

RECEIVED

Feb 20 2025

S.C. SUPREME COURT

**From:** [Vic Rawl](#)  
**To:** [Supreme Court Filings](#)  
**Cc:** [Peter Protopapas](#); [Lindsay Valek](#); [John T. Lay](#); [Gray Culbreath](#); [Lindsay Joyner](#); [Eleanor Jones](#); [Jon Robinson](#); [Shanon Peake](#); [murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com](#); [Carroll, Todd](#); [Troy Brown](#); [Dana Becker](#); [Brady Edwards](#); [Robert Jacques](#); [Paul A. Scrudato](#); [Theile McVey](#); [jkassel@kassellaw.com](#); [irutkoski@kassellaw.com](#); [tbranham@dobslegal.com](#); [kpaul@dobslegal.com](#); [David Humen](#); [jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](#); [cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com](#); [Steve Pugh](#); [Ben Carlton](#); [cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com](#); [Ashwin Sanzgiri](#); [John Nichols](#); [sbrown@yclaw.com](#); [tgandy@yclaw.com](#); [sgriffith@yclaw.com](#); [Stacey Smith](#); [Hall, Kevin](#); [O'Neill, Elizabeth](#); [rhines@yclaw.com](#); [Olive, IV, Graydon](#)  
**Subject:** Filing - Appellate Case No. 2025-000052  
**Date:** Thursday, February 20, 2025 10:46:21 PM  
**Attachments:** [image002.png](#)  
[image214085.png](#)  
[image638304.png](#)  
[image305523.png](#)  
[image537686.png](#)  
[image003.png](#)  
[Charter Defendants" Reply in Support of the Petition for Certiorari \(Second Mode of Trial Appeal\) \(4904-1607-9635.1\) \[29\]\[35\].pdf](#)

---

**\*\*\* EXTERNAL EMAIL:** This email originated from outside the organization. Please exercise caution before clicking any links or opening attachments. \*\*\*

Dear Madam Clerk,

Please find attached for filing with the Court the Charter Defendants' Reply In Support Of Petition For A Writ Of Certiorari (Second Mode Of Trial Appeal) in Appellate Case No. 2025-000052. By copy to all counsel, we are serving them with a copy of this filing.

Respectfully submitted,

Vic

**A. VICTOR RAWL, JR.** | Partner

**GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI | GRSM50**  
**YOUR 50 STATE LAW FIRM™**

677 King Street, Suite 450, Charleston, SC 29403  
301 South 13th Street, Suite 400, Lincoln, NE 68508

D: 843-714-2501 | C: 803-463-4004 | [vrawl@grsm.com](mailto:vrawl@grsm.com)

[www.grsm.com](http://www.grsm.com)

[vCard](#) | [Bio](#) | [LinkedIn](#)

*GRSM is a Mansfield Certified Firm.*

---

**From:** Carroll, Todd <Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com>

**Date:** Thursday, February 20, 2025 at 7:56 PM

**To:** [suptcfilings@sccourts.org](mailto:suptcfilings@sccourts.org) <[suptcfilings@sccourts.org](mailto:suptcfilings@sccourts.org)>

**Cc:** Peter Protopapas <[pdp@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:pdp@rplegalgroup.com)>, Lindsay Valek <[Lindsay@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:Lindsay@rplegalgroup.com)>, John T. Lay <[jl原因@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:jl原因@gwblawfirm.com)>, Gray Culbreath <[gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com)>, Lindsay Joyner

<ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com>, Eleanor Jones <ejones@gwblawfirm.com>, Jon Robinson <Jon.Robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com>, Vic Rawl <vrawl@grsm.com>, Shanon Peake <Shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com>, murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com <murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com>, Troy Brown <troy.brown@morganlewis.com>, Dana Becker <dana.becker@morganlewis.com>, Brady Edwards <brady.edwards@morganlewis.com>, Robert Jacques <Robert.jacques@morganlewis.com>, Paul A. Scudato <paul.scudato@morganlewis.com>, Theile McVey <tmcvey@kassellaw.com>, jkassel@kassellaw.com <jkassel@kassellaw.com>, jrutkoski@kassellaw.com <jrutkoski@kassellaw.com>, tbranham@dobslegal.com <tbranham@dobslegal.com>, kpaul@dobslegal.com <kpaul@dobslegal.com>, David Humen <dhumen@dobslegal.com>, jelliott@richardsonplowden.com <JElliott@RichardsonPlowden.com>, cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com <CBerthelsen@RichardsonPlowden.com>, Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>, Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>, cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com <CGanjehsani@RichardsonPlowden.com>, Ashwin Sanzgiri <ASanzgiri@RichardsonPlowden.com>, John Nichols <john@bluesteinattorneys.com>, sbrown@ycrlaw.com <sbrown@ycrlaw.com>, tgandy@ycrlaw.com <tgandy@ycrlaw.com>, sgriffith@ycrlaw.com <sgriffith@ycrlaw.com>, Stacey Smith <sasmith@grsm.com>, Hall, Kevin <Kevin.Hall@wbd-us.com>, O'Neill, Elizabeth <Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com>, rhines@ycrlaw.com <RHines@ycrlaw.com>, Olive, IV, Graydon <golive@ycrlaw.com>

