

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
IN THE SUPREME COURT

RECEIVED

Dec 29 2025

S.C. SUPREME COURT

\_\_\_\_\_  
Certiorari to Orangeburg County

Honorable Kristi F. Curtis, Circuit Court Judge

\_\_\_\_\_  
DANNY RYANT, JR.,

PETITIONER

V.

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA,

RESPONDENT

APPELLATE CASE NO. 2025-001191

\_\_\_\_\_  
APPENDIX  
\_\_\_\_\_

GARY H. JOHNSON  
Appellate Defender

ALAN WILSON  
Attorney General

South Carolina Commission on Indigent Defense  
Division of Appellate Defense  
PO Box 11589  
Columbia, SC 29211-1589  
(803) 734-1330

DANIELLE E. DIXON  
Assistant Attorney General  
PO Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211  
(803)734-3970

ATTORNEY FOR PETITIONER

DAVID MICHAEL PASCOE, JR.  
Solicitor, First Judicial Circuit  
First Circuit Solicitor's Office  
PO Box 1525  
Orangeburg, SC 29116  
(803) 533-6252

**Pages 501-1000**

ATTORNEYS FOR RESPONDENT

INDEX

INDEX ..... i

**TRIAL TRANSCRIPT DATED DECEMBER 10-17, 2010** ..... 1

INDICTMENTS ..... 1129

SENTENCE SHEETS ..... 1135

APPLICATION FOR POST-CONVICTION RELIEF DATED OCTOBER 13, 2015..... 1138

RETURN DATED JULY 21, 2016 ..... 1161

**PCR HEARING DATED AUGUST 12, 2024**..... 1167

APPLICANT’S EXHIBIT 1 (STATEMENT)..... 1224

APPLICANT’S EXHIBIT 2 (STATEMENT)..... 1226

ORDER OF DISMISSAL DATED MAY 7, 2025 ..... 1227

1 FIRMING PIN OR A HAMMER OF A FIREARM, THE PRIMER  
2 IGNITES, THE GUN POWDER IGNITES AND IT EXPELS OR  
3 PROJECTS THE BULLET. THAT'S HOW IT WORKS. THE  
4 CASING IS NORMALLY MADE OF ALUMINUM OR BRASS AND  
5 THAT IS WHAT HOLDS THE COMPONENTS. IT'S AFTER A  
6 BULLET'S BEEN FIRED ALREADY.

7 Q. OKAY. AND THEN WHAT HAPPENS AFTER YOU FIRE A GUN,  
8 WHAT HAPPENS TO THAT SHELL CASING?

9 A. IF IT'S AN AUTOMATIC GUN WHICH FEEDS  
10 AUTOMATICALLY, IN OTHER WORDS, ONCE YOU FIRE A  
11 ROUND THE ACTION OF THE WEAPON WILL PULL THE  
12 EMPTY SHELL CASING OUT AND EJECT IT OR THROW IT  
13 FROM THE GUN. AND THAT'S IF YOU HAVE A WEAPON  
14 THAT AUTOMATICALLY RELOADS ITSELF. IF IT'S A  
15 REVOLVER THEN THE CASING WILL STAY IN THE GUN AND  
16 IT HAS TO BE REMOVED MANUALLY BY THE PERSON WHO'S  
17 HANDLING THE WEAPON.

18 Q. OKAY. SO, IF SOMEBODY WAS IN THAT LIVING ROOM  
19 WITH A, WITH AN AUTOMATIC OR SEMI-AUTOMATIC HAND  
20 GUN FIRING IT, EVERY TIME -- THEORETICALLY, EVERY  
21 TIME THEY PULL THE TRIGGER NOT ONLY IS A BULLET  
22 GOING TO COME OUT BUT A SHELL CASING IS GOING TO  
23 GET EJECTED OUT OF THAT GUN?

24 A. YES, SIR, THEORETICALLY, AS LONG AS THE GUN IS  
25 FUNCTIONING PROPERLY, WHICH IF IT'S FIRING IT

1 SHOULD BE. EVERY TIME YOU SHOOT, EVERY TIME YO  
2 FIRE THE WEAPON IT'S GOING TO KICK THE SHELL  
3 CASING OUT.

4 Q. OKAY. NOW, IN COLLECTING THOSE SHELL CASINGS ARE  
5 YOU ABLE TO LOOK AT A SHELL CASING AND DETERMINE  
6 THE CALIBER OF THE GUN THAT FIRED THE SHELL  
7 CASING?

8 A. MOST OF THE TIME, YES.

9 Q. AND IN THIS CASE WERE YOU ABLE TO, IN LOOKING AT  
10 THE SHELL CASINGS YOU COLLECTED OUT THERE, WERE  
11 YOU ABLE TO DO THAT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. HOW MANY DIFFERENT CALIBER SHELL CASINGS  
14 WERE THERE LOCATED?

15 A. THERE WERE THREE -- THERE WERE SHELL CASINGS FOR  
16 THREE SEPARATE CALIBER WEAPONS, A NINE MILLIMETER  
17 LUGER, A FORTY CALIBER SMITH AND WESSON, AND A  
18 SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY THIRTY-NINE MILLIMETER,  
19 WHICH WOULD COME FROM AN ASSAULT RIFLE.

20 Q. OKAY. AND WOULD YOU TELL ME, WHAT DOES CALIBER  
21 MEAN, WHAT IS THAT?

22 A. CALIBER IS THE DIAMETER OF THE BULLET. IT  
23 DESIGNATES WHAT BULLETS GO IN A PARTICULAR  
24 WEAPON, AND IT'S THE SIZE OF THE BULLET, THE  
25 DIAMETER.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

503

1 Q. AND SPECIFICALLY, I GUESS YOU SAID, NINE  
2 MILLIMETER LUGER, FIRST, SHELL CASINGS, AND SO,  
3 WE'LL KIND OF DEAL WITH THAT KIND OF INITIALLY,  
4 DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY THEN TO COLLECT THOSE  
5 NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASINGS?

6 A. YES, SIR, I DID.

7 Q. AND I'M SHOWING YOU WHAT'S MARKED AS STATE'S  
8 EXHIBITS NUMBER THIRTY-NINE THROUGH FORTY-NINE,  
9 THESE ELEVEN ITEMS, I'LL GIVE YOU A CHANCE TO --  
10 THEY'RE OBVIOUSLY GOING TO HAVE DIFFERENT NUMBERS  
11 THAN YOU HAVE ON THERE, UNFORTUNATELY, BUT --  
12 HERE, I'LL HOLD THAT IF YOU WANT TO LOOK AT THESE  
13 REAL QUICK AND JUST SEE IF THOSE ARE THE NINE  
14 MILLIMETER SHELL CASINGS THAT YOU COLLECTED OUT  
15 THERE AT THE SCENE?

16 A. YES, SIR, THESE WOULD BE THE NINE MILLIMETER  
17 SHELL CASINGS WHICH I COLLECTED FROM THE SCENE.  
18 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OKAY. AND THIS SHOULD BE  
19 THIRTY-NINE THROUGH FORTY-NINE, YOUR HONOR, AND AGAIN,  
20 I'M PRETTY SURE THESE HAVE ALREADY BEEN MOVED INTO  
21 EVIDENCE, BUT JUST OUT OF A - - -

22 THE COURT: NO OBJECTION FROM THE DEFENDANTS, I  
23 BELIEVE THEY'VE ALL BEEN MOVED INTO EVIDENCE, IS THAT  
24 CORRECT?

25 DEFENSE COUNSEL: YES, SIR.

1           THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU.

2           (State's Exhibits Thirty-nine through  
3           Forty-nine marked and filed.)

4           Q. ALRIGHT. AND I'LL JUST PUT THESE BACK IN THE  
5           ENVELOPE. BUT THESE ELEVEN ITEMS, THESE ELEVEN  
6           SHELL CASINGS, IF YOU WOULD, JUST KIND OF SHOW  
7           FOR THE JURY ON THE DIAGRAM WHERE THOSE ELEVEN  
8           SHELL CASINGS WERE LOCATED AT? I KNOW THEY'VE  
9           BEEN KIND OF COLOR CODED ON THERE ALSO?

10          A. YES, SIR. IN THE DIAGRAM THE NINE MILLIMETER  
11          CASINGS HAVE BEEN COLOR CODED IN GREEN TO MAKE  
12          THEM MORE VISIBLE, MAKE THEM EASIER TO SEE. ALL  
13          OF THE NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASINGS I FOUND AT  
14          THE SCENE AND COLLECTED EXCEPT FOR ONE WERE  
15          ACTUALLY LAYING -- THESE SEVEN WERE ON THE LOVE  
16          SEAT. THEY WERE APPARENTLY PLACED IN THIS  
17          POSITION AFTER THE CUSHIONS WERE LAID UP, WHEN  
18          THE CUSHIONS WERE TURNED UP IT FELL ON IT, BUT  
19          THEY WERE ALL UNDERNEATH WHAT WOULD HAVE BEEN  
20          WHERE THE CUSHIONS WERE SITTING ON THE LOVE SEAT.  
21          THERE WERE THREE NINE MILLIMETER CASINGS ON THE  
22          SOUTH END, IF YOU WILL, THIS BEING THE NORTH WALL  
23          OF THE RESIDENCE. ON THE SOUTH END OF THE LOVE  
24          SEAT, ON THIS END THERE WERE THREE THERE, AND  
25          THERE WAS A FINAL NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

505

1           BESIDE THE VICTIM'S BODY.

2           Q.    OKAY.  I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
3           SIXTEEN, I WANT YOU TO HOLD THIS, DOES THAT KIND  
4           OF DEPICT THOSE SHELL CASINGS ON THE LOVE SEAT  
5           AND THEN THE THREE OF THEM THAT ARE RIGHT BESIDE  
6           THE LOVE SEAT, THOSE MARKERS?

7           COURT REPORTER:  DID YOU SAY STATE'S SIXTEEN?

8           THE COURT:  YES, MA'AM, STATE'S SIXTEEN.

9           A.    YES, SIR.  THE YELLOW PLACARDS, THIS IS THE LOVE  
10          SEAT, THESE YELLOW PLACARDS WOULD BE THE NINE  
11          MILLIMETER CASINGS THAT WERE FOUND ON THE LOVE  
12          SEAT, AND THEN SIXTEEN, SEVENTEEN AND EIGHTEEN ON  
13          THE END OF THE LOVE SEAT, THAT'S WHERE THOSE  
14          THREE WERE FOUND.

15          Q.    OKAY.

16          A.    ALRIGHT.  AND THEN AS TO - - -

17          COURT REPORTER:  I'M SORRY, YOU BOTH HAVE OUR  
18          BACKS TO ME.

19          SOLICITOR SORENSON:  I HAVEN'T SAID ANYTHING YET.

20          COURT REPORTER:  OH, I'M SORRY.

21          Q.    AS TO STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTEEN, DOES THAT  
22          SHOW ITEM NUMBER TEN,  YOUR ITEM NUMBER TEN THAT  
23          YOU REFERENCED?

24          A.    YES, SIR, OBVIOUSLY, THE VICTIM'S BODY, AND  
25          NUMBER TEN WAS RIGHT WHERE THAT PACKARD IS RIGHT

1           THERE.

2           Q.    OKAY.  NOW, THE SECOND CALIBER SHELL CASING YOU  
3           HAD REFERENCED, LIEUTENANT CARTER, WAS A FORTY  
4           CALIBER, IS THAT CORRECT?

5           A.    YES, SIR.

6           Q.    OKAY.  I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS FIFTY  
7           THROUGH FIFTY-SEVEN, LET ME GET YOU TO LOOK AT  
8           THOSE TO SEE IF THOSE ARE THE ITEMS, THE FORTY  
9           CALIBER SHELL CASINGS YOU COLLECTED OUT THERE?

10          A.    YES, SIR, THESE WOULD BE THE FORTY CALIBER SMITH  
11          AND WESSON FORTY CALIBER CARTRIDGES I COLLECTED  
12          ON THE SCENE.

13          Q.    AND THAT WOULD BE EIGHT OF THEM THAT WERE  
14          COLLECTED, IS THAT CORRECT?

15          A.    I BELIEVE SO,  YES, SIR.

16          SOLICITOR SORENSON:  YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
17          WE'D OFFER STATE'S FIFTY THROUGH FIFTY-SEVEN.  AND AS  
18          I SAID, I THINK THEY'VE ALREADY BEEN - - -

19          THE COURT:  I BELIEVE THEY'RE IN WITHOUT  
20          OBJECTION.

21          (State's Exhibits Fifty through Fifty-seven  
22          marked and filed.)

23          SOLICITOR SORENSON:  THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.  AND  
24          YET AGAIN, THOSE, JUST KIND OF SO THE JURY CAN SEE, I  
25          MEAN, THAT'S -- THE SHELL CASING THAT YOU WERE TALKING

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

507

1 ABOUT, WHAT WOULD BE EJECTED OUT OF A SEMI-AUTOMATIC  
2 OR AN AUTOMATIC WEAPON?

3 A. YES, SIR, THAT WOULD BE THE FIRED -- ONCE THE  
4 BULLET'S FIRED THAT WOULD BE THE EMPTY CASING  
5 EJECTED FROM THE WEAPON.

6 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, AS TO THE FORTY CALIBERS, ARE  
7 THEY, THOSE EIGHT ITEMS ALSO DEPICTED ON THE  
8 DIAGRAM?

9 A. YES, SIR, THEY ARE. THEY ARE COLOR CODED IN BLUE.  
10 ALL OF THE FORTY CALIBER ROUNDS WERE IN THIS  
11 AREA, WHICH WOULD BE, TWO NEAR THE VICTIM'S BODY,  
12 HIS HEAD AREA, TWO WERE NEARER TO THE END OF THAT  
13 SAME LOVE SEAT, AND THEN THE REMAINDER OF THE  
14 FORTY CALIBER CARTRIDGES WERE FOUND IN THIS OPEN  
15 AREA BETWEEN THE VICTIM AND THE BATHROOM, AND ONE  
16 OVER HERE BY THE BEDROOM DOOR ON THE RIGHT SIDE.

17 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTEEN,  
18 SEE IF THAT DEPICTS SOME OF THEM IN THAT PICTURE  
19 THERE?

20 A. YES, SIR. IN THIS PICTURE, SEVENTEEN, YOU HAVE  
21 TWENTY-ONE, TWENTY-TWO, TWENTY-THREE AND TWENTY-  
22 FIVE. TWENTY-FOUR IS NOT A FORTY CALIBER ROUND,  
23 THE OTHER FOUR ARE FORTY CALIBER ROUNDS BETWEEN  
24 THE VICTIM AND THE, THIS WOULD BE THE BATHROOM  
25 DOOR. AND NUMBER NINETEEN IS ALSO A FORTY CALIBER

1                   ROUND WHICH WAS CLOSER TO THE END OF THE LOVE  
2                   SEAT.

3           Q.    AND I BELIEVE THIRTY-FIVE WAS ALSO, IS THAT  
4                   CORRECT? IS THAT THE ONE THAT YOU, OR IS THAT  
5                   NOT?

6           A.    YEAH, THIRTY-FIVE WAS RIGHT BY THE VICTIM'S HEAD.

7           Q.    OKAY.

8           A.    I DIDN'T SEE THAT ONE, YES, SIR.

9           Q.    AND YOU HAD TALKED ABOUT ONE OF THEM BEING, A  
10                   COUPLE OF THEM NOT BEING IN THAT PICTURE. YOUR  
11                   MARKER NUMBER TWENTY-SIX, WHAT IS THAT ITEM?

12          A.    THAT IS THE FORTY CALIBER CARTRIDGE WHICH IS BY  
13                   THE BEDROOM ON THE RIGHT, BY THE DOOR.

14          Q.    AND THAT'S DEPICTED IN STATE'S NUMBER TWENTY?

15          A.    YES, SIR.

16          Q.    AND I BELIEVE ITEM, YOUR MARKER NUMBER TWENTY WAS  
17                   NOT IN THAT OTHER PHOTOGRAPH EITHER, IS THAT  
18                   CORRECT?

19          A.    FIFTEEN. IT MIGHT HAVE BEEN TWENTY, I KNOW, - -  
20                   -

21          Q.    IT'S TWENTY?

22          A.    FIFTEEN -- I'M SORRY, TWENTY.

23          Q.    TWENTY. AND THAT'S DEPICTED AS UP AGAINST THE  
24                   DOOR OTHER?

25          A.    YES, SIR.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

509

1 Q. STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER EIGHTEEN, SO THAT WOULD  
2 ALSO BE A FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASING?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THEN I BELIEVE THE LAST CALIBER OF  
5 CASING YOU INDICATED WAS WHAT?

6 A. IT WAS SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY THIRTY-NINE  
7 MILLIMETER. THE SHELL CASINGS WOULD HAVE BEEN  
8 LEFT BEHIND BY ASSAULT RIFLES COMMONLY KNOWN AS  
9 AN SKS OR AN AK FORTY-SEVEN TYPE ASSAULT RIFLE.

10 Q. OKAY. I'M SHOWING YOU, AND I BELIEVE YOU HAD  
11 INDICATED, HOW MANY OF THEM WERE COLLECTED?

12 A. ONE, TWO -- FIVE.

13 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT - - -

14 A. I'M SORRY, I APOLOGIZE, THERE WERE -- THERE WERE  
15 FIVE, YES, SIR.

16 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS FIFTY-EIGHT  
17 THROUGH SIXTY-TWO, AND LET ME GET YOU TO TAKE A  
18 LOOK AT THOSE.

19 A. YES, SIR, THESE WERE THE CARTRIDGE CASINGS  
20 COLLECTED BY ME AT THE SCENE.

21 Q. OKAY. AND THESE, THESE ARE A LITTLE BIT BIGGER  
22 SHELL CASINGS THAN THOSE OTHERS, IS THAT CORRECT?

23 A. YES, SIR, THEY'RE STILL SHELL CASINGS BUT IT'S  
24 FOR A LARGER, MORE POWERFUL BULLET.

25 SOLICITOR SORENSON: AT THIS TIME, YOUR HONOR,

1           LIKewise, FIFTY-EIGHT THROUGH SIXTY-TWO, I BELIEVE ARE  
2           IN EVIDENCE BUT - - -

3                   THE COURT:   THEY WERE ADMITTED WITHOUT OBJECTION.  
4           (State's Exhibits Fifty-eight through Sixty-two  
5           marked and filed.)

6           Q.    ALRIGHT.  AND IF YOU WOULD, THOSE FIVE ITEMS,  
7                   KIND OF POINT OUT TO THE JURY WHERE THEY WERE  
8                   LOCATED AT?

9           A.    YES, SIR, FOUR OF THEM WERE RELATIVELY CLOSE TO  
10                  EACH OTHER, AGAIN AT THE END OF THE LOVE SEAT.  
11                  FIFTEEN, NINETEEN AND TWENTY-FOUR GOT THIS OPEN  
12                  AREA HERE.  TWENTY-SEVEN WAS ACTUALLY FOUND  
13                  BEHIND THE LOVE SEAT, A SHORT DISTANCE BACK  
14                  BEHIND THE LOVE SEAT, BETWEEN THE LOVE SEAT AND  
15                  THE WALL.

16           Q.    YOU SAID FIFTEEN AND NINETEEN, AND THEY'RE  
17                  DEPICTED AS STATE'S EIGHTEEN, IS THAT CORRECT?

18           A.    YES, SIR, YES, SIR.  AGAIN, THE LOVE SEAT'S RIGHT  
19                  HERE.  NUMBER FIFTEEN AND NUMBER NINETEEN, THAT'S  
20                  HOW I FOUND THEM IN THE HOUSE.

21           Q.    AND YOU SAID TWENTY, WHAT NUMBER WAS THAT,  
22                  TWENTY-SEVEN WAS BEHIND - - -

23                   COURT REPORTER:  I'M SORRY.

24           Q.    YOU SAID TWENTY-SEVEN WAS BEHIND THE LOVE SEAT,  
25                  IS THAT CORRECT?

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

511

1 A. YES, SIR. NUMBER TWENTY-SEVEN, I PLACED IT HERE  
2 AT THE, WHERE THE LOVE SEAT IS, THE LOVE SEAT BY  
3 THE WALL. THE SHELL CASING IS ACTUALLY A SHORT  
4 DISTANCE BEHIND THE LOVE SEAT, AND THAT WAS JUST  
5 TO INDICATE FOR ME WHERE I FOUND IT AT.

6 Q. AND I BELIEVE THE OTHER ONE WAS NUMBER TWENTY-  
7 FOUR, IS THAT CORRECT?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
10 SEVENTEEN, KIND OF ALMOST OUT IN THAT OPEN AREA?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND THEN, THE LAST, WHERE WAS THE LAST ONE, I  
13 BELIEVE, THAT'S YOUR MARKER THIRTY?

14 A. THIRTY, YES, SIR. NUMBER THIRTY WAS NEXT TO THE  
15 VICTIM'S RIGHT SIDE, NEAR HIS THIGH, THIGH AREA.

16 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER TWENTY-  
17 TWO, YOU CAN ACTUALLY SEE IT IN THE PICTURE, IS  
18 THAT CORRECT?

19 A. YES, SIR, THAT'S THE, WHERE THE SHELL CASING WAS  
20 WHEN I FOUND IT.

21 Q. NOW ADDITIONALLY -- NOW, THOSE ARE ALL THE SHELL  
22 CASINGS THAT YOU FOUND OUT THERE?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. NOW, ADDITIONALLY, DID YOU HAVE AN  
25 OPPORTUNITY TO ALSO FIND MULTIPLE EITHER BULLETS

1 OR WHAT APPEARED TO BE FRAGMENTS FROM BULLETS - -

2 -

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. --- IN THE LIVING ROOM AREA? AND WERE THOSE ITEMS  
5 COLLECTED?

6 A. OH, YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND THERE'S SOME OF THEM AT LEAST NOTED ON THE, I  
8 GUESS, THE YELLOW MARKERS?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. JUST SO YOU CAN IDENTIFY THEM HERE, I SHOW YOU  
11 WHAT'S BEEN MARKED AS STATE'S EXHIBIT, I BELIEVE  
12 WE HAVE SIXTY-THREE THROUGH SEVENTY-TWO. I WANT  
13 YOU TO LOOK IN STATE'S SIXTY-THREE.

14 A. YES, SIR, THESE WERE SOME OF THE BULLET FRAGMENTS  
15 I COLLECTED FROM THE SCENE.

16 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU, THE ONES THAT ARE IN  
17 STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SIXTY-THREE, WERE THESE  
18 FRAGMENTS HERE SENT OUT TO THE STATE LAW  
19 ENFORCEMENT DIVISION FOR ANY ADDITIONAL ANALYSIS  
20 ON THIS STACK RIGHT HERE?

21 A. NO, SIR, THEY WERE NOT.

22 Q. OKAY. AND WHY, TELL THE JURY WHY THESE WERE NOT  
23 SENT OUT?

24 A. BASED ON MY EXPERIENCE, WHAT I'LL DO IS EXAMINE  
25 EVIDENCE TO SEE IF, IN MY OPINION, IT'S POSSIBLE

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

513

1 FOR ADDITIONAL ANALYSIS TO BE DONE, WHETHER IT BE  
2 FINGERPRINTS OR DNA OR BULLET FRAGMENTS. IN THIS  
3 CASE THESE PARTICULAR ITEMS WERE EITHER VERY  
4 SMALL FRAGMENTS OR PIECES THAT WERE DAMAGED SO  
5 SEVERELY FROM THE IMPACT AFTER THEY WERE FIRED,  
6 IN MY OPINION I DIDN'T BELIEVE THEY WOULD BE ANY  
7 USE FOR ANY FURTHER ANALYTICAL ANALYSIS.

8 Q. OKAY. SO YOU JUST COLLECTED THEM AND THEY ARE  
9 OBVIOUSLY PRESERVED HERE FOR US TODAY, RIGHT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. ALRIGHT. AND NOW, ADDITIONALLY, LET ME SHOW YOU  
12 STATE'S EXHIBITS SIXTY-FOUR THROUGH SEVENTY-TWO  
13 AND LET YOU LOOK AT THOSE.

14 A. YES, SIR, I COLLECTED THESE BULLET FRAGMENTS FROM  
15 THE SCENE.

16 Q. LET ME JUST ASK YOU, ON THE LITTLE KIND OF COIN  
17 ENVELOPE INSIDE YOU DOCUMENT YOUR, I GUESS IN  
18 BLACK PEN, YOUR MARKER NUMBER?

19 A. YES, SIR, THAT WOULD BE THE, HOW I IDENTIFY EACH  
20 PIECE.

21 Q. AND YOU ALSO INDICATED ON THE COIN ENVELOPE WHERE  
22 YOU COLLECTED THOSE ITEMS FROM?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 SOLICITOR SORENSON: JUST TO BE CERTAIN, I WOULD  
25 MOVE STATE'S SIXTY-THREE THROUGH SEVENTY-TWO ALSO.

1           THE COURT: INTO EVIDENCE WITHOUT OBJECTION.

2           COURT REPORTER: WAIT, LET ME - - -

3           THE COURT: SIXTY-THREE THROUGH SEVENTY-TWO, YES,  
4 MA'AM, I THINK THEY'VE ALREADY BEEN MARKED.

5 (State's Exhibits Sixty-three through Seventy-two  
6 marked and filed.)

7 Q. AND LET ME KIND OF BACK YOU UP A LITTLE BIT.

8 NOW, SOME OF THOSE ITEMS WERE FOUND OBVIOUSLY OUT  
9 -- AND THEY'RE DEPICTED AS THE YELLOW MARKERS,  
10 KIND OF OUT IN THE LIVING ROOM AREA, IS THAT  
11 CORRECT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, YOU HAD INDICATED EARLIER THAT  
14 AFTER YOU HAD KIND OF REMOVED, COLLECTED ITEMS SO  
15 THEY WOULDN'T BE DISTURBED, THAT MR. PRINGLE --  
16 THE CORNER THEN REMOVED HIS BODY FROM THE SCENE,  
17 IS THAT CORRECT?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY AFTER MR. PRINGLE WAS  
20 REMOVED FROM THE SCENE THEN TO DISCOVER ANY OTHER  
21 ITEMS OF EVIDENCE OUT THERE AFTER HE WAS REMOVED?

22 A. YES, SIR. ONCE THE BODY WAS REMOVED BY THE  
23 CORNER IT BECAME VERY APPARENT AND VISIBLE THAT  
24 THERE WAS ADDITIONAL EVIDENCE UNDERNEATH THE  
25 BODY.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

515

1 Q. AND WOULD YOU DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHAT YOU MEAN  
2 BY THAT?

3 COURT REPORTER: AND WHAT?

4 Q. I'M SORRY. DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY.

5 COURT REPORTER: HAVE YOU FINISHED WITH EXAMINING  
6 HIM BEFORE THE JURY?

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, MA'AM.

8 COURT REPORTER: ALRIGHT. GO AHEAD, BUT JUST  
9 KEEP YOUR VOICE UP, PLEASE.

10 A. I'LL TRY TO TALK A LITTLE LOUDER.

11 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

12 A. ONCE THE BODY WAS REMOVED BY THE CORONER THE  
13 CARPET WAS EXPOSED WHERE HIS BODY HAD LAID, AND  
14 THERE WERE BULLET FRAGMENTS LAYING ON TOP OF THE  
15 CARPET. THERE WERE SEVERAL. ALSO, THERE WAS  
16 DAMAGE TO THE CARPET. WE ALSO HAD SOME OF THAT  
17 DAMAGE VISIBLE ON THE, BASICALLY, THE EDGES OF  
18 THE VICTIM'S BODY, ON THE LEFT SIDE WHERE THE  
19 CARPET WAS FRAYED.

20 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER TWENTY-  
21 THREE, DOES THAT SHOW THAT AREA OF CARPET  
22 UNDERNEATH WHERE MR. PRINGLE HAD BEEN?

23 A. YES, SIR, THIS IS THE AREA OF THE UPPER BODY, MR.  
24 PRINGLE HAD COVERED THIS AREA HERE UP. EACH OF  
25 THE PLACARDS IS IDENTIFYING A BULLET OR BULLET

1 FRAGMENT THAT WAS UNDERNEATH HIS BODY.

2 Q. ALRIGHT. AND OBVIOUSLY, THOSE WERE COLLECTED  
3 AND THEY'RE IN THAT ENVELOPE THAT WE JUST LOOKED  
4 AT?

5 A. YES, SIR, THEY ARE.

6 Q. OKAY. NOW, DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY DUE TO  
7 THE DAMAGE TO THE CARPET THERE TO DO ANYTHING  
8 ELSE WITH REGARDS TO THAT CARPET THAT WAS  
9 UNDERNEATH MR. PRINGLE?

10 A. YES, SIR, I DID. BASED ON THE DAMAGE TO THE  
11 CARPET ITSELF LED ME TO BELIEVE THERE WOULD BE  
12 ADDITIONAL EVIDENCE UNDER THE CARPET. SO, ONCE  
13 THE EVIDENCE VISIBLE ON TOP WAS DOCUMENTED AND  
14 COLLECTED, I DO WHAT WE CALL A CUTTING, I CUT OUT  
15 THAT SECTION OF CARPET TO SEE WHAT WAS UNDERNEATH  
16 IT.

17 Q. OKAY. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
18 TWENTY-SIX WITH A MARKER FORTY-FIVE. WHAT IS  
19 MARKER FORTY-FIVE?

20 A. FORTY-FIVE IS ACTUALLY THE PIECE OF CARPET THAT I  
21 CUT OUT. AND WHAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT HERE IS THE  
22 BACK OF THE CARPET WHICH INDICATES THE DAMAGE WAS  
23 NOT JUST ON TOP BUT IT WENT ALL THE WAY THROUGH,  
24 ALL THE WAY THROUGH THE CARPET TO THE FLOOR.

25 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN YOU REMOVED THAT PIECE OF CARPER,

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

517

1            THAT MARKER FORTY-FIVE, FROM THE FLOOR, DID YOU  
2            FIND ANY ITEMS UNDERNEATH THAT CARPET?

3            A.    YES, SIR, I DID, ADDITIONAL BULLET FRAGMENTS WERE  
4            UNDERNEATH THE CARPET.

5            Q.    I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS TWENTY-FOUR AND  
6            TWENTY-FIVE, WHAT ARE DEPICTED IN THOSE ITEMS?

7            A.    FORTY-FOUR IS A SMALL PIECE OF A BULLET FRAGMENT  
8            WHICH WAS FOUND UNDERNEATH THE CARPET FROM  
9            UNDERNEATH WHERE MR. PRINGLE'S BODY HAD LAID.  
10           FORTY-THREE IS OBVIOUSLY A LARGER, MORE COMPLETE  
11           FRAGMENT OF A BULLET, AND A SMALLER FRAGMENT OF A  
12           BULLET, AGAIN, THAT WAS FOUND UNDERNEATH THE  
13           CARPET ONCE I CUT IT.

14           Q.    AND THOSE TWO ITEMS THAT YOU JUST SHOWED HERE AT  
15           MARKERS FORTY-THREE AND FORTY-FOUR, AND THOSE  
16           ITEMS WERE COLLECTED?

17           A.    YES, SIR, THEY WERE.

18           Q.    I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS SIXTY-NINE AND  
19           SEVENTY, ARE THOSE THOSE ITEMS?

20           A.    YES, SIR, THESE WOULD BE THE FRAGMENTS THAT WERE  
21           COLLECTED FROM UNDERNEATH THE CARPET.

22           Q.    AND THAT'S STATE'S SIXTY-NINE AND SEVENTY, IS  
23           THAT CORRECT?

24           A.    YES, SIR.

25           Q.    ALRIGHT. AND WHAT, IN YOUR EXPERIENCE AS A CRIME

1 SCENE INVESTIGATOR, LIEUTENANT, WHAT, YOU KNOW,  
2 THE LOCATION OF THOSE ITEMS AND THE EVIDENCE YOU  
3 FOUND, WHAT WOULD THAT SUGGEST TO YOU IN YOUR  
4 EXPERIENCE?

5 A. BASED ON MY EXPERIENCE, RECONSTRUCTING SHOOTING  
6 SCENES, MOST OF THE SHOTS FIRED WHICH HIT THE  
7 VICTIM WERE FIRED AFTER HE WAS ALREADY ON THE  
8 FLOOR. THIS IS BASED ON THE EVIDENCE, FRAGMENTS  
9 AND THE DAMAGE TO THE CARPET, THE IMPACTS TO THE  
10 HARD SUB-FLOOR UNDERNEATH, OTHER FRAYED, WHAT IN  
11 OPINION A BULLET IMPACTS TO THE CARPET ALONG THE  
12 LEFT SIDE OF THE BODY, THESE WERE CAUSED BY  
13 BULLETS BEING FIRED DOWNWARD AT THE FLOOR, AND  
14 THE ITEMS WE DISCOVERED ONCE I MADE THIS CARPET  
15 CUTTING APPEARED TO BE THE BULLETS THAT STRUCK  
16 MR. PRINGLE AFTER HE WAS ALREADY LAYING ON THE  
17 FLOOR. THE OTHER THING OF NOTE, USUALLY WHEN  
18 YOU HAVE THIS MANY SHOTS FIRED INSIDE A HOUSE,  
19 YOU HAVE, YOU KNOW, BULLET IMPACTS IN WALLS,  
20 CEILING, ALL OVER THE ROOM. I SEARCHED THE ROOM,  
21 THERE WERE NO IMPACTS FOUND BY ME ANYWHERE BUT  
22 THE FLOOR AND MR. PRINGLE.

23 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER TWENTY-  
24 SEVEN, WHAT IS IN TWENTY-SEVEN?

25 A. TWENTY-SEVEN IS ACTUALLY THE FLAT SCREEN T.V. I

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

519

1 ACTUALLY DESCRIBED EARLIER. IT'S SITTING ON THE  
2 T.V. STAND RIGHT NEXT TO MR. PRINGLE. IT HAS  
3 DAMAGE TO THE SCREEN WHICH WERE POSSIBLY  
4 RICOCHETS OF FRAGMENTS. THEY WEREN'T ROUND  
5 HOLES. THERE WAS DAMAGE, IT WAS CRACK, THE SCREEN  
6 WAS CRACKED AND HAD SOME INDENTATIONS WHICH MAY  
7 HAVE POSSIBLE BEEN FRAGMENTS THAT CAME UP AND HIT  
8 THE T.V.

9 Q. OKAY. I BELIEVE YOU CAN HAVE A SEAT, LIEUTENANT,  
10 THANK YOU. NOW, LIEUTENANT, YOU HAD INDICATED  
11 MR. PRINGLE WAS REMOVED FROM THE SCENE BY THE  
12 CORNER'S OFFICE, IS THAT CORRECT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. AND THAT FOLLOWING MORNING, THAT FOLLOWING  
15 SATURDAY MORNING DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO  
16 ATTEND AN AUTOPSY THAT WAS PERFORMED ON MR.  
17 PRINGLE?

18 A. YES, SIR, I DID.

19 Q. AND WHERE WAS THAT PERFORMED AT?

20 A. THAT WOULD BE AT NEWBERRY PATHOLOGY IN THE  
21 NEWBERRY HOSPITAL.

22 Q. AND WAS THAT DR. ROSS THAT PERFORMED THAT?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. AND AT THE AUTOPSY WERE THERE ANY ITEMS OF  
25 EVIDENTIARY VALUE THAT WERE TURNED OVER TO YOU BY

1 THE PATHOLOGIST?

2 A. YES, SIR. ALL OF THE EVIDENCE GATHERED AT THE  
3 AUTOPSY IN A HOMICIDE IS TRANSPORTED BY THE  
4 INVESTIGATING OFFICER EITHER DURING WEEK DAYS  
5 MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY, I WOULD HAVE TRANSPORTED  
6 THESE TO SLED, BUT BECAUSE IT WAS THE WEEKEND I  
7 HAD TO PUT THEM INTO OUR EVIDENCE STORAGE UNTIL  
8 THE FOLLOWING WEEK WHEN I COULD GET THEM TO SLED.

9 Q. OKAY.

10 A. BUT, YES, SIR, ITEMS WERE COLLECTED.

11 Q. OKAY. AND THOSE ITEMS, DID YOU RECEIVE SEVERAL  
12 BOTTLES WITH POTENTIAL BULLETS OR FRAGMENTS AND  
13 STUFF OF THAT NATURE?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU OPEN THEM OR ANYTHING?

16 A. NO, SIR, I WOULD NOT HAVE OPENED THEM.

17 Q. OKAY. AND WERE THOSE ULTIMATELY TRANSPORTED OUT  
18 TO SLED FOR COMPARISON OUT THERE BY THE FIREARMS  
19 EXPERT?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. ADDITIONALLY, WHEN YOU ARRIVED ON THE SCENE, AS  
22 FAR AS MR. PRINGLE, AS IS SHOWN IN STATE'S  
23 EXHIBIT NUMBER EIGHT, THE DUCT TAPE THAT'S ON HIS  
24 HEAD, WAS THAT THE CONDITION IT WAS IN WHEN YOU  
25 GOT THERE?

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

521

- 1 A. YES, SIR, THAT'S THE CONDITION I FOUND IT IN ON  
2 THE SCENE.
- 3 Q. OKAY. AND WAS THAT DUCT TAPE REMOVED FROM MR.  
4 PRINGLE'S HEAD?
- 5 A. IT WAS REMOVED BY THE PATHOLOGIST AT AUTOPSY.
- 6 Q. OKAY. AND WAS THAT TURNED OVER TO ALSO BE  
7 TRANSPORTED OUT TO SLED FOR FURTHER ANALYSIS?
- 8 A. YES, SIR, IT WAS TURNED OVER TO ME AND THEN AT A  
9 LATER DATE TRANSPORTED TO SLED.
- 10 Q. ALRIGHT. I KIND OF TOUCHED ON SOME OF THIS, BUT  
11 AS FAR AS THE SHELL CASINGS, THE NINE MILLIMETER  
12 SHELL CASINGS, THE FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASINGS,  
13 THE SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY THIRTY-NINE RIFLE  
14 CASINGS, WERE THOSE ITEMS ALL TRANSPORTED OUT TO  
15 STATE LAW ENFORCEMENT DIVISION FOR FURTHER  
16 ANALYSIS?
- 17 A. ALL EXCEPT FOR, WAS IT STATE'S EXHIBIT SIXTY-  
18 THREE?
- 19 Q. YES, SIR.
- 20 A. ALL EXCEPT FOR STATE'S EXHIBIT SIXTY-THREE WAS  
21 TRANSPORTED TO SLED.
- 22 Q. SO, ALL THE NINE MILLIMETER CASINGS WENT OUT  
23 THERE?
- 24 A. YES, SIR.
- 25 Q. ALL OF THE SEVEN POINT SIX TWO MILLIMETER RIFLE

1 CASINGS?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. THE FORTY CALIBER CASINGS?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. AND ALL OF THE OTHER BULLETS AND FRAGMENTS EXCEPT  
6 FOR THE ONES THAT YOU HAD TESTIFIED ABOUT?

7 A. OTHER -- YES, SIR.

8 Q. ALL WENT OUT THERE?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. AND AS YOU TESTIFIED, THE DUCT TAPE FROM THE  
11 VICTIM'S HEAD AND ALSO THE PROJECTILES COLLECTED  
12 FROM THE AUTOPSY ALSO WERE SENT OUT THERE?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. NOW, STATE'S EXHIBIT -- NOT STATE'S EXHIBIT, BUT  
15 YOUR MARKER NUMBER ONE, STATE'S EXHIBIT THIRTY-  
16 EIGHT, THE DUCT TAPE THAT YOU FOUND AT THE SCENE,

17 - - -

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. DID YOU, WHEN YOU GOT BACK TO THE OFFICE, PERFORM  
20 ANY TESTING ON THAT ROLL OF DUCT TAPE THAT YOU  
21 FOUND OUT THERE?

22 A. YES, SIR, I DID. I EXAMINED THE FLAT PORTION  
23 THAT WAS PULLED FROM THE ROLL AND THE ROLL ITSELF  
24 FOR LATENT FINGERPRINTS. THE END OF THE TAPE WAS  
25 WADDED UP IS THE BEST WAY TO DESCRIBE IT. I

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

523

1 SWABBED THE END OF THE TAPE THAT WAS WADDED UP  
2 FOR DNA, WHICH THE Q-TIPS USED TO COLLECT THE  
3 SWABS THEN WOULD BE TRANSPORTED TO SLED FOR DNA  
4 ANALYSIS.

5 Q. OKAY. AND AS TO YOUR PROCESSING THE ACTUAL ROLL  
6 ITSELF AS OPPOSED AS TO KIND OF THE PART THAT WAS  
7 STICKING OUT WADDED UP, WERE YOU ABLE TO GET ANY  
8 USABLE FINGERPRINTS OFF OF THAT ROLL OF DUCT  
9 TAPE?

10 A. NO, SIR, THERE WERE NO IDENTIFIABLE FINGERPRINTS  
11 ON THE DUCT TAPE.

12 Q. EXPLAIN WHAT YOU MEAN BY IDENTIFIABLE?

13 A. TO BE IDENTIFIABLE YOU HAVE TO BE ABLE TO COLLECT  
14 ENOUGH RIDGES, LAY PEOPLE CALL THEM LINES, FROM  
15 THE FINGERS. I WAS ONLY ABLE TO DEVELOP ONE OR  
16 TWO RIDGES WHICH IS COMPLETELY USELESS FOR  
17 IDENTIFICATION OF ANY TYPE. SO THE, WHAT WAS  
18 DEVELOPED ON THE TAPE WAS NOT IDENTIFIABLE.

19 Q. ALRIGHT. AND ALSO YOU INDICATED THAT YOU HAD  
20 SWABBED KIND OF THAT END OF THE DUCT TAPE, IS  
21 THAT CORRECT?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. BUT, AND THAT WAS SENT OFF TO SLED TO SEE IF THEY  
24 COULD GET DNA OFF OF THAT?

25 A. YES, SIR.

1 Q. AND ARE YOU AWARE OF WHETHER THEY WERE ABLE TO  
2 DEVELOP ANY DNA OFF OF THAT, THOSE SWABS THAT YOU  
3 TOOK?

4 A. NO, SIR, THE REPORT I RECEIVED BACK FROM THE LAB  
5 WAS, NO, SIR, THEY COULD NOT DEVELOP A PROFILE  
6 FROM THE DNA.

7 Q. AND THEN YOU HAVE INDICATE ALSO THAT THE DUCT  
8 TAPE THAT WAS AROUND MR. PRINGLE'S HEAD THAT WAS  
9 COLLECTED ALSO WAS SENT OUT TO SLED?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. WHY WAS IT SENT OUT TO SLED?

12 A. IT WAS A, BECAUSE IT WAS COLLECTED AT AUTOPSY AND  
13 NOT THE SCENE, PER SE, I WANTED IT TO GO WITH THE  
14 REST OF THE EVIDENCE FROM AUTOPSY, SO I ALLOWED  
15 SLED TO, I SENT THAT TO THEM TO PROCESS.

16 Q. OKAY. AND ARE YOU AWARE OF WHETHER, WERE THEY  
17 ABLE TO GET ANY USABLE PRINTS OFF OF THAT, THAT  
18 DUCT TAPE THAT WAS TAKEN OFF OF MR. PRINGLE?

19 A. NO, SIR, THE REPORT FROM SLED WAS A NEGATIVE  
20 RESULT FOR FINGERPRINTS.

21 Q. I THINK I'M JUST ABOUT DONE, LIEUTENANT. TWO  
22 OTHER ITEMS TO SHOW YOU, STATE'S EXHIBITS  
23 SEVENTY-THREE, AND I BELIEVE IT'S SEVENTY-FOUR,  
24 LET ME SHOW YOU THOSE ITEMS.

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

525

- 1 Q. WERE THOSE ITEMS TURNED INTO YOU FROM LIEUTENANT  
2 SHUMPERT?
- 3 A. YES, SIR.
- 4 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY, OR WHAT  
5 DID YOU DO WITH THOSE STATE'S EXHIBITS SEVENTY-  
6 THREE AND SEVENTY-FOUR?
- 7 A. I PUT THEM IN -- I WAS THE ONE THAT PLACED THEM  
8 IN THESE BOXES, AND I TIED THEM UP IN THE BOX SO  
9 THEY WERE SUSPENDED OR HANGING, AND I SENT THEM  
10 TO SLED FOR, I BELIEVE LATENT PRINT FIREARMS  
11 COMPARISON.
- 12 Q. ALRIGHT. AND AS TO -- ARE YOU AWARE OF WHETHER  
13 THEY WERE ABLE TO GET ANY LATENT PRINTS OFF OF  
14 THE MAGAZINE OR THE GUN?
- 15 A. I'M UNAWARE OF ANY. I HAVEN'T SEEN A REPORT ON  
16 THAT.
- 17 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S  
18 EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY-THREE, CAN YOU TELL THE  
19 JURY WHAT STATE'S SEVENTY-THREE IS?
- 20 A. STATE'S SEVENTY-THREE IS AN AUTO LOADER ON WHAT  
21 WE CALL A SEMI-AUTO PISTOL. IT'S MANUFACTURED BY  
22 THE RUGER CORPORATION, AND -- LET ME SEE WHAT IT  
23 SAYS ON HERE. AND IT WOULD BE A FORTY CALIBER  
24 WEAPON.
- 25 Q. SO, IT WOULD BE AT LEAST THE SAME CALIBER AS

1 EIGHT OF THE SHELL CASINGS YOU RECOVERED AT THE  
2 CRIME SCENE?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. ALRIGHT. AND STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-FOUR?

5 A. STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-FOUR WOULD BE THE  
6 MAGAZINE OR COMMONLY CALLED A CLIP, BUT IT'S A  
7 MAGAZINE THAT WOULD HOLD THE BULLETS FOR THAT  
8 TYPE WEAPON, FOR THE RUGER AUTOMATIC WEAPON.

9 Q. AND I BELIEVE, AND THOSE ITEMS I BELIEVE WERE  
10 SENT OUT TO SLED ON MARCH EIGHTEENTH, IS THAT  
11 CORRECT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. AND ANY FURTHER ANALYSIS, THEN, AS FAR AS  
14 COMPARING THAT GUN TO ANY OF THE EVIDENCE FOUND  
15 AT THAT SCENE WOULD HAVE BEEN DONE BY A FIREARMS  
16 EXPERT AT SLED?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, I BELIEVE  
19 SEVENTY-THREE AND SEVENTY-FOUR I'D OFFER INTO  
20 EVIDENCE. I BELIEVE THEY'RE ALREADY IN ALSO, BUT JUST

21 - - -

22 THE COURT: NO OBJECTION?

23 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

24 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

25 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

527

1           MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

2           MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

3           THE COURT: OKAY, WITHOUT OBJECTION, THEY'RE IN  
4 EVIDENCE.

5           (State's Exhibits Seventy-three and Seventy-four  
6 marked and filed.)

7           SOLICITOR SORENSON: I BEG THE COURT'S  
8 INDULGENCE.

9           THE COURT: YES, SIR.

10          SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, LIEUTENANT,  
11 PLEASE ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT DEFENSE COUNSEL HAS.

12          THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY.

13          (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
14 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
15 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
16 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
17 sequential continuation of record.)

1

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF GERALD DAVID CARTER

2

BY MR. LACKEY:

3

Q. GOOD MORNING.

4

A. GOOD MORNING.

5

Q. I ONLY HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS FOR YOU. YOU SAID

6

THAT YOU WERE UNABLE TO COLLECT ANY FINGERPRINTS

7

THAT DEVELOPED ANY SUSPECT, IS THAT CORRECT?

8

A. YES, SIR, I DIDN'T COLLECT ANY FINGERPRINTS IN

9

THIS CASE.

10

Q. OKAY. AND IT'S ALSO YOUR TESTIMONY THE SAME AS

11

TO DNA?

12

A. YES, SIR. I DIDN'T COLLECT ANY DNA EVIDENCE THAT

13

I KNOW OF THAT CAME BACK FROM SLED.

14

Q. AS TO THE CASINGS WERE YOU ABLE TO DETERMINE FROM

15

YOUR ANALYSIS HOW MANY WEAPONS WERE USED?

16

A. FROM MY ANALYSIS, IF YOU WILL, FROM THE SCENE,

17

AND I COULD ONLY GO BY THE SHELL CASINGS, I MEAN,

18

I'M NOT A FIREARMS EXPERT, THERE WERE AT LEAST

19

THREE WEAPONS AT THE SCENE DUE TO THE FACT WE

20

COLLECTED THREE DIFFERENT CALIBER SHELL CASINGS

21

FROM THE SCENE.

22

Q. OKAY. THAT WAS THE NINE MILLIMETER, THE FORTY

23

CALIBER AND THE -- WHAT WAS THE THIRD?

24

A. SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY THIRTY-NINE MILLIMETER.

25

Q. OKAY. SO, THOSE WERE THE THREE TYPES OF CASINGS

1 YOU COLLECTED?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, WHEN YOU GO TO A CRIME SCENE  
4 LIKE THIS AND GO THROUGH ALL THIS, I MEAN, YOU  
5 HAD A MOUNTAIN OF STUFF TO COLLECT, YOU DO A  
6 DETAILED REPORT?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. AND YOU COVER EVERY TIDBIT OF WHAT YOU COLLECTED  
9 AND HOW YOU COLLECTED IT?

10 A. YES, SIR, I MAKE EVERY EFFORT TO DESCRIBE AND  
11 DOCUMENT THE SCENE AND DESCRIBE WHAT WAS  
12 COLLECTED AND WHERE IT WAS COLLECTED FROM.

13 Q. AND IF, YOU KNOW, LET'S SAY, A FEW DAYS LATER  
14 EVIDENCE IS FOUND YOU WOULD DO A SUPPLEMENTAL  
15 REPORT AND PUT THAT IN THERE?

16 A. IF I'M INVOLVED WITH THE ACTUAL FINDING THE  
17 EVIDENCE OR COLLECTING THE EVIDENCE I WOULD DO A  
18 BASIC CONTINUATION OF MY REPORT.

19 Q. OKAY. BUT YOU WANT TO MAKE SURE, AND I GUESS  
20 THAT EVERY INVESTIGATION, OR EVERY INVESTIGATOR  
21 WOULD MAKE SURE THEY WOULD WANT TO DOCUMENT  
22 EVERYTHING IN A REPORT?

23 A. YES, SIR, YOU MAKE EVERY EFFORT TO DOCUMENT AS  
24 MUCH AS YOU CAN.

25 Q. OKAY. AND IF YOU, LET'S SAY, YOU LOOK BACK ON

1 THE REPORT AND YOU FOUND AN ERROR, YOU KNOW,  
2 THREE WEEKS DOWN THE ROAD, WOULD YOU -- HOW WOULD  
3 YOU CORRECT THAT?

4 A. I WOULD ACTUALLY DENOTE THE ERROR AND THEN  
5 CORRECT IT. I WOULDN'T JUST CHANGE THE REPORT  
6 BECAUSE IF IT'S ALREADY BEEN ISSUED I WOULDN'T  
7 WANT TO CAUSE ANY CONFUSION WITH TWO DIFFERENT  
8 REPORTS. SO, IF I DID FIND AN ERROR OF SOME SORT  
9 ON MY PART I WOULD DENOTE THE ERROR AND THEN  
10 MAKE THE CORRECT IN A SUPPLEMENTAL OR  
11 CONTINUATION.

12 Q. SO, YOU WOULD MAKE A SEPARATE REPORT AND REFER  
13 BACK TO THE FIRST AND SAY BASICALLY, OOPS?

14 A. RIGHT. IF I MADE SOME TYPE OF ERROR I WOULD  
15 POINT OUT, YEAH, I MADE AN ERROR.

16 Q. IS THAT PRETTY STANDARD OPERATING PROCEDURE?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 MR. LACKEY: I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

19 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. LACKEY.

20 MS. ULLMAN.

21 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
22 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
23 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
24 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
25 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY MS. ULLMAN

531

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF GERALD DAVID CARTER

BY MS. ULLMAN:

1 Q. GOOD MORNING.

2 A. GOOD MORNING.

3 Q. I JUST HAVE A COUPLE OF QUICK QUESTIONS.

4 A. THAT'S FINE.

5 Q. WHEN YOU FIRST ARRIVED YOU SAID THAT IT WAS DIMLY  
6 LIT WITH A BLACK LIGHT?

7 A. YES, MA'AM, THERE WAS, IT WAS A BLACK LIGHT IN  
8 THE OVERHEAD FIXTURE IN THE LIVING ROOM.

9 Q. WAS THAT THE ONLY LIGHT THAT THEY HAD THAT YOU  
10 NOTICED?

11 A. THAT WAS THE ONLY ONE THAT I NOTICED BEING ON.  
12 I'M PRETTY SURE THAT WAS THE ONLY ONE ON WHEN I  
13 WENT IN. THE OTHER ROOMS, NOW, HAD REGULAR LIGHT  
14 BULBS IN THEM, BUT THEY JUST WEREN'T TURNED ON  
15 WHEN I ENTERED.

16 Q. YES, SIR. DO YOU REMEMBER IF IT WAS ONE BULB,  
17 TWO BULBS, FIVE BULBS?

18 A. HONESTLY, I DON'T REMEMBER.

19 Q. NOW, YOU SAID THAT ANOTHER OFFICER ACTUALLY  
20 CHANGED THAT BULB OUT AND PUT A WHITE BULB IN SO  
21 YOU COULD SEE BETTER?

22 A. YES, MA'AM.

23 Q. AND THAT'S WHEN YOU TOOK THE PICTURES AND  
24  
25

1 COLLECTED EVIDENCE AND ALL OF THAT?

2 A. YES, MA'AM.

3 Q. THE SOLICITOR WENT THROUGH SOME OF THE DRUGS YOU  
4 FOUND AT THE SCENE. YOU SAID YOU FOUND MARIJUANA  
5 PRETTY MUCH ALL IN THE KITCHEN?

6 A. IN THE CABINETS DIRECTLY ABOVE THE STOVE, TO THE  
7 RIGHT OF THE STOVE, AND ON THE MICROWAVE OVEN.

8 Q. YOU ALSO FOUND SOME MONEY NEAR THAT MARIJUANA,  
9 DIDN'T YOU?

10 A. YES, THERE WAS A HUNDRED DOLLARS IN TWENTY DOLLAR  
11 BILLS.

12 Q. AND YOU ALSO FOUND SCALES, ELECTRONIC SCALES  
13 USUALLY USED TO WEIGH DRUGS?

14 A. I CAN ONLY SPECULATE WHAT HE USED THEM FOR, BUT  
15 YES, THERE WAS A SMALL SET OF ELECTRONIC SCALES  
16 ON THE KITCHEN TABLE.

17 Q. IN YOUR EXPERIENCE, THEY'RE USUALLY USED FOR  
18 DRUGS, THOUGH, AM I CORRECT?

19 A. QUITE OFTEN.

20 Q. IT CERTAINLY WASN'T A KITCHEN SCALE THAT YOU'RE  
21 PUTTING FOOD ON?

22 A. NO, IT WAS A SMALL FLAT ELECTRONIC SCALE THAT  
23 QUITE OFTEN IS USED TO WEIGH OUT DRUGS.

24 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S TWENTY-SEVEN.

25 A. YES, MA'AM.

1 Q. YOU SAID THAT'S THE T.V. THAT WAS THE ROOM CLOSE  
2 TO WHERE THE BODY WAS FOUND?

3 A. IT WAS RIGHT NEXT TO THE RIGHT SIDE OF MR.  
4 PRINGLE.

5 Q. AND I BELIEVE YOU TESTIFIED THAT IT WAS ON SOME  
6 SORT OF STAND, CORRECT?

7 A. YES, MA'AM.

8 Q. IT CERTAINLY WASN'T ON THE FLOOR?

9 A. NO, NO, IT WAS NOT ON THE FLOOR.

10 Q. OKAY. TALKING ABOUT THE LIVING ROOM, JUST THE  
11 SIZE OF IT, ACCORDING TO YOUR CHART, NOT  
12 INCLUDING -- I'M GOING TO STAND OVER HERE, BUT  
13 NOT INCLUDING THE KITCHEN AREA AT ALL, JUST  
14 ACCORDING TO YOUR CHART, FROM THE DOOR TO KIND OF  
15 THE BREAK OFF POINT IS FIFTEEN FEET FOUR INCHES?

16 A. YES, MA'AM.

17 Q. OKAY. AND THEN THIS WAY IS HOW BIG?

18 A. FROM THE NORTH WALL, THE FRONT OF THE APARTMENT,  
19 ONTO THE PETITION AGAIN WOULD BE THE SAME  
20 DISTANCE, APPROXIMATELY FIFTEEN FEET FOUR INCHES.  
21 AND THERE'S A STEP WHICH APPARENTLY I NEGLECTED  
22 TO MEASURE, BUT THERE'S A STEP WHICH LEADS TO THE  
23 BATHROOM, IT WOULD BE THIS AREA HERE, PROBABLY,  
24 POSSIBLY THREE MORE FEET OR SOMETHING OF THAT  
25 NATURE.

1 Q. AND HOW BIG THIS WAY?

2 A. THIS WAY IT'S GOING TO BE FOURTEEN FEET SIX  
3 INCHES.

4 Q. SO, THE AREA IS BASICALLY FOURTEEN BY FIFTEEN  
5 FEET?

6 A. YEAH, POSSIBLY.

7 Q. GIVE OR TAKE A FEW INCHES?

8 A. YES, MA'AM.

9 MS. ULLMAN: I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

10 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MA'AM.

11 MR. PALMER.

12 MR. PALMER: NO QUESTIONS.

13 THE COURT: THANK YOU.

14 MR. MELLARD.

15 MR. MELLARD: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

16 THE COURT: MR. KOGER.

17 MR. KOGER: A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS.

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

19 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
20 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
21 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
22 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
23 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY MR. KOGER

535

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF GERALD DAVID CARTER

BY MR. KOGER:

1  
2  
3 Q. INVESTIGATOR CARTER, YOU SAY THAT THE CRIME SCENE  
4 TEAM PRIMARILY EMPHASIZED THE LIVING ROOM AREA?

5 A. THAT WAS THE PRIMARY AREA OF EVIDENCE COLLECTION,  
6 YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. SO YOU PRIMARY DUSTED FOR PRINTS IN THE  
8 LIVING ROOM AREA?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. NOW, I THINK YOU TESTIFIED, TOO, THAT YOU  
11 DUSTED, YOU DUSTED FOR PRINTS ON THE DOOR?

12 A. YES, THE DOOR AND DOOR KNOB, YES, SIR.

13 Q. THE DOOR AND DOOR KNOB?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. DID YOU DUST FOR PRINTS ON THE DOOR JAM, AROUND  
16 THE DOOR, THE FRAME?

17 A. THE DOOR ITSELF, ON THE FRAME AROUND THE DOOR,  
18 NO, SIR, I DON'T BELIEVE I DID.

19 Q. OKAY. AND YOU DIDN'T DUST FOR PRINTS ON EITHER  
20 THE INSIDE OR OUTSIDE OF THE DOOR FRAME?

21 A. NOT ON THE DOOR FRAME.

22 Q. OKAY. AS FAR AS IN THE LIVING ROOM THERE WAS A  
23 COUPLE OF OTHER ITEMS THAT WAS IN THE LIVING  
24 ROOM. YOU MENTIONED THAT IT WAS A COFFEE TABLE.  
25 DID YOU DUST FOR PRINTS ON THE COFFEE TABLE?

1 A. NO, SIR, I DID NOT.

2 Q. OKAY. DID YOU DUST FOR PRINTS ON THE END TABLE?

3 A. NO, SIR, I DID NOT.

4 Q. DID YOU DUST FOR PRINTS ON THE T.V. STAND?

5 A. NO, SIR, I DID NOT.

6 Q. DID YOU DUST FOR PRINTS ON THE ACTUAL TELEVISION?

7 A. NO, SIR, I DID NOT.

8 Q. OKAY. AND THERE WAS A LOVE SEAT AND A COUCH THAT  
9 YOU TESTIFIED TO THE CUSHIONS BEING CUT, CORRECT?

10 A. IT APPEARED THEY MAY HAVE BEEN CUT, YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. AND LOOKING AT EXHIBIT NUMBER FIFTEEN,  
12 WILL YOU IDENTIFY THAT FOR THE COURT?

13 A. STATE'S EXHIBIT FIFTEEN IS A PHOTOGRAPH OF THE  
14 LOVE SEAT. THE CUSHIONS ARE MISSING AND THE  
15 PLACARDS ARE IDENTIFYING CARTRIDGE CASINGS WHICH  
16 WERE FOUND ON THE LOVE SEAT.

17 Q. OKAY. NOW, WOULDN'T YOU AGREE ON THIS PARTICULAR  
18 LOVE SEAT THAT THERE'S SOME TYPE OF EITHER FAKE  
19 WOOD ON THE ARMS AND COMING DOWN THE SIDES?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. AND WOULDN'T YOU AGREE THAT THAT TYPE OF  
22 FAKE WOOD MATERIAL IS ALSO ON THE SOFA, TOO?

23 A. YES, I BELIEVE IT WAS A MATCHING SET, YES, SIR.

24 Q. A MATCHING SET. AND DID YOU DUST FOR PRINTS ON  
25 THAT FAKE WOOD MATERIAL ON THE SOFA AND LOVE

1 SEAT?

2 A. NO, SIR, I DID NOT.

3 Q. OKAY. IF YOU HAD DUSTED FOR PRINTS, WOULD, IS IT  
4 A POSSIBILITY THAT THAT MATERIAL COULD HAVE  
5 PICKED UP PRINTS?

6 A. THIS MATERIAL COULD VERY POSSIBLY HAVE PRINTS ON  
7 IT, YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKA. AND AS FAR AS THE LOVE SEAT AND THE SOFA,  
9 THE ACTUAL MATERIAL, WHAT TYPE MATERIAL IS ON  
10 THAT LOVE SEAT AND SOFA?

11 A. IT WAS KIND OF A SUEDE TYPE OF MATERIAL, I THINK  
12 THAT WOULD BE A GOOD DESCRIPTION OF IT.

13 Q. OKAY. AND THAT MATERIAL COULD -- DID YOU DUST  
14 THAT MATERIAL FOR PRINTS?

15 A. NO, SIR, I DIDN'T DUST THAT.

16 Q. BUT IF YOU HAD DUSTED THAT MATERIAL FOR PRINTS  
17 COULD IT HAVE TAKEN, COULD YOU HAVE FOUND PRINTS?

18 A. THE CHANCES ON THAT PARTICULAR TYPE MATERIAL  
19 FINDING PRINTS WOULD BE VERY SLIM.

20 Q. BUT NOT IMPOSSIBLE?

21 A. NOT IMPOSSIBLE.

22 Q. OKAY, NOT IMPOSSIBLE?

23 A. NOT IMPOSSIBLE BUT VERY SLIM, YES, SIR.

24 Q. SO, BASICALLY, WITHIN THE LIVING ROOM, THE AREA  
25 OF CONCENTRATION YOU DIDN'T DUST FOR ANY PRINTS?

1 A. NOT INSIDE THE ROOM ITSELF.

2 Q. NOT INSIDE THE LIVING IN WHICH THE BODY WAS  
3 FOUND, YOU DIDN'T DUST FOR ANY TYPE OF PRINTS?

4 A. OUTSIDE THE LIVING ROOM?

5 Q. INSIDE THE LIVING ROOM.

6 A. INSIDE THE LIVING ROOM, NOT INSIDE THE ROOM  
7 ITSELF.

8 Q. AND YOU WOULD TESTIFY THAT THAT WAS THE CRIME  
9 SCENE, THE AREA OF CONCENTRATION?

10 A. THAT WAS THE PRIMARY AREA, YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. YOU DIDN'T FIND ANY GLOVES AT THE SCENE OR  
12 ANYTHING?

13 A. NO, SIR, NOT AT THE SCENE.

14 Q. OKAY. SO, I WOULD ASSUME THAT IF YOU DID NOT  
15 DUST FOR PRINTS IN THE LIVING ROOM YOU DIDN'T  
16 DUST FOR ANY PRINTS IN THE KITCHEN?

17 A. NO, SIR, THERE WAS NO INDICATION ANY SUSPECTS  
18 EVER ENTERED THE KITCHEN.

19 Q. YOU DIDN'T DUST FOR ANY PRINTS IN EITHER ONE OF  
20 THE BEDROOMS?

21 A. AGAIN, THERE WAS NO -- NO, SIR, I DID NOT, THERE  
22 WAS NO INDICATION THAT ANY OF THE SUSPECTS WENT  
23 INTO THOSE ROOMS.

24 Q. AND YOU DIDN'T DUST ANY ITEMS, YOU DIDN'T DUST  
25 FOR ANY PRINTS ON ANY ITEMS IN EITHER ONE OF

1           THOSE ROOMS?

2           A.    NO, SIR.

3           MR. KOGER:  I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE FOR JUST  
4           ONE MORE MOMENT.

5           THE COURT:  TAKE YOUR TIME, MR. KOGER.

6           Q.    NOW, I THINK AT THE BEGINNING OF YOUR TESTIMONY  
7           YOU MENTIONED ABOUT A DOG?

8           A.    YES, SIR.

9           Q.    OKAY.  AND THIS DOG WAS TIED TO A CEMENT BLOCK?

10          A.    YES, SIR.

11          Q.    WAS THE DOG INJURED IN ANY MANNER?

12          A.    NO, SIR.

13          Q.    OKAY.  HE WAS ALIVE?

14          A.    YES, SIR.

15          Q.    OKAY.  WHAT TYPE OF DOG WAS IT?

16          A.    IT WASN'T, IT WAS A LARGE DOG BUT IT DIDN'T  
17          APPEAR TO BE A PURE BRED DOG.

18          Q.    OKAY.

19          A.    IT WAS PROBABLY A MIXED BREED, I'M NOT SURE.

20          Q.    A MUTT?

21          A.    YES, SIR.

22          Q.    OKAY.  BUT FROM YOUR OBSERVATION OF THE DOG HE  
23          OR SHE WAS NOT SHOT?

24          A.    NO, SIR.

25          Q.    WAS NOT INJURED?

1 A. NO, SIR.

2 Q. AND WAS VERY MUCH ALIVE?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. AND JUST TO REITERATE A RESPONSE TO, I THINK  
5 ATTORNEY ULLMAN'S QUESTIONS, THERE WAS NO PRINTS  
6 FOUND ON THE SCENE?

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. NO PRINTS CONNECTING ANY OF THE DEFENDANTS TO THE  
9 CRIME SCENE?

10 A. NO, SIR.

11 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU, NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR.

13 MR. SORENSON, ANYTHING ON REDIRECT.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: JUST ONE BRIEF QUESTION.

15 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
16 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
17 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
18 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
19 sequential continuation of record.)

REDIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

541

1 REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF GERALD DAVID CARTER

2 BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

3 Q. LIEUTENANT CARTER, DO YOU RECALL WHEN MR.  
4 LACKEY'S FIRST WORDED THAT QUESTION TO YOU HE WAS  
5 ASKING YOU ABOUT HOW MANY, IF YOU COULD TELL HOW  
6 MANY WEAPONS WERE USED?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND I BELIEVE YOUR RESPONSE WAS, THERE  
9 WERE THREE DIFFERENT TYPES OF SHELL CASINGS,  
10 RIGHT, CALIBER SHELL CASINGS?

11 A. YES.

12 Q. WOULD THE FIREARMS EXPERT AT SLED BE MORE  
13 QUALIFIED IN DETERMINING HOW MANY DIFFERENT  
14 WEAPONS FIRED ALL OF THOSE SHELL CASINGS YOU  
15 RECOVERED?

16 A. OH, YES, SIR, THEY WOULD ACTUALLY ANALYZE THE  
17 BULLET FRAGMENTS AND THE SHELL CASINGS THEMSELVES  
18 TO DETERMINE HOW MANY CAME FROM THE SAME GUN OR  
19 DIFFERENT WEAPONS.

20 Q. OKAY. AND THOSE WERE ALL SENT OUT FOR THAT TO BE  
21 DONE?

22 A. YES, THEY WERE.

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, LIEUTENANT.

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR, MR. LACKEY, ANYTHING ON  
25 RECROSS?

1           MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

2           THE COURT: MS. ULLMAN, ANYTHING ON RECROSS?

3           MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

4           THE COURT: MR. PALMER?

5           MR. PALMER: NO, SIR.

6           THE COURT: MR. MELLARD?

7           MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR.

8           THE COURT: AND MR. KOGER?

9           MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

10          THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, LIEUTENANT CARTER,  
11 YOU MAY STEP DOWN. THANK YOU, SIR.

12           ALRIGHT, WE'RE GOING TO TAKE ABOUT A TEN TO  
13 FIFTEEN MINUTE BREAK. LADIES AND GENTLEMEN OF THE  
14 JURY, AGAIN I WILL REMIND YOU, WE HAVE NOT HEARD ALL  
15 OF THE TESTIMONY IN THIS CASE, YOU CANNOT BEGIN  
16 TALKING ABOUT ANYTHING THAT YOU'VE HEARD IN THIS CASE.  
17 YOU CAN TALK ABOUT THE WEATHER, GETTING READY FOR  
18 CHRISTMAS OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT, BUT THAT'S ALL YOU  
19 CAN TALK ABOUT. ALRIGHT, Y'ALL ARE EXCUSE TO THE JURY  
20 ROOM FOR ABOUT TEN OR FIFTEEN MINUTES. THANK Y'ALL.

21           (Whereupon, the jury retires  
22 to the jury room and the following  
23 takes place out of the presence  
24 of the jury.)

25          THE COURT: ANYTHING FROM THE STATE?



1           THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I HOPE YOU  
2 ENJOYED YOUR BREAK. WE'RE GETTING READY NOW TO RESUME  
3 TAKING TESTIMONY IN THIS CASE.

4           THE STATE CAN CALL THEIR NEXT WITNESS.

5           SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR. THE STATE CALLS  
6 SHANNON MITCHELL.

7           CLERK: SIR, PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE  
8 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT.

9           (Whereupon, Shannon Rishon Mitchell  
10 is duly sworn.)

11           CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE OUR FULL NAME FOR  
12 THE COURT.

13           WITNESS: SHANNON RISHON MITCHELL.

14           (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
15 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
16 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
17 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
18 sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY SOL. SORENSON

545

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF SHANNON R. MITCHELL

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

1 Q. SHANNON, IF YOU WOULD, TELL US, HOW OLD ARE YOU?

2 A. TWENTY-TWO.

3 Q. AND YOU LIVE HERE IN ORANGEBURG?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. DID YOU GROW UP IN ORANGEBURG?

6 A. SOMEWHAT, YES, SIR.

7 Q. WHERE DID YOU GO TO HIGH SCHOOL?

8 A. ORANGEBURG-WILKERSON.

9 Q. AND LET ME ASK YOU, BACK IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR

10 DID YOU KNOW THE VICTIM IN THIS CASE, CHARLES

11 PRINGLE?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. AND HOW, TELL THE JURY HOW YOU KNEW MR. PRINGLE?

14 A. HE WAS A FRIEND OF MINE.

15 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT NAME DID YOU KNOW HIM BY?

16 A. OLD SCHOOL.

17 Q. OKAY. AND HOW LONG HAD YOU BEEN FRIENDS WITH MR.

18 PRINGLE?

19 A. ABOUT THREE OR FOUR MONTHS.

20 Q. OKAY. AND TELL THE JURY HOW YOU INITIALLY BECAME

21 FRIENDS WITH MR. PRINGLE?

22 A. WELL, I START PURCHASING WEED, I STARTED SMOKING

23 WITH HIM, HANGING OUT, THAT'S ABOUT IT.

- 1 Q. AND BACK, THE BEGINNING OF MARCH OF THIS YEAR HOW  
2 OFTEN WOULD YOU KIND OF HANG OUT AND HANG AROUND  
3 MR. PRINGLE?
- 4 A. MAYBE THREE OR FOUR DAYS OUT THE WEEK.
- 5 Q. AND WERE YOU FAMILIAR BACK IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR  
6 WITH A YOUNG LADY NAMED ASHLEY PARSLEY?
- 7 A. YES, SIR.
- 8 Q. OKAY. AND HOW DID YOU KNOW MS. PARSLEY?
- 9 A. WE MET HER EARLIER IN THE WEEK.
- 10 Q. OKAY. AND WAS SHE ACTUALLY, FRIDAY, MARCH THE  
11 TWELFTH, AT THAT TIME WAS SHE STAYING WITH MR.  
12 PRINGLE?
- 13 A. YES, SIR.
- 14 Q. DID YOU KNOW HER PRIOR TO THAT, THOUGH, MEETING  
15 HER EARLIER IN THE WEEK?
- 16 A. NO, SIR.
- 17 Q. OKAY. I'M GOING TO TURN YOUR ATTENTION, IF I  
18 COULD, SHANNON, BACK TO THAT EVENING OF FRIDAY,  
19 MARCH THE TWELFTH OF THE YEAR. DO YOU REMEMBER  
20 WHAT YOU WERE DOING THAT NIGHT?
- 21 A. YES, SIR.
- 22 Q. OKAY. AND DID THREE COME A TIME WHEN YOU WENT  
23 OVER TO MR. PRINGLE'S APARTMENT?
- 24 A. YES, SIR.
- 25 Q. AND WHERE WAS HE LIVING BACK IN MARCH?

DIRECT - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY SOL. SORENSON

547

- 1 A. KINGS ROAD, I'M NOT SURE OF THE ADDRESS.
- 2 Q. THE APARTMENT, APARTMENT COMPLEX?
- 3 A. YES, SIR.
- 4 Q. AND DID YOU GO OVER, WENT OVER TO HIS HOUSE THAT
- 5 EVENING?
- 6 A. YES, SIR.
- 7 Q. TO THE APARTMENT, AND DO YOU KNOW ABOUT WHAT TIME
- 8 YOU GOT THERE?
- 9 A. ABOUT NINE O'CLOCK, AROUND, BETWEEN NINE AND
- 10 NINE:TEN.
- 11 Q. NINE AND NINE:TEN?
- 12 A. YES, SIR.
- 13 Q. AND DID YOU HAVE ANYBODY WITH YOU?
- 14 A. NO, SIR.
- 15 Q. ALRIGHT. AND HOW DID YOU GET THERE?
- 16 A. I DROVE.
- 17 Q. AND WHAT KIND OF CAR WERE YOU DRIVING BACK THEN?
- 18 A. TWO THOUSAND TWO HONDA ACCORD, IT WAS GREEN.
- 19 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU RECALL WHERE YOU PARKED?
- 20 A. IN THE FIRST FROM THE LAST PARKING SPACE ON THE
- 21 END, IN FRONT OF HIS APARTMENT.
- 22 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SIX, DO
- 23 YOU RECOGNIZE THAT PICTURE?
- 24 A. YES, SIR.
- 25 Q. OKAY. AND IS THAT, SHOW THE JURY OR POINT OUT

- 1                   WHERE YOU WERE PARKED?
- 2           A.    ON THE OTHER SIDE OF THIS HONDA.
- 3           Q.    OKAY.  SO, THE FAR SIDE OF THAT HONDA, OR THE
- 4                   NEAR SIDE, CLOSER TO THE PERSON TAKING THE
- 5                   PICTURE OR FARTHER AWAY FROM THE PERSON TAKING
- 6                   THE PICTURE?
- 7           A.    FARTHER AWAY.
- 8           Q.    AND THAT WOULD BE THE HONDA ACCORD YOU'RE TALKING
- 9                   ABOUT RIGHT THERE?
- 10          A.    YES, SIR.
- 11          Q.    SO, YOU'D BASICALLY BE ALMOST IN THE LAST SPOT IN
- 12                   THAT APARTMENT COMPLEX?
- 13          A.    YES, SIR.
- 14          Q.    OKAY.  AND IS THAT RIGHT IN FRONT OF MR.
- 15                   PRINGLE'S APARTMENT?
- 16          A.    YES, SIR.
- 17          Q.    NOW, WHEN YOU GOT OVER THERE THAT NIGHT WAS MR.
- 18                   PRINGLE HOME?
- 19          A.    YES, SIR.
- 20          Q.    OKAY.  HOW ABOUT MS. PARSLEY?
- 21          A.    YES.
- 22          Q.    OKAY.  AND WHEN YOU FIRST GOT THERE WHO, WHO, IF
- 23                   ANYBODY OUT OF THE TWO OF THEM WERE YOU
- 24                   INTERACTING WITH IN THE APARTMENT?
- 25          A.    ASHLEY.

DIRECT - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY SOL. SORENSON

549

1 Q. ASHLEY. AND WHERE WAS CHARLES?

2 A. IN THE ROOM TAKING A NAP.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHAT, WHAT WERE YOU AND ASHLEY THEN  
4 DOING?

5 A. JUST TALKING, SHOOTING THE BREEZE. I WAS SMOKING  
6 BUT SHE WASN'T SMOKING, SHE WAS JUST TALKING TO  
7 ME.

8 Q. AND WHERE WAS IT THAT Y'ALL WERE TALKING?

9 A. IN THE LIVING ROOM.

10 Q. OKAY. SITTING DOWN, STANDING UP?

11 A. SITTING DOWN.

12 Q. OKAY. NOW, DID THERE COME A TIME, SHANNON, WHERE  
13 ANYBODY ELSE WHILE YOU WERE THERE, ANYBODY ELSE  
14 CAME TO THE APARTMENT?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND TELL THE JURY HOW THAT CAME ABOUT.

17 A. I WAS SITTING THERE IN THE APARTMENT SMOKING, ME  
18 AND ASHLEY TALKING, AND WALTER CAME AND KNOCKED  
19 ON THE DOOR AND ASKED IF WE HAD ANY WEED.

20 Q. OKAY. AND BY WALTER, DO YOU SEE WALTER HERE IN  
21 THE COURTROOM TODAY?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. COULD YOU POINT HIM OUT TO THE JURY? WHICH ONE  
24 OUT OF THE FIVE PEOPLE ON THE FRONT BENCH IS HE?

25 A. BROWN SHIRT.

1 Q. BROWN SHIRT, IN THE MIDDLE OF THE FIVE OF THEM?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. AND HOW DO YOU KNOW WALTER?

4 A. HIGH SCHOOL, SEEING HIM AROUND YEARS BEFORE.

5 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU HAD KNOWN HIM FOR A WHILE?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU KNEW HIM BY NAME AND SIGHT WHEN  
8 YOU SAW HIM?

9 A. BY A NICK NAME.

10 Q. WHAT NICK NAME DID YOU KNOW HIM BY BACK THEN?

11 A. PETE.

12 Q. SAY AGAIN?

13 A. PETE.

14 Q. PETE? LET ME ASK YOU THIS, YOU SAID THAT YOU  
15 HAD BEEN HANGING AROUND OVER AT MR. PRINGLE'S  
16 WITH HIM FOR THE LAST THREE OR FOUR MONTHS BEFORE  
17 THIS OR SO?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. HAD YOU EVER SEEN WALTER HARRIS THAT YOU KNEW BY  
20 PETE, HAD YOU EVER SEEN HIM OVER AT MR. PRINGLE'S

21 - - -

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. --- EITHER HANGING OUT OR BUYING MARIJUANA PRIOR  
24 TO THAT NIGHT?

25 A. NO, SIR.

DIRECT - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY SOL. SORENSON

551

1 Q. AND BACK IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR, DID MR. HARRIS,  
2 DID HE KNOW WHAT KIND OF CAR YOU DROVE?

3 A. NO, SIR.

4 Q. HE DIDN'T. ALRIGHT. NOW, TELL THE JURY WHAT  
5 HAPPENED THEN WHEN HE CAME TO AND ENTERED THE  
6 APARTMENT THAT NIGHT?

7 A. HE ASKED IF WE HAD ANY DROE. DROE IS CALLED,  
8 YOU KNOW, A CERTAIN MARIJUANA. HE WAS ASKING IF  
9 WE HAD ANY, I SAID, NO, AND HE LEFT.

10 Q. OKAY. DID HE END UP TALKING TO ANYBODY BESIDES  
11 YOU AND MS. PARLEY?

12 A. OLD SCHOOL CAME OUT AND ASKED WHAT WAS HE LOOKING  
13 FOR.

14 COURT REPORTER: WHO CAME OUT WHERE?

15 A. CHARLES, WE CALLED HIM OLD SCHOOL, CAME OUT AND  
16 ASKED IF -- I GUESS ASKED ME WHAT HE WANTED, AND  
17 I TOLD HIM HE ASKED FOR SOME DROE. HE TOLD HIM  
18 HE DIDN'T HAVE ANY.

19 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER IF CHARLES ASKED MR. HARRIS FOR  
20 ANYTHING?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. WHAT DID HE ASK HIM FOR?

23 A. HE ASKED FOR AN ID, HE HADN'T SEEN HIM BEFORE, HE  
24 DIDN'T KNOW HIM, SO HE ASKED EVERYBODY FOR AN ID  
25 THAT HADN'T BEEN THERE BEFORE, AND CHECK THEM

1           OUT.

2           Q.   DO YOU KNOW WHETHER MR. HARRIS GAVE HIM AN ID?

3           A.   YES, SIR.

4           Q.   NOW, Y'ALL SAID THAT, AS FAR AS YOU KNOW, MR.  
5           PRINGLE DIDN'T HAVE ANY DROE, THAT TYPE OF  
6           MARIJUANA?

7           A.   NO, SIR.

8           Q.   OKAY.  ARE YOU AWARE OF WHETHER HE SOLD MR.  
9           HARRIS ANYTHING AT THAT TIME?

10          A.   NOT AT THAT TIME.

11          Q.   AND DID MR. HARRIS STICK AROUND AFTER THAT OR DID  
12          HE LEAVE?

13          A.   HE LEFT.

14          Q.   NOW, LET ME ASK YOU, AT THAT TIME DO YOU  
15          REMEMBER, YOU HAD TESTIFIED THAT PARKED BASICALLY  
16          RIGHT OUT IN FRONT OF THE APARTMENT, WERE YOU  
17          AWARE, OR DID YOU HEAR A CAR PULL UP IN FRONT OF  
18          THE APARTMENT OR A CAR DOOR CLOSE OR A CAR LEAVE  
19          AFTER MR. HARRIS LEFT OUTSIDE THE APARTMENT?

20          A.   NO, SIR.

21          Q.   ALRIGHT.  LET ME ASK YOU THIS TO KIND OF BACK UP  
22          A LITTLE BIT, WHILE YOU WERE IN THERE TALKING  
23          WITH ASHLEY DID YOU SEE AT ANY POINT IN TIME ANY  
24          WEAPONS INSIDE THE APARTMENT?

25          A.   YES, SIR.

DIRECT - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY SOL. SORENSON

553

1 Q. WHAT KIND OF WEAPON DID YOU SEE?

2 A. A THREE FIFTY-SEVEN THAT HE HAD, YEAH.

3 Q. WHO HAD THE, WHO HAD THAT WEAPON - - -

4 A. CHARLES.

5 Q. --- WHILE YOU WERE IN THERE?

6 A. OH, ASHLEY WAS HOLDING THE WEAPON.

7 Q. OKAY. YOU SAID IT WAS A THREE FIFTY-SEVEN?

8 A. YES, SIR, IT WAS A REVOLVER.

9 Q. A REVOLVER. OKAY. AND HAD YOU SEEN THAT GUN  
10 PRIOR TO THAT NIGHT, THAT FRIDAY NIGHT?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND DID YOU KNOW WHOSE GUN IT WAS?

13 A. IT WAS CHARLES'S.

14 Q. OKAY. BUT ASHLEY HAD IT IN HER POSSESSION WHILE  
15 YOU WERE THERE THAT NIGHT?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. NOW, AFTER PETE LEFT HOW LONG DID YOU END UP  
18 STAYING THERE?

19 A. ABOUT MAYBE TEN MINUTES.

20 Q. AND HOW LONG DO YOU THINK YOU WERE THERE TOTAL?

21 A. THIRTY TO MAYBE FORTY MINUTES TOTAL.

22 Q. AND WHAT WAS -- LET ME ASK YOU, WHEN YOU LEFT THE  
23 APARTMENT THAT NIGHT, I MEAN, WHAT CONDITION WAS  
24 IT IN?

25 A. EVERYTHING WAS FINE. A COUPLE THINGS WAS ON THE

1 TABLE, THAT'S ABOUT IT.

2 Q. WERE THE COUCH AND THE LOVE SEAT CUSHIONS IN  
3 THEIR PROPER PLACE?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. WAS THE CARPET ALL TORN UP AT ALL THAT YOU CAN  
6 RECALL?

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. AND WHEN YOU LEFT WHO WAS STILL IN THE APARTMENT  
9 WHEN YOU LEFT THAT NIGHT?

10 A. JUST ASHLEY AND CHARLES.

11 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHERE DID YOU END UP GOING,  
12 SHANNON?

13 A. I WENT TO PICK UP A FRIEND.

14 Q. AND WHO WAS THAT FRIEND YOU PICKED UP?

15 A. SHELDON.

16 COURT REPORTER: WHO?

17 A. SHELDON.

18 Q. SHELDON. ALRIGHT. AND WHAT DID YOU AND SHELDON  
19 THEN GO DO, DO YOU RECALL?

20 A. TALK ABOUT SOME THINGS, SMOKED A COUPLE OF  
21 JOINTS, THAT'S ABOUT IT.

22 Q. OKAY. AND SOMETIME LATER ON AFTER YOU LEFT DID  
23 YOU GET A CALL FROM ANYBODY, SPECIFICALLY, FROM  
24 ASHLEY?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY SOL. SORENSON

555

1 Q. OKAY. AND HOW WAS SHE ON THE PHONE WHEN SHE  
2 CALLED?

3 A. KIND OF UPSET. SHE CALLED AND TOLD ME OLD SCHOOL  
4 GOT KILLED.

5 Q. NOW, DID YOU TALK TO, AT ANY POINT IN TIME LATER  
6 ON THAT NIGHT AFTER YOU LEFT THE APARTMENT DID  
7 YOU TALK TO MR. HARRIS AGAIN?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AND WAS THAT IN PERSON OR ON THE  
10 TELEPHONE?

11 A. TELEPHONE.

12 Q. AND WHO -- DID HE CALL YOUR PHONE, OR YOU SAID  
13 SHELDON WAS WITH YOU?

14 A. SHELDON'S PHONE.

15 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER WHAT SHELDON'S PHONE NUMBER WAS  
16 BACK THEN?

17 A. IT WAS 803 403 SOMETHING, I DON'T REMEMBER THE  
18 LAST FOUR DIGITS.

19 Q. IF YOU SAW IT WOULD YOU RECOGNIZE IT?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY-  
22 SIX, PHONE CALLS AT TEN:FIFTY-NINE, ELEVEN  
23 O'CLOCK.

24 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE'S SHOWING  
25 PHONE RECORDS WITH LOTS OF DIFFERENT PHONE NUMBERS ON

1 THERE, AND HE SAID HE IF YOU SAW A NUMBER WOULD YOU  
2 RECOGNIZE IT? HE'S SHOWING HIM THAT NUMBER.

3 THE COURT: HE'S GOING TO HAND IT TO HIM AND SEE  
4 IF HE CAN IDENTIFY IT.

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 THE COURT: YOU CAN IDENTIFY HIS NUMBER?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. WHAT IS SHELDON'S PHONE NUMBER?

9 A. 803 403 7379.

10 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND DID YOU ACTUALLY TALK TO HIM,  
11 TO MR. HARRIS?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WAS ON SHELDON'S PHONE YOU WERE  
14 USING, THOUGH?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND DO YOU KNOW WHERE HE WAS AT THAT TIME?

17 A. NO, SIR.

18 Q. WHAT DID HE WANT?

19 A. WE TOLD HIM, WELL, HE ASKED US WHAT WE WAS GOING  
20 TO DO. I GUESS HE HAD FOUND OUT WHAT HAPPENED. I  
21 TOLD HIM WE WERE GOING TO TAKE A RIDE AND SMOKE,  
22 AND HE WANTED TO COME, WELL, HE WANTED ME TO COME  
23 PICK HIM UP AND RIDE WITH HIM, BUT I DIDN'T KNOW  
24 WHY.

25 Q. HE WANTED TO BE PICKED UP AT THAT POINT IN TIME?

DIRECT - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY SOL. SORENSON

557

1 A. I DIDN'T PICK HIM UP.

2 Q. YOU DIDN'T, THOUGH?

3 A. NO, SIR.

4 Q. SO, DID YOU SEE HIM ANYMORE THAT EVENING?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. DID YOU ULTIMATELY GO BACK OVER THAT NIGHT  
7 OVER TO CHARLES'S APARTMENT COMPLEX, THAT AREA?

8 A. I WENT TO SEE WHAT WAS GOING ON, AND ASK HER WHAT  
9 WAS GOING ON. SHE SAID, WELL, I DIDN'T TALK TO -  
10 - SHE WAS IN THE BACK OF THE CAR, COP CAR, BUT I  
11 THINK IT WAS A DEPUTY ASH, SHE TOLD US THAT WE  
12 COULDN'T COME AROUND, WE HAD TO LEAVE, WE  
13 COULDN'T STAY AT THE SCENE.

14 Q. OKAY. DID YOU ALSO GO IN AND SPEAK TO LAW  
15 ENFORCEMENT THAT - - -

16 A. NO -- OH, THAT NIGHT, YES, SIR.

17 Q. THAT WOULD BE LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT YOU SPOKE TO?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, SHANNON.

20 THE COURT: MR. LACKEY?

21 MR. LACKEY: I HAVE NOTHING FOR THIS WITNESS,  
22 YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY.

24 MS. ULLMAN, OR MR. WISE, EXCUSE ME, I'M SORRY.

25 MR. WISE.

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF SHANNON R. MITCHELL2 BY MR. WISE:

3 Q. MR. MITCHELL, I JUST HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS FOR  
4 YOU. WHEN YOU WERE IN THE APARTMENT THAT NIGHT,  
5 IT WAS PRETTY DARK IN THERE, RIGHT?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. THE ONLY LIGHTS THAT THEY HAD IN THAT  
8 APARTMENT ON THAT NIGHT WAS A BLACK LIGHT?

9 A. MAYBE. IT MAYBE HAVE BEEN A RED ONE IN THE  
10 KITCHEN BUT IT WAS A BLACK LIGHT IN THE LIVING  
11 ROOM PART, YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. THE ILLUMINATION, THE LIGHTING IN THE  
13 APARTMENT MAKES IT HARD TO SEE, IS THAT RIGHT?

14 A. SOMEWHAT, YES, SIR.

15 Q. SURE. OKAY. IF YOU DIDN'T RECOGNIZE ME, AND  
16 WE'RE THIS DISTANCE APART IN THAT LIGHTING COULD  
17 YOU MAKE OUT MY FEATURES?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. HOW ABOUT IF WE WERE ABOUT THIS FAR?

20 A. NO, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. AND YOU'D SAY FROM WHERE YOU ARE TO WHERE I  
22 AM IS ABOUT HOW FAR?

23 A. EIGHT FEET.

24 Q. EIGHT FEET. OKAY. WHEN YOU WERE IN THE  
25 APARTMENT YOU WERE SMOKING MARIJUANA BUT YOU SAID

CROSS - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY MR. WISE

559

1 ASHLEY WAS NOT?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. AND HOW LONG WERE YOU THERE?

4 A. FOR ABOUT THIRTY MINUTES, THIRTY TO FORTY  
5 MINUTES.

6 Q. OKAY. HOW MUCH DID YOU SMOKE IN THIRTY TO FORTY  
7 MINUTES?

8 A. JUST ONE.

9 Q. ONE?

10 A. JOINT.

11 Q. JOINT. A BLUNT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. ABOUT THE NORMAL SIZE OF A BLUNT IS THE  
14 NORMAL SIZE OF A CIGAR?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. EXPLAIN TO THE JURY WHAT A BLUNT IS?

17 A. TOBACCO PURCHASED AT THE GAS STATION AND ROLLED  
18 UP MARIJUANA.

19 Q. IT'S A CIGAR CALLED A BLUNT?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. AND YOU TAKE THE TOBACCO OUT, PUT MARIJUANA IN  
22 AND YOU SMOKE IT?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. IN TERMS OF HOW MUCH MARIJUANA A  
25 BLUNT WOULD HOLD, WOULD IT BE FIVE DOLLARS WORTH,

1 TEN DOLLARS WORTH?

2 A. FIVE DOLLARS.

3 Q. FIVE DOLLARS WORTH. ALRIGHT. AND YOU JUST HAD  
4 THE ONE BLUNT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. WHEN YOU ARE SITTING SMOKING THIS BLUNT AND  
7 TALKING TO ASHLEY, HOW FAR AWAY FROM ASHLEY ARE  
8 YOU?

9 A. MAYBE A FOOT. SHE'S SITTING RIGHT NEXT TO ME.

10 Q. SHE'S RIGHT NEXT TO YOU?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. YOU ARE SMOKING THE BLUNT AND YOU'RE  
13 BREATHING THE MARI -- SMOKING THE MARIJUANA, THE  
14 SMOKE'S OUT AND YOU'RE BREATHING IT, SHE'S  
15 BREATHING IT?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. YOU TESTIFIED THAT ASHLEY CALLED  
18 YOU LATER AFTER YOU LEFT?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. WHAT DID SHE SAY TO YOU?

21 A. SHE TOLD ME THAT OLD SCHOOL WAS DEAD, HAD BEEN  
22 KILLED.

23 Q. DID SHE TELL YOU WHAT HAPPENED?

24 A. NO, SIR.

25 Q. DID SHE TELL YOU WHO DID IT?

CROSS - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY MR. WISE

561

1 A. NO, SIR.

2 Q. DID SHE TELL ME HOW MANY PEOPLE WERE INVOLVED?

3 A. NO, SIR.

4 Q. DID SHE SAY THAT SHE SAW ANYBODY?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. DID SHE SAY SHE SAW ANYBODY'S FACE?

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. DID SHE DESCRIBE ANYBODY?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. ANYBODY AS TALL OR SHORT?

