

RECEIVED

Dec 16 2024

S.C. SUPREME COURT

From: [Vic Rawl](#)
To: [Supreme Court Filings](#)
Cc: [jlay@gwblawfirm.com](#); [gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com](#); [Ashwin Sanzgiri](#); [ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com](#); [ejones@gwblawfirm.com](#); [jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com](#); [shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com](#); [murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com](#); [pdp@rplegalgroup.com](#); [Shanon Peake](#); [john@bluesteinattorneys.com](#); [Carroll, Todd](#); [Stacey Smith](#); [Hall, Kevin](#); [O'Neill, Elizabeth](#); [Steve Pugh](#); [Ben Carlton](#); [brady.edwards@morganlewis.com](#); [Carmen Ganjehsani](#); [Charity McQueen](#); [Jacques, Robert](#); [paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com](#); [Jon Robinson](#); [Shanon Peake](#); [Theile McVey](#); [jkassel@kassellaw.com](#); [jrutkoski@kassellaw.com](#); [tbranham@dobslegal.com](#); [kpaul@dobslegal.com](#); [David Humen](#); [jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](#); [cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com](#); [Steve Pugh](#); [Ben Carlton](#); [Carmen Ganjehsani](#); [John Nichols](#); [sbrown@ycrlaw.com](#); [tgandy@ycrlaw.com](#); [sgriffith@ycrlaw.com](#); [Yingling, Donna](#); [Jon Robinson](#)
Subject: John A. Tibbs v. Asbestos Corporation Limited (Appellate Case Nos. 2024-000916 and 2024-001423)
Date: Monday, December 16, 2024 10:59:56 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.png](#)
[image003.png](#)
[image004.png](#)
[Charter Defendants' Return to the Receiver's Motion to Strike Supplemental Appendix \(Appellate Case Nos. 2024-000916 and 2024-001423\).pdf](#)

*** **EXTERNAL EMAIL:** This email originated from outside the organization. Please exercise caution before clicking any links or opening attachments. ***

Dear Madam Clerk,

Please find attached for filing on behalf of Appellants Charter Consolidated Ltd.; ESAB Corporation; and Central Mining & Investment Corporation Ltd. (the "Charter Defendants") the Return to the Receiver's Motion to Strike the Supplemental Appendix filed in Appellate Case Nos. 2024-000916 and 2024-001423. By copy to all counsel, we are serving them with this Return.

Respectfully submitted,

Vic

A. VICTOR RAWL, JR. (He/Him/His)
Office Managing Partner

GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI | GRSM50
YOUR 50 STATE LAW FIRM™

677 King Street, Suite 450, Charleston, SC 29403
301 South 13th Street, Suite 400, Lincoln, NE 68508

D: 843.714.2501 | **M:** 803.463.4004
vrawl@grsm.com

grsm.com

[vCard](#) | [Bio](#) | [LinkedIn](#)

From: Carroll, Todd <Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com>
Sent: Monday, December 16, 2024 8:37 PM
To: suptctfilings@sccourts.org
Cc: jlay@gwblawfirm.com; gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com; Ashwin Sanzgiri <ASanzgiri@RichardsonPlowden.com>; ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com; ejones@gwblawfirm.com; jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com; shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com; murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com; pdp@rplegalgroup.com; Shanon Peake <shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Vic Rawl

<vrawl@grsm.com>; john@bluesteinattorneys.com; Hall, Kevin <Kevin.Hall@wbd-us.com>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com>; Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>; brady.edwards@morganlewis.com; Carmen Ganjehsani <CGanjehsani@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Charity McQueen <CMcQueen@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Jacques, Robert <robert.jacques@morganlewis.com>; paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com; Jon Robinson <jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Shanon Peake <shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Theile McVey <tmcvey@kassellaw.com>; jkassel@kassellaw.com; jrutkoski@kassellaw.com; tbranham@dobslegal.com; kpaul@dobslegal.com; David Humen <dhumen@dobslegal.com>; jelliott@richardsonplowden.com; cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com; Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Carmen Ganjehsani <CGanjehsani@RichardsonPlowden.com>; John Nichols <john@bluesteinattorneys.com>; Vic Rawl <vrawl@grsm.com>; sbrown@ycrlaw.com; tgandy@ycrlaw.com; sgriffith@ycrlaw.com; Yingling, Donna <Donna.Yingling@wbd-us.com>; Jon Robinson <jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com>
Subject: RE: John A. Tibbs v. Asbestos Corporation Limited (Appellate Case Nos. 2024-000916 and 2024-001499)

