Now, is there a name on State's 7 as to -- to  
12 who the -- the suspect -- suspect was in this case or ---

13 A Yes, sir.

14 Q --- defendant?

15 Who was that?

16 A It's Xzavier Davis.

17 Q Okay. All right. You can pass that back. And I'm  
18 going to have you pass that back, and I'm going to hand  
19 you what's been marked at this point just as ID, State's  
20 -- State's 6 for ID purposes.

21 What is -- do you recognize State's 6?

22 A Yes, sir. I do.

23 Q Okay. What is that?

24 A This is a copy of the report that I generated after  
25 completing my analysis.

1 Q Okay. Fair and accurate representation of the  
2 report that you -- you submitted in this case?

3 A Yes, sir. It is.

4 Q Okay.

5 MR. STUMBO: Your Honor, we'd offer State's 6 into  
6 evidence at this time.

7 THE COURT: Any objection?

8 MR. GEOLY: I'm sorry, Your Honor. No objection.

9 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit No. 6  
10 admitted into evidence without objection.

11 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 6 was entered into  
12 evidence.)

13 Q Now, Ms. Simmons, if you could, just briefly tell  
14 the jury: What -- what's involved -- what are you  
15 looking for when you examine a gunshot-residue kit?

16 A Gunshot residue is a mixture of chemicals that come  
17 out of a gun when it's discharged. It can get on  
18 anything in close proximity to the gun, including the  
19 hands of the person that's shooting the gun.

20 It's -- the elements that we're looking for are  
21 comprised of lead, barium, and antimony. As what the  
22 gunshot-residue kits consists of is double-sided sticky  
23 tape on a handle. And the double-sided sticky tape is  
24 dabbed over the -- over the palms and backs of -- of the  
25 suspect's hand. And then it's all put into an envelope

1 and submitted to us.

2 Q Okay. And when you went to examine the package that  
3 Newberry sent to you and it went through -- your crime  
4 scene investigator brought it into evidence and they  
5 brought it to you to handle; is that correct?

6 A That -- yes. They brought it in; logged it into our  
7 login department. It was -- then I came downstairs and I  
8 received it to my custody.

9 Q Okay. And when you received that package that we're  
10 -- had it opened or tampered with at all before you got  
11 it?

12 A No, sir. It was sealed by the crime scene agent  
13 that brought it into the laboratory, as well as the  
14 specific gunshot-residue kit was sealed and initialed by  
15 the person who collected it from Newberry County.

16 Q Okay. So Newberry County had it and sealed and --  
17 and then -- there's no indication that any of those seals  
18 were broken when you received it.

19 A That's correct.

20 Q Okay. What were your findings on this case, Ms.  
21 Simmons?

22 A Particles -- particles characteristic of gunshot-  
23 primer residue were found.

24 Q Okay. And that -- that means that there were  
25 multiple particles. Is there a number that you stop at

1 when you ---

2 A There's not a number we stopped at. But there was a  
3 large amount of gunshot residue found. Yes, sir.

4 Q Okay. And after you did that analysis, you were  
5 able to seal the kit back up and put it back to evidence  
6 to go back to Newberry County?

7 A That's correct.

8 Q Okay. That's all the questions I have for you, Ms.  
9 Simmons. Thank you for being here today. Please answer  
10 anything Mr. Geoly may have.

11 MR. GEOLY: If it please the Court, Judge.

12 THE COURT: All right.

13 CROSS-EXAMINATION

14 BY MR. GEOLY:

15 Q Hey, Ms. Simmons. How are you?

16 A Hello. How are you?

17 Q How long you been retired?

18 A Almost two years.

19 Q I hope you're enjoying it.

20 Couple questions: Gunshot residue, you found that  
21 he did have gunshot residue on his hands; is that right?

22 A That's correct.

23 Q And to be clear, that just means he shot a gun  
24 recently, right?

25 A Yes. That is one way that you can get gunshot



1 residue on your hands. You can also be near a gun when  
2 it's discharged, or you can handle something that has  
3 gunshot residue on it and it can be transferred to your  
4 hands.

5 Q And it -- it -- actually, gunshot residue can -- can  
6 kind of easily be removed by taking a shower, washing  
7 your hands, or wiping off with a towel, that could  
8 disturb -- disturb those results; is that ---

9 A That's correct.

10 Q --- fair to say?

11 A Yes, sir.

12 Q And nothing like that, obviously, had been done in  
13 this case, because he did test positive for gunshot  
14 residue, right?

