

**RECEIVED**

**Apr 03 2023**

**SC Court of Appeals**

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Court of Appeals

APPEAL FROM CHARLESTON COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas

Keith Kelly, Circuit Court Judge

Case No. 2020-CP-10-03931

Royal Palms Property Owners Association, Inc.,

Respondent,

v.

Alpha Prime LLC, Alpha Prime Construction LLC, Sagehorn And Company Inc., Royal Palms Holding LLC, Lennar Carolinas LLC, Alpha Omega Construction Group, Inc., Valmar Nunes, individually, Bruza Construction LLC, Simons Construction Company, LLC, Cesar E Desouza a/k/a Cesar Desouza, individually, Raul Martinez Masonry LLC, Mark Wolverton, individually, DVS, Inc., Carolina Foundation, Inc., CEBS Construction, LLC a/k/a CEBS Custom Homes, LLC, Archer Exteriors, Inc., JAS Construction Services, LLC, Henry Palmer, individually and d/b/a Palmer's Construction Services, LLC, Angelo De Souza, individually and d/b/a Sunrise Siding, LLC, WW Pereira Construction, LLC, GC General Construction, LLC, Siding Construction, LLC, Builders Firstsource - Southeast Group, LLC, Associated Materials Incorporated a/k/a and d/b/a Alside; Cohen's Drywall Company, Inc.; Guaranteed Framing, LLC; Hurley Services, LLC; Sunrise Windows And Doors, LLC; Pereira Construction, LLC; Della Putti Construction; J. Plitz Construction, LLC; CMAC Construction, LLC; Henry's Construction & Trucking, Inc.; Charlotte Mechanical, LLC; Ethridge Electric Co., LLC; Builders Insulation of North Carolina, LLC a/k/a City Wide Insulation of Madison, Inc. a/b/a Builders' Insulation; Tradition Builders, Inc.; Heaven Woodworks, Inc.; Bishop & Sons Plumbing & Piping, Inc.; Arteaga Roofing, LLC; Melinda Amador; James Bayles; Blanca Christina Lopez a/k/a Blanca Christina Chaves; Flavio Morales; Daniel Leon Ramos; Juan Garza Ramos; Fidel Morales; and City Wide Insulation of Madison, Inc. d/b/a Builders Insulation; Defendants

Of which Lennar Carolinas, LLC is the Appellant.

And

Builders Firstsource-Southeast Group, LLC, Third Party Plaintiff

v.

Hurley Services, LLC and Sunrise Windows and Doors, LLC and Sunrise Windows and Doors LLC, Third-Party Defendants

And

Sagehorn and Company, Inc., Third Party Plaintiff

v.

Henry's Construction Trucking, Inc., Charlotte Mechanical, LLC, Ethridge Electric Co., LLC, Builders Insulation of North Carolina, LLC, Tradition Builders, Inc., Heaven Woodworks, Inc., Bishop & Sons Plumbing & Piping, Inc., and John Doe 1-10, Third Party Defendants

And

Alpha Omega Construction Group, LLC, Third Party Plaintiff

v.

Arteaga Roofing, LLC, Melinda Amador, James Bayles, Blanca Christina Lopez, Flavio Morales, Daniel Leon Ramos, Juan Garza Ramos and Fidel Morales, Third Party Defendants.

---

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**

---

Lennar Carolinas, LLC ("Lennar") appeals the Honorable Keith Kelly's order denying Lennar's Motion to Compel Arbitration, filed on February 21, 2023, and the Honorable Keith Kelly's order denying Lennar's Motion to Alter or Amend, filed on March 2, 2023. Lennar received notice of the circuit court's denial of the Motion to Alter or Amend on March 2, 2023. The order denying the Motion to Compel Arbitration and the Order denying the Motion to Alter or Amend are attached hereto as **Exhibit 1**.

s/Katon E. Dawson Jr.

---

James Lynn Werner, (SC Bar No. 6029)  
Taylor H. Stair (SC Bar No. 78430)  
Katon E. Dawson, Jr. (SC Bar No. 101167)  
Parker Poe Adams & Bernstein LLP  
1221 Main Street, Suite 1100  
Columbia, SC 29201  
(803) 255-8000

April 3, 2023

*Attorneys for Appellant Lennar Carolinas, LLC*

Other Counsel of Record:

Amanda M. Blundy, Esquire (S.C. Bar No. 73069)  
English Hanahan Maull, Esquire (S.C. Bar No. 104321)  
Blundy Law Firm, LLC  
234 Seven Farms Drive, Suite 111-A  
Charleston, SC 29492  
Telephone: 843.867.6050  
ablundy@blundylawfirm.com  
emaull@blundylawfirm.com

Robert L. Wylie, IV, Esquire. (SC Bar No. 13052)  
James L. Hills, Jr., Esquire (SC Bar No. 100942)  
Mullen Wylie, LLC  
4717 Jenn Drive, Second Floor (29577)  
Post Office Box 1980  
Myrtle Beach, SC 29578  
Telephone: 843.449.4800  
rwylie@mullenwylie.com  
jhills@mullenwylie.com

D. Ryan McCabe, Jr., Esquire. (SC Bar No. 16977)  
McCabe, Trotter & Beverly, P.C.  
4500 Fort Jackson Blvd., Suite 250  
Columbia, SC 29209  
PO Box 212069  
Columbia, SC 29221  
Telephone: 803.724.5000  
[ryan.mccabe@mccabetrotter.com](mailto:ryan.mccabe@mccabetrotter.com)

Francis E. Grimball, Esquire (SC Bar No. 2310)  
Mullen Wylie, LLC  
171 Church Street, Suite 370  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.853.6200  
fgrimball@mullenwylie.com

*Attorneys for Respondent Royal Palms Property Owners Association, Inc.*

L. Dean Best, Esquire (SC Bar No. 11952)  
Best Law, P.A.  
999 Lake Hunter Circle, Suite D  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Post Office Box 2374  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
Telephone: 843.793.4744  
[dean@bestlawsc.com](mailto:dean@bestlawsc.com)

Mark Shanter Chaparro, Esquire (SC Bar No. 102419)  
Best Law, P.A.  
999 Lake Hunter Circle, Suite D  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Post Office Box 2374  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
843.793.4744  
shanter@bestlawsc.com

*Attorneys for Alpha Omega Construction Group Inc.*

Sonaly Kirkley Hendricks, Esquire (SC Bar No. 74229)  
Pierce, Sloan, Wilson, Kennedy & Early, LLC  
321 E Bay Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Post Office Box 22437  
Charleston, SC 29401  
843.722.7733  
[sonalyhendricks@piercesloan.com](mailto:sonalyhendricks@piercesloan.com)

