

1 STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA )  
2 ) IN THE COURT OF  
3 COUNTY OF CHARLESTON ) COMMON PLEAS  
4

5 JOHN DOE, ) CASE NO. 2006-CP-18-01310  
6 Plaintiff, )  
7 Vs )

8 BISHOP OF CHARLESTON,) NOVEMBER 23, 2022  
9 Defendants ) ORANGEBURG, SOUTH CAROLINA

10 HONORABLE HEATH P. TAYLOR, JUDGE

11 A P P E A R A N C E S:

12 BY: DAVID K. HALLER, ESQUIRE

13 Attorney for the Class

14 BY: BENJAMIN C. BRUNER, ESQUIRE

15 CHELSEA J. CLARK, ESQUIRE

16 Attorneys for Richter

17 BY: JOHN E. CUTTINO, ESQUIRE

18 Attorney for Haller

19 BY: GREGG R. MYERS, ESQUIRE

20 Attorney for the McDonald's

21 BY: RICHARD S. DUKES, JR, ESQUIRE

22 Attorney for Dioceses of Charleston

23 BY: ALLEN SIRES, pro se

24 KATHERINE A. SPIRES

25 REGISTERED PROFESSIONAL REPORTER

**RECEIVED**  
**May 23 2023**  
**SC Court of Appeals**

1 THE COURT: We are here for a status conference in  
2 the Doe verses Bishop of Charleston. As you all know, I  
3 have been appointed by the Supreme Court to try to put  
4 this matter to rest. Let me go I guess first get  
5 everybody's name. I know Mr. Cuttino. I know  
6 Mr. Bruner. I don't think I've worked with any of you  
7 others, so if y'all let me know who's here and who you  
8 represent.

9 MR. HALLER: Good morning, Your Honor, I'm David  
10 Haller and I apologize for being late.

11 THE COURT: Not a problem.

12 MR. HALLER: I represent the class, the Plaintiff in  
13 this action.

14 THE COURT: And, John, who do you represent?

15 MR. CUTTINO: I represent Mr. Haller.

16 THE COURT: Okay. And, Ben, you represent Mr.  
17 Richter and the firm?

18 MR. BRUNER: And the former firm of Richter and  
19 Haller, yes, Your Honor.

20 THE COURT: Okay. All right. Who we got next?

21 MR. DUKES: I'm Richard Dukes, I represent the  
22 Diocese of Charleston.

23 THE COURT: All right. Who we got next?

24 MS. CLARK: I'm Chelsea Clark, Your Honor, I'm  
25 cocounsel with Ben representing Mr. Richter and the

1 former law firm.

2 THE COURT: Okay.

3 MR. MYERS: Your Honor, my name is Gregg Myers, I'm  
4 representing the McDonald's. Two persons who  
5 participated in the class. So it's Julie McDonald and  
6 Richard McDonald.

7 THE COURT: All right. Yes, sir?

8 MR. SIRES: Allen Sires, I represent myself and  
9 victims of child sexual abuse who will not be here. Or  
10 most likely be -- some will be here later if permitted  
11 and some will not want to meet with anyone here. But I  
12 would be glad to convey their stories and get affidavits  
13 from them.

14 THE COURT: Well, we're not here for any -- I don't  
15 want to say substantive reason because it's all  
16 substantive, but we're not here to get into the merits  
17 of anything today. I'm trying to get my head around  
18 where we are procedurally and what we need to do moving  
19 forward. So we're not here to take any evidence or  
20 testimony or anything like that today.

21 MR. SIRES: I've called David Pascoe's office about  
22 his investigation and they had no documents at this  
23 time.

24 THE COURT: Okay.

25 MR. MYERS: And, Your Honor, if I may? Mr. Sires is

1 a class representative from the class action.

2 THE COURT: Okay.

3 MR. HALLER: I guess technically, Your Honor, that  
4 would make him my client.

5 THE COURT: Okay. All right. And I have -- I've  
6 looked through everything that everyone has sent me and  
7 I appreciate it. But I want to -- you know, I've worked  
8 with Mr. Cuttino before, I've worked with Mr. Bruner  
9 before, I haven't worked with any of the rest of you,  
10 but one thing I want to say from the outset, there seems  
11 to be a lot of animosity, acrimony, all that good stuff  
12 going on and that ain't me. I don't deal with it. I  
13 don't like drama. I'm here to do a legal job and  
14 personal grudges, all that good stuff can stay in the  
15 hall. You know, we're going to refer to Judge Goodstein  
16 as Judge Goodstein not the Shock Four Circuit Court  
17 Judge. You know, I don't know what's going on  
18 personally amongst everybody, but let's, you know, put  
19 all that behind us and act like lawyers and, you know,  
20 this isn't personal, everybody's got a job to do. So I  
21 want to let you guys know that's how I operate.