15 A That's correct.

16 Q Which, again, just means he had fired a gun, right?

17 A Yes, sir.

18 Q Do you have anything to offer this jury in terms of  
19 what happened prior to him firing a gun?

20 A No, sir. I do not.

21 Q Do you have any testimony regarding his intentions  
22 or malice aforethought? You don't have anything to offer  
23 this jury regarding that, do you?

24 A No, sir. I do not.

25 Q I don't have any further questions. Thank you.

1 THE COURT: All right. Redirect.

2 MR. STUMBO: Just one more -- one question, Judge.

3 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

4 BY MR. STUMBO:

5 Q In those thousands of cases that you've looked at  
6 over the years, have you ever had an opportunity to be a  
7 crime scene where you end up having evidence that you  
8 analyzed later before the crime took place?

9 A No, sir.

10 Q Okay. It's always after; is that right?

11 A Yes, sir.

12 Q Okay. Thank you.

13 MR. STUMBO: No further questions, Your Honor.

14 THE COURT: All right. You may step down.

15 (Whereupon, the witness exited the witness stand.)

16 (Off the record briefly.)

17 THE COURT: All right. The state can call your next  
18 witness.

19 MR. DANIEL: All right. Your Honor, the state calls  
20 Michele Eichenmiller.

21 THE COURT: All right.

22 (Off the record briefly.)

23 (Whereupon, the witness came forward.)

24 MICHELE EICHENMILLER, having been first duly  
25 sworn, testified as follows:

1           DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT: Please have a seat and state  
2           your name for the record.

3           THE WITNESS: My name is Michele Eichenmiller.

4                               DIRECT EXAMINATION

5           BY MR. DANIEL:

6           Q     All right. Ms. Eichenmiller, where are you  
7           currently employed?

8           A     I employed at the South Carolina Law Enforcement  
9           Division. I work in the forensic laboratory in the  
10          firearms department.

11          Q     Okay. And what is your job title in the firearms  
12          department?

13          A     I'm a firearms-identification analyst.

14          Q     Okay. And briefly entail what that -- what that  
15          means, your job description.

16          A     My job at SLED is to analyze any evidence that is  
17          submitted to us from a crime scene, to include firearms,  
18          bullets, cartridge cases, anything else I would just  
19          consider part of a firearm.

20          Q     Okay. So if, for instance, shell casings -- spent  
21          shell casings are found at a crime scene or the actual  
22          projectile or bullets are at a crime scene and, say,  
23          there's also a gun found, too, you would test those items  
24          to see if they were fired from a particular gun?

25          A     That's correct.

1 Q Okay. All right. And what's your -- your training  
2 and background to be a firearms-identification analyst?

3 A I have a bachelor's degree in biology. And I also  
4 have a master of science in forensic science. In order  
5 to be a firearms examiner, though, there's no college you  
6 can attend. You have to be an apprentice.

7 So you learn with court-qualified examiners that are  
8 at your agency. So I learned with the examiners that  
9 were at SLED during the time of my training, which was  
10 approximately four years. I did practical exercises,  
11 written exercises, microscopic work. And then, at the  
12 end of that, I took a test and they deemed me competent  
13 to do casework on my own.

14 Q And how long have you been a -- a firearms-  
15 identification analyst?

16 A Approximately 15 years.

17 Q Okay. And have you ever been qualified as an expert  
18 in South Carolina state courts?

19 A I have.

20 Q Approximately how many times?

21 A Approximately 100 times.

22 Q And what is the terminology they use for your field  
23 of expertise?

24 A Firearms identification.

25 Q Okay.

1 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, at this time I would tender  
2 Ms. Eichenmiller as an expert in firearms identification.

3 All right. Any questions or challenges?

4 MR. GEOLY: None, Your Honor.

5 THE COURT: All right. I find this witness to be an  
6 expert in the field of firearm identification.

7 Q Okay. All right. I want to go to this specific  
8 case. We're dealing with an April 20th, 2019, incident.  
9 Did you have an occasion to analyze firearms-related  
10 evidence as it pertains to this particular case involving  
11 a suspect by the name of Xzavier Davis?

12 A I did.

13 Q Okay. And so you received firearm -- physical  
14 firearm-related evidence. Did -- was there a specific  
15 case number assigned to this evidence?

16 A The SLED lab number for this case is L1908244.

17 Q Okay. And approximately -- this evidence -- who  
18 logged this into evidence at SLED, all this firearm-  
19 related evidence as it pertains to this case?