William Oglesby Sweeny, IV, Esquire (SC Bar No. 78668)  
Rogers Townsend LLC  
205 King Street, Suite 201  
Charleston, SC 29401  
843.300.1000  
[billy.sweeny@rogerstownsend.com](mailto:billy.sweeny@rogerstownsend.com)

*Attorneys for Royal Palms Holding Inc.*

Erin DuBose Dean, Esquire (SC Bar No. 65320)  
Tupper, Grimsley, Dean & Canaday, P.A.  
611 Bay Street  
Beaufort, SC 29902  
Post Office Box 2055  
Beaufort, SC 29901-2055  
843.524.1116  
[erindean@tgdcpa.com](mailto:erindean@tgdcpa.com)

Caroline Coward McIntosh, Esquire (SC Bar No 73737)  
Luzuriaga Mims, LLP  
1156 King Street  
Charleston, SC 29403  
Telephone: 843.410.471  
[cmcintosh@lmlawllp.com](mailto:cmcintosh@lmlawllp.com)

Kevin W. Mims, Esquire (SC Bar No. 69418)  
Luzuriaga Mims, LLP

1156 King Street  
Charleston, SC 29403  
Telephone: 843.410.4713  
[kmims@lmlawllp.com](mailto:kmims@lmlawllp.com)

*Attorneys for Sagehorn and Company*

Roman Vincent Hammes, Esquire (SC Bar No. 76977)  
Charpia & Hammes, Attorneys at Law  
215 W. 2nd South Street  
Summerville, SC 29483  
Telephone: 843.261.7026  
[roman@charpiaw.com](mailto:roman@charpiaw.com)

*Attorney for Cesar Desouza & Cesar E De Souza*

David Starr Cobb, Esquire (SC Bar No. 66569)  
Turner Padget Graham & Laney, PA  
Post Office Box 22129  
Charleston, SC 29413-2129  
Telephone: 843.576.2803  
[dcobb@turnerpadget.com](mailto:dcobb@turnerpadget.com)

*Attorney for Carolina Foundation Inc.*

Tyler Ethan Cloud, Esquire (SC Bar No. 103155)  
Clawson & Staubes, LLC  
126 Seven Farms Drive, #200  
Charleston, SC 29492  
Telephone: 843.577.2026  
[tcloud@clawsonandstaubes.com](mailto:tcloud@clawsonandstaubes.com)

Michael Lawrence Leech, Esquire (SC Bar No. 1000516)  
Clawson & Staubes, LLC  
126 Seven Farms Dr, Ste. 200  
Charleston, SC 29492-8144  
Telephone: 843.577.2026  
[mleech@clawsonandstaubes.com](mailto:mleech@clawsonandstaubes.com)

*Attorneys for DVS, Inc.*

Francis Heyward Grimball, Esquire (SC Bar No. 101743)  
Richardson Plowden & Robinson, PA  
235 Magrath Darby, Suite 100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.714.2616  
[fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com)

*Attorney for Mark Wolverton*

Erin DuBose Dean, Esquire (SC Bar No. 65320)  
Tupper, Grimsley, Dean & Canaday, P.A.  
Post Office Box 2055  
Beaufort, SC 29901-2055  
Telephone: 843.524.1116  
[erindean@tgdcpa.com](mailto:erindean@tgdcpa.com)

*Attorney for Raul Martinez Masonry, LLC*

Catherine Holland Chase, Esquire (SC Bar No. 74593)  
Clement Rivers, LLP  
Post Office Box 993  
Charleston, SC 29402-0993  
Telephone: 843.720.5488  
[cchase@ycrlaw.com](mailto:cchase@ycrlaw.com)

*Attorney for Simons Construction Company, LLC*

Christopher Clay Olson, Esquire (SC Bar No. 17007)  
Gordon & Rees LLP  
40 Calhoun Street  
Suite 350  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.714.2509  
[colson@grsm.com](mailto:colson@grsm.com)

*Attorney for Bruza Construction, LLC*

Edward Glenn Elliott, Esquire (SC Bar No. 7838)  
Aiken Bridges Elliott Tyler & Saleeby, P.A.  
Aiken Bridges  
PO Drawer 1931  
Florence, SC 29503  
Telephone: 843.669.8787 ext. 328  
[ege@aikenbridges.com](mailto:ege@aikenbridges.com)

*Attorney for WW Pereira Construction, LLC*

Sarah E. Butler, Esquire (SC Bar No. 17235)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun St., Ste. 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.727.0307  
[sbutler@csvl.law](mailto:sbutler@csvl.law)

Ms. Julia A. Bradshaw, Esquire (SC Bar No. 103767)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.329.1261  
[jbradshaw@csvl.law](mailto:jbradshaw@csvl.law)

*Attorneys for Henry Palmer*

Thomas McRoy Shelley, III, Esquire (SC Bar No. 7067)  
Rogers Townsend LLC  
Post Office Box 100200  
1221 Main St., 14Th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29202-3200  
Telephone: 803.771.7900  
[roy.shelley@rogerstownsend.com](mailto:roy.shelley@rogerstownsend.com)

Steven T. Moon, Esquire (SC Bar No. 6488)  
Rogers Townsend LLC  
Post Office Box 100200  
Columbia, SC 29202-3200  
Telephone: 803.771.7900  
[steven.moon@rogerstownsend.com](mailto:steven.moon@rogerstownsend.com)

*Attorneys for JAS Construction Services, LLC*

Francis Heyward Grimball, Esquire (SC Bar No. 101743)  
Richardson Plowden & Robinson, PA  
235 Magrath Darby, Suite 100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.714.2616  
[fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com)

*Attorney for Archer Exteriors, Inc.*

Philip Paul Cristaldi, III, Esquire (SC Bar No. 102219)  
Ross & Cristaldi, LLC  
863 Coleman Blvd. Ste. B  
Mt Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.991.4328  
[pcristaldi@rclawsc.com](mailto:pcristaldi@rclawsc.com)

Jeffrey A Ross, Esquire (SC Bar No. 74254)  
Ross & Cristaldi, LLC  
863 Coleman Blvd., Ste B  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29464

Telephone: 843.329.4040  
[jross@rclawsc.com](mailto:jross@rclawsc.com)

