

RECEIVED

Apr 17 2024

S.C. SUPREME COURT

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA
In The Supreme Court

APPEAL FROM THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW COURT
Ralph King Anderson, III, Chief Administrative Law Judge

Appellate Case No. 2019-001706

Trial Court Case No. 17-ALJ-17-0238-CC

Amazon Services, LLC, Appellant,

v.

South Carolina Department of Revenue, Respondent.

APPENDIX - VOLUME IV of VII

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
Robert N. Hochman
(admitted Pro Hac Vice)
rhochman@sidley.com
Neil H. Conrad
(admitted Pro Hac Vice)
nconrad@sidley.com
One South Dearborn Street
Chicago, IL 60603
(312) 853-7000

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
Carter G. Phillips
(admitted Pro Hac Vice)
cphillips@sidley.com
1501 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005
(202) 736-8000

NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP
Bryson M. Geer
SC Bar No. 13606
bryson.geer@nelsonmullins.com

John C. von Lehe, Jr.
SC Bar No. 5719
john.vonlehe@nelsonmullins.com
151 Meeting St / 6th Floor
PO Box 1806 (29402-1806)
Charleston, SC 29401-2239
(843) 853-5200

Counsel for Appellant

**SOUTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF
REVENUE**

Jason P. Luther, Jr.
P. O. Box 12265
Columbia, SC 29211
jason.luther@dor.sc.gov

THE ACQUAVIVA LAW FIRM
Lauren Acquaviva
1092 Johnnie Dodds Blvd., Ste. 112
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464
lauren@vivalawsc.com

BURR & FORMAN LLP
Tracey Colton Green
Chad Nicholas Johnston
John William Roberts
1221 Main Street
Suite 1800
Columbia SC 29201
tgreen@burr.com
cjohnston@burr.com
jwroberts@burr.com

Counsel for Respondent

INDEX TO APPENDIX

Appendix Page

Index i

VOLUME I- RECORD ON APPEAL VOLUME I

ORDERS

Final Order dated September 10, 2019 7

Order Denying the Parties’ Motions for Summary Judgment dated January 29, 2019 61

MEMORANDA

Respondent’s Response in Opposition to Petitioner’s Motion for Summary Judgment dated January 4, 2019 82

Respondent’s Memorandum in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment dated December 7, 2018..... 109

TRANSCRIPTS

Hearing Transcript dated February 4-6, 2019 148

 Testimony of Christopher Poad

 Direct Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC 184

 Cross Examination by Mr. Green, Counsel for SCDOR 308

 Redirect Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC 419

VOLUME II- RECORD ON APPEAL VOLUME II

Testimony of Mr. Matthew Revich

 Direct Examination by Mr. Akins, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC 446

 Cross Examination by Mr. Green, Counsel for SCDOR 497

 Redirect Examination by Mr. Akins, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC..... 512

 Recross-Examination by Mr. Green, Counsel for SCDOR 522

Testimony of Mr. Tobin Weldele

 Direct Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC 528

 Cross Examination by Mr. Roberts, Counsel for SCDOR..... 570

 Redirect Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC 582

Publication of the Deposition of Ricky Taylor 590

Publication of the Deposition of John McCormack..... 594

Testimony of Mr. Erik Doerring	
Direct Examination by Mr. Akins, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC	632
Voir Dire by Mr. Green, Counsel for SCDOR	638
Direct Examination (cont.) by Mr. Akins, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC	647
Testimony of Ms. Logan Mitchell	
Direct Examination by Ms. Acquaviva, Counsel for SCDOR.....	673
Cross Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC	689
Redirect Examination by Ms. Acquaviva, Counsel for SCDOR.....	703
Recross-Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC	708
Publication of the Deposition of Christopher Poad	721
Testimony of Mr. John McCormack	
Direct Examination by Mr. Roberts, Counsel for SCDOR.....	738
Cross Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC	751

VOLUME III- RECORD ON APPEAL VOLUME III

EXHIBITS

Hearing Exhibit Number 3: Business Solutions Agreement.....	864
Hearing Exhibit Number 7: Increase Your Chances of Winning the Buy Box	912
Hearing Exhibit Number 14: Seller Performance Measurement	913
Hearing Exhibit Number 16: Selling on Amazon Fee Schedule	915
Hearing Exhibit Number 23: Tax Collection Service Terms.....	922
Hearing Exhibit Number 31: FBA Features and Fees	926
Hearing Exhibit Number 38: Premium Shipping Options.....	929
Hearing Exhibit Number 39: Product Detail Page Rules.....	931
Hearing Exhibit Number 40: Product Pricing and Selection Guidelines.....	932
Hearing Exhibit Number 41: Prohibited Seller Activities and Actions	933
Hearing Exhibit Number 50: 2018 Fulfillment by Amazon U.S. Fee Changes	937
Hearing Exhibit Number 58: Buyer-Seller Messaging Service Overview	945
Hearing Exhibit Number 64: FBA Fulfillment Fees for Amazon.com Orders.....	947
Hearing Exhibit Number 65: FBA Inventory Placement Service.....	953

