

RECEIVED

Feb 22 2024

SC Court of Appeals

**THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA
IN THE COURT OF APPEALS**

Appellate Case No. 2023-001461

APPEAL FROM THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS
FOR THE FIFTH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT

Civil Action No. 2023-CP-40-01759

THE HONORABLE JEAN TOAL ACTING CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE

PROOF OF SERVICE

James H. Elliott, Jr.
Cameron D. Berthelsen
RICHARDSON PLOWDEN & ROBINSON, P.A.
235 Magrath Darby Blvd., Ste. 100
Mt. Pleasant, South Carolina
(843) 805-6550

Scott S. Balber (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Benjamin C. Rubinstein (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Maxwell D. Herman (*Pro Hac Vice*)
HERBERT SMITH FREEHILLS NEW YORK LLP
450 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10017
(917) 542-7600

John A. Tibbs and Margaret B. Tibbs, Respondents,
v.
3M Company; 4520 Corp., Inc.; A.O. Smith Corporation;
A.W. Chesterton Company; ABB Inc.; Air & Liquid
Systems Corporation; Aiw-2010 Wind Down Corp.;
Amentum Environment & Energy, Inc.; Anchor/Darling
Valve Company; Armstrong International, Inc.; Asbestos

Corporation Limited; ASCO, L.P.; Atlas Asbestos Co; Atlas Turner, Inc.; AWT Air Company, Inc.; Bahnson, Inc.; Banner Industries International, Inc.; Banner Industries, LLC; Banner Industries of N.E., Inc.; Barretts Minerals Inc.; Beaty Investments, Inc.; Bechtel Corporation; The Bonitz Company; Brand Insulations, Inc.; BW/IP Inc.; Canvas Ct, LLC; Cape PLC; Carboline Company; CB&I Laurens, Inc.; Cleaver-Brooks, Inc.; Consolidated Electrical Distributors, Inc.; Copes-Vulcan, Inc.; Covil Corporation; Crane Instrumentation & Sampling, Inc.; Crosby Valve, LLC; Daniel International Corporation; Davis Mechanical Contractors, Inc.; Dezurik, Inc.; Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC; Duke Energy Corporation; Eaton Corporation; Ellington Insulation Company, Inc.; Emerson Electric Co.; Fisher Controls International LLC; Flame Refractories, Inc.; Flowserve Corporation; Flowserve US Inc.; Fluor Constructors International; Fluor Constructors International, Inc.; Fluor Daniel Services Corporation; Fluor Enterprises, Inc.; FMC Corporation; Foster Wheeler Energy Corporation; Gardner Denver Nash, LLC; General Boiler Casing Company, Inc.; General Cable Corporation; General Cable Industries, Inc.; General Electric Company; Gould Electronics Inc.; Goulds Pumps, Incorporated; Goulds Pumps LLC; Great Barrier Insulation Co.; Grinnell LLC; Hajoca Corporation; Howden North America Inc.; HPC Industrial Services, LLC; IMO Industries Inc.; ITT LLC; Joy Global Underground Mining LLC; K-Mac Services Incorporated; Metropolitan Life Insurance Company; Mine Safety Appliances Company, LLC; MP Supply, Inc.; The Nash Engineering Company; Occidental Chemical Corporation; Paramount Global; Patterson Pump Company; PECW Holding Company; Pfizer Inc.; Piedmont Insulation, Inc.; Plastics Engineering Company; Presnell Insulation Co., Inc.; Redco Corporation; Riley Power Inc.; Rockwell Automation, Inc.; RSCC Wire & Cable LLC; Schneider Electric USA, Inc.; Sequoia Ventures Inc.; Spirax Sarco, Inc.; SPX Corporation; Stafford Insulation Company; Standard

Insulation Company Of N. C., Inc.; Starr Davis Company, Inc.; Starr Davis Company Of S.C., Inc.; Sterling Fluid Systems (USA) LLC; TE Wire & Cable LLC; Thermo Electric Company, Inc.; Union Carbide Corporation; Valves And Controls Us, Inc.; Velan Valve Corp.; Viking Pump, Inc.; Vistra Intermediate Company LLC; The William Powell Company Wind Up, Ltd.; Yuba Heat Transfer LLC; Zurn Industries, LLC,

Defendants,

Of which Asbestos Corporation Limited is the Appellant,

And

Peter Protopapas, Duly Appointed Receiver for Atlas Corporation Limited, is the

Respondent,

And

Cape PLC, individually and as successor in interest to Cape Asbestos Company Limited, by and through its duly appointed Receiver Peter D. Protopapas,

Third- Party Plaintiff, Respondent,

v.

