

**From:** [Carroll, Todd](#)  
**To:** [Court Of Appeals Filings](#)  
**Cc:** [Theile McVey](#); [John Kassel](#); [kpaul@dobslegal.com](#); [jrutkoski@kassellaw.com](#); [tbranham@dobslegal.com](#); [Aaron Chapman](#); [dhumen@dobslegal.com](#); [khardin@dobslegal.com](#); [tbarnes@dobslegal.com](#); [Peter Protopapas](#); [Dot Faulkenberry](#); [John Chandler](#); [Brian Barnwell](#); [Hall, Kevin](#); [asanzgirl@richardsonplowden.com](#); [spugh@richardsonplowden.com](#); [cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com](#); [James Elliott](#); [O'Neill, Elizabeth](#); [bcarlton@richardsonplowden.com](#); [cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com](#); [vrawl@grsm.com](#); [Jon Robinson](#); [Murrell Smith](#); [Shanon Peake](#); [ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com](#); [jlay@gwblawfirm.com](#); [gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com](#); [ljordan@gwblawfirm.com](#); [ejones@gwblawfirm.com](#); [sbrown@ycrlaw.com](#); [rhines@ycrlaw.com](#); [tgandy@ycrlaw.com](#); [golive@ycrlaw.com](#); [Justman, Aimee](#); [troy.brown@morganlewis.com](#); [dana.beckner@morganlewis.com](#); [Edwards, Brady](#); [Jacques, Robert](#); [Scrudato, Paul A.](#); [cmcqueen@richardsonplowden.com](#); [Yingling, Donna](#); [sasmith@grsm.com](#)  
**Subject:** RE: Tibbs v 3M Company et al Case Nos. 2023-002006, 2023-002007, 2023-002007, 2023-002008, 2023-002009, 2023002010, 2023-002011  
**Date:** Thursday, April 11, 2024 10:46:11 AM  
**Attachments:** [image691481.png](#)  
[image510717.png](#)  
[image681909.png](#)  
[image702382.png](#)  
[Appellants' Reply Supporting Motion for First Extension for Serving Response to Motion to Dismiss \(Appellate Case No. 2023-002006\).pdf](#)

---

**\*\*\* EXTERNAL EMAIL:** This email originated from outside the organization. Please exercise caution before clicking any links or opening attachments. \*\*\*

Madam Clerk,

Please find attached for filing a short letter replying to the Respondent's objection from yesterday. By copy to all counsel, we are serving them with this correspondence as well. As always, we appreciate the Court's consideration. Best regards,

Todd

**Todd Carroll**

Partner

Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP

**d:** 803-454-7730

**m:** 803-446-2883

**e:** [Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com)

1221 Main Street

Suite 1600

Columbia, SC 29201



[womblebonddickinson.com](http://womblebonddickinson.com)



This email is sent for and on behalf of Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP. Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP is a member of Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited, which consists of independent and autonomous law firms providing services in the US, the UK, and elsewhere around the world. Each Womble Bond Dickinson entity is a separate legal entity and is not responsible for the acts or omissions of, nor can bind or obligate, another Womble Bond Dickinson entity. Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited does not practice law. Please see [www.womblebonddickinson.com/us/legal-notice](http://www.womblebonddickinson.com/us/legal-notice) for further details.

**From:** Court Of Appeals Filings <[ctappfilings@sccourts.org](mailto:ctappfilings@sccourts.org)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, April 10, 2024 10:38 AM

**To:** Dot Faulkenberry <[Dot.faulkenberry@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:Dot.faulkenberry@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Court Of Appeals Filings <[ctappfilings@sccourts.org](mailto:ctappfilings@sccourts.org)>