*Attorneys for Cohens Drywall Company, Inc.*

Alan Ross Belcher, Jr., Esquire (SC Bar No. 71686)  
Hall Booth Smith, PC  
111 Coleman Blvd.  
Suite 301  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.720.3460  
[alan.belcher@hallboothsmith.com](mailto:alan.belcher@hallboothsmith.com)

Connor Evan Johnson, Esquire (SC Bar No. 103111)  
Hall Booth Smith, PC  
111 Coleman Boulevard  
Suite 301  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.720.3487  
[connorjohnson@hallboothsmith.com](mailto:connorjohnson@hallboothsmith.com)

*Attorneys for CEBS Construction, LLC*

Hannah E. Smith, Esquire (SC Bar No. 105237)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun Street,, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.266.8233  
[hsmith@csvg.law](mailto:hsmith@csvg.law)

John Patrick Turner Norris, Esquire (SC Bar No. 78270)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun St., Ste. 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.266.8219  
[pnorris@csvg.law](mailto:pnorris@csvg.law)

Madison Brooke Alger, Esquire (SC Bar No. 101385)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun St, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.266.8207  
[malger@csvg.law](mailto:malger@csvg.law)

*Attorneys for Associated Materials Incorporated*

Stephen P. Hughes, Esquire (SC Bar No. 2805)  
Howell Gibson & Hughes, PA

Post Office Box 40  
Beaufort, SC 29901  
Telephone: 843.522.2400  
[sphughes@hghpa.com](mailto:sphughes@hghpa.com)

*Attorney for Builders Firstsource Southeast Group, LLC*

Claude Townsend Prevost, III, Esquire (SC Bar No. 74343)  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
PO Box 12487  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Telephone: 803.256.2660  
[cprevost@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:cprevost@collinsandlacy.com)

Robert McNair Peele, III, Esquire (SC Bar No. 77569)  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
Post Office Box 12487  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Telephone: 803.256.2660  
[rpeele@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:rpeele@collinsandlacy.com)

*Attorneys for Sunrise Siding, LLC*

Sarah E. Butler, Esquire (SC Bar No. 17235)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun St., Ste. 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.727.0307  
[sbutler@csvg.law](mailto:sbutler@csvg.law)

Ms. Julia A. Bradshaw, Esquire (SC Bar No. 103767)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.329.1261  
[jbradshaw@csvg.law](mailto:jbradshaw@csvg.law)

*Attorneys for Palmers Construction Services, LLC*  
Jennifer Sue Ivey, Esquire (SC Bar No. 102533)  
Walker Gressette & Linton, LLC  
Post Office Drawer 22167  
Charleston, SC 29413  
Telephone: 843.727.2216  
[ivey@wglfirm.com](mailto:ivey@wglfirm.com)

*Attorney for Hurley Services, LLC*

John Blanton O'Neal, IV, Esquire (SC Bar No. 68511)

Hood Law Firm, LLC  
172 Meeting Street  
Charleston, South Carolina 29401  
Post Office Box 1508  
Charleston, SC 29402  
Telephone: 843.577.4435  
[blanton.oneal@hoodlaw.com](mailto:blanton.oneal@hoodlaw.com)

Kathryn Nicole Tanner, Esquire (SC Bar No. 105334)  
Hood Law Firm, LLC  
172 Meeting Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.577.1210  
[katie.tanner@hoodlaw.com](mailto:katie.tanner@hoodlaw.com)

*Attorneys for CMAC Construction, LLC*

Robert McNair Peele, III, Esquire (SC Bar No. 77569)  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
1330 Lady Street, 6th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Post Office Box 12487  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Telephone: 803.256.2660  
[rpeele@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:rpeele@collinsandlacy.com)

James Lloyd Williams, Esquire (SC Bar No. 102408)  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
1330 Lady Street, Sixth Floor  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Telephone: 803.256.2660  
[jwilliams@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:jwilliams@collinsandlacy.com)

*Attorneys for J. Plitz Construction LLC*

Neil S. Haldrup, Esquire (SC Bar No. 13017)  
Wall Templeton & Haldrup, PA  
145 King St # 300  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Post Office Box 1200  
Charleston, SC 29402  
Telephone: 843.329.9500  
[neil.haldrup@walltempleton.com](mailto:neil.haldrup@walltempleton.com)

Sidney Markey Stubbs, Esquire (SC Bar No. 7973)  
Baker Ravenel & Bender, LLP  
3710 Landmark Dr # 400  
Columbia, SC 29204

Post Office Box 8057  
Columbia, SC 29202  
Telephone: 803.799.9091  
[mstubbs@brblegal.com](mailto:mstubbs@brblegal.com)

*Attorneys for Builders Insulation of North Carolina LLC*

Jordan Chelsae Davis, Esquire (SC Bar No. 104622)  
Baker Ravenel & Bender, LLP  
3710 Landmark Dr #400  
Columbia, SC 29204  
Telephone: 803.343.3866  
[jdavis@brblegal.com](mailto:jdavis@brblegal.com)

Everett Augustus Kendall, II, Esquire (SC Bar No. 8450)  
Murphy & Grantland, PA  
4406 B Forest Drive  
Columbia, SC 29206  
Post Office Box 6648  
Columbia, SC 29260  
Telephone: 803.782.4100  
[rkendall@murphygrantland.com](mailto:rkendall@murphygrantland.com)

Scott William Giblin, Esquire (SC Bar No. 105368)  
Murphy & Grantland, PA  
4406 B Forest Drive  
Columbia, SC 29206  
Post Office Box 6648  
Columbia, SC 29260  
Telephone: 803.782.4100  
[sgiblin@murphygrantland.com](mailto:sgiblin@murphygrantland.com)

*Attorneys for Bishop and Sons Plumbing Inc*

Roopal S. Ruparelia, Esquire (SC Bar No: 16003)  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, PA  
1201 Main St # 2200  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Post Office Box 11889  
Columbia, SC 29211-1889  
803.540.7846  
[rruparelia@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:rruparelia@hsblawfirm.com)

Clarke W. DuBose, Esquire (SC Bar No. 1761)  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, PA  
1201 Main St # 2200  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Post Office Box 11889

Columbia, SC 29211  
Telephone: 803.540.7833  
[cdubose@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:cdubose@hsblawfirm.com)

*Attorneys for Juan Garza Ramos*

Shanna Milcetch Stephens, Esquire (SC Bar No. 72012)  
Anderson Reynolds & Stephens, LLC  
37 Broad Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Post Office Box 87  
Charleston, SC 29402  
Telephone: 843.723.0185  
[sstephens@arslawsc.com](mailto:sstephens@arslawsc.com)