22 So with that being said, where are we? Who can -- I  
23 mean, I've read the orders as much as I can. You know,  
24 this case is so old, a lot of stuff is not online, so my  
25 assistant is going to go down and get me a copy of the

1 file next week.

2 MR. DUKES: I can tell you, Judge, there's nothing  
3 in it. The paper file is in a box in the clerk's office  
4 in Saint George because in 2017 I went and looked for it  
5 and there's very little in there.

6 THE COURT: Okay. Do we know where it went?

7 MR. DUKES: No.

8 THE COURT: I mean, I know, Mr. Myers, you've been  
9 in this thing from the outset, I mean, do you have a  
10 good file? I know, Mr. Haller, you've been here from  
11 the outset, I mean, do y'all have -- I'm looking for  
12 orders that we can't find, you know, the electronic file  
13 references some orders from the Supreme Court. There  
14 may or may not have been an order of dismissal from -- I  
15 guess, Judge Kinard. Do y'all have a good file because  
16 we can't find one.

17 MR. MYERS: I have a pretty comprehensive  
18 collection, Your Honor. Although, I was only on the  
19 perforated class action at the time, but the work I've  
20 done because of other people who've contacted me since  
21 then has caused me to assemble a lot of information. I  
22 also at one point went through the paper file. I didn't  
23 copy everything, but I copied a lot of stuff that I knew  
24 I would need down the road. So I may be able to at  
25 least provide the Court and copies for the parties a

1 fair amount of stuff. I certainly have every order I  
2 ran across. So I may be able to provide the orders as a  
3 starting point just orient the Court.

4 THE COURT: Yeah. And that's what I'm trying to do  
5 is -- because I want to go ahead and get y'all in as  
6 quick as possible. I've got a term -- a general  
7 sessions term the week of December 12th in Dorchester  
8 and what I'm leaning towards if we can go ahead and  
9 resolve whatever motions or anything that's outstanding  
10 toward the end of that week like December 16th just go  
11 ahead and get things moving.

12 But I want to make sure I have a good procedural  
13 understanding of where we are. Because I know, again,  
14 there may have been an order issued by Judge Kinard or  
15 may not --

16 MR. MYERS: Judge Kinard didn't even enter the  
17 picture until 2013, so he certainly didn't issue an  
18 order in 2009.

19 THE COURT: Yeah, I know that.

20 MS. CLARK: If I might just for convenience  
21 purposes. I think the best public copy of the orders  
22 that we -- some of them that we've located is the record  
23 on appeal from the consolidated eighth case appeal that  
24 was decided last year, that would be on speed track that  
25 would have more copies of things than what otherwise

1 would be assembled somewhere publically.

2 MR. BRUNER: And that's what I was going to suggest,  
3 Your Honor, that the C Track has numerous copies of the  
4 record, I think there are four volumes of more --  
5 they're multiple copies because there was some  
6 corrections. I have a hyperlink that was in the letter  
7 I sent yesterday afternoon that is our copies of those,  
8 but the Court can get them directly from the Court of  
9 Appeals. Most of the filings should be contained in  
10 that record, I believe. But as you mentioned,  
11 Mr. Myers, Mr. Haller has been here from the beginning.  
12 Our firm has been involved for at least 13 years now, we  
13 have a collection too we should be able to get most of  
14 it to you.

15 THE COURT: Okay.

16 MR. MYERS: And, Your Honor, if I may. Many of the  
17 issues on appeal concern issues that aren't part of  
18 this. So in other words, there's -- when Your Honor  
19 unfortunately drew the short straw from the Supreme  
20 Court concerns just the class and the fact that it was  
21 never closed. And the issues that Mr. Sires has raised  
22 that my client's raised, we think need to be addressed  
23 and at least looked at.