11 A. NO, SIR.

12 Q. CHUBBY OR THIN?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. SHE COULDN'T GIVE YOU ANY INFORMATION  
15 ABOUT WHO DID IT?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 Q. DID SHE GIVE YOU ANY INFORMATION ABOUT HOW MANY  
18 PEOPLE WERE INVOLVED?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY.

21 MR. WISE: YOUR HONOR, MAY I HAVE ONE MOMENT?

22 THE COURT: SURE.

23 MR. WISE: THANK YOU, MR. MITCHELL.

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 THE COURT: MR. PALMER.

1           MR. PALMER: YES, SIR. IF I COULD REMAIN HERE,  
2 YOUR HONOR?

3           THE COURT: YES, SIR, YOU MAY.

4           (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
5 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
6 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
7 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
8 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY MR. PALMER

563

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF SHANNON R. MITCHELL

BY MR. PALMER:

1 Q. HOW ARE YOU DOING, MR. MITCHELL?

2 A. ALRIGHT.

3 Q. YOU'VE ALREADY TESTIFIED YOU WERE FRIENDS WITH MY  
4 CLIENT, AND YOU SMOKED WEED WITH HIM BEFORE?

5 A. WITH?

6 Q. MR. HARRIS, PETE?

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. YOU HAVEN'T?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. WERE YOU SURPRISED TO SEE HIM THAT NIGHT?

11 A. KIND OF, SORT OF, BUT NOT REALLY, NO, SIR.

12 Q. NOW, IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY THAT HE HAD NEVER BEEN  
13 THERE BEFORE TO YOUR KNOWLEDGE?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND HOW LONG, TOTAL, DID HE STAY?

16 A. HOW MANY AMOUNT OF MINUTES, MAYBE TWO OR THREE,  
17 FOUR MINUTES, SOMETHING LIKE THAT.

18 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND DO YOU, HAVE YOU BEEN IN MR.  
19 PRINGLE'S APARTMENT WHEN HE ASKED FOR SOMEONE  
20 ELSE'S ID?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. PRIOR TO THIS EVENT?

23 A. YES, SIR.  
24  
25

1 Q. WHAT -- DO YOU HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT THE  
2 PURPOSE OF THE ID THING IS, WHAT DOES IT MATTER  
3 WHAT THEIR ID SAYS?

4 A. HE TOLD ME AN HONEST MAN CARRIES ID. HE SAID - -  
5 -

6 Q. UH-HUH.

7 A. --- HE WOULD ALWAYS CHECK ANY PERSON HE DIDN'T  
8 KNOW TO SEE, BEFORE, BECAUSE HE'S NOT FROM AROUND  
9 HERE. SO, HE ASKED FOR ANYONE'S ID, HE WANTED TO  
10 SEE, THAT HE DIDN'T KNOW, HE CHECKED IT OUT.  
11 COOL.

12 Q. ALRIGHT. OKAY. SO, IF A PERSON DIDN'T HAVE ID  
13 HE MIGHT NOT DO BUSINESS WITH HIM?

14 A. I COULDN'T SAY.

15 Q. IS THAT -- OR YOU COULDN'T SAY. ALRIGHT.

16 A. I WOULDN'T KNOW.

17 Q. SO, PETE SHOWS UP, HE STAYS A FEW MINUTES. MR.  
18 PRINGLE DOESN'T HAVE WHAT HE WANTS AND HE LEAVES,  
19 IS THAT ACCURATE?

20 A. NO, SIR.

21 Q. NOW, SO WHAT DID I MISS?

22 A. YOU SAID, HE WANTS AND HE LEAVES? REPHRASE YOUR  
23 QUESTION.

24 Q. MR. PRINGLE DIDN'T HAVE WHAT HE WANTED, THE TYPE  
25 OF WEED THAT HE WANTED, CORRECT?

CROSS - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY MR. PALMER

565

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. SO, THEN, MR. HARRIS LEAVES?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. AND YOU DON'T SEE HIM AFTER THAT, IS THAT  
5 CORRECT?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. YOU DO TALK TO HIM ON THE PHONE, THOUGH?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. AND THE CONVERSATION WAS THAT HE WANTED YOU TO  
10 COME PICK HIM UP?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. WHAT KIND OF CAR DID YOU HAVE BACK THEN?

13 A. A HONDA ACCORD, TWO THOUSAND TWO.

14 Q. OKAY. AND YOU SAID THAT, I'M NOT COMING TO PICK  
15 YOU UP?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. AND THAT WAS IT?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 MR. PALMER: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR.

20 THE COURT; MR. MELLARD.

21 MR. MELLARD: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

22 THE COURT; MR. KOGER.

23 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
24 part of record has been omitted. See next ensuing  
25 page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY MR. KOGER

566

1

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF SHANNON R. MITCHELL

2

BY MR. KOGER:

3

Q. MR. MITCHELL, DID YOU SEE MARIO SHIVERS ON THE  
SCENE ANYTIME THAT NIGHT?

4

5

A. NO, SIR.

6

MR. KOGER: THANK YOU, NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

7

THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

8

SOLICITOR SORENSON: JUST ONE BRIEF QUESTION.

9

(NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
sequential continuation of record.)

10

11

12

13

REDIRECT - SHANNON R. MITCHELL BY SOL. SORENSON

567

REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF SHANNON R. MITCHELL

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

1 Q. DID YOU HAVE ANY PROBLEM -- YOU TALKED ABOUT, MR.  
2 WISE ASKED YOU ABOUT THE LIGHTING IN THE  
3 APARTMENT, I MEAN, DID YOU HAVE ANY PROBLEM  
4 SEEING AND IDENTIFYING WALTER HARRIS WHEN HE WAS  
5 IN THERE THAT NIGHT?  
6

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. THERE WAS NO DOUBT IN YOUR MIND THAT WAS HIM?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

11 THE COURT: MR. LACKEY, ANYTHING ON RECROSS?

12 MR. LACKEY: NOTHING.

13 THE COURT: MR. WISE?

14 MR. WISE: NO, YOUR HONOR.

15 THE COURT: MR. PALMER.

16 MR. PALMER: NO, SIR.

17 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD?

18 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR.

19 THE COURT: MR. KOGER?

20 MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

21 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU, MR. MITCHELL,  
22 YOU MAY STEP DOWN. APPRECIATE YOU COMING.

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: MAY HE BE EXCUSED?

24 THE COURT: YOU MAY BE EXCUSED. OKAY.  
25

1 ALRIGHT, SIR.

2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I CALL ANDRE WASHINGTON, YOUR  
3 HONOR.

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR. ANDRE WASHINGTON?  
5 (Whereupon, the witness  
6 enters the courtroom.)

7 CLERK: SIR, PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE  
8 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.  
9 (Whereupon, Andre Washington  
10 is duly sworn.)

11 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE YOUR FULL NAME FOR  
12 THE COURT.

13 WITNESS: ANDRE WASHINGTON.

14 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
15 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
16 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
17 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
18 sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

569

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF ANDRE WASHINGTON

BY SOLICITOR PASCOE:

1 Q. GOOD MORNING, MR. WASHINGTON.

2 A. ALRIGHT.

3 Q. I APPRECIATE YOU COMING TODAY. YOU NEED TO SPEAK  
4 UP AS CLEARLY AS YOU CAN, OKAY, SO THE COURT  
5 REPORTER CAN HEAR YOU AND THE JURORS. ALRIGHT?  
6

7 A. ALRIGHT.

8 Q. THANK YOU. HOW OLD ARE YOU, MR. WASHINGTON?

9 A. TWENTY-THREE.

10 Q. DO YOU LIVE HERE IN ORANGEBURG COUNTY?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. DO YOU KNOW A YOUNG MAN, A SEVENTEEN YEAR  
13 OLD BY THE NAME OF PATRICK TYLER?  
14

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. DO YOU KNOW CHRIS COLEMAN, THE DEFENDANT RIGHT  
17 HERE?

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. DO YOU KNOW RALPH COLEMAN IN THE BLUE SHIRT?

20 A. I JUST WENT TO SCHOOL WITH HIM, THAT'S IT.

21 Q. WERE Y'ALL FRIENDS?

22 A. NO.

23 Q. DID YOU EVER HANG OUT WITH HIM?

24 A. NO.

25 Q. DO YOU KNOW THE DEFENDANT, WALTER HARRIS, IN THE

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

570

1 MIDDLE WITH THE BROWN SHIRT?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU KNOWN MR. WALTER HARRIS?

4 A. ABOUT A COUPLE OF YEARS.

5 Q. AND WERE YOU FRIENDS WITH HIM?

6 A. WE BE STRAIGHT, BUT NOT LIKE THAT.

7 COURT REPORTER: WHAT? I'M SORRY.

8 SOLICITOR PASCOE: HE SAID, WE BE STRAIGHT, BUT  
9 NOT LIKE THAT.

10 A. NOT LIKE THAT.

11 Q. DID YOU KNOW THE DEFENDANT, DANNY RYANT?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. AT ALL?

14 A. HUH-UH.

15 Q. AND DID YOU KNOW THE DEFENDANT, MARIO SHIVERS, ON  
16 THE END WITH THE BLUE SHIRT?

17 A. NO, SIR.

18 Q. AT ALL?

19 A. HUH-UH.

20 Q. SO, OF THE FIVE DEFENDANTS THE ONLY ONE THAT YOU  
21 REALLY KNEW CLOSE FOR A FEW YEARS WAS WHO?

22 A. PETE.

23 Q. AND WHO IS PETE?

24 A. OVER THERE.

25 Q. IN THE BROWN SHIRT IN THE MIDDLE?

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

571

1 A. YEAH.

2 Q. IS THAT THE NAME WALTER HARRIS WENT BY?

3 A. (Witness nods in the affirmative.)

4 Q. OKAY. YOU'VE GOT TO SPEAK UP, OKAY?

5 A. ALRIGHT.

6 Q. I'M GETTING HARD OF HEARING, TOO, SO -- DID YOU  
7 KNOW THE VICTIM IN THIS CASE, MR. CHARLES  
8 PRINGLE?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. HAD YOU EVER BEEN TO HIS APARTMENT ON KINGS ROAD?

11 A. NO, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, MR. WASHINGTON, DO  
13 YOU RECOGNIZE WHAT'S BEEN MARKED AS STATE'S  
14 EXHIBIT SEVENTY-THREE? HOLD IT AND TAKE A LOOK  
15 AT IT. DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT?

16 A. YES.

17 Q. WHAT DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT TO BE?

18 A. A FORTY CALIBER HE SOLD ME.

19 Q. AND WHEN YOU SAY, HE SOLD YOU, WHO SOLD YOU THAT  
20 FORTY CALIBER?

21 A. PETE.

22 Q. OKAY. AND IS THERE ANYTHING ON THERE, A SCUFF OR  
23 ANYTHING THAT YOU RECOGNIZE?

24 A. PROBABLY LIKE, BY THE CLIP.

25 Q. AND LET ME SHOW YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED STATE'S

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

572

1 EXHIBIT SEVENTY-FOUR, DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT?

2 A. YEAH.

3 Q. WHAT DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT AS?

4 A. IT'S THE CLIP.

5 Q. THE CLIP OF WHAT?

6 A. THE FORTY CALIBER.

7 Q. WHO GAVE YOU THAT CLIP?

8 A. PETE.

9 Q. OKAY. WHEN DID PETE, OR MR. WALTER HARRIS SELL  
10 YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS SEVENTY-THREE AND SEVENTY-  
11 FOUR?

12 A. REPEAT THAT AGAIN?

13 Q. WHEN DID HE SELL YOU THOSE TWO ITEMS?

14 A. IN MARCH, AROUND SOME TIME IN MARCH.

15 Q. OF THIS YEAR?

16 A. YEAH.

17 Q. OKAY. HOW LONG AFTER WALTER HARRIS SOLD YOU THE  
18 GUN DID YOU KEEP IT IN YOUR POSSESSION?

19 A. ABOUT THREE OR FOUR DAYS.

20 Q. OKAY. WHAT DID YOU END UP DOING WITH THE GUN?

21 A. SELLING IT.

22 Q. AND WHY DID YOU END UP SELLING IT?

23 A. BECAUSE I FOUND OUT IT WAS HOT, AND AFTER THAT I  
24 SOLD IT.

25 Q. AND WHEN YOU SAY IT WAS HOT, WHAT DOES THAT MEAN?

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

573

1 A. I FOUND OUT SOMETHING WAS DONE WITH IT, DEALING  
2 WITH A MURDER OR WHATEVER, SO I SOLD IT.

3 Q. OKAY. DID YOU FIND THAT OUT WHEN YOU BOUGHT THE  
4 GUN FROM MR. HARRIS OR AFTER?

5 A. AFTER.

6 Q. SO, IF YOU SOLD THE GUN TO -- DO YOU KNOW WHO  
7 CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT IS?

8 A. YEAH.

9 Q. WHO DID YOU SELL THE GUN TO?

10 A. YEAH, THAT'S WHO I SOLD IT TO.

11 Q. AND IF YOU SOLD IT TO HIM ON MARCH THE  
12 SEVENTEENTH, BECAUSE IT WAS HOT, WHICH WAS A  
13 WEDNESDAY, WHAT DAY DO YOU THINK YOU GOT THAT  
14 EXHIBIT, THAT GUN?

15 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, NONE OF THAT  
16 HAS BEEN PUT INTO EVIDENCE, NOBODY SAID THAT HE HAD  
17 SOLD IT TO ANYBODY.

18 THE COURT; WAIT, HOLD ON JUST A SECOND, MR.  
19 WASHINGTON.

20 WHAT'S YOUR OBJECTION?

21 MS. ULLMAN: THE SOLICITOR SAID THAT ON MARCH  
22 SEVENTEENTH WHEN HE SOLD WHATEVER, HOW MANY DAYS PRIOR  
23 TO THAT DID HE PURCHASE IT? NOBODY HAS EVER STATED  
24 EXCEPT FOR MR. PASCOE THAT THIS GUN WAS SOLD ON MARCH  
25 SEVENTEENTH.

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

574

1           THE COURT: WELL, I THINK HE, MR. WASHINGTON  
2 TESTIFIED THAT HE SOLD IT TO MR. CHRISTOPHER SOMEONE.

3           SOLICITOR PASCOE: CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT, YES, SIR.

4           THE COURT: CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT ON THE  
5 SEVENTEENTH. WAS THAT YOUR TESTIMONY, MR. WASHINGTON?

6 A.       YEAH, I SOLD IT.

7           THE COURT: AND DO YOU REMEMBER THAT DATE?

8 A.       I DON'T REMEMBER THE EXACT DATE THAT I SOLD IT  
9 ON, BUT I SOLD IT. I KNOW I AIN'T HAD IT BUT  
10 LIKE THREE OR FOUR DAYS.

11          SOLICITOR PASCOE: AND THAT'S THE POINT I WAS  
12 TRYING TO MAKE. I GUESS THE PURPOSE - - -

13 Q.       IF YOU SOLD IT ON A WEDNESDAY, WHAT DAY OF THE  
14 WEEK DID YOU BUY THAT GUN, OR HOW MUCH EARLIER  
15 DID YOU BUY THAT GUN?

16          THE COURT: YEAH.

17 Q.       WHAT DAY OF THE WEEK DID YOU BUY THAT GUN?

18 A.       PROBABLY LIKE ON A, IT HAD TO OF BEEN A SATURDAY  
19 OR SUNDAY.

20 Q.       AND THIS WAS -- I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY -- THAT'S  
21 LIKE NINE MONTHS AGO. YOU DON'T KNOW THE EXACT  
22 DAY YOU SOLD THE GUN TO CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT,  
23 RIGHT?

24 A.       I DON'T KNOW THE EXACT DATE.

25 Q.       TELL THE JURY IF YOU COULD NOW, GO INTO DETAIL,

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

575

1 HOW YOU WENT ABOUT BUYING THAT FORTY CALIBER GUN  
2 FROM WALTER HARRIS?

3 A. WELL, I HAD CALLED HIM AND I ASKED HIM, YOU KNOW,  
4 IF SOMEBODY IS SELLING A GUN, AND HE WAS, LIKE,  
5 YEAH, HE GOT A FORTY CAL. AND THAT'S WHEN HE  
6 CAME AND HE BROUGHT IT TO THE HOUSE, AND I GAVE  
7 HIM TWO FIFTY AND MY THIRTY-TWO AUTOMATIC FOR IT.

8 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU GAVE HIM TWO HUNDRED AND FIFTY  
9 DOLLARS AND ANOTHER GUN FOR THE FORTY CALIBER  
10 GUN?

11 A. YEAH.

12 Q. AND THAT WAS ON A SATURDAY OR A SUNDAY?

13 A. YEAH.

14 Q. LET'S SEE, DID -- WHEN HE SOLD YOU THE GUN WERE  
15 THERE ANY BULLETS IN THE MAGAZINE?

16 A. NOT THAT I KNOW OF. WELL, WHEN HE GOT TO THE  
17 DOOR HE TOOK TWO OUT OF THE CLIP.

18 Q. OKAY. SO, WHEN HE GOT TO WHAT DOOR, THE DOOR TO  
19 YOUR HOUSE, A CAR OR WHAT?

20 A. YEAH, LIKE THE CAR DOOR.

21 Q. AND HOW MANY WERE IN THE CLIP THAT HE TOOK OUT?

22 A. LIKE TWO.

23 Q. HOW MANY BULLETS DOES THE CLIP HOLD?

24 A. TEN.

25 Q. WOULD YOU HAVE BOUGHT THE GUN IF YOU KNEW HE HAD

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

576

1 BEEN USED IN A MURDER?

2 A. NO, I WOULDN'T HAVE BOUGHT IT.

3 Q. DID YOU EVER USE THE FORTY CALIBER IN THE THREE  
4 TO FOUR DAYS THAT IT WAS IN YOUR POSSESSION?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. AND WHY DID YOU SELL THE GUN TO CHRISTOPHER  
7 DWIGHT THREE OR FOUR DAYS LATER?

8 A. BECAUSE I FOUND OUT IT WAS HOT.

9 Q. DID YOU LET CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT KNOW THAT?

10 A. YEAH, HE KNOWED IT WAS HOT.

11 Q. AND HOW MUCH DID YOU SELL THE GUN TO CHRISTOPHER  
12 DWIGHT FOR?

13 A. THREE HUNDRED.

14 Q. AND MR. WASHINGTON, I'VE LEARNED, AND I THINK  
15 YOU'RE THE ONE THAT TOLD ME THIS, DO YOU HAVE  
16 PENDING CHARGES IN MY OFFICE?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. OKAY. FAILURE TO STOP FOR A BLUE LIGHT?

19 A. UH-HUH.

20 Q. AND THAT CARRIES ZERO TO THREE YEARS, DO YOU KNOW  
21 THAT, IS THAT RIGHT?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND ARE THERE ANY DEALS OR NEGOTIATIONS FOR YOUR  
24 SENTENCE IN THAT CASE?

25 A. NO, SIR.

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

577

1 Q. AND YOU MIGHT HAVE, I'VE BEEN TOLD, DO YOU HAVE  
2 FORGERY CHARGES IN MY OFFICE?

3 A. NOT THAT I KNOW OF.

4 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, IF YOU DO HAVE  
5 FORGERY CHARGES, HAVE THERE BEEN ANY DEALS OR  
6 NEGOTIATIONS ABOUT THOSE?

7 A. OH, NO.

8 Q. IN FACT, WE HAVEN'T TALKED ABOUT ANY CHARGES AT  
9 ALL WITH YOU, HAVE WE?

10 A. NO.

11 Q. DID YOU MEET WITH DETECTIVE SHUMPERT SOMETIME  
12 BACK IN MARCH RIGHT AFTER YOU SOLD THAT GUN TO  
13 CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU COOPERATE WITH HIM?

16 A. YEAH.

17 Q. DID YOU TELL HIM EVERYTHING YOU TOLD THE JURY  
18 TODAY?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND THE PERSON THAT YOU BOUGHT STATE'S EXHIBIT  
21 SEVENTY-THREE FROM ON THAT SATURDAY, DO YOU SEE  
22 HIM IN THE COURTROOM?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. AND POINT HIM OUT FOR THE JURY?

25 A. HE'S OVER THERE.

DIRECT - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY SOL. PASCOE

578

1 Q. THE BROWN SHIRT, PETE?

2 A. YEAH.

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: OKAY. THANK YOU, MR.

4 WASHINGTON, ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THEY HAVE FOR YOU.

5 THE COURT: MR. LACKEY.

6 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, I HAVE NONE.

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MS. ULLMAN, OR MR. WISE.

8 MS. ULLMAN, SORRY.

9 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
10 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
11 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
12 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
13 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY MS. ULLMAN

579

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ANDRE WASHINGTON

2 BY MS. ULLMAN:

3 Q. YOU SAY THAT YOU KNOW THAT CLIP HOLDS TEN  
4 BULLETS, IS THAT RIGHT?

5 A. UH-HUH.

6 Q. IS IT POSSIBLE THAT THERE WOULD BE ELEVEN BULLETS  
7 IN A GUN IF IT WAS FULLY LOADED, YOU CAN CHAMBER  
8 ONE AND THEN LOAD THE CLIP, CORRECT?

9 A. YEAH, YOU CAN PUT ON IN THE HEAD.

10 Q. SO, THERE COULD CERTAINLY BE ELEVEN BULLETS, IS  
11 THAT RIGHT?

12 A. UH-HUH.

13 Q. OKAY. WHY DID YOU WANT TO BUY A GUN?

14 A. FOR PROTECTION.

15 Q. FOR PROTECTION?

16 A. UH-HUH.

17 Q. DO YOU HAVE A DANGEROUS JOB?

18 A. NO, JUST I WAS IN A LITTLE SITUATION AROUND THAT  
19 TIME ANYWAY SO I HAD NEEDED A GUN.

20 Q. YOU WERE IN A SITUATION THAT YOU FELT YOU NEEDED  
21 A GUN?

22 A. YEAH, AROUND THAT TIME.

23 MS. ULLMAN: NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

24 THE COURT: THANK YOU.

25 ALRIGHT, MR. PALMER.

CROSS - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY MR. PALMER

580

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ANDRE WASHINGTON

2 BY MR. PALMER:

3 Q. HOW DID YOU FIND OUT THE GUN WAS HOT?

4 A. BECAUSE ONCE I WENT BACK OVER THERE ON JAMISON  
5 AND PEOPLE WAS TALKING PRETTY MUCH AND - - -

6 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER WHO WAS TALKING?

7 A. WELL, THE GUY, CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT, HE WAS  
8 TALKING.

9 Q. CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT, THAT'S THE GUY YOU SOLD IT  
10 TO, RIGHT?

11 A. YEAH, HE WAS PRETTY MUCH TALKING ABOUT WHAT HE  
12 HEARD AND ALL THAT, AND HE WAS, LIKE, WELL, THAT  
13 MIGHT BE THE GUN. SO, ONCE HE SAID THAT I  
14 DECIDED TO SELL IT.

15 Q. OKAY. DID YOU END UP BUYING ANOTHER GUN?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 Q. SO, THAT WAS THE ONLY GUN YOU'VE EVER OWNED?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. EXCEPT FOR THE ONE YOU TRADED?

20 A. YEAH, EXCEPT FOR THAT ONE.

21 Q. WHAT KIND OF GUN WAS THAT?

22 A. A THIRTY-TWO AUTOMATIC.

23 Q. OKAY. WHAT DID YOU NEED THAT GUN FOR?

24 A. PROTECTION.

25 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU'D NEVER USE IT ON ANYBODY, WOULD

CROSS - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY MR. PALMER

581

1 YOU?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. AND JUST BECAUSE YOU OWN A GUN DOESN'T MEAN  
4 YOU'RE GOING TO KILL ANYBODY, DOES IT?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 MR. PALMER: OKAY. THANK YOU.

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. MR. MELLARD.

8 MR. MELLARD: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

9 THE COURT: AND MR. KOGER.

10 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
11 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
12 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
13 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
14 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - ANDRE WASHINGTON BY MR. KOGER

582

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ANDRE WASHINGTON

2 BY MR. KOGER:

3 Q. MR. WASHINGTON, YOU DIDN'T PURCHASE THE GUN  
4 FROM MR. SHIVERS, DID YOU?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU, NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

8 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, SIR, THANK YOU.

9 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU, MR. WASHINGTON,  
10 YOU MAY STEP DOWN. APPRECIATE IT.

11 ALRIGHT, CALL YOUR NEXT WITNESS.

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THE STATE CALLS MONEAK  
13 BUSBY.

14 (Whereupon, the witness  
15 enters the courtroom.)

16 CLERK: MA'AM, PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE  
17 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.

18 (Whereupon, Moneak Busby  
19 is duly sworn.)

20 CLERK: YOU MAY HAVE A SEAT AND STATE OUR FULL  
21 NAME FOR THE COURT.

22 WITNESS: MONEAK R. BUSBY.

23 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
24 part of record has been omitted. See next ensuing  
25 page for sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

583

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MONEAK R. BUSBY

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

1 Q. GOOD MORNING, MONEAK.

2 A. GOOD MORNING, SIR.

3 Q. IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY WHERE YOU LIVE?

4 A. SEVEN THIRTEEN GREEN STREET, MALIBU APARTMENTS.

5 Q. AND THAT'S HERE IN ORANGEBURG?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. DID YOU GROW UP HERE IN ORANGEBURG?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. AND I WANT TO TURN YOUR ATTENTION, IF I COULD,

10 MONEAK, BACK TO FRIDAY, MARCH THE TWELFTH OF THIS

11 YEAR. DO YOU REMEMBER THAT NIGHT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER WHAT YOU WERE DOING THAT FRIDAY

14 NIGHT?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE DID YOU END UP GOING THAT FRIDAY

17 NIGHT?

18 A. TO A POOL ROOM CALLED THE CORNER POCKET.

19 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE IS THE CORNER POCKET LOCATED AT?

20 A. ON THE CORNER OF STILTON.

21 Q. ALRIGHT. AND LET ME SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS

22 THIRTY AND THIRTY-ONE, IS THAT THE CORNER POCKET?

23 A. YES, SIR.

1 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT IS THE CORNER POCKET?

2 A. IT'S A LITTLE POOL ROOM.

3 Q. A POOL BAR?

4 A. POOL BAR.

5 Q. A POOL HALL. AND WHO DID, WHO DID YOU GO TO THE  
6 CORNER POCKET WITH THAT NIGHT?

7 A. YVONNE SHARPERSON, MAKIVA MONROE, AND SHAUN  
8 MONROE.

9 Q. OKAY, AND THOSE THREE PEOPLE, MAKIVA, SHAUN AND  
10 YVONNE, OUT OF THOSE THREE PEOPLE ARE ANY OF THEM  
11 RELATED TO ANY OF THE DEFENDANTS HERE IN COURT  
12 TODAY?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. AND WHO IS RELATED TO WHO OVER THERE?

15 A. RYANT, THAT'S HIS MOTHER.

16 Q. OKAY. DANNY, THE DEFENDANT, DANNY RYANT THAT'S  
17 IN THE KIND OF LIGHT COLORED SHIRT TOWARDS, THE  
18 SECOND FROM THE RIGHT?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. ALRIGHT, AND WHO IS MR. RYANT'S MOTHER?

21 A. MAKIVA.

22 Q. OKAY. AND HOW ABOUT SHAUN, IS SHE RELATED TO MR.  
23 RYANT?

24 A. THAT'S HIS AUNT.

25 Q. THAT'S HIS AUNT, SO THAT'S MAKIVA'S SISTER, IS

DIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

585

1 THAT RIGHT?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. AND HOW ABOUT MS. SHARPERSON, IS SHE  
4 RELATED TO ANY OF THESE DEFENDANTS?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. NOW, THE FOUR OF Y'ALL ENDED UP GOING,  
7 YOU, MAKIVA, SHAUN AND YVONNE WENT OVER TO THE  
8 CORNER POCKET THAT NIGHT?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. AND DO YOU KNOW ABOUT WHAT TIME YOU GOT THERE?

11 A. BETWEEN EIGHT, EIGHT:THIRTY.

12 Q. OKAY. AND YOU WERE JUST GOING TO HANG OUT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. AND IS THERE A REASON THAT YOU KNOW YOU  
15 GOT THERE BETWEEN EIGHT AND EIGHT:THIRTY?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. AND WHAT'S THAT REASON?

18 A. BECAUSE ABOUT NINE O'CLOCK THEN THEY START  
19 CHARGING, WHEN THE DJ COMES.

20 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU GOT IN FOR -- YOU DIDN'T GET IN  
21 FOR ANY COVER CHARGE PRIOR TO NINE O'CLOCK?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. AND THAT NIGHT WHEN YOU WERE OVER THERE,  
24 BETWEEN EIGHT AND EIGHT:THIRTY AND THE, KIND OF  
25 THE TIME AFTER THAT DID YOU SEE MR. RYANT INSIDE

1 THE CORNER POCKET?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT NICK NAME OR WHAT NAME DID YOU  
4 KNOW MR. RYANT BY BACK IN MARCH?

5 A. POKEY.

6 Q. AND MONEAK, DID THERE COME A TIME THAT NIGHT WHEN  
7 YOU SAW POKEY TALKING TO ANYBODY OVER BY THE  
8 FRONT DOOR?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. AND ABOUT WHAT TIME DO YOU THINK THAT WAS?

11 A. BETWEEN ABOUT NINE, NINE:THIRTY, SOMEWHERE AROUND  
12 THERE, ABOUT NINE:FIFTEEN.

13 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, WERE YOU LOOKING AT A WATCH, KIND  
14 OF TAKING DOWN - - -

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. --- KIND OF ALL THESE TIMES, KIND OF ESTIMATING?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHO DID YOU SEE, OR HOW MANY PEOPLE  
19 DID YOU SEE POKEY TALKING TO OVER BY THE DOOR?

20 A. TWO OF THEM.

21 Q. OKAY. AND WAS HE TALKING TO THEM AT THE SAME  
22 TIME OR - - -

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. SO, IT WAS KIND OF ONE AT A TIME?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

587

1 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU, DID YOU RECOGNIZE ANY  
2 OF THOSE PEOPLE THAT HE WAS TALKING TO?

3 A. ONE OF THEM.

4 Q. OKAY. AND WHO, HOW DID YOU -- DID YOU KNOW THAT  
5 PERSON JUST RECOGNIZED THEM?

6 A. I REALLY DON'T KNOW HIM BUT I KNOW OF HIM A  
7 LITTLE BIT.

8 Q. OKAY. AND DOES HE HAVE SOME CONNECTION TO MR.  
9 RYANT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. WHAT'S HIS CONNECTION TO MR. RYANT?

12 A. THAT'S HIS SISTER'S BABY'S DADDY.

13 Q. SO, IT'S DANNY RYANT'S SISTER'S BABY'S FATHER?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND WHO IS THAT PERSON THAT YOU SAW MR.  
16 RYANT TALKING TO, DO YOU SEE HIM IN THE COURTROOM  
17 HERE TODAY?

18 A. THE ONE RIGHT THERE FAR TO MY RIGHT, ON THE  
19 CORNER.

20 Q. ON THE END, MR. MARIO SHIVERS?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. AND DID YOU KNOW HIS NAME BACK IN MARCH?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. NOW, HOW ABOUT THE OTHER PERSON, DID YOU  
25 RECOGNIZE HIM, THAT YOU SAW HIM TALKING TO, DID

1 YOU KNOW THAT OTHER PERSON?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU, DO YOU SEE THAT OTHER  
4 PERSON HERE IN THE COURTROOM TODAY ON THE FRONT  
5 ROW?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. NOW, THOSE PEOPLE THAT YOU SAW MR. RYANT TALKING  
8 TO, DID EITHER ONE OF THEM COME INTO THE CORNER  
9 POCKET?

10 A. NO, SIR.

11 Q. DO YOU KNOW WHY THEY DIDN'T?

12 A. BECAUSE THE MAN AT THE DOOR SAY IF RYANT WOULD  
13 HAVE WENT OUT THEN HE WOULD HAVE TO PAY, AND IF  
14 THEY WOULD HAVE CAME IN THEY WOULD HAVE TO PAY TO  
15 GO IN, SO THEY NEVER CAME IN.

16 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, DID THERE COME A TIME KIND OF  
17 LATER ON AFTER THAT HAPPENED WHEN ANYBODY INSIDE  
18 THE CORNER POCKET WAS LOOKING FOR DANNY RYANT?

19 A. HIS MOTHER.

20 Q. OKAY. AND SHE WAS LOOKING FOR HIM DID YOU SEE  
21 HIM ANYWHERE INSIDE THE CORNER POCKET WHEN SHE  
22 WAS LOOKING FOR HIM?

23 A. NO, SIR, BECAUSE I WAS ONE SIDE, HE WAS ON  
24 ANOTHER SIDE.

25 Q. SO, YOU DON'T KNOW WHERE HE WAS AT THAT POINT IN

DIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

589

1 TIME, - - -

2 A. NO, I REALLY - - -

3 Q. --- IS THAT CORRECT?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. YOU DIDN'T SEE HIM AT THAT TIME THAT SHE WAS  
6 LOOKING FOR HIM?

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. NOW, DID THERE COME A TIME SOMETIME LATER ON THAT  
9 NIGHT WHEN YOU SAW MR. RYANT AGAIN AT THE CORNER  
10 POCKET?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND DO YOU KNOW WHAT TIME THAT WOULD HAVE BEEN?

13 A. LIKE, ABOUT FORTY, FORTY-FIVE MINUTES LATER.

14 Q. FORTY-FIVE MINUTES AFTER YOU SAW HIM TALKING AT  
15 THE DOOR - - -

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q . --- OR AFTER?

18 A. AFTER I SEEN HIM TALKING AT THE DOOR.

19 Q. SO, YOU SAW HIM BACK INSIDE THE CORNER POCKET AT  
20 THAT TIME?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. WAS HE BY HIMSELF AT THAT TIME - - -

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. --- WHEN YOU SAW HIM BACK IN THERE? I TURN YOUR  
25 ATTENTION, DO YOU REMEMBER BACK ON MARCH THE

DIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

590

1 TWENTY-SIXTH MEETING WITH LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT  
2 WITH THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. AND DO YOU REMEMBER GIVING HIM A STATEMENT AT  
5 THAT TIME?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND DO YOU ALSO REMEMBER HIM SHOWING YOU A COUPLE  
8 OF LINEUPS?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER ONE, DO  
11 YOU REMEMBER HIM SHOWING YOU THAT LINEUP?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. WERE YOU ABLE TO PICK ANYBODY OUT OF THAT LINEUP?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND WHAT NUMBER DID YOU PICK OUT?

16 A. NUMBER THREE.

17 Q. OKAY. AND WHO WAS THAT IN PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER  
18 THREE?

19 A. MR. SHIVERS.

20 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S THE PERSON DOWN ON THE END?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. OBVIOUSLY, HIS HAIR IS A LITTLE DIFFERENT IN THE  
23 PHOTOGRAPH - - -

24 A. YES.

25 Q. --- THAN IT IS NOW, IS THAT CORRECT?

DIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

591

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. AND DID YOU THEN KIND OF MEMORIALIZE THAT IN THAT  
3 ATTACHED AFFIDAVIT THAT YOU PICKED OUT THAT  
4 PHOTOGRAPH?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
7 WE'D OFFER STATE'S NUMBER ONE INTO EVIDENCE.

8 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

9 MR. MELLARD: WITHOUT OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR.

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, STATE'S NUMBER ONE ADMITTED  
11 INTO EVIDENCE.

12 (State's Exhibit One  
13 marked and filed.)

14 Q. AND WHAT DID YOU INDICATE ON HERE ABOUT THE  
15 PERSON, WHAT DID YOU WRITE ON THERE, AS THAT  
16 BEING THE PERSON THAT WHAT?

17 A. THAT WAS AT THE DOOR AT THE CLUB.

18 Q. AT THE CORNER POCKET, THE CLUB, THE CORNER  
19 POCKET?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. AND YET AGAIN, THAT PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER THREE IS  
22 THE PERSON THAT YOU KNOW AS MARIO SHIVERS?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. AND THAT IS DANNY RYANT'S SISTER'S BABY'S FATHER?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

592

1 Q. AND DID YOU ALSO HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT  
2 ANOTHER LINEUP, STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER TWO?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. WERE YOU ABLE TO PICK ANYBODY OUT OF STATE'S  
5 EXHIBIT NUMBER TWO?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND WHAT PHOTOGRAPH DID YOU PICK OUT OF NUMBER  
8 TWO?

9 A. NUMBER FOUR.

10 Q. OKAY. AND WHO IS THAT IN NUMBER FOUR?

11 A. I REALLY DON'T KNOW HIM, BUT I SEEN HIM WHEN HE  
12 WAS AT THE DOOR.

13 Q. THAT'S THE OTHER PERSON YOU TESTIFIED ABOUT?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. ALRIGHT. AND YOU DON'T KNOW WHO HE IS, RIGHT?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OKAY. YOUR HONOR, AT THIS  
18 TIME WE'D OFFER STATE'S NUMBER TWO INTO EVIDENCE?

19 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION? THERE BEING NO  
20 OBJECTION, IT IS ADMITTED.

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON; THANK YOU.

22 (State's Exhibit Two  
23 marked and filed.)

24 Q. AND DID YOU ALSO, JUST LIKE YOU DID WITH THE  
25 OTHER ONE, INDICATED THAT YOU SAW THAT PERSON AT

DIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

593

1 THE DOOR?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. AND LET ME MAKE SURE, THAT'S THE PICTURE YOU  
4 CIRCLED, NUMBER FOUR?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. AND HE IS NOT SEATED ON THE FRONT ROW, IS THAT  
7 CORRECT?

8 A. NO, SIR.

9 Q. YOU DON'T SEE THAT PERSON IN THE COURTROOM?

10 A. NO, SIR.

11 Q. NOW, WHEN YOU WERE SHOWN THOSE TWO LINEUPS BY  
12 LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT DID HE AT ANYTIME TELL YOU  
13 WHO TO PICK OUT OR SUGGEST TO YOU WHO TO PICK OUT  
14 OF THOSE LINEUPS?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, MS. BUSBY.

17 THE COURT: NO, NO, MS. BUSBY, I'M SORRY. I KNOW  
18 YOU WANT TO LEAVE, BUT OTHER PEOPLE GET A CHANCE TO  
19 ASK YOU QUESTIONS, TOO. OKAY? SO, IF YOU'LL BEAR  
20 WITH US WE'RE GOING TO LET THEM ASK YOU QUESTIONS,  
21 TOO. ALRIGHT?

22 OKAY, MR. LACKEY.

23 MR. LACKEY: NO QUESTIONS FOR HER, YOUR HONOR.

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MS. - - -

25 MS. ULLMAN: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

1           THE COURT: OKAY. MS. ULLMAN. OKAY.

2           MR. PALMER: NO QUESTIONS.

3           THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. MELLARD.

4           MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

5           (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
6           part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
7           pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
8           required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
9           sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY MR. MELLARD

595

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF MONEAK R. BUSBY

BY MR. MELLARD:

1 Q. I'VE JUST GOT A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. NOW, YOU  
2 TOLD US YOU WERE AT THE CORNER POCKET ON THE  
3 NIGHT OF MARCH THE TWELFTH?  
4

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. AND JUST SO WE UNDERSTAND, THAT'S LOCATED  
7 YOU SAID AT THE CORNER OF STILTON?  
8

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. ALRIGHT. AND IT'S IN A NEIGHBORHOOD, I BELIEVE?  
11

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. ALRIGHT. AND IT'S SURROUNDED BY HOUSES?  
14

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. OKAY. YOU DON'T LIVE BY THE CORNER POCKET?  
17

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. YOU HAD TO GET A RIDE THERE?  
20

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. AND JUST SO THE JURY UNDERSTANDS, YOU CAN GO  
23 INSIDE THE CORNER POCKET, AND I BELIEVE YOU SAID  
24 THERE'S A PLACE YOU CAN SHOOT POOL?  
25

A. YES, SIR.

Q. ALRIGHT. AND I BELIEVE IT'S ALSO A PLACE WHERE  
YOU CAN GET SOME FOOD, IS THAT CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. THEY SERVE STONE STEW?

CROSS - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY MR. MELLARD

596

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. AND THE CORNER POCKET HAS A PLACE WHERE YOU  
3 CAN DANCE?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THE CORNER POCKET HAS A BAR?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN YOU GET TO THE CORNER POCKET  
8 EARLY I BELIEVE YOU DON'T HAVE TO PAY TO GET IN?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. ALRIGHT. DO YOU KNOW WHAT TIME THEY START  
11 CHARGING TO GET IN?

12 A. ABOUT NINE O'CLOCK.

13 Q. ABOUT NINE O'CLOCK. HOW MUCH DO THEY CHARGE TO  
14 GET INTO THE CLUB?

15 A. FIVE DOLLARS.

16 Q. FIVE DOLLARS. ALRIGHT, SO YOU TRIED TO GET THERE  
17 EARLY ON THAT NIGHT SO YOU WOULDN'T HAVE TO PAY  
18 THE COVER CHARGE?

19 A. YES.

20 Q. ALRIGHT. AND IT'S ALSO MY UNDERSTANDING, IF YOU  
21 LEAVE THE CLUB YOU'VE GOT TO PAY TO GET BACK IN?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. HOW MUCH HAVE YOU GOT TO PAY TO GET BACK IN?

24 A. AN ADDITION OF TWO DOLLARS.

25 Q. TWO DOLLARS. OKAY. SO, I'M JUST KIND OF

CROSS - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY MR. MELLARD

597

1                   WONDERING, WHEN YOU GET -- IF YOU DON'T WANT TO  
2                   PAY THE FIVE DOLLARS YOU TRY TO STAY IN THE CLUB

3                   - - -

4                   A.    YES, SIR.

5                   Q.    --- UNTIL YOU'RE READY TO LEAVE?

6                   A.    YES, SIR.

7                   Q.    OKAY.  NOW, I BELIEVE YOU SAID YOU SPOKE TO  
8                   INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT?

9                   A.    YES, SIR.

10                  Q.    AND AT THAT TIME YOU TOLD INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT  
11                  YOU GOT TO THE BAR AROUND SEVEN:THIRTY?

12                  A.    SIR, I CAN'T REALLY TELL YOU WHAT TIME IT WAS  
13                  BECAUSE I DIDN'T HAVE A WATCH ON, BUT IT WAS  
14                  BETWEEN SEVEN:THIRTY TO EIGHT, NO LATER THAN  
15                  EIGHT:THIRTY.

16                  Q.    OKAY.  IT COULD BE ANYWHERE BETWEEN SEVEN:THIRTY  
17                  AND EIGHT:THIRTY?

18                  A.    YES, SIR.

19                  Q.    OKAY.  AND SO, YOU DIDN'T HAVE TO PAY TO GET IN?

20                  A.    NO, SIR.

21                  Q.    NOW, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT YOU'RE CLAIMING  
22                  YOU SAW SOME PEOPLE COME TO THE DOOR AND TALK TO  
23                  DANNY RYANT?

24                  A.    YES, SIR.

25                  Q.    ALRIGHT.  NOW, WHAT TIME -- YOU SAID THIS

1                   HAPPENED AROUND NINE:FIFTEEN, SOMEWHERE AROUND  
2                   THERE, GIVE OR TAKE?

3           A.    YES, SIR.

4           Q.    SOMEWHERE BETWEEN NINE O'CLOCK OR NINE:THIRTY?

5           A.    YES, SIR.

6           Q.    OKAY. ALRIGHT, NOW IN MARCH YOU TOLD  
7                   INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT THAT YOU LEFT THE CORNER  
8                   POCKET AROUND ELEVEN:TWENTY?

9           A.    ELEVEN:TWENTY TO TWELVE.

10          Q.    OKAY. IS THAT STILL YOUR TESTIMONY, THAT YOU  
11               LEFT BETWEEN ELEVEN:THIRTY AND TWELVE?

12         A.    YES, SIR.

13         Q.    ALRIGHT. NOW, YOU GAVE THE STATEMENT TO  
14               INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT ABOUT, YOU SAID THAT MR.  
15               RYANT WAS TALKING TO PEOPLE, CORRECT?

16         A.    YES, SIR.

17         Q.    ALRIGHT. AND I ASSUME THAT YOUR STATEMENT WAS  
18               TRUE WHEN YOU TOLD HIM THAT?

19         A.    YES, SIR.

20         Q.    OKAY. BUT YOU DIDN'T TELL HIM ANYTHING ABOUT YOU  
21               LEAVING THE CLUB?

22         A.    NO, SIR.

23         Q.    OKAY. BECAUSE YOU DIDN'T LEAVE THE CLUB?

24         A.    YES, I DID.

25         Q.    ALRIGHT. WHEN DID YOU LEAVE THE CLUB?

CROSS - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY MR. MELLARD

599

1 A. LIKE, AFTER TWELVE.

2 Q. OKAY. AFTER TWELVE, RIGHT, BUT I MEAN,  
3 OBVIOUSLY, YOU'RE HERE IF YOU LEFT THE CLUB, BUT  
4 BETWEEN WHEN YOU GOT THERE AND THE TIME YOU LEFT  
5 AROUND TWELVE O'CLOCK YOU DIDN'T LEAVE THE CLUB?

6 A. NOT, NO, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU DIDN'T FOLLOW DANNY TO WHERE HE  
8 WENT?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. ALRIGHT. YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT HAPPENED ONCE YOU  
11 SAW HIM TALKING, CORRECT?

12 A. NO -- YOU'RE RIGHT, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. NOW, I BELIEVE YOUR STATEMENT DOESN'T SAY  
14 ANYTHING ABOUT ANY OF THESE OTHER PEOPLE BEING  
15 THERE OTHER THAN THE ONES YOU IDENTIFIED, IS THAT  
16 CORRECT?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, THE CORNER POCKET IS A BAR, I  
19 BELIEVE WE HAVE ESTABLISHED THAT, CORRECT?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. ALRIGHT. SO, I ASSUME YOU HAD A COUPLE OF DRINKS  
22 WHILE YOU WERE THERE?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. HOW MANY DRINKS DID YOU HAVE WHILE YOU WERE  
25 THERE?

CROSS - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY MR. MELLARD

600

1 A. APPROXIMATELY THREE OR FOUR.

2 Q. THREE OR FOUR, WHAT DO YOU USUALLY DRINK?

3 A. BEER.

4 Q. BEER? YOU HAD THREE OR FOUR BEERS.

5 MR. MELLARD: ALRIGHT. THAT'S ALL THE QUESTIONS  
6 I HAVE.

7 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. MELLARD.

8 MR. KOGER.

9 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
10 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
11 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
12 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
13 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY MR. KOGER

601

1

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF MONEAK R. BUSBY

2

BY MR. KOGER:

3

Q. MS. BUSBY, WERE YOU EMPLOYED AT THE TIME?

4

A. NO, SIR.

5

Q. OKAY. SO, YOU DIDN'T WORK ON THAT PARTICULAR

6

FRIDAY, CORRECT?

7

A. NO, SIR.

8

Q. NOW, YOU JUST TESTIFIED TO HAVING THREE OR FOR

9

BEERS WHILE YOU WAS AT THE BAR?

10

A. YES, SIR.

11

Q. OKAY. HOW ABOUT BETWEEN THE TIME FRAME OF

12

SEVEN:THIRTY AND NINE:THIRTY, HOW MANY BEERS DID

13

YOU HAVE?

14

A. PROBABLY TWO.

15

Q. TWO. OKAY, NOW, BEFORE YOU GOT TO THE CORNER

16

POCKET ON THAT PARTICULAR DAY, YOU SAY YOU DON'T

17

WORK, DID YOU HAVE ANY TYPE OF DRINKS AT HOME OR

18

ANYTHING?

19

A. NO, SIR.

20

Q. DID YOU HAVE ANY WEED ON THAT PARTICULAR DAY?

21

A. NO, SIR.

22

Q. OKAY. SO, YOUR TESTIMONY IS THAT THE TOTAL TIME

23

YOU HAD THREE OR FOUR BEERS?

24

A. YES, SIR.

25

Q. AND AT THE TIME THAT YOU ARRIVED BETWEEN

1 SEVEN:THIRTY AND EIGHT:THIRTY YOU HAD AT LEAST  
2 TWO BEERS BUT IT COULD HAVE BEEN MORE?

3 A. I SAID, ONLY TWO.

4 Q. ONLY TWO.

5 A. BECAUSE I ONLY HAD FOUR THE WHOLE TIME I WAS  
6 THERE.

7 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT WERE THE OUNCES OF THOSE BEERS?

8 A. IT WAS TWELVE OUNCE CAN.

9 Q. A LITTLE TWELVE OUNCE CAN?

10 A. UH-HUH.

11 Q. OKAY, TWO OF THEM.

12 A. I HAD FOUR -- YEAH, TWO AT THAT TIME.

13 Q. OKAY. BUT FOUR TOTAL?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU. NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

16 THE COURT: ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

17 SOLICITOR SORENSON; JUST REAL BRIEFLY, YOUR  
18 HONOR.

19 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
20 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
21 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
22 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
23 sequential continuation of record.)

REDIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

603

1 REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF MONEAK R. BUSBY

2 BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

3 Q. MR. MELLARD ASKED YOU A WHOLE BUNCH OF QUESTIONS  
4 ABOUT YOUR STATEMENT, IS THAT CORRECT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IS THERE ANY OBJECTION TO  
7 PUTTING HER STATEMENT INTO EVIDENCE?

8 MR. MELLARD: I WOULD OBJECT TO IT. SHE CAN  
9 TESTIFY TO ANYTHING SHE WANTS TO RIGHT NOW.

10 THE COURT: JUST ASK HER QUESTIONS.

11 SOLICITOR SORENSON: COULD I JUST MARK THIS FOR  
12 ID?

13 COURT REPORTER: STATE'S EIGHT, ID?

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I BELIEVE THAT'S CORRECT.

15 (State's Exhibit Eighty,  
16 Statement of Moneak R. Busby,  
17 marked for identification only.)

18 THE COURT: WHAT NUMBER IS THAT?

19 COURT REPORTER: THAT WOULD BE NUMBER EIGHTY,  
20 STATE'S EIGHTY.

21 THE COURT: NUMBER EIGHTY FOR ID.

22 SOLICITOR SORENSON: FOR ID, YES, SIR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY.

24 Q. I WANT YOU TO LOOK AT THAT, AND I'LL GET A COPY  
25 HERE. THAT WOULD BE STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER

1 EIGHTY, IS THAT THE STATEMENT YOU GAVE TO  
2 LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. --- BACK IN, ON MARCH TWENTY-SIX?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. IS THAT CORRECT?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. AND AS FAR AS GOING OVER -- MR. MELLARD ASKED  
9 YOU, YOU KNOW, ABOUT A BUNCH OF TIMES, IS THAT  
10 CORRECT?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. ALRIGHT. IS THAT, DOES YOUR STATEMENT INDICATE  
13 THAT YOU GOT THERE ABOUT SEVEN:THIRTY, IS THAT  
14 CORRECT?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND IT ALSO INDICATES THAT POKEY LEFT ABOUT  
17 NINE:TWENTY, YOU PUT THAT AS FAR AS TIMES IN YOUR  
18 STATEMENT?

19 A. HE WAS OUT OF MY EYE SIGHT AROUND THAT TIME.

20 Q. OKAY. BUT IN THE FRONT PART OF YOUR STATEMENT IN  
21 THAT PARAGRAPH YOU DID INDICATE THAT HE LEFT AT  
22 ABOUT NINE:TWENTY, IS THAT CORRECT?

23 A. FROM AROUND ME, YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. AND STAYED -- AND IT SAYS, AND STAYED FOR  
25 ABOUT FORTY-FIVE MINUTES TO AN HOUR?

REDIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

605

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. AND THAT WOULD BE POKEY YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT,  
3 RIGHT?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. OKAY. AND THAT YOU LEFT THE CLUB ABOUT  
6 ELEVEN:TWENTY, RIGHT?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S WHAT YOU TOLD LIEUTENANT  
9 SHUMPERT BACK IN MARCH, RIGHT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AND THEN JUST AS FAR AS TIMES, EVEN FARTHER DOWN,  
12 HE ASKED YOU ABOUT WHAT TIME YOU SAW THEM BOYS AT  
13 THE DOOR, IS THAT CORRECT?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND WHAT TIME WAS THAT THAT YOU INDICATED? THAT  
16 WOULD BE MID-WAY DOWN THE FRONT PAGE.

17 A. ABOUT NINE:TWENTY-FIVE.

18 Q. AND THEN THE NEXT QUESTION, DID POKEY LEAVE WITH  
19 THEM BOYS YOU PICKED OUT OF THE PHOTO LINEUP?  
20 AND WHAT WAS YOUR ANSWER TO THAT?

21 A. YES.

22 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S WHAT YOU TOLD LIEUTENANT  
23 SHUMPERT BACK IN MARCH, RIGHT?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. SO, THAT HE HAD LEFT WITH THEM ABOUT NINE:TWENTY-

REDIRECT - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY SOL. SORENSON

606

1 FIVE, AND WAS GONE ABOUT FORTY-FIVE MINUTES TO AN  
2 HOUR?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. AND THAT'S WHAT YOU PUT IN YOUR STATEMENT, IS  
5 THAT CORRECT?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. IT WAS OBVIOUSLY FRESHER IN YOUR MIND BACK IN  
8 MARCH, IS THAT CORRECT?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, MONEAK.

11 THE COURT: ANYTHING ON RECROSS, MR. LACKEY?

12 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

13 THE COURT: MS. ULLMAN?

14 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

15 THE COURT; MR. PALMER?

16 MR. PALMER: NO, SIR.

17 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD?

18 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
19 part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
20 testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
21 testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
22 ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

RE CROSS - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY MR. MELLARD

607

RE CROSS-EXAMINATION OF MONEAK R. BUSBY

BY MR. MELLARD:

Q. YOU SAID IN YOUR STATEMENT THAT HE LEFT WITH  
THOSE PEOPLE?

A. SIR, I DIDN'T SEE HIM LEFT, BUT THEY WAS LOOKING  
FOR HIM IN THE CLUB?

Q. OKAY. SO, YOU DIDN'T SEE HIM LEAVE?

A. NO, SIR.

MR. MELLARD; OKAY. THANK YOU.

THE COURT: MR. KOGER?

(NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

RE-CROSS - MONEAK R. BUSBY BY MR. KOGER

608

1

RE-CROSS-EXAMINATION OF MONEAK R. BUSBY

2

BY MR. KOGER:

3

Q. MR. BUSBY, YOU JUST WENT OVER THE STATEMENT WITH SOLICITOR SORENSON. THIS STATEMENT IS A TRUE AND AN ACCURATE DEPICTION OF WHAT HAPPENED ON THAT PARTICULAR NIGHT?

4

5

6

7

A. YES, SIR.

8

Q. OKAY. IS THERE ANY INDICATION THAT YOU HAD BEEN DRINKING ON THAT PARTICULAR NIGHT IN YOUR STATEMENT?

9

10

11

A. NO, SIR.

12

Q. AND YOU DID NOT PUT THAT IN YOUR STATEMENT?

13

A. WHAT I PUT ON THE PAPER, THAT'S WHAT I PUT ON THE STATEMENT.

14

15

Q. BUT THE STATEMENT DOES NOT HAVE THAT YOU WERE DRINKING ON THAT PARTICULAR NIGHT, CORRECT?

16

17

A. NO, SIR.

18

MR. KOGER: THANK YOU.

19

THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU, MS. BUSBY. YOU ARE NOW EXCUSED. THANK YOU, MA'AM.

20

ALRIGHT, DOES THE STATE CALL THEIR NEXT WITNESS?

21

SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR, THE STATE CALLS

22

YVONNE SHARPERSON.

23

(Whereupon, the witness

24

enters the courtroom.)

25

1           CLERK: MA'AM, PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE  
2           -- LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.  
3           (Whereupon, Yvonne Sharperson  
4           is duly sworn.)

5           CLERK: OKAY. HAVE YOU A SEAT AND STATE YOUR  
6           FULL NAME FOR THE COURT.

7           WITNESS: YVONNE SHARPERSON.

8           (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
9           part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
10          testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
11          testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
12          ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - YVONNE SHARPERSON BY SOL. SORENSON

610

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF YVONNE SHARPERSON

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

1 Q. I GUESS IT'S TECHNICALLY NOW AFTERNOON, SO GOOD  
2 AFTERNOON, MS. SHARPERSON. HOW ARE YOU TODAY?

3 A. ALRIGHT.

4 Q. ALRIGHT, IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY, YOU'RE  
5 FROM HERE IN ORANGEBURG?

6 A. ORANGEBURG, SOUTH CAROLINA.

7 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU GROW UP HERE, DID YOU GROW UP  
8 HERE IN ORANGEBURG?

9 A. YES.

10 Q. OKAY. I'M GOING TO TURN YOUR ATTENTION, GOING  
11 BACK TO THE NIGHT, FRIDAY NIGHT, MARCH THE  
12 TWELFTH, OF THIS YEAR, OKAY, DO YOU REMEMBER THAT  
13 EVENING?

14 A. YES.

15 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE DID YOU GO THAT NIGHT?

16 A. TO THE CORNER POCKET.

17 Q. OKAY. AND THE CORNER POCKET WE'VE HEARD  
18 TESTIMONY IS A LITTLE KIND OF POOL HALL OVER ON  
19 STILTON?

20 A. YES.

21 Q. IS THAT CORRECT?

22 A. UH-HUH.

23 Q. THE CORNER POCKET, STATE'S THIRTY?  
24  
25

DIRECT - YVONNE SHARPERSON BY SOL. SORENSON

611

- 1 A. UH-HUH.
- 2 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHO DID YOU GO TO THE CORNER POCKET
- 3 WITH THAT NIGHT, YVONNE?
- 4 A. ME, MONEAK, SHAUN AND KIVA.
- 5 Q. OKAY. AND MONEAK IS THE YOUNG LADY THAT JUST
- 6 TESTIFIED, CORRECT?
- 7 A. THAT'S RIGHT.
- 8 Q. AND KIVA IS MAKIVA, IS THAT RIGHT?
- 9 A. UH-HUH.
- 10 Q. AND IS SHE RELATED TO ONE OF THE DEFENDANTS OVER
- 11 HERE ON THE PEW?
- 12 A. YES.
- 13 Q. WHO IS SHE RELATED TO?
- 14 A. POKEY.
- 15 Q. AND THAT'S MR. RYANT?
- 16 A. I GUESS THAT'S HIS REAL NAME, I JUST KNOW HIM BY
- 17 POKEY.
- 18 Q. OKAY. AND HE WOULD BE THE SECOND FROM THE END?
- 19 A. YES.
- 20 Q. OKAY. AND HOW IS KIVA RELATED TO POKEY?
- 21 A. THAT'S HIS MOTHER.
- 22 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND HOW ABOUT SHAUN, IS SHE
- 23 RELATED TO POKEY?
- 24 A. THAT'S HIS AUNT.
- 25 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU, ARE YOU RELATED TO

DIRECT - YVONNE SHARPERSON BY SOL. SORENSON

612

1 HIM?

2 A. NO.

3 Q. OKAY. ARE YOU AWARE OF WHETHER MONEAK IS RELATED  
4 TO MR. RYANT?

5 A. NOT THAT I KNOW OF.

6 Q. NOT THAT YOU KNOW OF. OKAY. NOW, THAT NIGHT, DO  
7 YOU KNOW ABOUT WHAT TIME YOU GOT TO THE CORNER  
8 POCKET THAT NIGHT?

9 A. BETWEEN, EXACTLY EIGHT:THIRTY AND NINE O'CLOCK.

10 MR. MELLARD: I'M SORRY, I CAN'T HEAR HER.

11 THE COURT: WOULD YOU PLEASE - - -

12 A. BETWEEN EIGHT:THIRTY AND NINE O'CLOCK.

13 Q. AND HOW DID YOU GET THERE?

14 A. KIVA CAME AND PICKED ME, MONEAK AND SHAUN UP.

15 Q. OKAY. AND SHE WAS DRIVING ALL OF Y'ALL?

16 A. YES.

17 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN YOU GOT THERE THAT NIGHT DID YOU  
18 SEE POKEY THERE?

19 A. YEAH, HE WAS THERE.

20 Q. AND WHAT WAS HE DOING WHEN YOU SAW HIM THERE?

21 A. HE WAS EATING WHEN I SAW HIM.

22 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU KEEP UP WITH HIM THE REST OF  
23 THE NIGHT WHEN YOU WERE THERE?

24 A. I, THE ONLY THING I DID WAS SAW HIM THE SECOND  
25 TIME AT THE POOL, BY THE POOL ROOM. AFTER THAT,

DIRECT - YVONNE SHARPERSON BY SOL. SORENSON

613

1 ONCE I GET MY DRINKS I DON'T WATCH NOBODY ELSE IN  
2 THE CLUB.

3 Q. OKAY. NOW, DID THERE COME A TIME THAT NIGHT, MS.  
4 SHARPERSON, WHEN ANY OF POKEY'S FAMILY WAS  
5 LOOKING FOR HIM?

6 A. HIS MAMA ASKED ME TO ASK HIS SISTER TO TELL, TO  
7 CALL HIS PHONE BUT HE DIDN'T PICK UP.

8 Q. OKAY. SO, THEY WERE HAVING, COULDN'T FIND HIM AT  
9 THAT POINT IN TIME?

10 A. HE COULD HAVE STILL BEEN IN THE CLUB AS FAR AS I  
11 KNOW, BECAUSE HE WAS BY THE POOL TABLE THE LAST  
12 TIME I SAW HIM.

13 Q. OKAY. BUT YOU DIDN'T ACTUALLY, WHEN THEY WERE  
14 LOOKING FOR HIM YOU DIDN'T PHYSICALLY LAY EYES ON  
15 HIM AT THAT TIME, DID YOU? ARE YOU AWARE OF  
16 WHETHER THEY WERE ABLE TO GET IN TOUCH WITH HIM  
17 AT THAT TIME WHEN THEY WERE LOOKING FOR HIM?

18 A. I DON'T KNOW BECAUSE ABOUT A COUPLE OF MINUTES  
19 LATER I LEFT.

20 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU LEFT A SHORT TIME AFTER THAT?

21 A. YES.

22 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT TIME WAS IT THAT YOU LEFT THAT  
23 NIGHT?

24 A. ABOUT NINE:THIRTY, BETWEEN NINE:THIRTY AND TEN.

25 Q. OKAY. SO, IT WOULD HAVE BEEN SHORTLY BEFORE

DIRECT - YVONNE SHARPERSON BY SOL. SORENSON

614

1 NINE:THIRTY OR TEN THAT HIS SISTER AND MOTHER  
2 WERE LOOKING FOR HIM, IS THAT CORRECT? YOU SAID  
3 YOU LEFT A SHORT TIME AFTER THAT, SO ...

4 A. I LEFT, IT COULD HAVE BEEN, BETWEEN NINE:THIRTY,  
5 SOMETHING LIKE THAT.

6 Q. OKAY. SOMEWHERE, GIVE OR TAKE, A FEW MINUTES  
7 AROUND THAT TIME, THOUGH, IS THAT CORRECT?

8 A. UH-HUH.

9 Q. ALRIGHT. AND DID YOU LEAVE -- WHO DID YOU LEAVE  
10 WITH THAT NIGHT?

11 A. HIS AUNT SHAUN.

12 Q. AND AFTER SEEING HIM KIND OF EARLIER THAT NIGHT  
13 DID YOU EVER -- WELL, LET ME KIND OF BACK UP,  
14 ERASE THAT. AFTER THE TIME WHEN HIS SISTER AND  
15 MOTHER WERE LOOKING FOR POKEY, DID YOU EVER SEE  
16 HIM AGAIN THAT NIGHT?

17 A. AS OF, BEFORE I LEFT THE CLUB?

18 Q. BEFORE YOU LEFT THE CLUB?

19 A. NO.

20 Q. OKAY.

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANKS, YVONNE, PLEASE  
22 ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THE DEFENDANTS HAVE.

23 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY.

24 MR. LACKEY: I HAVE NONE, YOUR HONOR.

25 THE COURT: MS. ULLMAN?

1

MS. ULLMAN: NO QUESTIONS.

2

MR. PALMER: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

3

THE COURT: OKAY. MR. MELLARD.

4

(NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any

5

part of record has been omitted. Headers on

6

testimony pages and hard page breaks between

7

testimony are now required by the Court. See next

8

ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - YVONNE SHARPERSON BY MR. MELLARD

616

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF YVONNE SHARPERSON

BY MR. MELLARD:

Q. JUST ONE THING. WHEN YOU SAID YOU WERE, THEY  
ASKED YOU ABOUT, I BELIEVE, PEOPLE LOOKING FOR  
HIM, I BELIEVE YOU TESTIFIED AS FAR AS YOU KNEW  
HE COULD HAVE STILL BEEN IN THE CLUB?

A. HE COULD HAVE STILL BEEN IN, I NEVER CHECKED THE  
BATHROOM OR THE BACK AFTER I CAME TO THE FRONT.

MR. MELLARD: OKAY. THANK YOU.

THE COURT: OKAY, MR. KOGER?

MR. KOGER: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

SOLICITOR SORENSON: I DON'T THINK SO, NO, SIR.

THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, MS. SHARPERSON, YOU  
MAY STEP DOWN.

CALL YOUR NEXT WITNESS.

SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, MAY WE APPROACH?

THE COURT: SURE.

(Whereupon, a bench conference  
is had out of the hearing of  
the jury and court reporter.)

THE COURT: OKAY. YOU KNOW, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,  
I TOLD Y'ALL BEFORE WE STARTED THE TRIAL THAT EVERY  
NOW AND THEN I'D HAVE TO TALK TO THE ATTORNEYS, YOU  
KNOW, AND Y'ALL WOULDN'T GET TO HEAR WHAT WE'RE

1 TALKING ABOUT. SOMETIMES IT WAS MATTERS OF LAW AND  
2 LIKE THAT. THIS TIME IT'S A MATTER OF FOOD. WE  
3 VOTED AND DECIDED WE WERE GOING TO TAKE A BREAK FOR  
4 LUNCH NOW.

5 OKAY, NOW, Y'ALL NEED TO REMEMBER WHAT I HAVE  
6 TOLD Y'ALL SINCE THE VERY BEGINNING, BEFORE YOU EVEN  
7 GOT SWORN IN AS JURORS. YOU HAVE NOT HEARD ALL THE  
8 EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE, YOU CANNOT BEGIN TALKING ABOUT  
9 ANYTHING ABOUT THIS CASE RIGHT NOW. OKAY? SO, I AM  
10 GOING TO EXCUSE Y'ALL AND LET Y'ALL GO TO LUNCH, YOU  
11 KNOW, DON'T TALK ABOUT THE CASE, DON'T READ, LOOK AT  
12 ANYTHING, AND I'M GOING TO ASK Y'ALL TO BE BACK IN  
13 THE JURY ROOM AT ONE:THIRTY.

14 WHEN YOU GET BACK INTO THE JURY ROOM WHAT I WANT  
15 YOU TO DO, THE TWELVE OF YOU THAT ARE JURORS, AND  
16 MADAM ALTERNATE, YOU DON'T NEED TO WORRY ABOUT THIS,  
17 YOU CAN BE IN THERE, BUT I WANT THE TWELVE OF Y'ALL  
18 TO PICK SOMEBODY TO BE THE FOREMAN OF THIS JURY. THE  
19 FOREMAN OF THE JURY GETS TO SIT IN THAT SEAT RIGHT  
20 THERE CLOSEST TO ME. OKAY? NOW, LET ME TELL YOU  
21 WHAT'S IMPORTANT ABOUT BEING THE FOREMAN OF THE JURY.  
22 WHEN I TELL Y'ALL THAT Y'ALL ARE GOING TO BEGIN  
23 DELIBERATIONS THE FOREMAN OF THE JURY IS GOING TO BE  
24 IN CHARGE OF MAKING SURE EVERYBODY HAS SOME FEEDBACK  
25 INTO THE DELIBERATIONS. THEY WILL PRESIDE OVER THE

1 JURY ROOM AND THEY'RE THE ONE THAT'S GOING TO SIGN  
2 THE VERDICT FORMS. OKAY? SO, WHEN Y'ALL GET BACK  
3 INTO THE JURY ROOM AT ONE:THIRTY I WANT Y'ALL TO VOTE  
4 ON SOMEBODY TO BE THE FOREMAN FOR Y'ALL'S JURY.  
5 Y'ALL HAVE BEEN WITH EACH OTHER NOW FOR TWO AND A  
6 HALF DAYS, SO Y'ALL HAVE GOT A GOOD IDEA OF WHAT  
7 EVERYONE OF Y'ALL IS LIKE, SO IF Y'ALL WILL LET ME  
8 KNOW WHEN Y'ALL GET FROM LUNCH. OKAY?

9 NOW, GO HAVE A GOOD LUNCH, AND DON'T TALK ABOUT  
10 THE CASE.

11 THANK YOU.

12 (Whereupon, the jury leaves  
13 the courtroom and the following  
14 takes place out of the presence  
15 of the jury.)

16 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING FROM THE STATE  
17 BEFORE WE TAKE A BREAK?

18 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, SIR.

19 THE COURT: ANYTHING FROM ANY OF THE DEFENDANTS  
20 BEFORE WE TAKE A BREAK?

21 MR. LACKEY: NO, YOUR HONOR.

22 MS. ULLMAN: NO, YOUR HONOR.

23 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

24 MR. MELLARD: NO, YOUR HONOR.

25 MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

1           THE COURT:   ALRIGHT.

2           COURT REPORTER:   JUDGE, EXCUSE ME, - - -

3           THE COURT:   HAVE I ASKED HER?

4           COURT REPORTER:   NO, SIR.

5           THE COURT:   OKAY, MS. WALKER, WHAT HAVE YOU GOT  
6 TO SAY?

7           COURT REPORTER:   I FORGOT.   DO YOU WANT THIS  
8 COURTROOM LOCKED WITH THE EXHIBITS OUT LIKE THIS?

9           THE COURT:   YES, MA'AM.   WE'LL LOCK THE  
10 COURTROOM.   THANK YOU, MA'AM, FOR REMINDING ME OF  
11 THAT.

12          COURT REPORTER:   YOU'RE WELCOME.

13          THE COURT:   SHE COMES IN VERY HELPFUL, Y'ALL, YOU  
14 KNOW, SHE REALLY DOES.

15                 ALRIGHT, WE'RE GOING TO BE IN RECESS UNTIL  
16 ONE:THIRTY.   OKAY?   AND IF Y'ALL WILL SECURE THE  
17 COURTROOM.

18                                 (Recess)

19          THE COURT:   HAVE THEY ELECTED A FOREPERSON?

20          BAILIFF:   I'LL FIND OUT.

21          THE COURT:   WELL, WE CAN FIND OUT LATER.   OH, MS.  
22 JACKSON, AS A RETIRED TEACHER I DON'T EXPECT YOU TO  
23 FORGET ANYTHING.

24          BAILIFF:   I'VE GOT A LOT ON MY MIND.

25          THE COURT:   YES, MA'AM, I UNDERSTAND.

1 BEAR WITH US WHILE WE FIND OUT WHO THE FOREPERSON  
2 IS.

3 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, I TOLD MS.  
4 WALKER THAT I MARKED SEVERAL EXHIBITS, I THINK IT'S  
5 ELEVEN DIFFERENT BULLET FRAGMENTS, BULLETS OR BULLET  
6 FRAGMENTS THAT WERE REMOVED DURING THE AUTOPSY, AND  
7 ALSO A BODY DIAGRAM. I'VE MARKED THEM BASICALLY AS  
8 STATE'S EIGHTY-ONE THROUGH NINETY-ONE ON THE  
9 FRAGMENTS, AND NINETY-TWO, IT'S A DIAGRAM. I'VE  
10 SHOWN THEM TO ALL FIVE DEFENSE COUNSEL.

11 COURT REPORTER: BUT JUDGE, I HAVEN'T HAD TIME TO  
12 MARK THOSE ON MY EXHIBIT SHEET.

13 THE COURT: YOU HAVEN'T? OKAY.

14 COURT REPORTER: WILL YOU WAIT UNTIL I DO THAT?

15 THE COURT: YES, MA'AM, I WILL

16 COURT REPORTER: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU.

17 (State's Exhibits Eighty-one through Ninety-one,  
18 bullets and bullet fragments,  
19 marked for identification.)

20 (State's Exhibit Ninety-two,  
21 body diagram,  
22 marked for identification.)

23 THE COURT: OKAY, BRING THE JURY IN.

24 (Whereupon, the jury enters  
25 the courtroom.)

1           THE COURT: OKAY, WE'RE READY TO RESUME. MS.  
2 WILLIAMS, CONGRATULATIONS.

3           JURY FOREMAN: THANK YOU.

4 (Court's Exhibit 2  
5 marked and filed.)

6           THE COURT: ALRIGHT, IS THE STATE READY?

7           SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

8           THE COURT: OKAY.

9           SOLICITOR SORENSON: THE STATE CALLS DR. JANICE  
10 ROSS.

11          THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

12          CLERK: PLEASE PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE  
13 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.  
14 (Whereupon, Dr. Janice Edwards Ross  
15 is duly sworn.)

16          CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE OUR FULL NAME FOR  
17 THE COURT.

18          WITNESS: JANICE EDWARDS ROSS, R-O-S-S.

19 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
20 part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
21 testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
22 testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
23 ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

622

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DR. JANICE E. ROSS

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

Q. GOOD AFTERNOON, DR. ROSS.

A. GOOD AFTERNOON.

Q. IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY WHERE YOU'RE  
EMPLOYED?

A. IN NEWBERRY, SOUTH CAROLINA, WITH THE NEWBERRY  
PATHOLOGY ASSOCIATES.

Q. AND WHAT DO YOU DO AT NEWBERRY PATHOLOGY  
ASSOCIATES?

A. WE DO PATHOLOGY EXAMINATIONS FOR THE HOSPITAL AND  
WE DO FORENSIC AUTOPSIES FOR CORNERS AROUND THE  
COUNTIES OF THE STATE.

Q. OKAY. AND IF YOU WOULD, JUST TELL THE JURY JUST  
BRIEFLY YOUR EDUCATIONAL BACKGROUND?

A. YES. I HAVE A BACHELOR'S DEGREE FROM THE  
UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA, MY MB FROM UPSTATE  
MEDICAL CENTER IN SYRACUSE, NEW YORK, AND I'VE  
DONE TRAINING IN HOSPITAL PATHOLOGY AND FORENSIC  
PATHOLOGY TO BECOME BOARD CERTIFIED IN THREE  
AREAS OF PATHOLOGY.

Q. OKAY. AND THEN, KIND OF AFTER YOUR EDUCATION  
THEN, WHAT'S BEEN YOUR WORK HISTORY?

A. AFTERWARD I'VE BEEN HOSPITAL PATHOLOGIST PLUS A  
FORENSIC PATHOLOGIST DOING AUTOPSIES FOR CORONERS

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

623

1 OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK AND IN THE STATE OF  
2 SOUTH CAROLINA. I'VE BEEN A CORONER MYSELF AND A  
3 CHIEF MEDICAL EXAMINER.

4 Q. OKAY. AND SPECIFICALLY IN YOUR CURRENT POSITION  
5 WITH NEWBERRY PATHOLOGY ASSOCIATES, HOW LONG HAVE  
6 YOU BEEN THERE?

7 A. TEN YEARS.

8 Q. OKAY. AND YOU CURRENTLY, HOW MANY OTHER  
9 PATHOLOGISTS ARE CURRENTLY WORKING WITH YOU THERE  
10 NOW?

11 A. ONE.

12 Q. ALRIGHT. AND OVER THE LAST TEN YEARS DO YOU HAVE  
13 ANY IDEA APPROXIMATELY HOW MANY AUTOPSIES YOU'VE  
14 PERFORMED?

15 A. OVER THE LAST TEN YEARS?

16 Q. YES, MA'AM.

17 A. THREE THOUSAND.

18 Q. OKAY. HAVE YOU HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO COME INTO  
19 COURT AND TESTIFY BEFORE ABOUT YOUR FINDINGS?

20 A. YES.

21 Q. YOU'VE BEEN QUALIFIED AS AN EXPERT IN THE FIELD  
22 OF FORENSIC PATHOLOGY ON THOSE OCCASIONS?

23 A. YES.

24 Q. AND YOU'VE TESTIFIED IN THIS VERY COURTROOM  
25 MULTIPLE TIMES, HAVE YOU NOT?

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

624

1 A. YES.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OKAY. YOUR HONOR, AT THIS  
3 TIME WE'D OFFER DR. ROSS AS AN EXPERT IN THE FIELD OF  
4 FORENSIC PATHOLOGY.

5 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION FROM ANY OF THE  
6 DEFENDANTS?

7 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

8 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

9 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

10 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

11 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. SHE IS NOTED AS AN EXPERT  
13 IN FORENSIC PATHOLOGY.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

15 Q. ALRIGHT, DR. ROSS, IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY  
16 JUST WHAT AN AUTOPSY CONSISTS OF?

17 A. YES. WHEN WE DO AN AUTOPSY IT'S IN THE MORGUE OF  
18 NEWBERRY COUNTY MEMORIAL HOSPITAL. THE BODY IS  
19 BROUGHT TO US AND WE LOOK AT THE BODY EXTERNALLY,  
20 INCLUDING THE CLOTHING, AND DO INVENTORY,  
21 PHOTOGRAPHS, AND THEN WE, OF COURSE, LOOK AT THE  
22 BODY NUDE, LOOKING FOR INJURIES AND EVIDENCE OF  
23 DISEASES, AND WE DO A SPECIFIC TYPE OF INTERNAL  
24 EXAMINATION LOOKING AT EACH ORGAN TO IDENTIFY  
25 PATTERNS OF INJURY OR ANY DISEASES.

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

625

1 Q. AND SPECIFICALLY IN THIS CASE DID YOU HAVE THE  
2 OCCASION BACK ON THE MORNING OF MARCH THE  
3 THIRTEENTH OF THIS YEAR TO PERFORM AN AUTOPSY ON  
4 A CHARLES PRINGLE?

5 A. YES.

6 Q. OKAY. AND HOW OLD WAS MR. PRINGLE AT THE TIME OF  
7 HIS DEATH?

8 A. THIRTY-EIGHT.

9 Q. AND IF YOU WOULD, DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHEN, HOW  
10 MR. PRINGLE PRESENTED TO YOU IN NEWBERRY?

11 A. HE PRESENTED IN CLOTHING AND, WHICH WE  
12 PHOTOGRAPHED AND INVENTORIED.

13 Q. OKAY. DID HE HAVE ANY OTHER, AS FAR AS HIS HEAD  
14 AREA, ANY OTHER ITEMS THAT WAS KIND OF UNUSUAL  
15 OR OUT OF THE ORDINARY?

16 A. YES, HE HAD GRAY DUCT TAPE AROUND HIS MOUTH AND  
17 AROUND HIS HEAD.

18 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT, IF ANYTHING, DID YOU DO WITH  
19 THAT DUCT TAPE, MA'AM?

20 A. WE CAREFULLY REMOVED IT AND PLACED IT IN A BAG  
21 FOR INVESTIGATORS TO TAKE TO SLED.

22 Q. OKAY. AND IT WAS TURNED OVER TO LIEUTENANT  
23 CARTER WITH THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

24 A. YES.

25 Q. OKAY. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

626

1 EIGHT, OBVIOUSLY, THAT'S AT THE SCENE, BUT IS  
2 THAT BASICALLY HOW MR. PRINGLE PRESENTED TO YOU  
3 AT THE NEWBERRY MORGUE?

4 A. YES.

5 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WOULD BE THE DUCT TAPE THERE THAT  
6 YOU COLLECTED AND TURNED OVER TO LIEUTENANT  
7 CARTER?

8 A. YES.

9 Q. GOING ON FROM THERE YOU HAD AN OPPORTUNITY, I  
10 GUESS, TO REMOVE MR. PRINGLE'S CLOTHING?

11 A. YES.

12 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT -- WHEN YOU DID YOU THEN KIND OF  
13 DID AN INITIAL PHYSICAL EXTERNAL EXAM, AND WHAT  
14 WERE YOU FINDINGS AT THAT TIME, MA'AM?

15 A. WE FOUND A TOTAL OF TWENTY-FOUR GUN SHOT WOUNDS  
16 TO THE BODY, TORSO AND ARMS AND LEGS.

17 Q. AND DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A KIND  
18 OF A LITTLE BODY DIAGRAM TO KIND OF LAY OUT THE  
19 LOCATIONS OF THOSE WOUNDS AND DIRECTION OF  
20 TRAVEL?

21 A. YES.

22 Q. OKAY. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT  
23 NINETY-THREE, I'M SORRY, NINETY-TWO, IS THAT AN  
24 ENLARGEMENT OF THE DIAGRAM THAT YOU PREPARED,  
25 MA'AM?

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

627

1 A. YES, IT IS.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
3 WE'D OFFER STATE'S NINETY-TWO INTO EVIDENCE.

4 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

5 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

6 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

7 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

8 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

9 THE COURT: IT IS ADMITTED WITHOUT OBJECTION.

10 COURT REPORTER: WHAT NUMBER? THAT WAS NINETY-  
11 TWO?

12 THE COURT: NINETY-TWO.

13 (State's Exhibit Ninety-two  
14 marked and filed.)

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: CAN I GET DR. ROSS TO STEP  
16 DOWN, YOUR HONOR?

17 THE COURT: YES.

18 Q. LET ME PUT THIS OVER HERE AND I WANT YOU TO STEP  
19 AROUND, WE DON'T HAVE A HIGH TECH POINTER, BUT WE  
20 HAVE A ...

21 A. THANK YOU.

22 Q. IF YOU COULD, DR. ROSS, JUST KIND OF GO THROUGH  
23 FOR THE JURY, AND OBVIOUSLY, I NEED YOU TO KEEP  
24 YOUR VOICE UP NICE AND LOUD SO THAT NOT ONLY MS.  
25 WALKER BUT ALSO DEFENSE COUNSEL HEAR YOU, AND

1           KIND OF TELL THE JURY WHAT THEY'RE LOOKING AT  
2           THERE?

3           A.   YES.  THIS IS BASICALLY A DIAGRAM, NOT ACCURATE  
4           TO THE CENTIMETER, BUT IT SHOWS THE ROUND CIRCLES  
5           OR ENTRANCE WOUNDS OF BULLETS, AND THE LITTLE  
6           SQUIGGLY CIRCLES, ALMOST LIKE STARS THAT ARE EXIT  
7           WOUNDS.  AND YOU CAN SEE THAT THERE ARE A NUMBER  
8           OF ENTRANCE WOUNDS GOING INTO THE LEFT ARM, TWO  
9           BULLETS I THINK WERE LEFT IN THE ARM, WE FOUND  
10          THOSE.  ONE WENT THROUGH THE ARM THEN ENTERED THE  
11          CHEST.  THERE ARE A TOTAL OF FOUR OTHER WOUNDS IN  
12          THE CHEST.  THERE ARE, THIS WOUND IN THE ABDOMEN,  
13          I THINK SEVEN, OR FIVE IN THE BACK.  THERE'S A  
14          TOTAL OF TWENTY-FOUR, BUT THE, THERE ARE ALSO  
15          ARROWS HERE SHOWING THE DIRECTION OF THE BULLETS.  
16          SO, SOME OF THEM ARE GOING LEFT TO RIGHT, SOME  
17          ARE GOING RIGHT TO LEFT, SOME ARE GOING FROM  
18          FRONT TO BACK.  THIS IS AN ENTRANCE WOUND IN THE  
19          CHEST THAT COMES OUT THE BACK.  SOME ARE GOING  
20          FROM BACK TO FRONT, SOME ARE GOING FROM THE  
21          ABDOMEN DOWNWARD.  THIS ONE IN THE FOOT IS GOING  
22          FROM RIGHT TO LEFT AND THEN ACROSS THE TOP OF THE  
23          LEFT FOOT.  SO, THERE ARE BULLETS GOING DIFFERENT  
24          PATHS.

25          Q.  OKAY.  AND ALSO I NOTICE, IS THAT AN INJURY TO

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

629

1 MR. PRINGLE'S - - -

2 A. YES, IT IS.

3 Q. --- I GUESS THE BACK OF HIS RIGHT KNEE?

4 A. THE BACK OF THE RIGHT KNEE WAS A LARGE GAPING  
5 WOUND CAUSED BY A GRAZE WOUND. THE BULLET JUST  
6 GRAZED THE TOP OF THE SKIN AND DIDN'T GO  
7 UNDERNEATH.

8 Q. THANK YOU, DR. ROSS. NOW, YOU MADE REFERENCE TO  
9 THIS IN YOUR TESTIMONY RIGHT THERE, DID YOU HAVE  
10 AN OPPORTUNITY THEN, DR. ROSS, TO, TO KIND OF  
11 ALSO DO AN INTERNAL EXAM IN AN ATTEMPT TO LOCATE  
12 ANY EVIDENCE -- YOU INDICATED SOME OF THEM WERE  
13 AND ENTRANCE WOUND AND AN EXIT WOUND, BUT SOME OF  
14 THEM THERE WAS NO EXIT WOUND?

15 A. CORRECT.

16 Q. DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY THEN TO DO AN  
17 INTERNAL EXAM IN AN ATTEMPT TO FIND ANY PHYSICAL  
18 EVIDENCE WITHIN MR. PRINGLE?

19 A. YES, I DID AN INTERNAL EXAM ASSISTED BY X-RAYS TO  
20 SHOW WHERE BULLETS WERE LOCATED. WE FOUND A LOT  
21 OF INJURIES TO DIFFERENT ORGANS OF THE BODY FROM  
22 THE BULLET WOUNDS, LACERATED HEART, LUNGS, LIVER,  
23 STOMACH, SEVERAL DIFFERENT ORGANS, AND THEN WE  
24 WERE ABLE TO RETRIEVE SOME BULLETS, SOME WHOLE  
25 BULLETS AND SOME FRAGMENTS OF BULLETS FROM THAT.

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

630

1 Q. OKAY. AND THOSE ITEMS WERE COLLECTED, CORRECT?

2 A. YES.

3 Q. LET ME SHOW YOU WHAT IS MARKED AS STATE'S  
4 EXHIBITS NUMBERS EIGHTY-ONE THROUGH NINETY-ONE  
5 AND GET YOU TO JUST KIND OF LOOK THROUGH THOSE  
6 ITEMS.

7 A. THESE ARE BULLETS AND BULLET FRAGMENTS THAT WE  
8 WERE ABLE TO GET FROM CHARLES PRINGLE DURING THE  
9 AUTOPSY ON MARCH THIRTEENTH. THEY ARE, THEY WERE  
10 SUBMITTED IN THESE LITTLE CONTAINERS AND SEALED  
11 FOR EVIDENCE AND TAKEN TO SLED BY GERALD CARTER.

12 Q. OKAY.

13 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
14 WE'D OFFER STATE'S EIGHTY-ONE THROUGH NINETY-ONE INTO  
15 EVIDENCE.

16 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

17 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

18 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

19 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

20 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

21 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

22 THE COURT: THERE BEING NO OBJECTION, THEY ARE  
23 ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.

24 (State's Exhibits Eighty-one through Ninety-one  
25 marked and filed.)

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

631

1           SOLICITOR SORENSON: ARE YOU READY, MS. WALKER?

2           COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

3           Q. OKAY. NOW, DR. ROSS, LET ME JUST KIND OF,  
4           KEEPING OUT JUST FOR DESCRIPTION PURPOSES FOR THE  
5           JURY, STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER EIGHTY-EIGHT. YOU  
6           INDICATED THAT THESE, THE FRAGMENT OR WHATEVER  
7           YOU COLLECTED WAS THEN PLACED IN THIS LITTLE  
8           VIAL?

9           A. YES.

10          Q. OKAY. DID YOU, WHAT IF ANYTHING DID YOU DOCUMENT  
11          ON THE ACTUAL VIAL ITSELF?

12          A. WELL, THE NAME OF THE PERSON, CHARLES PRINGLE,  
13          THE DATE OF THE AUTOPSY, THE NUMBER OF THE  
14          AUTOPSY, THE AREA WHERE THE FRAGMENTS WERE FOUND,  
15          AND THIS ONE IS, HEART, AND MY INITIALS.

16          Q. OKAY. SO, EACH ONE OF THESE YOU CAN LOOK AT  
17          INDIVIDUALLY AND SEE WHERE IT WAS THAT YOU  
18          COLLECTED IT FROM WITHIN MR. PRINGLE?

19          A. YES.

20          Q. NOW, AS PART OF YOUR AUTOPSY, DR. ROSS, DID YOU  
21          COLLECT A BLOOD STANDARD FROM MR. PRINGLE TO HAVE  
22          A TOXICOLOGICAL SCREEN DONE ON IT?

23          A. YES.

24          Q. AND THAT WAS DONE IN THIS CASE?

25          A. YES.

1 Q. DO YOU HAVE THE RESULTS OF THE TOXICOLOGY?

2 A. YES, I DO.

3 Q. WHAT WAS THE RESULT, IF YOU KNOW?

4 A. THE ONLY THING PRESENT WAS TETRA HYDRO  
5 CANANBINOL, THC, WHICH IS MARIJUANA, AND ONE OF  
6 THE METABOLITES FROM IT.

7 Q. NO OTHER DRUGS IN HIS SYSTEM BESIDES MARIJUANA?

8 A. NO.

9 Q. ALRIGHT, NOW, GOING BACK AS FAR AS YOU KIND OF  
10 TALKING ABOUT THE ACTUAL WOUNDS THEMSELVES, WHAT  
11 -- YOU DESCRIBED EARLIER SEVERAL INTERNAL ORGANS  
12 THAT WERE DAMAGED AS A RESULT?

13 A. YES.

14 Q. WHAT WERE THOSE AGAIN?

15 A. THE HEART, LUNGS --BOTH LUNGS, LIVER, SPLEEN,  
16 STOMACH, AND VARIOUS BLOOD VESSELS IN THE CHEST  
17 AND ABDOMEN.

18 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU, AS FAR AS LOOKING AT  
19 THE WOUNDS WERE YOU ABLE TO TELL ANYTHING ABOUT,  
20 YOU KNOW, WHAT KIND OF WEAPON POSSIBLY COULD HAVE  
21 CAUSED ANY OF THE WOUNDS?

22 A. ALL I CAN SAY IS, THE ENTRANCE WOUNDS HAD SOME  
23 VARIABILITY IN THEIR SIZE.

24 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WOULD SUGGEST WHAT TO YOU IN YOUR  
25 EXPERIENCE?

DIRECT - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY SOL. SORENSON

633

1 A. SUGGESTS DIFFERENT CALIBERS.

2 Q. ULTIMATELY, DR. ROSS, WERE YOU ABLE TO DETERMINE  
3 WITHIN A REASONABLE DEGREE OF MEDICAL CERTAINTY A  
4 MANNER AND CAUSE OF DEATH IN THIS CASE?

5 A. YES.

6 Q. AND WHAT, TELL THE JURY WHAT YOUR OPINION IS IN  
7 REGARD TO THAT?

8 A. THE CAUSE OF DEATH IS LACERATION OF MULTIPLE  
9 ORGANS DUE TO DUE TO MULTIPLE GUN SHOT WOUNDS OF  
10 THE CHEST AND THE ABDOMEN. THE MANNER OF DEATH,  
11 HOMICIDE.

12 Q. AND SPECIFICALLY AS TO THOSE, YOU TESTIFIED  
13 EARLIER ABOUT THERE BEING, YOU KNOW, TWENTY,  
14 POSSIBLY TWENTY-FOUR GUN SHOT WOUNDS TO MR.  
15 PRINGLE. WERE YOU ABLE TO KIND OF LOOK AT THEM  
16 AND DETERMINE WHAT OF THOSE TWENTY-FOUR WOUNDS  
17 WERE THE FATAL WOUNDS?

18 A. MOSTLY THOSE GOING INTO THE CHEST.

19 Q. OKAY. AND THOSE WERE THE ONES THAT PERFORATED, I  
20 THINK YOU TESTIFIED, THE HEART AND THE LUNGS AND  
21 BASICALLY THOSE INTERNAL ORGANS?

22 A. YES, AND PROBABLY SOME OF THE ONES FROM THE BACK  
23 THAT WENT INTO THE CHEST CAVITY.

24 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I BEG THE COURT'S  
25 INDULGENCE.

1           THE COURT:    SURE.

2           SOLICITOR SORENSON:    THANK YOU, DR. ROSS.

3           THE COURT:    ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY.

4           MR. LACKEY:    I HAVE NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

5           THE COURT:    MS. ULLMAN.

6           (NOTE:  Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
7           part of record has been omitted.  Headers on  
8           testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
9           testimony are now required by the Court.  See next  
10          ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY MS. ULLMAN

635

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF DR. JANICE E. ROSS

BY MS. ULLMAN:

1 Q. GOOD AFTERNOON.

2 A. GOOD AFTERNOON.

3 Q. YOU TESTIFIED THERE WERE ENTRANCE WOUNDS IN MR.  
4 PRINGLE'S BACK?

5 A. YES.

6 Q. WOULD THAT BE CONSISTENT WITH SOMEONE WHO WAS  
7 LAYING ON THEIR BACK ON THE GROUND, GETTING SHOT  
8 WHILE LAYING DOWN?

9 A. WELL, YOU HAVE -- BULLETS GO STRAIGHT, SO SOMEHOW  
10 THE BULLET CAME IN THE BACK. WHETHER HE WAS ON  
11 THE GROUND, WHETHER HE WAS STANDING UP. YOU HAVE  
12 TWO PEOPLE MOVING, A GUN AND A BODY. IT'S  
13 POSSIBLE THAT HE COULD HAVE BEEN LAYING ON HIS  
14 STOMACH.