Danielle Beck Wegener, Esquire (SC Bar No. 77481)  
Anderson Reynolds & Stephens, LLC  
37 Broad Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Post Office Box 87  
Charleston, SC 29402  
Telephone: 843.723.0185  
[dwegener@arslawsc.com](mailto:dwegener@arslawsc.com)

*Attorneys for Daniel Leon Ramos*

Brandon Todd Reeser, Esquire (SC Bar No. 101342)  
Wilson Heyward & Reeser, LLC  
924 Folly Road  
Charleston, SC 29412  
Post Office Box 13177  
Charleston, SC 29422  
Telephone: 843.762.4567  
[breeser@wilsonheyward.com](mailto:breeser@wilsonheyward.com)

*Attorney for Blanca Christina Lopez*

Jason Alan Daigle, Esquire (SC Bar No. 73308)  
Young Clement Rivers  
25 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.577.4000  
[jdaigle@ycrlaw.com](mailto:jdaigle@ycrlaw.com)

*Attorney for Arteaga Roofing LLC*

Allen Leland DuPre, Esquire (SC Bar No. 13517)  
Lyles & Associates, LLC

1037 Chuck Dawley Blvd., Suite G-100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.577.7730  
[ald@lylesfirm.com](mailto:ald@lylesfirm.com)

Caroline Kathryn Hicks, Esquire (SC Bar No. 105289)  
Lyles & Associates, LLC  
1037 Chuck Dawley Blvd Suite G-100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.806.3281  
[ckh@lylesfirm.com](mailto:ckh@lylesfirm.com)

*Attorney for Melinda Amador*

Patrick J. McDonald, Esquire (SC Bar No. 16921)  
Resnick & Louis, P.C.  
146 Fairchild Street, Suite 130  
Daniel Island, SC 29492  
Telephone: 843.270.0675  
[pmcdonald@rlattorneys.com](mailto:pmcdonald@rlattorneys.com)

Kirkley Gibson White, Esquire (SC Bar No. 103702)  
Resnick & Louis, P.C.  
164 Fairchild Street, Suite 130  
Charleston, SC 29492  
Telephone: 843.212.0435  
[kwhite@rlattorneys.com](mailto:kwhite@rlattorneys.com)

*Attorneys for Flavio Morales*

**RECEIVED**

**Apr 03 2023**

**SC Court of Appeals**

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Court of Appeals

---

APPEAL FROM CHARLESTON COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas

Keith Kelly, Circuit Court Judge

---

Case No. 2020-CP-10-03931

---

Royal Palms Property Owners Association, Inc.,

Respondent,

v.

Alpha Prime LLC, Alpha Prime Construction LLC, Sagehorn And Company Inc., Royal Palms Holding LLC, Lennar Carolinas LLC, Alpha Omega Construction Group, Inc., Valmar Nunes, individually, Bruza Construction LLC, Simons Construction Company, LLC, Cesar E Desouza a/k/a Cesar Desouza, individually, Raul Martinez Masonry LLC, Mark Wolverton, individually, DVS, Inc., Carolina Foundation, Inc., CEBS Construction, LLC a/k/a CEBS Custom Homes, LLC, Archer Exteriors, Inc., JAS Construction Services, LLC, Henry Palmer, individually and d/b/a Palmer's Construction Services, LLC, Angelo De Souza, individually and d/b/a Sunrise Siding, LLC, WW Pereira Construction, LLC, GC General Construction, LLC, Siding Construction, LLC, Builders Firstsource - Southeast Group, LLC, Associated Materials Incorporated a/k/a and d/b/a Alside; Cohen's Drywall Company, Inc.; Guaranteed Framing, LLC; Hurley Services, LLC; Sunrise Windows And Doors, LLC; Pereira Construction, LLC; Della Putti Construction; J. Plitz Construction, LLC; CMAC Construction, LLC; Henry's Construction & Trucking, Inc.; Charlotte Mechanical, LLC; Ethridge Electric Co., LLC; Builders Insulation of North Carolina, LLC a/k/a City Wide Insulation of Madison, Inc. a/b/a Builders' Insulation; Tradition Builders, Inc.; Heaven Woodworks, Inc.; Bishop & Sons Plumbing & Piping, Inc.; Arteaga Roofing, LLC; Melinda Amador; James Bayles; Blanca Christina Lopez a/k/a Blanca Christina Chaves; Flavio Morales; Daniel Leon Ramos; Juan Garza Ramos; Fidel Morales; and City Wide Insulation of Madison, Inc. d/b/a Builders Insulation; Defendants

Of which Lennar Carolinas, LLC is the Appellant.

And

Builders Firstsource-Southeast Group, LLC, Third Party Plaintiff

v.

Hurley Services, LLC and Sunrise Windows and Doors, LLC and Sunrise Windows and Doors LLC, Third-Party Defendants

And

Sagehorn and Company, Inc., Third Party Plaintiff

v.

Henry's Construction Trucking, Inc., Charlotte Mechanical, LLC, Ethridge Electric Co., LLC, Builders Insulation of North Carolina, LLC, Tradition Builders, Inc., Heaven Woodworks, Inc., Bishop & Sons Plumbing & Piping, Inc., and John Doe 1-10, Third Party Defendants

And

Alpha Omega Construction Group, LLC, Third Party Plaintiff

v.

Arteaga Roofing, LLC, Melinda Amador, James Bayles, Blanca Christina Lopez, Flavio Morales, Daniel Leon Ramos, Juan Garza Ramos and Fidel Morales, Third Party Defendants.

---

**PROOF OF SERVICE**

---

The undersigned hereby certifies that on April 3, 2023, copies of **NOTICE OF APPEAL** were served on all counsel of record via email to counsels' individual AIS email addresses:

Amanda M. Blundy, Esquire (S.C. Bar No. 73069)  
English Hanahan Maull, Esquire (S.C. Bar No. 104321)  
Blundy Law Firm, LLC  
234 Seven Farms Drive, Suite 111-A  
Charleston, SC 29492  
Telephone: 843.867.6050  
[ablundy@blundylawfirm.com](mailto:ablundy@blundylawfirm.com)  
[emaull@blundylawfirm.com](mailto:emaull@blundylawfirm.com)

Robert L. Wylie, IV, Esq. (SC Bar No. 13052)  
James L. Hills, Jr., Esq. (SC Bar No. 100942)  
Mullen Wylie, LLC  
4717 Jenn Drive, Second Floor (29577)  
Post Office Box 1980  
Myrtle Beach, SC 29578  
Telephone: 843.449.4800  
[rwylie@mullenwylie.com](mailto:rwylie@mullenwylie.com)  
[jhills@mullenwylie.com](mailto:jhills@mullenwylie.com)