Anglo American PLC, individually and as successor in interest to Anglo American Corporation of South Africa LTD., De Beers PLC, individually and as successor in interest to De Beers S.A., De Beers Centenary AG, De Beers Consolidated Mines Ltd., n/k/a De Beers Consolidated Mines Proprietary Ltd., De Beers UK Ltd., De Beers Jewellers LTD., De Beers Jewellers US, Inc., Anglo American US Holdings Inc., Element Six US Corp., Element Six Technologies US Corp., Element Six Technologies (OR) Corp., First Mode Holdings, Inc., Platinum Guild International (U.S.A.) Jewelry Inc.,

Lightbox Jewelry Inc., Forevermark US Inc., Anglo American Crop Nutrients (U.S.A.) LLC, Charter Consolidated Ltd., ESAB Corporation, Central Mining & Investment Corporation Ltd., Cape Holdco Ltd., The Law Debenture Corporation PLC, Cape Industrial Services Group Ltd., Mohed Altrad, Altrad UK Ltd., Cape UK Holdings Newco Ltd., Altrad Services, Ltd., f/k/a Cape Industrial Services Ltd., Altrad Investment Authority S.A.S., Sparrows Offshore Group Ltd., Hawk Bidco US Inc., ArranCo US, LLC, Sparrows Offshore, LLC, and The Sparrows Group, LLC,

Third-Party Defendants,

Of which Mohed Altrad, Altrad Investment Authority S.A.S., ArranCo US, LLC, Hawk Bidco US Inc., Sparrows Offshore, LLC, Anglo American PLC, De Beers, PLC, De Beers Centenary AG, De Beers Consolidated Mines Proprietary Ltd., De Beers UK Ltd., ESAB Corporation, Charter Consolidated Ltd., and Central Mining & Investment Corporation Ltd. are

Appellants,

I, James H. Elliott, Jr., of Richardson Plowden and Robinson, *Attorney for Appellant De Beers Consolidated Mines Proprietary Ltd.*, hereby certify that the **INITIAL BRIEF OF APPELLANT AND DESIGNATION OF MATTERS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE RECORD ON APPEAL OF DE BEERS CONSOLIDATED MINES PROPRIETARY LTD.** were served on all other parties to this appeal on February 22, 2024, via email (see attached) to their following counsel of record:

Theile B. McVey
tmcvey@kassellaw.com
Jamie D. Rutkoski
jrutkoski@kassellaw.com
KASSEL MCVEY ATTORNEYS AT LAW
1330 Laurel Street
Post Office Box 1476
Columbia, South Carolina, 29202-1476
and
Charles W. Branham, III
tbranham@dobslegal.com
Aaron D. Chapman

achapman@dobslegal.com

David C. Humen

dhumen@dobslegal.com

Ka'Leya Q. Hardin

khardin@dobslegal.com

Todd Barnes

tbarnes@dobslegal.com

DEAN OMAR BRANHAM SHIRLEY, LLP

302 N. Market Street, Suite 300

Dallas, Texas 75202

Attorneys for Respondents John A. Tibbs and Margaret B. Tibbs

Peter D. Protopapas

pdp@rplegalgroup.com

John K. Chandler

jchandler@rplegalgroup.com

Brian M. Barnwell

bb@rplegalgroup.com

RIKARD & PROTOPAPAS, LLC

2110 N. Beltline Blvd, Columbia, SC 29204

PO Box 5640, Columbia, SC 29250

Receiver for CAPE PLC

Matthew Todd Carroll

todd.carroll@wbd-us.com

Kevin A. Hall

kevin.hall@wbd-us.com

WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP

1221 Main Street, Suite 1600

Columbia, SC 29201

and

Mary Elizabeth O'Neill

elizabeth.oneill@wbd-us.com

WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP

301 South College Street, Suite 3500

Charlotte, NC 28202

Attorneys for Altrad Investment Authority S.A.S.; and Mohed Altrad

Steven James Pugh

spugh@richardsonplowden.com

Benjamin P. Carlton

bcarlton@richardsonplowden.com

Carmen V. Ganjehsani

cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com

Ashwin R. Sanzgiri
asanzgiri@richardsonplowden.com
RICHARDSON PLOWDEN & ROBINSON, PA
1900 Barnwell Street
Columbia, SC 29201
Attorneys for ArranCo US, LLC; Hawk Bidco US Inc.; and Sparrows Offshore, LLC;

A. Victor Rawl, Jr.
vrawl@grsm.com
GORDON & REES LLP
677 King Street, Suite 450
Charleston, Sc 29403
Attorney for Central Mining & Investment Corporation Ltd.; Charter Consolidated Ltd.; and ESAB Corporation

