

**RECEIVED**

**Sep 05 2023**

**S.C. SUPREME COURT**

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In the Supreme Court

APPEAL FROM RICHLAND COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas

Jean Hoefer Toal, Chief Justice (Ret.) and Acting Circuit Court Judge

Case No. 2020-CP-40-04385

Appellate Case No. 2023-001243

Southern Insulation, Inc., through its Receiver, Peter D. Protopapas,.....Respondent,

vs.

OneBeacon Insurance Group, Ltd. (f/k/a White Mountains Insurance Group, Ltd., f/k/a CGU Insurance Company, f/k/a Commercial Union Corporation, f/k/a General Accident Insurance Company of America); OneBeacon Insurance Group LLC (n/k/a Intact Insurance Group USA LLC); R.V. Chandler & Associates, Inc.; Chandler Rental Properties, Inc.; Thomas S. Chandler; Jean B. Ownbey, as Trustee of the Thomas S. Chandler, Sr. Living Trust u/d 4/06/06; Gene N. Norville; the South Carolina Property and Casualty Insurance Guaranty Association; Trebuchet US Holdings, Inc.; Trebuchet Investments Limited; Trebuchet Group Holdings Limited (f/k/a Armour Group Holdings Limited); Brad S. Huntington, individually; and John C. Williams, individually, Defendants,

Of which OneBeacon Insurance Group, Ltd. (f/k/a White Mountains Insurance Group, Ltd., f/k/a CGU Insurance Company, f/k/a Commercial Union Corporation, f/k/a General Accident Insurance Company of America); OneBeacon Insurance Group LLC (n/k/a Intact Insurance Group USA LLC); Trebuchet US Holdings, Inc.; Trebuchet Investments Limited; Trebuchet Group Holdings Limited (f/k/a Armour Group Holdings Limited); Brad S. Huntington, individually; and John C. Williams, individually, are the..... Petitioners.

**PROOF OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that, on this date, a copy of Respondent’s Return to Petitioners’ Joint Petition for a Writ of Certiorari has been served upon counsel via email, as follows:

Demetri K. Koutrakos  
Harry A. Dixon  
CALLISON TIGHE & ROBINSON, LLC  
1812 Lincoln Street, Suite 200 (29201)  
P. O. Box 1390  
Columbia, SC 29202-1390  
[jimkoutrakos@callisontighe.com](mailto:jimkoutrakos@callisontighe.com)  
[harrydixon@callisontighe.com](mailto:harrydixon@callisontighe.com)

Paul M. Hummer (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Sean T. O'Neill (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Saul Ewing LLP  
Centre Square West  
1500 Market Street, 38th Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102-2186  
[paul.hummer@saul.com](mailto:paul.hummer@saul.com)  
[sean.oneill@saul.com](mailto:sean.oneill@saul.com)

John A. Basinger (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Saul Ewing LLP  
1270 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10020  
[john.basinger@saul.com](mailto:john.basinger@saul.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants/Appellants OneBeacon Insurance Group, Ltd. (f/k/a White Mountains Insurance Group, Ltd., f/k/a CGU Insurance Company, f/k/a Commercial Union Corporation, f/k/a General Accident Insurance Company of America); OneBeacon Insurance Group LLC (n/k/a Intact Insurance Group USA LLC)*

Robert Y. Knowlton  
Elizabeth H. Black  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, PA  
1201 Main Street, 22nd Floor  
P. O. Box 11889  
Columbia, SC 29211-1889  
[bknowlton@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:bknowlton@hsblawfirm.com)  
[eblack@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:eblack@hsblawfirm.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants/Appellants Trebuchet Investments Limited; Trebuchet Group Holdings Limited (f/k/a Armour Group Holdings Limited; Trebuchet US Holdings, Inc.; Brad S. Huntington; and John C. Williams)*

Walter R. Frye, III, Esquire  
John H. Scully, Esquire  
Eller Tonnsen Bach, LLC  
1306 South Church Street  
Greenville, SC 29605  
[wfrye@etblawfirm.com](mailto:wfrye@etblawfirm.com)  
[jscully@etblawfirm.com](mailto:jscully@etblawfirm.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants R.V. Chandler & Associates, Inc.; Thomas S. Chandler; Jean B. Ownbey as Trustee of the Thomas S. Chandler, Sr. Living Trust u/d 4/06/06; and Gene N. Norville*

Allen Leland DuPre, Esquire  
Lyles & Associates, LLC  
1037 Chuck Dawley Blvd., Suite G100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
[ald@lylesfirm.com](mailto:ald@lylesfirm.com)

*Attorney for Defendant Chandler Rental Properties, Inc.*

Erik T. Norton, Esquire  
Harrell Martin & Peace, PA  
135 Columbia Avenue  
Chapin, SC 29036  
[erik@hmp-law.com](mailto:erik@hmp-law.com)

*Attorneys for Defendant South Carolina Property & Casualty Insurance Guaranty Association*

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Matthew T. Richardson

Matthew T. Richardson (S.C. Bar No. 15647)

Eric B. Amstutz (S.C. Bar No. 363)

Brian Critzer (S.C. Bar No. 103159)

WYCHE, P.A.

807 Gervais Street, Suite 301

Columbia, SC 29201

(803) 254-6542

[mrichardson@wyche.com](mailto:mrichardson@wyche.com)

[eamstutz@wyche.com](mailto:eamstutz@wyche.com)

G. Murrell Smith, Jr. (S.C. Bar No. 66263)

SMITH, ROBINSON, LLC

P.O. Box 580

Sumter, SC 29151-0580

(803) 778-2471 x234

[murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com)

Jonathan M. Robinson (S.C. Bar No. 68285)  
Shanon N. Peake (S.C. Bar No. 102723)  
SMITH, ROBINSON, LLC  
2530 Devine Street, 3rd Floor  
Columbia, SC 29205  
(803) 254-5445  
[jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com)  
[shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com)

Brian M. Barnwell (S.C. Bar No. 78249)  
RIKARD & PROTOPAPAS, LLC  
2110 N. Beltline Blvd.  
Columbia, SC 29204  
(803) 978-6111  
[bb@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:bb@rplegalgroup.com)

John B. White, Jr. (S.C. Bar No. 5996)  
Marghretta H. Shisko (S.C. Bar No. 100106)  
Griffin L. Lynch (S.C. Bar No. 72518)  
JOHN B. WHITE, P.A.  
291 S. Pine Street  
P.O. Box 2465 (29304)  
Spartanburg, SC 29302  
(864) 594-5988  
[jwhite@johnbwhitelaw.com](mailto:jwhite@johnbwhitelaw.com)  
[mshisko@johnbwhitelaw.com](mailto:mshisko@johnbwhitelaw.com)  
[glynch@johnbwhitelaw.com](mailto:glynch@johnbwhitelaw.com)

*Attorneys for Respondent*

September 5, 2023