**Subject:** RE: Filing - Appellate Case No. 2025-000052

Dear Madam Clerk,

Please find attached for filing with the Court a reply brief in support of the Altrad Defendants' petition for a writ of certiorari in Appellate Case No. 2025-000052. By copy to all counsel, we are serving them with a copy of this filing. As always, we appreciate the Court's consideration of the parties' respective positions. Have a good evening, and best regards,

Todd

**Todd Carroll**

Partner

Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP

d: [803-454-7730](tel:803-454-7730)

m: [803-446-2883](tel:803-446-2883)

e: [Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com)

1221 Main Street

Suite 1600

Columbia, SC 29201



[wombledonddickinson.com](http://wombledonddickinson.com)



around the world. Each Womble Bond Dickinson entity is a separate legal entity and is not responsible for the acts or omissions of, nor can bind or obligate, another Womble Bond Dickinson entity. Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited does not practice law. Please see [www.womblebonddickinson.com/us/legal-notice](http://www.womblebonddickinson.com/us/legal-notice) for further details.

**From:** Lindsay Joyner <ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com>

**Sent:** Monday, February 10, 2025 3:08 PM

**To:** Vic Rawl <vrawl@grsm.com>; Carroll, Todd <Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com>

**Cc:** Peter Protopapas <pdp@rplegalgroup.com>; Lindsay Valek <Lindsay@rplegalgroup.com>; John T. Lay <jlay@gwblawfirm.com>; Gray Culbreath <gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com>; Eleanor Jones <ejones@gwblawfirm.com>; Jon Robinson <Jon.Robinson@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Shanon Peake <Shanon.peake@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com; Troy Brown <troy.brown@morganlewis.com>; Dana Becker <dana.becker@morganlewis.com>; Brady Edwards <brady.edwards@morganlewis.com>; Robert Jacques <Robert.jacques@morganlewis.com>; Paul A. Scrudato <paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com>; Theile McVey <tmcvey@kassellaw.com>; jkassel@kassellaw.com; jrutkoski@kassellaw.com; tbranham@dobslegal.com; kpaul@dobslegal.com; David Humen <dhumen@dobslegal.com>; jelliott@richardsonplowden.com; cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com; Steve Pugh <SPugh@RichardsonPlowden.com>; Ben Carlton <BCarlton@RichardsonPlowden.com>; cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com; Ashwin Sanzgiri <ASanzgiri@RichardsonPlowden.com>; John Nichols <john@bluesteinattorneys.com>; sbrown@ycrlaw.com; tgandy@ycrlaw.com; sgriffith@ycrlaw.com; Stacey Smith <sasmith@grsm.com>; achapman@dobslegal.com; khardin@dobslegal.com; tbarnes@dobslegal.com; Hall, Kevin <Kevin.Hall@wbd-us.com>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com>; rhines@ycrlaw.com; Olive, IV, Graydon <golive@ycrlaw.com>

**Subject:** Filing - Appellate Case No. 2025-000052

All,

Hope your Mondays are going well. Attached is Respondent's Return to Petitions for Writ of Certiorari in the above-referenced matter. Momentarily, I will attach this email to the POS and file electronically with the Court as permitted by Rule 262, SCACR.

Thanks,  
Lindsay



**Lindsay Anne Joyner**

Partner

[ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com)

**Gallivan, White & Boyd P.A.**

40 Calhoun Street | Suite 315 | Charleston SC 29401

843 414 8107 Direct | [843 735 7600](tel:8437357600) Main | [843 414 8070](tel:8434148070) Fax

**Mailing** Post Office Box 22768 | Charleston SC 29413

[vCard](#) | [BioURL](#) | [Website](#)

This message is from the law firm Gallivan, White & Boyd, PA and may be a confidential and privileged legal communication to the named recipient(s). If you receive this message in error or are not the named recipient(s), please notify the sender and delete this email. Thank you.

---

This email communication may contain CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION WHICH ALSO MAY BE LEGALLY PRIVILEGED and is intended only for the use of the intended recipients identified above. If you are not the intended recipient of this communication, you are hereby notified that any unauthorized review, use, dissemination, distribution, downloading, or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient and have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by reply email, delete the communication and destroy all copies.

**GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI, LLP**  
**YOUR 50 STATE LAW FIRM™**  
<http://www.grsm.com>