24 But don't concern most of the appellate issues which  
25 had to do with out-of-state class members who are saying

1 why was the noticed changed, that, you know, there were  
2 issues in those cases that aren't in these cases. But  
3 this concerns the conduct of class counsel and the way  
4 certain class members got treated and not treated. It's  
5 simpler in that regard.

6 THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Haller, you got anything to  
7 add?

8 MR. HALLER: No, Your Honor.

9 THE COURT: All right. Well, that's what -- I mean,  
10 that's the main thing I need to do is get my -- and I  
11 think -- I know there were some of -- obviously, the  
12 class order that Judge Goodstein signed, all that stuff  
13 is in the materials you all submitted. But like I said,  
14 the electronic file references a few orders in there.  
15 Judge Dickson I think filed a couple of procedural  
16 orders, but there's a few things in there -- so y'all  
17 are telling me that Judge Kinard never signed an order?

18 MR. MYERS: No, he didn't, Your Honor. He took ill  
19 not long after he got appointed and died in 2015.

20 THE COURT: Because the public index is showing a  
21 disposition of dismissed by him.

22 MR. MYERS: Yeah, I've never seen that. Never even  
23 ran across --

24 THE COURT: And I know y'all had circulated an order  
25 of dismissal to Judge Goodstein, but that must have been

1 about the time she recused herself.

2 MR. HALLER: That's correct, Your Honor.

3 MR. DUKES: And, Judge, this is not in the record,  
4 but after a hearing in 2017 in another case, Judge  
5 Nicholson told me that he entered an order closing this  
6 case. And said, you think that's okay? And I said,  
7 well, sure, Judge, I think so. But apparently that  
8 never got entered. So I hate to say it, but who knows.

9 THE COURT: Well, I guess that's my job to find out.  
10 Okay. What we'll do then is my administrative assistant  
11 is going to go down there and see what she can find  
12 Monday or Tuesday of next week. And then what I'd like  
13 to do is go ahead and schedule whatever outstanding  
14 motions. I know some folks have asked me just to issue  
15 a Form 4. That would be very easy for me to do, but I  
16 think I need to at least let everybody who has filed a  
17 motion, make a record and go from there.

18 So what I'm looking at right now is absent there  
19 being a week long general sessions trial, I'm going to  
20 look to hear everything on December 16th unless anybody  
21 has a particular conflict, okay.

22 MR. HALLER: Your Honor, I am -- my daughter has  
23 been spending the semester in Purgatory in Florence,  
24 Italy, she turns 22 on Saturday and she asked me to come  
25 and spend two weeks with her traveling. I'm leaving on

1 the 15th.

2 THE COURT: Okay. You're leaving on the 15th. All  
3 right. Then how about we say the afternoon of the 14th,  
4 does that give everybody enough time? I know you're  
5 traveling --

6 MR. HALLER: I have a mediation on the 14th, if I  
7 need to move that I will move that.

8 THE COURT: Well, how about the 12th? How is that  
9 with everybody's schedule?

10 Mr. Haller? (Joking)

11 MR. HALLER: I have a hearing. The next three weeks  
12 are as busy for me.

13 THE COURT: I understand. I'm just messing with  
14 you. I remember what it's like.

15 MR. HALLER: I'm available on the 13th. I have a  
16 hearing scheduled in front of Judge Scarborough who's  
17 the Master and Equity in Charleston at 2 o'clock. I  
18 would expect that would take an hour. So, you know, I  
19 mean, if you wanted to do -- ask Judge Scarborough if he  
20 would move it back or --

21 THE COURT: Well, I was just trying since I was  
22 going to be down there and I know a number of you are  
23 from Charleston just for convenience purposes, but I can  
24 do it -- I mean, we can wait until after the first of  
25 the year. I was just trying to get something going.

1 And I'm going to be in Dorchester a pretty good bit  
2 after the first of the year too. I'm not wet into  
3 having it that week, I was just trying to get things  
4 moving along.

5 MR. HALLER: I appreciate that and I'm sorry that my  
6 schedule is what it is.

7 THE COURT: That's all right. Hey, I know what it's  
8 like to be busy. That's no problem.

9 MR. HALLER: Whatever you -- if you'd like to do it  
10 on the 12th or the 14th, I can move either of those.

11 THE COURT: Pull up my schedule for January.  
12 Because I'm going to be -- I mean, I don't think I leave  
13 the circuit next six months but twice. So, I mean, I'm  
14 around. Why don't we look at -- let's go ahead and  
15 schedule it now for January 27th and that should give us  
16 time to -- everybody get their heads around it or for me  
17 to, you all have your heads around it, for me to get  
18 mine around it. And then -- and that will be in  
19 Dorchester.

