

**From:** [Bridenback, Tasha](#)  
**To:** [Toal, Jean](#); [Wesley B. Sawyer](#); [Carroll, Todd](#); [vrawl@grsm.com](#)  
**Cc:** [John Chandler](#); [Peter Protopapas](#); [Lee, Harry](#); [O'Neill, Elizabeth](#); [Kevin K. Bell](#); [Theile McVey](#); [Trey Branham](#); [Cameron Berthelsen](#); [James Elliott](#); [Balber, Scott](#); ["Rubinstein, Benjamin"](#); [Herman, Maxwell](#); [elizabeth.herman@hsfkramer.com](#); [John T. Lay](#); [Lindsay Joyner](#); [Jon Robinson](#); [Olesya Bracey](#); [Shanon Peake](#); [Dot Faulkenberry](#); [Danny Nieto](#); [Scrudato, Paul A.](#); [Melling, Andrew](#); [Gibson, Lisa](#); [Lindsay Valek](#); [Helen Elliott](#)  
**Subject:** RE: From Chief Justice Toal Regarding Tibbs (2023-CP-40-01759) and Park (2021-CP-40-02727)  
**Date:** Wednesday, July 23, 2025 4:42:47 PM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[image002.png](#)  
[image003.png](#)  
[image004.png](#)  
[image005.png](#)  
[image006.png](#)

RECEIVED

Oct 06 2025

S.C. SUPREME COURT

Caution! This message was sent from outside your organization.

[Allow sender](#) | [Block sender](#)

From Chief Justice Toal:

Dear Counsel,

Please know this matter is not pending at the Supreme Court at this time, it has been remanded to me by the South Carolina Supreme Court. Therefore, your comments need to be directed to me.

With my kindest personal regards,

I am sincerely yours,

**Chief Justice (Ret.) Jean H. Toal**  
Acting Circuit Court Judge

**Tasha Bridenback**

Judicial Law Clerk

SC Court Administration

Office: (803) 734-0833

[TBridenback@sccourts.org](mailto:TBridenback@sccourts.org)

*\*\*\*The message is intended exclusively for the individual or entity to which it is addressed. This communication may contain information that is privileged, confidential or otherwise exempt from disclosure. If you are not the named addressee, you are not authorized to read, print, retain, copy or disseminate this message. If you have received this message in error, please contact me immediately and delete all copies of this message.\*\*\**

**From:** Wesley B. Sawyer <[wsawyer@murphygrantland.com](mailto:wsawyer@murphygrantland.com)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 23, 2025 3:57 PM

**To:** Carroll, Todd <[todd.carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:todd.carroll@wbd-us.com)>; Bridenback, Tasha <[tbridenback@sccourts.org](mailto:tbridenback@sccourts.org)>; Toal, Jean <[JToal@sccourts.org](mailto:JToal@sccourts.org)>

**Cc:** John Chandler <[jchandler@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:jchandler@rplegalgroup.com)>; Peter Protopapas <[pdp@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:pdp@rplegalgroup.com)>; Lee, Harry <[hlee@steptoe.com](mailto:hlee@steptoe.com)>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <[Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com](mailto:Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com)>; Kevin K. Bell <[kbell@robinsongray.com](mailto:kbell@robinsongray.com)>; Theile McVey <[tmcvey@kassellaw.com](mailto:tmcvey@kassellaw.com)>; Trey Branham <[tbranham@dobslegal.com](mailto:tbranham@dobslegal.com)>; Cameron Berthelsen <[cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com)>; James Elliott <[jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)>; Balber, Scott <[scott.balber@hsf.com](mailto:scott.balber@hsf.com)>; 'Rubinstein,

Benjamin' <Benjamin.Rubinstein@hsf.com>; Herman, Maxwell <Maxwell.Herman@hsf.com>; elizabeth.herman@hsfkramer.com; vrawl@grsm.com; John T. Lay <jlay@gwblawfirm.com>; Lindsay Joyner <ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com>; Jon Robinson <jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Olesya Bracey <obracey@gwblawfirm.com>; Shanon Peake <shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Dot Faulkenberry <dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com>; Danny Nieto <danny@rplegalgroup.com>; Scrudato, Paul A. <paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com>; Melling, Andrew <amelling@burr.com>; Gibson, Lisa <lgibson@burr.com>; Lindsay Valek <Lindsay@rplegalgroup.com>; Helen Elliott <helliott@richardsonplowden.com>

**Subject:** RE: From Chief Justice Toal Regarding Tibbs (2023-CP-40-01759) and Park (2021-CP-40-02727)

**\*\*\* EXTERNAL EMAIL:** This email originated from outside the organization. Please exercise caution before clicking any links or opening attachments. \*\*\*

Dear Ms. Bridenback,

As Mr. Carroll noted in his email below, we have been in court with Judge Brown in Greenville this afternoon, and I have not had a chance to review the court's proposed submission/report in detail. To the extent my clients have concerns with any points made in the report, we will note them to the Supreme Court with a copy to her honor.