15 Q. I GUESS MY QUESTION, IF I'M LYING ON MY BACK  
16 WOULD YOU SAY IT'S POSSIBLE AT ALL TO GET SHOT IN  
17 MY BACK?

18 A. OH, IF YOU'RE LYING ON YOUR BACK?

19 Q. YES, MA'AM.

20 A. NO, NO.

21 Q. SO, THE WOUNDS IN THE BACK WOULD MAKE YOU ASSUME  
22 THAT IF HE WERE LAYING DOWN HE MUST HAVE BEEN ON  
23 HIS STOMACH OR HE WAS NOT LYING DOWN?  
24  
25

CROSS - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY MS. ULLMAN

636

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9

A. CORRECT.

MR. ULLMAN: NO FURTHER QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: THANK YOU.

MR. PALMER.

(NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now required by the Court. See next ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - DR. JANICE E. ROSS BY MR. PALMER

637

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF DR. JANICE E. ROSS

BY MR. PALMER:

1 Q. DR. ROSS, EXCUSE ME, THE PROJECTILES THAT YOU  
2 JUST TESTIFIED TO THAT YOU COLLECTED ARE FROM THE  
3 ACTUAL BODY?  
4

5 A. YES.

6 Q. AND YOU, YOU DETECTED, OR YOU DETERMINED THERE  
7 WERE TWENTY-FOUR GUN SHOT WOUNDS?  
8

9 A. YES.

10 Q. DOES THAT MEAN TWENTY-FOUR ENTRANCE WOUNDS?

11 A. TWENTY-FOUR ENTRANCE WOUNDS, YES.

12 Q. AND HOW MANY ACTUAL PROJECTILES OR FRAGMENTS OF  
13 PROJECTILES DID YOU COLLECT?

14 A. WELL, WE COLLECTED ELEVEN CONTAINERS. NOW, SOME  
15 OF THOSE MAY BE MIXED, SOME FOR INSTANCE THAT  
16 WERE JUST FRAGMENTS FOUND IN THE PELVIC AREA, AND  
17 THEY COULD BE REPRESENTATIVE OF ONE BULLET OR  
18 TWO, OR THREE.

19 Q. OKAY.

20 A. WE DID HAVE SOME WHOLE BULLETS, I CAN'T REMEMBER  
21 EXACTLY HOW MANY, BUT A LOT OF THE FRAGMENTS, I  
22 CAN'T TELL YOU IF THEY WERE FROM ONE BULLET OR  
23 SEVERAL.

24 Q. OKAY. THANK YOU.

25 MR. MELLARD: NO QUESTIONS.

1           THE COURT: ALRIGHT. AND MR. KOGER?

2           MR. KOGER: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

3           THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

4           SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, SIR.

5           THE COURT: ALRIGHT, DR. ROSS, THANK YOU FOR  
6 COMING IN, I APPRECIATE IT.

7           YOUR NEXT WITNESS?

8           SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR. THE STATE CALLS  
9 JAMES GREEN.

10           (Whereupon, the witness  
11 enters the courtroom.)

12           CLERK: SIR, PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE  
13 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT.

14           (Whereupon, James Green  
15 is duly sworn.)

16           CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE YOUR FULL NAME FOR  
17 THE COURT.

18           WITNESS: JAMES GREEN, G-R-E-E-N.

19           (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
20 part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
21 testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
22 testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
23 ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

639

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAMES GREEN

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

1 Q. GOOD AFTERNOON, AGENT GREEN.

2 A. GOOD AFTERNOON.

3 Q. IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY WHERE IT IS THAT  
4 YOU'RE EMPLOYED?

5 A. I'M EMPLOYED BY THE SOUTH CAROLINA LAW  
6 ENFORCEMENT DIVISION COMMON KNOWN AS SLED, IN THE  
7 FIREARMS DEPARTMENT OF THE FORENSIC SERVICES  
8 LABORATORY.

9 Q. ALRIGHT. HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN EMPLOYED FIRST  
10 OF ALL, WITH THE STATE LAW ENFORCEMENT DIVISION?

11 A. APPROXIMATELY FIVE AND A HALF YEARS.

12 Q. OKAY. AND HAVE YOU BEEN IN THE FIREARMS  
13 DEPARTMENT THAT ENTIRE TIME?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY KIND OF  
16 BRIEFLY WHAT YOUR TRAINING IS IN THAT DEPARTMENT?

17 A. AT THE FIREARMS DEPARTMENT AT SLED WE UNDERGO A  
18 THREE YEAR IN HOUSE COURSE OF INSTRUCTION, AND  
19 WHAT THAT DEALS WITH IS EXTENSIVE MICROSCOPIC  
20 COMPARISONS, RESEARCH, READING, UNDER COURT  
21 QUALIFIED FIREARMS EXAMINERS, WHERE YOU START  
22 OUT WATCHING THEM PERFORM THEIR CASE WORK, AND AS  
23 YOU BECOME MORE COMFORTABLE YOU START WRITING UP  
24  
25

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

640

1           THEIR WORK SHEETS FOR THEM, DOING THE MICROSCOPIC  
2           WORK, AND THEN THEY WILL COME BACK BEHIND YOU AND  
3           LOOK. I WAS ALSO GIVEN PRACTICAL PROBLEMS IN  
4           ORAL AND WRITTEN EXAMINATIONS.

5           Q. AND WHEN, WHAT TIME WERE YOU CERTIFIED TO  
6           ACTUALLY START HANDLING CASES ON YOUR OWN?

7           A. I BELIEVE IT WAS MARCH, TWO THOUSAND NINE.

8           Q. AND HAVE YOU HAD AN OPPORTUNITY, AGENT GREEN, --  
9           I GUESS AS KIND OF YOUR TRAINING AND ALL CONTINUE  
10          ON A DAY TO DAY BASIS IN THE LAB?

11          A. YES, SIR.

12          Q. AND HAVE YOU HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO TESTIFY BEFORE  
13          REGARDING YOUR FINDINGS, SIR?

14          A. YES, I HAVE.

15          Q. AND HOW MANY TIMES?

16          A. SIX.

17          Q. OKAY. AND HAVE YOU BEEN QUALIFIED AS AN EXPERT  
18          IN FIREARMS ANALYSIS?

19          A. IN FIREARMS IDENTIFICATION, YES, SIR.

20          Q. OKAY.

21          THE COURT: IN WHAT, FIREARM WHAT?

22          A. IDENTIFICATION.

23          SOLICITOR SORENSON: AND AT THIS TIME, YOUR  
24          HONOR, I WOULD OFFER AGENT GREEN AS AN EXPERT IN THE  
25          FIELD OF FIREARMS IDENTIFICATION.

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

641

1           THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION FROM THE DEFENDANTS?

2           MR. PALMER: NONE.

3           MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

4           MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

5           MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

6           MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

7           THE COURT: OKAY. WITHOUT OBJECTION AGENT GREEN  
8 IS QUALIFIED AS AN EXPERT AS TO FIREARMS.

9           Q. OKAY. AGENT GREEN, IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY  
10 KIND OF WHAT, WHAT, BASICALLY WHAT CAPABILITIES  
11 Y'ALL HAVE OUT AT SLED AS FAR AS IN THE FIELD OF  
12 FIREARMS AND IDENTIFICATION?

13           A. WHEN FIREARMS ARE MANUFACTURED THE MANUFACTURER  
14 SAYS, WELL, WE'RE GOING TO MAKE A GUN OF THIS  
15 CALIBER WITH THIS MANY LANDING GROOVES IN THE  
16 BARREL, AND A LANDING GROOVE IS A RIFLING. LET'S  
17 SAY THEY WANT SIX GROOVES CUT, AND THEY WILL CUT  
18 SIX GROOVES INTO THE BARREL. AND WHAT THAT DOES  
19 IS, IT CAUSES THE BULLET TO SPIN AS IT MOVES  
20 THROUGH THE BARREL AND THROUGH THE AIR. YOU CAN  
21 THINK ABOUT A QUARTERBACK IN THE NFL, THEY THROW  
22 A NICE TIGHT SPIRAL, IT GOES FARTHER, IT'S MORE  
23 ACCURATE, VERSUS, IF YOU THROW A FOOTBALL LIKE ME  
24 IT'S LIKE A DUCK, IT JUST KIND OF GOES THROUGH  
25 THE AIR AND IT FALLS NOWHERE NEAR WHERE YOU WANT

1 IT TO GO. SO, THEY PUT THE RIFLING IN THE BARREL  
2 IN A CERTAIN CALIBER, AND THEY'LL SAY, WE WANT TO  
3 MAKE THE SLIDE OR THE BREACH FACE AREA LOOK LIKE  
4 THIS, AND THEY'LL USE A DIFFERENT VARIETY OF  
5 TOOLS TO CUT THE WORKING SURFACES. THOSE MARKS  
6 LEFT ON THE WORKING SURFACES BY THE TOOLS MADE OR  
7 USED TO CREATE THE FIREARMS ARE WHAT WE LOOK FOR.  
8 YOU'LL HAVE CERTAIN CLASS CHARACTERISTICS, WHICH  
9 IS A BROAD CATEGORY. WHEN THE FIREARMS  
10 MANUFACTURER SAYS, WE WANT TO MAKE A GUN THAT  
11 LOOKS LIKE THIS, THAT WOULD FALL INTO A CLASS.  
12 HOWEVER, WHEN THE TOOL MOVES ACROSS THE TOOL  
13 SURFACE, OR THE SURFACE BEING MACHINED, TINY  
14 RAPIDLY CHANGING MICROSCOPIC MARKS ARE LEFT ON  
15 THOSE SURFACES, AND THAT LETS US DIFFERENTIATE  
16 BETWEEN, SAY, THIS FIREARM FIRING SOMETHING  
17 VERSUS THIS FIREARM FIRING SOMETHING, VERSUS  
18 THIS. WE CAN PRETTY MUCH TELL WHICH FIREARM  
19 SOMETHING WAS FIRED BY BASED ON THE MICROSCOPIC  
20 LEFT ON THE WORKING SURFACE OF THE FIREARM.

21 Q. IN OTHER WORDS, YOU CAN TAKE THREE GUNS OF THE  
22 SAME CALIBER, SAME BRAND, FIRE ONE OF THEM,  
23 RECOVER THAT BULLET, AND THEN BE ABLE TO TELL  
24 WHICH OF THOSE GUNS FIRED IT?

25 A. YES, SIR. I ACTUALLY JUST FINISHED TAKING A TEST

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

643

1 ADMINISTERED BY THE MIAMI DADE POLICE DEPARTMENT  
2 DOWN IN FLORIDA WHERE THEY TOOK, THEY WENT TO THE  
3 RUGER FACTORY AND THEY GOT TEN CONSECUTIVELY  
4 MANUFACTURED SLIDES. IF YOU'RE EVER GOING TO FIND  
5 ANY SIMILARITIES IN FIREARMS IT'S GOING TO BE  
6 THOSE MADE BY THE SAME TOOL. SO, WHAT THEY DID  
7 WAS, IT WAS LIKE A BLIND TEST, THEY GAVE US SOME  
8 FIRED CARTRIDGES CASES, AND THEN SOME KNOWN  
9 CARTRIDGE CASES THAT THEY SAID, WE FIRED FROM GUN  
10 NUMBER ONE, WE FIRED FROM GUN NUMBER TWO, ALL THE  
11 WAY THROUGH, AND I WAS ABLE TO CORRECTLY IDENTIFY  
12 WHICH UNKNOWN CARTRIDGE CASES WENT BACK TO THAT  
13 PARTICULAR FIREARM.

14 Q. OKAY. AND AS FAR AS CARTRIDGE CASINGS, EXPLAIN  
15 TO THE JURY, AND THEY'VE HEARD A LITTLE BIT OF  
16 THIS ALREADY, BUT WHEN YOU FIRE A WEAPON, LET'S  
17 SAY IN THE CASE OF A SEMI-AUTOMATIC PISTOL, WHEN  
18 YOU FIRE IT THE BULLET'S GOING TO COME OUT THE  
19 END OF THE GUN, RIGHT?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. AND THE SHELL CASING IS GOING TO GET EJECTED OUT  
22 OF THE GUN?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE'S  
25 TESTIFYING. HE CAN ASK HIM WHAT HAPPENS WHEN IT GETS

1           EXPELLED.

2           THE COURT: IF YOU'D JUST REPHRASE THE QUESTION.

3           Q. WOULD YOU DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHAT HAPPENS WHEN  
4           YOU FIRE A SEMI-AUTOMATIC PISTOL?

5           A. OKAY, I'LL START FROM THE BEGINNING. USUALLY  
6           SEMI-AUTOMATIC PISTOLS HAVE A MAGAZINE. YOU TAKE  
7           THE UNFIRED CARTRIDGES, LOAD THEM INTO THE  
8           MAGAZINE, AND THEN YOU FULL SEAT THE MAGAZINE TO  
9           THE MAGAZINE WELL, WHICH IS THE HOLE IN THE  
10          FIREARM FOR THE MAGAZINE TO GO IN. THEN YOU PULL  
11          BACK THE SLIDE WHICH IS THE PART THAT MOVES BACK  
12          AND FORTH. AND THAT WILL CHAMBER THE FIRST  
13          CARTRIDGE. THEN YOU PULL THE TRIGGER, THE FIRING  
14          PIN WILL HIT THE PRIMER CAUSING THE LITTLE  
15          PRIMING PELLET TO COMBUST, I'M GETTING A LITTLE  
16          TECHNICAL, IT WILL SEND A FLASH OF FLAME THROUGH  
17          A FLASH HOLE IN THE CARTRIDGE CASE WHICH IGNITES  
18          THE GUN POWER AND THE CARTRIDGE CASE. THE  
19          CARTRIDGE CASE, OR EXCUSE ME, THE GUN POWDER WILL  
20          BURN AND TURN INTO A GAS, AND THAT PRESSURE FROM  
21          THE GAS BUILDS UNTIL WHERE IT PUSHES THE BULLET  
22          DOWN THE BARREL, AND OUT THE BARREL OF THE  
23          FIREARM. AND AS THE BULLET IS PUT OUT OF THE  
24          FIREARM BARREL THE CARTRIDGE CASE GETS PUSHED  
25          BACK UP AGAINST THE BREACH FACE AND THE FORCE OF

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

645

1            THAT RECOIL WILL MAKE THE SLIDE MOVE REARWARD  
2            BASED ON SPRING TENSION, AND ONCE IT HITS A  
3            CERTAIN POINT THE CARTRIDGE CASE WILL BE EJECTED  
4            FROM THE FIREARM IN ANY DIFFERENT NUMBER OF  
5            DIRECTIONS. AND THEN THE SLIDE MOVE FORWARD BACK  
6            INTO THAT SPRING TENSION AND YOU PULL THE TRIGGER  
7            AND THE WHOLE CYCLE STARTS OVER AGAIN.

8            Q.    OKAY. AND NOW, YOU MADE REFERENCE EARLIER TO, I  
9            THINK, THE PROJECTILES AND THEN ALSO TO THE SHELL  
10           CASINGS, SO AN INDIVIDUAL FIREARM CAN BE COMPARED  
11           TO BOTH THE PROJECTILE IT FIRES AND ALSO THE  
12           SHELL CASING THAT'S PROJECTED FROM IT?

13           A.    YES, SIR.

14           Q.    OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU THIS, IF YOU ARE  
15           SUBMITTED IN A CASE A HANDFUL OF SHELL CASINGS  
16           THAT ARE COLLECTED BUT YOU DON'T HAVE A WEAPON,  
17           WHAT IF ANY CAPABILITY DO YOU HAVE WITH REGARD TO  
18           DOING ANALYSIS ON THOSE SHELL CASINGS, IF YOU  
19           DON'T HAVE A WEAPON TO ACTUALLY COMPARE THEM TO?

20           A.    BASED ON JUST CLASS CHARACTERISTICS WE CAN  
21           NEGATE, LET'S SAY, IF I GET A HANDFUL OF TEN  
22           CARTRIDGE CASES, FIVE LOOK LIKE THEY CAME OUT OF  
23           A HIGH POINT AND FIVE LOOK LIKE THEY CAME OUT OF  
24           A GLOCK BASED ON THE CLASS CHARACTERISTICS, I CAN  
25           DEFINITELY SAY THAT THESE FIVE WEREN'T FIRED BY

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

646

1 THE GUN THAT FIRED THESE FIVE, BASED ON JUST THE  
2 CLASS CHARACTERISTICS. THEN, YOU ALSO HAVE  
3 CALIBER. SOME CALIBERS ARE USED SOMEWHAT  
4 INTERCHANGEABLY IN DIFFERENT FIREARMS, SOME OR  
5 NOT. IT'S LIKE I CAN SAY, A TWENTY-TWO LONG  
6 RIFLE RIM FIRE CARTRIDGE WASN'T FIRED OUT OF A  
7 TWELVE GAUGE SHOT GUN.

8 Q. OKAY. YOU'RE ALSO ABLE TO TAKE THOSE CASINGS AND  
9 COMPARE THEM TO EACH OTHER?

10 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, THERE'S NO  
11 QUESTION, WHAT HE'S SAYING, JUST STATING - - -

12 Q. ARE YOU ALSO ABLE TO - - -

13 THE COURT: LET HIM FINISH THE QUESTION. YOU GO  
14 AHEAD AND FINISH THE QUESTION, MR. SORENSON.

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU.

16 Q. ARE YOU ALSO ABLE TO COMPARE THOSE SHELL CASINGS  
17 TO EACH OTHER TO SEE IF THEY WERE FIRED BY THE  
18 SAME FIREARM?

19 A. YES, SIR, WE CAN, SAY, ONCE AGAIN, IF I HAVE TEN  
20 I CAN SAY THEY WERE ALL FIRED BY ONE GUN, OR  
21 FIRED BY TEN DIFFERENT FIREARMS.

22 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, NOW, SPECIFICALLY I WANT TO NOW  
23 TURN US TO THIS CASE THAT WE'RE HERE ABOUT TODAY.  
24 OKAY, AGENT GREEN, DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO  
25 RECEIVE SEVERAL ITEMS OF EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

647

1 SUBMITTED BY THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S  
2 OFFICE?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. AND SPECIFICALLY, I GUESS TO KIND OF THESE  
5 ONE AT A TIME, LET ME SHOW YOU THIS ENVELOPE, AND  
6 LET YOU LOOK THROUGH THAT. DID YOU RECEIVE THOSE  
7 ITEMS FOR YOUR ANALYSIS?

8 A. WHEN WE RECEIVE ITEMS OF EVIDENCE AT SLED EACH  
9 ITEM IS MARKED WITH THE LAB NUMBER, ITEM NUMBER  
10 THAT IS GIVEN BY SLED, AND OUR INITIALS SO WE CAN  
11 IDENTIFY THEM AS HAVING BEEN RECEIVED. THAT'S  
12 WHAT I'M DOING NOW IS MAKING, LOOKING FOR MY  
13 INITIALS AND CASE NUMBER AND ITEM NUMBER. YES,  
14 SIR, I'VE SEEN ALL THESE ITEMS IN THIS ENVELOPE.

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: AND JUST FOR THE RECORD,  
16 YOUR HONOR, HE JUST SAID HE HAD SEEN STATE'S EXHIBITS  
17 THIRTY-NINE THROUGH FORTY-NINE.

18 THE COURT: OKAY.

19 Q. BEFORE -- YOU CAN JUST LEAVE THEM OUT FOR RIGHT  
20 NOW. AGENT GREEN, LET ME SHOW YOU -- LET ME ASK  
21 YOU THIS BEFORE WE GET INTO THOSE. IN THIS CASE  
22 DID YOU RECEIVE ANY ACTUAL WEAPONS, ANY FIREARMS,  
23 WERE ANY SUBMITTED TO YOU IN THIS CASE?

24 A. YES, SIR, I RECEIVED ONE RUGER PISTOL.

25 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED AS STATE'S

1 EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY-THREE, AND ASK IF YOU  
2 RECOGNIZE THAT ITEM?

3 A. YES, SIR, THIS THE PISTOL I EXAMINED IN THIS  
4 CASE.

5 Q. OKAY, AND WHAT -- TELL THE JURY WHAT KIND OF  
6 PISTOL THAT IS?

7 A. THIS IS A RUGER MODEL P-NINETY-FOUR, A SEMI-  
8 AUTOMATIC PISTOL, IT'S A NINE MILLIMETER LUGAR  
9 CALIBER.

10 Q. WHAT IS THE CALIBER?

11 A. I'M SORRY, IT'S A FORTY CALIBER SMITH AND WESSON.

12 Q. SO, IT'S A FORTY CALIBER?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. AGENT GREEN, NOW AS TO STATE'S EXHIBITS THIRTY-  
15 NINE THROUGH FORTY-NINE THAT ARE BEFORE YOU, WHAT  
16 IF ANY EXAMINATION OR ANALYSIS DID YOU PERFORM ON  
17 THOSE ELEVEN ITEMS?

18 A. LET ME GET THEM IN ORDER HERE. I TOOK THESE  
19 CARTRIDGES CASES AND LOOKED AT THEM USING OUR  
20 COMPARISON MICROSCOPE. AND WHAT THAT IS, IT'S  
21 JUST BASICALLY TWO MICROSCOPES JOINTED TOGETHER  
22 BY AN OPTICAL BRIDGE THAT LETS US LOOK AT TWO  
23 ITEMS SIMULTANEOUSLY UNDER MAGNIFICATION AND  
24 DIFFERENT LIGHTING ANGLES.

25 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT WERE YOUR RESULTS WHEN YOU

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

649

1 COMPARED THOSE ELEVEN SHELL CASINGS?

2 A. THESE ELEVEN SHELL CASINGS, WHICH WERE ITEMS,  
3 STATE'S EXHIBITS THIRTY-NINE THROUGH FORTY-NINE,  
4 WERE ALL FIRED BY ONE FIREARM.

5 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, COULD THEY HAVE BEEN FIRED BY, OR  
6 WERE THEY FIRED BY STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-THREE?

7 A. NO, SIR, THEY WERE NOT.

8 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. I'M GIVING YOU ANOTHER ENVELOPE  
9 TO LOOK AT, AND I ASK YOU TO DO THE SAME THING  
10 IN THAT ENVELOPE?

11 A. YES, SIR, I'VE SEEN ALL OF THOSE ITEMS.

12 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S STATE'S EXHIBITS FIFTY THROUGH  
13 FIFTY-SEVEN, IS THAT CORRECT?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO EXAMINE  
16 THOSE ITEMS?

17 A. YES, SIR, I DID.

18 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT, WHAT CALIBER SHELL CASINGS ARE  
19 THOSE?

20 A. THOSE ARE FORTY SMITH AND WESSON, OR FORTY S AND  
21 W CALIBER.

22 Q. AND LET ME ASK YOU THIS, DID YOU HAVE AN  
23 OPPORTUNITY TO COMPARE THOSE EIGHT SHELL CASINGS  
24 TO STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-THREE?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

650

1 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT WERE THE RESULTS OF COMPARING  
2 THOSE EIGHT SHELL CASINGS TO THAT FORTY CALIBER  
3 PISTOL?

4 A. THEY WERE ALL FIRED BY THAT PISTOL.

5 Q. OKAY. SO THAT GUN EJECTED THOSE EIGHT SHELL  
6 CASINGS?

7 A. YES, SIR, THEY WERE FIRED BY, AND EJECTED FROM  
8 IT.

9 Q. ALRIGHT. WE CAN PUT THEM BACK UP. LET ME SHOW  
10 YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS FIFTY-EIGHT THROUGH SIXTY-  
11 TWO, I BELIEVE, YES, FIFTY-EIGHT THROUGH SIXTY-  
12 TWO, AND ASK YOU IF YOU RECOGNIZE THOSE ITEMS?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHAT STATE'S  
15 EXHIBITS FIFTY-EIGHT THROUGH SIXTY-TWO ARE?

16 A. THEY ARE FIVE FIRED SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY  
17 THIRTY-NINE SOVIET OR RUSSIAN CALIBER CARTRIDGE  
18 CASES.

19 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT KIND OF WEAPON WOULD FIRE THOSE,  
20 THOSE TYPE OF, WOULD EJECT THOSE KIND OF SHELL  
21 CASINGS?

22 A. TYPICALLY WHAT YOU SEE IN SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY  
23 THIRTY-NINE CALIBER ARE YOUR SKS OR AK FORTY-  
24 SEVEN VARIANCE.

25 Q. AND LET ME SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

651

1 SEVENTY-FIVE, IS THAT A PHOTOGRAPH THAT YOU  
2 PROVIDED TO OUR OFFICE OF ONE OF THE WEAPONS THAT  
3 COULD POSSIBLY HAVE FIRED THOSE SHELL CASINGS?

4 A. YES, SIR, THIS IS A PHOTOGRAPH OF ONE OF THE SKS  
5 TYPE RIFLES FROM OUR FIREARMS REFERENCE  
6 COLLECTION.

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: AT THIS TIME WE'D OFFER  
8 STATE'S SEVENTY-FIVE INTO EVIDENCE.

9 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, I DO OBJECT.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. AND I NOTE YOUR OBJECTION FROM  
11 EARLIER, AND I AM GOING TO ALLOW IT IN, AND I WILL GO  
12 OVER THE REASONS FOR DOING THAT AT A LATER TIME.

13 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU. BUT I WILL NOTE  
15 YOUR OBJECTION FOR THE RECORD.

16 NUMBER SEVENTY-FIVE IS ADMITTED.

17 (State's Exhibit Seventy-five  
18 marked and filed.)

19 Q. AND THAT IS ONE OF THE TYPES OF FIREARMS THAT  
20 COULD HAVE FIRED BULLETS AND EJECTED THOSE FIVE  
21 SHELL CASINGS?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. ALRIGHT, NOW, WHAT -- I WAS GOING TO ASK YOU, DID  
24 YOU HAVE ANY WEAPONS LIKE THIS SUBMITTED IN THIS  
25 CASE?

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

652

1 A. NO, SIR, THE ONLY WEAPON SUBMITTED WAS THE  
2 PISTOL.

3 Q. OKAY. AND OBVIOUSLY, I MEAN, COULD THIS GUN HAVE  
4 FIRED THOSE SHELL CASINGS?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO THEN TAKE THOSE  
7 FIVE SHELL CASINGS AND KIND OF COMPARE THEM TO  
8 EACH OTHER TO SEE IF THE SAME FIREARM FIRED THOSE  
9 FIVE?

10 A. YES, SIR, I DID.

11 Q. AND WHAT WERE YOUR RESULTS AFTER DOING THAT?

12 A. STATE'S EXHIBIT FIFTY-EIGHT, FIFTY-NINE, SIXTY  
13 AND SIXTY-ONE WERE FIRED BY THE SAME FIREARM, AND  
14 STATE'S EXHIBIT SIXTY-TWO WAS FIRED BY A  
15 DIFFERENT FIREARM.

16 Q. SO, THIS ONE RIGHT HERE, STATE'S SIXTY-TWO, WHICH  
17 IS -- WHAT MARKER NUMBER IS THAT NOTED ON THE  
18 BACK?

19 A. IT SAYS, NUMBER THIRTY.

20 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WAS FIRED BY A DIFFERENT RIFLE  
21 THAN THE RIFLE THAT FIRED THESE FOUR?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. THANK YOU, WE CAN PUT THAT ONE BACK UP. BASED ON  
24 THE -- AND DID YOU RECEIVE ANY OTHER SHELL  
25 CASINGS IN THIS CASE, OTHER THAN WHAT WE'VE GONE

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

653

1 OVER?

2 A. LET'S SEE, WE WENT OVER -- NO, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. SO, JUST BASED ON THE SHELL CASINGS FOUND,  
4 HOW MANY DIFFERENT WEAPONS WOULD HAVE HAD TO HAVE  
5 BEEN USED TO FIRE ALL THOSE SHELL CASINGS THAT  
6 WERE SUBMITTED TO YOU?

7 A. FOUR.

8 Q. FOUR.

9 COURT REPORTER: FOUR?

10 A. YES, MA'AM.

11 Q. AND YOU ALSO, IN ADDITION TO THE SHELL CASINGS  
12 THAT WERE SUBMITTED, ALSO HAD SEVERAL PROJECTILES  
13 AND BULLETS AND THINGS OF THAT NATURE SUBMITTED?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME SHOW YOU ANOTHER ENVELOPE HERE.  
16 AND I BELIEVE THAT SHOULD CONTAIN STATE'S  
17 EXHIBITS SIXTY-FOUR THROUGH SEVENTY-TWO, I  
18 BELIEVE.

19 A. YES, SIR, I'VE SEEN THOSE BEFORE.

20 Q. OKAY. NOW ADDITIONALLY, I HAND YOU ANOTHER BAG  
21 HERE, AND WE'LL EVENTUALLY TAKE THEM ONE AT A  
22 TIME HERE, BUT - - -

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT BAG CONTAINS STATE'S  
24 EIGHTY-ONE THROUGH NINETY-ONE, YOUR HONOR, THAT HE'S  
25 LOOKING AT NOW.

1           THE COURT:   OKAY.

2           A.    YES, SIR, I'VE SEEN ALL THOSE AS WELL.

3           Q.    SO, ALL OF THOSE ITEMS WERE SUBMITTED TO YOU FOR  
4           YOUR ANALYSIS IN THIS CASE?

5           A.    YES, SIR.

6           Q.    ALRIGHT.  AND I GUESS THE BEST WAY TO DO THIS,  
7           AGENT GREEN, IS TO JUST KIND OF TAKE THEM ONE AT  
8           A TIME AND GET YOU TO KIND OF TELL THE JURY WHAT  
9           YOUR FINDINGS WERE AS TO EACH OF THOSE AS WE GO  
10          THROUGH.  IF YOU WANT ME TO KIND OF GIVE THEM TO  
11          YOU IN ORDER OR DO YOU -- IF YOU WOULD JUST KIND  
12          OF IDENTIFY THE STATE'S EXHIBIT AND THE RIGHT  
13          STICKER BEFORE YOU ...

14          A.    OKAY.  STATE'S EXHIBIT SIXTY-FOUR IS WHAT I'M  
15          LOOKING AT RIGHT NOW.

16          Q.    OF COURSE, NOW, YOU HAVE A DIFFERENT NUMBER THAN  
17          THAT, IS THAT CORRECT?

18          A.    YES, SIR.

19          Q.    OKAY.

20          A.    SO, I'M TRYING TO BALANCE THESE WITH MY NUMBERS.

21          Q.    THAT SHOULD BE, I BELIEVE,  YOUR ITEM TWENTY-FIVE  
22          I BELIEVE, IS THAT CORRECT?

23          A.    YES, SIR.

24          Q.    THEY SHOULD BE IN ORDER.  WHAT OTHER NUMBERS ARE  
25          YOU LOOKING FOR?

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

655

1 A. I GOT THEM OUT OF ORDER WHEN I PUT THEM UP HERE.  
2 OKAY, I'M SORRY. ALRIGHT, ITEM SIXTY-FOUR,  
3 STATE'S EXHIBIT SIXTY-FOUR, SIXTY-FIVE, SIXTY-  
4 SEVEN, SEVENTY-ONE, SIXTY-NINE, EIGHTY-TWO,  
5 EIGHTY-FOUR, EIGHTY-SEVEN AND NINETY-ONE -- OKAY,  
6 STATE'S EXHIBIT NINETY-ONE IS ACTUALLY TWO OF MY  
7 ITEM NUMBERS COMBINED INTO ONE.

8 Q. YES, SIR.

9 A. OKAY. SO WHEN I REFER TO STATE'S EXHIBIT NINETY-  
10 ONE I'M REFERRING TO THE FIRED BULLET PORTION AND  
11 NOT THE NON-AMMUNITION COMPONENTS.

12 COURT REPORTER: NOT THE WHAT?

13 A. IT LOOKS LIKE A BUTTON, BUT IT'S NOT AN  
14 AMMUNITION COMPONENT.

15 Q. AND HOW MANY IS THAT, TEN TOTAL?

16 A. YES, SIR. I'M MISSING ONE. WHICH ONE AM I  
17 MISSING? HANG ON, THAT'S NOT RIGHT.

18 Q. IT SHOULD BE FIVE OF THOSE.

19 A. TWENTY-FIVE, TWENTY-SIX, TWENTY-EIGHT, THIRTY-  
20 TWO.

21 Q. HAVE YOU GOT IT?

22 A. YES, SIR. OKAY. LET ME GIVE YOU THOSE ITEMS  
23 NUMBERS AGAIN. I'M SORRY. ITEMS SIXTY-FOUR,  
24 SIXTY-FIVE, SIXTY-SEVEN, SIXTY-NINE, SEVENTY-ONE,  
25 EIGHTY-TWO, EIGHTY-FOUR, EIGHTY-SEVEN, NINETY AND

1 NINETY-ONE.

2 Q. OKAY. SO, THOSE TEN BULLETS AND/OR BULLET  
3 FRAGMENTS, WHAT WERE THE RESULTS OF THOSE TEN?

4 A. THEY WERE ALL FIRED BY THE SAME FIREARM, BUT THEY  
5 WERE NOT FIRED BY THE RUGER PISTOL.

6 Q. ALL FIRED BY THE SAME BUT NOT BY STATE'S EXHIBIT  
7 SEVENTY-THREE?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. WHAT CAN YOU TELL US ABOUT AS FAR AS THE CALIBER  
10 OR ANYTHING OF THAT NATURE AS TO THOSE?

11 A. BASED ON THE WEIGHT, THEIR OBSERVABLE PHYSICAL  
12 CHARACTERISTICS, AND WHERE APPLICABLE THEIR  
13 DIAMETERS AT BASE, THEY'RE MOST CONSISTENT WITH  
14 BEING BULLETS LOADED INTO SOME NINE MILLIMETER  
15 LUGER CALIBER CARTRIDGES.

16 Q. OKAY. SO, THEREFORE, THEY WOULD BE CONSISTENT  
17 WITH COMING FROM THESE ELEVEN SHELL CASINGS?

18 A. YES, SIR, FROM CARTRIDGE CASINGS OF THAT CALIBER,  
19 YES, SIR.

20 Q. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, COULD THEY HAVE BEEN THEN  
21 FIRED BY THE SAME GUN THAT EJECTED THESE SHELL  
22 CASINGS HERE?

23 A. THEY COULD HAVE BEEN, BUT THAT'S NOT AN  
24 EXAMINATION WE PERFORM.

25 Q. ALRIGHT. LET'S KIND OF GO ON TO THE NEXT GROUP.

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

657

1 A. I HAVE STATE'S EXHIBITS SIXTY-SIX, SIXTY-EIGHT,  
2 SEVENTY, SEVENTY-TWO AND EIGHTY-FIVE.

3 Q. WHAT ABOUT EIGHTY-THREE?

4 A. NO, SIR, I'M LOOKING TO MAKE SURE I'VE GOT  
5 EVERYTHING. I'M SORRY, AND ITEM EIGHTY-THREE.

6 Q. SO, IT'S ONE, TWO, THREE, FOUR, FIVE, SIX EITHER  
7 BULLET FRAGMENTS OR PROJECTILES?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHAT WERE YOUR RESULTS AS TO THOSE  
10 SIX?

11 A. THEY WERE ALL FIRED BY THE SAME FIREARM, WHICH IS  
12 THAT RUGER PISTOL.

13 Q. SO, THOSE SIX BULLETS AND/OR BULLET FRAGMENTS  
14 WERE ALL FIRED BY STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-THREE?

15 A. YES, SIR. OKAY, I'LL TAKE THESE ONE AT A TIME.

16 Q. OKAY.

17 A. STATE'S EXHIBIT EIGHTY-ONE IS A HEAVILY DAMAGED  
18 BULLET FRAGMENT BUT BASED ON THE REMAINING  
19 OBSERVABLE PHYSICAL CHARACTERISTICS I WAS ABLE TO  
20 CONCLUDE IT WAS CONSISTENT WITH BULLETS LOADED IN  
21 SOME SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY THIRTY-NINE  
22 MILLIMETER CALIBER CARTRIDGES, AND THEY ALSO CAME  
23 WITH TWO LEAD FRAGMENTS WHICH BORE NO MARKS OF  
24 VALUE FOR IDENTIFICATION PURPOSES, SO THEY WERE  
25 UNSUITABLE.

1 Q. SO, THAT COULD HAVE BEEN FIRED BY A WEAPON  
2 SIMILAR TO THIS ONE?

3 A. YES, SIR, IT COULD HAVE BEEN. STATE'S EXHIBIT  
4 EIGHTY-SIX IS JUST A SMALL JACKET FRAGMENT, AND  
5 ONE SMALL LEAD FRAGMENT. DUE TO THE DAMAGE I WAS  
6 UNABLE TO DETERMINE THE CALIBER OF THIS FRAGMENT.  
7 HOWEVER, IT DID HAVE SOME MARKS OF VALUE SO IT  
8 MAY BE SUITABLE FOR IDENTIFICATION.

9 Q. OKAY. DID YOU ATTEMPT TO COMPARE IT WITH STATE'S  
10 EXHIBIT SEVENTY-THREE?

11 A. I DID, AND IT WAS NOT FIRED BY THAT FIREARM.

12 Q. ALRIGHT.

13 A. STATE'S EXHIBIT EIGHTY-EIGHT, ONCE AGAIN DUE TO  
14 THE DAMAGE I WAS UNABLE TO RELIABLY DETERMINE THE  
15 CALIBER, BUT BASED ON THE RIFLING SPECIFICATIONS  
16 I WAS ABLE TO DETERMINE IT WAS NOT FIRED BY THE  
17 PISTOL.

18 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT.

19 A. STATE'S EXHIBIT EIGHTY-NINE, THERE'S ACTUALLY IN  
20 THERE, ONE'S A SMALL LEAD FRAGMENT WHICH IS  
21 UNSUITABLE, AND THEN THERE'S A BULLET JACKET,  
22 ACTUALLY TWO BULLET JACKET FRAGMENTS AND A LEAD  
23 FRAGMENT. BASED ON THE JACKET FRAGMENTS I WAS  
24 ABLE TO DETERMINE IT'S MOST CONSISTENT WITH  
25 BULLETS LOADED INTO SOME NOMINAL THIRTY CALIBER

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

659

1 CARTRIDGES. I WAS UNABLE TO DETERMINE AN EXACT  
2 CALIBER DUE TO THE DAMAGE, AND BASICALLY, ALL I  
3 HAVE IS WHAT'S LEFT AT THE BASE, AND A THIRTY  
4 CALIBER COMES WITH A LOT OF DIFFERENT CALIBERS,  
5 THERE'S THIRTY OUGHT SIX SPRINGFIELD THREE O  
6 EIGHT, SO I WAS UNABLE TO GET AN EXACT CALIBER  
7 OTHER THAN A NOMINAL, AN APPROXIMATE THIRTY  
8 CALIBER.

9 Q. OKAY. COULD IT HAVE BEEN FIRED BY STATE'S  
10 EXHIBIT SEVENTY-THREE?

11 A. NO, SIR, IF IT WOULD HAVE BEEN FIRED IT WOULD  
12 HAVE BEEN DEFORMED AND IT COULD NOT HAVE BEEN  
13 FIRED BY THAT GUN BASED ON THE RIFLING AS WELL.

14 Q. COULD IT HAVE BEEN FIRED BY AN ASSAULT RIFLE SUCH  
15 AS THIS?

16 A. IT COULD HAVE.

17 Q. COULD IT HAVE BEEN FIRED BY A NINE MILLIMETER  
18 PISTOL?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. OBVIOUSLY, GOING BACK TO THE FORTY CALIBER PISTOL  
21 THAT YOU RECEIVED, IT WAS OPERABLE?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND LET ME ASK YOU THIS, KIND OF, MAYBE I SHOULD  
24 HAVE COVERED THIS BEFORE I EVEN GOT INTO THIS,  
25 BUT WHEN YOU, THE SHELL CASINGS AND THE

1 PROJECTILES THAT YOU TESTIFIED WERE FIRED BY THIS  
2 WEAPON, HOW DID YOU, HOW DO YOU GET STANDARDS TO  
3 COMPARE THOSE TO, TO MAKE THAT COMPARISON?

4 A. IT, SLED IN THE FIREARMS DEPARTMENT WE ACTUALLY  
5 HAVE A TWO STORY VERTICAL WATER TANK THAT WE TEST  
6 FIRE OUR FIREARMS INTO. THE WATER WE CHOSE AS A  
7 MEDIUM BECAUSE IT DOESN'T ADD TO OR TAKE AWAY  
8 FROM ANY MARKINGS LEFT ON THE FIRED COMPONENTS.  
9 AND WE TEST FIRE THE SPECIFIC FIREARMS, IN THIS  
10 CASE THE RUGER. I TEST FIRED THE PISTOL, SO I  
11 CAN SAY DEFINITELY I KNOW THOSE BULLETS AND  
12 CARTRIDGE CASINGS CAME FROM THAT GUN BECAUSE I  
13 FIRED THEM MYSELF.

14 Q. AND YOU TOOK THEN THOSE STANDARDS WHEN YOU FIRED  
15 IT INTO THE WATER TANK AND COMPARED THOSE  
16 STANDARDS THEN TO THE CASINGS FOUND AT THE SCENE  
17 AND THE PROJECTILES THAT WERE SUBMITTED TO YOU?

18 A. YES, SIR. AFTER I TEST FIRE THEM I'LL LOOK AT  
19 THE TESTS, MATCH THE TESTS UP, SEE HOW THE  
20 FIREARM'S MARKING. I DO THAT WITH BOTH THE  
21 CARTRIDGE CASINGS AND THE BULLETS, AND THEN WHAT  
22 I'LL DO IS, I'LL GO THROUGH EVERY SINGLE EVIDENCE  
23 ITEM YOU JUST SAW ME GO THROUGH AND SAY, YES,  
24 I'VE SEEN THEM BEFORE, I'LL LOOK AT THOSE VERSUS  
25 THE TESTS TO SEE IF THEY WERE FIRED BY THAT

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

661

1 FIREARM OR NOT.

2 Q. OKAY. AND I THINK ONE OF THE LAST THINGS I WANT  
3 TO ASK YOU ABOUT IS TO JUST GO BACK TO TWO OF THE  
4 ITEMS THAT YOU TESTIFIED ABOUT, STATE'S EXHIBITS  
5 SIXTY-NINE AND SEVENTY. START WITH STATE'S  
6 EXHIBIT SIXTY-NINE, I BELIEVE THAT WOULD BE YOUR  
7 ITEM THIRTY I BELIEVE. LET ME FIND THAT IN YOUR  
8 REPORT. AND WHAT IS, WHAT IS THE MARKER NUMBER  
9 THAT IS ON THAT LITTLE COIN ENVELOPE INSIDE THE  
10 PLASTIC ENVELOPE?

11 A. FORTY-THREE IS WHAT IT SAYS.

12 Q. AND WHAT IS NOTED ON THERE AS FAR AS WHERE THAT  
13 ITEM WAS FOUND? I THINK IT'S UNDERNEATH.

14 A. YEAH, IT SAYS, UNDER CARPET.

15 Q. UNDER CARPET. ALRIGHT. AND ONCE AGAIN, WHAT  
16 WERE THE RESULTS OF STATE'S EXHIBIT SIXTY-NINE?

17 A. THE SMALL COPPER FRAGMENT DIDN'T HAVE ANY MARKS  
18 OF VALUE ON IT, IT WAS UNSUITABLE, AND THEN THE  
19 BULLET ITSELF WAS MOST CONSISTENT WITH BEING A  
20 NINE MILLIMETER RUGER.

21 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THEN, STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
22 SEVENTY, YET AGAIN, WHAT IS THE MARKER NUMBER  
23 THAT'S LISTED ON STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY?

24 A. FORTY-FOUR.

25 Q. AND WHERE DOES IT INDICATE THAT THAT ITEM WAS

DIRECT - JAMES GREEN BY SOL. SORENSON

662

1 FOUND?

2 A. UNDER A CARPET.

3 Q. OKAY. AND ONCE AGAIN, AS TO STATE'S EXHIBIT  
4 NUMBER SEVENTY, WHAT WERE YOUR RESULTS AS TO  
5 STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY?

6 A. THIS WAS FIRED BY THE PISTOL, THE RUGER PISTOL.

7 Q. SO, THAT WAS FIRED BY STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
8 SEVENTY-THREE?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. ALRIGHT.

11 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I BEG THE COURT'S  
12 INDULGENCE.

13 THE COURT: TAKE YOUR TIME.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT WOULD BE ALL I HAVE,  
15 AGENT, PLEASE ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS DEFENDANTS HAVE  
16 FOR YOU.

17 THE COURT: MR. LACKEY.

18 MR. LACKEY: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

19 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

20 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
21 part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
22 testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
23 testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
24 ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - JAMES GREEN BY MR. LACKEY

663

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES GREEN

BY MR. LACKEY:

Q. AGENT GREEN?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. NOW, YOU'VE HAD A LOT OF SHELL CASINGS AND FRAGMENTS AND OF THE SORT HERE. I DON'T KNOW IF I KEPT UP WITH EVERYTHING EXACTLY RIGHT. TELL ME IF YOU COULD HOW MANY WEAPONS YOU BELIEVE WERE CONNECTED TO THE FRAGMENTS AND CASINGS HERE?

A. HANG ON A MINUTE AND LET ME GO THROUGH THIS.

Q. SURE.

A. ALRIGHT, BASED ON JUST THE CARTRIDGE CASINGS, THERE'S FOUR.

Q. SO, FOUR WEAPONS?

A. YES, SIR. ALRIGHT, NOW, PARDON ME, IT WILL TAKE ME SOME TIME FOR THE BULLETS.

THE COURT: THAT'S OKAY, AGENT GREEN, TAKE YOUR TIME.

Q. THAT'S FINE, WE STAY WITH THE FOUR. AS FAR AS -- LET'S START WITH STATE'S SEVENTY-THREE. NOW, YOU'VE IDENTIFIED THIS AS A WEAPON THAT WAS ACTUALLY USED TO FIRE SOME OF THOSE PROJECTILES?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND WHAT KIND OF WEAPON IS THAT?

A. IT'S A RUGER NINETY-FOUR SEMI-AUTOMATIC PISTOL.

1 Q. ALRIGHT. AND I BELIEVE YOU ALSO SAID THERE WAS A  
2 NINE MILLIMETER - - -

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. --- THAT COULD BE USED TO FIRE THOSE? ALRIGHT.  
5 IF YOU COULD, EXPLAIN TO US WHAT SIZE WEAPON A  
6 NINE MILLIMETER PISTOL IS?

7 A. WELL, THERE'S SO MANY DIFFERENT VARIANCES, IT'S  
8 HARD TO SAY. I KNOW RUGER MAKES A NINE MILLIMETER  
9 PISTOL. OTHER THAN THE BORE DIAMETER OR THE  
10 WIDTH OF THE BARREL IT LOOKS EXACTLY LIKE THAT  
11 PISTOL RIGHT THERE, SOME OF THE RUGERS DO.

12 Q. OKAY. SO IT WOULD ESSENTIALLY BE ABOUT THE SAME  
13 SIZE AS THIS?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, YOU ALSO IDENTIFIED SOME OF THE  
16 PROJECTILES AS BEING FIRED FROM A WEAPON SIMILAR  
17 TO STATE'S SEVENTY-FIVE, IS THAT CORRECT?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. AND NOTHING SHOWS THE REAL SCALE OF THIS,  
20 BUT I MEAN, HOW, HOW LONG WOULD YOU SAY THAT GUN  
21 IS?

22 A. I'M TRYING TO THINK, THAT'S JUST YOUR STANDARD  
23 SKS WITH A STANDARD WOODEN STOCK. YOU CAN BUY AT  
24 YOUR MARKET, YOU KNOW, SYNTHETICS. THAT RIFLE IS  
25 APPROXIMATELY FORTY-ONE OR FORTY-TWO INCHES LONG.

CROSS - JAMES GREEN BY MR. LACKEY

665

1 Q. SO, THAT WOULD BE A LITTLE OVER THREE FEET?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. CORRECT. SO, THAT WOULD BE AROUND - - -

4 A. RIGHT ABOUT WAIST HIGH, YES, SIR.

5 Q. AND YOU SAID THAT THERE COULD HAVE POSSIBLY BEEN  
6 TWO DIFFERENT TYPE OF THOSE SKS WEAPONS USED?

7 A. THERE WERE TWO, YES, SIR.

8 Q. THERE WERE DEFINITELY TWO?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. SO, FROM YOUR FINDINGS YOU HAD TWO OF THE LONG  
11 GUNS AND THEN TWO OF THE PISTOLS?

12 A. YES, SIR. LET ME BACK UP FOR A SECOND. I WAS  
13 THINKING PISTOL. THERE ARE SOME LONG GUNS MADE  
14 IN NINE MILLIMETER LUGER CALIBER. I KNOW HIGH  
15 POINT MAKES SOME CARIBBEANS, BUT GENERALLY, MOST  
16 OF THE NINE MILLIMETER LUGER CALIBER FIREARMS YOU  
17 SEE ARE IN PISTOLS.

18 Q. OKAY. SO, THERE'S A POSSIBILITY THAT THE NINE  
19 MILLIMETER COULD HAVE ALSO BEEN ABOUT THIS, ABOUT  
20 THIS LENGTH AS WELL?

21 A. IT'S POSSIBLE, YES, SIR.

22 Q. IT'S POSSIBLE. OKAY. NOW, YOUR ANALYSIS OF  
23 THESE CASINGS AND THESE FRAGMENTS AND THESE  
24 WEAPONS, IT'S NOT YOUR JOB TO PUT THESE WEAPONS  
25 IN ANY INDIVIDUAL'S HAND, YOU DON'T DO ANYTHING

CROSS - JAMES GREEN BY MR. LACKEY

666

1 WITH FINGERPRINTS OR CONNECTING THAT TO ANY  
2 INDIVIDUAL, DO YOU?

3 A. NO, SIR.

4 Q. AND YOU DIDN'T CONNECT ANY OF THESE -- WELL, THE  
5 ONE WEAPON HERE, TO ANY INDIVIDUALS CHARGED IN  
6 THIS CASE, DID YOU?

7 A. NO, SIR, ALL I DO IS JUST LOOK AT THE EVIDENCE.

8 Q. OKAY.

9 MR. LACKEY: THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, MR. LACKEY.

11 MS. ULLMAN.

12 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
13 part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
14 testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
15 testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
16 ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - JAMES GREEN BY MS. ULLMAN

667

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES GREEN

2 BY MS. ULLMAN:

3 Q. GOOD AFTERNOON.

4 A. HOW ARE YOU?

5 Q. I'M FINE. WHEN YOU WERE GOING OVER HOW YOU  
6 COMPARE ALL OF THIS YOU SAID YOU GET A TEST  
7 SAMPLE THAT YOU FIRE?

8 A. YES, MA'AM.

9 Q. AND YOU TAKE WHAT'S BEEN GIVEN TO YOU - - -

10 A. UH-HUH.

11 Q. --- AND YOU STICK IT UNDER A MICROSCOPE AND YOU  
12 LOOK AT IT?

13 A. YES, MA'AM.

14 Q. SO, BASICALLY, IT'S JUST YOUR KNOWLEDGE THAT  
15 YOU'RE LOOKING AT THIS?

16 A. YES. HOWEVER, BEFORE ANY OF OUR RESULTS ARE  
17 PUBLISHED OR GIVEN TO A SUBMITTING AGENCY SLED  
18 HAS A ONE HUNDRED PER CENT MICRO-VERIFICATION  
19 POLICY, WHICH MEANS THAT, SAY, IF YOU AND I ARE  
20 WORKING TOGETHER I'LL LOOK AT ALL THE EVIDENCE  
21 AND COME TO YOU AND SAY, I NEED YOU TO LOOK AT  
22 BUNCH OF EVIDENCE. SO, YOU COME AND SAY, OKAY,  
23 WELL, GIVE ME FIVE MINUTES, OR WHATEVER THE CASE  
24 MAY BE. AND YOU COME IN AND I SAY, OKAY, I HAVE  
25 ITEMS ONE THROUGH A HUNDRED. I'VE ALREADY

1 FINISHED WITH IT. SIT DOWN AND TELL ME WHAT YOU  
2 THINK. AND THEN WHEN THAT PERSON IS DOING THE  
3 MICRO-VERIFICATION, IT'S FINISHED, WE'LL SIT DOWN  
4 AND GO OVER WHAT I HAVE VERSUS WHAT THEY HAVE.

5 Q. OKAY. YOU WOULD AGREE WITH ME, THOUGH, THAT  
6 THERE'S NO REAL SCIENCE TO THIS, I MEAN, IT'S NOT  
7 A BLOOD TEST WHERE YOU CAN SAY FOR SURE THAT  
8 THEY'RE A POSITIVE, O NEGATIVE, I MEAN, IT IS YOU  
9 LOOKING AT SOMETHING, AND I UNDERSTAND YOU HAVE  
10 SOMEONE BACK YOU UP AND LOOK AT IT ALSO, BUT IT  
11 IS YOU LOOKING AT SOMETHING AND BASED ON YOUR  
12 KNOWLEDGE YOU'RE COMPARING IT?

13 A. WELL, THAT'S A BIG TOPIC IN THE FIREARMS WORLD  
14 RIGHT NOW, IN THE FIREARMS IDENTIFICATION WORLD.  
15 BASED ON THE NAS STUDY, WHICH THEY SAID -- I MAY  
16 BE GOING OFF INTO A TANGENT, BUT PARDON ME, THEY  
17 WERE CHARGED WITH MAKING A DATA BASE FOR EVERY  
18 FIREARM SOLD IN THE UNITED STATES. THEY DID A  
19 FIRED CARTRIDGE CASE AND A FIRED BULLET AND PUT  
20 IT IN THIS BIG SYSTEM. THAT WAS THEIR CHARGE.  
21 AND IN THEIR REPORT THEY CAME THROUGH AND SAID  
22 THAT FIREARMS IDENTIFICATION IS NOT RELIABLE, IT  
23 NEEDS TO BE TESTED MORE. SHORTLY THEREAFTER THE  
24 HEAD OF THE COMMITTEE WROTE AN AFFIDAVIT WHICH  
25 WAS SUBMITTED IN FEDERAL COURT IN CALIFORNIA THAT

CROSS - JAMES GREEN BY MS. ULLMAN

669

1 SAID, WHOA, WHOA, THAT'S NOT WHAT WE MEANT,  
2 FIREARMS IS A GOOD SCIENCE. SO, BASICALLY, WHAT  
3 WE'RE DOING IS, WE'RE TAKING A HYPOTHESIS AND I'M  
4 SAYING THAT I WANT TO LOOK AT THESE CARTRIDGE  
5 CASES AND SEE IF THEY MATCH THIS GUN. SO, I'LL  
6 TEST IT BY FIRING THEM, OR FIRING, LOOKING AT THE  
7 TEST VERSUS THEMSELVES, LOOKING AT TESTS VERSUS  
8 THE EVIDENCE AND MAKING CONCLUSIONS FROM THERE.  
9 AND THE KEY TO SCIENCE IS REPEATABILITY, AND A  
10 TRAINED FIREARM EXAMINER CAN FOLLOW THE STEPS I  
11 FOLLOWED AND ARRIVE AT THE SAME CONCLUSION I DID.

12 Q. WHEN YOU DID YOUR ANALYSIS YOU DIDN'T TAKE ANY  
13 PICTURES OF WHAT YOU WERE DOING, CORRECT?

14 A. YOU MEAN PICTURES, AS ...

15 Q. AS IN, I UNDERSTAND I CAN LOOK AT THIS BULLET BUT  
16 IT'S NOT GOING TO SHOW ME WHAT YOU SAW BECAUSE  
17 YOU USED A MICROSCOPE, CORRECT?

18 A. CORRECT.

19 Q. BUT FOR ME TO BE ABLE TO SEE WHAT YOU SAW I WOULD  
20 EITHER NEED THE MICROSCOPE OR SOME SORT OF  
21 PICTURE OF HOW CLOSE UP YOU LOOKED AT IT?

22 A. CORRECT.

23 Q. AND WE DON'T HAVE THAT TODAY?

24 A. NO.

25 Q. OKAY. YOU ALSO SAID WHEN YOU DO THE TEST FIRING

1            THAT YOU FIRE INTO WATER?

2            A.    YES, MA'AM.

3            Q.    AND YOU SAID THAT'S BECAUSE IT DOESN'T CHANGE ANY  
4            CHARACTERISTICS OF THE BULLET, SHELL CASING,  
5            ANYTHING?

6            A.    CORRECT.

7            Q.    NOW, IF I FIRED INTO THE FLOOR WOULD IT CHANGE  
8            IT, POSSIBLY?

9            A.    IT COULD, IT WOULD DEFORM THE BULLET.    THE REASON  
10           WHY WE CHOOSE WATER IS BECAUSE IT'S SOFT AND IT  
11           SLOWS THE BULLET DOWN, BUT IF YOU FIRED INTO THE  
12           FLOOR OR A WALL OR A CAR IT COULD DEFORM THE  
13           BULLETS.    IT    MAY REMOVE ALL THE MARKINGS ON THE  
14           BULLETS THAT WE LOOK FOR OR IT MAY NOT.    IT JUST  
15           DEPENDS ON HOW IT HITS.

16           Q.    OKAY.    NOW, THE PICTURE OF THE RIFLE, YOU DIDN'T  
17           RECEIVE AN ACTUAL RIFLE THAT LOOKED LIKE THIS?

18           A.    NO, MA'AM.

19           Q.    YOU'RE JUST STATING THAT IT COULD HAVE LOOKED  
20           LIKE THIS?

21           A.    CORRECT.    THAT IS WHAT A STANDARD SKS LOOKS LIKE.

22           Q.    OKAY.    NOW, THE STATE ASKED YOU TO GIVE THEM A  
23           PICTURE THAT REPRESENTED WHAT AN SKS LOOKED LIKE,  
24           AM I CORRECT?

25           A.    YES, MA'AM.

CROSS - JAMES GREEN BY MS. ULLMAN

671

1 Q. THEY DIDN'T ASK YOU FOR A PICTURE OF ANY SORT OF  
2 NINE MILLIMETER?

3 A. NO, MA'AM.

4 Q. OKAY.

5 MS. ULLMAN: JUST ONE SECOND, YOUR HONOR, PLEASE.

6 THE COURT: TAKE YOUR TIME.

7 Q. LET ME ASK YOU JUST ONE MORE QUESTION. ABOUT  
8 THESE SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY THIRTY-NINE  
9 MILLIMETER BULLETS, THERE'S A REPORT THAT YOU  
10 CREATED ABOUT ALL OF YOUR RESULTS, CORRECT?

11 A. YES, MA'AM.

12 Q. AND IN THAT REPORT DID YOU NOT LIST -- WE'LL JUST  
13 GO WITH THE NUMEROUS, MAKES OR MODELS AS TO WHERE  
14 THESE BULLETS COULD HAVE COME FROM, LOOKING AT  
15 PAGE FOUR OF SEVEN OF YOUR REPORT, THAT  
16 BASICALLY, THEY COULD HAVE BEEN FIRED BY THE  
17 FOLLOWING, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO -- THREE  
18 FULL LISTS OF POSSIBLE, POTENTIAL MAKERS OF THIS  
19 GUN, AM I CORRECT?

20 A. YES, MA'AM. BASED ON THE MEASUREMENTS THAT WE  
21 RECEIVED, WHEN WE TALKED ABOUT THE LANDS AND  
22 GROOVES PREVIOUSLY IN THE BARREL, WE'LL MEASURE  
23 THOSE, AND THEN WE'LL USE THOSE MEASUREMENTS AND  
24 PUT THEM INTO A DATA BASE PROVIDED TO US BY THE  
25 FBI, AND BASICALLY WHAT HAPPENS IS, WHEN A

1 FIREARM IS CREATED BY A MANUFACTURER, I BELIEVE  
2 THEY'LL CALL THE FBI AND SAY, HEY, WE'RE MAKING  
3 THIS GUN. THIS IS GOING TO BE THE CALIBER, THIS  
4 IS GOING TO BE THE TYPE OF RIFLING, AND THESE ARE  
5 GOING TO BE THE MEASUREMENTS, AND THEY'LL ENTER  
6 THAT INTO THEIR DATE BASE. SO, IT'S A SEARCH OF  
7 THE DATA BASE SO WE CAN USE IT AND WE'LL INPUT  
8 OUR MEASUREMENTS AND IT WILL GIVE US A LIST OF  
9 FIREARMS THAT HAVE THOSE SIMILAR RIFLING, OR  
10 EXCUSE, THOSE SIMILAR MEASUREMENTS.

11 Q. JUST LOOKING AT THE LIST QUICKLY, I DIDN'T COUNT  
12 ALL OF THEM BUT THERE'S ONE ROW OF SEVENTEEN AND  
13 THERE'S THREE ROWS, BUT DOING THE MATH THERE'S  
14 POTENTIALLY FIFTY-ONE MANUFACTURERS OF THIS  
15 FIREARM, IS THAT CORRECT, AGAIN, LOOKING AT PAGE  
16 FOUR O SEVEN?

17 A. YES, MA'AM.

18 MS. ULLMAN: THANK YOU.

19 THE COURT: MR. PALMER.

20 MR. PALMER: NO QUESTIONS.

21 THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

22 MR. MELLARD: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: MR. KOGER

24 MR. KOGER: JUST A COUPLE.

25 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR.

CROSS - JAMES GREEN BY MR. KOGER

673

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES GREEN

BY MR. KOGER:

1 Q. AGENT GREEN, TO REITERATE WHAT ATTORNEY ULLMAN  
2 JUST STATED, UNDER ITEM FORTY-SEVEN, IS THAT IN  
3 REFERENCE TO THE NINE MILLIMETER OR THE RIFLE?  
4

5 A. THAT WOULD BE -- THAT LONG LIST THAT SHE WAS  
6 SPEAKING OF JUST A MOMENT AGO, THAT'S A LIST OF  
7 FIREARMS IN NINE MILLIMETER LUGER CALIBER THAT  
8 COULD HAVE FIRED THOSE BULLETS.  
9

10 Q. IN RELATION TO NINE MILLIMETER?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. NOW, IT SAYS RIGHT HERE IN THE LAST  
13 PORTION OF YOUR REPORT, AND YOU HAVE THIS LISTED  
14 IN THREE ROWS OF SEVENTEEN, AS SHE STATED IT'S  
15 FIFTY-ONE, IT SAYS, MAYBE NOT -- SO IT COULD  
16 ACTUALLY BE MORE?

17 A. YES, SIR. IF A PARTICULAR FIREARM IS MADE IN  
18 RUSSIA AND IMPORTED BY RSA INDUSTRIES OUT OF NEW  
19 JERSEY THEY MAY HAVE NEGLECTED TO ENTER IT.

20 Q. OKAY.

21 A. SO, IT'S KIND OF LIKE, -- WE REALLY ISSUE THIS  
22 LIST AS AN INVESTIGATIVE TOOL, LIKE IF YOU'RE AN  
23 INVESTIGATOR I'M SAYING, WELL, BASED ON WHAT WE  
24 HAVE THESE WERE ALL FIRED BY ONE FIREARM. I  
25 CAN'T TELL YOU WHAT KIND OF FIREARM IT IS BUT IF

1           YOU GIVE ME ON I MAY BE ABLE TO, AND THIS IS  
2           WHERE YOU MAY WANT TO START LOOKING, WITH  
3           FIREARMS ON THIS LIST. BUT IF YOU -- IT'S KIND  
4           OF AN UNDERSTAND THAT IF SOMETHING IS NOT ON THAT  
5           LIST AND YOU WANT TO SUBMIT IT YOU GIVE US A CALL  
6           AND WE'LL TELL YOU.

7           Q. SO, ACCORDING TO YOUR REPORT THERE ARE AT LEAST  
8           FIFTY-ONE DIFFERENT BRANDS OF NINE MILLIMETERS?

9           A. WELL, THAT COULD HAVE FIRED THOSE BULLETS, YES,  
10          SIR, BUT THERE'S - - -

11          Q. AT LEAST FIFTY-ONE?

12          A. YES, SIR.

13          Q. AND YOU WOULD AGREE THAT A NINE MILLIMETER WAS  
14          NOT SUBMITTED IN COURT, A SPECIFIC FIREARM WAS  
15          NOT SUBMITTED IN COURT TODAY, A NINE MILLIMETER,  
16          CORRECT?

17          A. CORRECT.

18          Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, AS FAR AS WHAT THE ACTUAL RIFLE, I  
19          THINK THAT RIFLE THAT WE ARE DEALING IS A SOVIET  
20          CALIBER RIFLE?

21          A. YES, WELL, IT'S CALLED SEVEN POINT SIX TWO BY  
22          THIRTY-NINE SOVIET SIMPLY BECAUSE THE INVENTOR OF  
23          THE CARTRIDGE WAS FROM RUSSIA, OR THE SOVIET  
24          UNION AND THEY JUST KIND OF TOOK ON THAT NAME.

25          Q. OKAY. AND ACCORDING TO YOUR REPORT HOW MANY

CROSS - JAMES GREEN BY MR. KOGER

675

1 DIFFERENT RIFLES COULD HAVE FIRED THIS CASING OR  
2 PROJECTILE THAT WAS FOUND ON THE SCENE?

3 A. NINE.

4 Q. NINE?

5 A. YES, SIR, NINE IS WHAT'S ON MY LIST.

6 Q. OKAY. AND YOU WOULD AGREE THAT, THAT THE STATE  
7 HAS NOT SUBMITTED A SPECIFIC FIREARM IN RELATION  
8 TO THIS RIFLE IN COURT TODAY?

9 A. CORRECT.

10 Q. AND THE ONLY THING THAT THEY HAVE SUBMITTED IS A  
11 PICTURE OF ONE?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. AND THIS IS NOT IN EVIDENCE, THIS, AN  
14 ACTUAL PHYSICAL RIFLE IS NOT IN EVIDENCE,  
15 CORRECT?

16 A. CORRECT.

17 Q. OKAY. AND THE ONLY FIREARM THAT'S IN EVIDENCE IS  
18 THE FORTY CALIBER?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 MR. KOGER: OKAY. I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

21 THANK YOU.

22 THE COURT: THANK YOU. ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, SIR.

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR, I APPRECIATE  
25 YOU COMING, AGENT GREEN.

1           AGENT GREEN: THANK YOU, HAVE A GREAT DAY, SIR.

2           THE COURT: ALRIGHT, YOU, TOO, I APPRECIATE IT.

3           SOLICITOR SORENSON: MAY HE BE EXCUSED, YOUR  
4 HONOR?

5           THE COURT: HE MAY BE EXCUSED AND -- YOU CAN STEP  
6 DOWN, THANK YOU, SIR, I APPRECIATE IT.

7           COURT REPORTER: YOU DON'T HAVE ANY OF MY  
8 EXHIBITS, DO YOU?

9           AGENT GREEN: NO, MA'AM.

10          COURT REPORTER: GOOD. THANK YOU.

11          THE COURT: SHE'LL RUN YOU DOWN IF YOU DO. OKAY?  
12 THANK YOU, AGENT GREEN.

13                   ALRIGHT, WE'RE GOING TO TAKE ABOUT A TEN OR  
14 FIFTEEN MINUTE BREAK. WE'VE BEEN GOING SINCE  
15 ONE:THIRTY SO WE'LL TAKE ABOUT A TEN OR FIFTEEN  
16 MINUTE BREAK AND THEN COME BACK OUT HERE AND TAKE  
17 SOME MORE TESTIMONY. OKAY? REMEMBER, YOU CANNOT  
18 TALK ABOUT THIS.

19                   AND NOW, MS. WILLIAMS, YOU, AS FOREMAN, YOU MAKE  
20 SURE NOBODY TALKS ABOUT THIS CASE.

21           JUROR FOREMAN: YES, SIR.

22           THE COURT: THANK YOU, MA'AM.

23                   (Whereupon, the jury retires  
24 to the jury room and the following  
25 takes place out of the presence

1 of the jury.)

2 THE COURT: NOW, BEFORE -- MS. WALKER, ARE YOU  
3 STILL WITH ME?

4 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

5 THE COURT: OKAY. MS. ULLMAN, YOU MADE THE,  
6 RENEWED YOUR MOTION FOR ME NOT TO HAVE THAT  
7 PHOTOGRAPH PUT INTO EVIDENCE, - - -

8 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

9 THE COURT: --- AND I TOLD YOU I WAS GOING TO PUT  
10 ON THE RECORD WHY I WAS GOING TO DO THAT.

11 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

12 THE COURT: AND I'M GOING TO DO THAT NOW. MR.  
13 TYLER, WHEN HE TESTIFIED, TESTIFIED THAT THEY HAD --  
14 SKS TYPE WEAPONS WERE USED. THAT IS ONE OF THE TYPES  
15 OF FIREARMS THAT AGENT GREEN TESTIFIED COULD HAVE  
16 FIRED THAT BULLET, AND I THOUGHT IT COULD ASSIST THE  
17 JURY IN DETERMINING WHAT TYPE OF WEAPON WAS USED  
18 BECAUSE, IN FACT, I'M NOT FAMILIAR WITH THAT KIND OF  
19 WEAPON. SO, IT HELPED ME TO VISUALIZE WHAT TYPE  
20 WEAPON WAS USED. THAT WAS THE BASIS FOR IT. I AM  
21 NOTING YOUR OBJECTION ON THE RECORD TO ME PUTTING  
22 THAT INTO EVIDENCE, BUT I WANTED TO PUT ON THE RECORD  
23 WHY I DID IT. OKAY?

24 MS. ULLMAN: I WOULD JUST NOTE THAT THEY DID NOT  
25 SHOW A NINE MILLIMETER, AND I BROUGHT THAT UP, BUT



1           SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR, FOR TODAY.

2           THE COURT: OKAY. I KNOW THE JURY IS GOING TO BE  
3 UPSET.

4           ALRIGHT, IS THE STATE READY TO PROCEED?

5           SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, YOUR HONOR.

6           THE COURT: OKAY. ARE THE DEFENDANTS READY TO  
7 PROCEED?

8           MR. LACKEY: YES, YOUR HONOR.

9           MS. ULLMAN: YES, YOUR HONOR.

10          MR. PALMER: YES, YOUR HONOR.

11          MR. MELLARD: YES, YOUR HONOR.

12          MR. KOGER: YES, YOUR HONOR.

13          THE COURT: OKAY. YOU CAN GET THE JURY ON OUT  
14 HERE.

15          (Whereupon, the jury enters  
16 the courtroom and the following  
17 takes place in the presence  
18 of the jury.)

19          THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I APPRECIATE  
20 Y'ALL GETTING BACK PROMPTLY. I HOPE YOU ENJOYED YOUR  
21 BREAK. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED WITH TAKING SOME MORE  
22 TESTIMONY HERE THIS AFTERNOON.

23          IS THE STATE READY TO PROCEED?

24          SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, YOUR HONOR.

25          THE COURT: ALRIGHT, IF YOU'D CALL YOUR NEXT

1 WITNESS, PLEASE, SIR.

2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: DARRIUS GARNER, YOUR HONOR.

3 CLERK: PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE, SIR,  
4 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.

5 (Whereupon, Darrius Garner  
6 is duly sworn.)

7 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE YOUR FULL NAME FOR  
8 THE COURT.

9 WITNESS: DARRIUS GARNER.

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR.

11 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
12 part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
13 testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
14 testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
15 ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - DARRIUS GARNER BY SOL. PASCOE

681

1

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DARRIUS GARNER

2

BY SOLICITOR PASCOE:

3

Q. OKAY, DARIUS, YOU NEED TO SPEAK UP AS LOUDLY AS  
YOU CAN BECAUSE YOU'RE KIND OF SOFT SPOKEN.

4

5

ALRIGHT? OKAY?

6

A. ALRIGHT.

7

Q. ALRIGHT. AND YOU'VE GOT TO TALK, TOO, BECAUSE  
THE COURT REPORTER HAS TO BE ABLE TO HEAR YOU.

8

9

YOU CAN'T JUST NOD. UNDERSTAND?

10

A. YES, SIR.

11

Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. ARE YOU A LITTLE NERVOUS?

12

A. NO.

13

Q. YOU'RE OKAY?

14

A. (Witness nods head.)

15

THE COURT: OKAY, NOW YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO --

16

INSTEAD OF SHAKING YOUR HEAD YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO

17

SAY YES OR NOT, BECAUSE THEY'RE TAKING DOWN WHAT YOU

18

SAY. OKAY? NOT WHAT YOU SAY BY SHAKING YOUR HEAD.

19

Q. DO YOU UNDERSTAND?

20

A. YES, SIR.

21

Q. OKAY. ARE YOU ALRIGHT? A LITTLE NERVOUS? IS

22

THAT A NO?

23

A. YES, SIR.

24

Q. OKAY. DO YOU NEED ANY WATER OR ANYTHING?

25

A. NO.

1 Q. ALRIGHT. WHERE DO YOU GO TO SCHOOL, DARIUS?

2 A. O-W.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. AND DID WE HAVE TO GET YOU OUT OF  
4 SCHOOL TODAY?

5 A. UH-HUH.

6 Q. ARE YOU UPSET ABOUT THAT?

7 A. (Nods head in the negative.)

8 Q. I DIDN'T THINK SO. THAT'S A NO, WHAT YOU NEED IS  
9 TO ...

10 A. NO, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. WHAT GRADE ARE YOU IN?

12 A. TWELFTH.

13 Q. ARE YOU SET TO GRADUATE ON TIME?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. HAVE I ASKED YOU, HOW OLD ARE YOU, DARIUS?

16 A. SEVENTEEN.

17 Q. SEVENTEEN. WHAT DO YOU WANT TO DO WHEN YOU  
18 GRADUATE FROM O-W?

19 A. BE A MECHANIC.

20 Q. OKAY. DO YOU KNOW SOMEBODY BY THE NAME OF  
21 PATRICK TYLER?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU KNOW PATRICK TYLER?

24 A. SINCE, LIKE, THE EIGHTH GRADE.

25 COURT REPORTER: SINCE APRIL?

DIRECT - DARRIUS GARNER BY SOL. PASCOE

683

1           SOLICITOR PASCOE:   EIGHTH GRADE.

2           A.   EIGHTH GRADE.

3           Q.   AND DO THE TWO OF YOU ALSO GO TO O-W TOGETHER?

4           A.   YES, SIR.

5           Q.   OKAY.   SPEAK UP.

6           A.   YES, SIR.

7           Q.   ALRIGHT.   AND HOW CLOSE WERE YOU AND PATRICK BACK  
8           IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR?

9           A.   WE WAS COOL, WE WOULD CHILL OUT.

10          Q.   WERE Y'ALL CLOSE FRIENDS?

11          A.   YES, SIR.

12          Q.   OKAY.   HOW OFTEN WOULD THE TWO OF YOU HANG OUT  
13          BACK IN MARCH AND FEBRUARY AND JANUARY?

14          A.   DAILY.

15          Q.   LET ME ASK YOU, HOW WELL DO YOU KNOW SOMEBODY BY  
16          THE NAME OF MARIO SHIVERS?

17          A.   I DON'T KNOW HIM.

18          Q.   DID YOU EVER HANG OUT WITH MARIO SHIVERS BEFORE  
19          MARCH THE TWELFTH?

20          A.   NO, SIR.

21          Q.   AND DID YOU KNOW WHAT NAME HE WENT BY?

22          A.   LITTLE M.

23          Q.   LITTLE M?

24          A.   YES, SIR.

25          COURT REPORTER:   LITTLE M?   ALRIGHT.

1 Q. BUT YOU GUYS WEREN'T CLOSE OR ANYTHING, RIGHT?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. DID YOU EVEN KNOW ANYBODY BY THE NAME OF RALPH  
4 COLEMAN?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. DID YOU KNOW ANYBODY BY THE NAME OF WALTER  
7 HARRIS?

8 A. NO, SIR.

9 Q. DID YOU KNOW ANYBODY BY THE NAME OF CHRIS  
10 COLEMAN?

11 A. NO, SIR.

12 Q. DID YOU KNOW OF DANNY RYANT, THOUGH?

13 A. I KNEW OF HIM.

14 Q. OKAY. WHAT DID YOU KNOW HIM BY?

15 A. POKE.

16 Q. POKE? BUT DID YOU EVER HANG OUT WITH DANNY  
17 RYANT?

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. WERE YOU FRIENDS WITH MARIO SHIVERS, RALPH  
20 COLEMAN, WALTER HARRIS, CHRIS COLEMAN, OR DANNY  
21 RYANT?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. BECAUSE THE SIX PEOPLE THAT I'VE ASKED YOU ABOUT,  
24 THE ONLY ONE YOU WERE CLOSE WITH WAS PATRICK?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - DARRIUS GARNER BY SOL. PASCOE

685

1 Q. OKAY. NOW I WANT TO ASK YOU ABOUT THE AFTERNOON  
2 OF MARCH THE TWELFTH OF THIS YEAR, THAT FRIDAY  
3 AFTERNOON. WHO WERE YOU HANGING OUT WITH AT  
4 THREE, FOUR, FIVE, SIX O'CLOCK THAT NIGHT?

5 A. PATRICK.

6 Q. AND WHERE WERE YOU AND PATRICK HANGING OUT AT  
7 THREE, FOUR, FIVE, SIX O'CLOCK?

8 A. AROUND BROOKDALE.

9 Q. OKAY. BROOKDALE, AND THAT'S AN AREA IN THE  
10 NEIGHBORHOOD?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. WHO LIVED IN THE BROOKDALE AREA?

13 A. BOTH OF US.

14 Q. OKAY. BOTH YOU AND PATRICK?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND WHO WAS DRIVING BACK THEN, YOU OR PATRICK?

17 A. ME.

18 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND TELL US WHERE YOU AND  
19 PATRICK ENDED UP GOING SOMETIME BETWEEN, YOU  
20 KNOW, SEVEN:FIFTEEN AND SEVEN:THIRTY?

21 A. WOODBINE.

22 Q. WOODBINE? WHERE IS WOODBINE?

23 A. BY FRED'S.

24 Q. FRED'S, IS THAT A STORE?

25 A. UH-HUH.

DIRECT - DARRIUS GARNER BY SOL. PASCOE

686

- 1 Q. WHERE IS FRED'S?
- 2 A. ON THREE O ONE.
- 3 Q. ON THREE O ONE? OKAY. DID YOU KNOW WHOSE HOUSE
- 4 YOU WERE GOING TO ON WOODBINE?
- 5 A. NO, SIR.
- 6 Q. WHO DIRECTED YOU ON HOW TO GET TO WOODBINE?
- 7 A. P.T.
- 8 Q. P.T. AND WHO IS P.T.?
- 9 A. PATRICK.
- 10 Q. PATRICK, STANDS FOR PATRICK TYLER?
- 11 A. UH-HUH.
- 12 Q. OKAY. AND HAD YOU EVER BEEN TO THE HOUSE ON
- 13 WOODBINE BEFORE?
- 14 A. NO, SIR.
- 15 Q. SO, THAT, MARCH THE TWELFTH, THAT FRIDAY NIGHT
- 16 WAS THE FIRST TIME YOU EVER WENT?
- 17 A. YES, SIR.
- 18 Q. AND DO YOU RECOGNIZE THE HOUSE IN STATE'S
- 19 EXHIBITS THIRTY-TWO AND THIRTY-THREE?
- 20 A. YES, SIR.
- 21 Q. OKAY. IS THAT THE HOUSE ON WOODBINE?
- 22 A. YES, SIR.
- 23 Q. IN FACT, -- AND YOU'VE GOT TO SPEAK UP, OKAY? IN
- 24 FACT, WERE YOU THE ONE WHO DIRECTED MY
- 25 INVESTIGATORS ON HOW TO FIND THAT HOUSE?

DIRECT - DARRIUS GARNER BY SOL. PASCOE

687

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN YOU AND PATRICK GOT TO THE HOUSE  
3 ON WOODBINE WHO WAS THERE?

4 A. LITTLE M AND ANOTHER DUDE WITH THE DREDS, KIND  
5 OF STOCKY.

6 COURT REPORTER: AND ANOTHER DUDE WHAT?

7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: WITH THE DREDS, KIND OF  
8 STOCKY.

9 Q. OKAY. LITTLE M BEING MARIO SHIVERS?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. AND YOU KNEW OF HIM BUT YOU HAD NEVER HUNG  
12 OUT WITH HIM BEFORE THAT NIGHT, RIGHT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. AND YOU HAD NEVER HUNG OUT WITH THE DUDE WITH THE  
15 DREDS BEFORE THAT WAS STOCKY?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 Q. DID YOU EVEN KNOW WHOSE HOUSE THIS WAS WHEN YOU  
18 GOT THERE THAT NIGHT?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. WAS ANYBODY ELSE THERE BESIDES THE HEAVY SEAT GUY  
21 WITH THE DREDS, LITTLE M, YOU AND PATRICK TYLER?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. HOW LONG DID YOU END UP STAYING AT THE HOUSE ON  
24 WOODBINE?

25 A. FOR, LIKE, TWENTY MINUTES.

1 Q. AND WHERE DID Y'ALL HANG OUT, THE FOUR OF YOU,  
2 WHEN YOU WERE AT WOODBINE?

3 A. OUTSIDE.

4 Q. OKAY. ANY PARTICULAR PART OF THE HOUSE OUTSIDE?

5 A. UNDER THE CAR PORT.

6 Q. AND THAT'S THE CAR PORT IN STATE'S EXHIBIT  
7 THIRTY-TWO?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. SPEAK UP, ALRIGHT? AT ANY POINT IN TIME  
10 IN THE TWENTY MINUTES THAT YOU WERE THERE WAS  
11 ANYBODY ELSE THERE BESIDES YOU, LITTLE M, THE  
12 STOCKY GUY WITH THE DREDS, AND PATRICK?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. DID YOU ACTUALLY SEE ANY WEAPONS WHILE YOU  
15 WERE THERE?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 Q. ANY GUNS?

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. ANY RIFLES?

20 A. NO, SIR.

21 Q. DID YOU SEE ANYTHING THAT PEAKED YOUR INTEREST  
22 WHILE YOU WERE THERE?

23 A. A BAG, A RIFLE BAG OR SOMETHING.

24 Q. OKAY. NOW, SAY THAT AGAIN SO I CAN HEAR YOU?

25 A. A RIFLE BAG.

DIRECT - DARRIUS GARNER BY SOL. PASCOE

689

1 Q. OKAY. DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHAT YOU MEAN BY A  
2 RIFLE BAG, AND TELL THEM WHAT IT LOOKED LIKE?

3 A. CAMOUFLAGE.

4 COURT REPORTER: I'M SORRY?

5 A. A CAMOUFLAGE BAG.

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: HE SAID, A CAMOUFLAGE BAG.

7 Q. OKAY. HOW LONG WAS IT?

8 A. I DON'T REALLY KNOW.

9 Q. BUT YOU SAID IT WAS A RIFLE BAG?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. DID ANYBODY SHOW YOU WHAT WAS INSIDE THE BAG?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. DID ANYBODY OPEN UP THE BAG WHILE YOU WERE THERE?

14 A. NO, SIR.

15 Q. SO, IN HONESTY, ALL YOU KNOW IS IT WAS A RIFLE  
16 BAG, YOU DON'T EVEN KNOW WHAT, IF ANYTHING, WAS  
17 IN IT, RIGHT?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. NOW, YOU TESTIFIED YOU STAYED THERE FOR TWENTY  
20 MINUTES. WHAT DID YOU, WHAT DID YOU DO WHILE YOU  
21 WERE THERE WITH LITTLE M, THE GUY WITH THE DREDS,  
22 AND PATRICK, WHAT DID Y'ALL DO, THE FOUR OF YOU  
23 TOGETHER?

24 A. WE WAS SMOKING.

25 Q. SMOKING WHAT?

1 A. WEED.

2 Q. OKAY. AND AFTER THAT TWENTY MINUTES WENT BY WHAT  
3 DID YOU END UP DOING?

4 A. I LEFT AND WENT OVER ON TREADWELL.

5 Q. YOU HAVE TO SAY THAT AGAIN, I DIDN'T EVEN HEAR  
6 THAT. WHAT DID YOU SAY?

7 A. I LEFT AND WENT ON TREADWELL.

8 Q. YOU LEFT AND WENT ON TREADWELL. WHERE IS  
9 TREADWELL?

10 A. BEHIND THE BARBER SHOP.

11 Q. OKAY. WHERE'S -- BEHIND THE BARBER SHOP. WHO  
12 WERE YOU LOOKING FOR?

13 A. SOME GIRLS.

14 Q. A GIRL? ALRIGHT, NOW, I KNOW YOU SPEAK LOUDER  
15 THAN THIS WHEN YOU TALK TO GIRLS. OKAY? SO,  
16 YOU'VE GOT TO SPEAK UP SO WE CAN ALL HEAR YOU.  
17 ALRIGHT? DID ANYBODY ELSE GO WITH YOU, DID  
18 PATRICK GO WITH YOU?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. HE STAYED AT THE HOUSE ON WOODBINE?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. AND YOU LEFT BY YOURSELF?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. WERE YOU A LITTLE UPSET ABOUT THAT?

25 A. NO, SIR.

DIRECT - DARRIUS GARNER BY SOL. PASCOE

691

1 Q. WERE YOU SURPRISED?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. AFTER YOU LEFT WOODBINE TO GO MEET A GIRL  
4 DID YOU EVER HANG OUT WITH LITTLE M AGAIN THAT  
5 NIGHT?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. THE GUY WITH THE -- THE HEAVIER SET GUY WITH THE  
8 DREDS, DID YOU HANG OUT WITH HIM AGAIN THAT  
9 NIGHT?

10 A. NO, SIR.

11 Q. DID YOU EVER GO BACK TO WOODBINE?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. DO YOU KNOW ANY -- DID YOU KNOW ANYBODY BY THE  
14 NAME OF CHARLES PRINGLE?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. HAD YOU EVER BEEN TO SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD?

17 A. NO, SIR.

18 Q. DID YOU EVER SEE PATRICK TYLER AGAIN THAT NIGHT?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. WHAT WAS YOUR CELL PHONE NUMBER BACK THEN?

21 A. 860 0216.

22 Q. SO, IT'S 860 86, I MEAN - - -

23 A. 0216.

24 Q. --- 0216. AND TELL THE JURY WHY PATRICK TYLER  
25 CALLED YOU ON A COUPLE OF OCCASIONS BETWEEN TEN:0

1 TWO P.M. AND TEN:O-SEVEN P.M.?

2 A. HE SAID HE HAD BEEN WALKING THROUGH THE RAIN AND  
3 HE WAS TRYING TO CATCH A RIDE.

4 Q. AND DID YOU GO PICK HIM UP?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. WHERE DID YOU GO PICK HIM UP AT?

7 A. AT THE BOTTOM OF KINGS, BY THE LIGHT.

8 Q. BOTTOM OF WHAT?

9 A. OF KINGS, WHERE THE LIGHT AT, KINGS STREET, WHERE  
10 THE LIGHT AT.

11 Q. KINGS STREET. OKAY. SO, HOW FAR IS THAT TO  
12 BELLEVILLE-COLEMAN AREA?

13 A. DOWN THE STREET.

14 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT WAS THE WEATHER LIKE THAT NIGHT?

15 A. IT WAS RAINING.

16 Q. AND YOU TESTIFIED YOU PICKED HIM UP, AND HE WAS  
17 WALKING IN THE RAIN. WAS ANYONE ELSE WITH HIM  
18 WHEN YOU PICKED HIM UP?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. HOW LONG APPROXIMATELY DID IT TAKE YOU TO GET TO  
21 HIM AFTER HE CALLED YOU?

22 A. LIKE, TEN MINUTES.

23 Q. PRETTY QUICK?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. WAS HE ARMED WITH ANY WEAPON THAT YOU COULD SEE

DIRECT - DARRIUS GARNER BY SOL. PASCOE

693

1           WHEN YOU PICKED HIM UP?

2           A.   NO, SIR.

3           Q.   DID YOU EVER SEE HIM WITH A GUN THAT NIGHT?

4           A.   NO, SIR.

5           Q.   DID HE TELL YOU WHAT HAPPENED AFTER YOU PICKED  
6           HIM UP?

7           A.   NO, SIR.

8           Q.   WHAT DID Y'ALL DO AFTER YOU PICKED HIM UP?

9           A.   I HAD TOOK HIM TO SANTEE.

10          Q.   AND WHO LIVED IN SANTEE?

11          A.   HIS MOM.

12          Q.   HIS MOM DID? DID Y'ALL TALK A LOT ON THE WAY  
13          THERE?

14          A.   NO, SIR.

15          Q.   WHAT DID YOU DO AFTER YOU DROPPED PATRICK TYLER  
16          OFF IN SANTEE, DID YOU STAY THERE?

17          A.   NO, SIR, I CAME BACK TO ORANGEBURG.

18          Q.   YOU HEADED BACK TO ORANGEBURG?

19          A.   YES, SIR.

20          Q.   OKAY.

21                 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE  
22                 ONE SECOND, YOUR HONOR.

23                 THE COURT: OKAY.

24                 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, DARRIUS, ANSWER ANY  
25                 QUESTIONS DEFENSE COUNSEL HAS FOR YOU. AND YOU'VE

1 GOT TO SPEAK UP. OKAY?

2 THE COURT: MR. LACKEY.

3 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR.

4 THE COURT: OKAY.

5 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
6 part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
7 testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
8 testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
9 ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - DARRIUS GARNER BY MR. LACKEY

695

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF DARRIUS GARNER

BY MR. LACKEY:

Q. NOW, DARIUS, YOU, YOU JUST TESTIFIED THAT YOU  
DON'T KNOW WHO CHRISTIAN COLEMAN IS, IS THAT  
CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

MR. LACKEY: I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

MS. ULLMAN?

MS. ULLMAN: I HAVE NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: OKAY. MR. PALMER.

MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

(NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - DARRIUS GARNER BY MR. PALMER

696

1

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF DARRIUS GARNER

2

BY MR. PALMER:

3

Q. DO YOU KNOW WHO WALTER HARRIS IS?

4

A. NO, SIR.

5

Q. YOU DON'T KNOW HIM?

6

A. NO, SIR.

7

Q. AND YOU DIDN'T SEE WALTER HARRIS THAT DAY,

8

CORRECT?

9

A. NO, SIR. I DON'T KNOW HIM.

10

Q. THANK YOU.

11

A. I DON'T KNOW WHO THAT IS.

12

THE COURT: OKAY. MR. MELLARD.

13

MR. MELLARD: I HAVE NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

14

THE COURT; OKAY. MR. KOGER.

15

(NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any

16

part of record has been omitted. Headers on

17

testimony pages and hard page breaks between

18

testimony are now required by the Court. See next

19

ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - DARRIUS GARNER BY MR. KOGER

697

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF DARRIUS GARNER

BY MR. KOGER:

Q. MR. GARNER, BACK IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR WERE YOU ALSO A STUDENT AT ORANGEBURG-WILKERSON?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND YOU WERE, I GUESS YOU WERE A JUNIOR AT THAT PARTICULAR TIME OF THIS INCIDENT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND WHAT TIME DID YOU GET OUT OF SCHOOL DURING THAT PARTICULAR TIME, MARCH OF THIS YEAR?

A. ABOUT THREE:THIRTY-FIVE.

Q. ABOUT THREE:THIRTY. AND WHEN DID YOU GET UP WITH PATRICK TYLER ON THAT DAY?

A. WE CAUGHT THE BUS TOGETHER.

Q. OH, Y'ALL CAUGHT THE BUS TOGETHER. OKAY. Y'ALL CAUGHT THE BUS TOGETHER. HOW DID, AFTER Y'ALL RODE THE BUS, I GUESS, HOME, CORRECT?

A. UH-HUH.

Q. OKAY. WHEN DID Y'ALL GET IN THE CAR AND LEAVE, IN YOUR CAR AND LEAVE?

A. I AIN'T GOT NO CAR BUT IT WAS LATER ON THAT DAY.

Q. LATER ON THAT DAY?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. WHOSE CAR?

A. MY MOM'S BOYFRIEND.

1 Q. WHO?

2 A. MY MOM'S BOYFRIEND.

3 Q. YOUR MOTHER'S BOYFRIEND?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. SO, WHAT TIME DID YOU GET YOUR MOTHER'S  
6 BOYFRIEND'S CAR?

7 A. I DON'T REALLY RECALL THAT.

8 Q. OKAY. YOU DON'T RECALL. YOU JUST TESTIFIED TO  
9 SOME EVENTS THAT HAPPENED ON MARCH TWELFTH, BUT  
10 YOU DON'T RECALL THIS PARTICULAR FACT, CORRECT?

11 A. I DON'T KNOW THE EXACT TIME.

12 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. NOW, BUT AT SOME TIME YOU GOT  
13 TOGETHER BETWEEN THREE AND SIX? YOU SAY YOU GOT  
14 OUT OF SCHOOL -- DID YOU GET OUT OF SCHOOL AT  
15 THREE:THIRTY OR GOT OFF THE BUS AT THREE:THIRTY?

16 A. NO, WE AIN'T GOT OFF THE BUS AT THREE:THIRTY, IT  
17 WAS PROBABLY LIKE GOING ON FOUR WHEN WE GOT OFF  
18 THE BUS.

19 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU GOT OFF THE BUS AT FOUR O'CLOCK.  
20 DOES PATRICK TYLER LIVE NEAR YOU OR SOMETHING?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. OKAY. DID YOU GO HOME WHEN PATRICK TYLER WENT  
23 HOME?

24 A. NO, SIR, WE WAS CHILLING.

25 Q. OH, Y'ALL WERE CHILLING. SO, HE CAME, HE WENT TO

1 YOUR HOUSE OR YOU WENT TO HIS HOUSE?

2 A. HE CAME TO MY HOUSE.

3 Q. HE CAME TO YOUR HOUSE. OKAY. AND WHILE Y'ALL  
4 WERE CHILLING, HOW LONG WERE THE TWO OF YOU THERE  
5 CHILLING?

6 A. I DON'T KNOW, FOR A GOOD LITTLE MINUTE.

7 Q. OKAY. A GOOD LITTLE MINUTE. WHEN DID YOU GET  
8 YOUR MOTHER'S BOYFRIEND'S CAR?

9 A. I DON'T KNOW, IT WAS, LIKE, BEFORE IT START  
10 RAINING, IT WAS BEFORE IT START RAINING.

11 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU STATED THAT WHEN YOU WAS AT THIS  
12 OTHER LOCATION YOU WERE SMOKING WEED, RIGHT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. WHO BROUGHT THE WEED THERE?