20 MR. HALLER: Thank you, Your Honor. I appreciate  
21 your consideration.

22 THE COURT: No problem.

23 MR. HALLER: As to the file, we were sort of  
24 brainstorming where it might be. There were parts of  
25 under Judge Goodstein's order, there were parts of the

1 file that were required to be under seal including the  
2 identity of the individual class members. If I had to  
3 guess, that material and everything else got put in some  
4 secret hiding chamber in the Dorchester County  
5 courthouse. Or when the courthouse moved because this  
6 was -- this was the old courthouse days when the  
7 courthouse moved something happened to the file then.

8 THE COURT: Well, I think they physically had to go  
9 into a vault once this order was issued to go find it.  
10 But, again, we just don't know what all is in there.

11 MR. HALLER: Something we can do to help?

12 THE COURT: I mean, if y'all have and I don't want  
13 to put everybody to a lot of extra work, but if you have  
14 a good file with all the pleadings at least, you know, I  
15 don't need all the correspondence obviously and all  
16 that, but if somebody has, you know, a comprehensive  
17 file of the pleadings and orders and can get that to me,  
18 then we can make sure everything matches up with what's  
19 in the clerk's file too just so I have a --

20 MR. DUKES: I know that I have -- my predecessors of  
21 the Dioceses counsel is a man named Peter Shea and I  
22 have Peter's file. Peter is an imminent pack rat, so  
23 everything's there, but he's also -- his sense of  
24 organization is different than mine, so finding it is --  
25 maybe a little more difficult, but I know I've got

1 everything.

2 THE COURT: Okay. And, Mr. Myers, you think you  
3 have everything too?

4 MR. MYERS: Well, I have a lot and I'm glad to  
5 organize it. I have it all by date and I have it  
6 electronically. So I'm glad to circulate what I've got  
7 and provide it to the Court and to the parties and, you  
8 know, we'll see. I know to go and clean it up and make  
9 sure it's clean copies.

10 THE COURT: Okay. That would be good. I mean, what  
11 you all have provided so far has been helpful. I feel  
12 like I have a pretty good grasp, but I don't want to be  
13 missing something. Because, again, the public index  
14 shows a number of orders that y'all didn't provide. I  
15 mean, I didn't ask you to obviously, but -- that we just  
16 can't find. They're not -- this case is of the age that  
17 everything was not -- you know, we weren't e-filing  
18 then, so, you know, can't get my hands on a lot of it to  
19 give me an idea of, you know, where procedurally  
20 everything exactly stands.

21 MR. MYERS: If you give me about ten days, Your  
22 Honor, I think I can get something circulated.

23 MR. BRUNER: The index should at least show what was  
24 filed, Your Honor, and we may be able to amongst  
25 ourselves --

1 MR. DUKES: Reconstruct it.

2 MR. BRUNER: Look at the index and say by date,  
3 number, however way, at least say this is what we  
4 believe was filed at -- in these entries.

5 THE COURT: Yep.

6 MR. BRUNER: Some things like roster notice  
7 publications aren't really a separate document, but  
8 orders we should be able to birddog those.

9 THE COURT: Okay. There was a remitter order in  
10 2011 from the Supreme Court that we couldn't find.  
11 That's one that jumped out at me. Now, also there is --  
12 Mr. Myers, I have a copy of your motion, but there is  
13 another motion that was a motion -- it was filed May 11,  
14 2016 post award fairness hearing.

15 MR. MYERS: That's Mr. Sires, Your Honor. That's  
16 his motion.

17 THE COURT: Okay. I thought so.

18 MR. SIRES: I'll have to copy it and e-mail it to  
19 you.

20 THE COURT: Okay. That would be great. Because it  
21 wasn't electronically saved either, so I don't have a  
22 copy of it.

23 MS. CLARK: I'm not sure if there's anything missing  
24 from Judge Nicholson's time period, but I will mention  
25 that he's practicing in the O'Shea Law Firm as a

1 mediator as I understand it. And another lawyer in that  
2 firm, Brooklyn O'Shea was his law clerk, I believe, so  
3 if there's something that Judge Nicholson would have  
4 had, they may know about it.