Hearing Exhibit Number 83: Prepare Product Images	956
Hearing Exhibit Number 88: Remove Inventory (Overview)	958
Hearing Exhibit Number 97: Seller Best Practices.....	960
Hearing Exhibit Number 122: Example E-mail Order Confirmations and Related Documents	965
Hearing Exhibit Number 137: S.C. Revenue Ruling #18-14: Retailers Without a Physical Presence (“Remote Sellers”) – Economic Nexus (September 18, 2018).....	1011
Hearing Exhibit Number 171: Letter from SCDOR Enclosing Department Determination (June 21, 2017)	1017
Hearing Exhibit Number 172: Initial Audit Appointment Letter and Summons Sent to Amazon Services, LLC (September 1, 2016)	1033
Hearing Exhibit Number 175: Amazon Services Proposed Notice of Assessment (December 9, 2016)	1036
Hearing Exhibit Number 178: Protest to Proposed Notice of Assessment Issued to Amazon Services, LLC for the Tax Period January 1, 2016, through March 31, 2016 (March 9, 2017)	1038
Hearing Exhibit Number 192: Meeting Packet for the Legislative Oversight Committee Meeting (October 23, 2018).....	1269

VOLUME IV- RECORD ON APPEAL VOLUME IV

Hearing Exhibit Number 193: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Legislative Committee (October 23, 2018)	1287
Hearing Exhibit Number 194: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Joint Education and Finance Study Committee of the SC General Assembly (October 23, 2018)	1287
Hearing Exhibit Number 195: Video of Cabinet Meeting of SC’s Governor (August 1, 2018)	1287
Hearing Exhibit Number 196: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Economic Subcommittee (August 13, 2018).....	1287
Hearing Exhibit Number 197: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Economic Subcommittee (July 10, 2018).....	1287
Hearing Exhibit Number 198: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Economic Subcommittee (June 18, 2018)	1287

Hearing Exhibit Number 199: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Economic Subcommittee (September 10, 2018)	1287
Hearing Exhibit Number 200: Video of Director Powell’s Statements to WLTX Channel 19 (August 13, 2018).....	1287
Hearing Exhibit Number 201: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Joint Senate Education and Finance Study Committee (October 23, 2018).....	1287

VOLUME V- RECORD ON APPEAL VOLUME V

Hearing Exhibit Number 202: SCDOR House Legislative Oversight Committee Presentation (June 18, 2018).....	1294
Hearing Exhibit Number 203: Meeting Packet from the Economic Development, Transportation, and National Resources Subcommittee Meeting (September 10, 2018)	1327
Hearing Exhibit Number 205: SCDOR, Program Evaluation Report (May 31, 2018)	1376
Hearing Exhibit Number 207: Meeting Packet for the Economic Subcommittee Meeting (July 10, 2018)	1495
Hearing Exhibit Number 210: Screenshots of Amazon.com Website.....	1544
Hearing Exhibit Number 213: Deposition Designation – Testimony of Hartley Powell	1548
Hearing Exhibit Number 214: Senate Joint Finance and Education Study Testimony of Department Director Hartley Powell (October 23, 2018).....	1563

VOLUME VI- RECORD ON APPEAL VOLUME VI

Hearing Exhibit Number 215: South Carolina Sales and Use Tax Manual, 2015 Edition.....	1570
--	------

OTHER MATERIALS OR DOCUMENTS

Respondent’s Proposed Final Order and Decision dated April 5, 2019	1905
Affidavit of Damian Hunt dated December 4, 2018.....	1932
Amazon Service’s Request for Contested Case Hearing dated July 21, 2017.....	1935
Certificate of Counsel	1953

VOLUME VII- FILINGS FROM THE COURT OF APPEALS

Final Opening Brief of Appellant Amazon Services LLC dated June 11, 2020.....	1955
Final Brief of Respondent dated June 11, 2020.....	2014