15 A. PATRICK.

16 Q. PATRICK BROUGHT THE WEED?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. DID Y'ALL, DID Y'ALL SMOKE WEED BEFORE YOU GOT  
19 THERE?

20 A. NO, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. YOU DIDN'T SMOKE WEED IN YOUR HOUSE?

22 A. IN MY HOUSE?

23 Q. RIGHT.

24 A. NO, SIR.

25 Q. YOU DIDN'T SMOKE WEED IN THE CAR OVER THERE?

1 A. NO, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. SO, PATRICK OBVIOUSLY -- DID Y'ALL STOP TO  
3 BUY WEED BEFORE YOU GOT TO THIS OTHER LOCATION?

4 A. NO, SIR.

5 Q. OKAY. SO, PATRICK BROUGHT THE WEED, HE BROUGHT  
6 THE WEED FROM SCHOOL?

7 A. I AIN'T KNOW WHERE HE BROUGHT IT FROM.

8 Q. OKAY. BUT HE DIDN'T TAKE IT OUT ON THE BUS, DID  
9 HE?

10 A. NO, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, SO, HE BROUGHT THE WEED TO THIS  
12 OTHER LOCATION?

13 A. (Nods head in the affirmative.)

14 Q. OKAY. AND DID Y'ALL START SMOKING THE WEEK SOON  
15 AFTER YOU GOT THERE?

16 A. AFTER WE GOT THERE AND KIND OF TALKED FOR A  
17 LITTLE BIT THEN WE START SMOKING.

18 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND HOW LONG DID Y'ALL SMOKE  
19 WEED?

20 A. PROBABLY LIKE FIFTEEN MINUTES, OR SOMETHING LIKE  
21 THAT.

22 Q. OKAY. HOW MUCH WEED DID YOU SMOKE ON THAT DAY?

23 A. NOT A LOT.

24 Q. WELL, HOW MUCH IS NOT A LOT?

25 A. LIKE, TWO BLUNTS OR SOMETHING.

CROSS - DARRIUS GARNER BY MR. KOGER

701

- 1 Q. TWO BLUNTS A PIECE?
- 2 A. NO, TOGETHER.
- 3 Q. OH, Y'ALL PASSED IT AROUND OR SOMETHING?
- 4 A. UH-HUH.
- 5 Q. OKAY. NOW HAVE YOU SMOKED WEED WITH MR. TYLER IN
- 6 THE PAST?
- 7 A. UH-HUH.
- 8 Q. OKAY. AND HOW OFTEN DID YOU AND MR. TYLER GET
- 9 TOGETHER AND SMOKE WEED?
- 10 A. I AIN'T NEVER KNOW HE HAD IT.
- 11 Q. WHEREVER HE HAD IT. WELL, OFTEN DID YOU HAVE IT?
- 12 A. EVERY NOW AND THEN.
- 13 Q. EVERY NOW AND THEN, WHEN, I MEAN, EVERY NOW AND
- 14 THEN, EVERY WEEK, TWO DAYS A WEEK, THREE DAYS A
- 15 WEEK?
- 16 A. EVERY WEEK.
- 17 Q. EVERY WEEK. OKAY. SO, YOU SMOKED ONCE A WEEK OR
- 18 MULTIPLE TIMES PER WEEK?
- 19 A. MULTIPLE TIMES.
- 20 Q. OKAY. HOW MANY DAYS OUT OF THE WEEK?
- 21 A. ALL WEEK.
- 22 Q. ALL WEEK, ALL SEVEN DAYS?
- 23 A. UH-HUH.
- 24 Q. YOU DIDN'T REST ON SUNDAY?
- 25 A. HUH-UH.

1 Q. OKAY. SO, HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN SMOKING WEED?

2 COURT REPORTER: ANSWER, PLEASE.

3 MR. KOGER: EXCUSE ME?

4 COURT REPORTER: HE DOESN'T, HE'S GOT TO ANSWER.

5 Q. OKAY. SO, HOW LONG HAVE YOU AND PATRICK TYLER  
6 BEEN SMOKING WEED?

7 A. I DON'T KNOW.

8 Q. A YEAR?

9 A. FOR A LONG TIME.

10 Q. A YEAR, TWO YEARS, THREE YEARS?

11 A. ABOUT THREE YEARS.

12 Q. ABOUT THREE YEARS. SO, YOU STARTED SMOKING WEED  
13 AT WHAT AGE?

14 A. PROBABLY LIKE FOURTEEN.

15 Q. FOURTEEN. AND NOW YOU'RE SEVENTEEN. SO, YOU  
16 BEEN SMOKING WEED FOR THREE YEARS?

17 A. (Nods head in the affirmative.)

18 Q. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU KNOWN PATRICK TYLER?

19 A. SINCE EIGHTH GRADE.

20 Q. EIGHTH GRADE. SO, Y'ALL BEEN SMOKING WEED  
21 TOGETHER FOR THREE YEARS?

22 A. (Nods head in the affirmative.)

23 Q. OKAY. NOW, AFTER YOU LEFT HIS LOCATION DID YOU  
24 SMOKE WEED LATER ON THAT NIGHT?

25 A. NO, SIR.

1 Q. OKAY. SO, SO IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY THAT THE ONLY  
2 WEED YOU HAD ON THAT PARTICULAR DAY WAS WHEN YOU  
3 WAS AT THAT PLACE?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. BUT IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY THAT YOU SMOKED WEED  
6 CONTINUOUSLY, EVERY DAY FOR THE PAST THREE YEARS?

7 A. NOT EVERY DAY BUT EVERY DAY I HAD IT.

8 Q. EVERY DAY YOU HAD IT.

9 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU, NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

10 THE COURT: ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, SIR.

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU, SIR, YOU MAY  
13 STEP DOWN, YOU ARE EXCUSED.

14 OKAY. AND IS THAT THE STATE'S LAST WITNESS FOR  
15 THE DAY?

16 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR, YES, SIR. AND  
17 WE'LL JUST HAVE PROBABLY ONE MORE TOMORROW.

18 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,  
19 I'M HOPING YOU FEEL LIKE IT'S GOOD NEWS. WE'RE GOING  
20 TO STOP THE TESTIMONY FOR TODAY AND COME BACK  
21 TOMORROW MORNING AT NINE O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING, AND  
22 RESUME TESTIMONY.

23 AGAIN, LET ME REMIND YOU, YOU CAN'T TALK ABOUT  
24 THE CASE TO ANYBODY, YOU CAN'T READ ANYTHING ABOUT  
25 THE CASE, YOU CAN'T LISTEN TO ANYTHING ABOUT THE CASE

1 ON THE RADIO, YOU CAN'T WATCH ANYTHING ABOUT THE CASE  
2 ON T.V. OR ON THE INTERNET OR DO ANYTHING LIKE THAT.  
3 AND IF SOMEBODY WANTS TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE CASE  
4 OR COMES UP TO TALK TO YOU, FIND OUT WHO THEY ARE  
5 BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT SUPPOSED TO DO THAT. OKAY?

6 Y'ALL HAVE A GOOD EVENING, AND I'LL SEE Y'ALL  
7 BACK HERE AT NINE O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING. THANK YOU  
8 VERY MUCH.

9 (Whereupon, the jury leaves  
10 the courtroom for the day  
11 and the following takes place  
12 out of the presence of the jury.)

13 THE COURT: ANYTHING FROM THE STATE BEFORE WE'RE  
14 IN RECESS?

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, SIR, THANK YOU.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYTHING FROM ANY OF THE  
17 DEFENDANTS BEFORE WE GO INTO RECESS FOR THIS EVENING?

18 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR.

19 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

20 MR. PALMER: NO, SIR.

21 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR.

22 MR. KOGER: NO, SIR.

23 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, I'LL SEE Y'ALL BACK HERE AT  
24 NINE O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING.

25 COURT REPORTER: JUDGE, TELL ALL THE ATTORNEYS TO

1 COUNT THEIR EXHIBITS AND LEAVE THEM ALL WITH ME,  
2 PLEASE.

3 THE COURT: OKAY. IF Y'ALL WILL DOUBLE CHECK THE  
4 EXHIBITS BEFORE YOU LEAVE, MAKE SURE MS. HARRY DOT  
5 HAS THEM ALL. OKAY?

6 Y'ALL HAVE A WONDERFUL EVENING, AND I'LL SEE  
7 Y'ALL IN THE MORNING AT NINE. THANK YOU.

8 (Recess for the day.)

1 DATE:

2 DECEMBER 16, 2010

3 THE COURT: IS THE STATE READY TO PROCEED?

4 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

5 THE COURT: ARE ALL OF THE DEFENDANTS READY TO  
6 PROCEED?

7 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR.

8 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

9 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

10 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

11 MR. KOGER: YES, SIR.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND THE JURY IS ALL  
13 HERE?

14 BAILIFF: YES, SIR.

15 THE COURT: OKAY. BRING THE JURY ON IN.

16 (Whereupon, the jury enters  
17 the courtroom and the following

1 takes place in the presence  
2 of the jury.)

3 THE COURT: GOOD MORNING, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I  
4 HOPE YOU ALL HAD A PLEASANT EVENING. WE ARE NOW  
5 GOING TO PROCEED WITH TESTIMONY.

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THE STATE CALLS LIEUTENANT  
7 JAMES SHUMPERT.

8 CLERK: PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE AND  
9 RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.

10 (Whereupon, James Shumpert  
11 is duly sworn.)

12 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE YOUR FULL NAME FOR  
13 THE COURT.

14 WITNESS: JAMES SHUMPERT.

15 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
16 part of record has been omitted. Headers on  
17 testimony pages and hard page breaks between  
18 testimony are now required by the Court. See next  
19 ensuing page for sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

707

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAMES SHUMPERT

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

1 Q. GOOD MORNING, LIEUTENANT.

2 A. GOOD MORNING.

3 Q. IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY WHERE IT IS THAT  
4 YOU'RE EMPLOYED?

5 A. ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE.

6 Q. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN EMPLOYED WITH THE  
7 ORANGEBURG SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

8 A. GOING ON TWELVE YEARS.

9 Q. IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY WHAT YOUR CURRENT  
10 DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES ARE WITH THE  
11 SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

12 A. I'M A LIEUTENANT OVER CRIMINAL INVESTIGATIONS AND  
13 THE BURGLARY TASK FORCE AT THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY  
14 SHERIFF'S OFFICE AT THIS MOMENT.

15 Q. OKAY. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN EMPLOYED IN  
16 THAT CAPACITY?

17 A. ABOUT, SEVERAL MONTHS NOW.

18 Q. OKAY. AND BACK IN MARCH OF TWO THOUSAND TEN IN  
19 WHAT CAPACITY WERE YOU EMPLOYED AT THAT TIME NINE  
20 MONTHS AGO?

21 A. I WAS THE SERGEANT OVER CRIMINAL INVESTIGATIONS.

22 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU'VE BEEN PROMOTED SINCE MARCH?

23 A. I HAVE.  
24  
25

1 Q. ALRIGHT. AND LET ME ASK YOU, BACK IN MARCH OF  
2 TWO THOUSAND TEN WERE YOU ASSIGNED AS THE LEAD  
3 INVESTIGATOR INTO THE MURDER OF CHARLES PRINGLE?

4 A. I WAS.

5 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY,  
6 LIEUTENANT, TO RESPOND OUT TO THE SCENE THAT  
7 NIGHT, AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD?

8 A. I DID.

9 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THERE WERE OTHER OFFICERS AND  
10 INVESTIGATORS THAT ALSO RESPONDED OUT THERE THAT  
11 NIGHT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, DID YOU BECOME AWARE AT ANY POINT  
14 IN TIME WHETHER THERE WAS A WITNESS WHO WAS  
15 ACTUALLY IN THE APARTMENT AT THE TIME THE  
16 HOMICIDE OCCURRED?

17 A. I DID.

18 Q. AND WHO WAS THAT WITNESS?

19 A. MS. ASHLEY PARSLEY.

20 Q. AND DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY THEN THAT NIGHT,  
21 INTO THE EARLY MORNING HOURS OF THE THIRTEENTH TO  
22 TAKE A STATEMENT FROM MS. PARSLEY?

23 A. I DID.

24 Q. AND I'M SHOWING YOU DEFENDANT MARIO SHIVERS'S  
25 EXHIBIT NUMBER ONE. IS THAT THE STATEMENT YOU

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

709

1           TOOK FROM MS. PARSLEY?

2           A.    IT IS.

3           Q.    AND WHAT TIME WAS THAT STATEMENT TAKEN?

4           A.    TWO:TWENTY-FIVE A.M.

5           Q.    SO, THAT WOULD BE - - -

6           A.    ON THE THIRTEENTH.

7           Q.    --- THAT WOULD BE FOUR HOURS, FOUR AND A HALF  
8           HOURS AFTER THE HOMICIDE, IS THAT CORRECT?

9           A.    CORRECT.

10          Q.    LET ME SHOW YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED AS STATE'S  
11          EXHIBIT NUMBER NINETY-FOUR OR ID, DOES THAT  
12          ACCURATELY DEPICT THE CALENDER OF THE MONTH OF  
13          MARCH THIS YEAR?

14          A.    IT IS.

15          SOLICITOR SORENSON:   YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
16          WE'D OFFER STATE'S NUMBER NINETY-FOUR INTO EVIDENCE.

17          THE COURT:    ANY OBJECTION?

18          MR. LACKEY:    NO OBJECTION.

19          MS. ULLMAN:    NO OBJECTION.

20          MR. PALMER:    NO, SIR.

21          MR. MELLARD:   NO OBJECTION.

22          MR. KOGER:    NO OBJECTION.

23          THE COURT:    ALRIGHT, IT IS ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE  
24          WITHOUT OBJECTION.

25          (State's Exhibit Ninety-four

1 marked and filed.)

2 Q. NOW, THIS INCIDENT HAPPENED ON?

3 A. MARCH TWELFTH.

4 Q. MARCH TWELFTH. AND THAT WOULD BE -- WHAT DAY OF  
5 THE WEEK WOULD THAT BE?

6 A. I BELIEVE THAT WAS ON A FRIDAY, IF I'M NOT  
7 MISTAKEN.

8 Q. AND IN LOOKING AT STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER NINETY-  
9 FOUR, WHAT DOES THE CALENDAR INDICATE THAT DAY  
10 WAS -- AND JUST HOLD ON THAT IN CASE YOU NEED IT.  
11 CAN YOU SEE IT FROM THERE OR I'LL TURN IT, I'LL  
12 TURN IT.

13 A. RIGHT HERE, MARCH TWELFTH.

14 Q. OKAY. SO, THAT WOULD BE A FRIDAY NIGHT?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. ALRIGHT. SO, MS. PARSLEY'S STATEMENT WAS TAKEN  
17 AT TWO:TWENTY-FIVE THAT SATURDAY MORNING  
18 AFTERWARDS, IS THAT CORRECT?

19 A. THAT'S CORRECT, YES, SIR.

20 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, OVER THAT WEEKEND, ON SATURDAY THE  
21 THIRTEENTH, DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY ALSO TO  
22 TALK TO A YOUNG MAN BY THE NAME OF SHANNON  
23 MITCHELL?

24 A. I DID.

25 Q. AND THROUGH MR. MITCHELL WERE YOU ULTIMATELY

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

711

1 ABLE TO -- LET ME ASK YOU THIS, HAD MS. PARSLEY  
2 GIVEN YOU INFORMATION ABOUT AN INDIVIDUAL BEING  
3 IN THE APARTMENT A SHORT TIME BEFORE THE  
4 HOMICIDE?

5 A. SHE DID.

6 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN YOU TALKED TO MR. MITCHELL WERE  
7 YOU ULTIMATELY ABLE TO GET A NAME OF WHO THAT  
8 PERSON WAS?

9 A. I DID.

10 Q. AND WHO WAS THAT?

11 A. WALTER HARRIS.

12 Q. OKAY. AND DID MR. HARRIS HAVE A NICK NAME THAT  
13 HE WENT BY?

14 A. PETE.

15 Q. AND AS A RESULT OF THAT, GETTING THAT INFORMATION  
16 FROM MR. MITCHELL, DID YOU THEN HAVE AN  
17 OPPORTUNITY ON THE FIFTEENTH OF MARCH -- SO NOW  
18 THAT WOULD BE INTO MONDAY, TO SHOW MS. PARSLEY A  
19 PHOTO LINEUP CONTAINING A PICTURE OF WALTER  
20 HARRIS?

21 A. I DID.

22 Q. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THREE,  
23 IS THAT THE LINEUP YOU SHOWED MS. PARSLEY ON  
24 MARCH THE FIFTEENTH?

25 A. IT WAS, YES, SIR.

1 Q. OKAY. AND WHO, WHAT SUSPECT IS IN THAT LINEUP?

2 A. WALTER HARRIS.

3 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT PHOTOGRAPH IS HE IN THAT LINEUP?

4 A. NUMBER THREE.

5 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME SEE IT REAL QUICK. AND MR.

6 HARRIS HOW HE IS NUMBER THREE, IS THAT

7 ESSENTIALLY HOW MR. HARRIS LOOKED BACK IN MARCH

8 OF THIS YEAR?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. THAT IS NOT?

11 A. HE HAD, LIKE, SMALL TWISTIES IN HIS HAIR.

12 Q. OKAY. SO HIS HAIR WAS A LITTLE DIFFERENT THAN IT

13 IS IN THIS PICTURE?

14 A. CORRECT.

15 Q. OKAY. IS IT ALSO A LITTLE DIFFERENT THAN IT IS

16 HERE IN COURT TODAY?

17 A. IT IS.

18 Q. WHEN YOU SHOWED MS. PARSLEY THIS LINEUP DID YOU

19 TELL HER SHE HAD TO PICK SOMEBODY OUT?

20 A. NO, SIR.

21 Q. SUGGEST TO HER WHO TO PICK OUT?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. AND WAS, -- SHE, IN FACT, AS IS CIRCLED

24 AND DATED AND INITIALED, DID SHE PICK OUT MR.

25 HARRIS'S PICTURE?

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

713

1 A. CORRECT.

2 Q. AND THE ATTACHED AFFIDAVIT TO STATE'S EXHIBIT  
3 NUMBER THREE, WHO FILLED THAT OUT?

4 A. SHE DID, THAT'S HER HANDWRITING. I JUST SIGNED TO  
5 WITNESS IT.

6 Q. OKAY. SHE SIGNED IT ALSO?

7 A. SHE DID.

8 Q. AND THAT WAS DONE BACK ON MARCH THE FIFTEENTH?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. NOW, AFTER SHE PICKED HIM OUT WERE YOU ABLE TO AT  
11 THAT POINT IN TIME DETERMINE A POSSIBLE ADDRESS  
12 FOR MR. HARRIS?

13 A. I DID.

14 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHERE WAS THAT?

15 A. SEVEN, I BELIEVE IT WAS SEVEN O EIGHT  
16 REPRESENTATIVE CIRCLE.

17 Q. AND WHERE IS THAT LOCATED AT?

18 A. WHAT WE CALL ROOSEVELT GARDENS APARTMENT COMPLEX  
19 OFF OF SIX O ONE.

20 Q. OKAY. AND ON MARCH THE SIXTEEN, OR THAT  
21 FOLLOWING DAY, THAT TUESDAY, DID THE SHERIFF'S  
22 OFFICE, DID Y'ALL HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO EXECUTE  
23 A SEARCH WARRANT ON THAT RESIDENCE?

24 A. WE DID.

25 Q. OKAY. NOW, LET ME ASK YOU, BACK FROM RESPONDING

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

714

1           OUT TO THE SCENE THAT NIGHT, AND SPEAKING TO  
2           INVESTIGATORS, INCLUDING LIEUTENANT CARTER, DID  
3           YOU KNOW WHAT TYPE OF CALIBER WEAPONS YOU WERE  
4           LOOKING FOR IN THIS CASE?

5           A.    I DID.

6           Q.    AND WHAT CALIBER WEAPONS WERE YOU LOOKING FOR?

7           A.    FROM TALKING TO LIEUTENANT CARTER, HE STATED THAT  
8           WE MAY POSSIBLY BE LOOKING FOR A NINE MILLIMETER,  
9           FORTY CAL, AND ANY TYPE OF WEAPON THAT MAY SHOOT  
10          A SEVEN POINT SIX TWO CARTRIDGE.

11          Q.    OKAY.  AND THAT WOULD BE LIKE A RIFLE ROUND?

12          A.    YES, SIR.

13          Q.    OKAY.  ALRIGHT, NOW LET ME ASK YOU, WHEN YOU  
14          SEARCHED WALTER HARRIS'S -- THAT APARTMENT THAT  
15          DAY ON THE SIXTEENTH DID YOU FIND A NINE  
16          MILLIMETER PISTOL?

17          A.    NO, WE DID NOT.

18          Q.    DID YOU FIND A FORTY CALIBER PISTOL?

19          A.    NO, WE DID NOT.

20          Q.    DID YOU FIND ANY RIFLES?

21          A.    NO, WE DID NOT.

22          Q.    ALRIGHT.  AND FOLLOWING UP ON THAT, THOUGH, THE  
23          FOLLOWING DAY, ON MARCH THE SEVENTEENTH OR  
24          THEREABOUTS DID YOU LEARN OF A POSSIBLE LOCATION  
25          FOR THE FORTY CALIBER PISTOL THAT WAS ALLEGEDLY

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

715

1 USED IN MR. PRINGLE'S MURDER?

2 A. WE DID.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. AND AT THAT POINT IN TIME WHO DID YOU  
4 LEARN ALLEGEDLY HAD THAT WEAPON?

5 A. ANDRE WASHINGTON.

6 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU THEN DO AS A RESULT OF  
7 LEARNING THAT?

8 A. WELL, WHAT WE DID, WE GOT IN CONTACT WITH AN  
9 INDIVIDUAL BY THE NAME OF CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT. WE  
10 GAVE HIM THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS TO GO BUY THE  
11 WEAPON BACK. WE PUT A WIRE ON HIM, VIDEO SO WE  
12 COULD MONITOR THE TRANSACTION, AND ESSENTIALLY,  
13 AFTER HE OBTAINED THE WEAPON HE TURNED IT BACK  
14 OVER TO US.

15 Q. OKAY. SO YOU, IMMEDIATELY GOT POSSESSION OF THAT  
16 WEAPON?

17 A. YES, SIR, WE DID.

18 Q. OKAY. IN SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS NUMBER  
19 SEVENTY-THREE AND SEVENTY-FOUR, IS THAT THE  
20 WEAPON THAT MR. DWIGHT PURCHASED FROM MR.  
21 WASHINGTON AND THEN TURNED OVER TO YOU ON MARCH  
22 THE SEVENTEENTH?

23 A. YES, SIR, IT IS.

24 Q. AND AFTER THAT WAS DONE WERE YOU ULTIMATELY ABLE  
25 THEN TO TALK TO, OR DID YOU TALK TO MR.

1 WASHINGTON, ANDREW WASHINGTON?

2 A. I DID.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, ON MARCH THE SEVENTEENTH WHAT  
4 HAPPENED TO WALTER HARRIS ON MARCH THE  
5 SEVENTEENTH?

6 A. HE WAS ARRESTED.

7 Q. WERE YOU ABLE TO DETERMINE THROUGH YOUR  
8 INVESTIGATION WHAT WALTER HARRIS'S CELL PHONE  
9 NUMBER WAS THAT HE HAD BACK THEN?

10 A. I DID.

11 Q. AND LET ME SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVEN  
12 -- OR, I'M SORRY, THIRTY-SIX, AND ARE THOSE THE  
13 RECORDS THAT YOU THEN OBTAINED?

14 A. LET ME COMPARE IT TO MY NOTES AS WELL.

15 Q. YES, SIR.

16 A. YES, SIR, IT IS.

17 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT IS THAT CELL PHONE NUMBER?

18 A. 347, OR 803 347 9288.

19 Q. OKAY. AND THOSE RECORDS, I THINK WE'VE HEARD  
20 TESTIMONY FROM THE ALLTEL REPRESENTATIVE IN THE  
21 NAME OF PETEY CRACK LOCATED ON FIFTEEN TWENTY-  
22 FIVE ASHLEY AVENUE?

23 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE'S  
24 TESTIFYING. HE COULD ASK HIM WHAT THE PIECE OF PAPER  
25 SAYS.

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

717

1           THE COURT: IF YOU'D JUST REPHRASE THE QUESTION.

2           SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

3           Q. WHAT IS THAT, AND WE'VE HEARD TESTIMONY OF THIS,  
4           BUT WHAT IS THE NAME AND ADDRESS THAT THOSE  
5           RECORDS ARE IN?

6           A. IT SAYS, "PETEY CRACK, FIFTEEN TWENTY-FIVE ASHLEY  
7           AVENUE."

8           Q. OKAY. WHOSE HOUSE IS LOCATED AT FIFTEEN TWENTY-  
9           FIVE ASHLEY AVENUE?

10          A. WALTER HARRIS'S GRANDMAMA.

11          Q. OKAY. NOW, THE FOLLOWING DAY, ON MARCH THE  
12          EIGHTEEN, SO THAT WOULD BE NOW INTO THURSDAY OF  
13          MARCH OF THIS YEAR, DID ANY OTHER DEFENDANTS AT  
14          THAT POINT TIME TURN THEMSELVES IN ON THAT  
15          THURSDAY, MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH?

16          A. YES, SIR.

17          Q. AND WHO WAS THAT?

18          A. DANNY RYANT AND PATRICK TYLER.

19          Q. OKAY. AND WERE THEY BOTH ARRESTED AT THAT POINT  
20          IN TIME?

21          A. THEY WERE.

22          Q. BOTH CHARGED WITH MURDER, BURGLARY, FIRST, ARMED  
23          ROBBERY?

24          A. YES, SIR, THEY WERE.

25          Q. NOW, DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY ON MARCH THE

1 EIGHTEENTH TO TAKE A STATEMENT, OR TO TALK TO AND  
2 TAKE A STATEMENT FROM PATRICK TYLER?

3 A. I DID.

4 Q. ALRIGHT. I'M SHOWING YOU, IT LOOKS LIKE  
5 DEFENDANT MARIO SHIVERS'S EXHIBIT NUMBER TWO, IS  
6 THAT THE STATEMENT THAT YOU TOOK FROM MR. TYLER  
7 ON MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH?

8 A. IT IS.

9 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW WHO IS -- NOW, WHERE WAS IT -- I  
10 BELIEVED I HAS ASKED YOU EARLIER, BUT DID MR.  
11 TYLER TURN HIMSELF IN?

12 A. HE DID.

13 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE WAS THAT THAT HE TURNED HIMSELF  
14 IN?

15 A. AT FIFTEEN TWENTY ELLIS AVENUE, AT THE MAIN  
16 OFFICE AT THE COMPLEX.

17 Q. OKAY. AND IS THAT WHERE YOU TOOK THE STATEMENT  
18 FROM HIM?

19 A. IT WAS.

20 Q. AND WHO WAS WITH MR. TYLER WHEN HE TURNED HIMSELF  
21 IN?

22 A. HIS PARENTS.

23 Q. ALRIGHT. AND BACK ON MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH OF  
24 THIS YEAR WHEN HE DID TURN HIMSELF IN, HOW OLD  
25 WAS PATRICK TYLER AT THAT TIME?

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

719

1 A. AT THE TIME HE WAS SIXTEEN.

2 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU INDICATED HIS PARENTS WERE WITH  
3 HIM, DID HE HAVE AN ATTORNEY WITH HIM AT THAT  
4 TIME?

5 A. NO, HE DID NOT.

6 Q. OKAY. NOW, BEFORE YOU TOOK THAT STATEMENT FROM  
7 HIM WAS THERE ANYTHING YOU WENT OVER WITH MR.  
8 TYLER?

9 A. I ADVISED HIM OF HIS MIRANDA WARNINGS.

10 Q. DID YOU DO THAT WITH A WRITTEN FORM?

11 A. YES, I DID.

12 Q. OKAY. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
13 NINETY-FIVE, IS THAT THE FORM THAT YOU WENT OVER  
14 WITH HIM?

15 A. IT IS.

16 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
17 WE'D OFFER STATE'S NINETY-FIVE INTO EVIDENCE.

18 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

19 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

20 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

21 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

22 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

23 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT IT IS -- STATE'S NINETY-FIVE  
25 IS ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE WITHOUT OBJECTION.

1 (State's Exhibit Ninety-five  
2 marked and filed.)

3 Q. AND I'LL LET YOU HOLD ON TO THAT. AND IN  
4 LOOKING AT STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER NINETY-FIVE,  
5 DOES THAT INDICATE WHAT DATE YOU WENT OVER THAT  
6 FORM WITH MR. TYLER?

7 A. IT IS.

8 Q. AND WHAT DAY IS THAT?

9 A. MARCH EIGHTEENTH.

10 Q. OF THIS YEAR, TWO THOUSAND TEN?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND WHAT, HOW ABOUT, IS THERE A TIME ON IT ALSO?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. AND WHAT'S THE TIME?

15 A. FOUR:FORTY-THREE P.M.

16 Q. OKAY. AND IF YOU WOULD, JUST GO OVER WITH THE  
17 JURY WHAT RIGHTS YOU WENT OVER WITH MR. TYLER  
18 THAT AFTERNOON AT FOUR:FORTY-THREE OR SO IN THE  
19 AFTERNOON?

20 A. YES, SIR. THE STATEMENT SAYS, IT SAYS, "BEFORE  
21 WE ASK YOU ANY QUESTIONS YOU MUST UNDERSTAND YOUR  
22 RIGHTS." AND THEN WE ASK HIM TO PLEASE INITIAL  
23 BY EACH AFTER WE READ THEM THEIR RIGHTS. AND THE  
24 FIRST, NUMBER SAYS, "YOU HAVE A RIGHT TO REMAIN  
25 SILENT. ANYTHING YOU SAY CAN BE USED AGAINST YOU

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

721

1 IN COURT." NUMBER TWO SAYS, "YOU HAVE THE RIGHT  
2 TO TALK TO A LAWYER FOR ADVICE BEFORE WE ASK YOU  
3 ANY QUESTIONS, HAVE HIM WITH YOU DURING  
4 QUESTIONING." NUMBER THREE SAYS, "IF YOU CANNOT  
5 AFFORD A LAWYER ONE WILL BE APPOINTED FOR YOU  
6 BEFORE ANY QUESTIONS IF YOU WISH." NUMBER FOUR,  
7 "IF YOU DECIDE TO ANSWER QUESTIONS WITHOUT A  
8 LAWYER PRESENT YOU WILL STILL HAVE THE RIGHT TO  
9 STOP ANSWERING QUESTIONS AT ANYTIME." NUMBER  
10 FIVE, "YOU ALSO HAVE THE RIGHT TO STOP ANSWERING  
11 QUESTIONS AT ANYTIME UNTIL YOU TALK TO A LAWYER."  
12 AFTER I WENT OVER THE RIGHTS WITH HIM HE  
13 INITIALED EACH ONE. AT THE BOTTOM HERE IT SAYS,  
14 "I UNDERSTAND MY RIGHTS." AND HE SIGNED HIS  
15 NAME. AND THEN AT THE BOTTOM OF THE PAPER IT  
16 SAYS, "WAIVER OF YOUR RIGHTS." AND IT SAYS, "I  
17 HAVE READ THE STATEMENT OF MY RIGHTS. I  
18 UNDERSTAND WHAT MY RIGHTS ARE. I AM WILLING TO  
19 MAKE A STATEMENT AND ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. I DO  
20 NOT WANT A LAWYER AT THIS TIME. I UNDERSTAND AND  
21 KNOW WHAT I'M DOING. NO PROMISE OR THREATS HAVE  
22 BEEN MADE TO ME OR NO PRESSURE OR COERCION OF ANY  
23 KIND HAVE BEEN USED AGAINST ME." AND AGAIN, HE  
24 SIGNED HIS NAME AT THE TOP, AND I WITNESSED IT AT  
25 THE BOTTOM.

1 Q. OKAY. NOW, AT THAT POINT IN TIME WHAT WAS, WHAT  
2 WAS MR. TYLER'S DEMEANOR LIKE WHEN YOU WERE  
3 INITIALLY TALKING TO HIM?

4 A. WELL, WHEN I FIRST MADE CONTACT WITH MR. TYLER HE  
5 FIRST TOLD ME THAT HE DIDN'T KNOW NOTHING ABOUT  
6 NOTHING, AND HE DIDN'T EVEN KNOW WHY HE WAS  
7 THERE.

8 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, WHAT ULTIMATELY ENDED UP  
9 HAPPENING AFTER THAT?

10 A. WELL, AFTER I KEPT SPEAKING WITH MR. TYLER, HE  
11 JUST BROKE DOWN AND HE STARTED CRYING, AND HE  
12 SAID THAT, I WANT TO TELL THE TRUTH NOW. HE JUST  
13 SAID, I WANT TO TELL THE TRUTH, AND KEPT SAYING  
14 IT.

15 Q. ALRIGHT. AND DID YOU ULTIMATELY AT THAT POINT IN  
16 TIME TAKE THAT WRITTEN STATEMENT FROM MR. TYLER?

17 A. I DID.

18 Q. IT'S DEFENDANT'S SHIVERS'S NUMBER TWO?

19 A. IT IS.

20 Q. OKAY. AND DID MR. TYLER SIGNED THAT STATEMENT  
21 ALSO?

22 A. YES, HE SIGNED IT ON THE BACK.

23 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, LET ME ASK YOU THIS, LIEUTENANT  
24 SHUMPERT, DURING ALL OF THAT, DEALINGS WITH MR.  
25 TYLER BACK ON MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH, DID YOU AT

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

723

1 ANY POINT IN TIME PROMISE HIM ANYTHING TO GET HIM  
2 TO TALK TO YOU AND TO GIVE YOU THAT STATEMENT?

3 A. NO, I DIDN'T.

4 Q. DID YOU MAKE ANY OFFERS OR ANY DEALS TO GET HIM  
5 TO TALK WITH YOU BACK ON MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH?

6 A. NO, I DIDN'T.

7 Q. AND IN FACT, AFTER YOU GOT DONE WAS HE CHARGED AT  
8 THAT POINT IN TIME WITH MURDER, BURGLARY, FIRST  
9 DEGREE, AND ARMED ROBBERY?

10 A. YES, HE WAS.

11 Q. AND TAKEN OFF TO JAIL?

12 A. WELL, DJJ AT THE TIME.

13 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S BECAUSE HE WAS SIXTEEN AT THE  
14 TIME?

15 A. CORRECT.

16 Q. BUT HE WAS CHARGED AS AN ADULT RIGHT FROM THE GET  
17 GO?

18 A. YES, HE WAS.

19 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, IN THAT STATEMENT, THAT DEFENDANT  
20 SHIVERS'S NUMBER TWO STATEMENT OF MY TYLER, DOES  
21 HE REFERENCE IN THERE A DRIVER ALSO BEING  
22 INVOLVED?

23 A. HE DID.

24 Q. AND DID HE INDICATE THAT BACK ON MARCH THE  
25 EIGHTEENTH THAT HE KNEW WHO THAT DRIVER WAS?

1 A. HE DID NOT.

2 Q. OKAY. AND HAS HE EVER INDICATED TO YOU THAT  
3 YOU'RE AWARE OF THAT HE KNEW WHO THE DRIVER WAS?

4 A. NO, HE NEVER KNEW WHO THE DRIVER WAS.

5 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, WHAT WAS THE FIRST TIME YOU CAME  
6 INTO PHYSICAL CONTACT WITH A YOUNG MAN BY THE  
7 NAME OF RONNIE WASHINGTON?

8 A. TWO WEEKS AGO, I BELIEVE IT PROBABLY WOULD BE  
9 NOVEMBER THIRTIETH.

10 Q. AND DID YOU TAKE A STATEMENT FROM HIM AT THAT  
11 TIME?

12 A. I DID.

13 Q. LET ME SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS NUMBER TWENTY,  
14 TWENTY-EIGHT AND TWENTY-NINE. HAVE YOU SEEN  
15 THOSE PHOTOGRAPHS BEFORE?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. AND WHOSE, WHOSE FORD EXPLORER, WHO DOES THAT  
18 FORD EXPLORER BELONG TO?

19 A. RONNIE WASHINGTON.

20 Q. AND WHO WAS DRIVING THIS BACK ON MARCH THE  
21 TWELFTH OF TWO THOUSAND AND TEN?

22 A. RONNIE WASHINGTON.

23 Q. NOW, HAS MR. WASHINGTON AT THIS TIME BEEN CHARGED  
24 WITH ANYTHING, LIEUTENANT?

25 A. NOT AT THIS TIME.

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

725

1 Q. AND IS THAT SOMETHING THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE IS  
2 STILL EVALUATING?

3 A. WE ARE.

4 Q. AND YET AGAIN, HE JUST CAME TO YOUR ATTENTION TWO  
5 WEEKS AGO?

6 A. TWO WEEKS AGO.

7 Q. ALRIGHT. ALSO, AS PART OF YOUR INVESTIGATION AND  
8 TALKING TO PATRICK BACK IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR DID  
9 YOU LEARN WHAT PATRICK TYLER'S CELL PHONE IS?

10 A. I DID.

11 Q. ALRIGHT. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
12 THIRTY-FIVE, IS THAT MR. TYLER'S RECORDS THAT YOU  
13 OBTAINED?

14 A. IT IS.

15 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHAT IS THAT NUMBER?

16 A. 803 860 6062.

17 Q. OKAY. NOW, ALSO ON THAT DATE, THAT MARCH, ON  
18 MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY  
19 TO SHOW MR. TYLER ANY PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUPS?

20 A. I DID.

21 Q. I'M SPECIFICALLY SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS  
22 NUMBER SEVENTY-SIX AND SEVENTY-SEVEN. DID YOU  
23 HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHOW HIM THOSE TWO  
24 LINEUPS, ON MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH?

25 A. I DID.

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

726

1 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHO WAS CONTAINED IN THOSE TWO  
2 LINEUPS THAT YOU SHOWED TO HIM ON MARCH THE  
3 EIGHTEENTH?

4 A. DANNY RYANT AND MARIO SHIVERS.

5 Q. OKAY. AND WAS HE ABLE TO PICK MR. RYANT AND MR.  
6 SHIVERS OUT AS BEING THE PEOPLE THAT HE HAD  
7 REFERENCED IN THAT STATEMENT HE GAVE TO YOU?

8 A. HE DID.

9 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
10 WE'D OFFER STATE'S SEVENTY-SIX AND SEVENTY-SEVEN INTO  
11 EVIDENCE.

12 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION? I THOUGHT,-- THEY'RE  
13 WEREN'T IN ALREADY?

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, SIR.

15 THE COURT: OKAY.

16 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

17 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

18 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

19 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

20 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

21 THE COURT: OKAY, WITHOUT OBJECTION, THEY ARE  
22 ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.

23 (State's Exhibits Seventy-six and Seventy-seven  
24 marked and filed.)

25 Q. STARTING INITIALLY, LIEUTENANT WITH STATE'S

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

727

1 EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY-SIX, WAS HE ABLE TO PICK  
2 SOMEBODY OUT OF STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY-  
3 SIX?

4 A. HE DID.

5 Q. AND WHO IS THAT THAT HE PICKED OUT?

6 A. DANNY RYANT, NUMBER TWO.

7 Q. AND THAT'S PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER TWO?

8 A. UH-HUH.

9 Q. AND YET AGAIN, DID YOU AT ANY POINT IN TIME  
10 SUGGEST OR TELL MR. TYLER WHO TO PICK OUT?

11 A. NO, I DID NOT.

12 Q. DID HE FREELY AND VOLUNTARILY DO THAT?

13 A. HE DID.

14 Q. DID HE FILL OUT THE ACCOMPANYING AFFIDAVIT WITH  
15 THAT?

16 A. HE DID.

17 Q. AND WHAT DID HE INDICATE AS FAR AS BEING WHY HE  
18 PICKED OUT PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER TWO?

19 A. "WAS WITH A GUN IN THE APARTMENT, IT HAPPENED  
20 LAST FRIDAY."

21 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU ALSO INDICATED THAT YOU SHOWED  
22 HIM STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY-SEVEN AT THAT  
23 TIME. WAS HE ABLE TO PICK SOMEBODY OUT OF  
24 STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY-SEVEN?

25 A. HE DID.

1 Q. AND WHAT PHOTOGRAPH WAS THAT?

2 A. NUMBER THREE, MARIO SHIVERS.

3 Q. SO, THAT'S MR. SHIVERS?

4 A. IT IS.

5 Q. OKAY. AND YET AGAIN, DID YOU PROMISE HIM  
6 ANYTHING, SUGGEST TO HIM IN ANY WAY, YOU KNOW,  
7 TELL HIM THAT HE HAD TO, OR WHO TO PICK OUT OF  
8 THIS PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUP?

9 A. NO, SIR, I DID NOT.

10 Q. AND HE CIRCLED, DATED AND INITIALED THAT?

11 A. HE DID.

12 Q. AND I BELIEVE, DID HE ALSO WRITE SOMETHING ELSE  
13 UNDERNEATH THE PICTURE?

14 A. HE DID. HE WROTE, "LITTLE M."

15 Q. OKAY. AND WHY DID HE WRITE THAT?

16 A. THAT'S THE NICK NAME HE KNEW HIM BY.

17 Q. AND DID HE ALSO THEN FILL OUT THE ACCOMPANYING  
18 AFFIDAVIT?

19 A. HE DID.

20 Q. AND WHAT DID HE PUT ON THERE AS FAR AS WHY HE  
21 PICKED OUT MARIO SHIVERS, OR LITTLE M?

22 A. "HAD GUN, WE WENT INTO APARTMENT, LITTLE M,  
23 HAPPENED LAST FRIDAY."

24 Q. AND GOING BACK TO STATE'S SEVENTY-SIX, WITH MR.  
25 RYANT, DID HE ALSO PUT THE NICK NAME THAT HE KNEW

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

729

1 MR. RYANT BY UNDER HIS PHOTO?

2 A. HE DID.

3 Q. AND WHAT IS THAT NICK NAME?

4 A. "POKE."

5 Q. NOW, AT THAT POINT IN TIME WHEN YOU WERE SHOWING  
6 THOSE TWO ITEMS OF MR. SHIVERS AND MR. RYANT TO  
7 MR. TYLER, WALTER HARRIS HAD ALREADY BEEN  
8 ARRESTED THE DAY BEFORE?

9 A. YES, SIR, HE ALREADY BEEN ARRESTED.

10 Q. NOW, THE FOLLOWING DAY, ON MARCH THE NINETEENTH,  
11 DID YOU THEN HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHOW SOME  
12 ADDITIONAL PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUPS TO ASHLEY  
13 PARSLEY?

14 A. I DID.

15 Q. I BELIEVE YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER YOU HAD SHOWN HER  
16 THE ONE OF WALTER HARRIS BACK ON MARCH THE  
17 FIFTEENTH, IS THAT CORRECT?

18 A. CORRECT.

19 Q. AND WHO WERE YOU, WHO DID YOU SHOW HER LINEUPS OF  
20 ON MARCH THE NINETEENTH, THEN?

21 A. I SHOWED HER PHOTO LINEUPS OF RALPH COLEMAN,  
22 DANNY RYANT, MARIO SHIVERS AND PATRICK TYLER.

23 Q. OKAY. AND WAS SHE ABLE TO PICK ANYBODY OUT OF  
24 THOSE FOUR LINEUPS THAT YOU SHOWED HER?

25 A. TWO OUT OF THE FOUR SHE DID.

1 Q. OKAY. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
2 FOUR, IS THAT ONE OF THE LINEUPS SHE PICKED  
3 SOMEBODY OUT OF?

4 A. IT IS.

5 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHO DID SHE PICK OUT OF STATE'S  
6 EXHIBIT NUMBER FOUR?

7 A. MARIO SHIVERS.

8 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER THREE?

9 A. IT IS.

10 Q. ALRIGHT. AND DID SHE ALSO THEN DOCUMENT ON THE  
11 AFFIDAVIT WHY SHE PICKED HIM OUT?

12 A. SHE DID.

13 Q. AND WHAT DID SHE INDICATE ON THERE?

14 A. SHE SAID, "POINTED GUN AT ME IN THE APARTMENT AND  
15 TOLD ME TO PUT MY HANDS UP, AND IT WAS A SILVER  
16 NINE MILLIMETER."

17 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND THEN ADDITIONALLY, ON STATE'S  
18 EXHIBIT NUMBER FIVE DID SHE PICK SOMEBODY OUT OF  
19 STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER FIVE?

20 A. SHE DID.

21 Q. AND WHAT PHOTOGRAPH DID SHE PICK OUT?

22 A. NUMBER ONE, RALPH COLEMAN.

23 Q. AND IS THAT RALPH COLEMAN?

24 A. IT IS.

25 Q. AND WHAT DID SHE INDICATE ON THAT AFFIDAVIT?

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

731

1 A. SHE SAID, "WORE A GREEN T-SHIRT THAT CAME IN THE  
2 APARTMENT, AND HE IS POSSIBLE TO BE ONE OF THE  
3 GUYS THAT ENTERED THE HOUSE. I DIDN'T COMPLETELY  
4 SEE HIS FACE."

5 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU TELL HER WHAT TO WRITE ON  
6 THOSE?

7 A. NO, I DID NOT.

8 Q. OKAY. AND YET AGAIN, DID YOU TELL HER SHE HAD TO  
9 PICK SOMEBODY OUT OF ANY OF THESE LINEUPS?

10 A. NO, I DIDN'T.

11 Q. AND I BELIEVE YOU TESTIFIED A MINUTE AGO THAT TWO  
12 OTHER LINEUPS WITH PATRICK TYLER AND DANNY RYANT,  
13 THAT SHE WASN'T ABLE TO IDENTIFY ANY OF THOSE, IS  
14 THAT CORRECT?

15 A. NO, SHE DIDN'T PICK THEM OUT. CORRECT.

16 Q. NOW, AT THAT TIME, ON MARCH THE NINETEENTH,  
17 HONESTLY, YOU'VE SPOKEN TO MR. TYLER, SO YOU HAVE  
18 HIS STATEMENT, IS THAT CORRECT?

19 A. CORRECT.

20 Q. ALRIGHT. AND DOES HE REFERENCE A LITTLE CHRIS IN  
21 HIS STATEMENT?

22 A. YES, ON THE BACK PAGE.

23 Q. OKAY. AND I BELIEVE IT'S SEVERAL SPOTS IN THERE,  
24 IS THAT CORRECT?

25 A. RIGHT.

1 Q. NOW, AT THAT TIME ON MARCH THE NINETEENTH WHEN  
2 YOU WERE SHOWING THESE OTHER LINEUPS TO MS.  
3 PARSLEY, HAD YOU IDENTIFIED WHO LITTLE CHRIS WAS  
4 YET AT THAT POINT IN TIME?

5 A. NO.

6 Q. DID YOU HAVE A FULL NAME?

7 A. NO, I DID NOT.

8 Q. THEREFORE, WERE YOU ABLE TO SHOW HER A LINEUP ON  
9 MARCH THE NINETEENTH OF CHRISTIAN COLEMAN?

10 A. NO, HUH-UH.

11 Q. OKAY. KIND OF WHILE WE'RE DEALING WITH THE  
12 LINEUPS, LET ME TALK TO YOU ABOUT A COUPLE OF  
13 OTHERS HERE. DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY OVER  
14 THE NEXT SEVERAL DAYS TO SHOW, A COUPLE OF  
15 OCCASIONS TO SHOW MR. TYLER PHOTO LINEUPS OF  
16 RALPH COLEMAN AND ULTIMATELY ALSO CHRISTIAN  
17 COLEMAN?

18 A. CORRECT.

19 Q. OKAY. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER  
20 SEVENTY-EIGHT, DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT DOCUMENT?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. AND WHO IS, WHO IS IN THAT LINEUP?

23 A. RALPH COLEMAN.

24 Q. OKAY. AND IS THAT THE LINEUP THAT YOU SHOWED TO  
25 MR. TYLER?

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

733

1 A. WELL, ACTUALLY, MR. KISSAM SHOWED THE LINEUP.

2 Q. AND -- WELL, HE WITNESSED IT?

3 A. RIGHT.

4 Q. IS HIS NAME AT THE TOP AS FAR AS ...

5 A. RIGHT, YES, SIR.

6 Q. AND WAS MR. TYLER ABLE TO PICK ANYBODY OUT OF  
7 THAT LINEUP, STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY-  
8 EIGHT, I BELIEVE IT IS?

9 A. CORRECT. HE PICKED NUMBER ONE, RALPH COLEMAN.

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
11 WE'D OFFER STATE'S SEVENTY-EIGHT INTO EVIDENCE.

12 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

13 MS. ULLMAN: I DO OBJECT, YOUR HONOR.

14 THE COURT: AND?

15 MS. ULLMAN: AND THE REASON BEHIND MY BEHIND MY  
16 OBJECTION IS TWO-FOLD. FIRST OFF, PATRICK TYLER WAS  
17 ALREADY IN COURT AND IDENTIFIED RALPH COLEMAN, AND  
18 PICKING HIS PICTURE OUT OF A LINEUP DOESN'T PROVE  
19 ANYTHING AS TO WHETHER RALPH COLEMAN WAS THERE OR  
20 NOT, HE KNEW WHO HE WAS.

21 THE OTHER ISSUE I HAVE, YOUR HONOR, IS, IN  
22 INVESTIGATOR'S REPORTS THEY STATE THAT THEY OBTAINED  
23 A PICTURE OF RALPH COLEMAN AND SHOWED IT TO TYLER,  
24 AND I HAVE EVIDENCE TO SHOW THAT THEY OBTAINED A DMV  
25 PHOTO OF RALPH COLEMAN BY HIMSELF, SHOWED IT TO

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

734

1 PATRICK TYLER. AFTER THAT THEY CREATED THIS LINEUP  
2 AND HAD HIM PICK HIM OUT.

3 THE COURT: AFTER THEY SHOWED HIM THE LINEUP?

4 MS. ULLMAN: AFTER THEY SHOWED HIM THE ONE DMV  
5 PHOTO AND HE IDENTIFIED RALPH COLEMAN, THEN THEY MADE  
6 THE LINEUP.

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. I'M OVERRULING YOUR  
8 OBJECTION, AND I AM ADMITTING IT INTO EVIDENCE, AND I  
9 NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO MY RULING ON THE RECORD SO IT  
10 WILL BE PRESERVED. THANK YOU.

11 COURT REPORTER: STATE'S SEVENTY-EIGHT?

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: SEVENTY-EIGHT, YES, MA'AM.

13 (State's Exhibit Seventy-eight  
14 marked and filed.)

15 Q. AND I'M SHOWING YOU THEN THE ATTACHED LINEUP, AND  
16 MR. TYLER CIRCLED THE PHOTOGRAPH ON THERE?

17 A. HE DID.

18 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, AND THAT'S NUMBER ONE?

19 A. IT IS.

20 Q. AND WHO IS THAT IN PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER ONE?

21 A. RALPH COLEMAN.

22 Q. DID HE ALSO THEN FILL OUT THE ACCOMPANYING  
23 AFFIDAVIT?

24 A. HE DID.

25 Q. AND WHAT DID HE PUT ON THREE AS FAR AS WHY HE

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

735

1 PICKED MR. RALPH COLEMAN OUT?

2 A. "HAD GO AND DO A MURDER."

3 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THEN, I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S  
4 EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVENTY-NINE, AND I AGAIN ASK YOU  
5 IF YOU HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHOW THAT LINEUP TO  
6 MR. TYLER?

7 A. I DID.

8 Q. WHEN WSA THAT DONE?

9 A. THIS LINEUP WAS SHOWN ON MARCH TWENTY-THIRD, TWO  
10 THOUSAND TEN.

11 Q. OKAY. AND WHO IS CONTAINED IN THAT LINEUP?

12 A. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

13 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WAS MR. TYLER ABLE TO PICK  
14 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN OUT OF THAT LINEUP?

15 A. HE DID, NUMBER TWO.

16 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
17 WE'D OFFER STATE'S SEVENTY-NINE INTO EVIDENCE.

18 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

19 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR.

20 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

21 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

22 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

23 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. IT IS ADMITTED INTO  
25 EVIDENCE. THANK YOU.

1 (State's Exhibit Seventy-nine  
2 marked and filed.)

3 Q. AND AFTER SHOWING HIM THAT LINEUP DID HE, WHAT  
4 PHOTOGRAPH DID HE CIRCLE AND INITIAL?

5 A. NUMBER TWO.

6 Q. AND YET AGAIN, WHO IS THAT?

7 A. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

8 Q. DID MR. TYLER THEN ALSO FILL OUT THE ACCOMPANYING  
9 AFFIDAVIT AND SIGN IT?

10 A. HE DID.

11 Q. AND WHY DID HE INDICATE HE PICKED OUT CHRISTIAN  
12 COLEMAN ON MARCH THE TWENTY-THIRD?

13 A. HE WROTE, "HAD GUN WHEN WE WAS IN THE HOUSE, OR  
14 IN THE CAR." I'M SORRY, "WHEN WE WAS IN HOUSE,  
15 RIDE IN CAR." THAT'S WHAT HE WROTE.

16 Q. HAD GUN WHEN WE WAS IN HOUSE, RIDING IN CAR?

17 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE JUST READ  
18 IT AND THE SOLICITOR IS READING IT AGAIN.

19 THE COURT: I'M OVERRULING YOUR OBJECTION.

20 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU. I'M JUST  
21 CLARIFYING, HE SAID IT TWO WAYS.

22 Q. SO, IT'S, "HAD GUN WHEN WE WAS IN HOUSE, RIDE IN  
23 CAR." IS THAT CORRECT?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. NOW, LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT WHAT IS, WHAT ARE

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

737

1 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN'S AND RALPH COLEMAN'S  
2 RELATIONSHIP?

3 A. BROTHERS.

4 Q. NOW, YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER THAT WALTER HARRIS WAS  
5 ARRESTED ON MARCH THE SEVENTEENTH, CORRECT?

6 A. CORRECT.

7 Q. AND THAT DANNY RYANT AND PATRICK TYLER WERE  
8 ARRESTED ON MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH, IS THAT  
9 CORRECT?

10 A. CORRECT.

11 Q. WHEN DID YOU OBTAIN WARRANTS FOR MARIO SHIVERS,  
12 RALPH COLEMAN AND CHRISTIAN COLEMAN?

13 A. LET ME LOOK BACK. WE HAD, THE FIRST ONE I GOT ON  
14 MARIO WAS ON THE EIGHTEENTH, AND RALPH COLEMAN, I  
15 GOT A WARRANT ON HIM ON THE NINETEENTH, AND  
16 CHRISTIAN ON THE TWENTY-FOURTH.

17 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S ALL IN MARCH?

18 A. CORRECT.

19 Q. SO, MARIO SHIVERS, YOU OBTAINED HIS WARRANT ON  
20 MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH?

21 A. CORRECT.

22 Q. AND RALPH COLEMAN ON MARCH THE NINETEENTH?

23 A. NINETEENTH.

24 Q. AND CHRISTIAN COLEMAN ON MARCH THE TWENTY-FOURTH?

25 A. THE TWENTY-FOURTH, YES, SIR.

1 Q. ALRIGHT. HOW ABOUT, WHEN WERE THE THREE OF THEM  
2 ARRESTED?

3 A. MARIO SHIVERS ON THE TWENTY-FIRST, RALPH ON THE  
4 TWENTY-SECOND, AND CHRISTIAN ON THE SAME DAY, THE  
5 TWENTY-FOURTH.

6 Q. SO, MARIO, YOU OBTAINED A WARRANT ON THE  
7 EIGHTEENTH, HE WAS ARRESTED ON THE TWENTY-FIRST?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. RALPH COLEMAN, YOU OBTAINED A WARRANT ON THE  
10 NINETEENTH AND HE WAS ARRESTED ON THE TWENTY - -

11 -

12 A. SECOND.

13 Q. --- SECOND? AND THEN CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, YOU  
14 OBTAINED IT ON THE TWENTY-FOURTH AND HE WAS  
15 ARRESTED THAT SAY DAY, THE TWENTY-FOURTH?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. NOW, I HAD ASKED YOU EARLIER HOW OLD PATRICK  
18 TYLER WAS BACK IN MARCH OF TWO THOUSAND TEN, DO  
19 YOU REMEMBER THAT?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. AND HOW OLD WAS HE?

22 A. SIXTEEN.

23 Q. OKAY. NOW HOW ABOUT THE OTHER FIVE DEFENDANTS  
24 BACK IN MARCH OF TWO THOUSAND TEN, HOW OLD WERE  
25 THEY AT THAT TIME?

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

739

1 A. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN WAS TWENTY, DANNY RYANT WAS  
2 TWENTY, MARIO SHIVERS WAS TWENTY-ONE, WALTER  
3 HARRIS WAS TWENTY-ONE, AND RALPH COLEMAN WAS  
4 TWENTY-TWO.

5 Q. LET ME SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY-  
6 SEVEN, HAVE YOU SEEN THAT DOCUMENT BEFORE?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THAT'S THE ALLTEL RECORD THAT'S IN  
9 EVIDENCE FOR PHONE NUMBER 837 2014 BELONGING TO  
10 DANIELLE MONROE?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT, WHAT RELATIONSHIP IS DANIELLE  
13 MONROE TO THE DEFENDANT, DANNY RYANT?

14 A. BROTHER AND SISTER, SIBLINGS.

15 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, ARE YOU ALSO AWARE WHETHER MS.  
16 MONROE HAS ANY CONNECTION TO MARIO SHIVERS, THE  
17 DEFENDANT ON THE END?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. AND WHAT IS THEIR CONNECTION?

20 A. HE'S THE FATHER OF HER KID, CHILD.

21 Q. SO, SHE HAS A CHILD BY MR. SHIVERS?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. ALRIGHT. LET ME ASK YOU, AS PART OF YOUR  
24 INVESTIGATION WERE YOU ALSO ABLE TO DETERMINE  
25 BACK IN MARCH OF TWO THOUSAND TEN WHAT PHONE

1 NUMBER MARIO SHIVERS HAD?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. WHAT NUMBER WAS THAT?

4 A. 803 837 6147.

5 COURT REPORTER: SIXTY WHAT?

6 A. 6147, I'M SORRY.

7 Q. 614 -- HOLD ON, LET ME SHOW YOU THE RECORDS. I'M  
8 SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY-FIVE,  
9 IS THAT PHONE ON THERE?

10 A. YES, SIR, 803 837 6417, I'M SORRY.

11 Q. 6417.

12 A. I GOT MY NUMBERS BACKWARDS.

13 Q. THE NUMBERS TRANSPOSED?

14 A. RIGHT, I GOT THEM BACKWARDS.

15 Q. OKAY. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER --  
16 AND WE'RE JUST ABOUT DONE HERE, LIEUTENANT,  
17 STATE'S EXHIBIT THIRTY-TWO AND THIRTY-THREE. DO  
18 YOU RECOGNIZE WHOSE RESIDENCE THAT IS?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND WHOSE RESIDENCE IS THAT IN STATE'S THIRTY-TWO  
21 AND THIRTY-THREE?

22 A. RALPH COLEMAN AND CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

23 Q. AND WHAT ROAD IS THAT LOCATED ON?

24 A. WOODBINE.

25 Q. AND DO YOU KNOW WHO ELSE WAS LIVING THERE BACK IN

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

741

1 MARCH OF THIS YEAR?

2 A. AS FAR AS I KNOW, THE GRAND MAMA.

3 Q. AND I'M GOING TO KIND OF TURN BACK TO MR. TYLER'S  
4 STATEMENT THAT HE GAVE YOU, STATE'S EXHIBIT  
5 NUMBER -- DEFENSE EXHIBIT NUMBER TWO, DEFENDANT  
6 SHIVERS'S EXHIBIT NUMBER TWO, DID MR. TYLER BACK  
7 ON MARCH THE EIGHTEENTH PROVIDE YOU INFORMATION  
8 ABOUT THEM HAVING PICKED UP DANNY RYANT AT THE  
9 CORNER POCKET IN THAT STATEMENT?

10 A. HE DID.

11 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY,  
12 WHAT'S DEPICTED IN STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY?

13 A. THE CORNER POCKET.

14 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE IS THE CORNER POCKET LOCATED AT?

15 A. IT'S RIGHT OFF OF GOFF AVENUE AND STILTON, IT'S  
16 ON THE CORNER.

17 Q. ALRIGHT. AND AS A RESULT OF THAT INFORMATION  
18 THAT MR. TYLER PROVIDED YOU, DID YOU FOLLOW UP ON  
19 THAT INFORMATION?

20 A. I DID.

21 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHO, IF ANYBODY, DID YOU  
22 ULTIMATELY TAKE STATEMENTS FROM AS A RESULT OF  
23 THAT INFORMATION?

24 A. MONEAK BUSBY AND YVONNE SHARPERSON.

25 Q. AND IN FACT, THEN ON MARCH TWENTY-SIXTH DID YOU

1 HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHOW MS. BUSBY TWO PHOTO  
2 LINEUPS, STATE'S EXHIBIT ONE AND TWO?

3 A. I DID.

4 Q. OKAY. LET'S GO TO STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER ONE  
5 FIRST. IS THAT THE LINEUP YOU SHOWED HER ON  
6 MARCH TWENTY-SIXTH?

7 A. IT IS.

8 Q. AND YET AGAIN, DID YOU TELL HER SHE HAD TO PICK  
9 SOMEBODY OUT OF THAT LINEUP?

10 A. NO, I DID NOT.

11 Q. DID YOU SUGGEST TO HER WHO TO PICK OUT?

12 A. NO, I DID NOT.

13 Q. OKAY. I'M SHOWING YOU THE LINEUP THERE, WHOSE  
14 PHOTOGRAPH DID SHE PICK OUT OF THAT LINEUP?

15 A. MARIO SHIVERS.

16 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER THREE?

17 A. CORRECT.

18 Q. AND MS. BUSBY INITIALED THAT AND DATED IT?

19 A. SHE DID.

20 Q. AND DID SHE THEN WRITE ALSO ON THE AFFIDAVIT WHY  
21 SHE PICKED OUT MR. SHIVERS?

22 A. SHE DID.

23 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHAT DID SHE PUT ON THERE?

24 A. "THE PERSON WHO CAME TO THE DOOR AT THE CLUB,  
25 CORNER POCKET."

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

743

1 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S IN HER HANDWRITING?

2 A. IT IS.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT  
4 NUMBER TWO. YET AGAIN, DID YOU SHOW HER THAT  
5 LINEUP?

6 A. I DID.

7 Q. AND WAS SHE ABLE TO PICK SOMEBODY OUT OF STATE'S  
8 EXHIBIT NUMBER TWO?

9 A. SHE DID.

10 Q. AND WHAT PHOTO DID SHE PICK OUT?

11 A. PATRICK TYLER, NUMBER FOUR.

12 Q. THAT WOULD BE PATRICK TYLER. AND SHE DATED THAT  
13 AND INITIALED IT ALSO?

14 A. SHE DID.

15 Q. AND YET AGAIN, DID YOU SUGGEST TO HER OR TELL HER  
16 WHO TO PICK OUT?

17 A. I DID NOT.

18 Q. DID YOU TELL HER SHE HAD TO PICK SOMEBODY OUT?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. AND DID SHE ALSO THEN IN THE ACCOMPANYING  
21 AFFIDAVIT INDICATE WHY SHE PICKED OUT -- IN HER  
22 HANDWRITING WHY SHE HAD PICKED OUT MR. TYLER?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. AND WHAT DID SHE PUT ON THERE?

25 A. "I SEEN THE BOY COME TO THE, AND GET POKEY AT THE

1 CLUB."

2 Q. LET ME SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER NINETY-  
3 THREE. DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT ITEM?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. AND IS THAT, DOES THIS FAIRLY AND ACCURATELY  
6 DEPICT KIND OF THE SURROUNDING AREA AROUND THE  
7 INCIDENT LOCATION AT SIX THREE FIVE KINGS ROAD?

8 A. IT DOES.

9 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME  
10 WE'D OFFER STATE'S NUMBER NINETY-THREE INTO EVIDENCE.

11 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

12 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

13 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

14 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

15 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

16 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

17 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. NINETY-THREE IS ADMITTED  
18 INTO EVIDENCE WITHOUT OBJECTION.

19 (State's Exhibit Ninety-three  
20 marked and filed.)

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: COULD I HAVE LIEUTENANT  
22 SHUMPERT STEP DOWN BRIEFLY, YOUR HONOR?

23 THE COURT: SURE. YOU MAY STEP DOWN.

24 Q. IF YOU WOULD, I THINK IT'S ACTUALLY DEPICTED ON  
25 HERE, BUT SHOW THE JURY WHERE THE INCIDENT

DIRECT - JAMES SHUMPERT BY SOL. SORENSON

745

1 LOCATION AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD IS ON THAT  
2 MAP?

3 A. THE INCIDENT LOCATION HAPPENED RIGHT HERE, AT SIX  
4 THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD.

5 Q. AND HOW ABOUT, WHEN YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER ABOUT  
6 THE CORNER POCKET DEPICTED IN STATE'S EXHIBIT  
7 NUMBER THIRTY, WHERE IS THAT LOCATED AT ON THE  
8 MAP?

9 A. THE CORNER POCKET WOULD BE LOCATED RIGHT HERE.

10 THE COURT: HOLD ON A SECOND BEFORE -- IF YOU  
11 WOULD JUST POINT IT OUT AGAIN, AND LET THE DEFENSE  
12 ATTORNEYS GET OVER THERE SO THEY CAN SEE, TOO, AS  
13 SOON AS THEY GET SITUATED. I'M SORRY, LIEUTENANT  
14 SHUMPERT, I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THEY GET OVER  
15 THERE. ALRIGHT, IF YOU'LL GO BACK AND POINT OUT THE  
16 CORNER POCKET TO THEM NOW.

17 A. OKAY.

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR.

19 A. YES, SIR. THE CORNER POCKET IS RIGHT HERE.

20 Q. AND JUST SINCE THEY WEREN'T ALL OVER THERE, IF  
21 YOU'D SHOW THEM ALSO WHERE SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS  
22 ROAD IS?

23 A. RIGHT HERE.

24 Q. OKAY. AND ADDITIONALLY, YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER  
25 ABOUT WHERE WALTER HARRIS'S GRANDMOTHER LIVED AT

1 FIFTEEN TWENTY-FIVE ASHLEY AVENUE?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. WHERE IS THAT LOCATED AT?

4 A. RIGHT ABOUT, RIGHT HERE.

5 Q. AND ASHLEY, IS THAT THE INTERSECTION OF ASHLEY  
6 AND ANOTHER ROAD?

7 A. COLEMAN.

8 Q. OKAY. SO, AT THE INTERSECTION OF ASHLEY AND  
9 COLEMAN, YOU SAID THAT'S RIGHT IN THAT AREA?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU, SPECIFICALLY WITH  
12 REGARDS TO THE CORNER POCKET AT STILTON AND GOFF  
13 AND THE INCIDENT LOCATION AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE  
14 KINGS ROAD, WHAT IS THE DISTANCE BETWEEN THOSE  
15 TWO LOCATIONS?

16 A. JUST A LITTLE OVER A HALF A MILE.

17 Q. THANK YOU, LIEUTENANT, YOU CAN HAVE A SEAT.

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT WOULD BE ALL I WOULD  
20 HAVE, YOUR HONOR.

21 THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

22 ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY.

23 MR. LACKEY: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

24 (See Volume Three for the continuation  
25 of this transcript.)



I N D E X

(See Volume One for complete index.)

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

749

1 DATE:

2 DECEMBER 16, 2010

3 (Continued from Volume Two.)

4 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES SHUMPERT5 BY MR. LACKEY:

6 Q. GOOD MORNING.

7 A. HOW ARE YOU DOING, MR. LACKEY.

8 Q. GOOD. HOW ABOUT YOU?

9 A. ALRIGHT, FINE.

10 Q. LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT, YOU WERE THE LEAD  
11 INVESTIGATOR ON THIS CASE, IS THAT CORRECT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. AND SO, YOU WERE RESPONSIBLE BASICALLY  
14 FOR, ULTIMATELY RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL ASPECTS OF  
15 THE INVESTIGATION?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. AND YOU'VE BEEN IN HERE DURING THIS ENTIRE TRIAL  
18 AND LISTENED TO ALL THE TESTIMONY?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND THAT INCLUDES, OF COURSE, PATRICK TYLER?

21 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

22 Q. NOW, YOU KNOW MY CLIENT IS CHRISTIAN COLEMAN  
23 RIGHT HERE ON THE END?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. OKAY. YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER THAT I THINK ASHLEY

1 PARSLEY IDENTIFIED MR. TYLER FROM A PHOTO LINEUP,  
2 DID YOU NOT?

3 A. DID SHE PICK PATRICK TYLER OUT OF A LINEUP? SHE  
4 PICKED WALTER HARRIS OUT.

5 Q. OH, WALTER HARRIS. OKAY. WHO PICKED PATRICK  
6 TYLER OUT OF A LINEUP?

7 A. WHO PICKED PATRICK TYLER OUT?

8 Q. UH-HUH.

9 A. WALTER HARRIS.

10 Q. OKAY. AND SO, YOU DID TESTIFY THAT PATRICK TYLER  
11 DID COME IN AND YOU INTERVIEWED HIM?

12 A. YES.

13 Q. AND HE CAME IN WITH HIS PARENTS, IS THAT CORRECT?

14 A. YES, SIR, YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND YOUR, I GUESS IN YOUR TRAINING, YOU'RE  
16 TRAINED IN INTERVIEWING TECHNIQUES, IS THAT  
17 CORRECT?

18 A. SOMEWHAT, YES, SIR.

19 Q. IS IT FAIR TO SAY THAT ONE OF THE TECHNIQUES TO  
20 BE USED IS TO TRY TO LOCK A SUSPECT INTO SOME  
21 KIND OF STATEMENT?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. EVEN IF IT'S NOT TRUTHFUL YOU CAN AT LEAST USE  
24 THAT TO BOX HIM IN, IS THAT CORRECT?

25 A. WELL, THE INITIAL DAY YOU WANT TO GET A STATEMENT

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

751

1 FROM THEM, WE WILL BE INTERVIEWING THEM, CORRECT.

2 Q. AND YOU CAN USE THAT STATEMENT AS THE BASIS FOR  
3 TALKING TO HIM ABOUT OTHER ASPECTS YOU KNOW ABOUT  
4 THE CASE?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. AND YOU CAN POKE HOLES IN HIS STATEMENT HOWEVER  
7 YOU SEE FIT?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. INITIALLY, I'M HANDING YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED  
10 DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT TWO AND MOVED INTO EVIDENCE  
11 UNDER MARIO SHIVERS, I BELIEVE THAT IS, AND  
12 THAT'S PATRICK TYLER'S STATEMENT, IS THAT  
13 CORRECT?

14 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND TELL ME THE PROCESS, THE INITIAL  
16 STATEMENT HE WROTE FOR YOU, IS THAT CORRECT?

17 A. YES, SIR, THIS IS HIS HANDWRITING.

18 Q. OKAY. AND YOU SAID EARLIER THAT INITIALLY HE  
19 SAID HE HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH THE, WITH ANYTHING  
20 ABOUT THESE CHARGES?

21 A. CORRECT.

22 Q. AND THEN FINALLY HE SAID HE WAS GOING TO BE  
23 TRUTHFUL WITH YOU AND WRITE THAT STATEMENT, IS  
24 THAT CORRECT?

25 A. CORRECT.

1 Q. OKAY. AND SO, HE WROTE THE STATEMENT, HE, AND  
2 THEN HE PUT A GUN IN EVERYBODY'S HAND EXCEPT HIS  
3 OWN, IS THAT CORRECT?

4 A. CORRECT.

5 Q. OKAY. YOU'VE HEARD TESTIMONY THERE WERE FOUR  
6 WEAPONS, IS THAT CORRECT?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND THERE ARE SIX CO-DEFENDANTS, IS THAT  
9 CORRECT?

10 A. CORRECT.

11 Q. NOW, AFTER HE WROTE THAT STATEMENT -- I'M JUST  
12 MAKING SURE HE -- AGAIN, HE NAMED EVERYBODY, EVEN  
13 ON THE BACK PAGE, ON THE SECOND PAGE OF HIS  
14 HANDWRITTEN STATEMENT, AND YOU CAN START ON THE  
15 FRONT, READ ME THAT LAST SENTENCE?

16 A. AT THE BOTTOM?

17 Q. YES, SIR, AND GOING OVER TO THE END OF THE  
18 STATEMENT.

19 A. OKAY. "THAT WHEN ALL THE GUN SHOTS WENT OFF AND  
20 I WAS SHOCKED. BUT LITTLE CHRIS OR PETE HAD GUNS,  
21 LITTLE M AND POKE AND RALPH."

22 Q. OKAY. SO, IF YOU -- POINT OUT HERE ON PAGE TWO  
23 IT SAID THAT LITTLE CHRIS OR PETE HAD GUNS?

24 A. CORRECT.

25 Q. SO, HE'S JUST, BASICALLY HE'S MAKING SURE HE'S

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

753

1 GOT A GUN IN EVERYBODY'S HAND?

2 A. I DON'T KNOW HIS INTENT, BUT THAT'S WHAT HE  
3 WROTE.

4 Q. OKAY. THAT'S WHAT HE WROTE. SO, YOU WITNESSED  
5 THAT?

6 A. YES, I DID.

7 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, IS IT FAIR TO SAY, AFTER THAT  
8 YOU FOLLOWED UP WITH SOME STATEMENTS, OR SOME  
9 QUESTIONS, I'M SORRY?

10 A. YES, SIR, I DID.

11 Q. OKAY. AND SO, THIS WAS AFTER HE WROTE THAT  
12 INITIAL STATEMENT?

13 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

14 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHY DO YOU DO THAT, WHY DON'T YOU  
15 JUST SAY, OKAY, YOU WROTE A STATEMENT, AND THAT'S  
16 GOOD?

17 A. WELL, IF JUST, WHEN THEY WRITE STATEMENTS,  
18 SOMETIMES IT'S NOT CLEAR AS TO WHAT THEY'RE  
19 WRITING, SO YOU GO BACK THROUGH A QUESTION AND  
20 ANSWER SERIES TO JUST GET CLARITY OF WHAT THEY'RE  
21 TRYING TO SAY.

22 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU'RE CLARIFYING THE DETAILS?

23 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, IF YOU WOULD, GO AHEAD AND READ  
25 THAT FIRST QUESTION AND THE ANSWER. AND LET ME

1 ASK YOU THIS BEFORE YOU GET TO THAT.

2 A. UH-HUH.

3 Q. WHO WROTE THE QUESTIONS?

4 A. I WRITE THE QUESTION AND I HAVE THE DEFENDANT  
5 WRITE THE ANSWER.

6 Q. OKAY. GOOD ENOUGH. ALRIGHT, READ THAT FIRST  
7 QUESTION?

8 A. "WHO PICKED YOU UP?"

9 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT WAS HIS ANSWER?

10 A. THE ANSWER WAS, "IT WAS LITTLE CHRIS PASSENGER,  
11 LITTLE M BACK, RALPH BACK SEAT. DON'T HAVE NO  
12 IDEA WHO THE DRIVER IS."

13 Q. OKAY. AND THEN - - -

14 A. WHO WAS THE DRIVER.

15 COURT REPORTER: WHAT WAS YOUR LAST ...

16 A. IT'S THE DRIVER.

17 Q. SO, THERE WAS AN UNKNOWN DRIVER?

18 A. CORRECT.

19 Q. ALRIGHT, WE'LL COME BACK TO HIM. ALRIGHT, WHAT'S  
20 THE NEXT QUESTION?

21 A. "THEN WHERE DID Y'ALL GO?" ANSWER: "WENT TO  
22 JAMISON AND GOT PETE."

23 Q. OKAY. AND THEN THE NEXT QUESTION AND ANSWER?

24 A. "WHO ALL HAD GUNS?" "PETE, LITTLE M, POKE AND  
25 RALPH."

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

755

- 1 Q. SO, SO THE ANSWER THERE WAS PETE, WHO'S BEEN  
2 IDENTIFIED AS WALTER HARRIS?  
3 A. CORRECT.  
4 Q. LITTLE M, WHO'S BEEN IDENTIFIED AS MARIO SHIVERS?  
5 A. YES, SIR.  
6 Q. WHO WAS NEXT?  
7 A. POKE.  
8 Q. POKE. AND THAT'S WHO?  
9 A. DANNY RYANT.  
10 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, RALPH?  
11 A. RALPH, RALPH COLEMAN.  
12 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S ALL HE SAID WHO HAD GUNS?  
13 A. YES, SIR.  
14 Q. OKAY. HE DIDN'T SAY ANYTHING ABOUT MY CLIENT  
15 HAVING A GUN?  
16 A. NOT IN THAT QUESTION, NO.  
17 Q. NOT IN THAT QUESTION?  
18 A, HUH-UH.  
19 Q. OKAY, GOOD. ALRIGHT, LET'S GO DOWN TO THE NEXT  
20 QUESTIONS. I THINK THE NEXT FEW QUESTIONS WERE  
21 TRYING TO FIND OUT WHO THE ...  
22 A. THE NAMES OF THE OTHER.  
23 Q. THE NAMES FROM THE NICK NAMES?  
24 A. YES, SIR.  
25 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, AFTER THAT DID YOU ASK HIM AGAIN

1 ABOUT GUNS?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. YOU WROTE THESE QUESTIONS, DIDN'T YOU?

4 A. I DID.

5 Q. OKAY. AND READ THAT QUESTION FOR ME?

6 A. "WHO ALL TOOK GUNS INTO THE APARTMENT?"

7 Q. ALRIGHT. SO, YOU WENT FROM WHO ALL HAD GUNS TO

8 WHO ALL TOOK GUNS INTO THE APARTMENT?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. AND WHAT WAS HIS ANSWER?

11 A. "LITTLE M, POKE, PET, AND RALPH."

12 Q. ALRIGHT. SO, THAT WAS THE SAME ANSWER AS HE GAVE

13 YOU ON THE FIRST GUN QUESTION?

14 A. CORRECT.

15 Q. OKAY. SO, AND WHEN WAS THIS, WHEN WAS THIS

16 STATEMENT TAKEN?

17 A. MARCH EIGHTEENTH.

18 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU'RE TRYING TO CLARIFY THE DETAILS

19 HERE AND HE NEVER MENTIONED CHRISTIAN COLEMAN,

20 DID HE?

21 A. NOT AT THE LATTER PART OF THE QUESTION AND ANSWER

22 SERIES, HE DIDN'T, NO, SIR.

23 Q. WHERE YOU WERE TRYING TO CLARIFY AND MAKE SURE

24 YOU UNDERSTOOD - - -

25 A. YES, SIR.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

757

1 Q. --- WHO HAD THE GUNS?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. SO, YOU SAY THAT THAT WAS, THAT  
4 INTERVIEW WAS ON THE EIGHTEENTH?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. AND USING THIS INFORMATION YOU TESTIFIED  
7 EARLIER THAT YOU SUBMITTED FOUR PHOTO LINEUPS TO  
8 ASHLEY PARSLEY, IS THAT CORRECT?

9 A. I DID.

10 Q. OKAY. AND WHO WERE INCLUDED IN THE FOUR PHOTO  
11 LINEUPS?

12 A. RALPH COLEMAN, MARIO SHIVERS, DANNY RYANT, AND  
13 PATRICK.

14 Q. PATRICK TYLER?

15 A. UH-HUH.

16 Q. THE CO-DEFENDANT WHO TESTIFIED?

17 A. CORRECT.

18 Q. ALRIGHT. AND AFTER THAT INTERVIEW AND AFTER YOU  
19 CLARIFIED THE DETAILS YOU DIDN'T PUT TOGETHER A  
20 PHOTO LINEUP OF MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, TO  
21 SHOW ASHLEY PARSLEY, DID YOU?

22 A. I DIDN'T HAVE CHRISTIAN COLEMAN'S NAME AT THE  
23 TIME. ALL HE REFERRED TO HIM AS WAS LITTLE  
24 CHRIS.

25 Q. OKAY. AND THE UNKNOWN WAS ALSO REFERRED TO?

1 A. RIGHT, YES, SIR.

2 Q. SO, YOU DIDN'T SHOW A PICTURE OF THE UNKNOWN  
3 DRIVER BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY, HE DIDN'T KNOW WHO THE  
4 DRIVER WAS?

5 A. HE DIDN'T KNOW THE DRIVER'S NAME.

6 Q. AND YOU SAID, I BELIEVE EARLIER IN YOUR TESTIMONY,  
7 THAT TWO OF THE INDIVIDUALS CHARGED HERE TODAY  
8 WERE PICKED OUT OF THOSE FOUR LINEUPS, OR OUT OF  
9 THE FOUR INDIVIDUALS THAT YOU SHOWED IN A MONTAGE  
10 OF LINEUPS, TWO OF THE DEFENDANT WERE PICKED OUT?

11 A. BY MS. PARLEY YOU SAID?

12 Q. YES.

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. NOW, LET ME, STICKING WITH PATRICK TYLER FOR A  
15 SECOND, YOU SAID YOU DID SOME FURTHER  
16 INVESTIGATION, YOU SAID YOU DIDN'T KNOW WHO MY  
17 CLIENT WAS AT THE TIME. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S  
18 EXHIBIT SEVENTY-NINE WHICH HAS BEEN MOVED INTO  
19 EVIDENCE WITHOUT OBJECTION FROM ME, AND TELL ME  
20 WHAT THAT IS?

21 A. A PHOTO LINEUP OF CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

22 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WAS - - -

23 A. THE TWENTY-THIRD OF MARCH OF THIS YEAR.

24 Q. SO, FIVE DAYS LATER?

25 A. YES, SIR.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

759

1 Q. AND WHAT DID, WHAT DID PATRICK TYLER WRITE ON  
2 THAT STATEMENT?

3 A. "HAD GUN, WE WAS IN HOUSE, RIDE IN CAR."

4 Q. OKAY. SO, MR. TYLER CAME IN TO MAKE A STATEMENT  
5 TO YOU ON THE EIGHTEENTH?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND HE FINALLY BROKE DOWN AND GAVE HIMSELF UP?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. AND SO, HE'S PUTTING GUNS IN EVERYBODY'S HANDS  
10 EXCEPT HIS OWN?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND SO, ON CLARIFYING THE DETAILS HE WANTED TO  
13 MAKE SURE WHO HE SAID HAD GUNS IN THAT MARCH  
14 EIGHTEEN STATEMENT?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. ALRIGHT. HE SITS THERE FOR FIVE DAYS, HE ALL OF  
17 A SUDDEN PICKS OUT MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN COLEMAN,  
18 AND NOW HE COMES BACK AND PUTS A GUN BACK IN HIS  
19 HAND?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. DID YOU HEAR PATRICK TYLER SAY HE WENT TO HIGH  
22 SCHOOL WITH MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN?

23 A. I BELIEVE HE SAID HE KNEW HIM BACK IN HIGH  
24 SCHOOL.

25 Q. WHEN YOU DO THESE INTERVIEWS DO YOU -- YOU DIDN'T

1 USE A TAPE RECORDER ON THIS, DID YOU?

2 A. NO, I DID NOT.

3 Q. DO Y'ALL EVER USE TAPE RECORDERS?

4 A. IN SOME INSTANCES, BUT I THINK ON THIS DAY WHEN  
5 MR. TYLER CAME IN HE TURNED HIMSELF IN TO CHIEF  
6 WALTERS'S OFFICE WITH HIS PARENTS, EXCUSE ME.

7 Q. OKAY. AND HOW ABOUT VIDEO TAPES, DO YOU EVER  
8 VIDEO TAPE WHEN YOU INTERVIEW A SUBJECT?

9 A. I NEVER VIDEO TAPE.

10 Q. YOU NEVER HAVE?

11 A. NO, SIR.

12 Q. HAS THE COUNTY, DOES ORANGEBURG COUNTY EVER VIDEO  
13 TAPE ANY INTERVIEWS?

14 A. I CAN'T SPEAK FOR ANYBODY ELSE, I JUST DON'T USE  
15 IT.

16 Q. OKAY. BUT A TAPE RECORDER - - -

17 A. BUT I SAY, WHERE WE WERE AT IT WASN'T SET UP FOR  
18 THAT, IT WASN'T SET UP FOR NO TAPE RECORDER NOR  
19 NO VIDEO. LIKE I SAID, AGAIN, IT WAS IN THE  
20 CHIEF'S OFFICE, HE WAS THERE WITH HIS PARENTS AND  
21 THAT'S WHERE THE INTERVIEW TOOK PLACE AT.

22 Q. OKAY. FAIR ENOUGH. SO, I MEAN, Y'ALL TALKED  
23 ABOUT OTHER THINGS DURING THE INTERVIEW, THAT'S  
24 NOT A -- WORD FOR WORD THAT'S NOT EVERYTHING  
25 Y'ALL TALKED ABOUT. DID YOU EVER SAY, WHY DON'T

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

761

- 1           YOU HELP YOURSELF OUT, PATRICK?
- 2           A.    NO, SIR.
- 3           Q.    YOU DIDN'T SAY THAT?
- 4           A.    NO.  IT'S LIKE I SAID, I ASKED HIM A QUESTION
- 5           ABOUT THE INCIDENT.  HE INITIALLY STATED THAT HE
- 6           DIDN'T KNOW NOTHING ABOUT NOTHING.
- 7           Q.    SO, HE LIED INITIALLY?
- 8           A.    AT FIRST, HE SAID HE DIDN'T KNOW NOTHING ABOUT
- 9           NOTHING.  HIS PARENTS WAS THERE AND HE JUST BUST
- 10          OUT CRYING AND SAID, ALRIGHT, I WANT TO TELL THE
- 11          TRUTH.
- 12          Q.    UH-HUH.
- 13          A.    AND THEN WE WENT FROM THERE.
- 14          Q.    OKAY.  AND WHEN HE SAID HE WANTED TO TELL THE
- 15          TRUTH YOU STATED, WHEN YOU CLARIFIED THE DETAILS
- 16          HE PUT A GUN IN EVERYBODY'S HAND EXCEPT MY
- 17          CLIENT'S, IS THAT RIGHT?
- 18          A.    RIGHT.  BUT I ALSO BELIEVE HE TESTIFIED TO THE
- 19          FACT THAT MR. HARRIS HAD A GUN BUT HE GAVE HIS
- 20          GUN TO SOME OTHER DEFENDANT.
- 21          Q.    OKAY.  BUT HE DIDN'T SAY A NAME.
- 22          A.    I CAN'T - - -
- 23          COURT REPORTER:  HE DIDN'T WHAT?
- 24          Q.    HE DIDN'T SAY A NAME.
- 25          A.    I CAN'T REMEMBER.

1 Q. OKAY. NOW, LET ME ASK YOU THIS, DURING THIS  
2 INVESTIGATION YOU WERE THE LEAD INVESTIGATOR AND  
3 YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER THAT YOU'RE ULTIMATELY  
4 RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL THE, ALL THE EVIDENCE, ALL  
5 THE LEADS, ALL THE FOLLOWUP IN THE CASE, IS THAT  
6 RIGHT?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. I MEAN, WITH ASSISTANCE FROM, OF COURSE, OTHER  
9 FOLKS IN YOUR OFFICE?

10 A. CORRECT.

11 Q. AND YOU SAID EARLIER THAT Y'ALL HAVE TRAINING ON  
12 DIFFERENT THINGS. I ASKED YOU ABOUT TRAINING FOR  
13 INTERVIEWING TECHNIQUES, THAT'S CORRECT?

14 A. RIGHT, YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND DO Y'ALL HAVE TO GO THROUGH YEARLY TRAINING  
16 AND CERTIFICATION ON DIFFERENT THINGS?

17 A. YEARLY TRAINING ON INTERVIEWING, NO, SIR.

18 Q. ON ANYTHING, YOU JUST HAVE TO DO TRAINING EVERY  
19 YEAR ON DIFFERENT, DIFFERENT ISSUES?

20 A. ASPECTS OF THE JOB, CORRECT, YES, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. HAVE YOU EVER HAD ANY TRAINING ON REPORT  
22 WRITING?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. AND IS IT FAIR TO SAY, AS FAR AS YOUR  
25 REPORT YOU DOCUMENT THE ACTIVITIES OF AN

1 INVESTIGATION?

2 A. RIGHT, IN MY INVESTIGATIVE NOTES, CORRECT.

3 Q. OKAY. SO, BASICALLY THIS IS, THESE ARE THE FACTS  
4 OF THE CASE IN WRITTEN FORM, THAT'S ...

5 A. RIGHT, THROUGH THE INVESTIGATION.

6 Q. UH-HUH. SO, AS FAR AS, YOU KNOW, LET'S SAY,  
7 LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT WON THE LOTTERY AND YOU SAID,  
8 WELL, I LIKE LAW ENFORCEMENT BUT I'M GOING TO  
9 HANG IT UP FOR A WHILE, YOU OUGHT TO BE ABLE TO  
10 HAND THAT REPORT OFF TO SOMEBODY ELSE AND THEY  
11 OUGHT TO BE ABLE TO FINISH THE INVESTIGATION, IS  
12 THAT CORRECT?

13 A. CORRECT.

14 Q. DO YOU -- I'M TAKING A STAB, BUT I'D SAY YOU  
15 PROBABLY INVESTIGATE A LOT OF CASES PER YEAR?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. SO, YOU'VE GOT SOME PRETTY GOOD EXPERIENCE?

18 A. ON DIFFERENT CASES, YES, SIR.

19 Q. YOU'VE BEEN THERE FOR TWELVE YEARS?

20 A. I DID APPROXIMATELY ABOUT EIGHT, MAYBE SEVEN  
21 YEARS ON THE ROAD.

22 Q. AND THEN WENT INTO INVESTIGATION?

23 A. AND THEN WENT INTO INVESTIGATION, SIR.

24 Q. SO, YOU KNOW, BASICALLY FROM TOP TO BOTTOM?

25 A. IF YOU WANT TO SAY THAT, YEAH.

1 Q. AND SO, YOU REFERENCED EARLIER WHEN YOU WERE  
2 TESTIFYING I THINK WHEN SOLICITOR SORENSON WAS  
3 TALKING TO YOU, YOU REFERENCED, I NEED TO LOOK AT  
4 MY NOTES?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. AND THOSE NOTES ARE WHAT YOU USE TO REFRESH YOUR  
7 MEMORY, IS THAT CORRECT?

8 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

9 Q. SO, IT'S IMPORTANT THAT YOUR REPORT BE ACCURATE?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT YOUR REPORT BE THOROUGH?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT YOUR REPORT BE COMPLETE?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AND CONTAIN ALL THE FACTS?

16 A. CORRECT.

17 Q. ALRIGHT. AS FAR AS YOUR REPORT ON THIS CASE DID  
18 YOU CONSIDER THAT THOROUGH, COMPLETE AND  
19 PROFESSIONAL?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. AND I BELIEVE WHAT I SAW IN YOUR REPORT,  
22 YOU DO DIFFERENT NARRATIVES IN YOUR REPORT?

23 A. I DID, YES, SIR.

24 Q. AND IT'S DATED AND YOU GIVE KIND OF THE SUMMARY  
25 OF WHAT'S HAPPENED THROUGH THE DAY?

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

765

1 A. YES, SIR, YES, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. AND IN THIS CASE, ESPECIALLY INVOLVING A  
3 MURDER AND ARMED ROBBERY AND A BURGLARY, FIRST,  
4 THIS WAS A, YOU KNEW YOU HAD TO BE ON TOP OF YOUR  
5 GAME ON THIS, DIDN'T YOU?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND WE'VE ALREADY HAD TESTIMONY IN HERE THAT  
8 MURDER CARRIES LIFE IN PRISON?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. AND HOW MUCH DOES ARMED ROBBERY CARRY?

11 A. I BELIEVE - - -

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OBJECTION, THAT'S NOT  
13 RELEVANT. I DON'T SEE HOW IT'S RELEVANT WITH THIS.

14 THE COURT: WELL, THE TESTIMONY CAME IN ABOUT THE  
15 MURDER.

16 SOLICITOR SORENSON: RIGHT, BUT NOT WITH REGARDS,  
17 I MEAN, AS FOR A SPECIFIC LIMITED PURPOSE.

18 THE COURT: RIGHT. IF YOU WILL JUST -- I'M GOING  
19 TO SUSTAIN YOUR OBJECTION, SO IF YOU WANT TO REPHRASE  
20 THE QUESTION OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT?

21 MR. LACKEY: THAT'S FINE. HE TESTIFIED THAT  
22 MURDER CARRIES LIFE IN PRISON, SO, THIS IS - - -

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, I  
24 MEAN, THIS IS - - -

25 THE COURT: NO, I'M GOING TO LET -- THE JURY HAS

1 ALREADY GOTTEN THAT TESTIMONY. THEY KNOW THAT.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOU JUST SUSTAINED THE  
3 OBJECTION AND HE JUST PROCEEDED TO REPEAT WHAT YOU  
4 JUST SUSTAINED, SAYING IT WAS IMPROPER.

5 THE COURT: NO, I DIDN'T WANT HIM TO GO INTO ANY  
6 OF THE SENTENCES FOR ANYTHING ELSE.

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OKAY.

8 THE COURT: OKAY. LET ME CLARIFY MY STATEMENT.  
9 OKAY?

10 MR. LACKEY: THAT'S FINE.

11 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.

12 MR. LACKEY: I MEAN, WE'VE HEARD WHAT WE'VE  
13 HEARD.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. YES, SIR.