Shanon N. Peake
shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com
Jonathan M. Robinson
jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com
SMITH ROBINSON HOLLER DUBOSE MORGAN, LLC
2530 Devine Street
Columbia, SC 29205
and
G. Murrell Smith, Jr.
murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com
SMITH ROBINSON HOLLER DUBOSE MORGAN, LLC
PO Box 580
Sumter, SC 29151-0580
and
Lindsay Anne Joyner
ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com
GALLIVAN, WHITE & BOYD, PA
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 315
Charleston, SC 29401
and
John Thomas Lay, Jr.
jlay@gwblawfirm.com
Gray Thomas Culbreath
gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com

Laura Watkins Jordan
ljordan@gwblawfirm.com
Eleanor Lasseigne Jones
ejones@gwblawfirm.com
GALLIVAN, WHITE & BOYD, PA
1201 Main Street, Suite 1200
Columbia, SC 29201
Attorneys for Cape PLC

Stephen L. Brown (SC Bar No. 66468)
sbrown@ycrlaw.com
Russell G. Hines (SC Bar No. 72100)
RHines@ycrlaw.com
James D. Gandy, III (SC Bar No. 11925)
tgandy@ycrlaw.com
Graydon V. Olive, IV (SC Bar No. 105319)
golive@ycrlaw.com
CLEMENT RIVERS, LLP
25 Calhoun Street, Suite 400
Charleston, South Carolina 29401
(843) 720-5488
***Attorneys for Appellant Asbestos
Corporation Limited***

Signature Page to Follow

Respectfully submitted,

RICHARDSON PLOWDEN & ROBINSON, P.A.

/s/ James H. Elliott, Jr.

James H. Elliott, Jr. (SC Bar No. 13620)

Cameron D. Berthelsen (SC Bar No. 104849)

235 Magrath Darby Blvd., Ste. 100

Mt. Pleasant, South Carolina 29464

Tel: 843-805-6550

Fax: 843-805-6599

Email:

jelliott@richardsonplowden.com

cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com

Scott S. Balber (*Pro Hac Vice*)

Benjamin C. Rubinstein (*Pro Hac Vice*)

Maxwell D. Herman (*Pro Hac Vice*)

HERBERT SMITH FREEHILLS NEW YORK LLP

450 Lexington Avenue

New York, New York 10017

(917) 542-7600

February 22, 2024

From: [Helen Elliott](#)
To: TMcVey@kassellaw.com; jrutkoski@kassellaw.com; tbranham@dobslegal.com; achapman@dobslegal.com; dhumen@dobslegal.com; khardin@dobslegal.com; tbarnes@dobslegal.com; pdp@rplegalgroup.com; jchandler@rplegalgroup.com; BB@rplegalgroup.com; Todd.carroll@wbd-us.com; kevin.hall@wbd-us.com; Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com; Steve.Pugh; Ben.Carlton; Carmen.Ganjehsani; Ashwin.Sanzgiri; vrawl@grsm.com; shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com; jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com; murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com; ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com; jlay@gwblawfirm.com; gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com; lJordan@gwblawfirm.com; ejones@gwblawfirm.com; sbrown@ycrlaw.com; RHines@ycrlaw.com; tgandy@ycrlaw.com; golive@ycrlaw.com; AJustman@ycrlaw.com; pbell@ycrlaw.com
Cc: [James Elliott](#); [Cameron Berthelsen](#); [Marcy Dalton](#); [Helen Elliott](#)
Subject: RE: Tibbs v. Asbestos Corporation Limited; Appellate Case No. 2023-001461
Date: Thursday, February 22, 2024 7:29:22 PM
Attachments: [2024.02.22 - De Beers Consolidated Mines \(Pty\) Ltd. Proof of Service.pdf](#)
[2024.02.22 - De Beers Consolidated Mines \(Pty\) Ltd. SCACR 209 Designation.pdf](#)
[2024.02.22 - De Beers Consolidated Mines \(Pty\) Ltd. Initial Appellant Brief.pdf](#)
[image001.jpg](#)

Counsel,

Please find attached Appellant De Beers Consolidated Mines Proprietary Ltd.'s Initial Brief, Designation of Matter and Proof of Service.

Thank you,

HOME	VCARD	LOCATION
		<p>Helen Elliott Paralegal to James H. Elliott, Jr., Shareholder helliott@RichardsonPlowden.com Richardson Plowden & Robinson, P.A. 235 Magrath Darby Blvd., Suite 100 Mount Pleasant, SC 29464 P.O. Box 21203, Charleston, SC 29413 Tel: 843.805.6550 Fax: 843.805.6599 www.RichardsonPlowden.com</p>