Respectfully,

Wes Sawyer



**WESLEY B. SAWYER**

Shareholder

DD: 803-454-1233

Cell: 704-425-8502

Fax: 803-782-4140

Post Office Box 6648

Columbia, SC 29260

[www.murphygrantland.com](http://www.murphygrantland.com)



*Please be advised that this e-mail and any files transmitted with it are confidential attorney-client communications or may otherwise be privileged or confidential and are intended solely for the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, please do not read, copy or retransmit this communication but destroy it immediately. Any unauthorized dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited.*

---

**From:** Carroll, Todd <[Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 23, 2025 3:07 PM  
**To:** Bridenback, Tasha <[tbridenback@sccourts.org](mailto:tbridenback@sccourts.org)>; Toal, Jean <[JToal@sccourts.org](mailto:JToal@sccourts.org)>  
**Cc:** John Chandler <[jchandler@rlegalgroup.com](mailto:jchandler@rlegalgroup.com)>; Peter Protopapas <[pdp@rlegalgroup.com](mailto:pdp@rlegalgroup.com)>; Lee, Harry <[hlee@steptoe.com](mailto:hlee@steptoe.com)>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <[Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com](mailto:Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com)>; Kevin K. Bell <[kbell@robinsongray.com](mailto:kbell@robinsongray.com)>; Wesley B. Sawyer <[wsawyer@murphygrantland.com](mailto:wsawyer@murphygrantland.com)>; Theile McVey <[tmcvey@kassellaw.com](mailto:tmcvey@kassellaw.com)>; Trey Branham <[tbranham@dobslegal.com](mailto:tbranham@dobslegal.com)>; Cameron Berthelsen <[cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com)>; James Elliott <[jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)>; Balber, Scott <[scott.balber@hsf.com](mailto:scott.balber@hsf.com)>; 'Rubinstein, Benjamin' <[Benjamin.Rubinstein@hsf.com](mailto:Benjamin.Rubinstein@hsf.com)>; Herman, Maxwell <[Maxwell.Herman@hsf.com](mailto:Maxwell.Herman@hsf.com)>; [elizabeth.herman@hsfkramer.com](mailto:elizabeth.herman@hsfkramer.com); [vrawl@grsm.com](mailto:vrawl@grsm.com); John T. Lay <[jlay@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:jlay@gwblawfirm.com)>; Lindsay Joyner <[ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com)>; Jon Robinson <[jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Olesya Bracey <[obracey@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:obracey@gwblawfirm.com)>; Shanon Peake <[shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Dot Faulkenberry <[dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Danny Nieto <[danny@rlegalgroup.com](mailto:danny@rlegalgroup.com)>; Scudato, Paul A. <[paul.scudato@morganlewis.com](mailto:paul.scudato@morganlewis.com)>; Melling, Andrew <[amelling@burr.com](mailto:amelling@burr.com)>; Gibson, Lisa <[lgibson@burr.com](mailto:lgibson@burr.com)>; Lindsay Valek <[Lindsay@rlegalgroup.com](mailto:Lindsay@rlegalgroup.com)>; Helen Elliott <[helliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:helliott@richardsonplowden.com)>  
**Subject:** Re: From Chief Justice Toal Regarding Tibbs (2023-CP-40-01759) and Park (2021-CP-40-02727)

Ms. Bridenback, we have been in court with Judge Brown in Greenville this afternoon and have not yet had a chance to review the court's proposed submission/report. To the extent our clients have concerns with any points made in the report, we will note them to the Supreme Court with a copy to Her Honor. Best,

Todd

**Todd Carroll**

Partner

Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP

**d:** [803-454-7730](tel:803-454-7730)

**m:** [803-446-2883](tel:803-446-2883)

**e:** [Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com)

1221 Main Street

Suite 1600

Columbia, SC 29201



[womblebonddickinson.com](http://womblebonddickinson.com)



This email is sent for and on behalf of Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP. Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP is a member of Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited, which consists of independent and autonomous law firms providing services in the US, the UK, and elsewhere around the world. Each Womble Bond Dickinson entity is a separate legal entity and is not responsible for the acts or omissions of, nor can bind or obligate, another Womble Bond Dickinson entity. Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited does not practice law. Please see [www.womblebonddickinson.com/us/legal-notice](http://www.womblebonddickinson.com/us/legal-notice) for further details.