15 Q. ALRIGHT, DO YOU HAVE A COPY OF THE REPORT THAT  
16 YOU MADE IN YOUR NARRATIVES WITH YOU?

17 A. I DO, YES, SIR.

18 Q. OKAY, DO YOU HAVE IT WITH YOU, IN FRONT OF YOU?

19 A. UH-HUH.

20 Q. LET ME, LET ME ASK YOU, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE  
21 WE'RE LOOKING AT THE SAME THING, CAN I ASK YOU  
22 TO, I THINK, FLIP TO THE - - -

23 A. THEY'RE NUMBERED AT THE TOP.

24 Q. OKAY. I THINK MINE WAS CUT OFF IN THE COPIER  
25 WHEN I RECEIVED IT. IT LOOKS LIKE ON MINE THE

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

767

- 1                   NEXT TO THE LAST PAGE, NARRATIVE FOURTEEN?
- 2           A.    YES, SIR.
- 3           Q.    OKAY.  IS THAT THE NEXT TO THE LAST PAGE ON
- 4                   YOURS, TOO?
- 5           A.    IT IS.
- 6           Q.    SO, IT'S, IT'S, WHAT'S THE DATE ON THIS?
- 7           A.    THE TWENTY-THIRD.
- 8           Q.    THE TWENTY-THIRD?
- 9           A.    OF MARCH, TWO THOUSAND TEN.
- 10          Q.    OKAY.  AND THE TIME OF DAY?
- 11          A.    SIXTEEN:TWENTY-ONE.
- 12          Q.    TRANSLATE THAT INTO REGULAR TIME FOR ME.
- 13          A.    OH, I'M SORRY, FOUR:TWENTY-ONE.
- 14          Q.    OKAY.  FOUR:TWENTY-ONE P.M.?
- 15          A.    CORRECT.
- 16          Q.    ALRIGHT, I'VE GOT YOU NOW.  ALRIGHT, AND ON THE
- 17                   LEFT SIDE IT SAYS, SUPPLEMENTAL DETAILS, IS THAT
- 18                   CORRECT?
- 19          A.    YES, SIR, IT DOES.
- 20          Q.    ALRIGHT.  AND BELOW THAT YOU'VE TITLED THIS
- 21                   SECTION AS WHAT?
- 22          A.    CASE OVERVIEW.
- 23          Q.    CASE OVERVIEW.  OKAY.  AND REMIND ME AGAIN, WHEN
- 24                   YOU TOOK THE STATEMENT FROM PATRICK TYLER, THAT
- 25                   WAS ON THE EIGHTEENTH, SO FIVE DAYS PRIOR TO

1 THIS?

2 A. YES, SIR, IT IS.

3 Q. OKAY. FIVE DAYS PRIOR TO THIS CASE OVERVIEW IS  
4 WHEN YOU TALKED TO HIM?

5 A. CORRECT.

6 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHEN DID HE PICK OUT MR. CHRISTIAN  
7 COLEMAN, MY CLIENT, FROM THE LINEUP?

8 A. THE TWENTY-THIRD.

9 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT TIME ON THE TWENTY-THIRD?

10 A. ONE:TWENTY-FIVE.

11 Q. SO, THAT WAS BEFORE YOU PUT TOGETHER THIS CASE  
12 OVERVIEW, IS THAT CORRECT?

13 A. CORRECT.

14 Q. ALRIGHT. LET'S GO THROUGH THIS, THE FIRST LINE  
15 READS, "BASED ON THE INVESTIGATION OF THIS  
16 INVESTIGATOR," SO YOU'RE SAYING AFTER YOUR  
17 INVESTIGATIONS THIS IS WHAT YOU FOUND, IS THAT  
18 CORRECT?

19 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND, "IT WAS DETERMINED THAT MARIO SHIVERS," - -

21 -

22 MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, I WOULD OBJECT, I MEAN,  
23 IF HE'S GOING TO READ IT I WOULD JUST SAY IT'S  
24 HEARSAY. I THINK HE CAN ASK WHAT HE WANTS TO ASK  
25 ABOUT IT, BUT THE DOCUMENT ITSELF IS HEARSAY.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

769

1           THE COURT: ALRIGHT. IF YOU'D JUST ASK HIM A  
2 QUESTION.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. WHO DOES IT SAY HERE THAT PLANNED THE  
4 ROBBERY?

5 A. MARIO SHIVERS.

6 Q. AND THAT WAS BASED ON YOUR INVESTIGATION?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THE NEXT SENTENCE IT SAYS THAT  
9 SOMEBODY CONTACTED - -

10 MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, I OBJECT.

11 THE COURT: I THINK HE'S GOING TO CONTINUE HIS  
12 OBJECTION. IF YOU'LL JUST ASK HIM QUESTIONS ABOUT  
13 WHAT HE SAYS ON THERE - - -

14 MR. LACKEY: OKAY.

15 THE COURT: --- OR WHAT HIS INVESTIGATION  
16 REVEALED, - - -

17 MR. LACKEY: OKAY.

18 THE COURT: --- THAT WOULD BE EASIER, MR. LACKEY.

19 Q. ALRIGHT. AS FAR AS THE REMAINDER OF THE CASE  
20 OVERVIEW, THIS SUMMARIZES YOUR TALKS WITH PATRICK  
21 TYLER AS WELL, DOES IT NOT?

22 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. AND IN HERE IT STATES SEVERAL INDIVIDUALS  
24 CHARGED IN THIS CASE, INCLUDING MR. SHIVERS, IS  
25 THAT CORRECT?

1 A. RIGHT.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, I THINK I'M  
3 GOING TO KIND OF JOIN IN MR. MELLARD'S OBJECTION.  
4 THIS IS HECKLING HEARSAY, I MEAN, WHEN HE'S ASKING HIM  
5 - - -

6 Q. OKAY, WELL, WHO DO YOU - - -

7 THE COURT: WAIT A MINUTE, IF YOU'LL JUST ASK HIM  
8 QUESTIONS ABOUT HIS INVESTIGATION.

9 SOLICITOR SORENSON: AND YOUR HONOR, ALSO, IF YOU  
10 WANT TO GO FIRST THAT'S FINE WITH ME, AS TO WHAT  
11 PATRICK TYLER SAYS, THAT WOULD BE HEARSAY. HE HAD A  
12 CHANCE TO TESTIFY HIMSELF.

13 MR. LACKEY: OKAY.

14 THE COURT: IF -- I WILL SUSTAIN THE OBJECTIONS.  
15 OKAY?

16 Q. ALRIGHT. I WANT TO ASK IT THIS WAY, LIEUTENANT  
17 SHUMPERT, - - -

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. COULD YOU TAKE A MINUTE TO REVIEW THAT CASE  
20 OVERVIEW?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. ALRIGHT. LET ME KNOW WHEN YOU'VE FINISHED GOING  
23 THROUGH THAT.

24 A. I WILL. YES, SIR.

25 Q. OKAY. DID YOU GO THROUGH THAT?

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

771

- 1 A. UH-HUH.
- 2 Q. ALRIGHT. AND IN THAT CASE OVERVIEW WERE THE
- 3 INDIVIDUALS CHARGED IN THIS CASE NAME?
- 4 A. YES, SIR.
- 5 Q. EVEN CHRISTIAN COLEMAN?
- 6 A. NOT CHRISTIAN, NO, SIR.
- 7 Q. THAT WAS NOT INCLUDED IN THIS, WAS IT?
- 8 A. RIGHT. AT THE TIME THIS WAS WRITTEN WE STILL
- 9 HADN'T KNOWN WAS LITTLE CHRIS, HE STILL WASN'T
- 10 IDENTIFIED.
- 11 Q. OKAY.
- 12 A. WE STILL HADN'T IDENTIFIED HIM. WE HAD ALREADY
- 13 SPOKEN TO PATRICK AND PATRICK GAVE THE NAME OF
- 14 LITTLE CHRIS, BUT CHRISTIAN AT THAT TIME STILL
- 15 WASN'T IDENTIFIED.
- 16 Q. OKAY. HE STILL WASN'T IDENTIFIED?
- 17 A. NO, SIR.
- 18 Q. SO, EVEN THOUGH HE PICKED HIM OUT OF THIS LINEUP
- 19 HERE HE STILL WASN'T IDENTIFIED?
- 20 A. RIGHT. WHAT I'M SAYING IS, WHEN WE INTERVIEWED
- 21 PATRICK HE GAVE THE NAME OF LITTLE CHRIS. WE
- 22 SHOWED HIM THE LINEUP. HE STILL HADN'T -- THE
- 23 WARRANTS WAS ALREADY TAKEN OUT ON THE REST OF THE
- 24 INDIVIDUALS, BUT THIS IS JUST A BASIS TO CONTINUE
- 25 ON WITH THE INVESTIGATION.

1 Q. UH-HUH.

2 A. SO, YES, SIR.

3 Q. HAD, HAD YOU RUN ANY DMV RECORDS FOR POTENTIAL  
4 SUSPECTS BY THIS TIME?

5 A. I BELIEVE I DID, YES, SIR.

6 Q. HAD YOU RUN ANY INCLUDING THE NAME, CHRISTIAN  
7 COLEMAN?

8 A. I'M NOT SURE, BUT IF WE DO PHOTO LINEUPS WE RUN  
9 THE DMV PICTURES FIRST, CORRECT.

10 Q. I MEAN, JUST FOR YOUR OWN INVESTIGATION, THOUGH,  
11 DID YOU - - -

12 A. I BELIEVE I DID, YES, SIR.

13 Q. SO, ARE YOU STATING THAT YOU HAD ALREADY  
14 SUPPOSEDLY FIGURED OUT WHO LITTLE CHRIS WAS?

15 A. AS TO WHEN?

16 Q. AS TO MARCH TWENTY-THIRD, TWO THOUSAND TEN?

17 A. WELL, I THINK I STATED THAT THAT'S WHEN WE GOT  
18 THE WARRANT ON CHRISTIAN ON THE TWENTY-FOURTH.

19 Q. UH-HUH.

20 A. RIGHT. SO, THAT WOULD BE THE DAY BEFORE.

21 Q. OKAY.

22 A. THAT WAS THE SAME DAY WE SHOWED THE LINEUP TO  
23 PATRICK.

24 COURT REPORTER: THAT WAS THE SAME WHAT?

25 A. THE DAY WE SHOWED THE LINEUP TO PATRICK.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

773

1 Q. YOU LISTED THE UNKNOWN DRIVER I BELIEVE, DID YOU  
2 NOT, IN YOUR REPORT?

3 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, GOING ON THROUGH YOUR  
5 NARRATIVES, AFTER THAT POINT IN YOUR REPORT COULD  
6 YOU POINT OUT, OR DID YOU EVER PUT ANOTHER  
7 NARRATIVE IN FOLLOWING UP ON WHO MY CLIENT WAS?

8 A. IT WAS, IN NARRATIVE THIRTEEN I SAID, "I SHOWED  
9 PATRICK TYLER A PHOTO LINEUP OF A SUBJECT THAT  
10 MAY HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY AND DEATH  
11 OF CHARLES PRINGLE, AND THE KIDNAPING OF ASHLEY  
12 PARSLEY. HE PICKED OUT ALL SUBJECTS THAT WERE  
13 INVOLVED WITH HIM. SEE LINEUPS." SO, I  
14 REFERENCED THE LINEUPS IN THAT NARRATIVE  
15 THIRTEEN.

16 Q. YOU -- ALRIGHT, SO THAT WAS ON THE TWENTY-SECOND?

17 A. YES, SEE, OUR COMPUTER, THEY, WE CAN'T CONTROL  
18 THE DATES WHEN WE INPUT THAT INFORMATION, SO - -

19 -

20 Q. OKAY.

21 A. --- I GUESS THAT'S A TECHNOLOGICAL ERROR WITH THE  
22 COMPUTER AS FAR AS THE DATES, BUT I DID ENTER IT  
23 IN THE NARRATIVE, "SEE THE LINEUPS."

24 Q. OKAY.

25 A. THAT, ALL PARTIES THAT WAS INVOLVED WITH PATRICK

1 TYLER.

2 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WAS NARRATIVE - - -

3 A. THIRTEEN.

4 Q. --- THIRTEEN BEFORE YOU DID NARRATIVE FOURTEEN?

5 A. CORRECT.

6 Q. IN THE CASE OVERVIEW. OKAY. AND THEN, I BELIEVE  
7 THE NEXT PAGE ENDS YOUR REPORT, IS THAT RIGHT?

8 A. CORRECT.

9 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WAS DATED WHAT?

10 A. THE TWENTY-THIRD.

11 Q. DID YOU, DID YOU HAVE ANY SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT AS  
12 FAR AS, I THINK YOU TESTIFIED WHEN YOU FOUND THE  
13 UNKNOWN DRIVER DID YOU MAKE A SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT  
14 ON THAT?

15 A. NO, I JUST TOOK A STATEMENT FROM HIM BECAUSE,  
16 LIKE I SAID, I HADN'T EVEN GOT A CHANCE TO  
17 INTERVIEW, I MEANT, FINISH INVESTIGATING THAT  
18 PART OF THE INVESTIGATION.

19 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU TOOK A STATEMENT FROM HIM?

20 A. THAT'S ALL I DID, TOOK A STATEMENT FROM HIM,  
21 CORRECT.

22 Q. AND WHAT WAS HIS NAME?

23 A. RONNIE WASHINGTON.

24 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU TOOK THE STATEMENT FROM HIM, DID  
25 HE ADMIT TO BEING THE DRIVER IN THE STATEMENT?

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. LACKEY

775

1 A. YES, HE DID.

2 Q. SO, YOU CHARGED HIM AT THAT TIME?

3 A. NO, I DID NOT.

4 Q. AND WHY IS THAT?

5 A. WELL, HE SAID THAT HE WAS THE DRIVER, FROM WHAT  
6 HE TOLD ME THAT, HE STATES THAT - - -

7 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE'S GETTING  
8 INTO WHAT RONNIE WASHINGTON SAID IN HIS STATEMENT AND  
9 HE'S CERTAINLY NOT HERE FOR ME TO CROSS-EXAMINE HIM.

10 THE COURT: THE OBJECTION IS SUSTAINED.

11 Q. OKAY. BUT YOU DIDN'T ARREST HIM?

12 A. NOT YET.

13 Q. NOT YET?

14 A. NOT YET.

15 Q. NOT FROM TWO WEEKS AGO?

16 A. TWO WEEKS AGO, CORRECT.

17 Q. AND DID HE, DIDN'T HE, OR DID HE SAY HE KNEW MY  
18 CLIENT?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND HOW DID HE KNOW MY CLIENT?

21 A. HE SAID THEY USED TO WORK TOGETHER AT BURGER  
22 KING.

23 Q. UH-HUH.

24 A. AND I THINK THEY WENT TO SCHOOL TOGETHER, BUT HE  
25 USED TO RUN ERRANDS FOR HIM.

1 Q. OKAY. AS FAR AS, AS FAR AS THE ARREST OR NON-  
2 ARREST, FROM YOUR EXPERIENCE AS A LAW ENFORCEMENT  
3 OFFICER YOU DIDN'T FEEL AT THE TIME THAT YOU  
4 COULD CHARGE HIM WITH ANY CHARGE?

5 A. WELL, IT'S A MATTER OF -- WELL, I DON'T GO BY  
6 WHAT I FEEL. DO I THINK HE PROBABLY PARTICIPATED  
7 IN IT? YES. BUT CAN I PROVE IT? AT THIS TIME I  
8 CAN'T. THAT'S WHY IT'S STILL A FURTHER  
9 INVESTIGATION.

10 Q. OKAY. SO, - - -

11 A. THE STATEMENT I TOOK FROM HIM IS NOT ENOUGH TO  
12 PLACE HIM UNDER ARREST AT THIS TIME, I'VE GOT TO  
13 CONTINUE MY INVESTIGATION, BUT I'VE BEEN IN COURT  
14 ALL WEEK, SO ...

15 Q. BUT THAT WAS TWO WEEKS AGO?

16 A. TWO WEEKS, CORRECT.

17 Q. NOVEMBER THIRTIETH, IS THAT CORRECT?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. DID YOU CONSULT THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE ABOUT  
20 MAKING THAT ARREST?

21 A. I TOLD THEM THAT I TALKED TO THE DRIVER OF THE  
22 VEHICLE, IF THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE ASKING ME.

23 Q. DID Y'ALL TALK ABOUT A POSSIBLE ARREST?

24 A. I WAS MORE FOCUSED ON THIS CASE. I -- LIKE I TOLD  
25 THEM, I WOULD CONTINUE THE INVESTIGATION. I WENT

1           OUT ON MY OWN AND I CONDUCTED ANOTHER LINEUP,  
2           TOOK IT TO MR. TYLER, AND HE COULDN'T PICK HIM  
3           OUT. SO, I DIDN'T HAVE ENOUGH TO GO SEEK  
4           PROBABLE CAUSE TO GET AN ARREST AT THIS TIME.

5           Q. SO, YOU SAID YOU WERE MORE FOCUSED ON THIS CASE,  
6           BUT HE'S PART OF THIS CASE, IS HE NOT?

7           A. YES, NOW HE IS.

8           Q. OKAY. AND HE WAS TWO WEEKS AGO?

9           A. YES, SIR, HE IS.

10          Q. OKAY.

11          MR. LACKEY: I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS, YOUR  
12          HONOR.

13          THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.

14                 ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WE'VE BEEN GOING  
15                 FOR OUR USUAL HOUR AND A HALF, AND RIGHT NOW WE'RE  
16                 GOING TO TAKE A BREAK FOR ABOUT FIFTEEN MINUTES, LET  
17                 Y'ALL STRETCH YOUR LEGS, AND THEN WE'LL BE BACK IN  
18                 HERE AGAIN. LET ME REMIND YOU, YOU HAVE NOT HEARD ALL  
19                 THE TESTIMONY IN THIS CASE SO YOU CANNOT TALK ABOUT  
20                 THIS CASE AT THIS TIME. Y'ALL CAN GO BACK IN THE JURY  
21                 ROOM NOW. OKAY? THANK YOU.

22                 (Whereupon, the jury leaves  
23                 the courtroom and the following  
24                 takes place out of the presence  
25                 of the jury.)



1 WAY.

2 THE COURT: I SEE, I APPRECIATE THAT, MR. WISE.  
3 ARE YOU READY TO GO?

4 MR. WISE: WE ARE.

5 THE COURT: OKAY. IS THE JURY READY? SEE IF  
6 THEY'RE READY TO COME ON BACK IN. I TAKE THAT AS A  
7 YES. OKAY.

8 (Whereupon, the jury enters  
9 the courtroom and the following  
10 takes place in the presence  
11 of the jury.)

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, WE WILL CONTINUE WITH THE  
13 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT, AND MR.  
14 WISE, I BELIEVE YOU WERE GOING TO CROSS -- IT'S YOUR  
15 TURN, RIGHT?

16 MR. WISE: YES, YOUR HONOR, IF IT PLEASE THE  
17 COURT.

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, YES, SIR.

19 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
20 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
21 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
22 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
23 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

780

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES SHUMPERT

BY MR. WISE:

Q. GOOD AFTERNOON, LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT.

A. YES, SIR, GOOD AFTERNOON.

Q. OR GOOD MORNING.

A. GOOD MORNING.

Q. I'M OFF TO A GOOD START. LIEUTENANT, LET ME ASK YOU JUST SOME QUESTIONS TO FOLLOW UP ON SOME OF THE QUESTIONS THAT MR. SORENSON ASKED YOU.

A. YES, SIR.

Q. DID YOU EXECUTE ANY OTHER SEARCH WARRANTS IN THIS CASE?

A. NO, I DIDN'T.

Q. YOU INDICATED THAT CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT WAS WIRED WHEN HE PURCHASED THE GUN FROM ANDRE WASHINGTON?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. SO, YOU HAVE A TAPE OF THAT TRANSACTION?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. YOU TESTIFIED THAT PATRICK TYLER TURNED HIMSELF IN?

A. HE DID.

Q. HE CAME IN VOLUNTARILY?

A. YES, SIR, HE DID.

Q. OKAY. RALPH ALSO TURNED HIMSELF IN?

A. YES, HE DID.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

781

1 Q. HE CAME IN VOLUNTARILY?

2 A. HE DID.

3 Q. YOU DIDN'T HAVE TO TRACK HIM DOWN?

4 A. WELL, WE LOOKED FOR HIM FOR SEVERAL DAYS BUT HE  
5 EVENTUALLY TURNED HIMSELF IN.

6 Q. OKAY. YOU TALKED ABOUT YOUR INTERVIEW WITH  
7 PATRICK, AND I JUST NEED TO ASK YOU A LITTLE  
8 BACKGROUND, WHAT TIME DID HE GET TO YOUR OFFICE?

9 A. I'D HAVE TO LOOK BACK AT HIS STATEMENT.

10 Q. TAKE YOUR TIME.

11 A. WE STARTED THE STATEMENT AT FOUR:FIFTY-THREE. I  
12 WOULD HAVE WENT OVER HIS ADVISEMENT OF RIGHTS  
13 FIRST, SO I WOULD SAY ABOUT, SOMEWHERE A LITTLE  
14 AFTER, CLOSE TO FOUR:THIRTY, SOMEWHERE IN THAT  
15 TIME FRAME.

16 Q. SO, HE ARRIVED AROUND FOUR:THIRTY?

17 A. I'M NOT SURE EXACTLY OF THE TIME BUT IF I COULD  
18 LOOK AT MY ADVISEMENT OF RIGHTS, THAT WOULD  
19 PROBABLY TELL YOU.

20 Q. I DON'T HAVE THEM.

21 THE COURT: I THOUGHT THAT WAS AN EXHIBIT, I  
22 DON'T REMEMBER.

23 COURT REPORTER: IT IS, BUT - - -

24 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOU DON'T HAVE IT IN YOUR  
25 FILE?

1           COURT REPORTER: IT WOULD BE NINETY-FIVE, STATE'S  
2 NINETY-FIVE.

3           THE COURT: STATE'S NINETY-FIVE, IF YOU CAN PUT  
4 YOUR HANDS ON IT.

5 A. OKAY. SO, IF, I READ HIM THE ADVISEMENT OF  
6 RIGHTS AT FOUR:FORTY-THREE, SO THAT MEANS HE  
7 PROBABLY WOULD HAVE GOTTEN THERE ABOUT FIVE, MAY  
8 SIX MINUTES BEFORE THAT.

9 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU ONLY SPOKE TO HIM ABOUT SIX  
10 MINUTES BEFORE YOU ADVISED HIM OF HIS RIGHTS?

11 A. WELL, I WAS -- HE WAS SITTING IN THE CHIEF'S  
12 OFFICE, I WAS CALLED TO COME OVER TO HER OFFICE,  
13 AND PATRICK AND HIS PARENTS WAS ALREADY IN THE  
14 OFFICE. AND LIKE I SAY, I CAN'T TELL YOU EXACTLY  
15 WHAT TIME HE GOT TO THE COMPLEX. I KNOW I WAS  
16 CALLED OVER THERE.

17 Q. OKAY. LET ME REPHRASE IT THIS WAY, WHAT TIME DID  
18 YOU FIRST START SPEAKING TO PATRICK?

19 A. WHEN I STARTED READING HIM HIS RIGHTS.

20 Q. SO, THE FIRST WORDS OUT OF YOUR MOUTH TO HIM  
21 WERE?

22 A. ONCE I KNEW WHAT HE WAS THERE FOR, I WENT  
23 STRAIGHT INTO THE ADVISEMENT OF RIGHTS, AND THAT  
24 WAS AT FOUR:FORTY-THREE.

25 Q. OKAY. AND HIS STATEMENT IS TIMED AT FOUR:FIFTY-

1 THREE?

2 A. CORRECT.

3 Q. OKAY. WHEN YOU WERE TESTIFYING YOU USED THE  
4 EXPRESSION, WE KEPT SPEAKING. WHAT DID YOU SAY?

5 A. I'M NOT SURE WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT.

6 Q. WHEN YOU SAID YOU -- IT WAS WHEN YOU WERE  
7 TESTIFYING ABOUT YOUR INTERACTION WITH PATRICK  
8 YOU SAID, HE FIRST SAID HE DIDN'T KNOW NOTHING.

9 A. RIGHT, CORRECT.

10 Q. AND THEN YOU USED THE EXPRESSION, WE KEPT  
11 SPEAKING. THAT'S THE TERM YOU USED?

12 A. IF I SAID IT.

13 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. DO YOU REMEMBER WHAT YOU KEPT  
14 SPEAKING ABOUT?

15 A. I ASKED PATRICK ABOUT THE INCIDENT AND HE STATED  
16 THAT, LIKE I SAID AT FIRST INITIALLY HE DIDN'T  
17 KNOW NOTHING ABOUT NOTHING.

18 Q. UH-HUH.

19 A. AND THEN HE HELD HIS HEAD DOWN AND THEN HIS  
20 PARENTS WAS STANDING THERE AND THEN HE BUST OUT  
21 CRYING, LIKE I STATED EARLIER.

22 Q. UH-HUH.

23 A. AND HE STATED THAT HE WANTED TO TELL THE TRUTH.  
24 AND THEN I LISTENED TO WHAT HE HAD TO SAY AND  
25 AFTER HE SAID WHAT HE HAD TO SAY I ASKED HIM TO

1 PROVIDE A STATEMENT, WHICH HE DID.

2 Q. DID YOU TELL HIM, PROVIDE HIM ANY INFORMATION  
3 ABOUT WHAT YOU THOUGHT HAD HAPPENED TO MR.  
4 PRINGLE, HOW THAT WHOLE EVENT OCCURRED?

5 A. NO, NO, I COULDN'T HAVE, I DIDN'T KNOW.

6 Q. OKAY. DO YOU KNOW WHILE HE WAS WAITING FOR YOU  
7 TO COME OVER DID ANYBODY ELSE PROVIDE HIM ANY  
8 INFORMATION OR DETAILS ABOUT WHAT HAPPENED?

9 A. LIKE I SAID, WHEN I GOT THERE HE WAS ALREADY IN  
10 THE CHIEF'S OFFICE.

11 Q. SO, YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT HAPPENED BEFORE THAT?

12 A. NO.

13 Q. OKAY. I WANT TO SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT FIVE,  
14 THAT'S ASHLEY'S - - -

15 A. PARSLEY.

16 Q. RIGHT. THAT'S HER, THE AFFIDAVIT ATTACHED TO HER  
17 IDENTIFICATION?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. IN THAT AFFIDAVIT SHE NEVER MENTIONS RALPH HAVING  
20 A GUN, DOES SHE?

21 A. NO, SHE DOESN'T.

22 Q. WHEN -- I THINK YOU TESTIFIED THAT BEFORE YOU PUT  
23 TOGETHER A LINEUP YOU FIRST PULLED DMV PHOTOS, IS  
24 THAT RIGHT?

25 A. YES. IT'S CUSTOMARY WHEN WE GET READY TO DO A

1 LINEUP WE HAVE TO PULL THE DMV PHOTOS AND GIVE  
2 THEM TO THE SECRETARIES AND SHOW THEM WHO WE NEED  
3 TO BE PUT IN A LINEUP. BUT, NOW, HOWEVER, IF WE  
4 DON'T HAVE A JAIL PICTURE OF THE PERSON WE HAVE  
5 TO SEND A DMV PHOTO LINEUP, OR A DMV PICTURE OFF  
6 TO SLED WHERE THEY MAKE A PHOTO LINEUP.

7 Q. DID YOU SHOW ANY DMV PHOTOS TO PATRICK BEFORE YOU  
8 SHOWED HIM THE LINEUP?

9 A. NO, I DIDN'T.

10 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. NOW, WHEN YOU WERE BEING FIRST  
11 EXAMINED BY MR. LACKEY YOU USED THE EXPRESSION  
12 THAT YOU WANT TO GET A STATEMENT WHEN REFERRING  
13 TO INTERVIEWING PEOPLE, IS THAT YOUR INTENTION  
14 WHEN YOU'RE SITTING DOWN TALKING TO THEM, THAT  
15 YOU WANT TO GET A STATEMENT OUT OF THEM?

16 A. WELL, I MEAN, THAT DEPENDS ON THE SITUATION. IF  
17 YOU'RE INVESTIGATING A CRIME AND SOMEBODY'S GOT  
18 PERTINENT INFORMATION, YES, YOU WANT TO GET A  
19 STATEMENT FROM THEM.

20 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND LET ME BACK UP, WHEN YOU GET  
21 THESE DMV PICTURES AND YOU'RE PUTTING OTHER  
22 PICTURES WITH THEM WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO DO IS  
23 GET PICTURES THAT LOOK AS CLOSE AS POSSIBLE TO  
24 THE PICTURE OF THE PERSON THAT YOU ARE CONCERNED  
25 ABOUT, IS THAT AN ACCURATE STATEMENT?

1 A. IF POSSIBLE.

2 Q. SURE. WHEN YOU WERE TALKING TO PATRICK DID YOU  
3 SAY TO HIM THAT IF HE TOLD THE TRUTH OR IF HE  
4 GAVE A STATEMENT, THAT THAT WOULD HELP HIM, DID  
5 YOU TELL HIM THAT?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. DID YOU TELL HIM YOU WOULD TALK TO MR. PASCOE ON  
8 HIS BEHALF?

9 A. NO, SIR. AS I STATED EARLIER, WHEN I GOT TO THE  
10 OFFICE I WAS CALLED OVER THERE, AND HE WAS IN  
11 THERE WITH HIS PARENTS, AND JUST LIKE I STATED  
12 EARLIER, HE STATED THAT HE DIDN'T KNOW NOTHING  
13 ABOUT NOTHING, AND ON HIS OWN FREE WILL HE JUST  
14 BUST OUT AND START CRYING AND SAYING, I WANT TO  
15 TELL THE TRUTH. AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT HE WROTE  
16 IN HIS STATEMENT.

17 Q. HE WANTED TO DO WHAT WAS RIGHT?

18 A. BUT I CAN'T JUDGE PEOPLE, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT, WHAT HE SAID TO YOU, YOU PUT  
20 INTO YOUR REPORT, YOU ARE, AND MR. LACKEY ASKED  
21 YOU ABOUT THIS, YOU ARE DOING THESE INVESTIGATIVE  
22 REPORTS?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. WHEN PATRICK WAS TESTIFYING I  
25 THOUGHT HE REFERRED TO YOU AS JUNIOR SHUMPERT.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

787

1 DID I HEAR THAT RIGHT?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. DO YOU KNOW HIM, DID YOU KNOW HIM BEFORE THIS?

4 A. NO, I DON'T KNOW HIM, NO, SIR.

5 Q. DO YOU KNOW WHY HE WOULD REFER TO YOU THAT WAY?

6 A. A LOT OF PEOPLE REFER, A LOT OF PEOPLE CALL ME  
7 JUNIOR, A LOT OF PEOPLE CALL ME JUNIOR SHUMPERT,  
8 A LOT OF PEOPLE CALL ME JAMES SHUMPERT, A LOT OF  
9 PEOPLE CALL ME SHUMPERT. I MEAN, I HAVE NO  
10 EARTHLY IDEA, YOU'D HAVE TO ASK HIM THAT.

11 Q. OKAY. DID YOU TELL HIM TO CALL YOU JUNIOR?

12 A. NO, I DIDN'T.

13 Q. I WOULD CALL YOU LIEUTENANT, RIGHT?

14 A. CORRECT.

15 Q. OKAY. FINE. SO YOU AND HE -- OKAY, ALRIGHT.

16 WHEN, WHEN HE MADE HIS STATEMENT, WHEN HE SPOKE  
17 TO YOU AND MADE HIS STATEMENT HE NEVER SAID THAT  
18 THEY NEEDED ANOTHER PERSON FOR THIS ROBBERY, DID  
19 HE, HE SAID THEY NEEDED ANOTHER STRAP, THAT'S  
20 WHAT YOU WROTE DOWN, ISN'T THAT RIGHT?

21 A. IN MY INVESTIGATIVE NOTES?

22 Q. YEAH, WITH - - -

23 A. DO YOU HAVE THEM RIGHT THERE, I'LL LOOK AT YOURS.

24 COURT REPORTER: HE SAID THEY NEEDED ANOTHER  
25 WHAT?

1           MR. LACKEY: STRAP.

2           Q. THAT WAS THE TERM THAT HE USED, CORRECT?

3           A. I'M GOING TO HAVE TO READ IT. THE WHOLE THING,  
4           BECAUSE I DON'T SEE IT, IT'S NOT HIGHLIGHTED.

5           Q. I'M SORRY, TAKE YOUR TIME.

6           A. YES, SIR.

7           Q. HE USED THE EXPRESSION, WE NEED ANOTHER STRAP,  
8           NOT ANOTHER PERSON?

9           A. RIGHT, HE SAID, STRAP, UH-HUH.

10          Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND THAT WORD, STRAP, IS WHAT  
11          PEOPLE USE, SOMETIMES REFER TO AS A GUN?

12          A. CORRECT.

13          Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. WHEN HE SPOKE TO YOU AND WROTE  
14          HIS STATEMENT, HE NEVER SAID THAT ANYBODY GAVE  
15          THEIR GUN TO RALPH, HE NEVER SAID THAT, DID HE?

16          A. I CAN'T RECALL, I JUST REMEMBER HIM SAYING THAT  
17          HE PASSED -- PETE PASSED HIS GUN OFF TO SOMEONE.

18          Q. LOOK IN YOUR REPORT. YOU DON'T SEE ANYTHING IN  
19          THERE ABOUT HIM SAYING ANYONE GAVE HIS GUN TO  
20          RALPH?

21          A. NO, IT STATES HERE THAT PETE HANDED HIS GUN - - -

22                 MR. MELLARD: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE CAN

23          ANSWER THE QUESTIONS BUT NOT WHAT'S HEARSAY.

24                 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. I SUSTAIN YOUR OBJECTION.

25          LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT, IF YOU'D JUST ANSWER THE

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

789

1 QUESTION, IF YOU'LL JUST ANSWER HIS QUESTION, DON'T  
2 READ THE REPORT. IF YOU WOULD, JUST ANSWER THE  
3 QUESTION, DID -- IF YOU'LL REPHRASE THE QUESTION, DID  
4 ...

5 Q. PATRICK NEVER SAID IN HIS CONVERSATIONS WITH YOU  
6 OR STATEMENT THAT ANYONE PASSED A GUN TO RALPH?

7 A. NO, NOT IN THIS.

8 Q. OKAY. AND HE NEVER MENTIONED TO YOU OR WROTE IN  
9 HIS STATEMENT THAT HE RAN OUT OF THE APARTMENT?

10 A. LET ME LOOK BACK IN HIS STATEMENT REAL QUICK.

11 Q. TAKE YOUR TIME.

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. AND HE NEVER MENTIONED TO YOU OR WROTE IN  
14 HIS STATEMENT ANYTHING ABOUT ANYBODY SHOOTING A  
15 DOG?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. THERE OBVIOUSLY CAME A TIME WHEN PATRICK  
18 OFFERED TO TESTIFY IN THIS CASE. DID HE DO THAT  
19 YOUR FIRST MEETING?

20 A. NO, SIR, NOT WITH ME.

21 Q. OKAY. WERE, WERE YOU INVOLVED IN, WHEN THAT  
22 ISSUE CAME UP ABOUT WHEN HE, THAT HE WOULD OFFER  
23 TESTIMONY, WERE YOU INVOLVED AT ALL?

24 A. NO, SIR, I WASN'T INVOLVED WITH THAT.

25 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. SO, YOU DIDN'T MAKE ANY OFFERS

1 TO HIM ABOUT TESTIFYING?

2 A. NO, SIR, NO.

3 Q. YOU DIDN'T TALK TO HIS ATTORNEY ABOUT HIM  
4 OFFERING TESTIMONY?

5 A. NO, I DIDN'T.

6 Q. WHEN YOU, AND MR. LACKEY HAD TOUCHED ON THIS,  
7 WHEN YOU LOOK AT HIS STATEMENT, TAKING TOGETHER  
8 WHAT HE TRIES TO DO IS MINIMIZE HIS INVOLVEMENT  
9 AND INCREASE THE INVOLVEMENT OF EVERYBODY ELSE,  
10 ISN'T THAT CORRECT? LET ME BE MORE SPECIFIC.

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. WHEN YOU LOOK AT HIS STATEMENT AND READ YOUR  
13 REPORT ABOUT WHAT HE SAYS, HE DOESN'T PUT ANY  
14 GUNS IN HIS HANDS?

15 A. CORRECT.

16 Q. AND HE DOESN'T EVEN SAY HE WAS THERE?

17 A. OH, HE SAID HE WAS THERE.

18 Q. WHEN THE SHOOTING OCCURRED?

19 A. I -- NO, HE SAID HE WAS THERE.

20 Q. SO, HE SAYS HE WAS THERE WHEN THE SHOOTING  
21 OCCURRED?

22 A. NO, I'M SAYING WHEN THE INCIDENT TOOK PLACE, BUT  
23 I DON'T, YOU KNOW, FROM WHAT HE TESTIFIED TO.

24 Q. THAT'S GOOD, THAT'S A GOOD POINT. WOULD YOU  
25 AGREE WITH ME THAT SOME OF HIS STATEMENTS TO YOU

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

791

1 AND THAT HE WROTE DOWN ARE VERY INCONSISTENT WITH  
2 SOME OF THE THINGS HE TESTIFIED TO?

3 A. WELL, THAT'S JUST A MATTER OF OPINION, VERSUS  
4 WHETHER HE RAN OUT THE HOUSE OR WALKED OUT THE  
5 HOUSE, I JUST THINK THERE PROBABLY BEEN, YOU  
6 KNOW, I JUST DON'T KNOW TOO MANY PEOPLE WHO WILL  
7 PUT THEMSELVES IN A CRIME SCENE.

8 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, IN YOUR OPINION, - -

9 -

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. --- WOULD YOU AGREE WITH ME THAT WHAT HE WROTE IN  
12 HIS STATEMENT AND WHAT HE TOLD YOU IS  
13 INCONSISTENT WITH SOME OF THE THINGS HE TESTIFIED  
14 TO FROM THAT WITNESS STAND?

15 A. YES.

16 Q. OKAY. DURING THE COURSE OF THIS INVESTIGATION  
17 YOU PERFORMED A, I GUESS IT'S A GUN SHOT RESIDUE  
18 TEST ON ASHLEY PARSLEY THAT WAS PERFORMED?

19 A. IT WAS, BUT I DIDN'T DO IT.

20 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. YOU'RE THE LEAD INVESTIGATOR.  
21 DID YOU CONSIDER HER A SUSPECT?

22 A. IN THE BEGINNING?

23 Q. YES.

24 A. YES, I DID.

25 Q. OKAY. IT'S, IS IT FAIR TO SAY THAT YOU CONSIDER

1 THIS, EVEN NOW, AS A ROBBERY OF A PERSON WHO WAS  
2 SELLING DRUGS, THAT'S WHAT THE MOTIVE OF THIS  
3 WHOLE THING WAS?

4 A. YOU'RE ASKING ME WHAT I CONSIDERED?

5 Q. BASED ON YOUR INVESTIGATION?

6 A. WELL, FROM WHAT THE TESTIMONY, THAT'S WHAT IT MAY  
7 APPEAR TO BE, PEOPLE ROB FOR DRUGS AND MONEY.

8 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND YOU, DURING THE COURSE OF  
9 YOUR INVESTIGATION, LEARNED THAT ASHLEY PARSLEY  
10 HAD TOLD SOMEONE ELSE, SOMEBODY NAMED HASSAN  
11 GADDIST THAT THEY WERE SELLING DRUGS OUT OF THAT  
12 APARTMENT, YOU BECAME AWARE OF THAT, DIDN'T YOU?

13 A. I CAN'T RECALL THAT ISSUE, IT MAY BE WRITTEN, I  
14 CAN'T RECALL IT.

15 Q. OKAY. LIEUTENANT, JUST BEAR WITH ME ONE MINUTE.

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 MR. WISE: YOUR HONOR, JUST ONE MOMENT.

18 Q. LIEUTENANT, I'M GOING TO SHOW YOU A DOCUMENT,  
19 OKAY?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. I DON'T WANT YOU TO TALK ABOUT IT, I JUST WANT  
22 YOU TO LOOK AT IT.

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT?

25 A. YES, SIR.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

793

1 Q. IS THAT YOUR SIGNATURE AT THE BOTTOM?

2 A. IT'S VERY FADED, BUT I BELIEVE IT IS, YES, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. NOW, I WANT YOU TO LOOK NEAR THE BOTTOM.

4 A. UH-HUH.

5 Q. IS THERE A NOTATION ON THAT DOCUMENT THAT YOU  
6 SIGNED THAT - - -

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, I'M GOING TO  
8 OBJECT AT THIS POINT IN TIME. I MEAN, I DON'T THINK  
9 HE LAID THE PROPER FOUNDATION WHEN THEY WERE  
10 QUESTIONING MS. PARSLEY TO NOW BE ABLE TO IMPEACH,  
11 ATTEMPT TO IMPEACH HER WITH THAT DOCUMENT. AND HE  
12 NEVER ASKED HER, IT'S HEARSAY, AND HE NEVER ASKED HER  
13 SPECIFICALLY ABOUT THAT, WHAT HE IS NOW SHOWING  
14 LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT. I THINK UNDER RULE, I THINK IT'S  
15 SIX THIRTEEN THAT HE HAS NOT LAID A PROPER FOUNDATION  
16 IN AN ATTEMPT TO IMPEACH HER.

17 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, I ACTUALLY QUESTIONED  
18 MS. PARSLEY AND I DID QUESTIONED HER AS TO WHETHER SHE  
19 DISCUSSED THIS WITH THE POLICE.

20 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, MAY WE APPROACH?

21 THE COURT: YES.

22 (Whereupon, a bench conference  
23 is had out of the hearing of  
24 the jury and court reporter.)

25 THE COURT: OKAY, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, AS YOU

1 CAN SEE, I'VE GOT SOMETHING I'VE GOT TO CONSIDER, AND  
2 I MENTIONED BEFORE THAT I MAY HAVE TO TAKE UP SOME  
3 THINGS AND MAKE SOME COMMENTS ON SOME THINGS OUTSIDE  
4 OF Y'ALL'S PRESENCE. I'M GOING TO ASK Y'ALL TO STEP  
5 BACK INTO THE JURY ROOM FOR JUST A SECOND AND NOT TALK  
6 ABOUT THIS CASE FOR A MINUTE. OKAY? THANK YOU.

7 (Whereupon, the jury retires  
8 to the jury room and the following  
9 takes place out of the presence  
10 of the jury.)

11 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NOW, I'VE GOT THIS DOCUMENT  
12 THAT YOU ARE ASKING HIM QUESTIONS ABOUT, AND I'M  
13 GETTING THE IMPRESSION, MR. WISE, THAT YOU'RE ASKING  
14 IF HASSAN GADDIST WAS A POSSIBLE SUSPECT?

15 MR. WISE: THAT'S WHERE I'M GOING, THAT'S EXACTLY  
16 WHERE I'M GOING.

17 THE COURT: OKAY.

18 MR. WISE: THAT' EXACTLY WHERE I'M GOING.

19 THE COURT: AND WHEN I READ THIS THING, IT  
20 INDICATES THAT MS. PARSLEY SAYS THAT SHE DIDN'T PLAN  
21 TO ROB CHARLES PRINGLE, WHO IS THE VICTIM IN HERE, AND  
22 THAT THE ONLY THING SHE DID IS, SHE TOLD THIS MR.  
23 GADDIST WHERE SHE WAS NOW LIVING AND THAT THEY WERE  
24 SELLING DRUGS IN THE APARTMENT.

25 MR. WISE: YES, SIR.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

795

1           THE COURT:   WHAT DOES THAT, HOW DO YOU GET TO THE  
2           POINT OF WHERE HASSAN GADDIST MIGHT BE A SUSPECT OF A  
3           ROBBERY FROM THIS?

4           MR. WISE:   WELL, MAYBE HE WAS AND MAYBE HE  
5           WASN'T, BUT HERE'S THE ISSUE, - - -

6           THE COURT:   TELL ME WHAT THE ISSUE IS.

7           MR. WISE:   THE LIEUTENANT   HAS TESTIFIED THAT THE  
8           REASON THIS ROBBERY OCCURRED IS BECAUSE THERE WERE  
9           DRUGS BEING SOLD BY MR. PRINGLE, AND BECAUSE THAT WAS  
10          THE REASON FOR THE ROBBERY, I SUBMIT TO THE COURT THAT  
11          PEOPLE WHO KNEW THAT DRUGS WERE BEING SOLD WOULD HAVE  
12          THE SAME INTERESTS, IF YOU WILL, IN COMMITTING A  
13          ROBBERY, SINCE THAT'S WHAT THIS WAS ALL ABOUT.

14          THE COURT:   ALRIGHT.   MR. SORENSON, DO YOU WANT  
15          TO SAY ANYTHING?

16          SOLICITOR SORENSON:   YES, IF I COULD, YOUR HONOR.  
17          I GUESS MY OBJECTION NOW WOULD BE TWO-FOLD, AND  
18          INITIALLY MY OBJECTION WAS THAT THEY DIDN'T LAY THE  
19          PROPER FOUNDATION UNDER RULE SIX THIRTEEN, BECAUSE I  
20          THOUGHT THEY WERE, AT THAT POINT, INITIALLY,  
21          ATTEMPTING TO IMPEACH MS. PARSLEY.   SO, UNDER THAT  
22          LINE OF MY OBJECTION WOULD BE THAT THEY DID NOT ADVISE  
23          HER OF THE SUBSTANCE OF THE STATEMENT, THE TIME AND  
24          PLACE IT WAS ALLEGEDLY MADE, THE PERSON TO WHOM IT WAS  
25          MADE, AND GIVE HER AN OPPORTUNITY TO EXPLAIN OR DENY

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

796

1 IT, SO THEREFORE, THEY WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO INTRODUCE  
2 IT THROUGH LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT.

3 MY SECOND OBJECTION, ACTUALLY, IT'S PROBABLY I  
4 THINK THE MORE RELEVANT OBJECTION AT THIS POINT IN  
5 TIME IS THAT IT'S THIRD PARTY GUILT, AND I DON'T SEE  
6 HOW, I MEAN, THAT LITERALLY IS THE VERY DEFINITION IS  
7 JUST THROWING BARE SUSPICION ON SOMEBODY ELSE, I MEAN,  
8 HOW THAT IS POSSIBLY RELEVANT. IF THAT'S, FROM WHAT I  
9 HEAR FROM MR. WISE, IF THAT'S THE REASON WHY THEY WANT  
10 TO GET INTO IT, IT'S EXACTLY TO TRY AND JUST POINT THE  
11 FINGER AT SOMEBODY ELSE WHEN THIS EVIDENCE HAS  
12 ABSOLUTELY NOTHING, I MEAN, IT DOESN'T IN ANY WAY  
13 DISPROVE HIS CLIENT'S OR ANY OF THOSE OTHER  
14 DEFENDANTS' GUILT IN THIS MATTER, AND I THINK IT IS  
15 CLEARLY INADMISSIBLE UNDER THE CASE LAW DEALING WITH  
16 THIRD PARTY GUILT.

17 MR. WISE: MAY I RESPOND, YOUR HONOR?

18 THE COURT: YES, SIR, YOU CAN RESPOND.

19 MR. WISE: WELL, ONE OF THE ISSUES I THINK IN  
20 THIS CASE IS GOING TO BE WHO ALL WAS PRESENT AND WHO  
21 ALL WAS BEING A PART OF THE PLANNING AND WHO ALL WAS  
22 FIRING GUNS. AND SO, I THINK PEOPLE WHO -- ESPECIALLY  
23 PEOPLE CONNECTED TO MS. PARSLEY WHO KNEW THAT THIS WAS  
24 GOING ON IN THERE, THAT MAKES IT RELEVANT TO WHAT  
25 HAPPENED. IF, DO YOU HAVE FOUR GUYS, OR FIVE GUYS, OR

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

797

1 SIX GUYS OR SEVEN GUYS, AND THREE GUNS OR FOUR GUNS,  
2 SO I THINK THAT'S, THAT'S WHY I THINK IT BECOMES  
3 RELEVANT.

4 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, ONE OF THE QUESTIONS  
5 THEY ASKED HER WAS, REGARDING CHARLES, DID YOU PLAN  
6 WITH ANYONE TO ROB HIM? AND THE ANSWER WAS, NO. IS  
7 THAT CORRECT?

8 MR. WISE: THAT'S CORRECT. ABSOLUTELY.

9 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. ALRIGHT, I'M GOING  
10 TO SUSTAIN YOUR OBJECTION. IF YOU WANT -- SINCE WE'VE  
11 HAD THIS, YOU CAN NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO MY RULING,  
12 BUT WE'RE NOT GOING TO GO INTO HASSAN, WHATEVER HIS  
13 NAME IS, AS A POSSIBLE DEFENDANT IN THIS CASE, OKAY,  
14 AS A POSSIBLE THIRD PARTY DEFENDANT. OKAY? AND I'LL  
15 NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO MY RULING SO IT WILL BE  
16 PRESERVED. AND IF YOU WANT TO, I'LL MAKE THAT  
17 COURT'S EXHIBIT SO IT WILL BE PRESERVED FOR THE  
18 RECORD.

19 MR. WISE: THANK YOU.

20 THE COURT: OKAY.

21 MR. WISE: I APPRECIATE IT.

22 THE COURT: OKAY. A LITTLE WHILE LATER WE'LL  
23 MAKE A COPY OF THAT A COURT'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THREE SO  
24 IT WILL BE PRESERVED FOR THE RECORD, SO THEY'LL HAVE  
25 THAT IF YOU WANT TO GO FURTHER WITH THIS. OKAY?

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

798

1 SO, YOU CAN HAND THAT BACK TO HIM. WE'RE THROUGH  
2 WITH THAT PART OF IT. OKAY?

3 MR. WISE: GIVE IT TO THE COURT REPORTER?

4 THE COURT: YEAH, YOU CAN GIVE IT TO HER, WE'LL  
5 RUN A COPY OF IT LATER. IF YOU'D JUST PUT A STICKY  
6 NOTE ON THERE, IT WILL BE COURT'S NUMBER THREE,  
7 PRESERVED. OKAY.

8 (Court's Exhibit Three marked  
9 and preserved for the record.)

10 THE COURT: OKAY. I'M GETTING READY TO BRING THE  
11 JURY BACK OUT. OKAY, BRING THE JURY ON BACK OUT.

12 (Whereupon, the jury enters  
13 the courtroom and the following  
14 takes place in the presence  
15 of the jury.)

16 THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I APOLOGIZE FOR  
17 HAVING TO HAVE Y'ALL STEP OUT OF THE ROOM, BUT BECAUSE  
18 THERE WERE SOME THINGS WE NEEDED TO DISCUSS THAT Y'ALL  
19 DIDN'T NEED TO HEAR THAT'S WHY I ASKED Y'ALL TO BE  
20 EXCUSED WHILE WE DISCUSS SOME OF THE EVIDENCE.

21 ALRIGHT, IF YOU WANT TO PROCEED WITH YOUR CROSS-  
22 EXAMINATION.

23 MR. WISE: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

24 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

25 Q. LIEUTENANT, MR. LACKEY ASKED YOU IF YOU ARRESTED

- 1 RONNIE WASHINGTON, AND YOU SAID YOU HADN'T?
- 2 A. CORRECT.
- 3 Q. BUT YOU WOULD AGREE WITH ME, WOULDN'T YOU, THAT
- 4 IF YOU BELIEVED EVERYTHING PATRICK TYLER SAID, HE
- 5 WAS GUILTY OF THIS CRIME, HE WAS A PART OF THIS
- 6 WHOLE CRIME?
- 7 A. YES.
- 8 Q. IF YOU BELIEVED PATRICK TYLER?
- 9 A. CORRECT.
- 10 Q. OKAY. WHEN YOU SPOKE TO PATRICK TYLER INITIALLY
- 11 DID HE TELL YOU THE THINGS ABOUT RONNIE
- 12 WASHINGTON THAT HE TESTIFIED TO IN THIS TRIAL,
- 13 DID HE TELL YOU THAT INFORMATION?
- 14 A. I'M NOT SURE WHAT YOU'RE ASKING, BUT - - -
- 15 Q. OKAY.
- 16 A. --- IF IT'S THE WAY YOU'RE ASKING ME, HE DIDN'T
- 17 TELL ME NOTHING ABOUT RONNIE WASHINGTON BECAUSE
- 18 HE SAID HE DIDN'T KNOW THE DRIVER.
- 19 Q. OKAY. BUT LET ME BE MORE SPECIFIC.
- 20 A. OKAY.
- 21 Q. IF YOU -- HE OBVIOUSLY, THEN, IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY
- 22 THAT HE DIDN'T TELL YOU THAT WHEN THEY WERE IN
- 23 THE CAR THAT THEY WERE TALKING ABOUT THE ROBBERY,
- 24 HE DIDN'T TELL YOU THAT, DID HE?
- 25 A. NO, HE DIDN'T.

1 Q. OKAY. HE DIDN'T TELL YOU THAT RONNIE WASHINGTON  
2 DROVE THEM THERE?

3 A. HE SAID AN UNKNOWN DRIVER DROVE THEM THERE.

4 Q. OKAY. HE DIDN'T TELL YOU THAT ON THE WAY THERE  
5 THAT DISCUSSIONS WERE TAKING PLACE IN THE CAR  
6 ABOUT WHAT WAS GOING TO HAPPEN AT THE ROBBERY, HE  
7 DIDN'T TELL YOU THAT, DID HE?

8 A. NO.

9 Q. OKAY. I MAY HAVE ASKED YOU THIS, HE DIDN'T TELL  
10 YOU THAT THERE WERE GUNS IN THE CAR WHEN HE  
11 TALKED TO YOU AND WROTE THAT STATEMENT, HE DIDN'T  
12 TELL YOU THAT THERE WERE GUNS IN THE CAR?

13 A. NOT AT THE TIME, NO, HE DID NOT.

14 Q. OKAY. AND HE DIDN'T - - -

15 A. BUT HE DID ALSO SAY THAT HE HAD, THEY NEEDED  
16 ANOTHER STRAP, SO BY HIM SAYING ANOTHER STRAP,  
17 AND THEM GOING TO PICK UP WALTER HARRIS I ASSUMED  
18 THERE WERE GUNS ALREADY IN THE CAR.

19 Q. WELL, HERE'S THE POINT, YOU HEARD HIM TESTIFY TO  
20 THE GUNS BEING IN THE CAR EARLIER THIS WEEK,  
21 RIGHT?

22 A. YES.

23 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. SO, IF YOU BELIEVED THAT WHAT HE  
24 SAID IS TRUE, WOULDN'T YOU ARREST RONNIE  
25 WASHINGTON?

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

801

1 A. NOT AT THIS TIME. LIKE I STATED EARLIER, WHEN I  
2 LEARNED OF MR. WASHINGTON I SHOWED HIM A PHOTO  
3 LINEUP OF HIM, AND HE WASN'T ABLE TO PICK HIM  
4 OUT. AND SO, NOBODY ELSE REALLY HAVE CAME  
5 FORWARD AND SAID, YEAH, THIS IS THE GUY THAT WAS  
6 WITH US. SO, LIKE I SAID, IT'S A FURTHER  
7 INVESTIGATION STILL GOING ON AT THIS TIME.

8 Q. BUT -- OKAY. FINE. OKAY. WHEN YOU WERE DOING  
9 YOUR INVESTIGATION DID YOU INVESTIGATE SOMEBODY  
10 NAMED CHRISTOPHER EVANS TO THIS?

11 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, OBJECTION. SAME  
12 OBJECTION THAT I JUST MADE A LITTLE WHILE AGO.

13 THE COURT: I UNDERSTAND, I UNDERSTAND IT'S THE  
14 SAME OBJECTION, AND TELL ME - - -

15 MR. WISE: WELL, YOUR HONOR, AT - - -

16 THE COURT: WELL, YOUR HONOR, - - -

17 THE COURT: WAIT A MINUTE.

18 MR. WISE: OKAY.

19 THE COURT: Y'ALL COME UP HERE.

20 (Whereupon, a bench conference  
21 is had out of the hearing of  
22 the court reporter and jury.)

23 THE COURT: THIS IS GOOD EXERCISE FOR ME, GOOD  
24 EXERCISE FOR YOU. I'M GOING TO ASK Y'ALL TO GO BACK  
25 INTO THE JURY ROOM AGAIN, ONE MORE TIME. OKAY?

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

802

1 YOU'RE NOT GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE CASE AT ALL. I'M  
2 GOING TO GO OVER SOME THINGS OUT HERE AND I'LL GET  
3 Y'ALL BACK IN IN A FEW MINUTES. OKAY? THANK YOU.

4 (Whereupon, the jury retires to  
5 the jury room and the following  
6 takes place out of the presence  
7 of the jury.)

8 THE COURT: MR. WISE, BEFORE I HAVE THE JURY GO  
9 IN AND OUT ALL THESE TIMES I WANT TO KNOW THE NAMES OF  
10 EVERYBODY YOU THINK ...

11 MR. WISE: I HAVE TWO MORE PEOPLE I WAS GOING TO  
12 ASK HIM ABOUT.

13 THE COURT: GIVE ME, I WANT TO KNOW, I WANT TO  
14 SEE THE BASIS OF YOU ASKING HIM ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT  
15 ANYBODY ELSE.

16 MR. WISE: OKAY. I HAVE -- AND THEY'RE BOTH THE  
17 SAME SITUATION.

18 THE COURT: OKAY.

19 MR. WISE: ONE IS CHRISTOPHER EVANS AND ONE IS  
20 OMAR CAPERS.

21 THE COURT: OKAY.

22 MR. WISE: AND THESE NAMES COME UP THIS WAY, IN  
23 THE DISCOVERY THAT WAS PROVIDED, THEY PROVIDED US WITH  
24 WHAT I BELIEVE TO BE DMV PRINTOUTS OF THESE TWO  
25 PEOPLE. WHEN LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT ...

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

803

1           THE COURT: LET ME SEE THAT.

2           MR. WISE: OH. OKAY. WELL, YOUR HONOR, THIS IS  
3 CHRISTOPHER EVANS.

4           THE COURT: YES.

5           MR. WISE: GIVE ME ONE MOMENT FOR MR. CAPERS.

6           THE COURT: THESE WERE INCLUDED IN DISCOVERY  
7 DOCUMENTS THAT YOU GOT, THAT YOU GOT AS PART OF YOUR  
8 RULE FIVE DISCOVERY?

9           MR. WISE: YES, SIR.

10          THE COURT: OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU WANT TO ASK

11          ...

12          MR. WISE: I JUST WANTED TO ASK IF THEY  
13 CONSIDERED THEM A SUSPECT IN THE ROBBERY, OF THESE ...

14          THE COURT: ASK HIM.

15          MR. WISE: OKAY.

16          (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
17 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
18 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
19 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
20 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS, IN CAMERA - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

804

CROSS-EXAMINATION, IN CAMERA, OF JAMES SHUMPERT

BY MR. WISE:

1 Q. CHRISTOPHER EVANS, DID YOU CONSIDER HIM A  
2 SUSPECT?

3 A. NO. WELL, WITH CHRIS, ---

4 THE COURT: JUST ...

5 A. --- HIS NAME WAS LITTLE CHRIS.

6 THE COURT: OH, OKAY. NEVER MIND.

7 A. OH, WAS LITTLE CHRIS, THE NAME CAME UP, LITTLE  
8 CHRIS. SO, CHRISTOPHER EVANS CAME UP, WE TRIED  
9 TO GET HIM FOR IDENTIFICATION PURPOSES.

10 Q. BECAUSE HIS NAME MATCHED, KIND OF SOUNDED LIKE  
11 ONE OF THE NAMES YOU HAD?

12 A. LITTLE CHRIS.

13 Q. I'VE GOT YOU.

14 A. RIGHT.

15 Q. OMAR CAPERS. DID YOU CONSIDER HIM A SUSPECT?

16 A. NOT AT THE TIME. THAT WAS ANOTHER NAME THAT CAME  
17 UP.

18 Q. OKAY. HOW DID IT COME UP? MAY I ASK?

19 THE COURT: NO, GO AHEAD.

20 Q. HOW DID IT COME UP?

21 A. WE GET, LIKE WHEN WE HAVE INCIDENTS LIKE THAT WE  
22 GET ZILLIONS OF CALLS, PEOPLE CALLING IN WITH  
23 INFORMATION ABOUT, YOU KNOW, THIS PERSON, THAT  
24  
25

CROSS, IN CAMERA - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

805

1 PERSON, THIS MAY BE LITTLE CHRIS, AND IF I'M NOT  
2 MISTAKEN I THINK THAT WAS ONE THAT ALSO THEY MAY  
3 HAVE CALLED HIM LITTLE CHRIS AT THE TIME. BUT I  
4 THINK WHEN THOSE NAMES CAME UP WE WAS TRYING TO  
5 FIND OUT WHO LITTLE CHRIS WAS.

6 Q. SO, YOU WERE TRYING TO FIND LITTLE CHRIS, YOU  
7 USED CHRISTOPHER EVANS BECAUSE HIS NAME'S  
8 CHRISTOPHER. AND SOMEBODY TOLD YOU THAT OMAR  
9 CAPERS MAYBE LITTLE CHRIS?

10 A. IF I REMEMBER CORRECTLY, I'LL HAVE TO LOOK BACK,  
11 I CAN'T REMEMBER.

12 Q. AS THE INVESTIGATION PROCEEDED, THOUGH, YOU  
13 DIDN'T DO ANYTHING MORE WITH THOSE?

14 A. WELL, WE FOUND OUT THAT, IDENTIFIED LITTLE CHRIS  
15 AS BEING CHRISTOPHER COLEMAN AFTER PATRICK PICKED  
16 HIM OUT OF THE LINEUP, SO WE DIDN'T GO NO FURTHER  
17 WITH MR. EVANS OR, I DON'T BELIEVE WE WENT ANY  
18 FURTHER WITH THE OTHER GUY.

19 Q. YOU NEVER SHOWED THOSE PHOTOS TO ANYBODY ELSE?

20 A. NO, I DIDN'T EVEN DO A LINEUP OF THEM BECAUSE I  
21 THINK WE HAD ALREADY IDENTIFIED LITTLE CHRIS AS  
22 BEING CHRISTOPHER COLEMAN.

23 THE COURT; OKAY. ALRIGHT, I'M SUSTAINING YOUR  
24 OBJECTION, WE'RE NOT GOING TO GO INTO THAT. I'LL NOTE  
25 YOUR OBJECTION TO MY RULING ON THE RECORD. OKAY?



1           THE COURT: HE'S ALREADY TESTIFIED HE BOUGHT THE  
2 GUN, BUT I'LL LET YOU ASK HIM IF THEY CONSIDERED HIM A  
3 SUSPECT. OKAY?

4           MR. WISE: OKAY. I APOLOGIZE.

5           THE COURT: THAT'S OKAY.

6           MR. WISE: AND MAYBE I WON'T.

7           THE COURT: ALRIGHT. BRING THE JURY BACK IN.

8 (Whereupon, the jury enters  
9 the courtroom and the following  
10 takes place in the presence  
11 of the jury.)

12           THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, YOU'LL FIND, I  
13 LIKE TO STAND UP AND WALK AROUND, THAT HELPS ME. AND  
14 SO, I KNOW Y'ALL PROBABLY GET TIRED OF SITTING, AND I  
15 DO GET TIRED OF SITTING, SO I HOPE Y'ALL APPRECIATED  
16 THE BREAK, GETTING UP, AND WE'RE GOING TO RESUME THE  
17 CROSS-EXAMINATION NOW.

18           MR. WISE.

19           MR. WISE: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

20 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
21 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
22 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
23 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
24 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

808

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES SHUMPERT

BY MR. WISE CONTINUES:

1  
2  
3 Q. LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT, YOU CONSIDERED CHRISTOPHER  
4 DWIGHT WHITE A SUSPECT, DIDN'T YOU?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. LIEUTENANT, YOU TESTIFIED THAT  
7 RALPH AND CHRISTIAN LIVED TOGETHER, BUT YOUR  
8 RECORDS REFLECTED THEY DON'T LIVE TOGETHER, DO  
9 THEY? AND I CAN SHOW YOU YOUR ARREST REPORT IF  
10 THAT WOULD HELP REFRESH YOUR RECOLLECTION?

11 A. NO, I CAN EXPLAIN THAT. NORMALLY WHEN WE GET THE  
12 NAMES OF INDIVIDUALS AND ARE ABLE TO GET PROBABLE  
13 CAUSE YOU GO BY THE ADDRESS THAT YOU HAVE. WE  
14 BELIEVED THE TWO LIVED THERE. AND I BELIEVE THAT  
15 THE WARRANTS MAY BE HAVING DIFFERENT ADDRESSES,  
16 BUT YOU KNOW, PEOPLE MOVE SO MUCH YOU CAN'T KEEP  
17 UP WITH THEM.

18 Q. BUT THE INFORMATION THAT YOU HAVE IS TWO  
19 DIFFERENT ADDRESSES?

20 A. LET ME SEE, LOOK IT UP. CORRECT.

21 Q. OKAY. THANK YOU, LIEUTENANT.

22 A. UH-HUH.

23 Q. LIEUTENANT, ON TWO THOUSAND -- YOUR  
24 RESPONSIBILITIES, YOU UNDERSTAND ABOUT THE CRIME  
25 RATE IN ORANGEBURG, OR YOU KNOW THE STATISTICS

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. WISE

809

1           HERE, DON'T YOU?

2           A.   NOT OFF HAND RIGHT NOW, BUT ...

3           Q.   APPROXIMATELY HOW MANY MURDERS OCCURRED IN  
4           ORANGEBURG THIS YEAR?

5           SOLICITOR SORENSON:  YOUR HONOR, OBJECTION.

6           MR. WISE:  YOUR HONOR, MAY WE APPROACH ABOUT  
7           THIS?  IT'S A LITTLE EXPLANATION.

8           THE COURT:  ALRIGHT, SIR.

9           (Whereupon, a bench conference  
10          is had out of the hearing of  
11          the jury and court reporter.)

12          THE COURT:  ALRIGHT, I WILL SUSTAIN YOUR  
13          OBJECTION, AND AFTERWARDS WE'LL GO BACK AND WE CAN  
14          TALK ABOUT IT ON THE RECORD LATER ON.  OKAY?

15          MR. WISE:  THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

16          THE COURT:  THANK YOU, SIR.

17          MR. WISE:  YOUR HONOR, THAT'S ALL THE QUESTIONS I  
18          HAVE.

19          THE COURT;  ALRIGHT, THANK YOU.

20          MR. WISE:  THANK YOU, LIEUTENANT.

21          THE COURT:  ALRIGHT, MR. PALMER.

22          MR. PALMER:  THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

23          (NOTE:  Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
24          part of record has been omitted.  See next ensuing  
25          page for sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. PALMER

810

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES SHUMPERT

BY MR. PALMER:

1 Q. LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT, GOOD TO SEE YOU AGAIN.

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. AS YOU KNOW, I REPRESENT MR. WALTER LEE HARRIS.

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. AND I'M JUST REMINDING YOU OF THAT, BUT YOU  
6 ALREADY KNOW, JUST FOR THE RECORD. NOW, AND MY  
7 QUESTIONS HOPEFULLY WILL BE UNDERSTOOD BY YOU TO  
8 RELATE TO MR. HARRIS. I JUST WANTED TO GET THAT  
9 OUT THERE AS WELL.

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. NOW, YOU WOULD AGREE WITH ME, SIR, THAT OF ALL  
12 THE EXHIBITS THAT ARE ON THE RECORD, SPECIFICALLY  
13 REFERRING TO THE PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUPS, THERE'S  
14 ONLY ONE THAT RELATES TO WALTER LEE HARRIS?

15 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND THAT'S THE ONE OF ASHLEY PARSLEY - - -

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. --- THAT WAS DONE SHORTLY AFTER THESE ALLEGED  
19 OCCURRENCES?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. AND YOU WOULD AGREE WITH ME THAT THIS CASE  
22 INVOLVES SOME ALLEGED FACTS THAT PUT WALTER LEE  
23 HARRIS AT THAT APARTMENT ON SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS  
24  
25

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. PALMER

811

1 ROAD ON TWO SEPARATE OCCASIONS?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. AND JUST FOR THE RECORD AND TO MAKE THIS  
4 EASIER FOR US TO GET THROUGH THE QUESTIONING, I'M  
5 GOING TO REFER TO THEM AS ALLEGED VISIT ONE AND  
6 ALLEGED VISIT TWO, DO YOU FOLLOW ME WHERE I'M  
7 GOING?

8 A. YES, SIR, YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AND SO, MS. PARSLEY'S PHOTO LINEUP, WOULD  
10 YOU AGREE, RELATES TO ALLEGED VISIT ONE?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND THAT'S THE, WHEN WALTER LEE HARRIS WAS  
13 ALLEGED TO HAVE VISITED THE APARTMENT BY HIMSELF?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. WENT IN, DEALT WITH MS. PARSLEY AND MR. OLD  
16 SCHOOL, SHOWED HIS ID APPARENTLY, DIDN'T HAVE THE  
17 WEED THAT HE WANTED, AND HE LEFT?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. IS THAT YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT HAPPENED, THE  
20 BASIC FACTS OF ALLEGED VISIT ONE?

21 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

22 Q. OKAY. AND YOU WOULD AGREE WITH ME THAT AS FAR AS  
23 THE RECORD GOES, AND YOU'VE HAD THE BENEFIT OF  
24 BEING, LISTENING TO THE TESTIMONY, ESPECIALLY OF  
25 PATRICK TYLER, YOU WOULD AGREE WITH ME THAT THE

1 ONLY EVIDENCE IN THE FILE, IN THE CASE RIGHT NOW  
2 THAT PUTS MR. WALTER LEE HARRIS AT THAT APARTMENT  
3 DURING ALLEGED VISIT TWO, AND WHAT I'M REFERRING  
4 TO SPECIFICALLY IS THE ALLEGATIONS OF THE ACTUAL  
5 ROBBERY AND HOMICIDE AND THE BURGLARY, WHICH ARE  
6 THE THREE CHARGES IN THE CASE, ARE THE STATEMENT  
7 AND THE TESTIMONY OF PATRICK TYLER?

8 A. ARE YOU ASKING ME DO I AGREE?

9 Q. WELL, DO YOU AGREE THAT THAT'S THE ONLY EVIDENCE IN  
10 THE CASE THAT PUTS -- IN THE CASE NO THE RECORD THAT  
11 PUTS MR. WALTER LEE HARRIS AT THAT ADDRESS THE SECOND  
12 TIME?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. YOU DON'T AGREE WITH THAT?

15 A. NO.

16 Q. OKAY. NOW, I WANT TO ASK YOU A LITTLE BIT -- I  
17 KNOW YOU'RE TIRED OF TALKING ABOUT PATRICK  
18 TYLER'S STATEMENT, - - -

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. --- BUT I HAVE TO ASK YOU A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS  
21 ABOUT IT, AND I'LL TRY TO GET THROUGH IT AS  
22 QUICKLY AS I CAN. YOU'VE ALREADY TALKED ABOUT  
23 HOW YOU INTERVIEWED MR. TYLER, AND I WANT TO ASK  
24 YOU A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS ABOUT WHEN HE CAME IN  
25 WITH HIS PARENTS - - -

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. PALMER

813

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. --- HE INITIALLY DENIED ANY KNOWLEDGE OR  
3 INVOLVEMENT IN THIS, IS THAT AN ACCURATE  
4 STATEMENT?

5 A. CORRECT, YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, AT SOME POINT HE BECAME  
7 EMOTIONAL AND THEN STARTED TO TELL YOU WHAT  
8 HAPPENED, AN ACCURATE STATEMENT?

9 A. YES, SIR, HE SAID HE WANTED TO TELL THE TRUTH.

10 Q. OKAY. HOW MUCH TIME PASSED BETWEEN THE POINT  
11 THAT HE DENIED ANY KNOWLEDGE AND INVOLVEMENT AND  
12 THEN WHEN HE STARTED TO TELL YOU THAT HE WAS  
13 INVOLVED?

14 A. A MATTER OF SECONDS.

15 Q. OKAY.

16 A. IT WAS LIKE HE JUST CAME IN, AND LIKE I SAID, HIS  
17 PARENTS WAS STANDING THERE, AND IT WAS JUST A  
18 MATTER, I MEAN, IT WAS LIKE LESS THAN A MINUTE.

19 Q. OKAY.

20 A. LIKE I SAID, HE DROPPED HIS HEAD AND START CRYING  
21 AND SAID, I WANT TO TELL YOU THE TRUTH, I WANT TO  
22 TELL YOU WHAT HAPPENED.

23 Q. OKAY. AND IN BETWEEN THE DENIAL AND THE  
24 ADMISSION, IF YOU WANT TO JUST SUMMARIZE WHAT  
25 HAPPENED, YOU DIDN'T HAVE ANY OTHER CONVERSATION

1 WITH HIM?

2 A. ARE YOU TALKING ABOUT AFTER HE SAID HE WANTED TO  
3 TELL THE TRUTH?

4 Q. WELL, NO, ACTUALLY BEFORE -- AFTER HE DENIED IT  
5 AND BEFORE HE SAID HE WANTED TO TELL THE TRUTH. I  
6 MEAN, YOU SAID IT WAS A SECOND, BUT YOU DIDN'T  
7 SAY ANYTHING TO HIM TO INDUCE HIM TO FESS UP, IF  
8 YOU WANT TO CALL IT THAT?

9 A. LIKE I SAID, AGAIN, HE CAME IN WITH HIS PARENTS  
10 AND INITIALLY HE STATED WHAT HE STATED, AND HE  
11 STARTED CRYING. AND AFTER THAT, I TOLD HIM TO  
12 TELL ME WHAT HAPPENED, AND THEN HE WENT IN --  
13 BEFORE HE DID THAT I MIRANDIZED HIM, GAVE HIM HIS  
14 RIGHTS, AND THEN WE WENT INTO THE STATEMENT.

15 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU KNOW, YOUR POSITION ON THE  
16 SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT, YOU'VE BEEN DOING THIS FOR  
17 QUITE A WHILE, YOU'RE OBVIOUSLY AN EXPERIENCED,  
18 SKILLED DETECTIVE, AND YOU HAVE IN THE PAST USED  
19 CERTAIN INTERROGATION TECHNIQUES, IS THAT A FAIR  
20 STATEMENT?

21 A. YES.

22 Q. AND DID YOU HAVE TO USE ANY OF THOSE SKILLS OR  
23 TECHNIQUES TO GET MR. TYLER TO TELL YOU ABOUT  
24 WHAT HAPPENED IN THIS PARTICULAR INCIDENT?

25 A. NO, AS A MATTER OF FACT, TO BE HONEST WITH YOU, I

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. PALMER

815

1           THOUGHT IT WAS QUITE STRANGE BECAUSE I NEVER  
2           REALLY HAD PEOPLE JUST THAT EASY TELL ME WHAT  
3           HAPPENED.

4           Q.    OKAY.  HOW LONG DID IT TAKE YOU TO -- EXCUSE ME,  
5           HOW LONG DID IT TAKE HIM TO TELL YOU WHAT  
6           HAPPENED?

7           A.    AFTER HE SAID HE WANTED TO TELL ME THE TRUTH?

8           Q.    RIGHT.

9           A.    HE WENT THROUGH WHAT HE SAID, I ASKED HIM WHAT  
10          HAPPENED, HE WENT THROUGH IT, AND WHEN HE  
11          FINISHED WE STARTED GOING INTO THE STATEMENT,  
12          AND THAT WAS AT FOUR:FIFTY-THREE.

13          Q.    OKAY.  SO, AT FOUR:FIFTY-THREE YOU ASKED HIM TO  
14          START WRITING, YOU GAVE HIM THIS FORM?

15          A.    AT FOUR:FIFTY-THREE, CORRECT, YES, SIR.

16          Q.    I DIDN'T MEAN TO TALK OVER YOU.  YOU GAVE HIM  
17          THIS FORM AND ASKED HIM TO FILL IT OUT?

18          A.    YES, SIR, I DID.

19          Q.    AND I BELIEVE YOU SAID THIS IS HIS HANDWRITING?

20          A.    YES, SIR, THAT'S HIS HANDWRITING.

21          Q.    OKAY.  I WANT TO ASK YOU A COUPLE SPECIFIC THINGS  
22          ABOUT IT.  THE FIRST QUESTION IS, AND IT'S RIGHT  
23          AT THE BEGINNING OF LINE TWO, HE REFERS TO  
24          SOMETHING CALLED A LICK, L-I-C-K.

25          A.    YES, SIR.

1 Q. NOW, IN YOUR EXPERIENCE AS A DETECTIVE, WHAT DOES  
2 A LICK MEAN, IS THAT SOME KIND OF STREET LINGO?

3 A. YEAH, FROM MY UNDERSTANDING IT'S SUPPOSED TO BE A  
4 ROBBERY.

5 Q. OKAY. THAT'S A ROBBERY.

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. HAVE YOU EVER HEARD OF ANYBODY REFER TO A  
8 HOMICIDE AS A LICK?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. SO, YOUR UNDERSTANDING, THAT SPECIFICALLY  
11 REFERS TO A ROBBERY?

12 A. CORRECT.

13 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU WOULD INTERPRET THAT PART OF THE  
14 STATEMENT TO SAY THAT THERE WAS SOME PLAN TO  
15 COMMIT A ROBBERY?

16 A. CORRECT.

17 Q. OKAY. AND IT GOES ON TO SAY THAT, LET'S SEE, AND  
18 HIS STATEMENT CONTAINS A LOT OF VERNACULAR THAT  
19 I'M NOT FAMILIAR WITH SO I'M TRYING TO GET  
20 THROUGH IT. IT SAYS, TO BUY, AND THEN IT SAYS,  
21 A. M. GREEN FROM DUDE. WHAT DO YOU INTERPRET  
22 THAT STATEMENT TO MEAN?

23 A. OKAY. ABOUT HOW FAR ARE YOU DOWN?

24 Q. OKAY. I'M SORRY, I'M ON THE THIRD LINE STARTING  
25 AT THE FAR LEFT. BUY, AND THEN IT LOOKS A.M. TO

1 ME.

2 A. SUM.

3 Q. OH, THAT'S SUM, S-U-M. OKAY, TO BUY SUM GREEN  
4 FROM DUDE. WHAT DOES THAT MEAN TO YOU?

5 A. TO PURCHASE MARIJUANA.

6 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND THEN FARTHER DOWN, SO IT'S  
7 LINE ONE, TWO, THREE, FOUR, FIVE -- WELL,  
8 ACTUALLY ABOUT IN THE MIDDLE OF LINE FOUR IT  
9 SAYS, "THEY WAS, LIKE, WE NEED ANOTHER STRAP."  
10 AND YOU'VE ALREADY TESTIFIED -- I'LL GIVE YOU  
11 TIME TO FIND THE PLACE.

12 A. YEAH, I SEE IT, I FOLLOW YOU.

13 Q. OKAY. YOU'VE ALREADY TESTIFIED THAT TO YOUR  
14 KNOWLEDGE AND YOUR EXPERIENCE STRAP MEANS A GUN?

15 A. CORRECT.

16 Q. OKAY.

17 A. OR OTHER WEAPON.

18 Q. AND THE STRAP MEANS THAT THEY NEED A PERSON WITH  
19 A WEAPON OR THE WEAPON ITSELF?

20 A. WHAT I'M FAMILIAR WITH, A WEAPON.

21 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. OKAY, AND MOVING ON, IT SAYS,  
22 "WE NEED ANOTHER STRAP." AND THEN IT GOES ON TO  
23 SAY, IT LOOKS LIKE, "LITTLE M CALLED PEAT," AND  
24 HE SPELLED IT P-E-A-T. "WE WENT AND GOT PEAT OFF  
25 JAMISON. PEAT HOP IN THE JEEP, WE MADE IT 4" THE

1 NUMERAL FOUR IT LOOKS LIKE, OR MAYBE IT ISN'T.

2 A. IT IS.

3 Q. OKAY. "WE MADE IF 4 A MINUTE, THAT'S WHEN WE  
4 WENT TO THE PERSON THAT WAS SELLING THE WEED AND  
5 PEAT WAS," AND THEN THERE'S A CORRECTION. DO YOU  
6 REMEMBER HIM MAKING THAT CORRECTION?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. AND WHAT DID HE CORRECT, DO YOU RECALL?

9 A. I CAN'T SEE WHAT HE SCRATCHED OUT, BUT WHEN THEY  
10 MAKE MISTAKES, WE GO BACK OVER THEIR STATEMENT  
11 WITH THE. IF THEY HAVE ANY MISTAKES IN IT WE  
12 JUST HAVE THEM SCRATCH IT OUT AND INITIAL IT.  
13 BUT I CAN'T MAKE OUT - - -

14 Q. OKAY. AND DID HE DO THAT IN THIS CASE?

15 A. YES.

16 Q. OKAY.

17 A. HE GOT P.T. OVER IT.

18 Q. I SEE THE INITIALS. OKAY. AND IT SAYS, "AND  
19 PEAT SAY, I'M BOUT TO GO BUY SOME WEED. HE COME  
20 BACK, LIKE, IT'S A DUDE IN THERE I NO" SPELLED N-  
21 O.

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND YOU INTERPRETED THAT TO MEAN WHAT?

24 A. THAT HE KNEW A PERSON THAT WAS IN THE APARTMENT.

25 Q. AND DO YOU -- IS IT YOUR UNDERSTANDING WE'RE

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. PALMER

819

1 STILL TALKING ABOUT ALLEGED VISIT NUMBER ONE?

2 A. CORRECT.

3 Q. WHEN MR. HARRIS ALLEGEDLY WENT IN AND PURCHASED,  
4 TRIED TO PURCHASE THE WEED?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. OKAY. AND THEN I'M READING ON, THERE'S NO  
7 PUNCTUATION, BUT IT LOOKS LIKE, "EVERYBODY WAS  
8 LIKE" AND THEN I CAN'T MAKE OUT THAT WORD. DO YOU  
9 SEE WHERE I'M TALKING ABOUT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. TO ME IT LOOKS LIKE C-I-T-E.

12 A. WELL, I GUESS THAT'S SHORT TERMINOLOGY FOR,  
13 YOU'RE TRYING TO SAY ALRIGHT, BECAUSE THE I --  
14 SO, I'M - - -

15 Q. OH, OKAY.

16 COURT REPORTER: SPELL WHAT YOU'RE SAYING?

17 A. WELL, IT'S SPELLED ON HERE, A-I-T-E, I BELIEVE  
18 THAT'S A-I-T.

19 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, OKAY, SO "HE COME BACK LIKE IT'S  
20 A DUDE IN THERE I NO. EVERYBODY WAS LIKE, AITE,"  
21 IF I SAID THAT CORRECTLY, "THEN THAT'S WHEN THEY  
22 CALLED POKE ON THE WAY. YOU AT POKE LIKE CORNER  
23 POCKET." NOW, WITH YOUR CONVERSATION WITH MR.  
24 TYLER, WHAT WAS THE, YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF WHY  
25 THEY CALLED THE DEFENDANT THEY'VE REFERRED TO AS

1 POKE?

2 A. I NEVER UNDERSTOOD THE REASON WHY THEY WENT IN  
3 AND GOT HIM, I HAVE NO EARTHLY IDEA.

4 Q. OKAY. AND THEN IT SAYS, DESCRIBES, THEY WENT ON  
5 TO GET POKE. NOW, YOUR UNDERSTANDING FROM THIS  
6 STATEMENT THAT THE FIRST EXTRA STRAP THEY NEEDED  
7 WAS MR. HARRIS?

8 A. A GUN, ANOTHER GUN.

9 Q. OKAY. AND AT SOME POINT THEY CALLED ANOTHER  
10 STRAP IN, IS THAT YOUR UNDERSTANDING?

11 A. NO.

12 Q. NO?

13 A. MY UNDERSTANDING WAS, THEY WENT AND PICKED UP  
14 ANOTHER INDIVIDUAL.

15 Q. OKAY. AND DID MR. - - -

16 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, TO THE EXTENT  
17 THAT THEY'RE DISCUSSING WHAT ALL THAT STUFF MEANS,  
18 THAT WOULD BE BASED ON HEARSAY. THE STATEMENT STANDS  
19 BY ITSELF. I MEAN, ANYTHING THAT THEY KNOW ABOUT WHAT  
20 IT MEANT, THAT WOULD BE CONVERSATION.

21 THE COURT: AND I WILL - - -

22 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IF YOU WANT TO TALK ABOUT,  
23 I'M FINE WITH THAT, BUT - - -

24 THE COURT: OKAY. AND I WILL SUSTAIN HIS  
25 OBJECTION TO THAT. YOU CAN ASK HIM ABOUT YOUR CLIENT,

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. PALMER

821

1 BUT, YOU KNOW, I'M SUSTAINING HIS OBJECTION AS TO  
2 REGARDING ANYBODY ELSE.

3 MR. PALMER: OKAY.

4 THE COURT: OKAY.

5 Q. NOW, IN YOUR INTERVIEW WITH MR. TYLER, - - -

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. --- HE, DID HE DESCRIBE MR. HARRIS'S INVOLVEMENT  
8 IN ALLEGED VISIT NUMBER TWO?

9 A. YES, HE DID.

10 Q. AND AS PART OF WHAT HE DESCRIBED TO YOU CONTAINED  
11 IN THAT STATEMENT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. NOW, HE DID REFER TO MR. HARRIS AS HAVING  
14 SOME DUCT TAPE, I THINK IT'S DOWN AT THE BOTTOM  
15 OF THE FIRST PAGE?

16 A. YES, HE -- YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND YOU ALSO WERE HERE WITH MR. TYLER  
18 TALKED ABOUT MR. HARRIS RELINQUISHING HIS STRAP  
19 OR HIS WEAPON - - -

20 A. CORRECT.

21 Q. --- TO ONE OF THE OTHER DEFENDANTS?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. THAT, DOES THAT APPEAR, DOES THAT INFORMATION  
24 APPEAR IN THIS STATEMENT?

25 A. NO, SIR.

1 Q. OKAY. WOULD YOU CONSIDER THAT TO BE AN  
2 INCONSISTENCY?

3 A. IT'S NOT IN HIS STATEMENT BUT I DON'T THINK IT'S  
4 INCONSISTENT FROM THE OTHER STATEMENTS THAT I HAD  
5 TAKEN.

6 Q. OKAY. NOW, I'M GOING TO ASK YOU TO TURN TO PAGE  
7 TWO WHERE IT SAYS AT THE TOP, PAGE TWO,  
8 DEFENDANT'S AFFIDAVIT?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. AND IS THAT THAT QUESTION AND ANSWER SESSION?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. AND I'M GOING DOWN TO THE THIRD QUESTION,  
13 THEY'RE NOT NUMBERED BUT IT'S THE THIRD ONE THAT  
14 APPEARS ABOUT SIX OR SEVEN LINES DOWN.

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND YOU HAD WRITTEN, "WHO ALL HAD GUNS?"

17 A. CORRECT.

18 Q. AND WHAT DID TYLER WRITE?

19 A. "PEAT, LITTLE M, POKE AND RALPH."

20 Q. OKAY. AND THERE'S NO MENTION ANYWHERE ON THAT  
21 PAGE ABOUT MR. HARRIS HAVING ANY DUCT TAPE AT  
22 THAT POINT?

23 A. NO.

24 Q. OKAY. AND I'M GOING DOWN ABOUT, LET'S SEE, FIVE  
25 MORE QUESTIONS, AND YOUR QUESTION THAT YOU WROTE

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. PALMER

823

1 WAS, "WHO ALL TOOK GUNS INTO THE APARTMENT?" AND  
2 WHAT WAS HIS RESPONSE?

3 A. "LITTLE M, POKE, PEAT AND RALPH."

4 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU FIND THAT CONSISTENT WITH THE  
5 INFORMATION ON PAGE ONE THAT TALKS ABOUT MR.  
6 HARRIS HAVING THE DUCT TAPE?

7 A. IF YOU'RE ASKING ME MY OPINION, YES, BECAUSE FROM  
8 WHAT I THINK MR. TYLER SAID WAS, THAT ONCE IN  
9 THAT HIS GUN WAS PASSED OFF, PETE PASSED HIS GUN  
10 OFF, AND I THINK HE SAID THAT SOMEBODY YELLED AT  
11 PETE AND TOLD HIM TO TAPE THE GUY UP. SO, YES.

12 Q. OKAY. AND SO YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF THE STATEMENT  
13 AND TYLER'S STATEMENT TO YOU WAS THAT PETE GOT  
14 RID OF HIS GUN TO SOMEONE ELSE AND THAT'S WHEN  
15 THE DUCT TAPE CAME INTO PLAY?

16 A. THAT'S MY UNDERSTANDING, YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND YOUR LAST QUESTION WAS, "DID  
18 THE VICTIM HAVE A GUN?" AND THE RESPONSE WAS?

19 A. "NO."

20 Q. NOW, YOUR INVESTIGATION REVEALED THAT THERE  
21 ACTUALLY WAS A GUN IN THAT APARTMENT AT ONE  
22 POINT?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. BELONGING TO MR. PRINGLE?

25 A. YES, SIR.

1 Q. AND DO YOU REMEMBER WHAT TYPE OF WEAPON THAT WAS?

2 A. I BELIEVE THEY SAID IT WAS A THREE FIFTY-SEVEN.

3 Q. OKAY.

4 A. BUT IT WAS NEVER RECOVERED.

5 Q. ALRIGHT.

6 MR. PALMER: GIVE ME JUST A MOMENT, PLEASE.

7 THE COURT: TAKE YOUR TIME.

8 Q. THE INFORMATION THAT TYLER GAVE YOU, IS IT YOUR  
9 TESTIMONY HERE THAT HE GAVE IT WITHOUT ANY KIND  
10 OF PROMPTING OR QUESTIONING FROM YOU, HE JUST  
11 SORT OF WENT INTO A NARRATIVE AND TOLD YOU  
12 EVERYTHING THAT HAPPENED?

13 A. YES, SIR, THE BEST I CAN RECOLLECT. LIKE I  
14 SAID, AND I KEEP SAYING OVER AND OVER, I WAS  
15 CALLED OVER TO THE OFFICE AND HE WAS IN THERE  
16 WITH HIS PARENTS - - -

17 Q. UH-HUH.

18 A. --- AND LIKE I SAY AGAIN, HE INITIALLY SAID HE  
19 AIN'T HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH IT, AND WENT INTO  
20 THIS CRYING MODE, AND STARTED ...

21 Q. AND DO YOU RECALL HOW LONG IT TOOK HIM TO  
22 COMPLETE THIS WRITTEN STATEMENT?

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. AND WAS THIS THE ORIGINAL STATEMENT OR WERE THERE  
25 ANY OTHER STATEMENTS THAT WERE DESTROYED OR

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. PALMER

825

1 REVISED THAT RESULTED IN THIS ONE?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. I'M JUST ASKING BECAUSE HE, HE GAVE YOU AN  
4 INITIAL STATEMENT THAT WAS QUITE DIFFERENT, THAT  
5 HE SAID HE DIDN'T KNOW ANYTHING ABOUT IT.

6 A. YEAH, THAT WAS VERBALLY.

7 Q. AND THAT WASN'T EVER REDUCED TO WRITING?

8 A. NO.

9 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND AT THE TIME THIS STATEMENT  
10 WAS RENDERED WOULD YOU AGREE THAT MR. HARRIS WAS  
11 ALREADY UNDER ARREST?

12 A. YES, HE WAS.

13 Q. OKAY. AND WAS THAT BASED ON THE PHOTO LINEUP OF  
14 ASHLEY PARSLEY?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. THE PHOTO LINEUP HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH IT?

17 A. IT HAD SOMETHING TO DO WITH THE CASE BUT THAT  
18 WASN'T WHAT HE WAS INITIALLY ARRESTED FOR.

19 Q. OKAY.

20 MR. PALMER: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
21 TESTIMONY.

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. MR. MELLARD.

24 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
25 part of record has been omitted.)

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. MELLARD

826

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES SHUMPERT

BY MR. MELLARD:

Q. I'VE JUST GOT A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS.

A. YES, SIR.

Q. ALRIGHT.

THE COURT: I'M COUNTING.

Q. ALRIGHT, I'D SAY LESS THAN TWENTY.

THE COURT: OKAY. WELL, NOW, YOU WENT FROM A  
COUPLE TO LESS THAN TWENTY, RIGHT? OKAY, THANKS.

Q. ALRIGHT. YOU INVESTIGATED THE CASE, WE'VE  
ESTABLISHED THAT.

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND YOU WENT TO ASHLEY PARSLEY, CORRECT?

A. YES.

Q. AND YOU SHOWED HER VARIOUS PHOTO LINEUPS?

A. WE CALLED HER IN.

Q. OKAY. YOU CALLED HER IN?

A. YES, SIR, YES, SIR.

Q. AND YOU SHOWED HER VARIOUS PHOTO LINEUPS?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND ONE OF THESE PHOTO LINEUPS CONTAINED A  
PICTURE OF DANNY RYANT?

A. CORRECT.

Q. AND SHE DID NOT PICK DANNY RYANT OUT OF THAT?

A. SHE DID NOT.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. MELLARD

827

1 Q. SHE DID NOT PICK DANNY RYANT AS A PERSON WHO HAD  
2 COME INTO THE HOUSE ON MARCH THE TWELFTH?

3 A. NO, SHE DIDN'T.

4 MR. MELLARD: THAT'S IT. LESS THAN TWENTY, YOUR  
5 HONOR.

6 THE COURT: YES, SIR, MUCH LESS THAN TWENTY.  
7 THANK YOU, SIR.

8 MR. MELLARD: FOR THE RECORD, IT WAS SIX.

9 THE COURT: IT WAS SIX? OKAY.

10 MR. KOGER.

11 MR. KOGER: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

12 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

13 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
14 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
15 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
16 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
17 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. KOGER

828

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JAMES SHUMPERT

BY MR. KOGER:

1 Q. INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT, HOW ARE YOU DOING?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. JUST FOR THE RECORD, I REPRESENT MARIO SHIVERS ON  
4 THE END.

