

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
IN THE SUPREME COURT

RECEIVED

Jul 03 2023

S.C. SUPREME COURT

Appeal from Charleston County  
Court of Common Pleas

Deadra L. Jefferson, Circuit Court Judge

Case No. 2019-CP-10-01434

Court of Appeals Case No. 2019-001910  
Unpublished Opinion No. 2023-UP-005 (S.C. Ct. App. filed January 4, 2023)

Supreme Court Case No. 2023-000770

David Abdo,

Petitioner,

v.

City of Charleston and  
Board of Zoning Appeals-Zoning,

Respondents.

PROOF OF SERVICE

CLEMENT RIVERS, LLP  
Wilbur E. Johnson (SC Bar No. 3062)  
Russell G. Hines (SC Bar No. 72100)  
25 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, South Carolina 29401  
P.O. Box 993 (29402)  
wjohnson@ycrlaw.com  
rhines@ycrlaw.com  
(843) 720-5488

*and*

Julia P. Copeland (SC Bar No. 77199)  
CITY OF CHARLESTON  
Legal Department  
50 Broad Street  
Charleston, South Carolina 29401  
copelandj@charleston-sc.gov  
(843)-724-3730

*Attorneys for Respondents*

I, Russell G. Hines, of Clement Rivers, LLP, attorneys for Respondents, hereby certify that the **RETURN TO PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI** was served on July 3, 2023, on all parties to this matter via emailing (see attached) a copy of the same to the following:

Julia P. Copeland, Esquire  
[copelandj@charleston-sc.gov](mailto:copelandj@charleston-sc.gov)  
City of Charleston  
Legal Department  
50 Broad Street  
Charleston, SC 29401

*Additional Counsel for Respondents*

John A. Massalon, Esquire  
[jmassalon@wmalawfirm.net](mailto:jmassalon@wmalawfirm.net)  
Wills Massalon & Allen LLC  
P.O. Box 859  
Charleston, SC 29402  
*Attorneys for Appellant*

Respectfully submitted,  
CLEMENT RIVERS, LLP

By: s/Russell G. Hines  
Russell G. Hines (SC Bar No. 72100)

*Attorneys for Respondents*

Charleston, South Carolina

July 3, 2023

## Bell, Pollyana (Polly)

---

**From:** Bell, Pollyana (Polly)  
**Sent:** Monday, July 3, 2023 4:31 PM  
**To:** 'copelandj@charleston-sc.gov'; 'jmassalon@wmalawfirm.net';  
'csteichen@wmalawfirm.net'  
**Cc:** Hines, Russell; Justman, Aimee; Johnson, Wilbur; Russell, Karen  
**Subject:** Abdo v. City of Charleston (Sup. Ct. Case No. 2023-000770 ; Ct. App. Case No. 2019-001910) - CR 210598  
**Attachments:** Abdo v. Charleston -- Return to Cert Petition.pdf

Enclosed please find Respondents' Return to Petition for a Writ of Certiorari which will be filed today in the above-referenced matter.

Thank you,

Pollyana Bell  
Project Assistant  
Commercial Litigation Practice Group  
Phone:(843)720-5488 | Fax:(843)579-1369



**CLEMENT RIVERS, LLP**  
25 Calhoun Street • Suite 500 • Charleston, SC 29401  
FOR COUNSEL