

**RECEIVED**

**Jul 23 2025**

**SC Court of Appeals**

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA

In the Court of Appeals

---

APPEAL FROM AIKEN COUNTY

Court of Common Pleas

The Honorable Patrick C. Fant, III

Circuit Court Case No. 2023-CP-02-01719

Appellate Case No. 2024-002137

---

Deborah Denise Harley,

Respondent,

v.

D.R. Horton, Inc. and Plumbing  
Solutions, LLC,

Defendants,

of Which D.R. Horton, Inc. is the

Appellant.

---

PROOF OF SERVICE

---

The undersigned does hereby certify that on July 23, 2025, the Record on Appeal was served by email on all counsel of record as follows. A copy of the sent email is enclosed as **Exhibit 1** with this Proof of Service.

**[SIGNATURE PAGE TO FOLLOW]**

s/ David L. Paavola  
John T. Crawford Jr., SC Bar No.: 69682  
Kimila L. Wooten, SC Bar No.: 64516  
David L. Paavola, SC Bar No.: 100714  
W. Jacob Henerey, SC Bar No.: 102268  
Amelia Farmer, SC Bar No.: 105750  
KENISON, DUDLEY & CRAWFORD, LLC  
325 McBee Ave., Suite 301  
Greenville, SC 29601  
(864) 242-4899  
(864) 242-4844  
[crawford@conlaw.com](mailto:crawford@conlaw.com)  
[wooten@conlaw.com](mailto:wooten@conlaw.com)  
[paavola@conlaw.com](mailto:paavola@conlaw.com)  
[henerey@conlaw.com](mailto:henerey@conlaw.com)  
[farmer@conlaw.com](mailto:farmer@conlaw.com)  
*Attorneys for Appellant*

July 23, 2025

Other counsel of record:

LYLES & ASSOCIATES, LLC  
Robert T. Lyles, Jr., Esq.  
Joseph Daniel Winterstein, Esq.  
1037 Chuck Dawley Blvd., Suite G-100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
T 843-577-7730  
F 843-577-7172  
Email: [rtl@lylesfirm.com](mailto:rtl@lylesfirm.com)  
[jdw@lylesfirm.com](mailto:jdw@lylesfirm.com)

*Counsel for Respondent Deborah Denise Harley*

CLEMENT RIVERS, LLP  
Catherine Holland Chase, Esq.  
Willam A. Dennis, Jr. Esq.  
PO Box 993  
Charleston, SC 29402-0993  
T 843-720-5488  
Email: [cchase@yctrlaw.com](mailto:cchase@yctrlaw.com)  
[bdennis@yctrlaw.com](mailto:bdennis@yctrlaw.com)

*Counsel for Plumbing Solutions, LLC*

# EXHIBIT 1

**From:** [Natascha Genc](#)  
**To:** [Robert Lyles](#); [Danny Winterstein](#); [Catherine Chase](#); "[BDennis@ycrlaw.com](#)"  
**Cc:** [John Crawford](#); [Kim Wooten](#); [David Paavola](#); [Jacob Henerey](#); [Amelia Farmer](#); [Angelia Shaw](#); [Cara Smith](#); [Jessica Barrette](#); [Tammie Aycock](#)  
**Bcc:** [Kelly Nix](#)  
**Subject:** Deborah Denise Harley v D.R. Horton, Inc. and Plumbing Solutions, LLC (Case No. 2024-002137) - Part 1 of 3  
**Date:** Wednesday, July 23, 2025 9:52:00 AM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[25.07.23 ROA - Harley Part1.pdf](#)

---

Dear Counsel:

Attached please find the Record on Appeal (Part 1 of 3) as it relates to Deborah Denise Harley v. D.R. Horton, Inc. and Plumbing Solutions, LLC (Appellate Case No.: 2024-002137). The Proof of Service will be filed with the Court of Appeals shortly.

With kindest regards,



**Natascha Genc**  
Paralegal  
KENISON, DUDLEY & CRAWFORD, LLC  
325 W. McBee Avenue, Suite 301  
Greenville, SC 29601  
Email: [genc@conlaw.com](mailto:genc@conlaw.com)  
Main: (864) 242-4899  
Website: [www.conlaw.com](http://www.conlaw.com)

This email contains information that may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent authorized to receive for the intended recipient, you may not copy, disclose or use any contents in this email. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender at Kenison, Dudley & Crawford, LLC by replying to this email and delete the original and reply emails. Thank you.