D. Ryan McCabe, Jr., Esq. (SC Bar No. 16977)  
McCabe, Trotter & Beverly, P.C.  
4500 Fort Jackson Blvd., Suite 250  
Columbia, SC 29209  
PO Box 212069  
Columbia, SC 29221  
Telephone: 803.724.5000  
[ryan.mccabe@mccabetrotter.com](mailto:ryan.mccabe@mccabetrotter.com)

Francis E. Grimball (SC Bar No. 2310)  
Mullen Wylie, LLC  
171 Church Street, Suite 370  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.853.6200  
[fgrimball@mullenwylie.com](mailto:fgrimball@mullenwylie.com)

*Attorneys for Respondent Royal Palms Property Owners Association, Inc.*

L. Dean Best (SC Bar No. 11952)  
Best Law, P.A.  
999 Lake Hunter Circle, Suite D  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Post Office Box 2374  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
Telephone: 843.793.4744  
[dean@bestlawsc.com](mailto:dean@bestlawsc.com)

Mark Shanter Chaparro (SC Bar No. 102419)  
Best Law, P.A.  
999 Lake Hunter Circle, Suite D  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Post Office Box 2374  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
843.793.4744  
[shanter@bestlawsc.com](mailto:shanter@bestlawsc.com)

*Attorneys for Alpha Omega Construction Group Inc.*

Sonaly Kirkley Hendricks (SC Bar No. 74229)  
Pierce, Sloan, Wilson, Kennedy & Early, LLC  
321 E Bay Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Post Office Box 22437  
Charleston, SC 29401  
843.722.7733  
[sonalyhendricks@piercesloan.com](mailto:sonalyhendricks@piercesloan.com)

William Oglesby Sweeny, IV (SC Bar No. 78668)  
Rogers Townsend LLC  
205 King Street, Suite 201  
Charleston, SC 29401  
843.300.1000  
[billy.sweeny@rogerstownsend.com](mailto:billy.sweeny@rogerstownsend.com)

*Attorneys for Royal Palms Holding Inc.*

Erin DuBose Dean (SC Bar No. 65320)  
Tupper, Grimsley, Dean & Canaday, P.A.  
611 Bay Street  
Beaufort, SC 29902  
Post Office Box 2055  
Beaufort, SC 29901-2055  
843.524.1116  
[erindean@tgdcpa.com](mailto:erindean@tgdcpa.com)

Caroline Coward McIntosh (SC Bar No 73737)  
Luzuriaga Mims, LLP  
1156 King Street  
Charleston, SC 29403  
Telephone: 843.410.471  
[cmcintosh@lmlawllp.com](mailto:cmcintosh@lmlawllp.com)

Kevin W. Mims (SC Bar No. 69418)  
Luzuriaga Mims, LLP  
1156 King Street  
Charleston, SC 29403  
Telephone: 843.410.4713  
[kmims@lmlawllp.com](mailto:kmims@lmlawllp.com)

*Attorneys for Sagehorn and Company*

Roman Vincent Hammes (SC Bar No. 76977)  
Charpia & Hammes, Attorneys at Law  
215 W. 2Nd South Street  
Summerville, SC 29483  
Telephone: 843.261.7026  
[roman@charpialaw.com](mailto:roman@charpialaw.com)

*Attorney for Cesar Desouza & Cesar E De Souza*

David Starr Cobb (SC Bar No. 66569)  
Turner Padget Graham & Laney, PA  
PO Box 22129  
Charleston, SC 29413-2129

Telephone: 843.576.2803  
[dcobb@turnerpadget.com](mailto:dcobb@turnerpadget.com)

*Attorney for Carolina Foundation Inc.*

Tyler Ethan Cloud (SC Bar No. 103155)  
Clawson & Staubes, LLC  
126 Seven Farms Drive  
#200  
Charleston, SC 29492  
Telephone: 843.577.2026  
[tcloud@clawsonandstaubes.com](mailto:tcloud@clawsonandstaubes.com)

Michael Lawrence Leech (SC Bar No. 1000516)  
Clawson & Staubes, LLC  
126 Seven Farms Dr, Ste. 200  
Charleston, SC 29492-8144  
Telephone: 843.577.2026  
[mleech@clawsonandstaubes.com](mailto:mleech@clawsonandstaubes.com)

*Attorneys for DVS, Inc.*

Francis Heyward Grimball (SC Bar No. 101743)  
Richardson Plowden & Robinson, PA  
235 Magrath Darby  
Suite 100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.714.2616  
[fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com)

*Attorney for Mark Wolverson*

Erin DuBose Dean (SC Bar No. 65320)  
Tupper, Grimsley, Dean & Canaday, P.A.  
PO Box 2055  
Beaufort, SC 29901-2055  
Telephone: 843.524.1116  
[erindean@tgdcpa.com](mailto:erindean@tgdcpa.com)

*Attorney for Raul Martinez Masonry, LLC*

Catherine Holland Chase (SC Bar No. 74593)  
Clement Rivers, LLP  
PO Box 993  
Charleston, SC 29402-0993  
Telephone: 843.720.5488  
[cchase@ycrlaw.com](mailto:cchase@ycrlaw.com)

*Attorney for Simons Construction Company, LLC*

Christopher Clay Olson (SC Bar No. 17007)  
Gordon & Rees LLP  
40 Calhoun Street  
Suite 350  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.714.2509  
[colson@grsm.com](mailto:colson@grsm.com)

*Attorney for Bruza Construction, LLC*

Edward Glenn Elliott (SC Bar No. 7838)  
Aiken Bridges Elliott Tyler & Saleeby, P.A.  
Aiken Bridges  
PO Drawer 1931  
Florence, SC 29503  
Telephone: 843.669.8787 ext. 328  
[ege@aikenbridges.com](mailto:ege@aikenbridges.com)

*Attorney for WW Pereira Construction, LLC*

Sarah E. Butler (SC Bar No. 17235)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun St., Ste. 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.727.0307  
[sbutler@csvg.law](mailto:sbutler@csvg.law)

Ms. Julia A. Bradshaw (SC Bar No. 103767)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.329.1261  
[jbradshaw@csvg.law](mailto:jbradshaw@csvg.law)

*Attorneys for Henry Palmer*

Thomas McRoy Shelley, III (SC Bar No. 7067)  
Rogers Townsend LLC  
PO Box 100200  
1221 Main St., 14Th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29202-3200  
Telephone: 803.771.7900  
[roy.shelley@rogerstownsend.com](mailto:roy.shelley@rogerstownsend.com)