**Cc:** Theile McVey <[tmcvey@kassellaw.com](mailto:tmcvey@kassellaw.com)>; John Kassel <[jkassel@kassellaw.com](mailto:jkassel@kassellaw.com)>; kpaul@dobslegal.com; jrutkoski@kassellaw.com; tbranham@dobslegal.com; Aaron Chapman <[achapman@dobslegal.com](mailto:achapman@dobslegal.com)>; dhumen@dobslegal.com; khardin@dobslegal.com; tbarnes@dobslegal.com; Peter Protopapas <[pdp@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:pdp@rplegalgroup.com)>; John Chandler <[jchandler@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:jchandler@rplegalgroup.com)>; Brian Barnwell <[BB@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:BB@rplegalgroup.com)>; Hall, Kevin <[Kevin.Hall@wbd-us.com](mailto:Kevin.Hall@wbd-us.com)>; asanzgirl@richardsonplowden.com; spugh@richardsonplowden.com; cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com; James Elliott <[jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <[Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com](mailto:Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com)>; bcarlton@richardsonplowden.com; cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com; vrawl@grsm.com; Jon Robinson <[jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Murrell Smith <[murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Shanon Peake <[shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com; jlay@gwblawfirm.com; gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com; ljordan@gwblawfirm.com; ejones@gwblawfirm.com; sbrown@ycrlaw.com; rhines@ycrlaw.com; tgandy@ycrlaw.com; golive@ycrlaw.com; Justman, Aimee <[AJustman@ycrlaw.com](mailto:AJustman@ycrlaw.com)>; troy.brown@morganlewis.com; dana.beckner@morganlewis.com; Edwards, Brady <[brady.edwards@morganlewis.com](mailto:brady.edwards@morganlewis.com)>; Jacques, Robert <[robert.jacques@morganlewis.com](mailto:robert.jacques@morganlewis.com)>; Scrudato, Paul A. <[paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com](mailto:paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com)>; cmcqueen@richardsonplowden.com; Yingling, Donna <[Donna.Yingling@wbd-us.com](mailto:Donna.Yingling@wbd-us.com)>; Carroll, Todd <[Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com)>; sasmith@grsm.com

**Subject:** RE: Tibbs v 3M Company et al Case Nos. 2023-002006, 2023-002007, 2023-002007, 2023-002008, 2023-002009, 2023002010, 2023-002011

Dear Counsel:

The Court has received your filing. A stamped copy is attached for your records.

Thank you.

---

**From:** Dot Faulkenberry <[Dot.faulkenberry@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:Dot.faulkenberry@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, April 10, 2024 10:34 AM

**To:** Court Of Appeals Filings <[ctappfilings@sccourts.org](mailto:ctappfilings@sccourts.org)>

**Cc:** Theile McVey <[tmcvey@kassellaw.com](mailto:tmcvey@kassellaw.com)>; John Kassel <[jkassel@kassellaw.com](mailto:jkassel@kassellaw.com)>; kpaul@dobslegal.com; jrutkoski@kassellaw.com; tbranham@dobslegal.com; Aaron Chapman <[achapman@dobslegal.com](mailto:achapman@dobslegal.com)>; dhumen@dobslegal.com; khardin@dobslegal.com; tbarnes@dobslegal.com; Peter Protopapas <[pdp@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:pdp@rplegalgroup.com)>; John Chandler <[jchandler@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:jchandler@rplegalgroup.com)>; Brian Barnwell <[BB@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:BB@rplegalgroup.com)>; [kevin.hall@wbd-us.com](mailto:kevin.hall@wbd-us.com); asanzgirl@richardsonplowden.com; spugh@richardsonplowden.com; cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com; James Elliott <[jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <[elizabeth.oneill@wbd-us.com](mailto:elizabeth.oneill@wbd-us.com)>; bcarlton@richardsonplowden.com; cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com; vrawl@grsm.com; Jon Robinson <[jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Murrell Smith <[murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Shanon Peake <[shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com; jlay@gwblawfirm.com; gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com; ljordan@gwblawfirm.com; ejones@gwblawfirm.com;

[sbrown@ycrlaw.com](mailto:sbrown@ycrlaw.com); [rhines@ycrlaw.com](mailto:rhines@ycrlaw.com); [tgandy@ycrlaw.com](mailto:tgandy@ycrlaw.com); [golive@ycrlaw.com](mailto:golive@ycrlaw.com); Justman, Aimee <[AJustman@ycrlaw.com](mailto:AJustman@ycrlaw.com)>; [troy.brown@morganlewis.com](mailto:troy.brown@morganlewis.com); [dana.beckner@morganlewis.com](mailto:dana.beckner@morganlewis.com); Edwards, Brady <[brady.edwards@morganlewis.com](mailto:brady.edwards@morganlewis.com)>; Jacques, Robert <[robert.jacques@morganlewis.com](mailto:robert.jacques@morganlewis.com)>; Scrudato, Paul A. <[paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com](mailto:paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com)>; [cmqueen@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cmqueen@richardsonplowden.com); [donna.yingling@wbd-us.com](mailto:donna.yingling@wbd-us.com); 'todd.carroll@wbd-us.com' <[todd.carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:todd.carroll@wbd-us.com)>; [sasmith@grsm.com](mailto:sasmith@grsm.com)

**Subject:** RE: Tibbs v 3M Company et al Case Nos. 2023-002006, 2023-002007, 2023-002007, 2023-002008, 2023-002009, 2023002010, 2023-002011

**\*\*\* EXTERNAL EMAIL:** This email originated from outside the organization. Please exercise caution before clicking any links or opening attachments. \*\*\*

My apologies. Sending letter again with attachments.