20 A I believe it was our crime scene analyst.

21 Q Okay. Who would that be?

22 A Jaclynn McKay.

23 Q Okay. And when was that evidence submitted to your  
24 agency for forensic testing?

25 A The time on the packing slip that I have is 4/22 of

1 2019.

2 Q Okay. And I want to hand you what's already been  
3 admitted into evidence as State's 8 and 9. I'll pass  
4 those up through the clerk. Start with -- start with No.  
5 8, please, and tell us what that is.

6 A It's a revolver. It's the one I examined in this  
7 case.

8 Q Okay. And what type of weapon, make, and model?

9 A It's a Ruger LCR in .22-long-rifle caliber.

10 Q And is there a -- is there anything specific about  
11 that firearm additional? Does it have any attachments to  
12 it?

13 A It has a laser sight that's attached to the frame.

14 Q Okay. There is a laser sight attached to that .22-  
15 caliber revolver?

16 A Uh-huh.

17 Q And how many rounds does that revolver hold?

18 A Eight.

19 Q Okay. So that was submitted to you for testing  
20 against some of the -- some of the evidence found at the  
21 crime scene -- shell casings? projectiles? etc.?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Okay. And then, go to No. 9, please, in the box.

24 A All right.

25 Q And you recognize that?

1 A It's the pistol I examined in this case. It's a  
2 Taurus Model 709 Slim in 9-millimeter Luger caliber.

3 Q Okay. And so you tested that against, again -- what  
4 did you test that firearm against to see if that was a  
5 firearm that was used in this particular incident? What  
6 items did you test that against?

7 A I would've tested that against the fired cartridge  
8 cases I received and the fired bullets I received.

9 Q Okay. Let's walk through that. I'm going to hand  
10 you what's been marked for ID purposes as State's 10, 11,  
11 12, 13, 15, 16, and 17. I know that's a lot. But I'm  
12 going to go to pass that up to you through the clerk, and  
13 we'll try to go in numerical order.

14 All right. Let's start with what's been premarked  
15 for ID purposes as No. 10. You can see that on there  
16 with the evidence sticker. It says 10.

17 A Yes.

18 Q What is that?

19 A This is a fired bullets. It's identified for me as  
20 Item 7.

21 Q Okay. So the -- your internal item number is Item  
22 7. But it's -- it's State's Exhibit 10. And what are we  
23 -- what is that?

24 A It's a fired bullet.

25 Q And is there a description of where that fired

1 bullet was collected from?

2 A According to the paperwork I have, it was collected  
3 from the back seat of a Toyota Camry.

4 Q And that's an actual fired bullet, like a  
5 projectile?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Okay. All right. And did you test that against the  
8 two firearms, the .22-caliber firearm and the 9-  
9 millimeter?

10 A I did.

11 Q Okay. And what, if any, findings did you make to  
12 determine whether that projectile came from either one of  
13 those particular guns?

14 A I test-fired both firearms. And then I compared  
15 this bullet using my comparison microscope. I can --  
16 it's like a set of binoculars. I can put one piece of  
17 evidence on one side and then test-fire on the other  
18 side. I can turn them so that I can get the lighting  
19 right; look for individual characteristics to make it --  
20 to make an opinion if it was fired by that firearm.

21 That's what I did in this case. And it is my  
22 opinion that matching individual identifying  
23 characteristics were found, and Item 7, State's Item 10,  
24 was fired by State's Item 9, which is the Ruger -- or the  
25 Taurus pistol.



1 Q All right. So the -- the fired bullet that was  
2 collected from the back seat of the Toyota Camry, you  
3 determined that that was fired by the 9-millimeter  
4 pistol?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Okay.

7 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's No. 10  
8 for admission into evidence.

9 THE COURT: Any objection?

10 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Judge.

11 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 10 is admitted into  
12 evidence without objection.

13 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 10 was entered into  
14 evidence.)

15 Q All right. Let's go to -- let's go to No. 11,  
16 please, Ms. Eichenmiller -- State's No. 11. Tell me if  
17 you recognize that.

18 A I do.

19 Q All right. What is that?

20 A These are three items I examined in this case. I  
21 had one fired bullet. I had one piece of metal which was  
22 not a firearm component. And there is one more fired  
23 bullet in here. So there's two fired bullets and a piece  
24 of metal.