Steven T. Moon (SC Bar No. 6488)  
Rogers Townsend LLC  
PO Box 100200  
Columbia, SC 29202-3200  
Telephone: 803.771.7900  
[steven.moon@rogerstownsend.com](mailto:steven.moon@rogerstownsend.com)

*Attorneys for JAS Construction Services, LLC*

Francis Heyward Grimball (SC Bar No. 101743)  
Richardson Plowden & Robinson, PA  
235 Magrath Darby  
Suite 100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.714.2616  
[fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com)

*Attorney for Archer Exteriors, Inc.*

PHILIP Paul CRISTALDI, III (SC Bar No. 102219)  
Ross & Cristaldi, LLC  
863 Coleman Blvd. Ste. B  
Mt Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.991.4328  
[pcristaldi@rclawsc.com](mailto:pcristaldi@rclawsc.com)

Jeffrey A Ross (SC Bar No. 74254)  
Ross & Cristaldi, LLC  
863 Coleman Blvd., Ste B  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.329.4040  
[jross@rclawsc.com](mailto:jross@rclawsc.com)

*Attorneys for Cohens Drywall Company, Inc.*

Alan Ross Belcher, Jr. (SC Bar No. 71686)  
Hall Booth Smith, PC  
111 Coleman Blvd.  
Suite 301  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.720.3460  
[alan.belcher@hallboothsmith.com](mailto:alan.belcher@hallboothsmith.com)

Connor Evan Johnson (SC Bar No. 103111)  
Hall Booth Smith, PC  
111 Coleman Boulevard  
Suite 301  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29464

Telephone: 843.720.3487  
[connorjohnson@hallboothsmith.com](mailto:connorjohnson@hallboothsmith.com)

*Attorneys for CEBS Construction, LLC*

Hannah E. Smith (SC Bar No. 105237)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun Street., Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.266.8233  
[hsmith@csvg.law](mailto:hsmith@csvg.law)

John Patrick Turner Norris (SC Bar No. 78270)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun St., Ste. 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.266.8219  
[pnorris@csvg.law](mailto:pnorris@csvg.law)

Madison Brooke Alger (SC Bar No. 101385)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun St, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.266.8207  
[malger@csvg.law](mailto:malger@csvg.law)

*Attorneys for Associated Materials Incorporated*

Stephen P. Hughes (SC Bar No. 2805)  
Howell Gibson & Hughes, PA  
PO Box 40  
Beaufort, SC 29901  
Telephone: 843.522.2400  
[sphughes@hgghpa.com](mailto:sphughes@hgghpa.com)

*Attorney for Builders Firstsource Southeast Group, LLC*

Claude Townsend Prevost, III (SC Bar No. 74343)  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
PO Box 12487  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Telephone: 803.256.2660  
[cprevost@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:cprevost@collinsandlacy.com)

Robert McNair Peele, III (SC Bar No. 77569)  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
Collins & Lacy  
PO Box 12487  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Telephone: 803.256.2660  
[rpeele@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:rpeele@collinsandlacy.com)

*Attorneys for Sunrise Siding, LLC*

Sarah E. Butler (SC Bar No. 17235)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun St., Ste. 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.727.0307  
[sbutler@csvg.law](mailto:sbutler@csvg.law)

Ms. Julia A. Bradshaw (SC Bar No. 103767)  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
Copeland, Stair, Valz & Lovell, LLP  
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.329.1261  
[jbradshaw@csvg.law](mailto:jbradshaw@csvg.law)

*Attorneys for Palmers Construction Services, LLC*

Jennifer Sue Ivey (SC Bar No. 102533)  
Walker Gressette & Linton, LLC  
P.O. Drawer 22167  
Charleston, SC 29413  
Telephone: 843.727.2216  
[ivey@wglfirm.com](mailto:ivey@wglfirm.com)

*Attorney for Hurley Services, LLC*

John Blanton O'Neal, IV (SC Bar No. 68511)  
Hood Law Firm, LLC  
172 Meeting Street  
Charleston, South Carolina 29401  
Post Office Box 1508  
Charleston, SC 29402  
Telephone: 843.577.4435  
[blanton.oneal@hoodlaw.com](mailto:blanton.oneal@hoodlaw.com)

Kathryn Nicole Tanner (SC Bar No. 105334)  
Hood Law Firm, LLC  
172 Meeting Street

Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.577.1210  
[katie.tanner@hoodlaw.com](mailto:katie.tanner@hoodlaw.com)

*Attorneys for CMAC Construction, LLC*

Robert McNair Peele, III (SC Bar No. 77569)  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
1330 Lady Street, 6th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Post Office Box 12487  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Telephone: 803.256.2660  
[rpeele@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:rpeele@collinsandlacy.com)

James Lloyd Williams (SC Bar No. 102408)  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
1330 Lady Street, Sixth Floor  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Telephone: 803.256.2660  
[jwilliams@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:jwilliams@collinsandlacy.com)

*Attorneys for J. Plitz Construction LLC*

Neil S. Haldrup (SC Bar No. 13017)  
Wall Templeton & Haldrup, PA  
145 King St # 300  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Post Office Box 1200  
Charleston, SC 29402  
Telephone: 843.329.9500  
[neil.haldrup@walltempleton.com](mailto:neil.haldrup@walltempleton.com)

Sidney Markey Stubbs (SC Bar No. 7973)  
Baker Ravenel & Bender, LLP  
3710 Landmark Dr # 400  
Columbia, SC 29204  
Post Office Box 8057  
Columbia, SC 29202  
Telephone: 803.799.9091  
[mstubbs@brblegal.com](mailto:mstubbs@brblegal.com)

*Attorneys for Builders Insulation of North Carolina LLC*

Jordan Chelsae Davis (SC Bar No. 104622)  
Baker Ravenel & Bender, LLP  
3710 Landmark Dr #400  
Columbia, SC 29204

Telephone: 803.343.3866  
[jdavis@brblegal.com](mailto:jdavis@brblegal.com)

Everett Augustus Kendall, II (SC Bar No. 8450)  
Murphy & Grantland, PA  
4406 B Forest Drive  
Columbia, SC 29206  
Post Office Box 6648  
Columbia, SC 29260  
Telephone: 803.782.4100  
[rkendall@murphygrantland.com](mailto:rkendall@murphygrantland.com)