Final Reply Brief of Appellant Amazon Services LLC dated June 11, 2020..... 2072
Appellate Court Opinion dated January 24, 2024..... 2105
Appellant’s Petition for Rehearing dated February 8, 2024 2126
Return to Petition for Rehearing dated March 1, 2024..... 2168
Appellant’s Reply Brief in Support of Petition for Rehearing dated March 8, 2024 2211
Order Denying Amazon Services LLC’s Petition for Rehearing dated March 18, 2024 2224

RECEIVED

Jun 11 2020

SC Court of Appeals

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA
In The Court of Appeals

APPEAL FROM THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW COURT
Ralph King Anderson, III, Chief Administrative Law Judge

Appellate Case No. 2019-001706

Trial Court Case No. 17-ALJ-17-0238-CC

Amazon Services, LLC, Appellant,

v.

South Carolina Department of Revenue, Respondent.

**RECORD ON APPEAL
VOLUME IV of VI**

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
Constantine L. Trela, Jr. (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
ctrela@sidley.com
Robert N. Hochman (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
rhochman@sidley.com
Neil H. Conrad (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
nconrad@sidley.com
One South Dearborn Street
Chicago, IL 60603
(312) 853-7000

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
Carter G. Phillips (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
cphillips@sidley.com
1501 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 0005
(202) 736-8000

NELSON MULLINS RILEY & SCARBOROUGH
LLP
Bryson M. Geer
SC Bar No. 13606
bryson.geer@nelsonmullins.com
John C. von Lehe, Jr.
SC Bar No. 5719
john.vonlehe@nelsonmullins.com

151 Meeting St / 6th Floor
PO Box 1806 (29402-1806)
Charleston, SC 29401-2239
(843) 853-5200

Attorneys for Appellant

SOUTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF
REVENUE

Jason P. Luther (Bar No. 78021)
PO Box 12265
Columbia, SC 29211
(803) 898-5131

WILLOUGHBY & HOEFER, P.A.

John M.S. Hoefler (Bar No. 2549)
Tracey C. Green (Bar No. 9342)
Chad N. Johnston (Bar No. 73752)
John W. Robelis (Bar No. 78889)
Andrew R. Hand (Bar No. 101633)
PO Box 8416
Columbia, SC 29202
(803) 252-3300

THE ACQUAVIVA LAW FIRM, LLC

Lauren Acquaviva (Bar No. 100528)
1092 Johnnie Dodds Blvd., Suite 112
Mount Pleasant, SC 29464
(843) 216-7728

Attorneys for Respondent

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

ORDERS

Final Order dated September 10, 20191
Order Denying the Parties’ Motions for Summary Judgment dated January 29, 201955

MEMORANDA

Respondent’s Response in Opposition to Petitioner’s Motion for Summary Judgment dated January 4, 201976
Respondent’s Memorandum in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment dated December 7, 2018.....103

TRANSCRIPTS

Hearing Transcript dated February 4-6, 2019.....142
Testimony of Christopher Poad
 Direct Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC178
 Cross Examination by Mr. Green, Counsel for SCDOR302
 Redirect Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC.....413

VOLUME II

Testimony of Mr. Matthew Revich
 Direct Examination by Mr. Akins, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC434
 Cross Examination by Mr. Green, Counsel for SCDOR485
 Redirect Examination by Mr. Akins, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC.....500
 Recross-Examination by Mr. Green510
Testimony of Mr. Tobin Weldele
 Direct Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC516
 Cross Examination by Mr. Roberts, Counsel for SCDOR.....558
 Redirect Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC.....570
Publication of the Deposition of Ricky Taylor578
Publication of the Deposition of John McCormack.....582
Testimony of Mr. Erik Doerring
 Direct Examination by Mr. Akins, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC620
 Voir Dire by Mr. Green, Counsel for SCDOR626

Direct Examination (cont.) by Mr. Akins, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC.....	635
Testimony of Ms. Logan Mitchell	
Direct Examination by Ms. Acquaviva, Counsel for SCDOR.....	661
Cross Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC	677
Redirect Examination by Ms. Acquaviva, Counsel for SCDOR	691
Recross-Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC	696
Publication of the Deposition of Christopher Poad	709
Testimony of Mr. John McCormack	
Direct Examination by Mr. Roberts, Counsel for SCDOR.....	726
Cross Examination by Mr. Razi, Counsel for Amazon Services, LLC	739