Dear Madam Clerk,

Please find attached for filing the Altrad Defendants' memorandum in opposition to the Receiver's motion to strike the Supplemental Appendix filed in the referenced matters. By copy to all counsel, we are serving them with this opposition memorandum. As always, we appreciate the Court's consideration of this submission. Best,

Todd

From: Carroll, Todd

Sent: Sunday, November 24, 2024 10:11 PM

To: suptfilings@sccourts.org

Cc: jlaj@gwblawfirm.com; gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com; Ashwin Sanzgiri <ASanzgiri@RichardsonPlowden.com>; ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com; ejones@gwblawfirm.com; jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com; shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com; murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com; pdp@rplegalgroup.com; Shanon Peake <shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; vrawl@grsm.com; john@bluesteinattorneys.com; Hall, Kevin <Kevin.Hall@wbd-us.com>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com>; Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>; brady.edwards@morganlewis.com; Carmen Ganjehsani <CGanjehsani@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Charity McQueen <CMcQueen@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Jacques, Robert <robert.jacques@morganlewis.com>; paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com; Jon Robinson <jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Shanon Peake <shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Theile McVey <tmcvey@kassellaw.com>; jkassel@kassellaw.com; jrutkoski@kassellaw.com; tbranham@dobslegal.com; kpaul@dobslegal.com; David Humen <dhumen@dobslegal.com>; jelliott@richardsonplowden.com; cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com; Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Carmen Ganjehsani <CGanjehsani@RichardsonPlowden.com>; John Nichols <john@bluesteinattorneys.com>; vrawl@grsm.com; sbrown@ycrlaw.com; tgandy@ycrlaw.com; sgriffith@ycrlaw.com; Yingling, Donna <Donna.Yingling@wbd-us.com>; Carroll, Todd <Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com>; Jon Robinson <jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com>

Subject: John A. Tibbs v. Asbestos Corporation Limited (Appellate Case Nos. 2024-000916 and 2024-001499)

Dear Ms. Howard,

Please find attached for filing with the Supreme Court a supplement to two pending petitions for writs of certiorari, which is filed on behalf of the Altrad Defendants in Appellate Case Nos. 2024-000916 and 2024-001499. By copy to all counsel, we are serving the same on them via this email. Accompanying this Supplement is a two-volume Supplemental Appendix, which is available here and requires no password to access these volumes: <https://download.wbd-us.com/bds/Login.do?id=A06113209947&p1=o2j07kasbhccedbkkfilccffij20>

We attempted to upload the Supplemental Appendix to my OneDrive account with the Court, but that account appears to have been corrupted or disrupted this evening and was unavailable. I have requested a new OneDrive link from the AIS system, but in the meantime, please let us know if you have difficulties accessing the Supplemental Appendix through the link above. And, as always, if any counsel require hard copies of the Supplemental Appendix, please do not hesitate to let me know, and we'll be glad to provide them.

We appreciate the Court's consideration of this filing. Have a good evening,

Todd

From: Carroll, Todd <Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com>

Sent: Tuesday, September 10, 2024 8:11 PM

To: supctfilings@sccourts.org; ctappfilings@sccourts.org

Cc: jlav@gwblawfirm.com; gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com; Ashwin Sanzgiri <ASanzgiri@RichardsonPlowden.com>; ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com; ejones@gwblawfirm.com; jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com; shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com; murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com; pdp@rplegalgroup.com; bb@rplegalgroup.com; jchandler@rplegalgroup.com; vrawl@grsm.com; john@bluesteinattorneys.com; Hall, Kevin <Kevin.Hall@wbd-us.com>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com>; Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>; brady.edwards@morganlewis.com; Carmen Ganjehsani <CGanjehsani@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Charity McQueen <CMcQueen@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Jacques, Robert <robert.jacques@morganlewis.com>; paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com; Jon Robinson <jon.robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Shanon Peake <shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Theile McVey <tmcvey@kassellaw.com>; jkassel@kassellaw.com; jrutkoski@kassellaw.com; tbranham@dobslegal.com; kpaul@dobslegal.com; David Humen <dhumen@dobslegal.com>; jelliott@richardsonplowden.com; cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com; Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Carmen Ganjehsani <CGanjehsani@RichardsonPlowden.com>; John Nichols <john@bluesteinattorneys.com>; vrawl@grsm.com; sbrown@ycrlaw.com; tgandy@ycrlaw.com; sgriffith@ycrlaw.com; Yingling, Donna <Donna.Yingling@wbd-us.com>