Thank you,



**Dot Faulkenberry**  
Paralegal

E: [dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com) Columbia Office  
P: 803.254.5445 2530 Devine Street  
D: 803.704.1101 Columbia, SC 29205  
F: 803.254.5007

*CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: The information transmitted, including any attachments, is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. Any review, retransmission, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you received this in error, please contact the sender and delete the material from any computer. Intentional interception or dissemination of electronic mail not belonging to you may violate federal or state law.*

---

**From:** Dot Faulkenberry

**Sent:** Wednesday, April 10, 2024 10:22 AM

**To:** [ctappfilings@sccourts.org](mailto:ctappfilings@sccourts.org)

**Cc:** Theile McVey <[tmcvey@kassellaw.com](mailto:tmcvey@kassellaw.com)>; John Kassel <[jkassel@kassellaw.com](mailto:jkassel@kassellaw.com)>; [kpaul@dobslegal.com](mailto:kpaul@dobslegal.com); [jrutkoski@kassellaw.com](mailto:jrutkoski@kassellaw.com); [tbranham@dobslegal.com](mailto:tbranham@dobslegal.com); Aaron Chapman <[achapman@dobslegal.com](mailto:achapman@dobslegal.com)>; [dhumen@dobslegal.com](mailto:dhumen@dobslegal.com); [khardin@dobslegal.com](mailto:khardin@dobslegal.com); [tbarnes@dobslegal.com](mailto:tbarnes@dobslegal.com); Peter Protopapas <[pdp@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:pdp@rplegalgroup.com)>; John Chandler <[jchandler@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:jchandler@rplegalgroup.com)>; Brian Barnwell <[BB@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:BB@rplegalgroup.com)>; [kevin.hall@wbd-us.com](mailto:kevin.hall@wbd-us.com); [asanzgirl@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:asanzgirl@richardsonplowden.com); [spugh@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:spugh@richardsonplowden.com); [cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com); James Elliott <[jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <[elizabeth.oneill@wbd-us.com](mailto:elizabeth.oneill@wbd-us.com)>; [bcarlton@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:bcarlton@richardsonplowden.com); [cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com); [vrawl@grsm.com](mailto:vrawl@grsm.com); Jon Robinson <[jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Murrell Smith <[murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Shanon Peake <[shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; [ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com); [jlay@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:jlay@gwblawfirm.com); [gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com); [ljoan@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:ljoan@gwblawfirm.com); [ejones@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:ejones@gwblawfirm.com); [sbrown@ycrlaw.com](mailto:sbrown@ycrlaw.com); [rhines@ycrlaw.com](mailto:rhines@ycrlaw.com); [tgandy@ycrlaw.com](mailto:tgandy@ycrlaw.com); [golive@ycrlaw.com](mailto:golive@ycrlaw.com); Justman,

Aimee <[AJustman@yclr.com](mailto:AJustman@yclr.com)>; [troy.brown@morganlewis.com](mailto:troy.brown@morganlewis.com); [dana.beckner@morganlewis.com](mailto:dana.beckner@morganlewis.com);  
Edwards, Brady <[brady.edwards@morganlewis.com](mailto:brady.edwards@morganlewis.com)>; Jacques, Robert  
<[robert.jacques@morganlewis.com](mailto:robert.jacques@morganlewis.com)>; Scrudato, Paul A. <[paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com](mailto:paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com)>;  
[cmcqueen@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cmcqueen@richardsonplowden.com); [donna.yingling@wbd-us.com](mailto:donna.yingling@wbd-us.com); '[todd.carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:todd.carroll@wbd-us.com)'  
<[todd.carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:todd.carroll@wbd-us.com)>; [sasmith@grsm.com](mailto:sasmith@grsm.com)

**Subject:** Tibbs v 3M Company et al Case Nos. 2023-002006, 2023-002007, 2023-002007, 2023-002008, 2023-002009, 2023002010, 2023-002011

Please find attached correspondence from Jon Robinson regarding the above referenced appeals.



**Dot Faulkenberry**  
Paralegal

E: <a href="mailto:dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com">dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com</a>	Columbia Office
P: 803.254.5445	2530 Devine Street
D: 803.704.1101	Columbia, SC 29205
F: 803.254.5007	

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: The information transmitted, including any attachments, is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. Any review, retransmission, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you received this in error, please contact the sender and delete the material from any computer. Intentional interception or dissemination of electronic mail not belonging to you may violate federal or state law.

~~~ CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE ~~~ This message is intended only for the addressee and may contain information that is confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, do not read, copy, retain, or disseminate this message or any attachment. If you have received this message in error, please contact the sender immediately and delete all copies of the message and any attachments.