VOLUME III

EXHIBITS

Hearing Exhibit Number 3: Business Solutions Agreement.....	846
Hearing Exhibit Number 7: Increase Your Chances of Winning the Buy Box	894
Hearing Exhibit Number 14: Seller Performance Measurement	895
Hearing Exhibit Number 16: Selling on Amazon Fee Schedule	897
Hearing Exhibit Number 23: Tax Collection Service Terms.....	904
Hearing Exhibit Number 31: FBA Features and Fees	908
Hearing Exhibit Number 38: Premium Shipping Options.....	911
Hearing Exhibit Number 39: Product Detail Page Rules.....	913
Hearing Exhibit Number 40: Product Pricing and Selection Guidelines.....	914
Hearing Exhibit Number 41: Prohibited Seller Activities and Actions.....	915
Hearing Exhibit Number 50: 2018 Fulfillment by Amazon U.S. Fee Changes	919
Hearing Exhibit Number 58: Buyer-Seller Messaging Service Overview	927
Hearing Exhibit Number 64: FBA Fulfillment Fees for Amazon.com Orders.....	929
Hearing Exhibit Number 65: FBA Inventory Placement Service.....	935
Hearing Exhibit Number 83: Prepare Product Images	938

Hearing Exhibit Number 88: Remove Inventory (Overview)	940
Hearing Exhibit Number 97: Seller Best Practices.....	942
Hearing Exhibit Number 122: Example E-mail Order Confirmations and Related Documents	947
Hearing Exhibit Number 137: S.C. Revenue Ruling #18-14: Retailers Without a Physical Presence (“Remote Sellers”) – Economic Nexus (September 18, 2018).....	993
Hearing Exhibit Number 171: Letter from SCDOR Enclosing Department Determination (June 21, 2017)	999
Hearing Exhibit Number 172: Initial Audit Appointment Letter and Summons Sent to Amazon Services, LLC (September 1, 2016).....	1015
Hearing Exhibit Number 175: Amazon Services Proposed Notice of Assessment (December 9, 2016)	1018
Hearing Exhibit Number 178: Protest to Proposed Notice of Assessment Issued to Amazon Services, LLC for the Tax Period January 1, 2016, through March 31, 2016 (March 9, 2017)	1020
Hearing Exhibit Number 192: Meeting Packet for the Legislative Oversight Committee Meeting (October 23, 2018).....	1251

VOLUME IV

Hearing Exhibit Number 193: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Legislative Committee (October 23, 2018)	1263
Hearing Exhibit Number 194: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Joint Education and Finance Study Committee of the SC General Assembly (October 23, 2018)	1263
Hearing Exhibit Number 195: Video of Cabinet Meeting of SC’s Governor (August 1, 2018).....	1263
Hearing Exhibit Number 196: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Economic Subcommittee (August 13, 2018).....	1263
Hearing Exhibit Number 197: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Economic Subcommittee (July 10, 2018).....	1263
Hearing Exhibit Number 198: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Economic Subcommittee (June 18, 2018)	1263
Hearing Exhibit Number 199: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Economic Subcommittee (September 10, 2018)	1263

Hearing Exhibit Number 200: Video of Director Powell’s Statements to WLTX Channel 19 (August 13, 2018).....1263

Hearing Exhibit Number 201: Video of Director Powell’s Sworn Testimony Before the Joint Senate Education and Finance Study Committee (October 23, 2018).....1263

VOLUME V

Hearing Exhibit Number 202: SCDOR House Legislative Oversight Committee Presentation (June 18, 2018).....1264

Hearing Exhibit Number 203: Meeting Packet from the Economic Development, Transportation, and National Resources Subcommittee Meeting (September 10, 2018).....1297

Hearing Exhibit Number 205: SCDOR, Program Evaluation Report (May 31, 2018)1346

Hearing Exhibit Number 207: Meeting Packet for the Economic Subcommittee Meeting (July 10, 2018)1465

Hearing Exhibit Number 210: Screenshots of Amazon.com Website.....1514

Hearing Exhibit Number 213: Deposition Designation – Testimony of Hartley Powell1518

Hearing Exhibit Number 214: Senate Joint Finance and Education Study Testimony of Department Director Hartley Powell (October 23, 2018).....1533

VOLUME VI

Hearing Exhibit Number 215: South Carolina Sales and Use Tax Manual, 2015 Edition.....1534

OTHER MATERIALS OR DOCUMENTS

Respondent’s Proposed Final Order and Decision dated April 5, 20191869

Affidavit of Damian Hunt dated December 4, 2018.....1896

Amazon Service’s Request for Contested Case Hearing dated July 21, 2017.....1899

Certificate of Counsel1917

HEARING EXHIBITS 193-201:

Files are included on DVDs