25 Q Okay. So the -- excuse me -- the two fired bullets,

1       were you able to make a determination what, if any, of  
2       the two firearms you had to test up against, were these  
3       two fired bullets fired from any -- either one of those  
4       firearms? Were you able to make a determination?

5       A     Due to damage, I couldn't determine if these were  
6       fired by Items -- or State's Exhibit 9. They are the  
7       right caliber. So I did compare them to that firearm.  
8       But they were too damaged for me to make a determination.

9             In firearms we have a couple different answer. We  
10      can say positive, it was fired; negative, it was not  
11      fired; and then, inconclusive. Inconclusive is the  
12      answer for these two bullets.

13      Q     But they are consistent with being fired from a 9-  
14      millimeter weapon, though?

15      A     Correct.

16      Q     And tell us about what kind of characteristics  
17      you're looking for. I mean, each -- each time you fire a  
18      weapon, are there unique imprints left on the projectile?

19      A     Yes. Each firearm can mark a projectile with --  
20      with its barrel. And any marks that are in the barrel  
21      can translate to the bullet.

22             What I look for is little -- we call them  
23      striations, but they're scratches on bullets. Primarily,  
24      first off, though, I will evaluate it to see if it's the  
25      correct caliber for a firearm I've received; if the

1 general characteristics are consistent with that firearm;  
2 and then I'll evaluate it microscopically.

3 Q Okay. But there could be damage to these  
4 characteristics? If, say, they -- they hit something, it  
5 can alter the shape of the bullets?

6 A Correct.

7 Q Okay. And where were these two -- on State's No.  
8 11, these two fired bullets, where they collected from,  
9 according to your description?

10 A One of the bullets was collected from Marker 9, and  
11 one was collected from Marker 10.

12 Q And the crime scene agent would -- would be able to  
13 testify to Markers 9 and 10 at the crime scene ---

14 A Correct.

15 Q --- location? Okay. All right.

16 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's No. 11  
17 for admission to evidence.

18 THE COURT: Any objection?

19 MR. GEOLY: No, sir, Your Honor.

20 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 11 admitted into  
21 evidence without objection.

22 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 11 was entered into  
23 evidence.)

24 Q All right. Let's go to State's No. 12, Ms.  
25 Eichenmiller.

1 A Okay.

2 Q All right. Do you recognize State's No. -- No. 12?

3 A I do. These are the cartridge cases I examined in  
4 this case.

5 Q Okay. And -- well, what exactly -- are they -- are  
6 they spent shell casings, meaning they've been fired?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Okay. How many shell casings are in that -- that  
9 bag in State's No. 12?

10 A Eight.

11 Q Eight?

12 A (No audible response.)

13 Q Okay. And so you're also able to determine certain  
14 shell casings, whether they're fired from a particular  
15 gun; is that correct?

16 A Correct.

17 Q Okay. What conclusion did you reach regarding these  
18 eight spent shell casings?

19 A I microscopically compared these shell casings --  
20 cartridge cases to test fires from the firearm. And I  
21 concluded that these were fired by State's Exhibit 9,  
22 which is the Taurus pistol.

23 Q The 9-millimeter pistol?

24 A Correct.

25 Q Okay. So those eight shell casings came from the 9-

1 millimeter pistol ---

2 A Yes.

3 Q --- you have? Okay.

4 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's No. 12  
5 for admission to evidence.

6 THE COURT: Any objection?

7 MR. GEOLY: None, Your Honor.

8 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 12 admitted into  
9 evidence without objection.

10 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 12 was entered into  
11 evidence.)

12 Q All right. Let's go to -- let's go to 13. It's  
13 already in evidence. What is -- what is 13, Ms.  
14 Eichenmiller -- State's No. 13?

15 A State's 13 is a fired bullet.

16 Q And what is the exact description on that -- that  
17 exhibit, State's 13?

18 A It says (as read): "Ballistics 4/23/2019 FA19-291  
19 Newberry Caldwell, Iven J."

20 Q All right. So what does that mean to you? Is that  
21 a -- is that saying that is a fired bullet collected from  
22 a victim at the autopsy? Is that ---

23 A Yes.

24 Q --- what that ---

25 A This is typically how autopsy evidence arrives at

1 the lab.

2 Q Okay. So that -- that bullet was -- was extracted  
3 from the victim at the autopsy?

4 A Correct.

5 Q All right. Were you able to test that up against  
6 the -- the two firearms, the .22-caliber pistol and the  
7 9-millimeter pistol?