Scott William Giblin (SC Bar No. 105368)  
Murphy & Grantland, PA  
4406 B Forest Drive  
Columbia, SC 29206  
Post Office Box 6648  
Columbia, SC 29260  
Telephone: 803.782.4100  
[sgiblin@murphygrantland.com](mailto:sgiblin@murphygrantland.com)

*Attorneys for Bishop and Sons Plumbing Inc*

Roopal S. Ruparelia (SC Bar No: 16003)  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, PA  
1201 Main St # 2200  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Post Office Box 11889  
Columbia, SC 29211-1889  
803.540.7846  
[rruparelia@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:rruparelia@hsblawfirm.com)

Clarke W. DuBose (SC Bar No. 1761)  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, PA  
1201 Main St # 2200  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Post Office Box 11889  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Telephone: 803.540.7833  
[cdubose@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:cdubose@hsblawfirm.com)

*Attorneys for Juan Garza Ramos*

Shanna Milcetic Stephens (SC Bar No. 72012)  
Anderson Reynolds & Stephens, LLC  
37 Broad Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Post Office Box 87

Charleston, SC 29402  
Telephone: 843.723.0185  
[sstephens@arslawsc.com](mailto:sstephens@arslawsc.com)

Danielle Beck Wegener (SC Bar No. 77481)  
Anderson Reynolds & Stephens, LLC  
37 Broad Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Post Office Box 87  
Charleston, SC 29402  
Telephone: 843.723.0185  
[dwegener@arslawsc.com](mailto:dwegener@arslawsc.com)

*Attorneys for Daniel Leon Ramos*

Brandon Todd Reeser (SC Bar No. 101342)  
Wilson Heyward & Reeser, LLC  
924 Folly Road  
Charleston, SC 29412  
Post Office Box 13177  
Charleston, SC 29422  
Telephone: 843.762.4567  
[breeser@wilsonheyward.com](mailto:breeser@wilsonheyward.com)

*Attorney for Blanca Christina Lopez*

Jason Alan Daigle (SC Bar No. 73308)  
Young Clement Rivers  
25 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: 843.577.4000  
[jdaigle@ycrlaw.com](mailto:jdaigle@ycrlaw.com)

*Attorney for Arteaga Roofing LLC*

Allen Leland DuPre (SC Bar No. 13517)  
Lyles & Associates, LLC  
1037 Chuck Dawley Blvd., Suite G-100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.577.7730  
[ald@lylesfirm.com](mailto:ald@lylesfirm.com)

Caroline Kathryn Hicks (SC Bar No. 105289)  
Lyles & Associates, LLC  
1037 Chuck Dawley Blvd Suite G-100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
Telephone: 843.806.3281  
[ckh@lylesfirm.com](mailto:ckh@lylesfirm.com)

*Attorney for Melinda Amador*

Patrick J. McDonald (SC Bar No. 16921)  
Resnick & Louis, P.C.  
146 Fairchild Street, Suite 130  
Daniel Island, SC 29492  
Telephone: 843.270.0675  
[pmcdonald@rlattorneys.com](mailto:pmcdonald@rlattorneys.com)

Kirkley Gibson White (SC Bar No. 103702)  
Resnick & Louis, P.C.  
164 Fairchild Street, Suite 130  
Charleston, SC 29492  
Telephone: 843.212.0435  
[kwhite@rlattorneys.com](mailto:kwhite@rlattorneys.com)

*Attorneys for Flavio Morales*

s/Katon E. Dawson Jr.

---

James Lynn Werner, (SC Bar No. 6029)  
Taylor H. Stair (SC Bar No. 78430)  
Katon E. Dawson, Jr. (SC Bar No. 101167)  
Parker Poe Adams & Bernstein LLP  
1221 Main Street, Suite 1100  
Columbia, SC 29201  
(803) 255-8000  
[jimwerner@parkerpoe.com](mailto:jimwerner@parkerpoe.com)  
[taylorstair@parkerpoe.com](mailto:taylorstair@parkerpoe.com)  
[katondawson@parkerpoe.com](mailto:katondawson@parkerpoe.com)

April 3, 2023

*Attorneys for Appellant Lennar Carolinas, LLC*



RECEIVED

Apr 03 2023

SC Court of Appeals

Katon E. Dawson, Jr.  
*Partner*  
t: 803.253.6854  
f: 803.255.8017  
katondawson@parkerpoe.com

Atlanta, GA  
Charleston, SC  
Charlotte, NC  
Columbia, SC  
Greenville, SC  
Raleigh, NC  
Spartanburg, SC  
Washington, DC

April 3, 2023

**Via E-Mail [ctappfilings@sccourts.org] and U.S. Mail**

The Honorable Jenny Abbott Kitchings  
Clerk, South Carolina Court of Appeals  
1220 Senate Street  
Columbia, SC 29201

Re: ***Royal Palms Property Owner Association, on behalf of themselves and similarly situated, v. Lennar Carolinas, LLC, et al.***  
**Case No. 2020-CP-10-03931**

Dear Mrs. Kitchings:

Enclosed for filing please find Appellant Lennar Carolinas, LLC's Notice of Appeal in the above referenced matter. Also enclosed please find copies of the orders to be challenged on appeal, the Proof of Service, and this Firm's check in the amount of \$250.00 in satisfaction of the Court of Appeal's filing fee.

By copy of this correspondence, we are serving all counsel of record with a copy of the Notice of Appeal. A copy of this Notice of Appeal will also be filed electronically with the Charleston County Clerk of Court. Should you have any questions regarding this matter, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads 'Katon E. Dawson, Jr.'.

Katon E. Dawson, Jr.

KED  
Enclosures

Cc:

Amanda M. Blundy, Esquire, [ablundy@blundylawfirm.com](mailto:ablundy@blundylawfirm.com)  
English Hanahan Maull, Esquire, [emaull@blundylawfirm.com](mailto:emaull@blundylawfirm.com)  
Robert L. Wylie, IV, Esquire, [rwylie@mullenwylie.com](mailto:rwylie@mullenwylie.com)