5 THE COURT: Okay.

6 MR. MYERS: And, Your Honor, he may have -- Judge  
7 Nicholson may have asked things to be moved to  
8 Charleston at one point. I don't know that, but it's a  
9 possibility.

10 THE COURT: Okay. All right. Yeah, I know Brook.  
11 We'll reach out then and see if he has anything on it.

12 MR. HALLER: Your Honor, for the motions that you  
13 want to hear on the 27th, do you want any additional  
14 briefing from the parties, specifically the plaintiffs?

15 THE COURT: Whatever you want to do. I don't  
16 require anything. But if you want to file a memo or  
17 anything like that, that's fine, but I don't require it.  
18 I always hated filing those things myself. But if you  
19 just want to come argue that's fine too.

20 All right. So we got -- so right now there are --  
21 there's a motion to intervene and a motion for a post  
22 award fairness hearing; is there anything else  
23 outstanding?

24 MR. MYERS: As far as I know that's it, Your Honor,  
25 presently.

1 THE COURT: And, Mr. Myers, just so I'm clear, the  
2 motion to intervene is filed on behalf of the  
3 McDonald's, but they were already members of the class;  
4 correct?

5 MR. MYERS: Yes, sir.

6 THE COURT: Okay.

7 MR. SIRES: Your Honor, I had mail come to my  
8 residence regarding John Doe 66 and John Doe 66A. When  
9 I inquired about that, I was simply told that I was John  
10 Doe 66. However, I haven't been able to find out who  
11 John Doe 66A, is it a spouse of mine, a parent as laid  
12 out in their class action suit. So if anybody would  
13 care to clarify that at this time, I'd appreciate it.

14 THE COURT: Okay. And you want to know who --

15 MR. SIRES: Or quite possibly could be one of my  
16 children, I don't know. The Diocese has been pretty  
17 open to the format, the structure being what it is.  
18 It's just not that much money to quibble over what might  
19 be a dubious claim.

20 THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Haller?

21 MR. HALLER: Your Honor, in terms of identifying who  
22 the various Doe's are around her that Judge Goodstein's  
23 order is ironclad in maintaining the sanctity of those  
24 people's identities even to our own clients. So --

25 MR. SIRES: Thank you.

1 MR. HALLER: We're not at liberty to share that  
2 information unless Your Honor -- or, you know, unless  
3 Your Honor orders us to do so. But that was a key part  
4 of the agreement and the -- a key element for the manner  
5 in which this -- the settlement was structured was to  
6 maintain the confidentiality, the identities of the  
7 victims and their families.

8 THE COURT: Right.

9 MR. HALLER: So as to Mr. Sires, you know, Mr. Sires  
10 is brave enough to come forward himself, you know,  
11 uncloaking his Doe and congratulations for him having  
12 the strength to do that, but everybody else is entitled  
13 to their confidentiality.

14 THE COURT: Okay. Yeah, I would tend to agree with  
15 that. I don't --

16 MR. SIRES: Your Honor, it's been in the newspaper  
17 that spousal claims are a part of this show as well as  
18 parents. So when my name was thrown out there by the  
19 Diocese of Boston in the community that became clear to  
20 any relatives of mine that might want to jump in. So  
21 it's pretty clear that that opportunity was there. I'd  
22 just like to know if they got the money they needed.

23 THE COURT: Well, again, I think Mr. Haller is  
24 correct that there is pretty strict confidentiality  
25 requirements in the original order. And, I mean, if you

1 wanted to file a motion to unseal it or something, I'll  
2 be happy to hear you on it. But I don't think as of  
3 right now --

4 MR. SIRES: No, sir. I'd just like -- if Mr. Haller  
5 has contact with 66A and he tells me that they got the  
6 money and they're -- that they expected or the apology,  
7 whatever took place with that. If they're satisfied  
8 then that's fine.

9 THE COURT: Okay.

10 MR. MYERS: And also in 2014, Your Honor, we by  
11 consent allowed information to be shared among the  
12 litigants. There was a -- it didn't involve me, but  
13 there was some insurance claim I think at issue and so  
14 the adjustors needed to know who was who and we all did  
15 that by consent.