---

**From:** Bridenback, Tasha <[tbridenback@sccourts.org](mailto:tbridenback@sccourts.org)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 23, 2025 1:03:36 PM

**To:** Toal, Jean <[JToal@sccourts.org](mailto:JToal@sccourts.org)>

**Cc:** John Chandler <[jchandler@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:jchandler@rplegalgroup.com)>; Peter Protopapas <[pdp@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:pdp@rplegalgroup.com)>; Lee, Harry <[hlee@steptoe.com](mailto:hlee@steptoe.com)>; Carroll, Todd <[Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:Todd.Carroll@wbd-us.com)>; O'Neill, Elizabeth <[Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com](mailto:Elizabeth.ONeill@wbd-us.com)>; Kevin K. Bell <[kbell@robinsongray.com](mailto:kbell@robinsongray.com)>; Wesley B. Sawyer <[wsawyer@murphygrantland.com](mailto:wsawyer@murphygrantland.com)>; Theile McVey <[tmcvey@kassellaw.com](mailto:tmcvey@kassellaw.com)>; Trey Branham <[tbranham@dobslegal.com](mailto:tbranham@dobslegal.com)>; Cameron Berthelsen <[cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com)>; James Elliott <[jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)>; Balber, Scott <[scott.balber@hsf.com](mailto:scott.balber@hsf.com)>; 'Rubinstein, Benjamin' <[Benjamin.Rubinstein@hsf.com](mailto:Benjamin.Rubinstein@hsf.com)>; Herman, Maxwell <[Maxwell.Herman@hsf.com](mailto:Maxwell.Herman@hsf.com)>; [elizabeth.herman@hsfkramer.com](mailto:elizabeth.herman@hsfkramer.com) <[elizabeth.herman@hsfkramer.com](mailto:elizabeth.herman@hsfkramer.com)>; [vrawl@grsm.com](mailto:vrawl@grsm.com) <[vrawl@grsm.com](mailto:vrawl@grsm.com)>; John T. Lay <[jlay@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:jlay@gwblawfirm.com)>; Lindsay Joyner <[ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com)>; Jon Robinson <[jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Olesya Bracey <[obracey@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:obracey@gwblawfirm.com)>; Shanon Peake <[shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Jon Robinson <[jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Dot Faulkenberry <[dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:dot@smithrobinsonlaw.com)>; Danny Nieto <[danny@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:danny@rplegalgroup.com)>; Scudato, Paul A. <[paul.scudato@morganlewis.com](mailto:paul.scudato@morganlewis.com)>; Melling, Andrew <[amelling@burr.com](mailto:amelling@burr.com)>; Gibson, Lisa <[lgibson@burr.com](mailto:lgibson@burr.com)>; Lindsay Valek <[Lindsay@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:Lindsay@rplegalgroup.com)>; Helen Elliott <[helliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:helliott@richardsonplowden.com)>

**Subject:** From Chief Justice Toal Regarding Tibbs (2023-CP-40-01759) and Park (2021-CP-40-02727)

From Chief Justice Toal:

Dear Counsel,

I am enclosing a copy of the draft of my First Report to the Supreme Court of South Carolina which I intend to send out this afternoon at 5:00 PM. Please give me any comments you have by 4:00 PM. I have also determined that the first week of the August term should be reserved for the potential use of the parties in the case remaining in the August Block. I also want to give you adequate to make you filings on the motions in Tibbs. Therefore, I am setting the hearing to begin August 11, 2025, and I am also setting a briefing schedule on the motions. A copy of the notice of the hearing and the briefing schedule is also attached. It will be filed in Tibbs at 5:00 PM unless I hear some strong reason to change.

With my kindest personal regards,

I am sincerely yours,

**Chief Justice (Ret.) Jean H. Toal**  
Acting Circuit Court Judge

## **Tasha Bridenback**

Judicial Law Clerk

SC Court Administration

Office: (803) 734-0833

[TBridenback@sccourts.org](mailto:TBridenback@sccourts.org)

*\*\*\*The message is intended exclusively for the individual or entity to which it is addressed. This communication may contain information that is privileged, confidential or otherwise exempt from disclosure. If you are not the named addressee, you are not authorized to read, print, retain, copy or disseminate this message. If you have received this message in error, please contact me immediately and delete all copies of this message.\*\*\**

~~~ CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE ~~~ This message is intended only for the addressee and may contain information that is confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, do not read, copy, retain, or disseminate this message or any attachment. If you have received this message in error, please contact the sender immediately and delete all copies of the message and any attachments.