**From:** [Natascha Genc](mailto:Natascha.Genc)  
**To:** [rtl@lylesfirm.com](mailto:rtl@lylesfirm.com); [jdw@lylesfirm.com](mailto:jdw@lylesfirm.com); [cchase@ycrlaw.com](mailto:cchase@ycrlaw.com); [bdennis@ycrlaw.com](mailto:bdennis@ycrlaw.com)  
**Cc:** [John Crawford](#); [Kim Wooten](#); [David Paavola](#); [Jacob Henerey](#); [Amelia Farmer](#); [Angelia Shaw](#); [Cara Smith](#); [Jessica Barrette](#); [Tammie Aycock](#)  
**Bcc:** [Kelly Nix](#)  
**Subject:** Deborah Denise Harley v D.R. Horton, Inc. and Plumbing Solutions, LLC (Case No. 2024-002137) - Part 2 of 3  
**Date:** Wednesday, July 23, 2025 9:52:00 AM  
**Attachments:** [25.07.23 ROA - Harley Part2.pdf](#)  
[image001.png](#)

---

Dear Counsel:

Attached please find the Record on Appeal (Part 2 of 3) as it relates to Deborah Denise Harley v. D.R. Horton, Inc. and Plumbing Solutions, LLC (Appellate Case No.: 2024-002137). The Proof of Service will be filed with the Court of Appeals shortly.

With kindest regards,



**Natascha Genc**  
Paralegal  
KENISON, DUDLEY & CRAWFORD, LLC  
325 W. McBee Avenue, Suite 301  
Greenville, SC 29601  
Email: [genc@conlaw.com](mailto:genc@conlaw.com)  
Main: (864) 242-4899  
Website: [www.conlaw.com](http://www.conlaw.com)

This email contains information that may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent authorized to receive for the intended recipient, you may not copy, disclose or use any contents in this email. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender at Kenison, Dudley & Crawford, LLC by replying to this email and delete the original and reply emails. Thank you.

**From:** [Natascha Genc](mailto:Natascha.Genc)  
**To:** [rtl@lylesfirm.com](mailto:rtl@lylesfirm.com); [jdw@lylesfirm.com](mailto:jdw@lylesfirm.com); [cchase@ycrlaw.com](mailto:cchase@ycrlaw.com); [bdennis@ycrlaw.com](mailto:bdennis@ycrlaw.com)  
**Cc:** [John Crawford](#); [Kim Wooten](#); [David Paavola](#); [Jacob Henerey](#); [Amelia Farmer](#); [Angelia Shaw](#); [Cara Smith](#); [Jessica Barrette](#); [Tammie Aycock](#)  
**Bcc:** [Kelly Nix](#)  
**Subject:** Deborah Denise Harley v D.R. Horton, Inc. and Plumbing Solutions, LLC (Case No. 2024-002137) - Part 3 of 3  
**Date:** Wednesday, July 23, 2025 9:52:00 AM  
**Attachments:** [25.07.23 ROA - Harley Part3.pdf](#)  
[image001.png](#)

---

Dear Counsel:

Attached please find the Record on Appeal (Part 3 of 3) as it relates to Deborah Denise Harley v. D.R. Horton, Inc. and Plumbing Solutions, LLC (Appellate Case No.: 2024-002137). The Proof of Service will be filed with the Court of Appeals shortly.

With kindest regards,



**Natascha Genc**  
Paralegal  
KENISON, DUDLEY & CRAWFORD, LLC  
325 W. McBee Avenue, Suite 301  
Greenville, SC 29601  
Email: [genc@conlaw.com](mailto:genc@conlaw.com)  
Main: (864) 242-4899  
Website: [www.conlaw.com](http://www.conlaw.com)

This email contains information that may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent authorized to receive for the intended recipient, you may not copy, disclose or use any contents in this email. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender at Kenison, Dudley & Crawford, LLC by replying to this email and delete the original and reply emails. Thank you.