Subject: John A. Tibbs v. Asbestos Corporation Limited (Appellate Case No. 2023-002006)

Dear Ms. Howard and Ms. Kitchings,

Please find attached for filing with both the Supreme Court and Court of Appeals a Petition for a Writ of Certiorari on behalf of the Altrad Defendants in Appellate Case No. 2023-002006. By copy to all counsel, we are serving the same on them via this email. Accompanying this Petition is a two-volume appendix, which has been uploaded to my OneDrive with both courts and is available here: <https://download.wbd-us.com/bds/Login.do?id=A06109909569&p1=naj21yssbhcbkbbkghklccffij20>

If any counsel require hard copies of the appendix, please do not hesitate to let me know, and

we'll be glad to provide them.

We will be submitting the requisite filing fee within five business days of this correspondence.

We appreciate the Court's consideration of this filing. Have a good evening,

Todd

Todd Carroll

Partner

Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP

d: [803-454-7730](tel:803-454-7730)

m: [803-446-2883](tel:803-446-2883)

e: Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com

1221 Main Street

Suite 1600

Columbia, SC 29201



womblebonddickinson.com



This email is sent for and on behalf of Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP. Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP is a member of Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited, which consists of independent and autonomous law firms providing services in the US, the UK, and elsewhere around the world. Each Womble Bond Dickinson entity is a separate legal entity and is not responsible for the acts or omissions of, nor can bind or obligate, another Womble Bond Dickinson entity. Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited does not practice law. Please see www.womblebonddickinson.com/us/legal-notice for further details.

From: Ashwin Sanzgiri <ASanzgiri@RichardsonPlowden.com>

Sent: Tuesday, September 10, 2024 4:54 PM

To: suptfilings@sccourts.org; ctappfilings@sccourts.org

Cc: jlay@gwblawfirm.com; gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com; ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com; ljoordan@gwblawfirm.com; ejones@gwblawfirm.com; jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com; shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com; murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com; pdp@rplegalgroup.com; bb@rplegalgroup.com; jchandler@rplegalgroup.com; vrawl@grsm.com; john@bluesteinattorneys.com; Carroll, Todd <Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com>; Hall, Kevin <Kevin.Hall@wbd-us.com>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com>; Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Carmen Ganjehsani <CGanjehsani@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Charity McQueen <CMcQueen@RichardsonPlowden.com>

Subject: John A. Tibbs v. Asbestos Corporation Limited (Appellate Case No. 2023-002007)

Good evening,

Please find attached for filing the Petition for Writ of Certiorari along with proof of service on behalf of Petitioners ArranCo US, LLC; Hawk Bidco (US) Inc.; and Sparrows Offshore, LLC, in Appellate Case No. 2023-002007. The filing fee will be delivered to the Supreme Court within five business days.

We appreciate the Court's time and consideration.

Thank you,

Ashwin Sanzgiri

[HOME](#)

[BIO](#)

[LOCATION](#)

	Ashwin R. Sanzgiri Attorney ASanzgiri@RichardsonPlowden.com
	Richardson Plowden & Robinson, P.A. 1900 Barnwell Street Columbia, SC 29201 Tel: 803.576.3732 Fax: 803.779.0016 www.RichardsonPlowden.com

The information contained in this e-mail message may be attorney-client privileged, attorney work product, or strictly confidential information. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of the communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by telephone at (803) 771-4400 and permanently delete this e-mail.

This email communication may contain CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION WHICH ALSO MAY BE LEGALLY PRIVILEGED and is intended only for the use of the intended recipients identified above. If you are not the intended recipient of this communication, you are hereby notified that any unauthorized review, use, dissemination, distribution, downloading, or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient and have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by reply email, delete the communication and destroy all copies.

GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI, LLP
YOUR 50 STATE LAW FIRM™
<http://www.grsm.com>