

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA

In the Supreme Court

APPEAL FROM CHARLESTON COUNTY

Court of Common Pleas

Mikell R. Scarborough, Master-in-Equity

Case No.: 2018-CP-10-4083

Appellate Tracking No.: 2025-001659

Opinion No.: 2025-UP-153

RECEIVED

Oct 17 2025

S.C. SUPREME COURT

Charleston Carriage Works, L.L.C.,

Petitioner,

v.

Charleston Animal Society, Ellen Harley and
Charleston Carriage Horse Advocates, Inc.,

Respondents.

PROOF OF SERVICE

I certify that I have served the Petitioner's Reply To Return upon the Charleston Animal Society, Charleston Carriage Horse Advocates and Ellen Harley by depositing a copy of it in the United States Mail (and by providing an electronic copy), postage prepaid on October 17, 2025, addressed to their attorneys of record, Elizabeth Palmer at her office Saxton & Stump at 151 Meeting Street, Suite 350, Charleston, South Carolina 29401 and to Spencer Gill and Joseph Thompson at their office Hall Booth Smith, P.C. at 111 Coleman Boulevard, Mt. Pleasant, S. C. 29464, and to Jenkins Mann at his office, Mann Blake & Jackson at 1901 Main Street, Suite 1205, Columbia, South Carolina 29201 and via electronic service.

October 17, 2025

/s/Thomas R. Goldstein

Thomas R. Goldstein, S. C. Bar No. 2186

Belk, Cobb, Infinger & Goldstein, P.A.

P. O. Box 71121

N. Charleston, S. C. 29415-1121

(843) 729 0928

tgoldstein@cobblaw.net

Attorneys for Petitioner