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. YOU TESTIFIED, TOO, THAT YOU DIDN'T KNOW  
7 HOW LONG MR. TYLER AND HIS PARENTS WERE SITTING  
8 IN THE OFFICE WITH THE CHIEF, CORRECT?

9 A. CORRECT.

10 Q. BEFORE YOU CAME?

11 A. CORRECT. I WAS CALLED OVER.

12 Q. YOU WERE CALLED OVER.

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. THE CHIEF NEVER COMMUNICATED THAT TO YOU?

15 A. COMMUNICATED WHAT, NOW?

16 Q. COMMUNICATED HOW LONG THEY WAS IN THE OFFICE  
17 BEFORE YOU ARRIVED?

18 A. NO, HUH-UH.

19 Q. DID THE CHIEF COMMUNICATE TO YOU WHETHER SHE HAD  
20 A CONVERSATION WITH THE PARENTS AND MR. TYLER?

21 A. NO, SHE DIDN'T.

22 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU STATED THAT INITIALLY HE DENIED  
23 IT AND THEN AFTER A COUPLE OF MINUTES HE BROKE  
24  
25

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. KOGER

829

- 1 DOWN, CORRECT?
- 2 A. SECONDS, WITHIN SECONDS.
- 3 Q. WITHIN SECONDS. DID YOU TAKE HIM TO ANOTHER
- 4 ROOM?
- 5 A. NO, WE STAYED RIGHT THERE IN THE CHIEF'S OFFICE.
- 6 Q. AND WHEN YOU SAY, WE, DID THAT INCLUDE THE CHIEF?
- 7 A. NO, SERGEANT ETHERIDGE.
- 8 Q. OKAY. SERGEANT ETHERIDGE, AND HOW ABOUT THE
- 9 PARENTS?
- 10 A. THE PARENTS WAS THERE, YES, SIR.
- 11 Q. SO, SO MR. TYLER BROKE DOWN IN FRONT OF HIS
- 12 PARENTS AND MADE THE STATEMENT?
- 13 A. I BELIEVE HE DID. I BELIEVE AT ONE POINT, I'M NOT
- 14 SURE IF IT WAS THE MOM OR THE DAD THAT STEPPED
- 15 OUT, BUT THEY WAS THERE.
- 16 Q. OKAY.
- 17 A. BECAUSE WHEN I GOT THERE THEY WAS IN THE OFFICE.
- 18 Q. SO, AT LEAST ONE OF THE PARENTS WAS IN THE ROOM
- 19 THE WHOLE TIME THAT HE WAS MAKING THE STATEMENT?
- 20 A. I CAN'T REMEMBER IF THEY STAYED THE WHOLE TIME
- 21 BUT I'M ALMOST CERTAIN THEY WAS THERE.
- 22 Q. OKAY.
- 23 A. THEY WAS THERE WHEN I GOT THERE, LIKE I SAID.
- 24 Q. GOOD.
- 25 A. THEY NEVER LEFT.

1 Q. THEY WERE THERE WHEN YOU GOT THERE. SO, YOU SAY  
2 HE SIGNED THE WAIVER OF RIGHTS AT FOUR:FORTY-  
3 THREE, THE WAIVER OF RIGHTS, APPROXIMATELY?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. OKAY. AND HE ACTUALLY GAVE HIS STATEMENT AT  
6 FOUR:FIFTY-THREE?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND HOW LONG DID IT TAKE HIM TO WRITE THAT  
9 STATEMENT?

10 A. ONCE AGAIN, HE ASKED ME THAT BEFORE, AND I CAN'T  
11 TELL YOU.

12 Q. OKAY.

13 A. I DON'T KNOW HOW LONG IT TOOK HIM TO WRITE IT.

14 Q. AND ONCE HE FINISHED WRITING THE STATEMENT YOU  
15 TOOK THE STATEMENT FROM HIM?

16 A. I DID.

17 Q. ALRIGHT. AND YOU REVIEWED IT?

18 A. I DID.

19 Q. AND ONCE YOU REVIEWED THE STATEMENT, THEN YOU  
20 ASKED ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS?

21 A. I DID.

22 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU KNOW HOW LONG THAT PORTION  
23 TOOK?

24 A. HOW LONG I ASKED THE QUESTIONS OR HOW LONG DID I  
25 WRITE THE QUESTIONS OUT?

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. KOGER

831

1 Q. WELL, HOW LONG HIS RESPONSE TO YOUR QUESTIONS  
2 TOOK, BECAUSE HE WROTE THEM OUT, CORRECT?

3 A. I WILL WRITE, WE WILL GO STEP BY STEP. I ASK THE  
4 QUESTIONS, INSTEAD OF JUST WRITING A LIST OF  
5 QUESTIONS I ASK ONE QUESTION, HE WILL ANSWER.  
6 I'LL WRITE THE NEXT QUESTION, AND HE WILL ANSWER.  
7 SO, IT COULD HAVE TOOK A MATTER OF TEN, FIFTEEN  
8 MINUTES, APPROXIMATELY.

9 Q. OKAY. AND DURING THE TIME THAT YOU WERE  
10 INTERACTING WITH MR. TYLER DID THE PARENTS OR HIM  
11 OBJECT?

12 A. NO, I DON'T RECALL THEM OBJECTING AT ALL.

13 Q. DID, DID THE PARENTS - - -

14 A. I BELIEVE THE DAD SAID, IF -- I BELIEVE THE DAD  
15 SAID SOMETHING, BUT AS FAR AS, I CAN'T REMEMBER  
16 WHAT HE SAID.

17 Q. OKAY. WELL, DID HE SAY SOMETHING TO YOU OR SAID  
18 SOMETHING TO MR. TYLER?

19 A. I BELIEVE HE SAID SOMETHING TO HIS SON.

20 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND YOU DON'T RECALL THE  
21 COMMENT?

22 A. WELL, SOMETHING SMALL, NO, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. DO YOU RECALL THE MOTHER SAYING ANYTHING  
24 TO MR. TYLER?

25 A. I BELIEVE THEY SPOKE BUT I CAN'T REMEMBER WHAT

1 THE CONVERSATION WAS ABOUT.

2 Q. NOW, YOU SAY, YOU SAID THEY SPOKE. DID THEY  
3 SPEAK BEFORE THIS SESSION STARTED OR DURING THE  
4 SESSION?

5 A. WELL, THEY OBVIOUSLY SPOKE BEFORE BECAUSE, LIKE I  
6 SAY, THEY THE ONES BRUNG THEM INTO THE OFFICE.

7 Q. OKAY.

8 A. AND WHILE WE WAS IN THE OFFICE, I MEAN, LIKE I  
9 SAID, I BELIEVE THEY SAID SOMETHING TO HIM, BUT I  
10 JUST -- I KNOW IT WAS A LOT OF CRYING, A LOT OF  
11 HUGGING GOING ON AND, YOU KNOW, I BELIEVE THEY  
12 SAID SOMETHING TO THE EFFECT, WE'LL BE THERE FOR  
13 YOU, AND, YOU KNOW.

14 Q. AND THIS IS, THIS IS DURING, WHILE HE WAS  
15 ACTUALLY SPEAKING TO YOU OR WRITING THE STATEMENT  
16 OR - - -

17 A. IT WAS AFTER.

18 Q. IT WAS AFTER. WHAT INTERACTION DID THE PARENTS  
19 HAVE WITH MR. TYLER DURING THE TIME HE WAS  
20 WRITING THE STATEMENT AND ANSWERING YOUR  
21 QUESTIONS, WRITING RESPONSES TO YOUR QUESTIONS?

22 A. LIKE I SAID, AGAIN, I CAN'T REMEMBER IF THERE WAS  
23 ANY INTERACTION AT ALL. LIKE I SAID, ONCE HE  
24 TOLD ME WHAT HAPPENED, I ASKED HIM TO WRITE THE  
25 STATEMENT, HE STARTED WRITING THE STATEMENT, AND

1                    THAT'S BASICALLY WHAT I RECOLLECT.

2                    Q.    YOU WOULD AGREE THAT THERE WAS A TOTAL OF FOUR  
3                    PEOPLE IN THE ROOM?

4                    A.    NO, SIR.

5                    Q.    OKAY.    WHAT WAS THE TOTAL NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN THE  
6                    ROOM?

7                    A.    IT WAS MYSELF, INVESTIGATOR ETHERIDGE, PATRICK,  
8                    HIS PARENTS.    THE CHIEF LEFT OUT.

9                    Q.    OKAY.    SO, THE PARENTS, WAS IT ONE PARENT OR TWO  
10                    PARENTS?

11                    A.    LIKE I SAID, AGAIN, I CAN'T RECALL IF THEY CAME  
12                    IN AND OUT, BUT LIKE I SAID, THEY WAS THERE.  
13                    THAT'S ALL I CAN TELL YOU. I CAN'T TELL YOU, YOU  
14                    KNOW, HOW LONG THEY STAYED IN, HOW LONG THEY WENT  
15                    OUT, I MEAN, IT'S THE SAME ANSWER OVER AND OVER.

16                    Q.    BUT YOU CAN SAY THAT HE WAS THE ONLY MINOR IN  
17                    THAT ROOM UNDER EIGHTEEN?

18                    A.    CORRECT.

19                    Q.    OKAY.    NOW, - - -

20                    A.    WE MAKE IT CUSTOMARY TO TALK TO THE PARENTS, WHEN  
21                    WE DEAL WITH MINORS WE ALWAYS MAKE IT CUSTOMARY  
22                    TO TALK TO THE PARENTS FIRST.

23                    Q.    NOW, INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT, YOU STATED, I THINK  
24                    ON CROSS WITH ONE OF THE ATTORNEYS, THAT YOU DO  
25                    ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE HAVE BEEN SOME

1 INCONSISTENCIES BETWEEN THE TESTIMONY OF MR.  
2 TYLER AND WHAT HE WROTE ON MARCH EIGHTEENTH,  
3 CORRECT?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. OKAY. AND WOULDN'T YOU AGREE, TO USE THE  
6 TERMINOLOGY OF ATTORNEY PALMER, THAT THERE IS AN  
7 INCONSISTENCY BETWEEN THE STATEMENT OF ASHLEY  
8 PARSLEY AND ALLEGED VISIT TWO IN RELATION TO  
9 PATRICK TYLER'S STATEMENT?

10 A. I'M NOT SURE IF I FOLLOW YOU. ARE YOU ASKING ME

11 - - -

12 Q. WELL, CAN YOU REVIEW THE STATEMENT YOU TOOK FROM  
13 ASHLEY PARSLEY AND REVIEW THE STATEMENT THAT YOU  
14 TOOK FROM - - -

15 A. IT'S DOWN THERE SOMEWHERE.

16 Q. OKAY. FROM MR. TYLER.

17 A. I'VE GOT TYLER'S HERE.

18 Q. YOU'VE GOT TYLER'S?

19 MR. KOGER: MAY I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE,  
20 YOUR HONOR?

21 THE COURT: TAKE YOUR TIME.

22 A. NOW WHAT WAS THE QUESTION NOW?

23 Q. WOULDN'T YOU AGREE THAT THERE IS AN INCONSISTENCY  
24 WITH MS. PARSLEY SAYING THE SECOND TIME SOMEONE  
25 CAME IN, SOMEONE CAME IN WITH A GUN?

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. KOGER

835

1 A. IN HER STATEMENT SHE STATES THAT THERE WAS A  
2 KNOCK AT THE DOOR AND SHE HAD A PISTOL IN HER  
3 HAND.

4 Q. OKAY.

5 A. AND THE GUY WANTED TO BUY SOME MARIJUANA, AND  
6 WHEN SHE REACHED DOWN TO GET IT THAT'S WHEN SHE  
7 LOOKED UP AND THEY HAD A GUN.

8 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU WOULD SAY THAT'S AN INCONSISTENCY  
9 WITH MR. TYLER SAYING THAT HE WENT IN TO ATTEMPT  
10 TO PURCHASE SOME MARIJUANA?

11 A. WELL, I BELIEVE IT'S THE SAME, BECAUSE MR. TYLER  
12 STATES THAT HE AND RALPH -- I'M GOING TO READ  
13 BACK AT THE STATEMENT, BUT HE SAID THEY WENT IN  
14 FOR THE PURPOSE OF ACTING LIKE THEY WERE GOING TO  
15 BUY SOME MARIJUANA, AND I THINK THAT'S THE SAME.

16 Q. SO, YOU DON'T AGREE WITH THIS INCONSISTENCY, BUT  
17 YOU HAVE TESTIFIED THAT THEY ARE SOME  
18 INCONSISTENCIES BETWEEN WHAT MR. TYLER TESTIFIED  
19 ON THE STAND AND WHAT HE WROTE BEFORE YOU ON  
20 MARCH EIGHTEENTH?

21 A. YES, I DO.

22 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. NOW, YOU WERE THE LEAD  
23 INVESTIGATOR IN THIS CASE?

24 A. YES, I WAS.

25 Q. OKAY. AND AS PART OF BEING A LEAD INVESTIGATOR

- 1           YOU WOULD PARTICIPATE OR HAVE SOME INPUT IN  
2           WHETHER A SEARCH WARRANT IS EXECUTED OR NOT,  
3           CORRECT?
- 4           A.    CORRECT.
- 5           Q.    ALRIGHT.  OF COURSE, THE MAGISTRATE - - -
- 6           A.    RIGHT, YES.
- 7           Q.    --- SIGNS OFF ON IT, BUT YOU PROVIDE THE INPUT TO  
8           THE MAGISTRATE?
- 9           A.    YES, SIR.
- 10          Q.    OKAY.  NOW, I THINK YOU TESTIFIED TOO THAT YOU  
11          RECEIVED SOME INFORMATION SOON AFTER THE INCIDENT  
12          FROM LIEUTENANT CARTER?
- 13          A.    ABOUT THE TYPES OF WEAPONS WE'RE LOOKING FOR?
- 14          Q.    RIGHT.
- 15          A.    YES, SIR.
- 16          Q.    AND WHAT WERE THOSE TYPES OF WEAPONS AGAIN?
- 17          A.    A NINE MILLIMETER, A FORTY CALIBER AND ANY TYPE  
18          OF WEAPON THAT WOULD SHOOT A SIX, I MEAN, A SEVEN  
19          POINT SIX TWO.
- 20          Q.    OKAY.  AND YOU ARRESTED MR. SHIVERS WITH A  
21          WARRANT THAT WAS OBTAINED ON MARCH EIGHTEENTH,  
22          CORRECT?
- 23          A.    YEAH - LET ME LOOK BACK FOR SURE.
- 24          Q.    YOU CAN REFRESH YOUR MEMORY.
- 25          A.    CORRECT,  YES, SIR.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. KOGER

837

1 Q. OKAY. AND ACCORDING TO THE WARRANT WHAT IS THE  
2 DATE OF HIS ARREST?

3 A. THE TWENTY-FIRST.

4 Q. AND BY VIRTUE OF THAT, THE ADDRESSES, OR ADDRESS  
5 ON THE WARRANT YOU HAD CREDIBLE INFORMATION WHERE  
6 HE WAS STAYING AT THAT PARTICULAR TIME, CORRECT?

7 A. I BELIEVE, YES, SIR, I THINK, AND CORRECT ME IF  
8 I'M WRONG, BUT I BELIEVE THE ADDRESS THAT WE GOT  
9 WAS OFF OF HIS DMV PHOTO.

10 Q. OKAY. DOES ONE FIFTY-TWO LEQUINTA DRIVE HERE IN  
11 ORANGEBURG JOG YOUR MEMORY?

12 A. HOLD ON ONE SECOND.

13 Q. YOU CAN REVIEW THE WARRANT. I HAVE A COPY OF THE  
14 WARRANT OR ONE OF THE WARRANTS IF YOU WANT TO  
15 VIEW IT.

16 A. OKAY. I'LL LOOK AT YOURS. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND IT'S ALSO ANOTHER ADDRESS ON THERE?

18 A. SOMEBODY HAND WRITTEN IN THERE, NINE FIFTY-FIVE  
19 RODNEY STREET.

20 Q. AND FROM YOUR KNOWLEDGE, IS RODNEY STREET IN  
21 ORANGEBURG COUNTY?

22 A. I BELIEVE SO. I'M NOT SURE WHERE IT IS, BUT I  
23 BELIEVE SO.

24 Q. OKAY. IS IT IN THE CITY OF ORANGEBURG?

25 A. IT COULD BE, I DON'T KNOW.

1 Q. OKAY. SO, AROUND MARCH, A COUPLE OF DAYS AFTER,  
2 LIEUTENANT CARTER COMMUNICATED TO YOU THE TYPE OF  
3 WEAPONS THAT YOU WERE LOOKING FOR?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. OKAY. AND THEN YOU TOOK THE STATEMENT FROM MR.  
6 TYLER ON MARCH EIGHTEENTH?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND MR. SHIVERS WAS IMPLICATED IN THAT  
9 PARTICULAR STATEMENT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WAS THE BASIS FOR HIS ARREST?

12 A. NO, THAT WASN'T THE ONLY BASIS FOR HIS ARREST.

13 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT.

14 A. MS. PARSLEY HAS ALSO PICKED HIM OUT.

15 Q. OKAY. DID YOU EVER EXECUTE A SEARCH WARRANT OF  
16 ONE FIFTY-TWO LEQUINTA DRIVE?

17 A. NO, I DID NOT.

18 Q. DID YOU EVER EXECUTE A SEARCH WARRANT FOR NINE  
19 FIFTY-FIVE RODNEY STREET?

20 A. NO, SIR, I DID NOT.

21 Q. DID YOU EVER EXECUTE A SEARCH WARRANT FOR THE  
22 WOODBINE LOCATION WITH CHRISTOPHER AND RALPH  
23 COLEMAN?

24 A. NO, SIR.

25 Q. OKAY. DID YOU EVER EXECUTE A SEARCH WARRANT FOR

1 THE RESIDENCE, OR ADDRESS OF DANNY RYANT?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. DID YOU EVER EXECUTE A SEARCH WARRANT FOR  
4 PATRICK TYLER'S RESIDENCE?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. WHAT EFFORTS DID ORANGEBURG COUNTY  
7 SHERIFF'S OFFICE PLACE FOR IN TRYING TO LOCATE  
8 THESE MURDER WEAPONS?

9 A. WELL, THIS IS, IN MY EXPERIENCE, SIR, NORMALLY  
10 WHEN YOU HAVE INDIVIDUALS THAT COMMIT CRIMES AND  
11 THEY TURN THEMSELVES IN THEY'RE NOT GOING TO  
12 LEAVE THE EVIDENCE AT THEIR HOUSE ONCE THEY TURN  
13 THEMSELVES IN. SO, I MEAN, I JUST DIDN'T SEE NO  
14 POINT IN GOING AND TEARING UP OTHER PEOPLE'S  
15 HOUSES ONCE THESE GUYS TURNED THEMSELVES IN. I  
16 MOST CERTAIN THEY'RE NOT GOING TO LEAVE A MURDER  
17 WEAPON AT THEIR HOME, SO THAT'S WHY THE WARRANTS  
18 WASN'T EXECUTED.

19 Q. DID YOU LOCATE AROUND, ANY TYPE OF SURROUNDING  
20 AREAS, WOODED AREAS AROUND WHERE THESE DEFENDANTS  
21 WAS LOCATED?

22 A. THEY TURNED THEMSELVES IN.

23 Q. BUT DID YOU -- SO, YOUR TESTIMONY IS THAT WE'VE  
24 STILL GOT MURDER WEAPONS OUT HERE?

25 A. YES.

1 Q. AND THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE DIDN'T  
2 PUT FORTH ANY EFFORT TO FIND THESE MURDER  
3 WEAPONS?

4 A. NO, THAT IS NOT WHAT I'M SAYING. AND IT'S A SCARY  
5 THOUGHT ONE OF THE WEAPONS IS STILL OUT THERE,  
6 BUT WHAT I'M SAYING IS, EVEN ON THE WARRANT THAT  
7 ADDRESS WITH A SIMILAR WARRANT IS TOTALLY  
8 DIFFERENT FROM THE ADDRESS WHERE HE RESIDES. WE  
9 ONLY COULD GET THE ADDRESSES THAT'S OFF THE DMV  
10 PHOTOS BECAUSE YOU CANNOT OBTAIN A WARRANT  
11 WITHOUT AN ADDRESS. SO, WE GO BY THE LAST KNOWN  
12 ADDRESS. SO, IF YOU'RE ASKING ME DID WE PUT FORTH  
13 AN EFFORT, WE PUT FORTH THE BEST EFFORT THAT WE  
14 CAN TO FIND WEAPONS. AND I THINK WE DID A GOOD  
15 JOB BECAUSE WE GOT ONE OF THEM BACK.

16 Q. DURING THIS INVESTIGATION THOUGH, IN RELATION TO  
17 MARIO SHIVERS, Y'ALL WAS ABLE TO ASCERTAIN HIS  
18 CORRECT RESIDENCE, CORRECT?

19 A. NO.

20 Q. AFTER HE WAS LOCKED UP Y'ALL WERE ABLE - - -

21 A. AFTER HE WAS LOCKED UP.

22 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT.

23 A. AFTER HE TURNED HIMSELF IN.

24 Q. SO, YOU HAD THE INFORMATION?

25 A. AFTER HE TURNED HIMSELF IN.

CROSS - JAMES SHUMPERT BY MR. KOGER

841

1 Q. AFTER HE TURNED HIMSELF IN?

2 A. RIGHT.

3 Q. DID Y'ALL MAKE ANY EFFORT WITH THAT INFORMATION  
4 TO LOOK FOR ANY MURDER WEAPONS?

5 A. ONCE AGAIN, I STATE, ONCE A PERSON TURNS  
6 THEMSELVES IN, I MEAN, THEY'RE NOT GOING TO LEAVE  
7 EVIDENCE OF A CRIME THEY COMMITTED AT THEIR  
8 NORMAL ADDRESS. IT JUST DON'T MAKE SENSE. SO,  
9 NO, THERE WAS NO WARRANT TO SEARCH FOR ONE  
10 ISSUED.

11 Q. ISN'T IT TRUE, INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT, THAT THERE,  
12 THAT THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE HAS  
13 NOT LOCATED ANY TYPE OF GUN, ANY TYPE OF RIFLE  
14 THAT CONNECTS MARIO SHIVERS TO THESE CRIMES?

15 A. NO.

16 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU, NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

17 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR.

18 ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, SIR.

20 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU, LIEUTENANT  
21 SHUMPERT, I APPRECIATE IT.

22 LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT: THANK YOU, SIR.

23 THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I'M GOING TO  
24 ASK Y'ALL TO GO BACK -- YOU CAN STEP DOWN, I'M SORRY.  
25 I'M TALKING TO THE JURY RIGHT NOW. OKAY?

1 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I'M GOING TO ASK Y'ALL TO  
2 GO BACK INTO THE JURY ROOM. I'M NOT EXCUSING YOU FOR  
3 LUNCH RIGHT NOW, IT'S NOT BECAUSE I'M GOING TO CALL  
4 YOU BACK IMMEDIATELY, IT'S BECAUSE I WANT TO TALK WITH  
5 THE ATTORNEYS FOR A MINUTE AND DECIDE HOW LONG I'M  
6 GOING TO GIVE Y'ALL FOR LUNCH. OKAY? SO, Y'ALL GO  
7 BACK IN THE JURY ROOM. AGAIN, YOU HAVE NOT HEARD ALL  
8 THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE, YOU CANNOT BEGIN TALKING  
9 AMONG YOURSELVES ABOUT THIS CASE. OKAY? THANK Y'ALL.

10 (Whereupon, the jury retires  
11 to the jury room and the following  
12 takes place out of the presence  
13 of the jury.)

14 THE COURT: OKAY. NOW, I'M NOT ASKING YOU TO REST  
15 ON THE RECORD, BUT IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT'S  
16 Y'ALL'S LAST WITNESS?

17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

18 THE COURT: OKAY. AND SO, THEN, I KNOW I'VE GOT  
19 MOTIONS TO HEAR FROM Y'ALL. OKAY?

20 SOLICITOR PASCOE: OKAY. AND WE'RE GOING TO  
21 CHECK AND MAKE SURE EVERYTHING IS IN IF THAT'S OKAY.

22 THE COURT: YEAH.

23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: BUT THE STATE RESTS.

24 THE COURT: RIGHT, RIGHT. NOW, WHEN DO Y'ALL  
25 WANT ME TO QUESTION THE WITNESSES, I MEAN, YOUR

1 CLIENTS ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT THEY'RE GOING TO TESTIFY  
2 OR NOT?

3 MS. ULLMAN: I WOULD PREFER AFTER THE STATE  
4 RESTED AND AFTER WE HAD A MOMENT, AFTER I HAVE A  
5 MOMENT TO SPEAK WITH MR. COLEMAN TO SEE WHAT HIS  
6 INTENTIONS ARE.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. WELL, THAT'S WHAT I WAS  
8 ASKING, DO Y'ALL WANT TO -- BECAUSE I'M TRYING TO FIND  
9 OUT WHEN I WANT THE JURY TO COME BACK, BECAUSE IT'S  
10 GOING TO TAKE ME SOME TIME, I KNOW, TO LISTEN TO THE  
11 MOTIONS, IT'S GOING TO TAKE ME SOME TIME TO GO OVER  
12 THE QUESTIONING WITH ALL FIVE OF THEM. SO, AND THEN  
13 GO ON AND EAT LUNCH IN BETWEEN?

14 MR. PALMER: I WOULD JOIN IN WHAT JILL SAID, BUT  
15 I THINK I'LL NEED MORE THAN A MOMENT. I CAN DO IT OVER  
16 THE LUNCH BREAK BUT - - -

17 THE COURT: OKAY. IS THAT WHAT Y'ALL WANT TO DO?  
18 AND THEN I'LL QUESTION THEM WHEN WE COME BACK FROM  
19 LUNCH. OKAY. WHAT I'M THINKING ABOUT DOING IS  
20 LETTING THE JURY -- TELL THE JURY TO COME BACK AT,  
21 SAY, TWO. THAT WILL GIVE US TIME TO DO THE MOTIONS  
22 AND GO OVER THE QUESTIONS. Y'ALL HAVE A BREAK FOR  
23 LUNCH, TALK WITH YOUR CLIENTS. OKAY?

24 ALRIGHT, WOULD YOU TELL THE JURY THEY ARE EXCUSED  
25 AND ASK THEM TO BE BACK IN THE JURY ROOM AT TWO?

1 OKAY. THANK YOU.

2 ALRIGHT. ANYTHING FROM THE STATE BEFORE WE  
3 BREAK?

4 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, YOUR HONOR, THANK YOU.

5 THE COURT: ANYTHING FROM THE DEFENDANTS BEFORE  
6 WE BREAK?

7 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

8 THE COURT: Y'ALL WANT TO DO, ARE YOU GOING TO DO  
9 YOUR MOTIONS NOW OR DO YOU WANT TO DO THEM WHEN WE  
10 COME BACK?

11 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, I DON'T THINK THEY'VE  
12 OFFICIALLY RESTED.

13 SOLICITOR SORENSON: WELL, WE CAN STILL DO THEM  
14 IF YOU WANT TO, WE'RE GOING TO REST AS LONG AS  
15 EVERYTHING IS IN.

16 THE COURT: I MEAN, THEY'RE GOING TO REST WHEN  
17 THE JURY COMES -- IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THEY'RE GOING  
18 TO REST WHEN THE JURY COMES BACK.

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

20 THE COURT; AND SO, I WAS JUST TRYING - - -

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON; WE COULD JUST ASK MS. WALKER  
22 IF THERE'S ANYTHING THAT'S NOT IN EVIDENCE RIGHT NOW,  
23 I MEAN, THAT WILL ANSWER THEIR QUESTION, I MEAN, - - -

24 THE COURT: OKAY. LOOK AND SEE IF THERE'S  
25 SOMETHING THAT'S NOT IN EVIDENCE, MS. WALKER.

1           COURT REPORTER:   JUST A MINUTE.

2           THE COURT:   UNFORTUNATELY, SHE'S GOT TO DO TWO  
3           JOBS, SO -- OH, YEAH, YOU WANT TO GET YOUR NOTES.  
4           THANK YOU FOR REMINDING ME.

5           COURT REPORTER:   SOLICITOR, - - -

6           SOLICITOR SORENSON:   UH-HUH.

7           COURT REPORTER:   ON SEVENTY-SIX, CRIMINAL  
8           INVESTIGATIVE SOMETHING, ID PHOTO LINEUP AND AFFIDAVIT  
9           -- OH, THAT'S CHECKED OFF.

10          SOLICITOR SORENSON:   YES.

11          COURT REPORTER:   I SEE IT.    OKAY, HOLD ON.  
12          SOLICITOR, COME BACK.   STATEMENT OF BUSBY, ID?

13          SOLICITOR SORENSON:   YES, THAT'S ID, THAT IS NOT  
14          IN.

15          COURT REPORTER:   OKAY, JUST ONE MORE.   HOLD ON.

16          SOLICITOR SORENSON:   THAT SHOULD BE THE ONLY  
17          THING.

18          COURT REPORTER:   I'VE GOT ONE MORE SHEET.   THAT'S  
19          IT, THEY ARE ALL IN.

20          THE COURT:    OKAY, ONLY ONE PERTAINING TO - - -

21          COURT REPORTER:   WITH THE EXCEPTION OF THE  
22          STATEMENT OF, NUMBER EIGHTY, THE STATEMENT OF BUSBY IS  
23          ONLY ID, IT HAS NOT BEEN PUT IN.

24          THE COURT:    ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, MA'AM.

25          AND MR. WISE, YOU WANTED TO CLEAR UP, YOU HAD,

1 WANTED TO ASK QUESTIONS ABOUT STATISTICAL MURDERS AND  
2 ROBBERIES OR WHATEVER IN ORANGEBURG, OF LIEUTENANT  
3 SHUMPERT, IS THAT CORRECT?

4 MR. WISE: YES, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

5 THE COURT: AND I SUSTAINED THE STATE'S  
6 OBJECTION, BUT YOU WANTED TO PUT THE REASONS FOR YOUR  
7 REQUEST ON THE RECORD?

8 MR. WISE: I DO, YOUR HONOR, AND THE REASON I  
9 WANTED TO DO THAT IS, THERE'S GOING TO COME A POINT  
10 WHERE REVIEWING THE CHARGES IN THIS CASE, AND ONE OF  
11 THE CHARGES I'M GOING TO ASK THE COURT TO CONSIDER IS  
12 THE CHARGE THAT'S BASED ON THE CASE, AND I'M SURE THE  
13 COURT'S AWARE OF IT, THAT SAYS, WHEN PEOPLE BAND  
14 TOGETHER TO COMMIT AN ILLEGAL ACT LIKE A ROBBERY, AND  
15 A MURDER OCCURS, THAT YOU CAN'T CONVICT SOMEBODY WHO  
16 IS A PARTICIPANT IF THE MURDER WASN'T A NATURAL AND  
17 PROBABLE CONSEQUENCE OF WHAT THEY WERE BANDING  
18 TOGETHER TO DO. SO, THE PURPOSE OF ASKING LIEUTENANT  
19 SHUMPERT ABOUT THE CRIMES IN ORANGEBURG COUNTY WAS SO  
20 THAT THERE WOULD BE A FOUNDATION FOR THE COURT TO BE  
21 ABLE TO CONSIDER WHETHER OR NOT IT WAS AN APPROPRIATE  
22 CHARGE.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR.

24 MR. WISE: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

25 THE COURT: I APPRECIATE IT. WE HAVE NOW MADE

1 THAT A PART OF THE RECORD, AND THE OBJECTION.

2 ALRIGHT, NOW, DO Y'ALL WANT -- YOU KNOW, IT'S MY  
3 UNDERSTANDING THE STATE'S NOT GOING TO PUT UP ANYMORE  
4 EVIDENCE, THEY'RE GOING TO REST ON THE RECORD IN FRONT  
5 OF THE JURY, YOU KNOW, WHEN WE COME BACK, AND I WAS  
6 GOING TO GO AHEAD AND HEAR OUR MOTIONS NOW, BUT IF  
7 Y'ALL WANT TO WAIT -- BECAUSE OTHERWISE WE COME BACK,  
8 WE REST ON THE RECORD, THEN I LET THEM GO BACK OUT AND  
9 THEN YOU MAKE YOUR MOTIONS FOR A DIRECTED VERDICT OR  
10 WHATEVER YOU WANT TO MAKE. IS THAT, THAT'S WHAT Y'ALL  
11 WERE PLANNING ON DOING, RIGHT?

12 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. ANY PROBLEM WITH THEM PUTTING  
14 ON THE RECORD THAT THEY ARE RESTING AND THEN WE'LL  
15 JUST VERIFY IT WITH THE JURY WHEN THEY COME OUT, AND  
16 THEN Y'ALL MAKE YOUR MOTIONS NOW? DOES ANYBODY HAVE  
17 ANY PROBLEMS WITH THAT?

18 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, I THINK IT WOULD BE, IF  
19 WE COULD, WE'VE HEARD THIS TESTIMONY TODAY, TO GIVE  
20 THE ATTORNEYS HERE A LITTLE TIME TO TALK ABOUT THOSE  
21 MOTIONS, SO I DON'T KNOW WHETHER IT WOULD MORE - - -

22 THE COURT: OKAY. THAT WILL BE FINE, WE'LL DO  
23 THAT.

24 MR. LACKEY: - EXPEDIENT TO JUST DO IT WHEN WE  
25 COME BACK FROM LUNCH.



1           THE COURT:   OKAY.   MS. ULLMAN.

2           MS. ULLMAN:   THANK YOU.   I BELIEVE THE STATE HAS  
3           RESTED, AND I WOULD MAKE A MOTION FOR A DIRECTED  
4           VERDICT ON BEHALF OF MR. COLEMAN.   MR. COLEMAN IS HERE  
5           TODAY CHARGED WITH THREE CHARGES.   I'LL START WITH THE  
6           ARMED ROBBERY.

7           THE COURT:   YOU MEAN RALPH COLEMAN?

8           MS. ULLMAN:   I'M SORRY, YES, SIR, MR. RALPH  
9           COLEMAN.   ARMED ROBBERY, THE ELEMENTS ARE TAKING  
10          PERSONAL PROPERTY FROM ANOTHER WITHOUT THEIR CONSENT,  
11          AGAINST THEIR WILL, WITH THE INTENT TO STEAL IT, DOING  
12          IT IN THAT PERSON'S PRESENCE, AND DOING SO BY VIOLENCE  
13          OR THREAT OF VIOLENCE OR INTIMIDATION.   IN THIS  
14          SITUATION, YOUR HONOR, WE'VE CERTAINLY HAD EVIDENCE --  
15          LET ME REPHRASE THAT, I APOLOGIZE.   I DON'T BELIEVE  
16          THERE'S BEEN ANY EVIDENCE THAT ANYTHING'S BEEN  
17          ACTUALLY TAKEN AWAY FROM ANOTHER.   THE INDICTMENT  
18          AGAINST RALPH COLEMAN IS AN INDICTMENT THAT STATES  
19          THAT ON MARCH TWELFTH, ON OR ABOUT MARCH TWELFTH MR.  
20          COLEMAN DID TAKE AND CARRY AWAY THE PERSONAL PROPERTY  
21          OF CHARLES PRINGLE.   I DON'T THINK THAT THERE'S BEEN  
22          ANY EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AS TO WHAT IT IS THAT WAS  
23          ALLEGEDLY TAKEN.   REALISTICALLY, THE ONLY WITNESSES  
24          THAT WERE PRESENTED THAT COULD POSSIBLY SAY THAT  
25          SOMETHING WAS MISSING FROM THAT HOUSE WOULD BE ASHLEY

1 PARSLEY OR SHANNON MITCHELL. CERTAINLY, NOBODY ELSE  
2 THAT TESTIFIED HAS PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE AS TO WHAT WAS  
3 IN THE HOUSE AND WAS NOT IN THE HOUSE AFTERWARDS.  
4 CERTAINLY, SHANNON MITCHELL HAS NO KNOWLEDGE AS TO  
5 WHAT WAS NOT IN THE HOUSE AFTERWARDS BECAUSE HE WAS  
6 NOT ALLOWED BACK ON THE SCENE AND CERTAINLY NEVER WENT  
7 BACK INTO THE HOUSE. ASHLEY PARSLEY DID NOT STATE  
8 THAT ANYTHING WAS TAKEN FROM THAT RESIDENCE. THERE'S  
9 NO EVIDENCE THAT ANYTHING WAS FOUND ON MR. COLEMAN. I  
10 UNDERSTAND THAT HE DID TURN HIMSELF IN BUT THERE'S  
11 CERTAINLY NO REASON THEY COULDN'T HAVE TRIED TO SEARCH  
12 HIS HOUSE, THEY COULD HAVE GOTTEN A WARRANT.  
13 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT ACTUALLY STATED THAT HE TURNED  
14 HIMSELF IN I THINK ON THE TWENTY-SECOND OR TWENTY-  
15 THIRD. HIS WARRANT HAD BEEN ISSUED ON THE NINETEENTH.  
16 OBVIOUSLY, THEY HAD PROBABLY CAUSE AGAINST HIM ON THE  
17 NINETEENTH, THEY CERTAINLY COULD HAVE GOTTEN A SEARCH  
18 WARRANT AND LOOKED FOR ANYTHING TO SEE IF THERE WAS  
19 SOMETHING TAKEN. THE ALLEGATION THAT WE'VE HEARD FROM  
20 EVERYBODY, INCLUDING PATRICK TYLER, THE ONLY PERSON  
21 WHO WAS ALLEGEDLY THERE DURING THIS INCIDENT, SAYS  
22 THAT THEY WENT THERE WITH THE INTENT TO ROB MONEY AND  
23 DRUGS. THEY FOUND MONEY IN THE KITCHEN, FOUND DRUGS  
24 IN THE KITCHEN. I UNDERSTAND THERE MAY BE EVIDENCE  
25 THAT THINGS WERE LOOKED FOR, TURNED UP CUSHIONS,

1 THINGS OF THAT NATURE, BUT ARMED ROBBERY IS NOT  
2 SOMEONE TRIES TO TAKE SOMETHING, IT'S SOMEONE DID TAKE  
3 SOMETHING, AND I CERTAINLY DON'T THINK THERE'S BEEN  
4 EVIDENCE OF ANYTHING THAT'S BEEN TAKEN.

5 IN REGARDS TO THE MURDER, YOUR HONOR, I WOULD  
6 ALSO MOTION THIS COURT FOR A FINDING, OR A DIRECTED  
7 VERDICT. MURDER AS IT IS STATED IS AN INTENTIONAL  
8 KILLING OF ANOTHER WITH MALICE AND MALICE  
9 AFORETHOUGHT. YOUR HONOR, THERE'S BEEN NO TESTIMONY  
10 AT ALL THAT THERE HAS BEEN ANY MALICE AFORETHOUGHT. I  
11 THINK ANOTHER WAY TO EXPLAIN THAT IS KIND OF A  
12 PREMEDITATION. I UNDERSTAND THE LAW DOESN'T SAY THAT  
13 THERE HAS TO BE LOTS OF PREMEDITATION, BUT THE ONLY  
14 TESTIMONY HERE THAT WE'VE HEARD IS BASICALLY THAT  
15 PEOPLE ENTERED THIS HOUSE WITH THE INTENT TO ROB, THAT  
16 THEY RANSACKED THE HOUSE AND THINGS WENT BAD  
17 OBVIOUSLY, AND SOMEONE GOT SHOT. CERTAINLY, THAT IS  
18 NOT MALICE AFORETHOUGHT. IT MAY BE -- I'M LOOKING FOR  
19 THE WORD, I'M SORRY, YOUR HONOR -- IT MAY BE HEAT OF  
20 PASSION. IF THEY WERE CHARGED WITH VOLUNTARY  
21 MANSLAUGHTER I DON'T THINK I'D BE STANDING HERE MAKING  
22 THIS MOTION, BUT THEY ARE NOT. I CERTAINLY THINK  
23 ACCEPTING THE EVIDENCE AS TRUE, WHICH IN A DIRECTED  
24 MOTION IS WHAT YOU MUST DO, LOOK AT IT IN THE LIGHT  
25 MOST FAVORABLE TO THE STATE, TAKING PATRICK TYLER'S

1 STATEMENT AS IT IS IN THE LIGHT MOST FAVORABLE TO THE  
2 STATE, IT IS THAT THEY WENT IN THERE TO ROB, AND WHILE  
3 THEY WERE TRYING TO ROB HIM THE VICTIM MADE SOME  
4 STATEMENTS, MADE SOME MOVEMENTS, AND AT THAT POINT  
5 PATRICK TYLER HEARD GUNSHOTS. HE CERTAINLY NEVER SAID  
6 THERE WAS INTENT TO GO IN THERE AND KILL ANYBODY, HE  
7 NEVER SAID THEY SPOKE ABOUT IT, HE NEVER SAID WHILE  
8 THEY WERE IN THERE ANYBODY SAID, HE'S NOT GIVING US  
9 WHAT WE WANT, KILL HIM, NOTHING LIKE THAT. WHAT HE  
10 SAID IS, THINGS WENT CRAZY, I HEARD GUNSHOTS AND RAN.  
11 SO, I DON'T THINK THERE'S BEEN ANY EVIDENCE OF MALICE  
12 AFORETHOUGHT.

13 LASTLY, YOUR HONOR, IN REGARDS TO - - -

14 THE COURT: BURGLARY, ONE.

15 MS. ULLMAN: EXCUSE ME?

16 THE COURT: BURGLARY.

17 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR. IN REGARDS TO THE  
18 BURGLARY, IN REGARDS TO RALPH COLEMAN, BASICALLY,  
19 AGAIN TAKING THE EVIDENCE IN THE LIGHT MOST FAVORABLE  
20 TO THE STATE, IF YOU BELIEVE PATRICK TYLER THAT HE AND  
21 RALPH COLEMAN WENT IN, THEY WENT IN THERE WITH THE  
22 INTENTION OF BUYING WEED. THEY WERE LET IN BY THE  
23 VICTIM. PATRICK TYLER ACTUALLY BOUGHT MARIJUANA WHILE  
24 THEY WERE IN THERE. ACCORDING TO PATRICK TYLER, SO I  
25 DON'T THINK THAT THEY ENTERED WITHOUT CONSENT. I

1 THINK WHEN YOU'RE A DRUG DEALER YOU HAVE YOUR DOOR  
2 OPEN TO WHOEVER IS COMING IN TO BUY DRUGS, AND  
3 CERTAINLY, YOU'RE CONSENTING TO THEM COMING IN FOR  
4 THAT PURPOSE. THAT'S WHAT THEY WENT IN TO DO AND  
5 THAT'S CERTAINLY WHAT THEY STARTED TO DO.

6 AND THAT WOULD BE MY BASIS FOR MY MOTION ON RALPH  
7 COLEMAN.

8 THE COURT: THANK YOU. DO Y'ALL WANT TO RESPOND?

9 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I CAN, YOUR HONOR.

10 THE COURT: IF YOU WANT TO BRIEFLY RESPOND.

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: OR I CAN WAIT UNTIL THE END,  
12 IT DOESN'T MATTER.

13 THE COURT: IS EVERYBODY GOING TO MAKE SEPARATE  
14 MOTIONS?

15 MR. PALMER: I'M GOING TO MAKE A MOTION.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. WELL, THEN, I'LL LET YOU WAIT  
17 UNTIL THE END. OKAY. WHO WANTS TO GO NEXT?

18 MR. PALMER: I'LL GO NEXT, YOUR HONOR.

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, YES, SIR.

20 MR. PALMER: FIRST AND FOREMOST, YOUR HONOR, I  
21 WOULD JOIN IN THE MOTION ALREADY MADE BY CO-COUNSEL,  
22 BUT WITH REGARD TO MR. HARRIS ON THE SAME GROUNDS. AND  
23 THEN ADDITIONALLY, YOUR HONOR, I WOULD MAKE AN  
24 ADDITIONAL MOTION FOR A DIRECTED VERDICT ON THE CHARGE  
25 OF MURDER WITH REGARD TO WALTER LEE HARRIS. THE

1 GROUND OF MY MOTION ARE AS FOLLOWS, YOUR HONOR.  
2 THERE'S BEEN A LOT OF CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE THAT  
3 SUGGESTS MR. HARRIS HAD A GUN AND SO FORTH AND SO ON,  
4 BUT THE ONLY THAT THE EVIDENCE THAT THE JURY HAS TO  
5 SUPPORT THE CHARGE OF MURDER IS THE STATE'S WITNESS,  
6 MR. TYLER, THAT DESCRIBED WHAT HAPPENED AT THE  
7 APARTMENT. AND MR. TYLER'S TESTIMONY IS THAT MY  
8 CLIENT RELINQUISHED HIS WEAPON AND INSTEAD HAD A ROLL  
9 OF TAPE. AND YOUR HONOR, THERE'S NO EVIDENCE IN THE  
10 RECORD THAT THE ORIGINAL PLAN WAS TO MURDER THIS  
11 GENTLEMAN OR THAT THE PLAN DEVELOPED ON THE WAY TO THE  
12 INCIDENT, OR EVEN THAT THESE DEFENDANTS ALLEGEDLY HAD  
13 THE INTENT TO MURDER WHEN THEY ENTERED THE APARTMENT.  
14 THE ONLY INFORMATION THE JURY HAS TO INFER INTENT IS  
15 WHAT HAPPENED AFTER THEY GOT THERE BECAUSE EVERYONE  
16 AGREES THAT THE PLAN WAS TO COMMIT A ROBBERY, AND  
17 WHETHER OR NOT ALL OF THEM OR SOME OF THEM WERE IN ON  
18 IT IS A FACTUAL DETERMINATION. BUT IF YOU BELIEVE MR.  
19 TYLER, WHICH IS WHAT THE STATE'S RELYING THEIR CASE ON  
20 PRIMARILY, IS THAT MR. HARRIS WAS IN THERE WITH A ROLL  
21 OF TAPE, IN THE PROCESS OF RESTRAINING THE VICTIM,  
22 AND HE HAD ALREADY GIVEN UP HIS WEAPON. SO, YOUR  
23 HONOR, WHEN THE INTENT, IF THE JURY FINDS THERE WAS  
24 INTENT TO MURDER, I THINK UNDER THE FACTS THE JURY  
25 WOULD HAVE TO FIND THAT THE INTENT FORMED AFTER THE

1 DEFENDANTS WERE INSIDE THE APARTMENT IN THE PROCESS OF  
2 CARRYING OUT THE ALLEGED ROBBERY, AND AT THAT POINT MY  
3 CLIENT DID NOT HAVE THE MEANS TO COMMIT THE MURDER,  
4 BECAUSE AS THE STATE'S WITNESS TESTIFIED, THE CAUSE OF  
5 DEATH WAS FROM GUN SHOT WOUNDS AND NOT ANYTHING TO DO  
6 WITH DUCT TAPE. SO, ON THAT BASIS I WOULD MAKE AN  
7 ADDITIONAL MOTION FOR A DIRECTED VERDICT ON BEHALF OF  
8 MR. HARRIS ON THE CHARGE OF MURDER.

9 THE COURT: ADDITIONAL REASON? AN ADDITIONAL  
10 REASON REGARDING YOUR CLIENT?

11 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR, YES, SIR, THANK YOU.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE.  
13 OKAY.

14 MR. MELLARD.

15 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR, I WOULD ALSO JOIN IN  
16 THOSE MOTIONS. AS FAR AS THE ARMED ROBBERY, ON THE  
17 SAME GROUNDS THAT MS. ULLMAN MADE, AND ALSO TO THE  
18 EXTENT THAT IT APPLIES TO DANNY RYANT, THE SAME  
19 GROUNDS THAT MR. PALMER MADE.

20 THE COURT: OKAY.

21 MR. MELLARD: AS FAR AS THE ARMED ROBBERY, AGAIN,  
22 THERE'S NO EVIDENCE THAT ANY PROPERTY OF CHARLES  
23 PRINGLE WAS TAKEN. ASHLEY PARSLEY, AGAIN, WAS THE ONLY  
24 WITNESS WHO COULD HAVE TESTIFIED TO THAT, AND FROM  
25 WHAT I HEARD I DON'T BELIEVE SHE PROVIDED ANY

1 TESTIMONY THAT MR. PRINGLE'S PROPERTY WAS TAKEN.

2 AS FAR AS THE BURGLARY, FIRST, MS. PARSLEY DID  
3 NOT SEE DANNY RYANT ON MARCH THE TWELFTH, I BELIEVE  
4 THAT WAS ESTABLISHED BY HER TESTIMONY AND ALSO BY  
5 OFFICER SHUMPERT'S TESTIMONY.

6 AND AS FAR AS THE MURDER, AGAIN I WOULD REITERATE  
7 WHAT EVERYBODY ELSE SAYS, THAT THE PURPOSE OF GOING  
8 THERE WAS TO ROB, IT WAS NOT TO KILL.

9 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR.

10 WHO'S NEXT? MR. KOGER?

11 MR. KOGER: YOUR HONOR, MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

12 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

13 MR. KOGER: I, TOO, JOIN IN WITH SEVERAL OF MY  
14 COLLEAGUES AS FAR AS DIRECTED VERDICT ON THESE THREE  
15 PARTICULAR CHARGES. IN RELATION TO THE MURDER IT'S  
16 BEEN TESTIFIED TO IN RELATION TO MARIO SHIVERS AGAIN  
17 AND AGAIN THAT THERE'S NO PHYSICAL EVIDENCE, NO MURDER  
18 WEAPON THAT CONNECTS MR. SHIVERS TO THESE PARTICULAR  
19 CRIMES. SO THEREFORE, NO EVIDENCE EXISTS FOR, ON THE  
20 MURDER CHARGE TO GET TO THE JURY FOR A JURY TO MAKE A  
21 DETERMINATION. THERE'S NOTHING THAT PLACES MARIO  
22 SHIVERS THERE IN RELATION TO THE MURDER.

23 AS FAR AS WITH THE ARMED ROBBERY, I AGAIN JOIN IN  
24 WITH THE GROUNDS SET FORTH BY CO-COUNSEL ON THAT  
25 PARTICULAR INSTANCE. THERE HAS BEEN NO TESTIMONY OF

1 ANY TYPE OF GOODS OR ANY TYPE OF MONIES TAKEN OFF OF  
2 THE PERSON OF CHARLES PRINGLE IN THIS PARTICULAR  
3 TRIAL. AS SET FORTH BY ASHLEY PARSLEY, PARSLEY DID  
4 NOT TESTIFY TO ANYTHING, AND MR. TYLER, HIS STATEMENT  
5 WAS RATHER VAGUE WHEN HE CAME TO THAT. AND I'M  
6 READING THE INDICTMENT HERE, AND THERE HAS BEEN NO  
7 TESTIMONY FOR THE TAKING AND CARRYING AWAY OF ANY  
8 GOODS OR MONIES FROM THE PERSON OR THE PRESENCE OF THE  
9 VICTIM, CHARLES PRINGLE, SO I ASK THAT YOUR HONOR  
10 WOULD CONSIDER GRANTING A DIRECTED VERDICT ON THAT  
11 PARTICULAR CHARGE.

12 IN RELATION TO THE BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE,  
13 I AM AWARE THAT EVEN THOUGH THERE WAS AN ATTEMPTED  
14 IDENTIFICATION BY ASHLEY PARSLEY TO PUT MY GUY AT THE  
15 DOOR, AND THAT MAY BE A JURY QUESTION, BUT I WOULD  
16 JUST ASK YOUR HONOR, IN YOUR DISCRETION TO DETERMINE  
17 WHETHER TO GRANT A DIRECTED VERDICT IN RELATION TO  
18 THAT PARTICULAR CHARGE.

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR.

20 AND MR. LACKEY.

21 MR. LACKEY: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. AGAIN, I  
22 WOULD JOIN IN THESE MOTIONS FOR A DIRECTED VERDICT.  
23 AND TO FURTHER SPECIFY AS TO MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN  
24 COLEMAN, FIRST TO THE MURDER, I BELIEVE THAT THERE WAS  
25 TESTIMONY THAT, FROM THE STATEMENT OF PATRICK TYLER

1 THAT PUT THE GUN IN EVERYBODY'S, OR WEAPONS IN  
2 EVERYONE'S HANDS EXCEPT MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.  
3 ALSO, AS FAR AS THE MALICE AFORETHOUGHT, NUMBER ONE,  
4 THERE'S BEEN NO TESTIMONY OF ANY PLANNING OF A MURDER.  
5 NUMBER TWO, IF THERE WAS PLANNING, THAT PLANNING DID  
6 NOT INCLUDE MY CLIENT AT ALL FROM WHAT CO-DEFENDANT  
7 PATRICK TYLER SAID.

8 MOVING ON TO THE ARMED ROBBERY AGAIN, THERE IS  
9 EVIDENCE IN THE RECORD OF NO WEAPON THAT MY CLIENT HAD  
10 EITHER BEFORE OR UPON ENTRANCE INTO THE APARTMENT.  
11 AND ALSO, AGAIN, NOTHING WAS TAKEN FROM THE PREMISES  
12 THAT BELONGED TO CHARLES PRINGLE, NOTHING TAKEN AT  
13 ALL. THERE WAS A LOT OF SPECULATION ABOUT THE ROBBERY  
14 AND LOOKING FOR ITEMS, BUT AFTER LOOKING, NO EVIDENCE  
15 OF ACTUAL REMOVAL OF SOMETHING.

16 AND AS TO THE BURGLARY, FIRST, I THINK AGAIN THE  
17 ABSENCE OF A WEAPON IN MY CLIENT'S HAND. ALSO, BOTH  
18 THE TESTIMONY THAT, IF YOU WOULD EVEN INFER THAT MY  
19 CLIENT WERE AT THE SCENE, BOTH ASHLEY PARSLEY AND  
20 PATRICK TYLER USED THE WORD, CONSENT UPON THE ENTRANCE  
21 INTO THE APARTMENT THAT NIGHT.

22 AND THOSE WOULD BE MY GROUNDS ON THOSE THREE  
23 CHARGES FOR A DIRECTED VERDICT.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. SOLICITOR PASCOE.

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

1           THE COURT: YES, SIR.

2           SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

3           YOUR HONOR, WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE EVIDENCE IN THIS  
4           CASE IN THE LIGHT MOST FAVORABLE TO THE STATE, WHICH  
5           IS THE STANDARD, THIS CASE WOULD CERTAINLY GO TO THE  
6           JURY TO MAKE THE DETERMINATION OF WHETHER EACH OF  
7           THESE DEFENDANTS IS GUILTY OF MURDER, BURGLARY AND  
8           ARMED ROBBERY. PATRICK TYLER'S TESTIMONY AND ASHLEY  
9           PARSLEY'S TESTIMONY BY ITSELF IS ENOUGH TO GET THIS  
10          CASE TO THE JURY. PATRICK TYLER TESTIFIED THAT ALL  
11          FIVE OF THESE DEFENDANTS PARTICIPATED IN THE MURDER,  
12          BURGLARY AND ARMED ROBBERY OF THE VICTIM, CHARLES  
13          PRINGLE. MS. PARSLEY TESTIFIED THAT DURING THE  
14          BURGLARY AND ROBBERY, THE VICTIM'S GUN WAS TAKEN FROM  
15          THE SCENE. SHUMPERT, INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT TESTIFIED  
16          THAT THAT GUN WAS NEVER RECOVERED FROM THE SCENE. THAT  
17          IS ENOUGH TO GET AN ARMED ROBBERY CHARGE TO THE JURY.

18                 ADDRESSING SOME OF THE SPECIFICS BROUGHT UP BY  
19                 SOME OF THE DEFENSE ATTORNEYS, I THINK MS. ULLMAN AND  
20                 SOME OF THE OTHER ATTORNEYS INADVERTENTLY MIS-STATED  
21                 THE LAW. WITH REGARDS TO MALICE ON MURDER, THE LAW  
22                 SAYS SPECIFICALLY IT DOESN'T HAVE TO BE ANY  
23                 PREMEDITATION. FOR MURDER THERE JUST HAS TO BE MALICE  
24                 AFORETHOUGHT, AND THE MERE USE OF A DEADLY WEAPON, AND  
25                 WE HAD A MINIMUM OF FOUR WEAPONS USED IN THIS CASE, IS

1 EVIDENCE BY ITSELF OF MALICE. IT'S EVIDENCE OF MALICE.

2 WITH REGARDS TO WALTER LEE HARRIS, AGAIN, THE  
3 TESTIMONY FROM PATRICK TYLER, MR. HARRIS PARTICIPATED  
4 IN THIS HOME INVASION, HE GAVE HIS GUN, ACCORDING TO  
5 PATRICK TYLER, TO ANOTHER PERSON TO USE DURING THIS  
6 HOME INVASION, AND ACCORDING TO PATRICK TYLER WALTER  
7 HARRIS PUT THE TAPE OVER THE VICTIM'S MOUTH DURING  
8 THIS HOME INVASION. AND UNDER THE HAND OF ONE IS THE  
9 HAND OF ALL, IT WOULD CERTAINLY PROVE GUILT ON BEHALF  
10 OF MR. HARRIS AND ALL OF THESE DEFENDANTS.

11 SO, IT'S THE STATE'S POSITION THAT ALL OF THESE  
12 CHARGES SHOULD OBVIOUSLY GO BEFORE THE JURY.

13 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR.

14 ALRIGHT, WITH REGARD TO YOUR MOTIONS, I AM  
15 DENYING THE MOTIONS. I BELIEVE THERE IS EVIDENCE IN  
16 THE RECORD REGARDING ALL OF THE CHARGES. I BELIEVE  
17 THE RECORD ESTABLISHES THAT THEY WERE, WITH REGARDS TO  
18 THE ARMED ROBBERY, THEY WERE PLANNING A ROBBERY.  
19 THERE IS EVIDENCE IN THE RECORD THAT A GUN WAS TAKEN.  
20 THERE IS CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE THAT THEY WERE  
21 LOOKING FOR OTHER THINGS BY SLITTING THE SOFA AND  
22 GOING THROUGH THE HOUSE.

23 IN REGARD TO THE BURGLARY, THEY MAY -- I DON'T  
24 THINK YOU CAN GET AROUND JUST INTENT OR AN INVITATION  
25 IN IF YOU'RE DOING IT ON A DECEITFUL BASIS. I DON'T

1 THINK YOU CAN GET AROUND, THEY WERE TRYING TO USE  
2 DECEIT TO COME INTO THE HOUSE AND I THINK THAT IS  
3 PROPER TO GO FORWARD ON THE BURGLARY CHARGE. WHEN  
4 Y'ALL WERE MAKING THE ARGUMENT ABOUT WHETHER AT LEAST  
5 ONE PERSON WAS ALLOWED TO COME IN, MR. TYLER I THINK  
6 WENT IN UNDER THE AUSPICES TO BUY THE DRUGS AND THEN  
7 WAS FOLLOWED IN ALLEGEDLY BY ANOTHER ONE OF THE  
8 GENTLEMAN.

9 IN REGARD TO THE MURDER AND WHETHER OR NOT THERE  
10 WAS ANY MALICE, I THINK YOU CAN INFER MALICE, AGAIN,  
11 FROM THE USE OF THE WEAPONS, BUT ALSO YOU CAN INFER  
12 MALICE ON THE FACT THAT HE WAS SHOT, I BELIEVE TWENTY  
13 SOMETHING TIMES ACCORDING TO THE NUMBER OF ENTRANCE  
14 WOUNDS THAT WAS FOUND IN HIS BODY.

15 AND SO, I THINK THERE IS ENOUGH EVIDENCE BEFORE  
16 THE JURY FOR THEM TO MAKE A DETERMINATION WITH REGARD  
17 TO ALL THREE OF THESE CHARGES, SO I WILL DENY YOUR  
18 MOTIONS AND NOTE OUR OBJECTIONS TO MY DENIAL OF YOUR  
19 MOTIONS. OKAY?

20 WHAT ELSE?

21 MS. ULLMAN.

22 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR. I WOULD ALSO RENEW ALL  
23 OTHER MOTIONS AND OBJECTIONS THAT I HAVE MADE DURING  
24 THIS TRIAL, - - -

25 THE COURT: OKAY.

1           MS. ULLMAN: --- INCLUDING MY MOTION TO SEVER.  
2           AND I UNDERSTAND YOUR RULING BUT I WOULD LIKE TO PUT A  
3           COUPLE OF THINGS ON THE RECORD THAT I THINK ARE NEW  
4           COMPARED TO WHAT I HAVE PREVIOUSLY STATED.

5           THE COURT: OKAY.

6           MS. ULLMAN: AT THE BEGINNING OF THIS WHEN I  
7           DISCUSSED OR ARGUED THIS MOTION TO SEVER PART OF THE  
8           QUESTION I BELIEVE FROM YOUR HONOR IN REGARDS TO THE  
9           STATE WAS THE WITNESSES. THEY STATED THAT PRETTY MUCH  
10          THE SAME WITNESSES WOULD BE CALLED AT EACH SEPARATE  
11          TRIAL, ALL FIVE SEPARATE TRIALS. WHILE I DISAGREED  
12          WITH THAT YOUR HONOR QUESTIONED THEM AND I THINK THE  
13          NUMBER THAT WE HAD COME UP WITH WAS ABOUT NINETY PER  
14          CENT OF THESE WITNESSES WOULD BE THE SAME.

15          THE COURT: UH-HUH.

16          MS. ULLMAN: IN COUNTING WHAT OCCURRED DURING  
17          THIS WEEK I COUNT TWELVE WITNESSES, AND LOOKING AT THE  
18          TESTIMONY THAT THEY HAVE PROVIDED I WOULD SAY HALF OF  
19          THEM ARE NOT RELEVANT AT ALL TO RALPH COLEMAN. DARIUS  
20          GARDNER DOES NOT PUT RALPH COLEMAN AT ANY CERTAIN  
21          LOCATION EXCEPT HIS OWN HOUSE AND IT'S CERTAINLY NOT  
22          ILLEGAL TO BE AT YOUR OWN HOUSE.

23                        YVONNE SHARPERSON HAS NO KNOWLEDGE OF RALPH  
24          COLEMAN.

25                        MONEAK BUSBY HAS NO KNOWLEDGE OF RALPH COLEMAN.

1           ANDRE WASHINGTON HAS NO KNOWLEDGE OF RALPH  
2 COLEMAN.

3           SHANNON MITCHELL HAD NO KNOWLEDGE OF RALPH  
4 COLEMAN.

5           NATHANIEL HUBBARD HAD NO KNOWLEDGE OF RALPH  
6 COLEMAN.

7           AND WHEN I SAY KNOWLEDGE, I MEAN TESTIMONY REGARDING  
8 HIM IN ANY FASHION. AND CERTAINLY, THAT'S HALF, THAT  
9 IS FIFTY PER CENT.

10           NOW, I UNDERSTAND YVONNE SHARPERSON, MONEAK BUSBY  
11 MAY BE RELEVANT TO DANNY RYANT'S CASE, I UNDERSTAND  
12 ANDRE WASHINGTON MAY BE RELEVANT TO WALTER HARRIS'S  
13 CASE, BUT THEY ARE NOT RELEVANT AND THEY CERTAINLY  
14 WERE PRESENTED DURING THIS TRIAL AGAINST RALPH  
15 COLEMAN.

16           ALSO, YOUR HONOR, IN THE BEGINNING OF THIS I  
17 STATED THAT I DID BELIEVE THAT WE WOULD HAVE  
18 ANTAGONISTIC VIEWS. THERE IS CASE LAW THAT SAYS THAT  
19 ANTAGONISTIC VIEWS IN AND OF ITSELF IS NOT A REASON TO  
20 SEVER A TRIAL, BUT WHERE THE COURT CAN FIND THAT THOSE  
21 ANTAGONISTIC VIEWS WHEN PRESENTED TO A JURY WOULD  
22 REQUIRE THE JURY TO DETERMINE EITHER BASICALLY THAT  
23 THE VIEWS ARE SO ANTAGONISTIC THAT THEY ALL MUST BE  
24 INCORRECT, THEREFORE, EVERYONE MUST BE GUILTY. BASED  
25 ON THE TESTIMONY THAT'S COME OUT I FEEL THAT WE'RE IN

1            THAT POSITION.  IF I STAND UP AND ARGUE AS I INTENDED  
2            TO ORIGINALLY, THAT RALPH COLEMAN WAS MISTAKENLY  
3            PICKED OUT DUE TO CHRISTIAN COLEMAN'S INVOLVEMENT,  
4            THEY'RE GOING TO CONVICT ON ALL.  THE STATE HAS  
5            PRESENTED ITS CASE IN SUCH A WAY, AS THE STATE SAID IN  
6            THEIR OPENING, AS JIG SAW PUZZLES AND WHEN THEY FIT  
7            ALL THOSE PIECES TOGETHER THE RESULT'S GOING TO BE  
8            THAT THEY ALL MUST HAVE DONE THIS.  AND MY POINT IS,  
9            IF THE JURY BELIEVES THAT WALTER HARRIS THAT FORTY AND  
10           THAT HE SOLD THAT FORTY, AND HAT FORTY WAS USED IN  
11           THIS, HE'S SITTING HERE NEXT TO MY CLIENT, THEY'RE  
12           GOING TO FIND HIM GUILTY, THEY'RE GOING TO FIND RALPH  
13           COLEMAN GUILTY.  AND IT'S GOING TO BE BASED ON THE  
14           EVIDENCE THAT WAS ENTERED BY ANDRE WASHINGTON AND  
15           OTHERS RELATING TO THAT FORTY CALIBER WEAPON THAT HAS  
16           NO RELATION TO MY CLIENT.  I THINK THERE'S BEEN  
17           WITNESSES THAT WOULDN'T HAVE BEEN PRODUCED AT MY TRIAL  
18           SEPARATELY FOR RALPH COLEMAN.  I THINK THERE'S BEEN  
19           EVIDENCE INTRODUCE THAT WOULDN'T HAVE BEEN INTRODUCED.  
20           I WOULD NOTE FOR THE RECORD ALSO THAT INVESTIGATOR  
21           SHUMPERT DID MENTION TODAY THAT WALTER HARRIS TOLD HIM  
22           SOMETHING, OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD I DON'T REMEMBER  
23           RIGHT NOW EXACTLY WHAT IT WAS, BUT MY POINT IS, THE  
24           FACT THAT WALTER HARRIS TALKED TO INVESTIGATOR  
25           SHUMPERT CERTAINLY CAME OUT TODAY, AND I DON'T BELIEVE

1 THAT WOULD HAVE BEEN SOMETHING THAT COULD HAVE BEEN  
2 DONE AT A TRIAL AGAINST RALPH COLEMAN ON HIS OWN,  
3 BECAUSE AS FAR AS I UNDERSTAND, AND I UNDERSTAND WE  
4 HAVEN'T GOTTEN TO THAT POINT YET, BUT IF WALTER HARRIS  
5 DOESN'T TAKE THE STAND I HAVE NO ABILITY TO QUESTION  
6 HIM ABOUT, DID HE TALK TO HIM, WAS IT VOLUNTARY, DID  
7 HE MEAN WHAT HE SAID, WAS HE LYING TO GET OTHER PEOPLE  
8 OUT OF IT, WHY DID HE SAY IT? I CANNOT QUESTION HIM  
9 ON ANY OF THAT. SO, I WOULD RENEW MY MOTION SEVER FOR  
10 ALL OF THE GROUNDS THAT I PREVIOUSLY STATED PLUS THE  
11 NEW GROUNDS THAT I'VE STATED JUST NOW.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, MA'AM, AND I  
13 APPRECIATE YOU NOW HAVE THAT ON THE RECORD. I AGAIN  
14 STAND BY MY DECISION NOT TO SEVER THIS TRIAL. OKAY?

15 MR. MELLARD: JUST ONE MORE, YOUR HONOR.

16 THE COURT: YES, SIR. NO, I'M NOT TRYING TO  
17 HURRY YOU THROUGH.

18 MR. MELLARD: I'M NOT, I'M NOT NECESSARILY  
19 JOINING MS. ULLMAN'S GROUNDS ON THE SEVERANCE PART,  
20 BUT IT'S MY ARGUMENT THAT THIS TRIAL, BECAUSE OF THE  
21 LACK TO SEVER HAS VIOLATED DANNY RYANT'S RIGHT TO DUE  
22 PROCESS. MS. ULLMAN HAS STATED SOME OF THE GROUNDS.  
23 OBVIOUSLY, WE HAVE LOST THE RIGHT TO MAKE LAST  
24 ARGUMENT, WE'VE PUT -- DANNY RYANT HAS PUT NO EVIDENCE  
25 UP, HE MAY DECIDE TO DO IT, BUT IF HE DOES DO IT, IT

1 IS DETERMINED STRATEGY IN THIS CASE, BECAUSE ANOTHER  
2 DEFENDANT HAS ALREADY ADMITTED EVIDENCE INTO THIS CASE  
3 AND IT'S AFFECTED THAT PART OF OUR TRIAL. CROSS-  
4 EXAMINATION HAS BEEN AFFECTED. AS MS. ULLMAN SAYS, IF  
5 WE START POINTING FINGERS AT EVERYBODY IT'S NOT GOING  
6 TO HELP ANYBODY, SO CROSS-EXAMINATION HAS BEEN  
7 AFFECTED BY THIS. JUST, THE OVERALL STRATEGY, THE  
8 OVERALL PROCEDURAL ASPECTS OF IT, IT'S OUR, IT'S DANNY  
9 RYANT'S POSITION THAT BECAUSE THESE DEFENDANTS WERE  
10 TRIED JOINTLY, THAT HIS RIGHT TO DUE PROCESS HAS BEEN  
11 VIOLATED, YOUR HONOR.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR.

13 MS. ULLMAN: AND YOUR HONOR, IF I MIGHT REFLECT,  
14 I WOULD ACTUALLY JOIN THAT MOTION AND STATE THAT AS  
15 OBVIOUSLY HAS HAPPENED, WE HAVE ALL BEEN FORCED TO  
16 WORK AS A GROUP, WE PICKED A JURY AS A GROUP, WE  
17 DECIDED ON WHETHER WE WOULD AGREE TO THE JURY MEMBER  
18 BEING EXCUSED AS A GROUP, WE HAVE ACTUALLY DISCUSSED  
19 DIRECTED VERDICT MOTIONS AS A GROUP. AT THIS POINT,  
20 UNFORTUNATELY, WE DIDN'T KNOW THAT WE NEED TO DISCUSS  
21 WHETHER EVIDENCE WAS BEING PRESENTED AS A GROUP OR  
22 NOT, AND MR. KOGER HAS ENTERED EVIDENCE AND THAT HAS  
23 RUINED OUR RIGHT TO LAST CLOSE. OBVIOUSLY, YOUR HONOR  
24 KNOWS WE DID NOT KNOW THAT. I BELIEVE THE STATE WAS  
25 AWARE AT THE BEGINNING AND WE WERE NOT, AND

1 UNFORTUNATELY, HERE WE STAND. IT CERTAINLY HAS  
2 AFFECTED HOW I WOULD HAVE QUESTIONED PEOPLE, JUST AS  
3 MR. MELLARD SAID, AND CERTAINLY, ABSOLUTELY IT'S GOING  
4 TO AFFECT MY CLOSING ARGUMENT.

5 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MA'AM.

6 MR. KOGER.

7 MR. KOGER: YOUR HONOR, MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.  
8 I ALSO WOULD LIKE TO JOIN IN ON THE GROUNDS SET FORTH  
9 BY ATTORNEY MELLARD, THIS TRIAL MAY HAVE RESULTED IN  
10 SOME LOSS OF SOME CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS FOR MY CLIENT,  
11 MR. SHIVERS. AS ATTORNEY ULLMAN JUST SET FORTH BEFORE  
12 THE COURT, OF COURSE, I REPRESENT MR. SHIVERS, I DID  
13 NOT KNOW BEFOREHAND, BECAUSE YOU STATED FROM THE  
14 BENCH, YOUR HONOR, AND WE ALL STATED IN OUR OPENINGS  
15 THAT THESE ARE FIVE SEPARATE TRIALS. I DIDN'T KNOW  
16 BEFOREHAND THAT I'M SUPPOSED TO CONFER WITH FOUR OTHER  
17 ATTORNEYS WITH THEIR SEPARATE CLIENTS BEFORE I  
18 SUBMITTED EVIDENCE ON BEHALF OF MY CLIENT. I THINK  
19 MS. ULLMAN JUST STATED THEY DIDN'T EVEN KNOW THAT. WE  
20 WAS FORCED TO, AGAIN, SELECT THE JURY TOGETHER, AND  
21 IT'S BEEN A GOING BACK AND FORTH TYPE THING HERE, YOU  
22 KNOW. SOMETIMES WE ARE TOGETHER, WE'RE SUPPOSED TO BE  
23 TOGETHER, AND THEN WE'RE SUPPOSED TO SEPARATELY IN  
24 DEPTH, YOUR HONOR, REPRESENT OUR CLIENT. SO, I JOIN  
25 IN ON THE DUE PROCESS ISSUE ON THE GROUNDS SET FORTH

1 BY MR. MELLARD IN RELATION TO THIS CASE.

2 MR. PALMER: YOUR HONOR, - - -

3 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

4 MR. PALMER: --- JUST BRIEFLY, - - -

5 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

6 MR. PALMER: --- I JOIN IN ALL OF THAT ON BEHALF

7 OF MY CLIENT. I WANT TO ADD SOMETHING THAT - - -

8 THE COURT: ADD ANOTHER TWIST TO IT, PLEASE, SIR.

9 MR. PALMER: JUST ANOTHER TWIST, PLEASE, SIR.

10 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

11 MR. PALMER: --- THAT AT FIRST GLANCE MAY SEEM  
12 KIND OF FRIVOLOUS BUT SITTING HERE ALL WEEK IT'S GIVEN  
13 ME MORE AND MORE CONCERN, IT'S JUST THE LOGISTICS OF  
14 THIS TRIAL, YOUR HONOR, AND I'M NOT, YOU KNOW, CASTING  
15 ANY ASPERSIONS ON ANYONE, BUT JUST THE WAY WE'RE  
16 CLUTTERED AT THE DEFENSE TABLE AND BUNCHED UP LIKE  
17 THIS, AND YOU KNOW, IT JUST LOOKS LIKE THE PROSECUTION  
18 HAS MORE ROOM TO WORK, AND AGAIN, NO REFLECTION ON  
19 THEM, BUT THEY JUST LOOK MORE ORGANIZED AND CONFIDENT  
20 THAN WE DO. WE'RE STEPPING OVER EACH OTHER TO GET OUT  
21 TO CONDUCT OUR CROSS-EXAMINATIONS AND DO OTHER THINGS  
22 IN THE COURTROOM, AND I THINK JUST THE APPEARANCE OF  
23 IT WITH THE JURY, YOUR HONOR, MAY BE PREJUDICING OUR  
24 CLIENTS' RIGHT TO A FAIR TRIAL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

25 THE COURT: AN INTERESTING TWIST, MR. PALMER.

1           THANK YOU FOR THAT.

2                   OKAY, AND MR. LACKEY.

3           MR. LACKEY:   YES, SIR, YOUR HONOR, JUST BRIEFLY,  
4           I WOULD, TOO, JOIN IN THE MOTION MR. MELLARD MAKES. IT  
5           IS DIFFICULT AS YOU REPRESENT YOUR CLIENT TO ALSO HAVE  
6           TO CONFER WITH THESE OTHER ATTORNEYS, WHICH ARE GREAT  
7           ATTORNEYS, BUT WE EACH HAVE OUR OWN TRIAL STRATEGY,  
8           AND AT THAT POINT IT DOES AFFECT CERTAIN DECISIONS,  
9           WHETHER THEY BE LARGE OR SMALL, BUT TO BE MADE IN  
10          PUTTING UP A DEFENSE FOR YOUR CASE.  SO, WE WOULD ALSO  
11          JOIN IN ON BEHALF OF MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

12          THE COURT:   ALRIGHT, THANK YOU.

13          SOLICITOR PASCOE:  YOUR HONOR, - - -

14          THE COURT:   OH, YES, SIR.

15          SOLICITOR PASCOE:   I ASK, OBVIOUSLY FEEL  
16          PREJUDICED AS WELL. I WANT TO JOIN IN THEIR MOTION  
17          BECAUSE IT IS, AFTER ALL, SIX AGAINST TWO, AND MY  
18          WITNESSES HAD TO BE CROSS-EXAMINED BY FIVE DEFENSE  
19          ATTORNEYS INSTEAD OF ONE.  ON A SERIOUS NOTE, THOUGH,  
20          I WANT TO CORRECT SOME MIS-STATEMENTS.

21                   FIRST OF ALL, MS. ULLMAN TWICE SAID THAT WE  
22                   WOULDN'T HAVE CALLED THE SAME WITNESSES AGAINST HER  
23                   CLIENT THAT WE CALLED IN THIS TRIAL. EVERY SINGLE  
24                   WITNESS WE CALLED IN THIS TRIAL WOULD HAVE BEEN CALLED  
25                   IN THE TRIALS AGAINST EVERYONE OF THOSE DEFENDANTS,

1 EVERY SINGLE WITNESS. THAT IS A MIS-STATEMENT AND I  
2 WANT TO CLARIFY THAT ON THE RECORD.

3 HAVING TO BE FORCED TO WORK IN A GROUP? NO, SIR,  
4 THAT WAS ONE OF THE LAWYER'S STATEMENTS. THAT WAS  
5 THEIR CHOICE TO WORK IN A GROUP. AS MR. KOGER POINTED  
6 OUT, REALLY, THEY AREN'T SUPPOSED TO CONFER IF THEY  
7 DON'T WANT TO. SO, THEY'RE NOT PREJUDICED IN ANY  
8 MANNER, AND I JUST WANTED TO MAKE THAT PART OF THE  
9 RECORD.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR. ON BEHALF --  
11 WITH Y'ALL'S MOTIONS, LET ME TELL YOU, I UNDERSTAND  
12 THE DIFFICULTIES THAT Y'ALL HAD, AND I CAN APPRECIATE  
13 THE DIFFICULTIES THAT Y'ALL HAD, BUT -- AND YOU KNOW,  
14 I UNDERSTAND EVERYTHING THAT Y'ALL SAID ABOUT, YOU  
15 KNOW, HAVING TO WORK TOGETHER AND TRYING TO DETERMINE  
16 WHETHER YOU WERE GOING TO WORK AS A GROUP IN CERTAIN  
17 SITUATIONS AND THEN HAVING TO ALSO JUST WORRY ABOUT  
18 REPRESENTING YOUR CLIENTS INDIVIDUALLY. OKAY? I WANT  
19 TO TELL YOU THAT I THINK Y'ALL HAVE THUS FAR DONE A  
20 WONDERFUL JOB IN REPRESENTING YOUR CLIENTS THROUGH ALL  
21 THESE DIFFICULTIES. AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, I AM NOT  
22 CHANGING MY POSITION WITH REGARD TO SEVERANCE AND I AM  
23 DENYING YOUR MOTIONS THAT YOU HAVE, THAT WE HAVE JUST  
24 GONE THROUGH. SO, I THINK Y'ALL HAVE DONE A GREAT  
25 JOB. I REALIZE IT WAS UNDER DIFFICULT CIRCUMSTANCES,

1 I DO THINK THAT THIS WOULD HAVE BEEN THE SAME CASE  
2 TRIED FIVE TIMES, AND I WAS, I THINK THAT Y'ALL WERE  
3 ALSO ABLE TO CROSS -- FIVE DIFFERENT PEOPLE WERE ABLE  
4 TO CROSS-EXAMINE ANY ONE OF THE WITNESSES, AND BY  
5 VIRTUE OF THE FACT THAT Y'ALL ALL HAD DIFFERENT STYLES  
6 I THOUGHT IT WAS EFFECTIVE, WHEREAS IF WE WERE DOING  
7 SINGLE TRIALS YOU WOULD HAVE ONLY HAD ONE STYLE  
8 ATTORNEY CROSS-EXAMINING ANOTHER. AND IN REGARD TO  
9 MR. PALMER'S COMMENT, WHICH I THOUGHT WAS INTERESTING  
10 ABOUT -- ACTUALLY, I THINK THAT EVEN THOUGH Y'ALL DID  
11 HAVE TO STEP UP, AND I APOLOGIZE FOR Y'ALL NOT HAVING  
12 AS MUCH SPACE, BUT I THINK Y'ALL ACTUALLY SEEMED TO  
13 WORK VERY WELL TOGETHER IN FRONT OF THE JURY, AND I  
14 THINK THAT THAT CAME ACROSS TO THE JURY. BUT I NOTE  
15 ALL THE PROBLEMS THAT Y'ALL HAVE RECITED, OKAY, AND  
16 DENY YOUR MOTIONS. THANKS.

17 ANYTHING ELSE?

18 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR.

19 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

20 MR. PALMER: NO, SIR.

21 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR.

22 MR. KOGER: NO, SIR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. NOW, DO YOU WANT ME TO CALL  
24 THE JURY BACK IN SO THAT THE STATE CAN REST AND THEN  
25 EXCUSE THEM WHILE Y'ALL, SO Y'ALL CAN TELL ME, SO I

1 CAN THEN QUESTION THE DEFENDANTS?

2 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

3 THE COURT; OKAY. BRING THE JURY BACK IN SO WE  
4 CAN PROCEED.

5 (Whereupon, the jury enters  
6 the courtroom and the following  
7 takes place in the presence of  
8 the jury.)

9 THE COURT: I APPRECIATE YOU GETTING BACK IN A  
10 TIMELY FOR LUNCH, OR FROM LUNCH, EXCUSE ME. WE HAD  
11 SOME THINGS TO TAKE CARE OF BEFORE I COULD BRING YOU  
12 BACK OUT, AND NOW WE'RE READY TO PROCEED.

13 MR. PASCOE.

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

15 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

16 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME THE  
17 STATE RESTS.

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU, SIR.

19 ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, THE STATE HAS NOW  
20 PUT UP ALL THE EVIDENCE THAT THEY ARE GOING TO PUT UP  
21 IN THIS CASE, AND SO IT WILL BE NOW, WE'RE GOING TO  
22 FIND OUT WHAT THE DEFENDANTS ARE GOING TO CHOOSE TO  
23 DO. BEFORE I CAN DO THAT I HAVE GOT TO ASK THEM SOME  
24 QUESTIONS BEFORE THEY TESTIFY OR ANY EVIDENCE IS PUT  
25 UP, SO I'M GOING TO EXCUSE YOU TO GO BACK INTO THE

1 JURY ROOM FOR A FEW MINUTES WHILE WE MAKE SOME  
2 DETERMINATIONS, AND THEN I'LL BRING Y'ALL BACK OUT.  
3 OKAY? THANK YOU. AND REMEMBER, YOU'VE HEARD ALL THE  
4 EVIDENCE ONLY FROM THE STATE'S PERSPECTIVE SO YOU  
5 STILL CANNOT BEGIN DISCUSSING THIS CASE. THANK YOU.  
6 (Whereupon, the jury retires  
7 to the jury room and the following  
8 takes place out of the presence  
9 of the jury.)

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, ARE Y'ALL'S CLIENTS READY  
11 FOR ME TO GO OVER THEIR RIGHTS WITH THEM?

12 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. AND EACH ONE OF YOU HAVE HAD A  
14 CHANCE TO MEET WITH THEM AND DISCUSS THIS WITH THEM?

15 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR.

16 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

17 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

18 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

19 MR. KOGER: YES, SIR.

20 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, MR. CHRISTIAN  
21 COLEMAN, WOULD YOU PLEASE STAND, PLEASE, SIR? OKAY.

22 AND MR. RALPH COLEMAN, WOULD YOU STAND?

23 AND MR. WALTER LEE HARRIS?

24 AND MR. DANNY RYANT?

25 AND MR. MARIO SHIVERS.

1 IF Y'ALL WANT TO MOVE -- YEAH, IF Y'ALL WANT TO  
2 MOVE AND JUST STAND OVER TO THE STAND THAT WILL BE  
3 HELPFUL, IF YOU DON'T MIND.

4 MADAM CLERK, WOULD YOU MIND SWEARING THEM IN?

5 CLERK: ALL RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.

6 (Whereupon, Ralph Coleman, Christian  
7 Coleman, Walter Lee Harris, Danny Ryant  
8 and Mario Shivers are duly sworn.)

9 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any  
10 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony  
11 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now  
12 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for  
13 sequential continuation of record.)

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

875

1 EXAMINATION, IN CAMERA, OF RALPH COLEMAN,  
2 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY  
3 RYANT AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT:

4 Q. ALRIGHT, GENTLEMEN, AT THIS TIME I'M GOING TO GO  
5 OVER AND EXPLAIN CERTAIN OF YOUR RIGHTS TO YOU  
6 AND IF WHILE I'M DOING THE EXPLANATIONS I SAY  
7 SOMETHING THAT YOU DON'T UNDERSTAND IF YOU WILL  
8 PLEASE STOP ME OR ASK ME TO GO INTO FURTHER  
9 DETAIL I WILL BE HAPPY TO DO SO, BUT I WANT TO  
10 MAKE SURE Y'ALL UNDERSTAND THAT FIRST OFF. DO  
11 Y'ALL ALL UNDERSTAND THAT, THAT YOU HAVE A RIGHT  
12 TO QUESTIONING?

13 A. (RALPH COLEMAN) YES, SIR.

14 A. (CHRISTIAN COLEMAN) YES, SIR.

15 A. (WALTER LEE HARRIS) YES, SIR.

16 A. (DANNY RYANT) YES, SIR.

17 A. (MARIO SHIVERS) YES, SIR.

18 Q. OKAY. MR. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. MR. RALPH COLEMAN?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. MR. HARRIS?

23 A. YES, YOUR HONOR.

24 Q. MR. RYANT?

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

876

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. MR. SHIVERS?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. NOW, WE ARE, AS YOU KNOW, THE STATE HAS  
5 ALREADY PRESENTED THEIR CASE, AND IT'S NOW UP TO  
6 Y'ALL TO DECIDE WHAT Y'ALL ARE GOING TO DO AS FAR  
7 AS PRESENTING A DEFENSE OR NOT. YOU HAVE THE  
8 RIGHT TO CLAIM THE PROTECTIONS OF THE FIFTH  
9 AMENDMENT WHICH SAYS THAT NO ONE, -- IN PERTINENT  
10 PART, SAYS THAT NO PERSON SHALL BE COMPELLED IN  
11 ANY CRIMINAL CASE TO BE A WITNESS AGAINST  
12 HIMSELF. THIS MEANS THAT YOU CANNOT BE REQUIRED  
13 TO TESTIFY IN THIS CASE. YOU DO HAVE THE RIGHT  
14 TO TESTIFY IN YOUR OWN BEHALF, BUT NO ONE CAN  
15 MAKE YOU TESTIFY. THIS IS A PERSONAL RIGHT THAT  
16 YOU HAVE AND ONLY YOU CAN WAIVE. IF YOU DECIDE TO  
17 TESTIFY YOU WILL BE SUBJECT TO THE SAME RULES  
18 THAT GOVERN THE OTHER WITNESSES AND YOU MAY BE  
19 EXAMINED AND CROSS-EXAMINED ON ANY RELEVANT ISSUE  
20 IN THIS CASE JUST AS ALL THE WITNESSES FROM THE  
21 STATE'S CASE WERE CROSS-EXAMINED.  
22 ADDITIONALLY, IF YOU HAVE ANY CONVICTIONS  
23 INVOLVING DISHONESTY OR FALSE STATEMENTS OR FOR  
24 CRIMES PUNISHABLE BY IMPRISONMENT FOR MORE THAN

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

877

1 ONE YEAR AND I DETERMINE THAT THE PROBATIVE VALUE  
2 OF ADMITTING THIS EVIDENCE OUTWEIGHS ITS  
3 PREJUDICIAL EFFECT TO YOU THE SOLICITOR WILL BE  
4 ABLE TO INTRODUCE YOUR RECORD TO ATTACK YOUR  
5 CREDIBILITY.

6 IF YOU DECIDE TO TESTIFY THIS DECISION ON YOUR  
7 PART MUST BE FREELY, VOLUNTARILY AND  
8 INTELLIGENTLY MADE, WITH KNOWLEDGE OF THE  
9 PROTECTIONS GIVEN TO YOU BY THE FIFTH AMENDMENT  
10 AND THE CONSEQUENCES OF YOUR DECISION TO TESTIFY.  
11 IF YOU DECIDE NOT TO TESTIFY I WILL INSTRUCT THE  
12 JURORS THAT THEY CANNOT GIVE THE FACT THAT YOU  
13 DID NOT TESTIFY ANY CONSIDERATION WHATSOEVER, AND  
14 THAT THERE IS TO BE ABSOLUTELY NO PREJUDICE TO  
15 YOU BECAUSE YOU DID NOT TESTIFY. IT IS LEFT  
16 ENTIRELY UP TO YOU WHETHER OR NOT YOU TESTIFY. I  
17 KNOW THAT YOU HAVE ALL -- LET'S SEE, FIRST I JUST  
18 NEED TO FIND OUT.

19 MR. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, YOU HAVE TALKED WITH YOUR  
20 ATTORNEY?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. ABOUT THIS?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. HAVE YOU TALKED WITH ANY FAMILY MEMBERS ABOUT IT

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

878

- 1 AS WELL?
- 2 A. NO, SIR.
- 3 Q. OKAY. HAVE YOU UNDERSTOOD EVERYTHING YOUR  
4 ATTORNEY HAS TOLD YOU?
- 5 A. YES, SIR.
- 6 Q. OKAY. MR. RALPH COLEMAN, HAVE YOU TALKED WITH  
7 YOUR ATTORNEYS ABOUT THIS?
- 8 A. YES, SIR.
- 9 Q. HAVE YOU TALKED WITH ANY FAMILY MEMBERS ABOUT IT?
- 10 A. NO, SIR.
- 11 Q. OKAY. HAVE YOU UNDERSTOOD EVERYTHING YOUR  
12 ATTORNEYS HAVE TOLD YOU?
- 13 A. YES, SIR.
- 14 Q. OKAY. MR. HARRIS, HAVE YOU TALKED WITH YOUR  
15 ATTORNEY ABOUT THIS?
- 16 A. YES, YOUR HONOR.
- 17 Q. HAVE YOU TALKED WITH ANY FAMILY MEMBERS ABOUT  
18 THIS?
- 19 A. YES, YOUR HONOR.
- 20 Q. OKAY. HAVE YOU UNDERSTOOD EVERYTHING YOUR  
21 ATTORNEY HAS SAID?
- 22 A. YES, YOUR HONOR.
- 23 Q. OKAY. MR. RYANT, HAVE YOU TALKED WITH YOUR  
24 ATTORNEY ABOUT THIS?

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

879

- 1 A. YES, SIR.
- 2 Q. HAVE YOU UNDERSTOOD EVERYTHING HE'S TOLD YOU?
- 3 A. YES, SIR.
- 4 Q. HAVE YOU TALKED WITH ANY FAMILY MEMBERS ABOUT
- 5 THIS?
- 6 A. NO, SIR.
- 7 Q. OKAY. AND MR. SHIVERS, HAVE YOU TALKED WITH YOUR
- 8 ATTORNEY ABOUT THIS?
- 9 A. YES, SIR.
- 10 Q. OKAY. HAVE YOU TALKED WITH ANY FAMILY MEMBERS
- 11 ABOUT IT?
- 12 A. NO, SIR.
- 13 Q. OKAY. HAVE YOU UNDERSTOOD EVERYTHING THAT YOUR
- 14 ATTORNEY HAS TOLD YOU ABOUT THIS?
- 15 A. YES, SIR.
- 16 Q. ALRIGHT. DO EACH ONE OF YOU GENTLEMEN UNDERSTAND
- 17 THAT THE DECISION YOU MAKE NOW WILL BE YOUR FINAL
- 18 DECISION? DO YOU UNDERSTAND THAT, MR. CHRISTIAN
- 19 COLEMAN?
- 20 A. YES, SIR.
- 21 Q. OKAY, MR. RALPH COLEMAN?
- 22 A. YES, SIR.
- 23 Q. MR. HARRIS?
- 24 A. YES, YOUR HONOR.

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

880

- 1 Q. MR. RYANT?
- 2 A. YES, SIR.
- 3 Q. AND MR. SHIVERS?
- 4 A. YES, SIR.
- 5 Q. ALRIGHT. HAS EVERYONE UNDERSTOOD WHAT I HAVE
- 6 TOLD YOU? ALRIGHT, MR. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN?
- 7 A. YES, SIR.
- 8 Q. MR. RALPH COLEMAN?
- 9 A. YES, SIR.
- 10 Q. MR. HARRIS?
- 11 A. YES, YOUR HONOR.
- 12 Q. MR. RYANT?
- 13 A. YES, SIR.
- 14 Q. AND MR. SHIVERS?
- 15 A. YES, SIR.
- 16 Q. ALRIGHT. DO ANY OF Y'ALL HAVE ANY QUESTIONS
- 17 ABOUT WHAT I'VE EXPLAINED TO YOU? IF YOU DO, I
- 18 NEED, IF YOU'LL JUST RAISE YOUR HAND. ALRIGHT,
- 19 NO ONE HAS ANY QUESTIONS. DOES ANYBODY NEED TO
- 20 TALK TO THEIR ATTORNEY ONE MORE TIME? MR.
- 21 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN?
- 22 A. NO, SIR.
- 23 Q. MR. RALPH COLEMAN?
- 24 A. NO, SIR.

