

**RECEIVED**

**Dec 05 2025**

**S.C. SUPREME COURT**

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Supreme Court

---

APPEAL FROM SOUTH CAROLINA  
Workers' Compensation Commission

---

Appellate Case No. 2024-001975  
Order filed September 24, 2025

---

Troy Hinson, Claimant, ..... Petitioner,

v.

Merrill Gardens, LLC, Employer, and  
Church Mutual Insurance Company, Carrier, ..... Respondents.

---

**APPENDIX**

---

Stephen B. Samuels  
SAMUELS REYNOLDS LAW FIRM, LLC  
1320 Richland Street  
Columbia, SC 29201  
[stephen@samuelsreynolds.com](mailto:stephen@samuelsreynolds.com)

ATTORNEYS FOR PETITIONER

Mark Davis, Esquire  
MCANGUS GOUDELICK & COURIE, LLC  
735 Johnnie Dodds Blvd, Suite 200  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29465  
[mdavis@mgclaw.com](mailto:mdavis@mgclaw.com)

Jeffrey Kuykendal, Esquire  
MCANGUS GOUDELICK & COURIE, LLC  
6302 Fairview Road, Suite 700  
Charlotte, NC 28226  
[jeffrey.kuykendal@mgclaw.com](mailto:jeffrey.kuykendal@mgclaw.com)

ATTORNEYS FOR RESPONDENTS

**APPENDIX**

**I. ORDERS**

Order requiring memoranda on the issue of appealability (S.C. Ct. App. filed August 22, 2025) ..... 1

Order dismissing appeal (S.C. Ct. App. filed September 24, 2025) ..... 2

Order denying Petition for Rehearing (S.C. Ct. App. filed November 5, 2025) ..... 4

**II. PETITIONS AND MOTIONS**

Petition for Rehearing ..... 5

Return to Petition for Rehearing ..... 15

Reply to Return to Petitioner for Rehearing ..... 21

**III. BRIEFS AND MEMORANDA**

Appellant 's Memorandum of Law on Appealability ..... 28

Supplemental Brief of Respondent ..... 39

Brief of Appellant ..... 43

Brief of Respondent ..... 73

Reply Brief of Appellant ..... 91

**IV. RECORD ON APPEAL**

**RECORD ON APPEAL**

**I. ORDERS** ..... 1

Single Commission Decision and Order dated January 31, 2024 ..... 1

Full Commission Decision and Order dated November 1, 2024 ..... 22

<b>II. PLEADINGS</b> .....	44
SCWCC Form 15 dated February 8, 2022 .....	44
Claimant's Form 58 dated April 11, 2022 .....	45
Claimant's APA Submissions dated April 11, 2022 .....	50
1. Concentra Medical Center - Downtown .....	53
2. Providence Hospital NE .....	89
3. The Practice, LLC .....	126
4. Midlands Orthopaedics & Neurosurgery Dr. James O'Leary .....	150
5. Palmetto Imaging .....	188
6. Prisma Health Weight Management Center Dr. David Moffat .....	190
7. Morrow Urology .....	233
8. Midlands Ortho & Neuro PT .....	238
9. Midlands Orthopaedics & Neurosurgery Dr. Ivan Lamotta .....	243
Claimant's Exhibits dated April 11, 2022 .....	251
A. Job Description - Maintenance Director .....	251
B. Merrill Gardens - Valid Job Offer .....	254
C. Emails between Claimant's counsel and Defense counsel .....	256
D. Merrill Gardens - Termination letter .....	270
E. Outstanding bills .....	271
F. Employee Timecard .....	288

G. TTD Check Stubs . . . . .	300
H. Merrill Garden Paycheck Stubs . . . . .	304
Defendant’s Form 58 dated April 11, 2022 . . . . .	308
Defendant’s APA Submissions dated April 11, 2022. . . . .	310
1. Midlands Orthopaedics & Neurosurgery Dr. Ivan Lamotta . . . . .	312
2. Prisma Health Dr. David Moffat . . . . .	322
3. Dr. Charles McElmurray . . . . .	328
4. Personnel and payroll records . . . . .	338
5. Valid job offer letter. . . . .	345
6. Form 15, Section III . . . . .	346
7. Maintenance Director Job Description . . . . .	347
8. Pre-Injury Job Analysis . . . . .	351
9. Incident Report. . . . .	352
10. Termination Document Form . . . . .	355
III. <b>TRANSCRIPTS</b> . . . . .	363
Transcript of the Workers’ Compensation Hearing dated April 25, 2022 . . . . .	363
IV. <b>CERTIFICATE OF COUNSEL</b> . . . . .	480

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Supreme Court

RECEIVED

DEC 05 2025

S.C. SUPREME COURT

APPEAL FROM SOUTH CAROLINA  
Workers' Compensation Commission

Appellate Case No. 2024-001975

Troy Hinson, Claimant, ..... Appellant,

v.

Merrill Gardens, LLC, Employer, and  
Church Mutual Insurance Company, Carrier, ..... Respondents.

PROOF OF SERVICE

I certify that I, Wanda Powell, Paralegal to Stephen B. Samuels have caused the **Petition for Writ of Certiorari** and **Appendix** to be served on the parties on the date indicated below and addressed as follows:

Mark Davis, Esquire  
McAngus Goudeock & Courie, LLC  
PO Box 650007  
735 Johnnie Dodds Blvd, Suite 200  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29465  
[mdavis@mgclaw.com](mailto:mdavis@mgclaw.com)

Honorable Patricia A. Howard  
Clerk of the SC Supreme Court  
1231 Gervais Street  
Columbia, SC 29201  
[suptfilings@sccourts.org](mailto:suptfilings@sccourts.org)

Jeffrey Kuykendal, Esquire  
McAngus Goudelock & Courie, LLC  
6302 Fairview Road, Suite 700  
Charlotte, NC 28226  
[jeffrey.kuykendal@mgclaw.com](mailto:jeffrey.kuykendal@mgclaw.com)



Wanda Powell, Paralegal

December 5, 2025

**SAMUELS REYNOLDS LAW FIRM LLC**  
1320 RICHLAND ST 803-779-4000  
COLUMBIA, SC 29201-2522

12/5/2025

PAY TO THE ORDER OF South Carolina Supreme Court

\$ \*\*250.00

Two Hundred Fifty and 00/100\*\*\*\*\*

DOLLAR

South Carolina Supreme Court  
Supreme Court Building  
1231 Gervais Street  
Columbia, South Carolina 29201



AUTHORIZED SIGNATURE

MEMO

Petition for Writ of Certiorari, T. Hinson

⑈017179⑈ ⑆063114030⑆ 200120024758⑈

**SAMUELS REYNOLDS LAW FIRM LLC**

17179

South Carolina Supreme Court				12/5/2025	
Date	Type	Reference	Original Amt.	Balance Due	Discount
12/5/2025	Bill		250.00	250.00	
				Check Amount	250.00
					Payment 250.00

**RECEIVED**  
DEC 05 2025  
S.C. SUPREME COURT

Operating Account      Petition for Writ of Certiorari, T. Hinson      250.00

**SAMUELS REYNOLDS LAW FIRM LLC**

17179

South Carolina Supreme Court				12/5/2025	
Date	Type	Reference	Original Amt.	Balance Due	Discount
12/5/2025	Bill		250.00	250.00	
				Check Amount	250.00
					Payment 250.00

Operating Account      Petition for Writ of Certiorari, T. Hinson      250.00