16 THE COURT: Okay.

17 MR. HALLER: It was Judge Dickson.

18 THE COURT: Right. I've seen that order. All right.  
19 Anything else? Okay. Well, let's plan on January 27th  
20 at 10 a.m. in Dorchester. And if anything else comes  
21 up, y'all are free to let me, you know, reach out to me  
22 and let me know. If there's -- I certainly would  
23 appreciate any copies of the pleadings and other  
24 outstanding orders that you can get me. So I can make  
25 sure I have a good handle. I mean, I think I pretty

1 well understand where we are. Now, I saw an accounting,  
2 I think it was on your memo?

3 MR. DUKES: Yes, Your Honor. I found that in  
4 Peter's files.

5 THE COURT: Right. Has any -- and I don't see where  
6 one was ever filed. Was one required to be filed?

7 MR. DUKES: No, sir.

8 THE COURT: And I didn't see it in the order that  
9 required a formal accounting.

10 MR. DUKES: I think Mr. Richter and Mr. Shade  
11 provided that to Judge Goodstein when all the claims  
12 have been paid, all the expenses have been paid,  
13 everything was zeroed out just to let her know it was  
14 over.

15 THE COURT: Okay.

16 MR. BRUNER: That's correct and that's in the  
17 hyperlink too. That was a letter and enclosures  
18 provided to Judge Goodstein following the claims process  
19 and the payments. It was initialed by Mr. Enfinger and  
20 by Mr. Todd who is was the CPA who handled the funds.  
21 And all that was provided to the judge. Whether that,  
22 you know, was ever formally stamped or whether it just  
23 went into the Court's file whether it did not --

24 MR. DUKES: I think it probably just went into the  
25 circular file.

1 MR. BRUNER: And it may have, Your Honor.

2 THE COURT: And it may have gone in her personal  
3 file that she keeps as well. I don't see anywhere -- I  
4 see there was an order at some point in February of '09,  
5 it just says order/order trust account. I don't know.  
6 Again, I haven't seen it.

7 MR. BRUNER: Right. And we may be -- part of this  
8 exercise may lead us into esoteric inquiries about what  
9 constitutes an order; right, and what is required by  
10 law. I've seen an order for continuance. There was a  
11 letter requesting continuance with handwriting to the  
12 judge, sent over and, you know, what happens to those.  
13 So we may hit some of those here in the near future.

14 THE COURT: Okay.

15 MR. BRUNER: But, yes, that accounting of the  
16 settlement funds was provided to the court.

17 THE COURT: Okay. And based on my review of it, it  
18 appears -- I mean, the account was zeroed out. There  
19 are no funds left?

20 MR. DUKES: No, there's nothing left.

21 THE COURT: And there are no outstanding claims or  
22 northing like that?

23 MR. DUKES: No.

24 THE COURT: Okay. I mean, you agree with that,  
25 Mr. Myers?

1           MR. MYERS: I don't know for sure, Your Honor. That  
2 sounds right to me. But I wanted to point out that I'm  
3 pretty sure it's the August 30th or 31st order from  
4 Judge Goodstein refers to getting an accounting in the  
5 future. So I think their reference was there. It makes  
6 sense for an accounting to be submitted to the court.

7           THE COURT: Okay. I'll check the order again.  
8 Probably was not looking for it, but now that I thought  
9 of it, the reason I asked. All right. Anything else?  
10 Okay. Well, I appreciate y'all coming down or coming  
11 up. Some came up. Some came down. Again, I wanted to  
12 meet everybody and, you know, see where we were and make  
13 sure I have a decent grasp of where we are. Obviously,  
14 y'all have been living with this case a lot longer than  
15 I have, so I wanted to, you know, just touch base with  
16 you personally.

17           So, again, if you have anything, anything pops up,  
18 you think of anything I need to see prior to January  
19 27th, just let me know. Otherwise, y'all have a good  
20 Thanksgiving.

21           - - -END OF REQUESTED TRANSCRIPT OF RECORD- - -  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA )

COUNTY OF CHARLESTON )

I, KATHERINE A. SPIRES, Registered Professional Reporter for the Ninth Judicial Circuit of the State of South Carolina, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, accurate and complete Transcript of Record of the proceedings had and the evidence introduced in the trial of the captioned case, relative to appeal, in the Court of Common Pleas for Charleston County, South Carolina, on the 23rd of November, 2022.

I do further certify that I am neither of kin, counsel, nor interest to any party hereto.

February 28, 2023

*s/Katherine A. Spires*

Katherine A. Spires

Registered Professional Reporter