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

881

- 1 Q. MR. HARRIS?
- 2 A. NO, YOUR HONOR.
- 3 Q. MR. RYANT?
- 4 A. NO, SIR.
- 5 Q. MR. SHIVERS?
- 6 A. NO, SIR.
- 7 Q. ALRIGHT. MR. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, DO YOU WISH TO
- 8 TESTIFY?
- 9 A. NO, SIR.
- 10 Q. ALRIGHT. AND MR. COLEMAN, HAS ANYBODY THREATENED
- 11 YOU TO GET YOU TO DECIDE THIS?
- 12 A. NO, SIR.
- 13 Q. HAS ANYBODY PROMISED YOU ANYTHING TO GET YOU TO
- 14 DECIDE THIS?
- 15 A. NO, SIR.
- 16 Q. YOU'RE DOING IT FREELY AND VOLUNTARILY?
- 17 A. YES, SIR.
- 18 Q. YOU UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE DOING?
- 19 A. YES, SIR.
- 20 Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. MR. RALPH COLEMAN, DO YOU WISH TO
- 21 TESTIFY?
- 22 A. NO, SIR.
- 23 Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. HAS ANYBODY THREATENED YOU TO GET
- 24 YOU TO NOT TESTIFY?

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

882

- 1 A. NO, SIR.
- 2 Q. HAS ANYBODY PROMISED YOU ANYTHING TO GET YOU TO  
3 NOT TESTIFY?
- 4 A. NO, SIR.
- 5 Q. ARE YOU DOING IT FREELY AND VOLUNTARILY?
- 6 A. YES, SIR.
- 7 Q. YOU UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE DOING?
- 8 A. YES, SIR.
- 9 Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. MR. HARRIS, DO YOU WISH TO  
10 TESTIFY?
- 11 A. NO, YOUR HONOR.
- 12 Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. MR. HARRIS, HAS ANYBODY THREATENED  
13 YOU TO GET YOU TO NOT TESTIFY?
- 14 A. NO, YOUR HONOR.
- 15 Q. HAS ANYBODY PROMISED YOU ANYTHING TO GET YOU TO  
16 NOT TESTIFY?
- 17 A. NO, YOUR HONOR.
- 18 Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. YOU'RE DOING IT FREELY AND  
19 VOLUNTARILY?
- 20 A. YES, SIR.
- 21 Q. YOU UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE DOING?
- 22 A. YES, SIR.
- 23 Q. ALRIGHT. MR. RYANT, DO YOU WISH TO TESTIFY?
- 24 A. NO, SIR.

EXAM, IN CAMERA - RALPH COLEMAN, CHRISTIAN  
COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT  
AND MARIO SHIVERS BY THE COURT

883

1 Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. MR. RYANT, HAS ANYBODY PROMISED  
2 YOU ANYTHING TO GET YOU TO NOT TESTIFY?

3 A. NO, SIR.

4 Q. HAS ANYBODY THREATENED YOU TO GET YOU TO NOT  
5 TESTIFY?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. YOU'RE DOING IT FREELY AND VOLUNTARILY?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. YOU UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE DOING?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. ALRIGHT. MR. SHIVERS, DO YOU WISH TO TESTIFY?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. HAS ANYBODY PROMISED YOU ANYTHING TO GET  
14 YOU TO NOT TESTIFY?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. HAS ANYBODY THREATENED YOU TO GET YOU TO NOT  
17 TESTIFY?

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. YOU'RE DOING IT FREELY AND VOLUNTARILY?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. YOU UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE DOING?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR. ALRIGHT, THANK YOU,  
24 GENTLEMEN, YOU MAY BE SEATED. APPRECIATE IT.

1 ALRIGHT, NOW, I KNOW THAT THERE WERE SOME OTHER  
2 ISSUES BESIDES -- IS THERE GOING TO BE ANY EVIDENCE  
3 PUT UP BY THE DEFENSE AT ALL, ANY WITNESSES? I KNOW  
4 THERE WERE SOME ALLEGATION OF SOME OTHER THINGS. I  
5 WAS PUT ON NOTICE OF SOME OTHER WITNESSES.

6 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, RALPH COLEMAN IS NOT  
7 PUTTING UP ANY WITNESSES.

8 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. LACKEY?

9 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, NONE ON BEHALF OF  
10 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

11 THE COURT: MR. PALMER?

12 MR. PALMER: NONE ON BEHALF OF MR. HARRIS, YOUR  
13 HONOR.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MR. MELLARD?

15 MR. MELLARD: NONE ON BEHALF OF DANNY RYANT.

16 THE COURT: AND MR. KOGER?

17 MR. KOGER: NONE ON BEHALF OF MR. SHIVERS, YOUR  
18 HONOR.

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. SO, WHEN THE JURY COMES IN  
20 YOU'RE JUST GOING TO TELL THEM, LET EACH ONE OF Y'ALL  
21 TELL THE JURY THAT THE DEFENSE RESTS, EACH ONE OF  
22 Y'ALL RESTS.

23 NOW, ARE Y'ALL PREPARED TO GO FORWARD WITH THE  
24 ARGUMENTS RIGHT NOW OR DO WE NEED A BREAK, OR HOW DO  
25 Y'ALL WANT TO HANDLE THAT? MR. LACKEY, I'LL LET YOU

1 GO FIRST SINCE YOU'RE IN LINE.

2 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, I THINK WHAT WE WOULD  
3 NEED TO DO AT THAT POINT IS THEN MEET WITH, MEET WITH  
4 YOUR HONOR AND GO OVER THE REQUESTS TO CHARGE TO MAKE  
5 SURE - - -

6 THE COURT: OH, YEAH, WE'VE GOT A LOT, I WILL  
7 TELL YOU WHAT I'M PLANNING ON CHARGING AND THEN Y'ALL  
8 CAN TELL ME WHAT -- BUT I MEAN, OTHER THAN THAT ARE  
9 Y'ALL PREPARED TO GO FORWARD AFTER WE DO THAT?

10 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, I WOULD -- JUST IN THE  
11 INTEREST OF TIME, AFTER ALL THAT IS DONE I WOULD -- IT  
12 APPEARS TO ME THAT WE WOULD PROBABLY RUN PAST THE HOUR  
13 TONIGHT, AND I CERTAINLY DO NOT WANT TO BIFURCATE  
14 CLOSING ARGUMENTS.

15 THE COURT: YOU'RE SUGGESTING THAT WE COME BACK  
16 IN THE MORNING AND DO CLOSINGS?

17 MR. LACKEY: EVEN IF WE WANT TO START EARLIER, I  
18 THINK THAT WOULD BE MORE FUNDAMENTALLY FAIR TO EACH OF  
19 OUR CLIENTS SINCE THE STATE DOES GET LAST CLOSE AND  
20 THEY'D HAVE OVERNIGHT WHEREVER WE BROKE IT IF A COUPLE  
21 OF US HAD TO ARGUE.

22 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. MS. ULLMAN?

23 MS. ULLMAN: I AGREE COMPLETELY. IT'S OBVIOUS TO  
24 ME, BASED ON TIME, THE STATE WOULD GO THE FIRST TIME  
25 LIKE THEY DID TO, MAYBE MR. LACKEY AND I WOULD GO AND

1 THEN THEY WOULD HAVE ALL NIGHT TO DEVELOP THEIR  
2 RESPONSE TO US, AND THE OTHER ATTORNEYS WOULD GET TO  
3 GO TOMORROW, BUT CERTAINLY, THE LAST TIME THE JURY  
4 WOULD HEAR ME SPEAK ON BEHALF OF RALPH COLEMAN WOULD  
5 BE TODAY, AND I CERTAINLY THINK THAT'S UNFAIR.

6 THE COURT; OKAY. MR. PALMER?

7 MR. PALMER: AGREED, YOUR HONOR.

8 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD?

9 MR. MELLARD: YES, I THINK WE NEED TO START  
10 TOMORROW MORNING, YOUR HONOR.

11 THE COURT; OKAY. MR. KOGER?

12 MR. KOGER: I AGREE, YOUR HONOR.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MR. PASCOE?

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I'LL DO WHATEVER YOUR HONOR  
15 WANTS TO DO.

16 THE COURT; OKAY. ALRIGHT. I DON'T HAVE ANY  
17 HOPE THAT ANYBODY IS GOING TO BE SHORT WINDED IN THEIR  
18 CLOSINGS, SO I WILL, WE WILL START BACK IN THE  
19 MORNING. LET'S GET THE JURY BACK OUT THERE. I'LL LET  
20 EACH ONE OF Y'ALL REST AND THEN I'LL EXCUSE THE JURY  
21 FOR THE DAY. I'M NOT GOING TO TELL THEM TO COME BACK  
22 ANY EARLIER THAN NINE, AND WE'LL JUST START AT NINE.  
23 OKAY?

24 ALRIGHT, ANYTHING ELSE BEFORE I BRING THE JURY  
25 BACK OUT?

1           SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, SIR.

2           MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

3           THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU. IF YOU'LL BRING  
4 THE JURY ON BACK OUT.

5           (Whereupon, the jury enters  
6 the courtroom and the following  
7 takes place in the presence  
8 of the jury.)

9           THE COURT: ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I  
10 APPRECIATE YOUR PATIENCE. RIGHT NOW WE ARE READY TO  
11 PROCEED WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THIS TRIAL.

12           MR. LACKEY.

13           MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME ON BEHALF  
14 OF MY CLIENT, MR. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, THE DEFENSE WOULD  
15 REST.

16           THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR.

17           MS. ULLMAN.

18           MS. ULLMAN: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. ON BEHALF OF  
19 RALPH COLEMAN THE DEFENSE RESTS.

20           THE COURT: OKAY. MR. PALMER.

21           MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. ON BEHALF OF  
22 WALTER LEE HARRIS, THE DEFENSE RESTS.

23           THE COURT: OKAY. AND MR. MELLARD.

24           MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR. ON BEHALF OF THE  
25 DEFENDANT, DANNY RYANT, THE DEFENSE RESTS.

1           THE COURT: ALRIGHT. AND MR. KOGER.

2           MR. KOGER: YOUR HONOR, ON BEHALF OF MARIO  
3 SHIVERS THE DEFENSE RESTS.

4           THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.

5           ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WHAT YOU HAVE NOW  
6 HEARD IS THAT THE DEFENDANTS HAVE RESTED ON THE  
7 TESTIMONY THAT IS BEFORE YOU. OKAY? WHAT WE HAVE TO  
8 DO NOW IS GO FORWARD AND DO THE CLOSING ARGUMENTS AND  
9 I NEED TO CHARGE YOU WITH THE LAW. OKAY? IT IS NOW  
10 NEARLY THREE O'CLOCK IN THE AFTERNOON. Y'ALL HAVE  
11 BEEN WITH ME ALL WEEK, Y'ALL HAVE A GOOD IDEA, I GUESS  
12 YOU HAVE A GOOD GUESS THAT THE ATTORNEYS AND THE COURT  
13 HAVE A LOT TO SAY, TO ADVISE YOU ABOUT AT THE END OF  
14 TRIAL, AND SINCE IT IS LATE IN THE AFTERNOON AND I  
15 DON'T WANT TO KEEP Y'ALL INTO THE EVENING WITH THE  
16 CLOSINGS AND THEN TO BEGIN YOUR DELIBERATIONS, WHAT  
17 I'M GOING TO ALLOW Y'ALL TO DO IS GO HOME EARLY, COME  
18 BACK HERE AT NINE O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING. WHEN YOU  
19 GET BACK HERE AT NINE O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING WE WILL  
20 BEGIN IMMEDIATELY WITH THE CLOSING ARGUMENTS OF THE  
21 ATTORNEYS, AND THEN I WILL CHARGE YOU WITH THE LAW,  
22 AND THEN AND ONLY THEN WILL YOU BE TOLD THAT YOU CAN  
23 BEGIN TALK ABOUT THIS CASE AMONG YOURSELVES AND BEGIN  
24 YOUR DELIBERATIONS.

25           NOW, AGAIN, I AM GOING TO EXCUSE YOU FOR THE REST

1 OF THE AFTERNOON AND I ASK YOU TO BE BACK IN THE JURY  
2 ROOM AT NINE O'CLOCK. REMEMBER, YOU CAN'T TALK ABOUT  
3 IT, YOU HAVE NOT HEARD THE CLOSING ARGUMENTS OR MY  
4 INSTRUCTIONS ON THE LAW SO YOU CANNOT TALK ABOUT THIS  
5 CASE AMONG YOURSELVES OR TO ANYONE. AGAIN, YOU CANNOT  
6 READ ANYTHING IN THE PAPER, LISTEN TO ANYTHING ON T.V.  
7 OR THE INTERNET OR THE RADIO ABOUT THIS CASE. AND  
8 AGAIN, I APPRECIATE Y'ALL'S ATTENTION THAT YOU HAVE  
9 GIVEN TO ALL THE WITNESS AND THE ATTORNEYS IN THIS  
10 MATTER, AND WE WILL BE BACK HERE TOMORROW SO WE CAN  
11 FINALIZE THIS. OKAY? THANK Y'ALL SO MUCH AND Y'ALL  
12 ARE NOW EXCUSED FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE AFTERNOON.

13 (Whereupon, the jury leaves  
14 the courtroom for the day  
15 and the following takes place  
16 out of the presence of the  
17 jury.)

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, WE'LL TAKE A SHORT BREAK,  
19 LET THE COURTROOM CLEAR, AND THEN, YOU KNOW, WE'LL  
20 COME BACK AND GO OVER THE CHARGES AND ALL LIKE THAT.  
21 OKAY? THANK Y'ALL.

22 (Recess)

23 THE COURT: MS. HARRY DOT, ARE YOU READY?

24 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

25 THE COURT: OKAY. LET ME GO THROUGH, I THINK, I

1 DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS GOING TO BE THE WAY TO DO IT OR  
2 NOT, BUT THIS IS GOING TO BE, WE'LL AT LEAST START  
3 THIS WAY. I'M GOING TO GO THROUGH WHAT MY USUAL, WHAT  
4 I SEE, CHARGES FOR, I THINK -- Y'ALL HAVE EXCHANGED  
5 CHARGES?

6 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. Y'ALL KNOW WHAT EACH ONE OF YOU  
8 HAS? OKAY. YOU KNOW, I START OFF WITH THE FACT THAT  
9 INDICTMENT IS NOT EVIDENCE. I DO THE CHARGE ON  
10 MULTIPLE CHARGES, YOU'VE GOT, EACH ONE IS SEPARATE AND  
11 DISTINCT. I'M GOING OVER THE MULTIPLE DEFENDANTS  
12 CHARGE AND THAT SAYS THAT, YOU KNOW, YOU CAN FIND ONE  
13 GUILTY OR ONE INNOCENT, YOU KNOW, TRY AND SEPARATE --  
14 YEAH, EVERYBODY IS HERE. OKAY. TRY AND SEPARATE IT  
15 OUT. I GO OVER THE PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE, THAT'S  
16 THE ONE, BECAUSE I CAN'T FIND ANYTHING ELSE I LIKE I'M  
17 STILL DOING THAT ROBE OF RIGHTEOUSNESS THAT YOU  
18 MENTIONED WHICH I STILL DISLIKE THAT PHRASE TO NO END,  
19 BUT I HAVEN'T FOUND ANOTHER WAY TO DESCRIBE IT, SO I'M  
20 STILL DESCRIBING IT THAT WAY.

21 MR. LACKEY: I THINK I USE THE CLOAK RATHER THAN  
22 ROBE.

23 THE COURT: WELL, IF YOU'LL SAY CLOAK AND I'LL  
24 SAY ROBE I'LL FEEL MUCH BETTER. OKAY. THEN I'LL DO  
25 BOTH REASONABLE DOUBTS, I DO THE SHORT ONE AND THE

1 LONG ONE, BECAUSE SOME SIDES WANT IT LONG, SOME WANT  
2 IT SHORT, SO I DO IT BOTH. OKAY? I GO OVER THE  
3 DUTIES OF THE TRIAL JUDGE AND THE JURY, DIRECT AND  
4 CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE, CREDIBILITY OF WITNESSES.  
5 SINCE WE HAD AN EXPERT WITNESS I WILL GIVE AN EXPERT  
6 WITNESS CHARGE, THE FAILURE OF THE DEFENDANTS TO  
7 TESTIFY THE FACT THAT THEY CANNOT EVEN BE DISCUSSED IN  
8 THE JURY ROOM. THE HAND OF ONE IS THE HAND OF ALL,  
9 IN THAT REGARD, SOLICITOR SORENSON, YOU HANDED ME YOUR  
10 HAND OF ONE, YOUR REQUEST TO CHARGE NUMBER FIVE?

11 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

12 THE COURT: MINE, THAT'S INCLUDED IN MINE, MY  
13 HAND OF ONE, HAND OF ALL IS THE LONGEST.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THE WAY I'VE GOT IT,  
15 ACTUALLY, SOME JUDGES CHARGE IT THAT WAY.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. I'VE GOT -- I HAVE A CHARGE --  
17 I'M GOING TO CHARGE IDENTIFICATION, YOU KNOW, INTENT,  
18 ARMED ROBBERY, FIRST DEGREE BURGLARY, AND MURDER, AND  
19 I USUALLY LEAVE OUT -- WELL, NOT USUALLY LEAVE OUT,  
20 BUT WHEN I'M GOING THROUGH, THE MALICE CAN BE INFERRED  
21 BY THE USE OF A DEADLY WEAPON, I DON'T MENTION A DIRK.  
22 EVEN THOUGH I KNOW IT'S IN THERE, I USUALLY LEAVE DIRK  
23 OUT BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW IF ANYBODY KNOWS WHAT IT IS  
24 ON THE JURY. I DOUBT THAT TOO MANY PEOPLE IN THIS ROOM  
25 KNOW WHAT A DIRK IS, YOU KNOW, BUT, SO I LEAVE THAT

1 OUT UNLESS SOMEBODY REALLY WANTS ME TO MENTION IT. YOU  
2 KNOW, I CAN SEE THE LOOK. OKAY.

3 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I THINK TO ACCURATELY STATE  
4 THE LAW, YOUR HONOR.

5 THE COURT: SIR?

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: TO ACCURATELY STATE THE LAW.

7 THE COURT: SURE. OKAY. LET'S SEE, Y'ALL HAVE  
8 LOOKED -- LET'S SEE, MS. ULLMAN, YOU GAVE ME THE BASIC  
9 CHARGE.

10 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, MY ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY  
11 AND THEN THE CASE I GAVE YOU WHICH ACTUALLY HAS TWO  
12 SEPARATE POINTS OF LAW IN IT THAT I WAS RELYING UPON.  
13 THEY'RE BOTH RELATED TO IDENTIFICATION TESTIMONY, BUT  
14 ONE IS IN RELATION TO AN INFORMER IDENTIFICATION  
15 TESTIMONY, AND THEN THE OTHER IS IN RELATION TO EYE  
16 WITNESS IDENTIFICATION WHEN THERE'S BEEN TESTIMONY  
17 THAT IT IS NOT A - - -

18 THE COURT: OKAY, YOUR ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY  
19 CHARGE?

20 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

21 THE COURT: OKAY. AND I THINK -- YOU DON'T HAVE  
22 YOURS NUMBERED. YOU SAID, ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY, BUT  
23 MR. SORENSON, YOU HAVE ONE THAT SAYS, IF TWO OR MORE  
24 PEOPLE ACT TOGETHER TO COMMIT AN UNLAWFUL ACT, IS YOUR  
25 CHARGE, THAT'S YOUR FIRST CHARGE?

1           SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

2           THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, OKAY, I DON'T HAVE  
3 ANY PROBLEMS WITH CHARGING BOTH OF THESE. I'LL CHARGE  
4 YOUR NUMBER ONE, AND FOLLOW IT UP WITH HER ONE  
5 SENTENCE THING ABOUT ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY, I'LL PUT  
6 THOSE BOTH TOGETHER.

7           SOLICITOR PASCOE: I DON'T THINK WE HAVE ANY  
8 OBJECTION TO THAT, BUT I MEAN, WE'D JUST KIND OF LOOK  
9 STATE VERSUS PETERSON TO SEE WHAT CONTEXT THAT IS IN.

10          THE COURT: YEAH, AND I'M GOING TO DOUBLE CHECK,  
11 I'M GOING TO DOUBLE CHECK BOTH OF THESE CITES JUST TO  
12 MAKE SURE MYSELF, BUT ON MY INITIAL READING OF IT,  
13 SINCE I KNOW Y'ALL WANT SOME KIND OF AN IDEA. OKAY?

14          SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

15          THE COURT: YOUR REQUEST NUMBER TWO, VOLUNTARY  
16 INTOXICATION OR USE OF DRUGS DOES NOT CONSTITUTE A  
17 DEFENSE FOR A CRIME. I DON'T KNOW THAT THERE WAS ANY  
18 EVIDENCE -- TELL ME - - -

19          SOLICITOR PASCOE: OH, YEAH, THERE'S TESTIMONY  
20 THROUGHOUT THE TRIAL THAT THEY WERE SMOKING MARIJUANA,  
21 YOUR HONOR, THAT MARIO SHIVERS WAS SMOKING MARIJUANA,  
22 PATRICK TYLER WAS SMOKING MARIJUANA WITH THEM, RALPH  
23 COLEMAN, SO THAT - - -

24          THE COURT: OKAY. OH, YEAH, THAT'S RIGHT, THEY  
25 HAD BEEN. OKAY, WELL, LET ME CHECK THAT, AND I'LL

1 READ THAT CASE AS WELL, YOU KNOW, JUST TO BE ON THE  
2 SAFE SIDE.

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

4 THE COURT: THE -- AND YOU'VE GOT CHARGES THREE  
5 AND FOUR LOOK FINE. OKAY?

6 OKAY. WITH REGARD TO -- LET ME SEE, LET ME GO  
7 THROUGH THE BASIC CHARGE. OKAY, MS. ULLMAN, I GO  
8 THROUGH THE FACT THEY PLED NOT GUILTY, I DON'T -- AND  
9 TOWARD THE END OF IT I REMIND EVERYBODY, SOLE JUDGES  
10 OF THE FACTS, CREDIBILITY OF THE WITNESSES. I'VE GOT,  
11 I'VE GOT PRETTY MUCH EVERYTHING IN YOUR BASIC CHARGE  
12 IN MY CHARGES SO, REASONABLE DOUBT, I'VE ALREADY SAID  
13 I'M CHARGING BOTH THE LONG AND THE SHORT. I'VE GOT MY  
14 PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE THING. I'M GOING OVER THE  
15 FACT THAT THEY CAN'T INFER ANYTHING ABOUT THE  
16 DEFENDANTS NOT TAKING THE STAND, THEY CAN'T EVEN TALK  
17 ABOUT THE DEFENDANTS NOT TAKING THE STAND. LET'S SEE  
18 -- I THINK I ALREADY TOLD Y'ALL I'M CHARGING CRIMINAL  
19 INTENT, DIDN'T I?

20 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

21 THE COURT: OKAY. THE, AT THE END OF THE CASE I  
22 REMIND EVERY ONE OF THEM THAT IT IS EACH AND EVERY ONE  
23 OF THEM, UNANIMITY OF VERDICT, I REMIND THEM OF THAT.  
24 MY MURDER CHARGE IS ABOUT THE SAME, IT'S THE STANDARD  
25 MURDER CHARGE.

1           NOW, MERE PRESENCE, YOU HAVE MERE PRESENCE.  
2           WELL, I'M NOT GOING TO USE, I WON'T USE YOUR LONG -- I  
3           HAVE A SHORTER ONE THAT JUST REMINDS THE, IT JUST SAYS  
4           THAT IT'S NOT -- PRESENCE AT THE SCENE IS NOT  
5           SUFFICIENT TO PROVE SOMEONE GUILTY OF IT. MERE  
6           ASSOCIATION WITH A PERSON WHO COMMITS A CRIME DOES NOW  
7           MAKE THEM -- AND JUST REMIND EVERYBODY -- AND THEN THE  
8           NEXT PARAGRAPH THAT THE BURDEN IS ON THE STATE TO  
9           PROVE THAT THEY WERE ALL THERE, AND THAT'S WHY WE'VE  
10          GOT THE ACCOMPLICE CHARGE IN THERE LIKE THAT. SO MY,  
11          I'VE GOT A SHORTER MERE PRESENCE CHARGE THAT I WILL  
12          USE.

13                 WHY DO YOU HAVE VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER?

14                 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, WE WOULD ASK THAT YOU  
15                 CHARGE THE JURY ON VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER, I THINK  
16                 WHAT PATRICK TYLER STATED WAS THAT THEY WENT THERE  
17                 INTENDING TO ROB THIS PERSON AND THAT WHILE THEY WERE  
18                 THERE ROBBING HIM THINGS WENT CRAZE AND STUFF JUST  
19                 HAPPENED. YOU KNOW, THAT'S MY - - -

20                 THE COURT: WELL, THAT IS - - -

21                 MS. ULLMAN: --- SYNOPSIS OF WHAT HE SAID.

22                 THE COURT: --- THAT IS THE SYNOPSIS OF WHAT HE  
23                 SAID.

24                 MS. ULLMAN: I THINK THE JURY COULD FIND THAT  
25                 THERE WAS NO MALICE AND THAT IN THE HEAT OF PASSION IT

1 HAPPENED.

2 THE COURT: SO, YOU WANT ME TO MAKE THAT AN  
3 OPTION ON THE VERDICT FORM, VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER?

4 MS. ULLMAN: WELL, TO BE QUITE HONEST, YOUR  
5 HONOR, I KIND OF THINK AT THIS POINT MAYBE WE SHOULD  
6 DISCUSS THAT SINCE WE KIND OF ALL ARE SITTING IN THE  
7 SAME BOAT AND WE'VE HAD TO DISCUSS OTHER THINGS.

8 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT -- YES?

9 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AND OF COURSE, I'M GOING TO  
10 OBJECT, BECAUSE IF THEY HAD FOUND THEM GUILTY OF  
11 VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER IT'S GOING TO GET THROWN OUT.  
12 THERE'S NO EVIDENCE OF LEGAL PROVOCATION, HEAT OF  
13 PASSION. YOU WILL NEVER FIND A CASE IN THE HISTORY OF  
14 SOUTH CAROLINA WHERE A HOME INVASION WAS A VOLUNTARY  
15 MANSLAUGHTER.

16 THE COURT: WELL, LET ME -- OH, YEAH, I MEAN, I'M  
17 SORRY, I'M JUST READING OVER THE CHARGE. I SEE, HEAT  
18 OF PASSION WILL NOT SUFFICE. WHAT'S THE SUFFICIENT  
19 LEGAL PROVOCATION IN THIS ONE?

20 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, I WOULD SIMPLY SAY THAT  
21 IF THE JURY COULDN'T FIND THE MALICE THEN THEY MIGHT  
22 FIND THAT IN THE HEAT OF PASSION. THERE'S TESTIMONY  
23 THAT WHEN - - -

24 THE COURT: IF THEY DON'T FIND THE MALICE THEY  
25 MIGHT FIND THEM NOT GUILTY OF MURDER.

1           MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

2           THE COURT: OKAY. SO, I'M NOT GOING TO CHARGE  
3 VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER. OKAY?

4           OBJECTIONS.

5           MR. PALMER: EXCUSE ME, YOUR HONOR, ONE MOMENT.

6           THE COURT: OKAY. YOU'VE GOT A CHARGE ABOUT  
7 OBJECTIONS. YOU KNOW, MY CHARGE IS GOING TO BE LONG  
8 ENOUGH WITHOUT GOING INTO THAT. I DON'T THINK THAT  
9 THERE IS ANYTHING IN HERE TO MAKE ME THINK THAT, YOU  
10 KNOW, WE NEED TO SAY ANYTHING ABOUT OBJECTING IN THE  
11 CHARGE. I'M JUST CHARGING THEM ON THE LAW SO THEY CAN  
12 MAKE A DETERMINATION ABOUT WHETHER THEY'RE GOING TO  
13 FIND SOMEBODY GUILTY OR NOT. SO, DID YOU MAKE A COPY  
14 OF THIS AND GIVE IT TO - - -

15           MR. PALMER: I HAVE, YOUR HONOR, YES.

16           THE COURT: ALRIGHT. OKAY, I'VE GOT MY EXPERT  
17 WITNESS AND I'VE GOT IDENTIFICATION. I'VE ALREADY GOT  
18 THOSE CHARGES. OKAY. AND THEN, WHAT WAS THE -- MS.  
19 ULLMAN, WHAT DID YOU -- I'VE GOT YOUR -- OKAY.

20           MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, THE U.S. VERSUS BROOKS  
21 CASE THAT I'VE HANDED TO YOU ACTUALLY CITES THE CASE  
22 OF U.S. VERSUS TELFARE, I BELIEVE IS HOW IT'S SAID,  
23 AND VERY BRIEFLY, BASICALLY, THAT STATES THAT WHEN  
24 THERE IS EVIDENCE THAT AN EYE WITNESS HAS MADE AN  
25 IDENTIFICATION, THAT EYE IDENTIFICATION IS CERTAINLY

1 NOT CERTAIN, WHICH MS. PARSLEY IN REGARDS TO RALPH  
2 COLEMAN ABSOLUTELY STATED THAT SHE IS NOT SURE, SHE  
3 COULDN'T BE SURE, IT'S POSSIBLE IT WASN'T HIM, THAT  
4 THERE BE A SPECIAL INSTRUCTION GIVEN TO THE JURY THAT  
5 STATES, I BELIEVE THE INSTRUCTION IS IN THERE, BUT IT  
6 BASICALLY IS A CAUTIONARY INSTRUCTION STATING THAT  
7 JUST BECAUSE SHE PICKS THAT PICTURE DOESN'T GUARANTEE  
8 THAT PERSON WAS THERE, THEY NEED TO PAY ATTENTION TO  
9 WHAT SHE SAID ABOUT HER ABILITY TO SEE, HER ABILITY TO  
10 PERCEIVE WHAT IT IS THAT SHE IDENTIFIED.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. MY CHARGE ON IDENTIFICATION  
12 SAYS THAT IDENTIFICATION TESTIMONY IS EXPRESSION OF  
13 BELIEF OR AN IMPRESSION BY A WITNESS, AND IT GOES ON  
14 DOWN TO SAY, YOU MAY CONSIDER WHETHER A WITNESS HAD AN  
15 ADEQUATE TO OBSERVE THE OFFENDER. THIS WOULD BE  
16 AFFECTED BY THINGS, ABOUT HOW LONG OR SHORT A TIME IS  
17 AVAILABLE, HOW FAR OR CLOSE, LIGHTING CONDITIONS,  
18 WHETHER THEY HAD A CHANCE TO SEE OR KNOW THE PERSON IN  
19 THE PAST. ONCE AGAIN, I INSTRUCT YOU, THE BURDEN IS  
20 ON THE STATE. OKAY? SO, I THINK THAT'S INCLUDED IN  
21 MY GENERAL INSTRUCTION.

22 MS. ULLMAN: JUST FOR THE RECORD, I NOTE THE  
23 TELFARE INSTRUCTION.

24 THE COURT: MA'AM?

25 MS. ULLMAN: THE RECORD CALLS IT A TELFARE

1 INSTRUCTION, A CAUTIONARY INSTRUCTION UNDER THE  
2 TELFARE CASE.

3 THE COURT: WELL, THE REQUIREMENT OF A CAUTIONARY  
4 INSTRUCTION, IT SAYS, "THE CAUTIONARY INSTRUCTION OF  
5 IDENTIFICATION IS NOT AN ABSOLUTE RULE BUT IT'S A  
6 FLEXIBLE ONE TO BE APPLIED IN CONNECTION WITH THE  
7 FACTS IN A PARTICULAR CASE UNDER REVIEW." IN MY  
8 INSTRUCTIONS I'M GOING TO TELL THEM TO PAY ATTENTION  
9 TO WHAT THEY SAID, HOW FAR OR CLOSE, LIGHTING  
10 CONDITIONS IS SOMETHING THAT Y'ALL HAVE MADE A BIG  
11 ISSUE ABOUT, AND I'M CHARGING THEM ON THAT. I MEAN,  
12 ISN'T THAT WHAT - - -

13 MS. ULLMAN: WHAT I MEANT SIR, WAS - - -

14 THE COURT: OH, I'M SORRY, I MUST BE MISSING THE  
15 WHOLE POINT.

16 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR, THE CASE, I BELIEVE IN A,  
17 I WANT TO SAY, FOOTNOTE ACTUALLY GAVE THE EXACT  
18 INSTRUCTION. THE FOOTNOTE MAY NOT BE THERE NOW THAT  
19 I'M THINKING ABOUT THIS, I MAY HAVE TO RUN DOWNSTAIRS  
20 TO GET IT FOR YOU, BUT THE POINT OF WHAT I'M GETTING  
21 AT IS, I UNDERSTAND YOUR INSTRUCTION TALKS ABOUT THE  
22 LIGHTING AND ALL OF THAT. THE TELFARE INSTRUCTION  
23 ITSELF IS ACTUALLY A SPECIALLY CAUTIONARY INSTRUCTION  
24 THAT JUDGES CHOOSE TO GIVE AT CERTAIN POINTS, AND I  
25 UNDERSTAND THAT CASE THAT I GAVE YOU IS A FOURTH

1           CIRCUIT CASE SAYING THAT IT IS NOT A -- IT IS A  
2           FLEXIBLE RULE IN THE JUDGE'S DISCRETION. I'M NOT  
3           SAYING YOU HAVE TO GIVE IT, I'M JUST ASKING, AND  
4           AGAIN, I MAY NOT HAVE THE ACTUAL INSTRUCTION FOR YOU,  
5           I AN GRAB IT IN ABOUT TWO MINUTES, BUT THE TELFARE  
6           INSTRUCTION I'M SPEAKING OF IS AN ACTUAL SPECIAL  
7           CAUTIONARY INSTRUCTION ASIDE FROM THE NORMAL EYE  
8           WITNESS IDENTIFICATION INSTRUCTION THAT'S GIVEN THAT  
9           STATES, LOOK AT THE LIGHTING, LOOK AT THE DISTANCE,  
10          THINGS OF THAT NATURE.

11           THE COURT; OKAY. WELL, I'LL LET YOU -- SINCE I  
12          MUST BE MISSING IT - - -

13           MS. ULLMAN: I'M THINKING I HAD TO PULL IT IN A  
14          DIFFERENT CASE BECAUSE I COULDN'T GET THE FOOTNOTE,  
15          AND I FORGOT TO BRING THAT CASE OVER HERE, BUT I CAN  
16          GET IT FROM MY OFFICE IN ABOUT A MINUTE.

17           THE COURT: AND MAYBE I'M JUST MISSING IT IN  
18          HERE, BUT IF YOU'LL BRING IT TO MY ATTENTION I'LL LOOK  
19          BACK OVER IT. OKAY?

20           MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR. THE FURTHER INSTRUCTION,  
21          YOUR HONOR, IS THE INFORMER'S IDENTIFICATION  
22          INSTRUCTION, AND IT'S ALSO STATED IN THAT BROOKS CASE  
23          THAT I HANDED YOU. AND I THINK IT'S ACTUALLY STATED IN  
24          THE BROOKS CASE CLOSE TO THE LAST PAGE, IT'S KIND OF  
25          INDENTED UPON ITSELF, AND BASICALLY, THAT INSTRUCTION

1 STATES THAT WHEN A PARTICIPANT IN THE ACT PRESENTS EYE  
2 WITNESS IDENTIFICATION ABOUT WHO PARTICIPATED, A  
3 CAUTIONARY INSTRUCTION CAN BE GIVEN IF THAT PERSON HAS  
4 BEEN PAID FOR THEIR TESTIMONY OF IF THEY'VE RECEIVED  
5 IMMUNITY FOR THEIR TESTIMONY, WHICH THEY HAVE NOT - -

6 -  
7 THE COURT: RIGHT.

8 MS. ULLMAN: --- OF IF THEY'VE RECEIVED ANY SORT  
9 OF PERSONAL BENEFIT. I UNDERSTAND THERE HAS BEEN NO  
10 PROMISE REGARDING SENTENCING, AND OUTSIDE OF THE  
11 JURY'S PRESENCE, I CERTAINLY CAN SAY, PLEADING TO  
12 VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER GIVES A PERSON A BENEFIT. I  
13 MEAN, THE IDEA OF HIM COMING IN HERE AND TESTIFYING  
14 AND GETTING LIFE WITHOUT PAROLE IS PRETTY ABSURD. SO,  
15 THE REALITY IS, HE'S GOING TO GET SOME SORT OF  
16 SENTENCE THAT EVERYBODY IN THIS COURT KNOWS HE WILL  
17 SERVE EIGHTY-FIVE PER CENT OF, AND NOT DAY FOR DAY FOR  
18 MURDER. SO, CERTAINLY, HIS TESTIMONY HAS PROVIDED A  
19 BENEFIT TO HIM. EVEN IF HE DOESN'T UNDERSTAND THAT,  
20 WE ALL UNDERSTAND THAT. HE HAS CERTAINLY BEEN  
21 PROVIDED A BENEFIT, AND I BELIEVE THAT THE CAUTIONARY  
22 INSTRUCTION REGARDING AN INFORMER'S TESTIMONY SHOULD  
23 ALSO BE GIVEN.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. YOU KNOW, I KNOW THAT EACH ONE  
25 OF Y'ALL, EACH AND EVERY ONE OF Y'ALL, WHEN YOU STAND

1 UP AND DO YOUR CLOSING ARGUMENTS IS GOING TO MAKE SOME  
2 COMMENT ABOUT THAT, OR I WILL BE STUNNED, YOU KNOW,  
3 BUT THE WAY THIS READS IS, IT SAYS, -- THIS IS FOR AN  
4 INFORMER, THIS IS A CO-DEFENDANT. I UNDERSTAND YOU  
5 WANT TO SAY HE'S AN INFORMER BECAUSE HE SQUEALED, YOU  
6 KNOW, AND SO, I DON'T SEE, -- GIVEN THAT, BUT ASIDE  
7 FROM THAT, THE EXAMPLE, IT SAYS, "TESTIMONY OF AN  
8 INFORMANT WHO PROVIDES EVIDENCE AGAINST A DEFENDANT  
9 FOR PAY OR FOR IMMUNITY FROM PUNISHMENT, OR FOR A  
10 PERSONAL ADVANTAGE OR VINDICATION MUST BE EXAMINED AND  
11 WEIGHED BY THE JURY." OKAY. EVERYTHING THAT I CAN  
12 SEE IS, OKAY, HE HASN'T BEEN PAID. OKAY. HE'S NOT  
13 GETTING ANY IMMUNITY FROM PUNISHMENT, AND I --  
14 PERSONAL ADVANTAGE OR VINDICATION, I DON'T KNOW  
15 EXACTLY WHAT THAT MEANS, I'D HAVE TO READ IT, BUT THAT  
16 SOUNDS MORE LIKE SOME PERSONAL VENDETTA THAT HE WOULD  
17 HAVE AGAINST SOMEBODY ELSE. I REALIZE WHAT YOU'RE  
18 SAYING, HE'S ALLOWED TO PLEAD TO, WHAT, VOLUNTARY?

19 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

20 THE COURT: BUT THAT'S NOT, IT'S NOT IMMUNITY  
21 FROM PUNISHMENT. HE'S STILL GOT TO WORRY ABOUT  
22 WHATEVER SOME CRAZY JUDGE IS GOING TO DO, YOU KNOW.  
23 SO, YOU CAN BRING ME THAT TELFARE THING BUT I'M - - -

24 MS. ULLMAN: I'M GETTING IT RIGHT NOW.

25 THE COURT: OKAY. IF YOU'LL DO THAT. OKAY. SO,

1 IS THERE ANYTHING THAT Y'ALL, ANYTHING ELSE THAT Y'ALL  
2 THINK -- MR. PALMER? OH, YEAH, YOUR WITHDRAWAL,  
3 EXCUSE ME.

4 MS. PALMER: AND YOUR HONOR, I, QUITE CANDIDLY, I  
5 HAD HOPED THAT MY CLIENT WOULD WANT TO TESTIFY,  
6 BECAUSE I THINK THAT WOULD MAKE HIS DEFENSE WITH  
7 REGARD TO WITHDRAWAL EVEN STRONGER, BUT I THINK AS IT  
8 STANDS THERE'S STILL SOME EVIDENCE IN THE RECORD, EVEN  
9 FROM THE STATE'S PRINCIPLE WITNESS THAT MY CLIENT, YOU  
10 KNOW, HAD A CHANGE OF HEART, HANDED OVER HIS GUN, AND  
11 AT LEAST TRIED TO WITHDRAW FROM THE SITUATION. OF  
12 COURSE, A LOT OF IT DEPENDS ON HOW CREDIBLE THE JURY  
13 FINDS PATRICK TYLER IN DIFFERENT PARTS OF HIS  
14 STATEMENT TO BE, BUT I DO THINK THERE IS ENOUGH  
15 FACTUAL MATTER IN THE EVIDENCE TO SUPPORT THAT CHARGE,  
16 AND I SURE WOULD LIKE TO MAKE THE ARGUMENT.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. WELL, YOU'RE MAKING THE  
18 ARGUMENT NOW, I MEAN, TO ME.

19 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

20 THE COURT: BUT IT SAYS, "WITHDRAWAL MAY BE SHOWN  
21 IF HE WITHDREW ENTIRELY FROM THE ENTERPRISE." THAT'S  
22 ONE THING. SO, WE KNOW THAT'S NOT TRUE.

23 MR. PALMER: I GUESS IT DEPENDS ON WHETHER THEY  
24 BELIEVE TYLER, BECAUSE HE SAYS THAT HE CAME BACK WITH  
25 DUCT TAPE.

1           THE COURT: WELL, YOU KNOW, WITHDRAWAL IS BEFORE  
2 SOME ACT IN FURTHERANCE. I MEAN, THIS WHOLE CASE IS  
3 GOING TO DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT THEY BELIEVE P.T.,  
4 YOU KNOW, THAT'S WHERE WE ARE WITH THIS. I DON'T KNOW  
5 THAT I -- I MEAN, I'M LOOKING OVER THE DIFFERENT  
6 CHARGES, I MEAN, THE DIFFERENT ELEMENTS OF WITHDRAWAL,  
7 AND THE ONLY ONE I SEE THAT EVEN MAY BE ARGUMENT IS  
8 THE SECOND, NUMBER TWO, WHICH IT'S GOT FOUR DIFFERENT  
9 THINGS, IT'S GOT ONE, TWO, TWO AND THREE.

10           MR. PALMER: IT'S SUPPOSED TO BE FOUR OF THEM.

11           THE COURT: I KNOW, IT SOUNDS LIKE SOMETHING I  
12 WOULD BE DRAWING UP, SO I WAS IMPRESSED WITH THAT.  
13 BUT ANYWAY, IT SAYS, "THERE WAS AN AFFIRMATIVE ACT BY  
14 THE DEFENDANT SUCH AS VOICING WITHDRAWAL WHICH  
15 ANNOUNCED WITHDRAWAL TO THE OTHERS INVOLVED IN THE  
16 CRIME." NOW, I DO REMEMBER P.T. SAYING SOMETHING TO  
17 THE EFFECT THAT YOUR CLIENT SAID, HE KNOWS SOMEBODY  
18 THERE, AND LET'S GO. AND I, AND - - -

19           MR. PALMER: AND THAT'S WHEN THEY WENT AND GOT  
20 THE OTHER GUNMAN.

21           THE COURT: YEAH. NOW, I, I'M, I WILL LOOK OVER  
22 THAT CASE JUST TO SEE, THAT STATE VERSUS WALTER LEE  
23 HARRIS, I MEAN, -- I THOUGHT YOU HAD A CITE UP THERE,  
24 I'M SORRY, STATE VERSUS WALTER LEE HARRIS, EXCUSE ME.

25           MR. PALMER: IT'S KIND OF ROUGH SHOD CAPTION.

1           THE COURT: THANK YOU, THANK YOU. UNLESS YOU'VE  
2 GOT -- UNLESS YOU CAN FIND ME A CASE THAT WOULD LEAD  
3 ME -- WELL, THERE'S ONE DOWN HERE STATE V. VANG, LET  
4 ME LOOK AT THAT ONE, TWO THOUSAND THREE. RIGHT NOW I  
5 WANT TO TELL YOU THAT IT'S NOT LOOKING GOOD. OKAY?

6           MR. PALMER: AND YOUR HONOR, JUST TO SHIFT GEARS  
7 FOR JUST A SECOND - - -

8           THE COURT: SURE.

9           MR. PALMER: --- AND GO BACK TO THE -- THE FACT  
10 THAT MR. TYLER TESTIFIED AND HE'S GETTING A DEAL AND  
11 THAT SORT OF THING, I MEAN, YOU SAID THAT YOU WOULD BE  
12 SURPRISED IF WE DIDN'T ALL GET INTO THAT, BUT JUST FOR  
13 MY -- SO I DON'T STEP IN IT, HOW FAR CAN WE GO WITH  
14 THAT?

15           THE COURT: WELL, ACTUALLY, I DON'T HAVE -- IT'S  
16 HARD FOR ME TO TELL Y'ALL HOW FAR TO GO, BECAUSE  
17 THAT'S NOT MY JOB. I JUST FIGURED Y'ALL WERE GOING TO  
18 MENTION -- I FIGURED Y'ALL WERE JUST GOING TO MENTION  
19 THE FACT, HE IS GETTING THIS AND HE'S HERE, AND YOU'LL  
20 NOTICE, LIKE MR. LACKEY SAID, HE'S THE ONLY ONE THAT  
21 DIDN'T PUT A GUN IN HIS HAND, YOU KNOW, AND GET  
22 WHATEVER IMPLICATION YOU CAN GET OUT OF THAT. BUT - -

23 -

24           SOLICITOR PASCOE: BUT THE ONLY GUIDANCE I WOULD  
25 PROVIDE, YOUR HONOR, WOULD BE, THEY CAN GET INTO WHAT

1 CAME OUT DURING HIS TESTIMONY, THAT INSTEAD OF LOOKING  
2 AT THIRTY TO LIFE, DAY FOR DAY, HE'S LOOKING AT  
3 FIFTEEN TO LIFE, EIGHTY-FIVE PER CENT, WITHOUT PAROLE.

4 MR. PALMER: BUT WE CAN'T - - -

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I'M SORRY, SCOTT, THERE WAS  
6 NOTHING, YOU KNOW, ABOUT INDIVIDUAL CHARGES,  
7 OBVIOUSLY, OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT, JUST THAT THAT'S  
8 WHAT HIS SENTENCE IS.

9 THE COURT: COULD BE.

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: COULD BE, YES, SIR.

11 MR. PALMER: I THINK MY SPECIFIC QUESTION WOULD  
12 BE, WOULD IT BE APPROPRIATE TO ARGUE THAT HE STATED  
13 THAT HE INTENDS TO PLEAD GUILTY TO EACH OF THE CHARGES  
14 THAT HE SAID HE WAS GETTING?

15 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

16 MR. PALMER: OKAY.

17 THE COURT: YEAH, HE SAID THAT.

18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: HE'S GOING TO PLEAD GUILTY TO  
19 THOSE CHARGES.

20 MR. PALMER: OKAY.

21 THE COURT: WHAT ELSE, WHAT ELSE HAVE WE GOT?

22 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, I'VE GOT TELFARE.

23 THE COURT: OH, YOU'VE GOT TELFARE. DID MR.  
24 CHISOLM BRING IT?

25 MS. ULLMAN: HE DID.

1           THE COURT: THAT'S TAINTED, THEN. NEVER MIND,  
2           OKAY.

3           MS. ULLMAN: OKAY. HE WAS DIDN'T WANT ME TO GO  
4           UP AND DOWN THE STAIRS A COUPLE OF TIMES - - -

5           THE COURT: I JUST WANTED YOU TO DO THAT A COUPLE  
6           OF TIMES.

7           MS. ULLMAN: YOU KNOW, IN MY HEELS IT'S  
8           DANGEROUS.

9           THE COURT: LET ME READ THIS OVER AND JUST SEE.  
10          OKAY. BUT SO YOU'LL KNOW, I'M -- YOU KNOW, UNLESS YOU  
11          CAN HAVE MR. CHISOLM ARGUE IT FOR ME, BECAUSE I'VE  
12          ALREADY HEARD FROM YOU AND MR. WISE ENOUGH, SO LET ME  
13          SEE IF MR. CHISOLM HAS A FRESH TASTE ON SOMETHING.  
14          NO, I'LL READ THIS OVER AND I'LL PULL THAT VANG CASE,  
15          AND HAVE Y'ALL HAD A CHANCE TO LOOK AT THE VERDICT  
16          FORM? OH, I'M SORRY.

17          SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, I HAVE, AND THE ONLY  
18          THING I DID SEE WAS JUST A TYPO ON NUMBER TWO,  
19          UNANIMOUSLY.

20          THE COURT: OKAY.

21          MS. ULLMAN: UNANIMOUSLY.

22          THE COURT: OKAY.

23          SOLICITOR PASCOE: I OBJECT TO THE NOT GUILTY  
24          PART OF THESE JURY VERDICT FORMS.

25          MS. ULLMAN: WELL, WE OBJECT TO THE GUILTY PART.

1           SOLICITOR PASCOE: I HAD A JUDGE SHULER ONCE, I  
2 WAS TRYING A CASE, AND HE HAD THE FORMS AND HE MADE A  
3 MISTAKE AND HAD HIM GUILTY, GUILTY, AND I, OF COURSE,  
4 HAD NO OBJECTION TO THAT. JUDGE SHULER MIGHT NOT HAVE  
5 EVEN - - -

6           THE COURT: DO Y'ALL -- WHEN WE DID THE ROMAN  
7 NUMERAL AFTER BURGLARY, YOU WOULD HAVE PUT BURGLARY IN  
8 THE FIRST DEGREE, OR SINCE I'M GOING TO BE CHANGING  
9 THIS ANYWAY, OR - IT SAYS, BURGLARY, ONE.

10          SOLICITOR PASCOE: FIRST DEGREE, YES.

11          MR. LACKEY: I THINK JUST FOR - - -

12          THE COURT: CLARIFICATION.

13          MR. LACKEY: IT WOULD BE PARALLEL TO THE  
14 INDICTMENT, YES, SIR.

15          THE COURT: OKAY. I'LL MAKE THAT CHANGE, AND  
16 HOPEFULLY I'LL SPELL UNANIMOUSLY CORRECTLY NEXT TIME,  
17 SINCE I'M RESPONSIBLE FOR MY LOYAL AND DEVOTED STAFF.  
18 I TOOK RESPONSIBILITY. OKAY.

19          OKAY. ALRIGHT, THANK Y'ALL -- ANYTHING - - -

20          MS. ULLMAN: I HAVE JUST ONE MORE.

21          THE COURT: YES, MA'AM.

22          MS. ULLMAN: I THINK IT'S MORE OF A QUESTION TO  
23 THE STATE.

24          THE COURT: YES, MA'AM.

25          MS. ULLMAN: EVERYBODY HAS HEARD, GOING ON AND ON

1 AND ON ABOUT THE LIGHTS BEING BLACK LIGHTS, THINGS OF  
2 THAT NATURE. I WOULD LIKE TO BRING A BLACK LIGHT IN  
3 TO SHOW THE JURY. I UNDERSTAND THAT I CAN'T SAY THAT'S  
4 THE BLACK LIGHT THAT CAME FROM THE HOUSE, JUST AS MUCH  
5 AS THEY CAN'T SAY THAT THE PICTURE OF THE GUN IS THE  
6 GUN THAT CAME FROM THIS INCIDENT, AND I CERTAINLY --  
7 AND IT'S JUST A MATTER OF, I'D LIKE FOR THEM TO SEE A  
8 BLACK LIGHT. I MEAN, I UNDERSTAND THAT IN MY MIND I  
9 KNOW WHAT A BLACK LIGHT IS, BUT REALISTICALLY, I THINK  
10 MOST PEOPLE COULD PROBABLY SAY, YEAH, I KNOW WHAT A  
11 BLACK LIGHT IS, BUT COULD MOST PEOPLE SAY THAT THEY  
12 UNDERSTAND HOW BRIGHT OR HOW DIM IT REALLY IS. I WOULD  
13 SAY NOT. I WOULD JUST ASK FOR ME TO BE ALLOWED TO  
14 PLUG IN A BLACK LIGHT AND TURN IT ON.

15 THE COURT: WELL, I UNDERSTAND YOUR REQUEST. ARE  
16 YOU THEN ASKING US TO TURN OFF THE LIGHTS IN HERE SO  
17 WE CAN THEN SEE? AND THEN, THE OTHER QUESTION IS,  
18 EVEN THOUGH THEY SAID IT WAS A BLACK LIGHT, OKAY,  
19 NOBODY SAID WHAT THE WATTAGE WAS, AND JUST SO Y'ALL  
20 WILL KNOW, WHEN I WAS IN COLLEGE I HAD A FLORESCENT  
21 BLACK LIGHT THAT WAS REALLY, REALLY BRIGHT, YOU KNOW.  
22 SO, YOU KNOW, -- SO - - -

23 MS. ULLMAN: ACTUALLY, I DO BELIEVE, YOUR HONOR,  
24 THAT ASHLEY PARSLEY TESTIFIED THAT THE WATTAGE OF THE  
25 BULBS IN THE HOUSE WAS SIXTY WATTS.

1           THE COURT: SHE DID?

2           MS. ULLMAN: AND ON TOP OF THAT, YOUR HONOR, I  
3 WOULD NOT ASK THAT WE TURN THE COURTROOM OFF. I MEAN,  
4 I UNDERSTAND WE'VE ALREADY GOT A BUNCH OF SECURITY IN  
5 HERE. TWO THINGS COULD HAPPEN, WE COULD HAVE ONE OF  
6 THE BAILIFFS PUT THE LIGHT IN THE JURY ROOM AND THEY  
7 COULD GO IN THERE AND SEE IT AND COME BACK OUT. OR - -

8 -

9           THE COURT: NO, I'M NOT GOING TO LET THEM - I'M  
10 NOT GOING TO DO THAT.

11          MS. ULLMAN: THERE WAS ONE OTHER SUGGESTION, YOUR  
12 HONOR.

13          THE COURT: OKAY.

14          MS. ULLMAN: I'VE PLAYED WITH THE LIGHTS IN THE  
15 ROOM.

16          THE COURT: HUH?

17          MS. ULLMAN: I'VE ACTUALLY PLAYED WITH ALL OF THE  
18 LIGHTS IN THE ROOM, AND I'VE FOUND THAT YOU CAN TURN  
19 JUST THOSE BROWN LIGHTS OVER THE JURY OFF, JUST THOSE,  
20 AND NOT AFFECT ANYBODY ELSE. SO, THAT WOULD BE MY  
21 OTHER SUGGESTION.

22          THE COURT: YOU'VE GOT A SIXTY WATT BLACK LIGHT?

23          MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

24          SOLICITOR PASCOE: IT'S - - -

25          THE COURT: GO AHEAD.

1           SOLICITOR PASCOE: IT'S ONE HUNDRED PER CENT  
2 IMPROPER, YOUR HONOR, WE CAN'T DO THAT, WE CAN'T HAVE  
3 SCIENCE EXPERIMENTS IN FRONT OF THE JURY. I MEAN,  
4 THAT'S SOMETHING SHE COULD HAVE ASKED THE WITNESSES  
5 ABOUT AND MAYBE HAD A DEMONSTRATION THEN. I'M NOT SO  
6 SURE SHE COULD HAVE EVEN DONE IT THEN.

7           THE COURT: WELL, I THINK SHE COULD HAVE HAD A  
8 DEMONSTRATION IF SHE WANTED TO SAY, IS THIS BLACK  
9 LIGHT, IS THIS ABOUT THE RIGHT LIGHTING, I THINK SHE  
10 COULD HAVE DONE THAT. I'M -

11           SOLICITOR PASCOE: NOT TO MENTION, I DON'T THINK  
12 THE SIXTY WATT INFORMATION CAME OUT DURING THE TRIAL.  
13 IT MIGHT HAVE COME OUT IN PRETRIAL.

14           SOLICITOR SORENSON: I KNOW IT DID DURING THE  
15 PRETRIAL, I DON'T THINK SHE TESTIFIED TO THAT DURING  
16 THE -- I COULD BE WRONG, BUT - - -

17           THE COURT: I DON'T, I HONESTLY DON'T REMEMBER HER  
18 OR ANYBODY TESTIFYING TO THE WATTAGE.

19           SOLICITOR SORENSON: SHE DID IN THE PRETRIAL, I  
20 KNOW THAT, BECAUSE I'VE EVEN GOT THE TRANSCRIPT. I  
21 DON'T BELIEVE SHE DID TUESDAY.

22           THE COURT: I'M - - -

23           SOLICITOR PASCOE: AND THERE'S BEEN GOOD  
24 TESTIMONY THAT THEY CAN USE IN THEIR CLOSING. DIDN'T  
25 ONE OF THE WITNESSES TALK ABOUT HOW YOU COULDN'T SEE

1 SOMEONE FROM - - -

2 THE COURT: YEAH, MR. WISE GOT UP AND, I THINK IT  
3 WAS MR. WISE, - - -

4 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, MR. WISE.

5 THE COURT: --- AND ASKED, COULD YOU SEE ME FROM  
6 HERE? AND OF COURSE, WHEN HE WAS STANDING BACK TOWARD  
7 RICHARD AND HE SAID IT WAS EIGHT FEET, I THOUGHT, OH,  
8 YEAH. I THOUGHT THAT WAS GOOD, YOU KNOW, I REMEMBERED  
9 THAT PART AND I WAS THINKING, OH, GOOD. HE'S A GOOD  
10 JUDGE OF DISTANCE. OKAY. BUT, I MEAN, YOU GET TO MAKE  
11 THE EIGHT FOOT ARGUMENT EVEN THOUGH HE WAS FOURTEEN,  
12 FIFTEEN FEET AWAY, WHICH I THOUGHT THAT WAS CLEVER THE  
13 WAY HE DIDN'T SAY, NO, ISN'T IT MORE LIKE FIFTEEN?

14 MR. WISE: I SAID OVER EIGHT FEET, YOUR HONOR.

15 THE COURT: I KNOW, I KNOW. NO, MA'AM.

16 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. I APPRECIATE IT. OKAY. DOES  
18 ANYBODY WANT TO DO A DEMONSTRATION OF DUCT TAPING  
19 SOMEBODY'S MOUTH AND SEE IF THEY CAN STILL TALK?

20 MS. ULLMAN: I ACTUALLY WOULD KIND OF - - -

21 THE COURT: NO, NO, NO. OKAY. ALRIGHT, ANYTHING  
22 ELSE FROM - - -

23 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

24 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD, YES, SIR.

25 MR. MELLARD: I BELIEVE THE DEFENSE HAS RESTED,

1 SO AT THIS TIME I WOULD RENEW OUR DIRECTED VERDICT  
2 MOTIONS.

3 THE COURT: OH, YEAH, LET'S -- YEAH, SINCE WE'RE  
4 ON THE RECORD NOW, ALL OF Y'ALL ARE RENEWING YOUR  
5 DIRECTED VERDICT MOTIONS.

6 COURT REPORTER: JUDGE, ALL OF THIS I HAVE BEEN  
7 PUTTING ON THE RECORD.

8 THE COURT: YOU HADN'T BEEN DOING THIS ON THE  
9 RECORD?

10 COURT REPORTER: I HAVE.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. OKAY. NO, I WANT THIS, ON THE  
12 RECORD IS FINE. OKAY?

13 COURT REPORTER: THAT'S ALL. OKAY.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. AND NOW, JUST CONTINUING ON  
15 THE RECORD, I'M SORRY, I DIDN'T MEAN TO IMPLY THAT YOU  
16 WEREN'T DOING IT, OKAY, ALL OF THE DEFENDANTS ARE  
17 RENEWING THEIR DIRECTED VERDICT MOTION AND THE OTHER  
18 MOTION YOU MADE ABOUT VIOLATION OF DUE PROCESS.

19 MR. MELLARD: FAIR TRIAL AND DUE PROCESS, YES,  
20 SIR.

21 THE COURT: THAT I THINK EVERYBODY JOINED IN.

22 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

23 THE COURT: LET'S SEE, AND I DID ENJOY THE WAY  
24 Y'ALL DANCED AROUND THE FACT THAT -- WHO MADE THE  
25 DECISION TO GO FORWARD ON THIS?

1           MR. MELLARD: ON WHAT?

2           THE COURT: THE COURT. NO, OF DENYING SEVERANCE  
3 AND DENYING YOUR CLIENTS A RIGHT TO A FAIR AND  
4 IMPARTIAL TRIAL AND LIKE THAT WAS ALL DONE BY THIS  
5 COURT, AND I AM AGAIN DENYING YOUR MOTIONS FOR  
6 DIRECTED VERDICT AND I'M DENYING THE MOTION THAT THEY  
7 DIDN'T GET A FAIR TRIAL, THEY GOT ONE. AND I THOUGHT  
8 Y'ALL DID A GREAT JOB. OKAY. I THINK THAT'S IT.  
9 HAVE WE GOT ALL THE OBJECTIONS PRESERVED FOR THE  
10 RECORD, I THINK, ALL YOUR COMPLAINTS ABOUT WHAT I DID  
11 IS PRESERVED, SO WE OUGHT TO BE DOING PRETTY GOOD.  
12 OKAY.

13           ANYTHING ELSE FROM THE STATE?

14           SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, YOUR HONOR.

15           THE COURT: ANYTHING ELSE FROM DEFENDANTS?

16           MS. ULLMAN: NO, YOUR HONOR.

17           MR. LACKEY: NO, YOUR HONOR.

18           MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

19           MR. MELLARD: NO, YOUR HONOR.

20           MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

21           THE COURT: AND I'LL EXPECT TO SEE YOU IN A WHITE  
22 SHIRT AND A STRIPED TIE, MR. PASCOE.

23           SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

24           THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR. Y'ALL HAVE A  
25 GOOD EVENING, OKAY, AND WE'LL SEE Y'ALL AT NINE IN THE

1 MORNING. AND I'LL LOOK -- AGAIN, I WILL LOOK OVER  
2 THIS VANG CASE AND TELFARE.

3 MS. ULLMAN: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

4 (Recess for the day.)

5 DATE:

6 DECEMBER 17, 2010

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, Y'ALL HAD, Y'ALL CAME BACK  
8 INTO CHAMBERS AND STARTED DISCUSSING THINGS THAT WE  
9 DECIDED WE NEEDED TO COME AND PUT THOSE, THAT STUFF ON  
10 THE RECORD, SO LET'S GO AHEAD AND DO THAT.

11 MR. PASCOE.

12 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

13 THE COURT; YES, SIR.

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE; ONE THING WE WOULD ASK FOR,  
15 SINCE THERE HAS BEEN TESTIMONY ABOUT SENTENCES, A  
16 CHARGE FOR THE JURY THAT THEY'RE NOT TO CONSIDER  
17 SENTENCING IN THEIR DELIBERATIONS, THAT YOU ARE THE  
18 ONLY PERSON WHO CONSIDER WHAT SENTENCE SOMEONE GETS.

19 THE COURT: AND WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IN MY CHARGE  
20 WHERE I DISCUSS THE DUTIES OF THE JUDGE AND THE JURY,  
21 I'M GOING TO REMIND THE JURY IT'S THEIR JOB TO  
22 DETERMINE GUILT OR INNOCENCE, AND IT'S MY JOB TO,  
23 BASED UPON THEIR DECISION, TO DETERMINE WHAT SENTENCE,  
24 IF ANY, WILL BE GIVEN TO THE DEFENDANTS, AND THAT THEY  
25 AREN'T TO CONSIDER ANY OF THAT IN COMING TO THEIR

1 DETERMINATION OF THAT GUILT OR INNOCENCE. I'M GOING  
2 TO ADD THAT AS PART OF MY JURY CHARGES.

3 ANY OBJECTION TO THAT FROM ANY OF THE DEFENSE  
4 ATTORNEYS?

5 MR. LACKEY: NO, YOUR HONOR.

6 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

7 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

8 MR. MELLARD: NO, YOUR HONOR.

9 MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. WHAT'S NEXT, MR. PASCOE?

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YOUR HONOR WAS GOING TO LOOK  
12 AT THE -- AND I DON'T HAVE IT IN FRONT OF ME, THE JURY  
13 REQUEST TO CHARGE ON ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY BY MS.  
14 ULLMAN.

15 THE COURT: YES, IT WAS A ONE SENTENCE REQUEST --  
16 I'VE GOT IT SOMEWHERE IN THERE -- CITING STATE VERSUS  
17 PETERSON - - -

18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: --- THE ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY THING.  
20 I HAVE READ THE STATE VERSUS PETERSON THING, THE  
21 PARTIES WERE KIND ENOUGH TO PROVIDE ME A COPY OF IT.  
22 IN THAT CASE IT APPEARED TO BE THE UNARMED LARCENY OF  
23 A CAR, AND THERE WAS AN ISSUE ABOUT WHETHER IT WOULD  
24 HAVE BEEN THE NATURAL AND PROBABLE CONSEQUENCE OF THAT  
25 SITUATION WHEN IT WAS A NON LIFE THREATENING CRIME.

1 AND AFTER REVIEWING THAT I KNOW THAT I AM GOING TO NOT  
2 MAKE THAT CHARGE. AND SO, I WILL NOTE Y'ALL'S  
3 OBJECTION TO MY FAILURE TO DO THAT IN THE RECORD.

4 MR. WISE, IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE YOU WANT TO PUT  
5 ON THE ABOUT THAT?

6 MR. WISE: NO, YOUR HONOR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. OH, YES, SIR?

8 MR. WISE: CAN YOU MAKE THAT PART OF THE COURT'S  
9 EXHIBITS?

10 THE COURT: YEAH, I'LL BE GLAD TO. I WILL MAKE  
11 THAT ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY, I DON'T KNOW WHAT COURT'S  
12 EXHIBIT THAT WAS. WHERE ARE WE ON THAT, MS. - - -

13 COURT REPORTER: IT WILL BE -- HOLD ON ONE  
14 MOMENT. IT WILL BE COURT'S THREE.

15 THE COURT: COURT'S THREE? OKAY.

16 COURT REPORTER: FOUR, I'M SORRY.

17 THE COURT: NUMBER FOUR?

18 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: OKAY. IF YOU'D MARK THAT NUMBER FOUR  
20 AND GOING ALONG WITH MR. WISE'S OBJECTION. OKAY?

21 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

22 (Court's Exhibit Four  
23 marked and filed.)

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. YES, SIR?

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: ALSO, YOUR HONOR, I THINK IT

1 WAS AN AGREEMENT IN CHAMBERS WITH THE STATE AND THE  
2 DEFENSE ATTORNEYS THAT WE'RE GOING TO REQUEST AN  
3 ATTEMPTED ARMED ROBBERY CHARGE IN THIS CASE AS WELL.

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THE, AND WE'RE IN THE  
5 PROCESS OF DOING THE VERDICT FORM RIGHT NOW. AND THE  
6 VERDICT FORM, I BELIEVE, Y'ALL HAD SEEN A COPY BUT THE  
7 LAST ONE, OR THE LAST CHARGE THAT'S ON IT, I BELIEVE  
8 IS ARMED ROBBERY, IS THAT CORRECT?

9 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

10 THE COURT: AND WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS, I HAVE  
11 AN INSTRUCTION ON THAT VERDICT FORM THAT READS, "IF  
12 YOU FIND THE DEFENDANT GUILTY OF NUMBER THREE" WHICH  
13 IS THE THIRD CHARGE, "YOU CAN END YOUR DELIBERATIONS.  
14 IF YOU FIND THE DEFENDANT NOT GUILTY AS TO NUMBER  
15 THREE," WHICH IS THE ARMED ROBBERY CHARGE, "YOU WILL  
16 GO ON AND CONSIDER QUESTION NUMBER FOUR" WHICH IS THE  
17 ATTEMPTED ARMED ROBBERY CHARGE. OKAY? AT SOME POINT  
18 THEY WILL BE PRINTED UP AND I'LL GET EACH ONE OF Y'ALL  
19 TO LOOK IT OVER FOR, -- Y'ALL ARE MY OFFICIAL SPELL  
20 CHECKS. SO, WE'LL GET Y'ALL TO DOUBLE CHECK AND SEE IF  
21 YOU HAVE ANY OBJECTION TO IT, SO WE CAN HAVE THOSE  
22 READY TO GIVE TO THE JURY UPON THE CONCLUSION OF THE  
23 CLOSINGS.

24 ANYTHING ELSE, MR. PASCOE?

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, YOUR HONOR.

1           THE COURT: ANYTHING ELSE FROM THE DEFENDANTS,  
2 ANY OF THE DEFENDANTS?

3           MR. PALMER: YES, YOUR HONOR.

4           THE COURT: YEAH, WE'VE GOT -- I'M SORRY, WE DO  
5 HAVE TWO OTHER THINGS. MR. PALMER, YOU MADE THE  
6 REQUEST OF THE WITHDRAWAL CHARGE?

7           MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

8           THE COURT: AND YOU WERE KIND ENOUGH TO POINT OUT  
9 STATE VERSUS VANG, - - -

10          MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

11          THE COURT: --- AND WE MENTIONED HOW IN CHAMBERS  
12 IT WAS AN INTERESTING GROUP OF DEFENDANTS IN THAT  
13 CASE.

14          MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

15          THE COURT: IN THAT CASE IT APPEARS TO ME THAT,  
16 THAT MR. VANG ACTIVELY PARTICIPATED IN HIS DEFENSE IN  
17 THE CASE. I MEAN, HE PUT UP A DEFENSE. I REALIZE THAT  
18 FROM, FROM, IN MY CHARGE TO THE JURY WITH REGARD TO  
19 YOUR CLIENT IN THIS CASE, THEY CAN'T MAKE ANY  
20 INFERENCE WITH REGARD TO THAT, YOU KNOW. BUT IT SEEMS  
21 TO ME IN THIS CASE THAT MR. VANG ACTIVELY PARTICIPATED  
22 IN THE DEFENSE OF HIS CASE AND PUT UP A DEFENSE, IS  
23 THAT CORRECT?

24          MR. PALMER: I AGREE THAT VANG MADE AN  
25 AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE IN THE CASE, YOUR HONOR, - - -

1           THE COURT:   YES, SIR.

2           MR. PALMER:   --- AND HAD MY CLIENT DONE THAT, OF  
3 COURSE, WE'D HAVE A DIFFERENT SITUATION.   HOWEVER, I  
4 BELIEVE THERE IS -- IT'S NOT JUST MY BELIEF, IT'S  
5 OBVIOUS THAT THERE IS SOME EVIDENCE IN THE STATE'S  
6 CASE FROM THEIR PRINCIPLE WITNESS THAT MY CLIENT TOOK  
7 SOME ACTION TO WITHDRAW FROM THIS CHAIN OF EVENTS.  
8 NOW, WHETHER OR NOT HE RE-ENTERED, IT IS A QUESTION OF  
9 FACT AS WELL, BUT I THINK IT'S CERTAINLY ENOUGH TO GET  
10 IT TO THE JURY.

11           THE COURT:   WELL, YOUR CHARGE IS DIFFERENT FROM  
12 EVEN THE CHARGE THAT THEY GAVE IN VANG -- IN VANG,  
13 EXCUSE ME, I GET CONFUSED WITH THE TWO DEFENDANTS.  
14 AND THAT CHARGE THAT WAS GIVEN IN VANG AND APPROVED,  
15 THE JUDGE ADDED THE PART THAT A PERSON WHO CONTINUES  
16 IN THE COMMON DESIGN CANNOT CLAIM WITHDRAWAL, YOU  
17 KNOW, AND I REALIZE THERE IS AN INFERENCE FROM, FROM  
18 THE STATE'S PRIMARY WITNESS THAT AT LEAST YOUR CLIENT  
19 MENTIONED THAT THEY SHOULD NOT GO THROUGH WITH THIS.

20           MR. PALMER:   YOUR HONOR, IN ADDITION, HE GAVE UP  
21 HIS WEAPON, ACCORDING TO THE WITNESS.

22           THE COURT:   RIGHT. BUT HE STILL CAME AND  
23 ACTIVELY PARTICIPATED IN THE CRIME, ACCORDING TO ALL  
24 THE TESTIMONY I'VE HEARD SO FAR AS WELL.

25           MR. PALMER:   YES, SIR, AND CERTAINLY, THE JURY

1 CAN BELIEVE PART OF THAT AND NOT PART OF -- THE OTHER  
2 PART.

3 THE COURT: I AGREE.

4 MR. PALMER: AND I'M FINE WITH YOUR HONOR  
5 CHARGING THE CHARGE THAT'S IN THE CASE LAW ITSELF  
6 ABOUT CONTINUING, BECAUSE THAT'S, YOU KNOW, I  
7 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT'S A QUESTION OF FACT, BUT CERTAINLY,  
8 I THINK MY CLIENT HAS THE RIGHT TO AT LEAST ARGUE  
9 THAT, SINCE THERE ARE SOME FACTS IN THE RECORD, AND  
10 THE JURY CAN GIVE THOSE FACTS WHATEVER WEIGHT OR  
11 CREDIBILITY THEY WANT TO.

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. MR. PASCOE, ANYTHING FROM  
13 YOU?

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: WELL, CAN I HAVE TIME LATER TO  
15 LOOK AT THE CASE, I APOLOGIZE, I JUST HAVEN'T LOOKED  
16 AT THE CASE.

17 THE COURT: OKAY.

18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I WILL SAY THIS, THOUGH,  
19 WITHOUT HAVING LOOKED AT IT, ONE PROBLEM IS, FOR THE  
20 DEFENSE, THAT ONCE ALLEGATIONS ARE MADE AND THE ONLY  
21 EVIDENCE IS THAT A DEFENDANT GOES IN THERE TO START  
22 THE PROCESS OF THE ROBBERY AND THE BURGLARY, IT, I  
23 DON'T THINK IT MATTERS UNDER THE LAW EVEN IF HE WALKS  
24 AWAY THEN, EVEN IF THE EVIDENCE WAS, I WENT IN THERE  
25 AND SCOPED IT OUT AND CAME OUT AND SAID, I CAN'T GO

1 BACK IN THERE WITH YOU, AND HE WALKS AWAY, HE'S STILL  
2 PART OF THE ROBBERY AND THE BURGLARY.

3 THE COURT: OH, I AGREE, AND THE CHARGE THAT  
4 JUDGE KEISLEY GAVE WAS, IF A PERSON COMPLETELY  
5 WITHDRAWS FROM THE COMMON DESIGN. SO, I MEAN, IT'S --  
6 AND MAKES IT CLEAR THAT IT'S COMMUNICATED TO ALL OF  
7 THE OTHER PARTICIPANTS, YOU KNOW. AND FINALLY, HE  
8 SAYS, IF HE CONTINUES HE CANNOT CLAIM IT. SO, YOU  
9 KNOW, I THINK IT -- I UNDERSTAND -- I'LL GIVE YOU A  
10 CHANCE TO READ THE CASE, - - -

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, YES, SIR.

12 THE COURT: --- AND THEN I'LL MAKE THAT DECISION  
13 IN A FEW MINUTES -- AS SHORTLY AS WE CAN. I'VE GOT  
14 THE CASE HERE IF YOU WANT TO SEE IT.

15 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, THANK YOU.

16 THE COURT: HERE, I'VE GOT IT RIGHT HERE, AND YOU  
17 CAN LOOK IT OVER. OKAY?

18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YOU SAID, THE DEFENDANT  
19 TESTIFIED IN THIS CASE, YOUR HONOR?

20 THE COURT: WELL, HE -- IT APPEARS, I CANNOT TELL  
21 FOR SURE. IT APPEARS THAT HE TESTIFIED. IT SAYS IN  
22 THERE THAT HE, HIS TESTIMONY FROM A PREVIOUS TRIAL WAS  
23 READ INTO THE RECORD, AND THEN IT SEEMS TO APPEAR THAT  
24 HE -- YOU TAKE YOUR TIME, YOU DON'T HAVE TO DO IT  
25 RIGHT NOW. I'M GOING TO GO ON TO THE OTHER THING, TO

1 THE OTHER THING RIGHT NOW.

2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, THANK YOU.

3 THE COURT: --- AND WE'LL COME BACK TO THAT.

4 AND FINALLY, MS. ULLMAN, YOU ASKED ME TO GIVE A  
5 TELFARE CHARGE?

6 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

7 THE COURT: AND I AM CURIOUS, DID YOU HAPPEN TO  
8 READ STATE VERSUS PATTERSON OR STATE VERSUS ROBINSON?

9 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, I DID NOT, I READ THE  
10 BROOKS CASE THAT I PRESENTED TO YOU.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, ANYWAY, IT APPEARS  
12 FROM MY READING OF THOSE CASES, STATE VERSUS PATTERSON  
13 IS FIVE TWENTY-TWO SOUTHEASTERN, SECOND, EIGHT FORTY-  
14 FIVE -- AND HAVE YOU GOT THE CITE FOR ROBINSON? AND  
15 I'LL GIVE YOU THE CITE FOR ROBINSON, - - -

16 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

17 THE COURT: --- BUT IT APPEARS TO ME THAT I AM  
18 NOT GOING TO CHARGE, FROM MY READING OF STATE LAW THAT  
19 I AM NOT GOING TO CHARGE THE TELFARE INSTRUCTIONS IN  
20 THIS MATTER. AND THE ROBINSON CASE IS TWO SEVENTY-  
21 FOUR SOUTH CAROLINA ONE NINETY-EIGHT. AND I WILL GET  
22 Y'ALL - I WILL NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO MY RULING, - - -

23 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

24 THE COURT: --- AND THEN IF YOU NEED TO PUT  
25 ANYTHING ELSE IN THE RECORD AFTER YOU'VE READ THOSE

1 SOUTH CAROLINA CASES YOU MAY FEEL FREE TO DO SO.

2 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

3 THE COURT: OKAY?

4 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

5 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, I'M GOING TO GIVE Y'ALL A  
6 CHANCE TO FINISH READING THE CASE, SINCE THIS IS NOT A  
7 TIMED EVENT. OKAY? MR. SORENSON, YOU CAN TAKE --  
8 OKAY.

9 SOLICITOR PASCOE: HE HAS NOTHING ELSE TO DO.

10 THE COURT: HE DOESN'T HAVE ANYTHING ELSE TO DO,  
11 SO YOU'RE GOING TO DO THE OPENING?

12 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, I'M GOING TO DO ALL  
13 THE CLOSINGS.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. AND YOU CAN DO YOUR OPENING  
15 WITHOUT ME MAKING A DECISION ON THAT?

16 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I CAN, YES, SIR.

17 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. WHAT I'M GOING TO DO, SINCE  
18 THE JURY HAS BEEN HERE FOR A WHILE, IF THERE'S NO  
19 OBJECTION FROM ANY OF THE PARTIES HERE I'M GOING TO  
20 ALLOW THE SOLICITOR TO GO AHEAD AND DO HIS OPENING IN  
21 THIS CASE, AND THEN WE'LL TAKE A BREAK AND THAT WILL  
22 GIVE EVERYBODY A CHANCE, AND I'LL TELL YOU AT THAT  
23 TIME WHETHER I'M GOING TO CHARGE THE WITHDRAWAL THAT  
24 JUDGE KEISLEY DID IN THAT CASE, AND THEN WE'LL ALLOW  
25 Y'ALL TO ALL GO FORWARD AND DO YOUR CLOSINGS.

1           SOLICITOR PASCOE: I JUST WANT TO -- AND THAT'S  
2 FINE WITH ME, I'LL LET YOU KNOW THAT MY OPENING ISN'T  
3 GOING TO BE MORE THAN TEN MINUTES, FIFTEEN MINUTES.

4           THE COURT: NOW, YOU KNOW, I AM STUNNED, JUST --  
5 WELL, NEVER MIND, YOU KNOW. I APPRECIATE YOU DOING IT  
6 IN SUCH A PRECISE FASHION.

7           SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR. WE CAN STILL TAKE A  
8 BREAK.

9           THE COURT: OKAY.

10          SOLICITOR PASCOE: I INTENTIONALLY ONLY HAD ONE  
11 CUP OF COFFEE TODAY, THINKING I WAS GOING TO HAVE TO  
12 SIT A LONG TIME.

13          THE COURT: WELL, I JUST FEEL LIKE IF WE CAN AT  
14 LEAST GET THE JURY OUT AND DO THAT, AND THEN THAT WILL  
15 GIVE US SOME TIME.

16          MS. ULLMAN, YOU LOOKED LIKE YOU WANTED TO SAY  
17 SOMETHING.

18          MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR, I HAVE A QUESTION. IF MR.  
19 PASCOE IS GOING TO USE THOSE BOARDS IS THERE ANY WAY  
20 HE COULD JUST SHOW - - -

21          SOLICITOR PASCOE: SHE CAN DO IT, RIGHT, YES,  
22 SIR, I'LL LET HER - - -

23          MS. ULLMAN: JUST SO WE DON'T HAVE TO GET UP AND  
24 EVERYTHING, I MEAN, IF WE COULD JUST SEE THEM  
25 BEFOREHAND.

1           THE COURT:    SURE.

2           SOLICITOR PASCOE:    COULD WE JUST DO THAT NOW JUST  
3 TO SAVE TIME?

4           THE COURT:    YES, GO AHEAD AND DO THAT.  
5 OKAY.    ARE THE DEFENDANTS READY?

6           MR. PALMER:    YES, SIR.

7           THE COURT:    ALRIGHT, BRING THE JURY IN.

8           (Whereupon, the jury enters  
9 the courtroom and the following  
10 takes place in the presence  
11 of the jury.)

12           THE COURT:    GOOD MORNING, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I  
13 HOPE YOU ALL HAD A GOOD EVENING.

14           AGAIN, BEFORE I GET READY TO GET STARTED TODAY I  
15 WANT TO JUST GO THROUGH AND ASK YOU THE SAME QUESTIONS  
16 I'VE BEEN ASKING Y'ALL ALL WEEK, AND ASK YOU TO RAISE  
17 YOUR HANDS IF YOU NEED TO ANSWER IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AS  
18 TO ANY OF MY QUESTIONS.

19           HAS ANYBODY READ ANYTHING IN THE PAPER ABOUT THIS  
20 CASE?

21           ALRIGHT, NO ONE HAS RAISED THEIR HANDS.

22           HAS ANYBODY SEEN ANYTHING ON T.V., LISTED TO  
23 ANYTHING ON THE RADIO OR READ OR SEEN ANYTHING ON THE  
24 INTERNET ABOUT THIS CASE?

25           HAS ANYBODY TRIED TO CONTACT YOU ABOUT THIS CASE?

1 ALRIGHT, NO ONE HAS ANSWERED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE,  
2 SO LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WHAT WE ARE NOW -- AS I TOLD  
3 YOU YESTERDAY, YOU HAVE HEARD ALL OF THE EVIDENCE --  
4 ALL OF THE TESTIMONY IN THIS CASE, AND WE ARE NOW  
5 GETTING READY TO BEGIN THE CLOSING ARGUMENTS IN THIS  
6 TRIAL, AND AFTER YOU'VE HEARD THE CLOSING ARGUMENTS OF  
7 THE ATTORNEYS I WILL THEN CHARGE YOU ON THE LAW AND  
8 THEN I WILL TELL YOU -- I WILL GO OVER THE VERDICT  
9 FORM WITH YOU, MADAM FORELADY, AND THEN I WILL TELL  
10 Y'ALL TO BEGIN Y'ALL'S DELIBERATIONS IN THIS CASE.

11 NOW, UNTIL I TELL YOU YOU CAN BEGIN YOUR  
12 DELIBERATIONS IN THIS CASE YOU STILL MAY NOT TALK  
13 ABOUT THIS CASE, UNTIL I TELL YOU TO BEGIN  
14 DELIBERATIONS, BECAUSE THERE WILL BE A LOT OF  
15 ATTORNEYS SPEAKING TO YOU TODAY. WE WILL BE TAKING  
16 BREAKS DURING THESE CLOSING ARGUMENTS. OKAY? RIGHT  
17 NOW THE SOLICITOR IS GOING TO DO HIS OPENING PART OF  
18 HIS CLOSING ARGUMENT.

19 ALRIGHT, MR. PASCOE.

20 SOLICITOR PASCOE: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

21 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

22 CLOSING ARGUMENT BY SOLICITOR PASCOE

23 MADAM FORELADY, AND LADIES AND GENTLEMEN OF THE  
24 JURY, GOOD MORNING. I WANT TO START OFF BY THANKING  
25 EACH AND EVERY ONE OF YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE THIS WEEK.

1 IT'S OFTEN SAID THAT JURY DUTY IS ONE OF THE MOST  
2 IMPORTANT DUTIES YOU CAN PERFORM FOR YOUR COUNTRY, AND  
3 I CERTAINLY CONCUR WITH THAT. YOUR SERVICE IS NOT  
4 ONLY IMPORTANT TO THE FIVE DEFENDANTS, IT'S IMPORTANT  
5 TO THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA, TO CHARLES PRINGLE'S  
6 FAMILY, AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO THE CITIZENS OF  
7 ORANGEBURG COUNTY. AND IT'S IMPORTANT BECAUSE WE ALL  
8 HAVE OUR JOBS TO DO IN THIS COURTROOM. UNDER THE CODE  
9 OF ETHICS IT'S THE STATE'S JOB TO BE MINISTERS OF  
10 JUSTICE, IT'S DEFENSE COUNSELS' JOB TO REPRESENT THEIR  
11 CLIENTS ZEALOUSLY, IT'S THE JUDGE'S JOB TO ADMINISTER  
12 THE LAW, AND IT'S YOUR JOB, MOST IMPORTANT OF ALL, TO  
13 RENDER A VERDICT. WHETHER YOUR VERDICT IS GUILTY OR  
14 NOT GUILTY, AS LONG AS IT SPEAKS THE TRUTH NO ONE WILL  
15 BE ABLE TO QUESTION IT. IF YOU RECALL, THE MOST  
16 IMPORTANT THING YOU'VE DONE UP TO NOW IS, YOU TOOK AND  
17 OATH. YOU TOOK AN OATH ON MONDAY THAT YOU WOULD PUT  
18 ASIDE ANY BIAS OR PREJUDICE THAT YOU MAY HAVE EITHER  
19 AGAINST THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA OR THE DEFENDANTS,  
20 AND BASE YOUR VERDICT ON JUST TWO THINGS, THE EVIDENCE  
21 AND THE LAW, NOT ON ASSERTION, NOT ON FICTION, NOT ON  
22 SPECULATION, BUT ON THE EVIDENCE AND THE LAW. AND  
23 WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS, I'M GOING TO TAKE NO MORE  
24 THAN MAYBE TEN TO TWELVE MINUTES MORE OF YOUR TIME  
25 RIGHT NOW AND I'M GOING TO TALK TO YOU A LITTLE BIT

1 ABOUT THE LAW IN THIS CASE. AND THEN I'M GOING TO SIT  
2 DOWN, THE DEFENSE ATTORNEYS ARE GOING TO PRESENT THEIR  
3 CLOSING ARGUMENTS, AND I'M GOING TO GET ONE MORE  
4 OPPORTUNITY TO COME UP HERE AND TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE  
5 FACTS IN THIS CASE.

6 NOW, AS I GO OVER THE LAW WITH YOU, LET ME GIVE  
7 YOU ONE CAVEAT, WHICH IS, IF I EVER SAY ANYTHING THAT  
8 CONTRADICTS THE LAW THAT THE JUDGE TELLS YOU, YOU TAKE  
9 THE LAW ACCORDING TO JUDGE DICKSON, AND NOT THE LAW  
10 ACCORDING TO PASCOE, BECAUSE JUST LIKE YOU ARE THE  
11 SOLE TRIERS OF THE FACTS IN THIS CASE, HE IS THE SOLE  
12 TRIER OF THE LAW.

13 AND AS WE ALL KNOW BY THE DEFENDANT IS CHARGE --  
14 ALL THE DEFENDANTS ARE CHARGED WITH MURDER, BURGLARY  
15 IN THE FIRST DEGREE, AND ARMED ROBBERY. AND WHILE  
16 MURDER -- AND I THINK MR. SORENSON TOLD YOU THIS IN  
17 HIS OPENING, IS THE MOST HEINOUS CRIME A PERSON CAN  
18 COMMIT, IT HAS PROBABLY THE SHORTEST AND SIMPLEST  
19 DEFINITION OF ANY CRIME ON OUR BOOKS. MURDER IS  
20 DEFINED AS THE UNLAWFUL KILLING OF ANOTHER WITH MALICE  
21 AFORETHOUGHT, EITHER EXPRESSED OR IMPLIED. THAT'S IT.  
22 PREMEDITATION IS AN ELEMENT OF MURDER, BECAUSE AS YOU  
23 CAN IMAGINE, YOU CAN'T PROVE USUALLY WHAT'S IN  
24 SOMEBODY'S HEAD. PREMEDITATION IS NOT AN ELEMENT OF  
25 MURDER. ALL YOU HAVE TO HAVE IS MALICE AFORETHOUGHT,

1 THE UNLAWFUL KILLING OF ANOTHER WITH MALICE  
2 AFORETHOUGHT. AND MALICE HAS A NUMBER OF DEFINITIONS.

3 MALICE IS AN INTENTIONAL ACT OF VIOLENCE, SUCH AS  
4 COMMITTING A BURGLARY OR A ROBBERY. MALICE IS RECKLESS  
5 DISREGARD FOR THE WELFARE OF ANOTHER. I MEAN, HOW  
6 MUCH MORE RECKLESS CAN YOU GET THAN STICKING ONE GUN  
7 IN SOMEBODY'S FACE? MALICE IS CONDUCT THAT SIGNIFIES  
8 A CONSCIOUS EFFORT OF CREATING A HIGH RISK OF BODILY  
9 INJURY TO ANOTHER. MALICE HAS NO TIME LIMIT. IT CAN  
10 HAPPEN AT THE SNAP OF A FINGER OR THE BLINK OF AN EYE.  
11 I CAN HAPPEN AT THE PULLING OF THE TRIGGER ONE TIME,  
12 MUCH LESS TWENTY-FOUR TIMES. AND AS I SAID, MALICE  
13 CAN BE EITHER EXPRESSED OR IMPLIED. AND EXAMPLES OF  
14 EXPRESSED OR IMPLIED MALICE WOULD BE WHEN THE HOMICIDE  
15 OCCURRED DURING A ROBBERY. ANOTHER EXAMPLE OF MALICE  
16 WOULD BE JUST THE MERE USE OF ONE DEADLY WEAPON, MUCH  
17 LESS, MULTIPLE DEADLY WEAPONS. SIMPLY PUT, YOU SHOOT  
18 SOMEBODY WITH A GUN YOU'RE GUILTY OF MURDER, THE  
19 UNLAWFUL KILLING OF ANOTHER WITH MALICE AFORETHOUGHT.

20 THE JUDGE IS ALSO GOING TO CHARGE YOU WITH  
21 REGARDS TO MURDER ON ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY. SOMETIMES  
22 IT'S REFERRED TO AS FELONY MURDER, BUT IT'S REALLY,  
23 IT'S ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY MURDER. AND THIS ONLY  
24 APPLIES -- LET ME GET THIS CLEAR, THIS ONLY APPLIES TO  
25 NON-TRIGGER MEN, PEOPLE WHO GO IN A HOME WITHOUT A

1 GUN, THAT'S WHO IT APPLIES TO. AND UNDER THE  
2 ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY FOR MURDER THE LAW IS, AND HE'S  
3 GOING TO CHARGE YOU, IS SEVERAL PEOPLE AGREE TO COMMIT  
4 A FELONY, SUCH AS A ROBBERY OR A BURGLARY, EACH OF  
5 THOSE PERSONS IS CRIMINALLY RESPONSIBLE FOR THE ACTS  
6 OF HIS ASSOCIATES. THE COMMON PURPOSE MAY NOT HAVE  
7 INCLUDED THE KILLING AND MURDER OF ANYONE. LET ME  
8 READ THAT AGAIN, THE COMMON PURPOSE MAY NOT HAVE  
9 INCLUDED THE KILLING AND MURDER OF ANYONE, BUT IF IN  
10 EXECUTING THE CRIME A HOMICIDE IS COMMITTED BY ONE OF  
11 THE DEFENDANTS, ALL WHO ARE PRESENT ARE AS GUILTY AS  
12 THE SLAYER HIMSELF. AND THE REASON FOR THAT, VERY  
13 SIMPLY, IS BECAUSE HOMICIDE IS A NATURAL CONSEQUENCE  
14 OF HAVING A GUN STUCK IN YOUR FACE, BECAUSE ARMED  
15 ROBBERY AND BURGLARY ARE DANGEROUS CRIMES. IF SIX  
16 PEOPLE DECIDE TO GO INTO A HOME TO ROB SOMEBODY OR  
17 BURGLARIZE THE HOME, IF SIX PEOPLE GO INTO THAT HOME  
18 AND ONLY ONE PERSON TAKES A GUN, AND THAT ONE PERSON  
19 SHOOTS AND KILLS SOMEONE IN THAT HOME DURING THE  
20 ROBBERY, UNDER THE LAW ALL SIX PEOPLE ARE GUILTY OF  
21 MURDER, NOT JUST THE GUNMAN, BECAUSE THE LAW STATES  
22 THAT YOU SHOULD KNOW THAT IT IS AN INHERENTLY  
23 DANGEROUS THING TO GO INTO ANOTHER PERSON'S HOME ARMED  
24 WITH A WEAPON, EVEN IF SOMEBODY ELSE HAS A GUN, FOR  
25 THE PURPOSE OF COMMITTING A ROBBERY. AND THAT'S JUST

1 IF ONE PERSON HAS A GUN, ALL SIX PEOPLE ARE GUILTY OF  
2 MURDER.

3 THE NEXT CRIME IS BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE.  
4 AND BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE IS WHERE YOU ENTER A  
5 DWELLING, OR APARTMENT OR HOUSE, WITHOUT CONSENT OR BY  
6 DECEPTION OR MISREPRESENTATION WITH JUST THE INTENT TO  
7 COMMIT A CRIME AND IT'S EITHER DONE DURING THE HOURS  
8 OF DARKNESS, SUCH AS TEN O'CLOCK AT NIGHT, OR WHILE  
9 ARMED WITH A DEADLY WEAPON, MUCH LESS FOUR, OR THE  
10 VICTIM IS INJURED DURING THE BURGLARY, THAT'S IT. IF  
11 SIX PEOPLE GO INTO A HOME, EVEN THEY'RE UNARMED, AT  
12 NIGHT TIME WITH JUST THE INTENT TO COMMIT A CRIME,  
13 EVEN IF THEY DON'T COMMIT A CRIME IN THERE, IN THE  
14 HOUSE LIKE A MURDER AND A ROBBERY, THEY'RE GUILTY OF  
15 BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE, VERY SIMPLE.