PPAB 8863008v1

The Honorable Jenny Abbott Kitchings  
April 3, 2023  
Page 2

James L. Hills, Jr., Esquire, [jhills@mullenwylie.com](mailto:jhills@mullenwylie.com)  
D. Ryan McCabe, Jr., Esquire, [ryan.mccabe@mccabetrotter.com](mailto:ryan.mccabe@mccabetrotter.com)  
Francis E. Grimball, Esquire, [fgrimball@mullenwylie.com](mailto:fgrimball@mullenwylie.com)  
L. Dean Best, Esquire, [dean@bestlawsc.com](mailto:dean@bestlawsc.com)  
Mark Shanter Chaparro, Esquire, [shanter@bestlawsc.com](mailto:shanter@bestlawsc.com)  
Sonaly Kirkley Hendricks, Esquire, [sonalyhendricks@piercesloan.com](mailto:sonalyhendricks@piercesloan.com)  
William Oglesby Sweeny, IV, Esquire, [billy.sweeny@rogerstownsends.com](mailto:billy.sweeny@rogerstownsends.com)  
Erin DuBose Dean, Esquire, [erindean@tgdcpa.com](mailto:erindean@tgdcpa.com)  
Caroline Coward McIntosh, Esquire; [cmcintosh@lmlawllp.com](mailto:cmcintosh@lmlawllp.com)  
Kevin W. Mims, Esquire, [kmims@lmlawllp.com](mailto:kmims@lmlawllp.com)  
Roman Vincent Hammes, Esquire, [roman@charpialaw.com](mailto:roman@charpialaw.com)  
David Starr Cobb, Esquire, [dcobb@turnerpadget.com](mailto:dcobb@turnerpadget.com)  
Tyler Ethan Cloud, Esquire, [tcloud@clawsonandstaubes.com](mailto:tcloud@clawsonandstaubes.com)  
Michael Lawrence Leech, Esquire, [mleech@clawsonandstaubes.com](mailto:mleech@clawsonandstaubes.com)  
Francis Heyward Grimball, Esquire, [fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com)  
Erin DuBose Dean, Esquire, [erindean@tgdcpa.com](mailto:erindean@tgdcpa.com)  
Catherine Holland Chase, Esquire, [cchase@ycrlaw.com](mailto:cchase@ycrlaw.com)  
Christopher Clay Olson, Esquire, [colson@grsm.com](mailto:colson@grsm.com)  
Edward Glenn Elliott, Esquire, [ege@aikenbridges.com](mailto:ege@aikenbridges.com)  
Sarah E. Butler, Esquire, [sbutler@csvl.law](mailto:sbutler@csvl.law)  
Julia A. Bradshaw, Esquire, [jbradshaw@csvl.law](mailto:jbradshaw@csvl.law)  
Thomas McRoy Shelley, III, Esquire, [roy.shelley@rogerstownsends.com](mailto:roy.shelley@rogerstownsends.com)  
Steven T. Moon, Esquire, [steven.moon@rogerstownsends.com](mailto:steven.moon@rogerstownsends.com)  
Francis Heyward Grimball, Esquire, [fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com)  
Philip Paul Cristaldi, III, Esquire, [pcristaldi@rclawsc.com](mailto:pcristaldi@rclawsc.com)  
Jeffrey A. Ross, Esquire, [jross@rclawsc.com](mailto:jross@rclawsc.com)  
Alan Ross Belcher, Jr., Esquire, [alan.belcher@hallboothsmith.com](mailto:alan.belcher@hallboothsmith.com)  
Connor Evan Johnson, Esquire, [connorjohnson@hallboothsmith.com](mailto:connorjohnson@hallboothsmith.com)  
Hannah E. Smith, Esquire, [hsmith@csvl.law](mailto:hsmith@csvl.law)  
John Patrick Turner Norris, Esquire, [pnorris@csvl.law](mailto:pnorris@csvl.law)  
Madison Brooke Alger, Esquire, [malger@csvl.law](mailto:malger@csvl.law)  
Stephen P. Hughes Esquire, [sphughes@hghpa.com](mailto:sphughes@hghpa.com)  
Claude Townsend Prevost, III Esquire, [cprevost@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:cprevost@collinsandlacy.com)  
Robert McNair Peele, III, Esquire, [rpeele@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:rpeele@collinsandlacy.com)  
Sarah E. Butler, Esquire, [sbutler@csvl.law](mailto:sbutler@csvl.law)  
Julia A. Bradshaw, Esquire, [jbradshaw@csvl.law](mailto:jbradshaw@csvl.law)  
Jennifer Sue Ivey, Esquire, [ivey@wglfirm.com](mailto:ivey@wglfirm.com)  
John Blanton O'Neal, IV, Esquire, [blanton.oneal@hoodlaw.com](mailto:blanton.oneal@hoodlaw.com)  
Kathryn Nicole Tanner, Esquire, [katie.tanner@hoodlaw.com](mailto:katie.tanner@hoodlaw.com)  
Robert McNair Peele, III, Esquire, [rpeele@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:rpeele@collinsandlacy.com)  
James Lloyd Williams, Esquire, [jwilliams@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:jwilliams@collinsandlacy.com)  
Neil S. Haldrup, Esquire, [neil.haldrup@walltempleton.com](mailto:neil.haldrup@walltempleton.com)  
Sidney Markey Stubbs, Esquire, [mstubbs@brblegal.com](mailto:mstubbs@brblegal.com)  
Jordan Chelsae Davis, Esquire, [jdavis@brblegal.com](mailto:jdavis@brblegal.com)  
Everett Augustus Kendall, II, Esquire, [rkendall@murphygrantland.com](mailto:rkendall@murphygrantland.com)  
Scott William GIBLIN, Esquire, [sgiblin@murphygrantland.com](mailto:sgiblin@murphygrantland.com)  
Roopal S. Ruparelia, Esquire, [rruparelia@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:rruparelia@hsblawfirm.com)  
Clarke W. DuBose, Esquire, [cdubose@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:cdubose@hsblawfirm.com)  
Shanna Milcetich Stephens, Esquire, [sstephens@arslawsc.com](mailto:sstephens@arslawsc.com)  
Danielle Beck Wegener, Esquire, [dwegener@arslawsc.com](mailto:dwegener@arslawsc.com)  
Brandon Todd Reeser, LLC, Esquire, [breeser@wilsonheyward.com](mailto:breeser@wilsonheyward.com)

The Honorable Jenny Abbott Kitchings

April 3, 2023

Page 3

Jason Alan Daigle, Esquire, [jdaigle@ycrlaw.com](mailto:jdaigle@ycrlaw.com)

Allen Leland DuPre, Esquire, [ald@lylesfirm.com](mailto:ald@lylesfirm.com)

Caroline Kathryn Hicks, Esquire, [ckh@lylesfirm.com](mailto:ckh@lylesfirm.com)

Patrick J. McDonald, Esquire, [pmcdonald@rlattorneys.com](mailto:pmcdonald@rlattorneys.com)

Kirkley Gibson White, Esquire, [kwhite@rlattorneys.com](mailto:kwhite@rlattorneys.com)