8 A I did.

9 Q All right. What determination were you able to  
10 make?

11 A I determined that item -- State's Exhibit 13 was  
12 fired by the 9-millimeter pistol.

13 Q Okay. So that was -- your determination is that was  
14 fired by the 9-millimeter pistol?

15 A Correct.

16 Q All right. Excuse me. Let's go to No. 15, State's  
17 15. All right. What is that?

18 A These are unfired cartridges.

19 Q And what are they -- what caliber cartridges are  
20 they for -- or they're live rounds, correct?

21 A They are.

22 Q All right. Well, for ---

23 A They're ---

24 Q --- what type ---

25 A --- 9-millimeter ---

1 Q --- of gun?

2 A --- Luger caliber.

3 Q 9-millimeter Luger caliber?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Which -- which is the appropriate ammunition for a  
6 9-millimeter handgun, correct?

7 A Correct.

8 Q Okay.

9 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 15 for  
10 admission to evidence.

11 THE COURT: Any objection?

12 MR. GEOLY: No objection, Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: State's Exhibit 15 admitted into  
14 evidence without objection.

15 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 15 was entered into  
16 evidence.)

17 Q And where were they collected from?

18 A According to the packaging, they were with a  
19 magazine -- they came from a magazine.

20 Q Okay. And that would -- you would have to check  
21 with the SLED crime scene agent -- the -- the exact  
22 location that was collected?

23 A It says on here: "Item 18." Typically, crime scene  
24 will put the cartridge -- cartridges that were retrieved  
25 from a firearm in a separate package. So these came from

1 the 9-millimeter pistol.

2 Q Okay. So that was -- those live, unfired eight  
3 rounds of ammunition came from the 9-millimeter pistol?

4 Is that what you're saying?

5 A I think it was a magazine that perhaps was with Item  
6 18 ---

7 Q Okay.

8 A --- my Item 18.

9 Q Which would be the 9-millimeter pistol.

10 A Correct.

11 Q Okay. But that -- that was one -- one package  
12 originally; is that -- is that what you're saying?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Okay. All right.

15 MR. DANIEL: I did offer 15 to evidence, Your Honor,  
16 if I'm ---

17 THE COURT: Yes.

18 MR. DANIEL: --- not mistaken.

19 THE COURT: 15 is in evidence.

20 MR. DANIEL: All right.

21 Q Let's go to 16, Ms. Eichenmiller. Do you recognize  
22 State's 16?

23 A I do.

24 Q And what is that?

25 A They're fired cartridge cases.



1 Q Okay. Were you able to make a determination what --  
2 what caliber cartridge cases?

3 A They're .22 long-rifle.

4 Q Are they fired or unfired ---

5 A These are ---

6 Q --- cartridge cases?

7 A These are fired.

8 Q Fired?

9 A (No audible response.)

10 Q Okay. So they're spent .22 shell casings, in other  
11 words?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And you said how many of them are there?

14 A There's eight, but one is in the bag.

15 Q Okay. Got you. So there's eight of them. Did you  
16 test those against the two pistols, the .22 pistol and  
17 the 9-millimeter pistol?

18 A Due to the recovery location of these cartridge  
19 cases, which was from the revolver, we didn't do any  
20 forensic testing on them.

21 Q Okay. So those were still -- so you're saying those  
22 .22-caliber spent casings were still in the cylinder of  
23 the .22-caliber pistol; is that correct?

24 A I believe they were taken out of the revolver by  
25 crime scene.

1 Q Got you.

2 MR. DANIEL: Your Honor, I'd offer State's 16 for  
3 admission to evidence.

4 MR. GEOLY: No objection ---

5 THE COURT: Any objection?

6 MR. GEOLY: --- Your Honor.

7 THE COURT: All right. State's Exhibit 16 admitted  
8 into evidence without objection.

9 (Whereupon, State's Exhibit 16 was entered into  
10 evidence.)

11 Q All right. And then, just got one more piece of  
12 physical evidence, State's 17. You recognize that?

13 A Yes.

14 Q And what is that?

15 A These are unfired cartridges, 26 of them.

16 Q Twenty-six unfired rounds of ammunition?

17 A Correct.

18 Q What caliber of ammunition?

19 A They're 9-millimeter Luger.

20 Q 9-millimeter Luger?

21 A (No audible response.)

22 Q Okay. And that would be consistent with the  
23 ammunition you'd need for a 9-millimeter pistol; is that

24 ---

25 A Correct.