16 AND FINALLY, THE DEFENDANTS ARE ALL CHARGED WITH  
17 ARMED ROBBERY. AND ARMED ROBBERY IS THE TAKING OF  
18 PROPERTY FROM THE PRESENCE OF ANOTHER BY MEANS OF  
19 FORCE OR INTIMIDATION WHILE ARMED WITH A DEADLY  
20 WEAPON. IF YOU STICK A GUN INTO SOMEBODY'S FACE, OR  
21 ONE OF YOUR ACCOMPLICES STICKS A GUN INTO SOMEBODY'S  
22 FACE AND THEY TAKE MONEY OR THEY TAKE DRUGS, OR THEY  
23 TAKE A GUN, AS IN THIS CASE, IT'S ARMED ROBBERY.

24 NOW, THE JUDGE, REGARDS TO THE ARMED ROBBERY  
25 VERDICT, IS GOING TO GIVE YOU TWO POSSIBLE VERDICTS

1 WITH REGARDS TO GUILT. YOU CAN FIND THE DEFENDANTS  
2 GUILTY OF ARMED ROBBERY, OR IF FOR SOME REASON YOU  
3 DON'T FIND THAT A GUN WAS TAKEN AT THE SCENE, THEY CAN  
4 BE FOUND GUILTY OF JUST ATTEMPTED ARMED ROBBERY. SO,  
5 YOU'LL HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO FIND THE DEFENDANTS  
6 EITHER GUILTY OF ARMED ROBBERY, WHICH I SUBMIT DID  
7 OCCUR, BECAUSE A GUN WAS TAKEN, OR ATTEMPTED ARMED  
8 ROBBERY IF NOTHING WAS TAKEN.

9 THE JUDGE IS ALSO GOING TO CHARGE YOU THAT IN  
10 SOUTH CAROLINA, AND ANYWHERE, MERE PRESENCE TO A CRIME  
11 BY ITSELF IS NOT ENOUGH TO CONVICT SOMEBODY. NOW,  
12 THAT DOESN'T MEAN THAT MERE PRESENCE AND MERE  
13 ASSOCIATION WITH DEFENDANTS IS AN EVIDENCE OF GUILT,  
14 IT IS DEFINITELY EVIDENCE OF GUILT WHICH YOU CAN  
15 CONSIDER IN YOUR VERDICT, IT JUST MEANS THAT BY ITSELF  
16 IT'S NOT ENOUGH TO CONVICT SOMEONE. AND IN SOUTH  
17 CAROLINA, MUCH LIKE THE ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY CRIME I  
18 TOLD YOU ABOUT WITH MURDER, IF TWO OR MORE PEOPLE SET  
19 OUT TO COMMIT A CRIME TOGETHER EACH IS GUILTY NO  
20 MATTER WHAT ROLES THEY PLAY. THE HAND OF ONE IS THE  
21 HAND OF ALL. IT DOESN'T MATTER WHAT ROLE YOU PLAY,  
22 WHETHER YOU WERE THE PERSON THAT PUT DUCT TAPE ON  
23 SOMEBODY'S MOUTH, OR YOU WERE THE PERSON THAT WOULD GO  
24 IN THE HOUSE WITH A GUN, EVERYBODY IS GUILTY OF ARMED  
25 ROBBERY, MURDER AND BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE.

1           NOW, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I SUBMIT, YOUR JOB IS  
2           SIMPLE IN THIS CASE, YOU'VE HAD A DIFFICULT WEEK,  
3           YOU'VE HAD A LONG WEEK, YOU'VE HAD TO PUT UP WITH THE  
4           COLD, IF YOU'RE LIKE ME YOU HAD A HARD TIME GETTING  
5           YOUR CAR STARTED ON MONDAY AND TUESDAY MORNINGS,  
6           TAKING CARE OF YOUR CHILDREN, YOUR JOBS, BUT YOUR JOB  
7           IS SIMPLE IN THIS RESPECT, IT'S NOT TO TELL US WHAT  
8           HAPPENED, THERE IS NO DOUBT WHATSOEVER THAT CHARLES  
9           PRINGLE WAS MURDERED, ROBBED, AND HIS HOUSE WAS  
10          BURGLARIZED. YOUR JOB IS JUST TO TELL US WHETHER  
11          THEY'RE INVOLVED OR NOT, DID THEY PARTICIPATE? AND  
12          WHEN YOU DO THAT YOU LOOK AT THE EVIDENCE.

13           THERE ARE TWO TYPES OF EVIDENCE, BOTH OF WHICH  
14           EXIST IN THIS CASE, AND BOTH ARE EQUAL UNDER THE LAW.  
15           THERE'S DIRECT EVIDENCE AND THERE'S CIRCUMSTANTIAL  
16           EVIDENCE. DIRECT EVIDENCE IS EVIDENCE THAT A WITNESS  
17           SEES, HEARS, TOUCHES, SMELLS. ASHLEY'S TESTIMONY, I  
18           COULD HEAR THE FOOTPRINTS, I COULD HEAR THE DUCT TAPE.  
19           PATRICK TYLER'S TESTIMONY THAT WALTER HARRIS GAVE HIS  
20           BLACK GUN TO RALPH COLEMAN. HE SAW THAT. THAT'S  
21           DIRECT EVIDENCE. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE IS WHERE YOU  
22           CAN INFER SOMETHING FROM THE CIRCUMSTANCES. IT'S A  
23           CHAIN OF EVENTS THAT PROVE THE EXISTENCE OF A FACT.  
24           JUST ONE EXAMPLE OF CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE IN THIS  
25           CASE IS THAT A BLACK GUN, THE FORTY CALIBER THAT

1 WALTER HARRIS SOLD ON SATURDAY IS ONE OF THE GUNS USED  
2 TO MURDER CHARGES PRINGLE. THAT'S AN EXAMPLE OF  
3 CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE. BOTH ARE EQUAL UNDER THE  
4 LAW.

5 AND THE JUDGE IS GOING TO TELL YOU THAT YOU ALSO  
6 ASSESS THE CREDIBILITY OF THE WITNESSES. AND WHEN YOU  
7 ASSESS THE CREDIBILITY OF THE WITNESSES THAT TOOK THAT  
8 WITNESS STAND ALL I ASK IS THAT YOU USE YOUR EVERY DAY  
9 LIFE EXPERIENCES. YOU DEAL WITH PEOPLE EVERY SINGLE  
10 DAY. YOU KNOW WHEN SOMEBODY IS LYING, YOU KNOW WHEN  
11 SOMEBODY IS TELLING THE TRUTH. AND SOME OTHER THINGS  
12 YOU CAN CONSIDER WHEN DETERMINING THE CREDIBILITY OF  
13 THE WITNESSES, WHAT WAS THEIR Demeanor ON THE WITNESS  
14 STAND? WERE THEY FORTHRIGHT OR HESITANT? IS THEIR  
15 TESTIMONY CONSISTENT? WAS THE TESTIMONY CORROBORATED  
16 BY THE EVIDENCE? AND DOES THE WITNESS HAVE A REASON  
17 TO BE BIASED OR PREJUDICED?

18 AND LET ME TELL YOU WHAT IS NOT A DEFENSE TO A  
19 CRIME IN SOUTH CAROLINA. VOLUNTARY INTOXICATION IS  
20 NEVER A DEFENSE TO A CRIME, NEVER A DEFENSE. GETTING  
21 HIGH ON MARIJUANA, HIGH ON DRUGS AND THEN DECIDING TO  
22 ROB SOMEBODY AND END UP MURDERING THEM, IS NEVER A  
23 DEFENSE TO A CRIME. NOW, IT MAY BE EVIDENCE AS TO WHY  
24 SOMEBODY COMMITTED THE CRIME, BUT IT IS NEVER A  
25 DEFENSE TO A CRIME IN SOUTH CAROLINA.

1           AND THE LAST LEGAL PHRASE I'M GOING TO TALK TO  
2 YOU ABOUT IS PROOF BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT. THIS  
3 PHRASE MEANS EXACTLY AS IT SOUNDS. IT'S NOT PROOF  
4 BEYOND ANY DOUBT, IT'S NOT PROOF BEYOND ANY POSSIBLE  
5 DOUBT, IT'S PROOF BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT. THE  
6 SIMPLE FACT OF THE MATTER IS, WE ALL HAVE DOUBTS IN  
7 THIS WORLD. SOME MAY DOUBT WHETHER THE EARTH REVOLVES  
8 AROUND THE SUN, BUT YOU HAVE TO ASK YOURSELF, IS IT  
9 REASONABLE? AND IN ESSENCE, WHAT PROOF BEYOND A  
10 REASONABLE DOUBT MEANS IS, AFTER YOU'VE LOOKED AT ALL  
11 THE EVIDENCE COLLECTED, NOT JUST ONE PIECE, BUT AFTER  
12 YOU'VE LOOKED AT ALL THE EVIDENCE, IF YOU ARE FIRMLY  
13 CONVINCED, JUST FIRM CONVINCED THAT THE DEFENDANTS ARE  
14 GUILTY, YOU MUST FIND THEM GUILTY. AND I SUBMIT, THE  
15 EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE LEAVES YOU MUCH, MUCH MORE THAN  
16 FIRMLY CONVINCED.

17           IN CLOSING, I AGAIN WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
18 SERVICE. YOU'VE BEEN EXTREMELY ATTENTIVE THIS ENTIRE  
19 WEEK AND I'M SURE YOU'RE GOING TO CONTINUE THAT TODAY.  
20 AND ALL I ASK IS THAT DURING THE DEFENSE ATTORNEYS'  
21 CLOSING ARGUMENTS, THE ONLY THING I ASK IS THAT YOU  
22 KEEP AN OPEN MIND AND YOU GIVE ME ONE MORE OPPORTUNITY  
23 TO COME UP HERE AND TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE FACTS IN  
24 THIS CASE.

25           THANK YOU.

1           THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, MR. PASCOE.

2           ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WHAT WE'RE GOING  
3 TO DO RIGHT NOW BEFORE THE DEFENSE ATTORNEYS BEGIN  
4 MAKING THEIR CLOSING ARGUMENTS, I'VE GOT SOMETHING  
5 THAT I'VE GOT TO TAKE UP WITH THEM, AND SO I WILL HAVE  
6 A SHORT BREAK, LET Y'ALL HAVE JUST A QUICK SHORT  
7 BREAK, HOPEFULLY, ABOUT TEN MINUTES BACK IN THE JURY  
8 ROOM, AND THEN WE'LL COME BACK AND YOU'LL START  
9 HEARING THE CLOSING ARGUMENTS OF THE ATTORNEYS.  
10 AGAIN, LET ME REMIND YOU, YOU CANNOT BEGIN TALKING  
11 ABOUT THIS CASE NOW. OKAY? THANK Y'ALL VERY MUCH.

12           (Whereupon, the jury retires  
13 to the jury room and the following  
14 takes place out of the presence  
15 of the jury.)

16           THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. SORENSON, OR MR. PASCOE.  
17 SINCE MR. SORENSON IS DOING ALL THE READING I'M GOING  
18 TO LET HIM DO IT RATHER THAN YOU TRANS - - -

19           SOLICITOR SORENSON: OKAY. YOUR HONOR, I THINK  
20 WE'LL LEAVE IT UP TO YOUR HONOR INITIALLY WHETHER  
21 YOU'RE GOING TO CHARGE WITHDRAWAL. I WOULD ASK IF YOU  
22 DO DECIDE TO CHARGE IT, TO CHARGE WHAT, THAT  
23 ADDITIONAL KIND OF LANGUAGE.

24           THE COURT: OH, YEAH, I'M GOING TO CHARGE, I'M  
25 GOING TO MAKE THE CHARGE THAT JUDGE KEISLEY MADE IN

1 THAT CASE, BECAUSE I THINK IT MORE ACCURATELY REFLECTS  
2 WHAT POSSIBLY COULD HAVE HAPPENED HERE.

3 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

4 THE COURT: BUT I NEED THAT SO I CAN DO IT.

5 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. AND SO, MR. PALMER, I'M GOING  
7 TO CHARGE JUDGE KEISLEY'S CHARGE FROM STATE VERSUS  
8 VANG. OKAY?

9 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

10 THE COURT: NOW, IF ANYBODY NEEDS A -- NOW, WE'RE  
11 GOING TO DO CLOSINGS IN THE SAME ORDER WE'VE BEEN  
12 DOING EVERYTHING ELSE? AND IS IT -- MS. ULLMAN,  
13 YOU'VE BEEN POINTED TO BY MR. WISE, SO I'LL EXPECT YOU  
14 TO BE BATTING NUMBER TWO. OKAY?

15 YES, MA'AM, MS. ULLMAN.

16 MS. ULLMAN: I HATE TO ASK, BUT COULD WE HAVE  
17 MORE THAN TWENTY-FIVE SECONDS, MR. MELLARD AND I NEED  
18 TO GO TO THE RESTROOM.

19 THE COURT: OH, YEAH.

20 MS. ULLMAN: IT WON'T TAKE ME MORE THAN TWENTY-  
21 FIVE SECONDS, I PROMISE YOU.

22 THE COURT: WELL, I WAS GOING TO GIVE -- IF Y'ALL  
23 WILL BE BACK HERE ABOUT TWENTY AFTER, WE'LL BE READY  
24 TO GO. THAT WAY I CAN FIX MYSELF A CUP OF COFFEE.  
25 OKAY. THANK Y'ALL. ALRIGHT, WE'RE IN RECESS FOR

1 ABOUT TEN MINUTES.

2 (Recess)

3 THE COURT: IS THE JURY READY? OKAY. BRING THEM  
4 ON OUT.

5 (Whereupon the jury enters  
6 the courtroom and the following  
7 takes place in the presence  
8 of the jury.)

9 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WE'RE  
10 GETTING READY TO BEGIN THE CLOSING ARGUMENTS OF  
11 DEFENSE COUNSEL. AGAIN, I WOULD ASK YOU AS YOU HAVE  
12 DONE THROUGHOUT THE TRIAL TO CONTINUE TO GIVE THEM  
13 YOUR COMPLETE ATTENTION. ALRIGHT? THANK YOU.

14 MR. LACKEY.

15 MR. LACKEY: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

16 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

17 MR. LACKEY: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

18 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

19 CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MR. LACKEY

20 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN OF THE JURY, MY CLIENT,  
21 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, DID NOT HAVE A PART IN PLAYING THIS  
22 EVENT. I SUBMIT TO YOU, HE DID NOT HAVE A GUN, AND  
23 HIS MERE PRESENCE THAT DAY DOES NOT CARRY TO THAT.

24 NOW, YOU SAW ME OVER HERE, AND I DIDN'T ASK MANY  
25 QUESTIONS THROUGH THE TRIAL. A LOT OF TIMES I'D SAY,

1 NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR. WHAT I DON'T WANT YOU TO  
2 TAKE THAT AS IS A LACK OF CONCERN, LACK OF  
3 PREPARATION. WHAT IT WAS IS A LACK OF EVIDENCE  
4 AGAINST MY CLIENT. AS WE'VE SAID, WE'VE EACH GOT  
5 SEPARATE TRIALS FOR EACH OF OUR SEPARATE CLIENTS, AND  
6 THE ONLY PERSON WHO, THE ONLY LAY PERSON WHO MENTIONED  
7 MY CLIENT WAS PATRICK TYLER, THE CO-DEFENDANT WHO  
8 TESTIFIED. PATRICK TYLER IS THE GUY WHO, ONE OF THE  
9 STATE'S WITNESSES, SAID SMOKED WEED SEVEN DAYS A WEEK  
10 FOR THE LAST THREE YEARS. LET'S TALK ABOUT HIS  
11 TESTIMONY A LITTLE BIT.

12 HE ALSO MADE THE STATEMENT, WHICH YOU'LL HAVE IN  
13 THE JURY ROOM TO LOOK AT. WHAT DOES HE SAY? HE SAID  
14 THE DAY STARTED OFF ON MARCH TWELFTH, HE CALLED LITTLE  
15 M, MARIO SHIVERS. THAT'S THE FIRST THING THAT HE  
16 CONTRADICTS IN HIS STATEMENT, BECAUSE THAT DAY HE SAID  
17 LITTLE M CALLED HIM, SO, IT'S FULL OF INCONSISTENCIES.  
18 HOWEVER, WHAT DID HE DECIDE TO DO THAT DAY? HE WENT  
19 OVER TO LOOK AT SOME GUYS. MR. WISE QUESTIONED MR.  
20 TYLER AND SAID, HAVE YOU SEEN A GUN BEFORE? AND HE  
21 COULDN'T HELP HIMSELF, HE SAID, I'VE SEEN PLENTY OF  
22 GUNS. WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT HERE IS A GUY WHO IS  
23 FAMILIAR WITH GUNS, HE'S FAMILIAR WITH WEED. JUST  
24 THINK ABOUT THAT. WHAT DID HE DO NEXT? HE WENT OVER  
25 TO SEE THE GUNS, AND HE NAMED HIMSELF AND TWO OTHERS

1 WAS THE GUYS THAT WERE PLANNING THIS EVENT THAT NIGHT,  
2 THIS CRIME. IT WAS HIMSELF, MARIO SHIVERS AND RALPH  
3 COLEMAN. THAT'S WHO HE NAMED FROM THIS WITNESS STAND.  
4 YOU SAW HIM HERE IN SHACKLES, YOU SAW HIM HERE IN THE  
5 ORANGE JUMP SUIT. HE NEVER SAID MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN  
6 COLEMAN, HAD A THING TO DO WITH IT. WHAT DID HE SAY  
7 ABOUT CHRISTIAN COLEMAN? HE SAID -- HE DIDN'T SAY  
8 ANYBODY CALLED THEM, ALL HE SAID WAS, THE UNKNOWN  
9 DRIVER AND CHRISTIAN COLEMAN CAME BY THAT NIGHT. THEY  
10 DIDN'T GET OUT OF THE CAR, ALL THEY DID WAS GET INTO  
11 THE BACK. MR. TYLER SAID THEY PUT THE GUNS IN THE  
12 BACK.

13 AND LET'S TALK HIS STATEMENTS, HIS WRITTEN  
14 STATEMENT AND HIS TESTIMONY, AND INCONSISTENCIES  
15 THERE. WHAT DO WE HAVE? WE'VE GOT SOMEBODY WHO WROTE  
16 A LENGTHY STATEMENT AND HE -- AND YOU'LL HAVE IT BACK  
17 IN THE JURY ROOM TO CONSIDER -- HE WROTE A LENGTHY  
18 STATEMENT AND HE SAID ON THE STAND, AFTER BEING  
19 QUESTIONED ABOUT THAT LENGTHY STATEMENT, HE SAID,  
20 WELL, I WASN'T TRUTHFUL IN ALL OF IT. AND I SAID, DO  
21 YOU MEAN YOU LIED? AND HE SAID, YEAH, I LIED. SO, IT  
22 WAS APPARENT THAT HE DID IT. IN THERE HE NAMED EVERY  
23 OTHER PERSON BESIDES HIMSELF THAT HAD A GUN. HE  
24 DIDN'T PUT A GUN IN PATRICK TYLER'S HAND, HE PUTS FOUR  
25 GUNS IN FIVE OTHER PEOPLE'S HANDS. EVEN LIEUTENANT

1 SHUMPERT SAID, CRIMINALS DON'T PUT THEMSELVES IN  
2 DIRECT LINE OF FIRE WHEN YOU'VE GOT A CONFESSION  
3 GOING. LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT SAID HE HAD TO FOLLOW UP  
4 WITH SOME QUESTIONS, HE WROTE THE QUESTIONS, AND I  
5 WANT YOU TO LOOK AT THIS, HE ASKED TWO TIMES ABOUT  
6 GUNS. AND PATRICK TYLER, IN HIS HANDWRITING, NAMED  
7 FOUR PEOPLE THAT HAD GUNS. I THINK THE FIRST QUESTION  
8 THAT WAS STATED IS, WHO ALL HAD GUNS? IT WAS -- HIS  
9 RESPONSE WAS, LITTLE M, PETE, RALPH AND S FOURTH CO-  
10 DEFENDANT. HE ASKED HIM AGAIN, WHO TOOK THEM INTO --  
11 WHO TOOK THE GUNS INTO THE APARTMENT? AGAIN, LITTLE  
12 M, RALPH, PETE, AND POKE, DANNY RYANT. HE NEVER  
13 MENTIONED CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

14 NOW, LET ME TALK TO YOU A LITTLE BIT, SWITCHING  
15 GEARS HERE, ABOUT A FELLOW NAMED RONNIE WASHINGTON.  
16 RONNIE WASHINGTON. RONNIE WASHINGTON, SOLICITOR  
17 SORENSON GAVE THE OPENING STATEMENT AND HE PROMISED  
18 YOU RONNIE WASHINGTON, WHO WAS THE DRIVER, WAS GOING  
19 TO COME IN HERE AND TESTIFY. RONNIE WASHINGTON DID  
20 NOT GET ON THAT STAND, DID NOT PUT HIS HAND ON THAT  
21 BIBLE, AND DID NOT TESTIFY. I DO, IN MY CIVIL  
22 PRACTICE I DO A LOT OF WORK FOR A LUMBER COMPANY, AND  
23 THE EIGHTY-SIX YEAR OLD FOUNDER OFTENTIMES SAYS, WITH  
24 THE CUSTOMERS, YOU DON'T WANT TO OVER PROMISE AND  
25 UNDER DELIVER. DON'T OVER PROMISE AND UNDER DELIVER.

1 WELL, THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT THE STATE DID, ESPECIALLY  
2 WITH REGARD TO RONNIE WASHINGTON. NOW, LIEUTENANT  
3 SHUMPERT SAID THEY DID FIND THE DRIVER, RONNIE  
4 WASHINGTON, ABOUT SOME TWO WEEKS AGO. HE SAID HE  
5 ADMITTED TO BEING THE DRIVER THAT NIGHT. OKAY. DID  
6 YOU CHARGE HIM WITH ANYTHING? NO. OKAY. WELL, AS  
7 THE SOLICITOR JUST GAVE YOU THE CHARGES ON THE LAW, HE  
8 WOULD HAVE YOU BELIEVE THAT THE HAND OF ONE IS THE  
9 HAND OF ALL, LET'S GO AHEAD AND PICK HIM AND CHARGE  
10 HIM WITH THE SAME THING THESE GUYS ARE CHARGED WITH.  
11 WELL, NO CHARGES, HE'S WALKING FREE ON THE STREETS.  
12 THAT'S BECAUSE, I ASSUME, BECAUSE OF MERE PRESENCE,  
13 THEY DIDN'T WANT TO CHARGE HIM WITH THAT.

14 LET'S GO BACK TO PATRICK TYLER. ONE OF THE FEW  
15 CONSISTENT THINGS HE SAID IN HIS TESTIMONY WAS THAT  
16 THE UNKNOWN DRIVER WHO WE NOW KNOW AS RONNIE  
17 WASHINGTON WAS SITTING IN THE FRONT SEAT DRIVING AND  
18 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN WAS IN THE PASSENGER SEAT. WHAT  
19 BETTER WITNESS TO COME IN HERE AND TESTIFY OF  
20 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN'S ACTIVITIES THAT NIGHT THAN RONNIE  
21 WASHINGTON? WHO COULD HAVE TOLD YOU BETTER IF  
22 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN GOT OUT OF THAT CAR THAT NIGHT AND  
23 WENT INTO THIS APARTMENT? WHO COULD HAVE HAD A BETTER  
24 SHOT OF LOOKING TO SEE IF CHRISTIAN COLEMAN HAD A GUN  
25 IN THE CAR THAT NIGHT THAN RONNIE WASHINGTON? NOW,

1 WHY WAS RONNIE WASHINGTON NOT HERE? NOW, IF THAT  
2 CAUSES YOU PAUSE FOR CONCERN OR THAT MAKES YOU  
3 HESITATE TO ACT, YOU'VE JUST HAD REASONABLE DOUBT.  
4 AND THE JUDGE WILL TALK TO YOU MORE ABOUT THAT AND  
5 HE'LL SAY THOSE WORDS, HE'LL STATE THAT THAT'S  
6 REASONABLE DOUBT. I WANT YOU TO THINK ABOUT THAT.  
7 OVER PROMISE, UNDER DELIVER.

8 NOW, THE JUDGE, AS I SAID, AND I'M NOT GOING TO  
9 STAND UP TOO LONG, I'M JUST GOING TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT  
10 THE LAW. HE'LL TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE HAND OF ONE, THE  
11 HAND OF ALL, AND AS WE ALSO SAID, MERE PRESENCE, THE  
12 MERE PRESENCE ON THE SCENE, THE MERE PRESENCE IN THE  
13 CAR DOES NOT MAKE YOU GUILTY. IF YOU'RE GOING INTO  
14 THE MALL WITH A GROUP OF FRIENDS CHRISTMAS SHOPPING  
15 AND THEY START SHOOTING UP PEOPLE, JUST BECAUSE YOU'RE  
16 THERE YOU'RE NOT GOING TO BE ARRESTED. PATRICK TYLER  
17 TESTIFIED THAT CHRISTIAN COLEMAN DID NOT PLAN THIS  
18 EVENT.

19 NOW, AS FAR AS MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN, HE DIDN'T  
20 TESTIFY. NOT ONLY CAN YOU NOT HOLD THAT AGAINST HIM,  
21 THE JUDGE IS GOING TO TELL YOU, YOU CAN'T EVEN TALK  
22 ABOUT THAT. THAT'S A FUNDAMENTAL CONSTITUTIONAL  
23 RIGHT. THE STATE HAS TO PROVE THEIR CASE, THEY HAVE  
24 THE BURDEN OF PROOF. HAVE THEY DONE THAT HERE? AS TO  
25 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, THEY HAVE NOT. BEYOND A REASONABLE

1 DOUBT, AS I SAID, MY CLIENT HAS TO PROVE NOTHING. THEY  
2 HAVE TO PROVE THEIR CASE BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT.  
3 THAT MAKES A REASONABLE MAN HESITATE TO ACT, HESITATE  
4 TO ACT. THINK ABOUT THAT.

5 THE JUDGE WILL ALSO TELL YOU, AS I STATED  
6 EARLIER, WE HAVE SEPARATE TRIALS FOR EACH OF THESE  
7 SEPARATE DEFENDANTS. I WOULD SUBMIT TO YOU, MY CLIENT  
8 HAS A FACT PATTERN THAT'S MUCH DIFFERENT FROM THE  
9 OTHER FOUR, AND YOU HAVE TO CONSIDER THE EVIDENCE  
10 AGAINST MY CLIENT DISTINCTLY FROM THE EVIDENCE AGAINST  
11 THE OTHER CLIENTS. AND WHEN YOU DO THAT YOU'RE GOING  
12 TO SEE THE STATE HAS FAILED TO MEET THEIR BURDEN OF  
13 PROOF. YOU'RE GOING TO SEE THAT THE ONLY VERDICT YOU  
14 CAN RETURN IS A NOT GUILTY ON ARMED ROBBERY, A NOT  
15 GUILTY ON BURGLARY, AND A NOT GUILTY ON MURDER.

16 I THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND ATTENTION.

17 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. LACKEY.

18 MS. ULLMAN.

19 CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MS. ULLMAN

20 GOOD MORNING. AS MR. LACKEY JUST SAID, THIS IS  
21 FIVE SEPARATE TRIALS. I UNDERSTAND WE'RE ALL SITTING  
22 HERE, WE'RE ALL SITTING AS A GROUP OVER THERE, BUT THE  
23 REALITY IS, THAT IS FOR JUDICIAL ECONOMY. WHAT DO I  
24 MEAN BY THAT? IT'S CHEAPER FOR THE STATE TO DO IT  
25 THIS WAY, WE DON'T HAVE TO HAVE MORE THAN ONE JURY

1           HERE, WE DON'T HAVE TO HAVE THE LAWYERS HERE MORE THAN  
2           ONCE, WE DON'T HAVE TO HAVE THE WITNESSES HERE MORE  
3           THAN ONCE. THAT SHOULD NOT MATTER TO YOU, THOUGH, YOU  
4           NEED TO GO INTO THAT JURY DELIBERATION ROOM AND THINK  
5           OF EACH PERSON SITTING THERE SEPARATELY. YOU WILL  
6           ACTUALLY HAVE A FORM THAT THE JUDGE IS GOING TO GIVE  
7           YOU TO FILL OUT WHEN YOU DELIBERATE TO DECIDE WHETHER  
8           A PERSON IS GUILTY OR NOT GUILTY. EACH ONE OF THOSE  
9           FORMS IS PER PERSON, YOU WILL HAVE FIVE FORMS BACK  
10          THERE. SO, I JUST REMIND YOU TO PLEASE SEPARATE THIS.  
11          IF YOU DECIDE THAT ONE PERSON OVER THERE IS GUILTY,  
12          THAT IS NOT A REASON THAT YOU MUST DECIDE THAT THEY  
13          ARE ALL GUILTY. ONE PERSON COULD BE GUILTY, THE REST  
14          COULD BE NOT GUILTY, THEY COULD ALL BE NOT GUILTY.

15                 I REPRESENT RALPH COLEMAN.

16                 PLEASE STAND UP, RALPH.

17                 THIS IS RALPH COLEMAN, HE IS MY CLIENT. I'M HERE  
18          TO TALK ABOUT RALPH TODAY AND THE EVIDENCE THE STATE  
19          WAS NOT ABLE TO PRODUCE FOR RALPH.

20                 NOW, MR. PASCOE GOT UP HERE AND PUT SOME BOARDS  
21          UP HERE THAT TOLD YOU WHAT HE SAYS THE LAW IS. AND AS  
22          HE TOLD YOU, WHAT HE SAID REALLY DOESN'T MATTER, THE  
23          JUDGE IS GOING TO TELL YOU WHAT THE LAW IS. WHEN WE  
24          ALL GET DONE TALKING YOU WILL GET TO TAKE THE EVIDENCE  
25          THAT YOU'VE HEARD FROM THE WITNESS STAND, ALL THE

1 EXHIBITS, THE PICTURES, EVERYTHING THAT YOU SAW BACK  
2 INTO THAT DELIBERATION ROOM AND YOU'LL GET TO USE ALL  
3 OF THAT, PUT IT AGAINST THE LAW THE JUDGE GIVES YOU TO  
4 DECIDE INNOCENCE OR GUILT.

5 ONE THING I'D LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT THE  
6 SOLICITOR DID SAY THAT I AGREE WITH, THOUGH, IS, I DO  
7 WANT YOU TO PAY ATTENTION TO EVIDENCE, DIRECT  
8 EVIDENCE, CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE, AND PART OF THAT IS  
9 PAYING ATTENTION TO THE WITNESSES. THE STATE ASKED  
10 YOU TO LOOK AT THE TESTIMONY GIVEN AND CONSIDER  
11 WHETHER A PERSON WAS BIASED OR PREJUDICED, WHETHER  
12 THEY HAD A REASON TO LIE, WHAT THEIR Demeanor WAS ON  
13 THE STAND, AND I'LL TELL YOU, THAT IS VERY IMPORTANT,  
14 PLEASE KEEP THAT IN YOUR MIND.

15 I UNDERSTAND THIS HAS BEEN A LONG TRIAL, IT'S  
16 BEEN LONG FOR EVERYBODY. AND THIS IS A VERY IMPORTANT  
17 TRIAL. THERE'S ONE PERSON THAT'S LOST THEIR LIFE,  
18 THERE'S NO QUESTION ABOUT THAT. WE ARE NOT  
19 QUESTIONING WHAT HAPPENED, IT CERTAINLY DID HAPPEN.  
20 RIGHT NOW RALPH COLEMAN IS FIGHTING FOR HIS LIFE, AND  
21 NOTHING I'VE SAID TODAY, NOTHING I'M GOING TO SAY, AND  
22 NOTHING THAT I'VE SAID OVER THE LAST WEEK IN ANY WAY  
23 WAS MEANT BY ME OR RALPH COLEMAN AS DISRESPECT TO MR.  
24 PRINGLE OR TO HIS FAMILY. BUT RALPH HAS NOTHING TO  
25 PROVE HERE TODAY. HE SITS HERE AN INNOCENT MAN, AND

1 HE'S GOING TO REMAIN INNOCENT UNTIL YOU DELIBERATE. I  
2 SUBMIT TO YOU THAT WHEN YOU ARE DONE DELIBERATING HE  
3 WILL REMAIN AN INNOCENT MAN. YOU ARE THE ONLY PEOPLE  
4 WHO CAN DETERMINE WHETHER HE IS INNOCENT OR GUILTY.

5 RALPH DOES NOT HAVE TO TESTIFY, THE JUDGE WILL  
6 TELL YOU THAT. THE JUDGE WILL TELL YOU THAT YOU  
7 CANNOT CONSIDER WHETHER HE TESTIFIED OR NOT, AS ANY  
8 SORT OF EVIDENCE, HE DOES NOT HAVE TO TESTIFY. HE  
9 DOESN'T HAVE TO GET UP THERE AND TELL YOU HE WASN'T  
10 THERE ON THE MARCH TWELFTH. HE DOESN'T HAVE TO  
11 PRODUCE SOMEBODY ELSE THAT CAN TELL YOU HE WASN'T  
12 THERE ON THE NIGHT OF MARCH TWELFTH. IT'S ACTUALLY  
13 YOUR DUTY AS THE JURY TO ASSUME HE WAS NOT THERE ON  
14 THE MARCH TWELFTH. YOU MUST GO INTO THAT ROOM  
15 ASSUMING HE WAS NOT THERE, AND THE ONLY WAY YOU CAN  
16 CHANGE YOUR MIND ABOUT THAT IS IF THE STATE HAS  
17 PROVIDED EVIDENCE TO YOU BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT  
18 THAT HE WASN'T. AND NOT JUST THAT HE WAS THERE, AS  
19 THE JUDGE WILL TELL YOU, MERE PRESENCE DOES NOT  
20 MATTER, BUT THAT HE WAS THERE, KNEW WHAT WAS GOING ON  
21 AND PARTICIPATED IN SOME FASHION.

22 NOW, FOR YOU TO BE CONVINCED BEYOND A REASONABLE  
23 DOUBT THAT RALPH COLEMAN WAS PRESENT AND THAT HE  
24 PARTICIPATED YOU NEED TO LOOK AT THE EVIDENCE AS IT  
25 CAME FROM THE WITNESSES' MOUTHS. I SUBMIT TO YOU THAT

1 NONE OF THE EVIDENCE, PICTURES OR THE BALLISTICS, THE  
2 BULLETS, ANY OF THAT STUFF, REALLY MATTERS. WE'VE  
3 ALREADY STATED, UNFORTUNATELY, THERE IS A PERSON WHO  
4 PASSED AWAY. HE DEFINITELY WAS SHOT, WE'RE NOT  
5 CONTENDING THAT, BUT BULLETS DON'T PROVE ANYTHING.

6 NOW, I ASK YOU TO PAY ATTENTION TO ACTUALLY WHAT  
7 CAME OUT OF THE WITNESSES' MOUTHS, NOT WHAT THEY WERE  
8 PROMPTED TO SAY. IF I SAY, ON MARCH SEVENTEENTH, YOU  
9 SPOKE TO SOMEONE, THE WITNESS DIDN'T TELL YOU IT  
10 HAPPENED ON MARCH SEVENTEENTH, THE ATTORNEY PROMPTED  
11 THEM TO SAY YES TO THAT. I SUBMIT TO YOU THAT WHEN  
12 THE STATE IS QUESTIONING THEIR WITNESSES THE WITNESS  
13 SHOULD BE TELLING YOU WHAT HAPPENED, WHEN IT HAPPENED,  
14 WHAT DATE IT HAPPENED, ALL OF THAT. THEY SHOULD BE  
15 COMPLETING THE STORY, NOT, SO ON MARCH SEVENTEENTH,  
16 WHO DID YOU TALK TO, AT FIVE P.M. ON MARCH  
17 SEVENTEENTH, WHO DID YOU TALK TO? THAT'S THE STATE  
18 THROWING IN THOSE FACTS FOR YOU, AND WHAT THE STATE  
19 SAYS IS NOT EVIDENCE. WHAT CAME OUT OF THEIR MOUTHS  
20 AS THEY STOOD AT THE PODIUM ASKING QUESTIONS OR AS  
21 THEY SIT HERE AS I AM TALKING TO YOU IS NOT EVIDENCE.

22 NOW, PART OF THE PROBLEM IN THIS CASE AND PART OF  
23 THE REASON I KNOW THAT AFTER YOU DELIBERATE YOU WILL  
24 FIND RALPH COLEMAN INNOCENT, IS THAT THE STATE DID NOT  
25 INVESTIGATE THIS CASE VERY WELL. AND THAT IS VERY

1 UNFORTUNATE BECAUSE THERE IS SOMEONE WHO PASSED AWAY.  
2 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT WAS THE LEAD INVESTIGATOR, HE  
3 TOLD YOU THAT HE WAS RESPONSIBLE FOR THE ENTIRE  
4 INVESTIGATION. HE TOLD YOU THAT TIPS COME IN, THEY  
5 GET PHONE CALLS, PEOPLE IN THE COMMUNITY, TALKING  
6 ABOUT WHO MIGHT HAVE DONE SOMETHING. AND THEY, OF  
7 COURSE, WEIGH THOSE TIPS AND GO FROM THERE AND DECIDE  
8 WHETHER TO INVESTIGATE OR NOT INVESTIGATE. THEY  
9 INVESTIGATED A FEW PEOPLE, THEY TESTIFIED THAT THERE  
10 WERE SOME SUSPECTS, BUT THEN THEY TALKED TO PATRICK  
11 TYLER, PATRICK TYLER GAVE THEM NAMES, AND THAT WAS THE  
12 END OF IT. THEY DECIDE THOSE PEOPLE WERE WHO DID THIS,  
13 THEY GOT WARRANTS, THAT WAS THE END OF IT. WHAT ELSE  
14 DID THEY DO? THEY DID NOT GET SEARCH WARRANTS FOR  
15 ANYBODY'S HOUSE EXCEPT ONE PERSON. NOW, I UNDERSTAND  
16 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT GOT ON THE STAND AND SAID, WELL,  
17 ONCE A PERSON'S BEEN ARRESTED WE'RE NOT GOING TO  
18 SEARCH THEIR HOUSE BECAUSE ONCE THEY'VE BEEN ARRESTED  
19 ONCE THEY, OR TURN THEMSELVES IN AS RALPH COLEMAN DID,  
20 THEY'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE EVIDENCE AT THEIR HOUSE.  
21 AND THAT'S BASED ON HIS EXPERIENCE, THAT'S JUST TRUE.  
22 WELL, THE PROBLEM IS, HE GOT ON THE STAND AND TOLD YOU  
23 THAT RALPH COLEMAN'S WARRANT WAS ISSUED ON MARCH  
24 NINETEENTH RALPH COLEMAN TURNED HIMSELF IN ON MARCH  
25 TWENTY-SECOND. I SUBMIT TO YOU THAT THE PROBABLE

1 CAUSE NECESSARY TO GET AN ARREST WARRANT WOULD  
2 CERTAINLY SUFFICE TO GET A SEARCH WARRANT, ON THE SAME  
3 DATE FROM THE SAME MAGISTRATE THE ARREST WARRANT WAS  
4 ISSUED A SEARCH WARRANT COULD HAVE BEEN ISSUED. NOW,  
5 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT SAID THERE'S NO POINT IN GETTING  
6 A SEARCH WARRANT IF YOU DON'T KNOW WHERE THE PERSON  
7 LIVES. BUT HE ALSO TESTIFIED THAT HE KNEW MY CLIENT  
8 LIVED ON WOODBINE DRIVE. THAT WAS HIS GRANDMOTHER'S  
9 HOUSE. HE EVEN KNEW WHOSE HOUSE IT WAS. SO,  
10 CERTAINLY, HE COULD HAVE INVESTIGATED THIS FURTHER. HE  
11 GOT ON THE STAND AND SAID THAT THERE ARE MURDER  
12 WEAPONS IN THE COMMUNITY, AND THAT'S A SCARY THOUGHT,  
13 BUT WHAT DID THEY DO TO TRY TO GET THOSE WEAPONS?  
14 THEY DIDN'T SEARCH CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT'S HOUSE, HE WAS  
15 THE PERSON WHO HAD THIS WEAPON THAT THEY'RE SAYING WAS  
16 ONE OF THE MURDER WEAPONS. THEY DIDN'T INVESTIGATE  
17 HIM ANY FURTHER. HE HAD A MURDER WEAPON AND THEY  
18 DIDN'T DECIDE TO SEARCH HIS HOUSE TO SEE HE MAYBE HAD  
19 ONE OF THE OTHER WEAPONS, TO SEE IF HE WAS INVOLVED,  
20 THEY JUST GOT THE WEAPON FROM HIM AND MOVED ON. WHY IS  
21 THAT? BECAUSE PATRICK TYLER SAID WHO DID IT.

22 NOW, CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT ALSO, THEY COULD HAVE  
23 MADE A LINEUP FOR HIM, THEY COULD HAVE PUT HIM IN A  
24 LINEUP AND SHOWED HIM TO PATRICK TYLER OR ASHLEY  
25 PARSLEY, BUT THEY DIDN'T DO THAT. HIS NAME IS

1 CHRISTOPHER, HE COULD BE LITTLE CHRIS, BUT THEY DIDN'T  
2 DO THAT.

3 ANDRE WASHINGTON CAME INTO COURT, HE HAD THE, HE  
4 WAS THE PERSON THAT SAID HE HAD ORIGINALLY PURCHASED  
5 THE FORTY CALIBER PISTOL FROM CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT. HE  
6 GOT ON THE STAND AND SAID HE BOUGHT IT FOR PROTECTION,  
7 DIDN'T HAVE ANY SORT OF DANGEROUS JOB, HAD BEEN IN  
8 SOME KIND OF SCUFFLE, SO OBVIOUSLY, HE THOUGHT  
9 SOMEBODY MIGHT SHOOT HIM AND HE MIGHT NEED TO SHOOT  
10 SOMEBODY. HE ALSO SAID THAT WHEN HE BOUGHT THAT GUN  
11 HE TRADED A GUN HE ALREADY HAD. ALL OF THIS IS  
12 EVIDENCE THAT HE HAD NUMEROUS WEAPONS. DID THEY TRY  
13 TO SEARCH HIS HOUSE TO FIND ANY OTHER OF THESE GUNS?  
14 NO. THEY JUST TOOK HIS WORD THAT THIS IS WHO I GOT IT  
15 FROM, THIS IS WHERE IT CAME FROM, AND THEY TOOK IT.  
16 NOW, DOES MR. WASHINGTON'S POSSESSION OF ONE OF THESE  
17 WEAPONS GIVE PROBABLE CAUSE TO SEARCH HIS HOUSE?  
18 ABSOLUTELY.

19 NOW, ANOTHER PROBLEM THAT WE HAD WAS AT THE CRIME  
20 SCENE. AND I UNDERSTAND INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT WAS NOT  
21 AT THE CRIME SCENE, HE'S NOT THE CRIME SCENE  
22 INVESTIGATOR, BUT HE IS IN CHARGE OF THE  
23 INVESTIGATION. HE DIDN'T ASK WHY, AND LIEUTENANT  
24 CARTER DIDN'T BOTHER FINGERPRINTING THE ENTIRE LIVING  
25 ROOM. WHERE DID THEY FINGERPRINT? ONE PLACE, THE

1 DOOR KNOB. AND I BELIEVE IT WAS LIEUTENANT CARTER  
2 THAT ACTUALLY STATED, A DOOR KNOB IS USUALLY A PLACE  
3 THAT FINGERPRINTS AREN'T THE BEST PLACE, AREN'T LEFT  
4 WELL. WHY IS THAT? BECAUSE IF I GO THROUGH A DOOR  
5 AND I TOUCH IT, AND YOU GO THE DOOR AND YOU TOUCH IT,  
6 AND YOU GO THROUGH THE DOOR AND YOU TOUCH IT,  
7 FINGERPRINTS ARE GOING TO BE WIPED AWAY, THEY'RE NOT  
8 GOING TO BE SOMETHING THAT'S VALUABLE. THEY DIDN'T  
9 FINGERPRINT THE TABLE, THEY DIDN'T FINGERPRINT ANY  
10 PART OF THE WOOD THAT WAS ON EITHER OF THE COUCHES,  
11 THEY DIDN'T FINGERPRINT ANYTHING IN THAT LIVING ROOM.  
12 THEY SAY THAT WAS OBVIOUSLY THE PLACE THAT EVERYTHING  
13 WENT DOWN, NO FINGERPRINTS.

14 THEY DIDN'T SEARCH THE OUTSIDE AREA OF THIS  
15 APARTMENT. YOU'LL HAVE THE PICTURES BACK THERE, AND  
16 IN ONE OF THE PICTURES IS A DEPICTION OF THE ACTUAL  
17 APARTMENT BUILDING. AT THE END OF THE APARTMENT  
18 BUILDING RIGHT NEXT TO THE LAST APARTMENT, WHICH IS  
19 SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD, YOU WILL SEE THERE'S, I  
20 DON'T KNOW HOW BIG IT IS, TO BE QUITE HONEST, BUT  
21 THERE'S AN OPENING, AN OPEN FIELD. IT'S NOT A HOUSE OR  
22 ANOTHER PARKING LOT OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT. THEY  
23 DIDN'T SEARCH THAT AREA. WHOEVER DID THIS CERTAINLY  
24 COULD HAVE THROWN A GUN WHEN THEY RAN OUT OF THE  
25 SEARCH, BUT THEY DIDN'T SEARCH. THERE'S A BACK DOOR,

1 AND THEY DIDN'T SEARCH BEHIND THE HOUSE. I SUBMIT TO  
2 YOU, THERE IS AREA BEHIND THE HOUSE. THERE IS  
3 OBVIOUSLY NOT A BUILDING BUTTED UP AGAINST THIS  
4 BUILDING, THERE'S AREA BACK THERE. THERE WAS ACTUALLY  
5 EVEN TESTIMONY FROM PATRICK TYLER THAT THE, THAT MR.  
6 PRINGLE WAS SAYING DURING THIS INCIDENT, THE STUFF'S  
7 OUTSIDE, THE STUFF'S OUTSIDE. BUT THEY DIDN'T LOOK  
8 OUTSIDE. AND WHEN I SAY, THEN, I MEAN, THE POLICE.  
9 THEY DIDN'T LOOK OUTSIDE FOR ANYTHING.

10 NOW, DUE TO THE POLICE NOT INVESTIGATING PROPERLY  
11 THE STATE HAS NOT BEEN ABLE TO PROVIDE YOU WITH  
12 EVIDENCE BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT AGAINST RALPH  
13 COLEMAN. NOW, CERTAINLY, AT THE BEGINNING OF THIS  
14 TRIAL YOU HEARD THE ATTORNEYS GIVE AN OPENING  
15 STATEMENT, AND IT'S NOT EVIDENCE, IT'S NOT ANYTHING  
16 YOU CAN USE TO DECIDE WHETHER A PERSON IS GUILTY OR  
17 INNOCENCE, BUT IT'S CERTAINLY SOMETHING THAT YOU CAN  
18 TAKE TO SEE WHAT THE ATTORNEYS ARE TELLING YOU. WHAT  
19 ARE WE TELLING YOU THIS CASE IS GOING TO SHOW? THE  
20 STATE SAID THEY'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO SHOW YOU BEYOND  
21 ANY DOUBT, ANY DOUBT THAT RALPH COLEMAN WAS GUILTY.  
22 THAT MEANS THAT YOU HAVE NO DOUBT AT ALL, NOT A  
23 REASONABLE DOUBT, NO DOUBT AT ALL THAT HE IS GUILTY,  
24 AND I SUBMIT TO YOU, THEY HAVE NOT DONE THAT.

25 NOW, RALPH COLEMAN WAS NOT PRESENT DURING THIS

1 INCIDENT. THE STATE HAS NOT PROVEN THAT HE WAS  
2 PRESENT DURING THIS INCIDENT, BUT FOR ARGUMENT'S SAKE,  
3 FOR JUST ONE SECOND LET'S PRETEND HE WAS. NOW,  
4 PRETENDING RALPH COLEMAN WAS PRESENT, THE STATE STILL  
5 HASN'T PROVEN THAT HE'S GUILTY OF MURDER. AS THEY  
6 EXPLAINED TO YOU, MURDER IS THE KILLING OF ANOTHER  
7 WITH MALICE AFORETHOUGHT. THERE'S CERTAINLY SOMEONE  
8 WHO'S PASSED AWAY, WE'VE STATED THAT. MALICE  
9 AFORETHOUGHT, THEY WENT THROUGH A BUNCH OF DEFINITIONS  
10 OF WHAT THAT MEANS. THE JUDGE WILL GO THROUGH MORE  
11 DEFINITIONS. MALICE IS VERY HARD TO UNDERSTAND. AS A  
12 LAWYER I DON'T NECESSARILY HAVE A PERFECT DEFINITION  
13 EITHER. IT IS NOT SOMETHING THAT IS EASILY  
14 UNDERSTOOD. IT'S SOMETHING THAT I'VE OFTEN READ IS,  
15 IT'S A DEPRAVED HEART, A MATTER OF ILL WILL. AND  
16 THEY'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO PROVE THAT. THEY'RE  
17 NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO PROVE THAT RALPH COLEMAN HAD A  
18 DEPRAVED HEART IN ANY SORT OF ACTIONS THAT HE HAD.

19 NOW, REGARDING ARMED ROBBERY, THE JUDGE IS GOING  
20 TO EXPLAIN TO YOU THAT ARMED ROBBERY IS THE TAKING OF  
21 PROPERTY FROM ANOTHER PERSON BY FORCE. AND HE'S GOING  
22 TO GIVE YOU A BETTER DEFINITION BUT THAT'S THE SHORT  
23 VERSION, BUT IT'S THE TAKING OF PROPERTY. THE STATE  
24 HAS NOT PROVEN THAT PROPERTY WAS TAKEN BY RALPH  
25 COLEMAN IN THIS CASE. NOW, THERE IS, I THINK, AN

1 ALLEGATION THAT ASHLEY PARSLEY HAD A GUN. NOW, SHE  
2 SAYS IT WASN'T HER GUN, SHE SAYS IT WAS CHARLES  
3 PRINGLE'S GUN. AND THEY SAID THAT THEY COULD NEVER  
4 RECOVER THAT GUN. NOW, DOES THAT MEAN THAT RALPH  
5 COLEMAN TOOK THAT GUN, THAT HE ARM ROBBED CHARLES  
6 PRINGLE OF THAT GUN? NO, IT DOES NOT. THAT GUN AGAIN  
7 COULD HAVE BEEN OUTSIDE, MAYBE WHEN THIS WAS ALL OVER  
8 ASHLEY WAS CONCERNED ABOUT WHAT HAD JUST HAPPENED, THE  
9 POLICE OBVIOUSLY THOUGHT AT ONE POINT SHE WAS  
10 INVOLVED, AND SHE THREW THE GUN OUT BACK, OR SHE THREW  
11 THE GUN OUT THE FRONT DOOR. IT COULD HAVE BEEN IN THE  
12 AREA WHERE I SAID, ANY OF THESE GUNS COULD BE. THEY  
13 DIDN'T FIND IT BUT THAT DOESN'T PROVE RALPH COLEMAN  
14 TOOK IT.

15 NOW, LET'S STEP AWAY FROM THAT AND GO BACK TO THE  
16 TRUTH. AND THE TRUTH IS, RALPH COLEMAN WAS NOT  
17 PRESENT DURING THIS. REMOVE ANY IDEA THAT I SAID,  
18 LET'S ASSUME HE WAS PRESENT, BECAUSE YOUR JOB AS A THE  
19 JURY, AS I SAID, IS TO ASSUME HE WAS NOT PRESENT UNTIL  
20 YOU FIND THAT THE STATE HAS PROVEN BEYOND A REASONABLE  
21 DOUBT THAT HE WAS.

22 NOW, WE HEARD A LOT OF TESTIMONY OVER THE LAST  
23 WEEK, BUT WHAT WE REALLY NEED TO FOCUS ON IS WHAT OF  
24 THAT TESTIMONY PERTAINS TO RALPH COLEMAN AND WHETHER  
25 OR NOT HE COMMITTED THESE ACTS. WE SUBMIT TO YOU THAT

1           THERE ARE TWO PEOPLE, TWO WITNESSES OUT OF EVERYBODY  
2           YOU SAW, I BELIEVE THERE WERE TWELVE WITNESSES, TWO  
3           PERTAIN TO THIS. THAT WOULD BE ASHLEY PARSLEY AND  
4           PATRICK TYLER. INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT GOT UP, HE WAS  
5           THE LAST WITNESS YESTERDAY, AND HE TALKED A LOT ABOUT  
6           WHO PATRICK TYLER SAID DID WHAT, AND WHAT ASHLEY  
7           PARSLEY WAS ABLE TO TELL HIM, BUT HE HAD NO PERSONAL  
8           KNOWLEDGE. HIS TESTIMONY IS JUST BASICALLY EXPLAINING  
9           HIS INVESTIGATION. SO, JUST BECAUSE HE GOT UP THERE  
10          AND SAID, ASHLEY PARSLEY PICKED THIS PHOTO OUT OF THIS  
11          LINEUP DOESN'T MAKE IT ANYMORE TRUE, IT JUST MEANS  
12          THAT HE WAS THE INVESTIGATOR SHOWING THE LINEUPS.  
13          IT'S BASICALLY A MATTER OF EVIDENCE, THE STATE CAN'T  
14          SHOW YOU THOSE LINEUPS WITHOUT THE INVESTIGATOR  
15          SAYING, YES, I MADE THAT LINEUP. IT DOESN'T MAKE IT  
16          MORE TRUE JUST BECAUSE IT CAME FROM THE INVESTIGATOR'S  
17          MOUTH. HE CAN'T MAKE ANOTHER WITNESS BE TRUTHFUL.

18                 NOW, LOOKING AT ASHLEY PARSLEY FIRST, HER  
19                 STATEMENT TO THE POLICE, AND YOU'LL HAVE THAT IN YOUR  
20                 JURY ROOM WITH YOU, HAD ABOUT FOUR LINES, AND IT'S A  
21                 GOOD LONG PAGE, THAT ACTUALLY DISCUSSED WHAT HAPPENED  
22                 DURING THIS INCIDENT. SHE STATED TO THE POLICE THAT  
23                 ONE DARK SKINNED DUDE IN BLUE CAME IN. NOW, ON THE  
24                 STAND SHE ACTUALLY ADMITTED THAT SHE COULDN'T SEE THAT  
25                 PERSON'S FACE, SHE SAW HIS EYES, THAT HE HAD SOMETHING

1 COVERING HIS FACE, A MASK. NOW, I SUBMIT TO YOU, IT'S  
2 A LITTLE STRANGE THAT YOU WOULD OPEN A DOOR TO A  
3 MASKED MAN AND LET HIM IN, BUT SHE SAID SHE DID. NOW,  
4 OBVIOUSLY, THAT PERSON, THAT ONE DARK SKINNED DUDE IN  
5 THE BLUE WAS NOT RALPH COLEMAN. SHE NEVER SAID THAT  
6 WAS RALPH COLEMAN.

7 NOW, IN HER STATEMENT TO THE POLICE THE DAY THAT  
8 IT HAPPENED, THAT MORNING THIS HAPPENED, SHE NEVER  
9 TALKED ABOUT SEEING A SECOND PERSON. SHE MENTIONED ON  
10 THE STAND SHE MIGHT HAVE CAUGHT A GLIMPSE OF A CHUBBY  
11 PERSON, BUT SHE NEVER TOLD THE POLICE THAT ORIGINALLY.  
12 SHE DIDN'T RELAY ANY OF THAT INFORMATION TO THE  
13 DISPATCH WHEN SHE CALLED NINE ONE ONE, SHE COULDN'T  
14 IDENTIFY ANYBODY, SHE COULDN'T GIVE ANY DESCRIPTION.  
15 SHE SAID NOTHING. SHE SAID, SEVERAL MEN, THAT WAS HER  
16 DESCRIPTION. SHE DIDN'T TALK TO THE RESPONDING  
17 OFFICER ABOUT, I ACTUALLY SAW TWO PEOPLE, SHE DIDN'T  
18 EVEN SAY SHE SAW ONE. SHE DIDN'T TALK TO INVESTIGATOR  
19 SHUMPERT ABOUT SEEING TWO PEOPLE. EIGHT MONTHS AFTER  
20 THIS INCIDENT SHE GOT ON THE STAND AND SAID NOW SHE  
21 REMEMBERED SEEING TWO PEOPLE.

22 NOW, THAT SECOND PERSON SHE SAW, SHE SAID SHE  
23 CAUGHT A GLIMPSE OF, HE WAS CHUBBY, MIGHT HAVE BEEN  
24 WEARING GREEN, YOU KNOW, WHY COULD SHE NOT SAY WHAT  
25 HAPPENED? HER FACE WAS DOWN ON THE GROUND. SHE SAW

1 ONE PERSON, AND BEYOND THAT YOU REMEMBER TESTIMONY  
2 FROM JUST ABOUT EVERY WITNESS THAT WAS ACTUALLY AT THE  
3 SCENE THAT THERE WAS ONE LIGHT IN THIS HOUSE IN THE  
4 CEILING, AND IT WAS A BLACK LIGHT. NOW, I KNOW WE'RE  
5 ALL DIFFERENT AGES, SO BLACK LIGHTS MIGHT MEAN  
6 DIFFERENT THINGS TO EVERYBODY, BUT FOR ME, THINK OF A  
7 SKATE RINK WHEN YOU'RE A KID GOING SKATING, THEY HAVE  
8 BLACK LIGHTS A LOT OF TIMES. IN THE EVENINGS THEY'LL  
9 PUT MUSIC ON, BLACK LIGHTS. COSMIC BOWLING, IF YOU'VE  
10 EVER BEEN COSMIC BOWLING OR TAKING YOUR CHILDREN  
11 BOWLING, THEY TURN OFF ALL THE LIGHTS, TURN ON BLACK  
12 LIGHTS, PLAY MUSIC, YOU BOWL. THEY USED TO HAVE BLACK  
13 LIGHTS A LOT OF TIMES IN CLUBS, I THINK SOMETIMES THEY  
14 STILL DO, BUT I KNOW IT USED TO BE MUCH MORE POPULAR.  
15 LASER TAG, I'M NOT FROM SOUTH CAROLINA, WHERE I'M FROM  
16 WE USED TO LAY LASER TAG, AND THAT'S THE SAME THING,  
17 IN A BUILDING YOU'RE PLAYING TAG AND YOU TURN OFF THE  
18 LIGHTS AND THERE'S BLACK LIGHTS. THE REASON I BRING  
19 THIS UP, AND I HOPE YOU ALL HAVE A REFERENCE OF WHAT A  
20 BLACK IS, A BLACK LIGHT IS NOT MEANT TO ILLUMINATE A  
21 ROOM. A BLACK LIGHT, THE PURPOSE OF A BLACK LIGHT IS  
22 TO CHANGE COLORS. IF YOU WALK INTO A ROOM WITH A  
23 BLACK LIGHT, I SUBMIT TO YOU, YOU WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO  
24 TELL THAT I HAD A GREEN SHIRT ON VERSUS A BROWN SUIT.  
25 YOU WOULDN'T EVEN BE ABLE TO TELL I HAVE A BROWN SUIT

1 ON. IT WOULD LOOK ALL BLACK TO YOU. NOW, MY HAIR  
2 WOULD GLOW, AND MY NAILS MIGHT GLOW, BECAUSE THEY'RE  
3 WHITE AT THE ENDS. WHITE GLOWS IN THE DARK, IN BLACK  
4 LIGHT. LIGHTER COLORS GLOW IN BLACK LIGHT. DARKER  
5 COLORS ALL LOOK THE SAME IN BLACK LIGHT. BEYOND THAT  
6 IT IS NOT BRIGHT. EVERYBODY TESTIFIED THAT IT WAS  
7 DIM. I BELIEVE SHANNON MITCHELL, WHEN MY CO-COUNSEL  
8 WAS QUESTIONING HIM, SAID THAT THIS FAR AWAY HE MIGHT  
9 BE ABLE TO SEE SOMEBODY, BUT NOT THIS FAR AWAY. WHEN  
10 I SPEAK OF A BLACK LIGHT, IT'S NOT MEANT TO ILLUMINATE  
11 THE ROOM. NOBODY IN THAT ROOM COULD SEE WHAT WAS  
12 GOING ON.

13 NOW, GETTING BACK TO WHAT ASHLEY SAID ABOUT THE  
14 PERSON THAT SHE MIGHT HAVE SEEN, IN HER AFFIDAVIT OF  
15 THE LINEUP SHE SAID THAT IT'S POSSIBLE THAT PERSON WAS  
16 THERE, I DIDN'T REALLY SEE HIS FACE. WHEN I  
17 QUESTIONED HER ON THE STAND I SAID, ARE YOU SURE THAT  
18 THE PERSON YOU PICKED IN THAT LINEUP IS THE PERSON YOU  
19 SAW? SHE SAID, NO, I CAN'T BE SURE, I CAN'T BE SURE.  
20 NOW, THE ONLY DESCRIPTION WE GOT OF THAT PERSON WAS,  
21 HE'S CHUBBY.

22 RALPH COULD YOU PLEASE STAND UP.

23 I SUBMIT TO YOU, THERE'S NOTHING CHUBBY ABOUT  
24 RALPH COLEMAN. HE'S ACTUALLY A PRETTY WELL BUILT MAN,  
25 NOTHING CHUBBY ABOUT HIM. NOW, WHAT IS NOTICEABLE

1 ABOUT HIM? I WOULD SAY HIS LONG DREDS ARE PRETTY  
2 NOTICEABLE. THAT'S NOT SOMETHING THAT YOU GROW  
3 OVERNIGHT. SHE MENTIONED NOTHING ABOUT ANYBODY HAVING  
4 ANY DREDS.

5 THANK YOU, RALPH.

6 NOW, I UNDERSTAND SHE DID PICK HIM OUT OF THE  
7 LINEUP, AND THAT'S CURIOUS, THAT'S QUESTIONABLE. BUT  
8 YOU HEARD INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT SAY, WHEN THEY PUT A  
9 LINEUP TOGETHER THE PURPOSE IS TO MAKE THESE SIX  
10 PEOPLE LOOK AS MUCH ALIKE AS POSSIBLE. AND THE REASON  
11 IS, THEY DON'T WANT WITNESSES TO MAKE A MISTAKE OR TO  
12 NOT BE SURE, JUST AS ASHLEY PARSLEY SAID, SHE WAS NOT  
13 SURE. THEY MAKE EVERYBODY LOOK AS CLOSE ALIKE AS THEY  
14 CAN SO THAT WHEN YOU TRULY GET A GOOD LOOK AT SOMEBODY  
15 YOU COULD PICK THAT PERSON OUT EVEN THOUGH THE OTHER  
16 FIVE PICTURES LOOK LIKE THEM. NOW, I'LL ASK YOU, WHEN  
17 YOU GO BACK INTO THAT JURY ROOM LOOK AT THIS LINEUP.  
18 I WILL TELL YOU THAT THE MAN IN NUMBER TWO IS PRETTY  
19 DARN CLOSE TO THE MAN IN NUMBER ONE. BOTH HAVE DREDS,  
20 BOTH HAVE THE SAME FACE STRUCTURE, BOTH HAVE THE SAME  
21 NOSE STRUCTURE, THEY LOOK VERY SIMILAR, VERY SIMILAR.  
22 NOW, WHY DID SHE PICK NUMBER ONE? WE CAN ONLY GUESS  
23 AS TO THAT, BUT IF YOU THINK ABOUT IT, RALPH COLEMAN'S  
24 PICTURE IN THIS SIX PERSON LINEUP WAS NUMBER ONE, THE  
25 FIRST ONE. WHEN YOU'RE A CHILD, VERY YOUNG, YOU START

1 TO LEARN TO READ. HOW DO WE READ, LEFT TO RIGHT, TOP  
2 TO BOTTOM? YOUR EYE IS NATURALLY DRAWN TO THAT PART  
3 OF THE PAPER, START AT THE TOP, WORK TO THE BOTTOM,  
4 LEFT TO RIGHT, THAT'S THE WAY WE READ, THAT'S THE WAY  
5 WE'VE BEEN TAUGHT TO READ SINCE THREE, FOUR, FIVE  
6 YEARS OLD, A VERY NATURAL THING TO DO. YOU'RE GOING  
7 TO HAVE ALL THESE LINEUPS BACK THERE, AND I ASK YOU TO  
8 LOOK AT THEM.

9 NOW, THEY SHOWED PATRICK TYLER LINEUPS. HE  
10 PICKED MARIO SHIVERS, HIS PICTURE WAS NUMBER THREE, HE  
11 PICKED DANNY RYANT, HIS PICTURE WAS NUMBER TWO, HE  
12 PICKED CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, HIS PICTURE WAS NUMBER TWO,  
13 HE PICKED RALPH COLEMAN, AGAIN, HIS PICTURE WAS NUMBER  
14 ONE. GRANTED, PATRICK TYLER KNEW ALL OF THESE PEOPLE.  
15 HE WAS ALSO SHOWN DMV PHOTOS PREVIOUSLY WHO THESE  
16 PEOPLE WERE, SO, REALISTIC HIS LINEUPS DON'T MATTER.  
17 BUT THE POINT IS, WHERE THE PEOPLE WERE IN THESE  
18 LINEUPS. ASHLEY PARSLEY LOOKED AT LINEUPS, THE THREE  
19 SHE PICKED, MARIO SHIVERS WAS NUMBER THREE, WALTER  
20 HARRIS WAS NUMBER THREE, AGAIN RALPH COLEMAN WAS  
21 NUMBER ONE. WHEN MONEAK BUSBY LOOKED AT LINEUPS, AND  
22 GRANTED, MONEAK BUSBY HAS NOTHING TO DO WITH RALPH  
23 COLEMAN, KNOWS NOTHING ABOUT RALPH COLEMAN, BUT WHEN  
24 SHE LOOKED AT LINEUPS SHE PICKED TWO PEOPLE. PATRICK  
25 TYLER WAS NUMBER FOUR, MARIO SHIVERS WAS NUMBER

1 THREE. OUT OF ALL THE LINEUPS THAT ANYBODY WAS ABLE  
2 TO BE IDENTIFIED, RALPH COLEMAN IS THE ONLY ONE THAT  
3 HIS PICTURE WAS NUMBER ONE, AND I SUBMIT TO YOU, SHE  
4 PICKED HIM BECAUSE IT WAS THE FIRST IN THE LINE, SHE  
5 WASN'T REAL SURE, IT LOOKED LIKE IT COULD HAVE BEEN  
6 THAT GUY, SO SHE PICKED HIM.

7 NOW, HEARING ASHLEY PARSLEY ADIT ON THE STAND SHE  
8 WAS NOT SURE AT ALL IF IT WAS RALPH COLEMAN OR NOT,  
9 SHE COULDN'T BE SURE, IS THAT REASONABLE DOUBT AS TO  
10 WHETHER RALPH COLEMAN WAS PRESENT? YES. THAT'S  
11 ABSOLUTELY REASONABLE DOUBT. AND I UNDERSTAND, THE  
12 SOLICITOR ORIGINALLY GOT UP HERE AND TALKED ABOUT  
13 REASONABLE DOUBT AND SAID, YOU KNOW, SOME PEOPLE MAY  
14 DOUBT THAT THE EARTH REVOLVES AROUND THE SUN. IS THAT  
15 REASONABLE? I WOULD SAY, NO. I MEAN, AT THIS POINT  
16 WE'VE GOT SCIENTIFIC PROOF, WE'VE HAD -- WE'VE GOT  
17 SATELLITES, WE'VE HAD PEOPLE ON THE MOON, WE CAN TELL  
18 THE EARTH REVOLVES AROUND THE SUN. THAT IS NOT A  
19 REASONABLE DOUBT. IS IT REASONABLE TO DOUBT THAT  
20 RALPH COLEMAN WAS THERE WHEN THE ONLY PERSON PRESENT  
21 DURING THE ROBBERY THAT HAS NO INTEREST IN THIS CASE  
22 CAN'T BE SURE IF HE WAS THERE? IT'S ABSOLUTELY  
23 REASONABLE TO DOUBT HE WAS THERE.

24 NOW, PATRICK TYLER GOT ON THE STAND AND SAID A  
25 LOT OF INTERESTING THINGS. MOST INTERESTING I FOUND

1 WAS HIS NEW DESIRE TO DO THE RIGHT THING. NOW, HE  
2 SAID, WHY WAS HE DOING THE RIGHT THING? FOR HIM AND  
3 HIS FAMILY. WELL, THAT DOESN'T MEAN HE'S TELLING THE  
4 TRUTH, THAT JUST MEANS HE'S TRYING TO GET HIMSELF OUT  
5 OF TROUBLE. HE'S SEVENTEEN YEARS OLD. HIS FAMILY  
6 DOESN'T WANT HIM IN PRISON FOR THE REST OF HIS LIFE,  
7 SO HE'S DOING WHAT HE CAN TO GET HOME AS QUICK AS HE  
8 CAN.

9 NOW, HE TURNED HIMSELF IN, PATRICK TYLER KNEW HE  
10 WAS WANTED. HE KNEW WHAT THE POLICE WANTED HIM FOR.  
11 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT SAID THEY HAD GOTTEN TIPS ABOUT  
12 WHAT WAS GOING ON, INVESTIGATOR, OR EXCUSE ME, ANDRE  
13 WASHINGTON SAID THAT HE HAD HEARD THAT THIS GUN THAT  
14 HE HAD PURCHASED WAS STOLEN. WELL, WHO DID HE HEAR  
15 THAT FROM? PEOPLE ON THE STREET. WE KNOW HOW IT  
16 WORKS. EVERYBODY TALKS. ORANGEBURG COUNTY IS HUGE,  
17 AND I UNDERSTAND THAT. BASED ON SIZE AND LAND IT IS  
18 BIG. BUT COMMUNITY, THE COMMUNITY AROUND HERE IS  
19 SMALL. AND WHAT I MEAN BY THAT IS, PEOPLE TALK.  
20 PEOPLE STICK TOGETHER, PEOPLE TALK ABOUT WHAT'S GOING  
21 ON, AND THAT'S HOW PATRICK TYLER KNEW WHO THE POLICE  
22 WERE LOOKING FOR AND KNEW WHAT THEY WANTED TO HEAR.  
23 PATRICK TYLER GOT ON THE STAND AND ACTUALLY TOLD YOU,  
24 HE TOLD THE POLICE WHAT THEY WANTED TO HEAR. HE TOLD  
25 YOU HE LIED. HE DIDN'T SAY AT ANYTIME HE WAS TELLING

1 THE TRUTH, HE SAID HE WAS DOING WHAT HE NEEDED TO DO,  
2 DOING WHAT WAS RIGHT FOR HIS FAMILY.

3 NOW, I UNDERSTAND PATRICK TYLER CAME, AND  
4 EVERYONE OF THE DEFENSE ATTORNEYS QUESTIONED HIM ABOUT  
5 HIS BENEFIT FOR TESTIFYING, AND HE SAID HE HAD GOTTEN  
6 NO PROMISE. AND I'M SURE THAT'S TRUE, THE STATE  
7 WOULDN'T MAKE A PROMISE SO HE COULD COME IN HERE AND  
8 TESTIFY THEY PROMISED HIM SOMETHING. BUT HE DID TELL  
9 YOU HE'S PLEADING TO A REDUCED CHARGE. NOW, I  
10 UNDERSTAND THAT A REDUCED CHARGE DOESN'T GET HIM OUT  
11 OF TROUBLE, ABSOLUTELY DOESN'T GET HIM OUT OF TROUBLE.  
12 HE SHOULDN'T BE OUT OF TROUBLE. HE ADMITTED ON THIS  
13 STAND HE WAS PRESENT WHEN CHARLES PRINGLE WAS KILLED.  
14 HE SHOULDN'T BE OUT OF TROUBLE. NOW, HE'S FACING  
15 FIFTEEN YEARS TO LIFE, HE TOLD YOU THAT. BUT  
16 REALISTICALLY -- AND HE SAID THAT HE WOULDN'T BE  
17 SURPRISED IF HE GOT LIFE. IS THAT REAL? IS THAT  
18 REALISTIC? NO. HE'S NOT GOING TO GET LIFE, HE'S  
19 GOING TO GET A BENEFIT FROM TESTIFYING, OR HE WOULD  
20 HAVE NEVER DONE IT. NOW, HE CAN GET FIFTEEN TO LIFE,  
21 BUT WHATEVER HE GETS HE'S ALSO PAROLE ELIGIBLE, HE'LL  
22 SERVE EIGHTY-FIVE PER CENT OF HIS SENTENCE. SO, LET'S  
23 PRETEND HE GETS FIFTEEN YEARS. WHAT DOES THAT MEAN?  
24 THAT MEANS HE'S GOING TO SERVE ABOUT TWELVE AND A  
25 HALF, GIVE OR TAKE A MONTH OR TWO, I'M NOT A

1 MATHEMATICIAN, BUT MY POINT IS, HIS TESTIMONY COULD  
2 VERY WELL GET HIM TWELVE AND A HALF YEARS IN PRISON  
3 FOR HIS ADMISSION THAT HE WAS PRESENT AND PARTICIPATED  
4 IN THE MURDER OF CHARLES PRINGLE. DOES HE HAVE A  
5 BENEFIT FOR GETTING UP HERE AND TELLING YOU WHAT THE  
6 POLICE WANTED TO HEAR? ABSOLUTELY.

7 NOW, HE ALSO GOT UP HERE AND SAID THAT HE WASN'T  
8 LYING, BUT HE KNEW HE COULDN'T CHANGE HIS STORY  
9 EITHER, BECAUSE IF HE CHANGES HIS STORY HE WOULDN'T  
10 GET ANY BENEFIT. I SUBMIT TO YOU, HE DID CHANGE HIS  
11 STORY. LOOK AT HIS STATEMENT AND THEN LISTEN TO WHAT  
12 HE SAID ON THE STAND. IT IS NOT THE SAME. NOW,  
13 OBVIOUSLY, THERE IS ONE PART THAT IS THE SAME, AND  
14 THAT'S WHO PARTICIPATED. BUT WHY DID HE NOT CHANGE  
15 THAT? BECAUSE HE KNEW BETTER. THAT WAS THE PART THE  
16 POLICE WANTED TO HEAR. THEY DIDN'T REALLY CARE ABOUT  
17 WHO HAD A GUN AND WHO DIDN'T. I MEAN, THEY'RE TELLING  
18 YOU THAT IT DIDN'T MATTER WHO HAD A GUN. SO, IF HE'S  
19 CHANGING HIS STORY ABOUT WHO HAD A GUN, OR IF HE'S  
20 CHANGING HIS STORY ABOUT WHO WENT WHERE WHEN, THAT'S  
21 NOT GOING TO AFFECT HIS BENEFIT. BUT HE CAN'T NOW  
22 COME IN HERE AND TELL YOU THAT ANYBODY ELSE DID IT, HE  
23 HAD TO STICK TO RALPH COLEMAN BEING THERE, HE HAD TO,  
24 OR HE WOULDN'T GET THE BENEFIT.

25 NOW, THE SOLICITOR MADE A BIG POINT ABOUT

1 PATRICK TYLER BEING SIXTEEN YEARS OLD WHEN THIS  
2 HAPPENED. SIXTEEN IS YOUNG, I'M NOT SAYING THAT IT'S  
3 NOT. HE'S SEVENTEEN NOW, BUT THAT DOESN'T MATTER. THE  
4 POINT IS, HE MADE AN ADULT DECISION. THE SOLICITOR  
5 AND PATRICK TYLER CAN'T COME IN HERE AND ACT LIKE HE  
6 WAS YOUNG AND DIDN'T WANT TO DO THIS, AND THESE OLDER  
7 GUYS JUST MADE HIM DO THIS, AND YOU KNOW, HE JUST, HE  
8 JUST COULDN'T STOP HIMSELF, HE WAS JUST TOO YOUNG AND  
9 TOO DUMB TO KNOW BETTER. I SUBMIT TO YOU THAT  
10 EVERYBODY KNOWS BETTER. I THINK AT FIVE YEARS OLD YOU  
11 KNOW BETTER.

12 NOW, WHAT ELSE DID PATRICK TYLER TELL US? WHAT  
13 ELSE IS GOING TO HELP MAKE SURE THAT HE DOESN'T GET  
14 LIFE IN PRISON? HIS STORY. PATRICK TYLER DIDN'T  
15 HAVE A GUN, ACCORDING TO PATRICK TYLER. PATRICK TYLER  
16 WASN'T PRESENT WHEN MR. PRINGLE GOT SHOT, EXCUSE ME,  
17 ACCORDING TO PATRICK TYLER. WHAT DID HE SAY ON THE  
18 STAND? HE SAID, HE WAS IN THE HOUSE WITH ALL THESE  
19 OTHER PEOPLE, AND THAT HE HEARD A GUN SHOT BECAUSE  
20 SOMEONE SHOT THE DOG. AND GRANTED, NO OTHER PERSON  
21 GOT ON THAT STAND AND SAID THAT DOG WAS HURT, EVER. I  
22 THINK WE ACTUALLY ASKED ONE OF THE INVESTIGATORS IF  
23 THE DOG WAS HURT IN ANY FASHION, WAS HE INJURED, WAS  
24 HE SHOT, WAS HE DEAD? AND I BELIEVE IT WAS LIEUTENANT  
25 CARTER WHO SAID, NO, HE WAS FINE, HE WAS TIED TO A

1 BRICK IN THE KITCHEN. BUT PATRICK TYLER HAS THAT, HAS  
2 SOMEBODY, HE DOESN'T KNOW WHO, DEFINITELY NOT HIM,  
3 SHOOTING THE DOG, AND HE RUNS OUT. HE RUNS OUT TO THE  
4 CAR, RIGHT, BECAUSE HE DOESN'T WANT TO BE IN THERE, HE  
5 DOESN'T KNOW WHO SHOT WHAT, AND HE DIDN'T EVEN KNOW  
6 CHARLES PRINGLE GOT SHOT BECAUSE HE DIDN'T SEE IT.  
7 THEY ONLY SHOT THE DOG AS FAR AS HE KNEW.

8 WHAT ELSE DID HE DO TO MAKE SURE THAT HE DOESN'T  
9 GET LIFE? HE WAS ONLY SUPPOSED TO BUY WEED. HE  
10 DIDN'T HAVE A GUN, HIS ONLY PARTICIPATION WAS GOING IN  
11 TO BUY THE WEED. HE WAS JUST TO GO IN, BUT WHAT HE  
12 FORGOT TO TELL YOU WAS, HE WAS SUPPOSED TO GO IN AND  
13 LEAVE THAT DOOR OPEN TO MAKE SURE THAT SOMEBODY ELSE  
14 COULD GET IN. THAT DOESN'T MAKE HIM INNOCENT. HE WAS  
15 PRESENT, HE WILL BE PUNISHED, AND HE NEEDS TO BE  
16 PUNISHED.

17 NOW, OTHER INTERESTING THINGS CAME OUT OF PATRICK  
18 TYLER'S TESTIMONY. HE SAID THAT HE AND RALPH HAD WENT  
19 INTO THIS HOUSE TOGETHER WHEN THEY GOT THERE, THE  
20 SECOND TIME, AND YOU'VE HEARD ABOUT THEM GOING ONE  
21 TIME AND THEN GOING BACK A SECOND TIME. THE SECOND  
22 TIME IS WHAT REALLY MATTERS. HE SAID HE AND RALPH  
23 WENT IN TOGETHER. ASHLEY PARSLEY, THE PERSON WHO WAS  
24 THERE, THE PERSON WHO HAS NO REASON TO CHANGE ANY SORT  
25 OF STORY, SHE SAID, ONE PERSON CAME IN, NOT TWO. SHE

1 SAID IT WAS ONE DARK SKINNED GUY WITH A MASK ON HIS  
2 FACE, WHICH AGAIN, IS ODD, BUT THAT'S WHAT SHE SAID.  
3 SHE DIDN'T SAY TWO PEOPLE CAME IN.

4 NOW, PATRICK TYLER SAID THAT WALTER HARRIS HAD  
5 GIVEN RALPH HIS GUN BEFORE HE HAD GONE INTO THE  
6 APARTMENT. ASHLEY PARSLEY SAID THAT THE PERSON THAT  
7 CAME IN AND PUT A GUN IN HER FACE HAD A NINE  
8 MILLIMETER CHROME, AND I BELIEVE THAT'S IN HER  
9 AFFIDAVIT ON THE LINEUPS THAT SHE PICKED, NOT ON RALPH  
10 COLEMAN'S LINEUP, BUT THE PERSON THAT PUT THE GUN IN  
11 HER FACE HAD A NINE MILLIMETER CHROME GUN. THAT IS  
12 CERTAINLY NOT THE BLACK FORTY THAT THEY ARE TRYING TO  
13 SAY WALTER GAVE TO RALPH, THAT THEY'RE TRYING TO SAY  
14 RALPH WENT INTO THAT HOUSE WITH. ASHLEY PARSLEY SAID  
15 IT WAS A CHROME NINE MILLIMETER. DOES SHE HAVE ANY  
16 REASON TO LIE? NO.

17 NOW, PATRICK TYLER GAVE US TWO STORIES. IN COURT  
18 HE TESTIFIED, I BELIEVE IT WAS DARIUS GARNER HAD TAKEN  
19 HIM TO RALPH COLEMAN'S HOUSE AND WHILE THEY WERE THERE  
20 THEY DISCUSSED A ROBBERY. NOW, IN HIS FIRST STORY YOU  
21 WILL SEE, HE DOESN'T SAY THAT, HE SAYS, LITTLE M  
22 CALLED HIM AND THAT THEY ALL RODE OVER THERE TO PICK  
23 PATRICK TYLER UP OFF BROOKDALE, UP AROUND BROOKDALE  
24 SCHOOL. OBVIOUSLY, THAT'S WAY DIFFERENT THAN HIM  
25 BEING AT RALPH COLEMAN'S HOUSE.

1           NOW, WHEN YOU GET BACK IN THE JURY ROOM REMEMBER  
2           WHAT HE ORIGINALLY TOLD THE POLICE. HE PUT FOUR GUNS  
3           IN FIVE PEOPLE'S HANDS. HE SAID, ME AND RALPH WENT IN  
4           AND RALPH HAD A GUN, AND THEN WALTER, PETE, POKE --  
5           WHO AM I MISSING, THE OTHER FOUR, EXCUSE ME, CAME IN  
6           WITH GUNS OUT. THAT'S FIVE PEOPLE, FOUR GUNS. NOT  
7           POSSIBLE.

8           NOW, WHAT WAS CONSISTENT WITH PATRICK TYLER'S  
9           STORY? HE'S NOT THE BAD GUY. NOW, WHY WOULD PATRICK  
10          TYLER SAY RALPH COLEMAN WAS THERE IF HE WASN'T? WHY  
11          WOULD HE PICK HIM? WELL, IF YOU BELIEVE DARIUS  
12          GARNER'S STORY THAT HE DID TAKE PATRICK TYLER OVER TO  
13          RALPH COLEMAN'S HOUSE, MAYBE HE KNEW THAT SOMEONE  
14          COULD PUT RALPH COLEMAN WITH HIM. DARIUS COULD SAY, I  
15          TOOK HIM TO RALPH COLEMAN'S HOUSE. NOW, DARIUS  
16          COULDN'T TRULY SAY IT WAS RALPH COLEMAN'S HOUSE, WE  
17          LEARNED THAT THROUGH SOMEBODY ELSE, AND HE COULDN'T  
18          TRULY SAY IT WAS ACTUALLY RALPH COLEMAN, HE SAID IT  
19          WAS A STOCKY GUY WITH DREDS. I SUBMIT TO YOU, RALPH  
20          COLEMAN IS CERTAINLY NOT THE ONLY PERSON STOCKY WITH  
21          DREDS. DARIUS GRANT, OR GARNER, EXCUSE ME, COULD NOT  
22          PUT RALPH COLEMAN WITH PATRICK TYLER AFTER THIS EVENT,  
23          AFTER HIS HOUSE. HE LEFT HIM THERE, THAT'S ALL HE  
24          COULD SAY. BUT THAT TIED PATRICK TYLER TO RALPH  
25          COLEMAN ON THIS DATE, SO PATRICK KNEW HE COULD PICK

1 RALPH AND THERE WOULD BE SOME EVIDENCE THAT THEY HAD  
2 BEEN TOGETHER. WHY ELSE WOULD BE PICK RALPH? WELL,  
3 THERE'S SOME REASON TO BELIEVE THAT THERE HAD BEEN  
4 SOME CONFRONTATION BETWEEN THE TWO OF THEM. I BELIEVE  
5 PATRICK TYLER DENIED IT, BUT I BELIEVE THERE - - -

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: SO, WHERE IS HER EVIDENCE OF  
7 IT? OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. THERE IS NO EVIDENCE OF  
8 IT. I WITHDRAW MY OBJECTION, I APOLOGIZE. I WITHDRAW  
9 IT, GO AHEAD.

10 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

11 MS. ULLMAN: JUST BECAUSE PATRICK TYLER SAID THAT  
12 HE AND RALPH NEVER HAD PROBLEMS DOESN'T MEAN IT'S  
13 TRUE.

14 WHEN YOU GO BACK IN THAT JURY ROOM TO DELIBERATE  
15 PLEASE PAY ATTENTION TO THE TESTIMONY OF THE  
16 WITNESSES, AGAIN, WHAT CAME OUT OF THEIR MOUTHS.  
17 ALSO, PLEASE REMEMBER TWO THINGS THE STATE PROMISED AT  
18 THE BEGINNING OF THIS TRIAL, THEY PROMISED THAT ONCE  
19 PATRICK TYLER EXPLAINED EVERYBODY THAT WAS INVOLVED  
20 AND EVERYTHING THAT WAS DONE THEY WOULD HAVE AT LEAST  
21 ONE MORE WITNESS, IF NOT MORE, THAT WOULD BACK UP WHAT  
22 HE SAID. NOW, WHAT WITNESS DID THEY PROVIDE TO BACK  
23 UP HIS STORY? DARIUS GARNER. WHAT DID HE BACK UP?  
24 HE BACKED UP THAT HE DROPPED PATRICK TYLER OFF AT  
25 SOMEBODY'S HOUSE AND THAT HOURS LATER HE PICKED HIM UP

1 IN THE RAIN. I SUBMIT TO YOU THAT THAT DOES NOT  
2 CORROBORATE PATRICK TYLER'S STORY OF WHAT HAPPENED IN  
3 BETWEEN. HE COULD HAVE BEEN ANYWHERE WITH ANYBODY.  
4 DARIUS GARNER HAS NO IDEA.

5 THEY ALSO PROMISED THEY WERE GOING TO PRODUCE  
6 RONNIE WASHINGTON. RONNIE WASHINGTON HAS ADMITTED HE  
7 WAS THE DRIVER IN THIS INCIDENT. THEY DID NOT PRODUCE  
8 HIM. THEY DID NOT PRODUCE THE PERSON WHO WAS  
9 ALLEGEDLY IN HIS CAR WHO ADMITTED TO BEING IN HIS CAR,  
10 WHO SUPPOSEDLY DROVE ALL THESE PEOPLE, INCLUDING  
11 PATRICK TYLER, TO THIS RESIDENCE. THEY DIDN'T PRODUCE  
12 HIM. HE DID NOT GET ON THAT STAND AND NAME RALPH  
13 COLEMAN AS EVER BEING IN THAT CAR. AS A MATTER OF  
14 FACT, DURING OPENING STATEMENTS THE STATE ACTUALLY  
15 PROMISED YOU THAT RONNIE WASHINGTON WOULD COME IN HERE  
16 AND CORROBORATE ALL SIX PEOPLE WERE IN THAT CAR, AND  
17 WHEN I SAY, SIX, I'M INCLUDING PATRICK TYLER. HE  
18 DIDN'T SAY ANYTHING, HE DID NOT COME IN HERE. RONNIE  
19 WASHINGTON WAS SUPPOSED TO TELL YOU THAT HE TOOK ALL  
20 SIX OF THOSE PEOPLE TO THE KINGS ROAD APARTMENT, THEY  
21 WERE GOING THERE TO BUY WEED IS WHAT HE KNEW, BUT HE  
22 DIDN'T COME IN AND TELL YOU THAT. THE STATE HAS NOT  
23 PRODUCED THAT. SO, THEY HAVE NOT CORROBORATED PATRICK  
24 TYLER'S STORY. NOBODY HAS CORROBORATED PATRICK  
25 TYLER'S STORY EXCEPT FOR WHERE HE WAS AROUND, I THINK,

1 FIVE O'CLOCK, AND WHERE HE WAS AROUND MAYBE TEN:THIRTY  
2 OR ELEVEN O'CLOCK. THAT DOES NOT CORROBORATE HIS  
3 STORY.

4 ASHLEY PARSLEY, THE ONLY OTHER PERSON WHO HAD ANY  
5 TESTIMONY ABOUT WHAT DID OR DID NOT HAPPEN IN THAT  
6 APARTMENT, DOES NOT CORROBORATE HIS STORY. SHE SAYS  
7 ONE PERSON CAME IN, HE SAYS TWO. SHE NEVER BROUGHT UP  
8 THE DOG IN HER STATEMENT. HE NEVER TALKED ABOUT ANY OF  
9 THAT.

10 THE STATE HAS NOT MADE GOOD ON THEIR PROMISES,  
11 THEY DID NOT CORROBORATE PATRICK TYLER'S STORY, THEY  
12 DID NOT PRODUCE SUFFICIENT EVIDENCE TO PROVE RALPH  
13 COLEMAN GUILTY BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT, OR AS THEY  
14 SAID, BEYOND ANY DOUBT. ALL THEY'VE PRODUCED IS A  
15 LYING CO-DEFENDANT AND A WITNESS THAT DID NOT SEE  
16 RALPH, ID'D HIM POSSIBLY BECAUSE MAYBE, MAYBE SHE SAW  
17 HIM. I SUBMIT TO YOU THAT THAT IS REASONABLE DOUBT, A  
18 LYING CO-DEFENDANT AND A WITNESS WHO CANNOT BE SURE IS  
19 REASONABLE DOUBT. IT IS NOT WHETHER OR NOT THE EARTH  
20 REVOLVES AROUND THE SUN, IT IS A QUESTION THAT A  
21 REASONABLE PERSON WOULD ASK THEMSELVES, IT WOULD CAUSE  
22 YOU TO HESITATE.

23 NOW, AS I STATED EARLIER, I DID NOT HAVE TO  
24 PROVE, NOR DOES RALPH COLEMAN HAVE TO PROVE THAT HE  
25 DID NOT DO THIS. HE DOESN'T HAVE TO PROVE THAT HE WAS

1 NOT THERE. THE STATE MUST PROVE TO YOU BEYOND A  
2 REASONABLE DOUBT THAT HE WAS, AND THEY HAVE NOT. AND  
3 I ASK YOU TO RETURN A VERDICT OF NOT GUILTY FOR RALPH  
4 COLEMAN.

5 THANK YOU.

6 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MS. ULLMAN.

7 MR. PALMER.

8 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR, MAY IT PLEASE  
9 THE COURT.

10 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

11 CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MR. PALMER

12 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WEED AND GUNS, I'M SURE  
13 YOU'RE TIRED OF HEARING ABOUT WEED AND GUNS, AS I AM,  
14 BUT WE HAVE TO TALK ABOUT WEED AND GUNS FOR A MINUTE,  
15 BECAUSE THE DEFENDANTS ARE ALLEGED TO HAVE BEEN  
16 INVOLVED IN THIS. NOW PART OF WHAT THEY'RE BEING  
17 ACCUSED OF IS BEING INVOLVED WITH WEED AND GUNS. BUT  
18 LET ME SUGGEST TO YOU, AND MY NEXT COMMENT  
19 SPECIFICALLY EXCLUDES THE EXPERT WITNESSES THAT  
20 TESTIFIED IN THIS TRIAL. WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT IS  
21 THE LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS, I'M NOT REFERRING TO  
22 THEM, BUT EVERY OTHER FACTUAL WITNESS THAT TOOK THIS  
23 STAND IS ALSO HEAVILY INVOLVED IN WEED AND GUNS. SO,  
24 IF YOU'RE GOING TO JUDGE MY CLIENT, MR. HARRIS IN THE  
25 RED TIE OVER THERE, BECAUSE HE IS INVOLVED, OR HAS

1 BEEN INVOLVED IN WEED AND GUNS, THEN YOU'VE GOT TO  
2 GIVE THESE WITNESSES THE SAME JUDGEMENT. NOW, THEY'RE  
3 NOT HERE ON TRIAL FOR SMOKING WEED OR POSSESSING GUNS,  
4 THEY'RE HERE FOR A MUCH GRIMMER PURPOSE. AND AS THE  
5 SOLICITOR SAID, WHICH I AGREE, MR. HARRIS IS CHARGED  
6 WITH THE MOST HEINOUS CRIME ON THE BOOKS, MURDER. BUT  
7 LET'S GET ONE THING OUT OF THE WAY, EVEN IF YOU  
8 BELIEVE EVERY WORD OF TESTIMONY, EVEN IF YOU BELIEVE  
9 WHAT'S ON EVERY WRITTEN STATEMENT, WALTER LEE HARRIS  
10 DID NOT ACTUALLY KILL ANYBODY. THERE'S NOT A SHRED OF  
11 EVIDENCE THAT HE PULLED THE TRIGGER IN ANY SEQUENCE OF  
12 EVENTS THAT LED UP TO THESE CHARGES. AND THAT'S OUT  
13 OF THE WAY.

14 NOW, LET'S LOOK AT THE STATE'S CASE BECAUSE WE  
15 WERE -- YOU KNOW, THEY WROTE A CHECK AT THE BEGINNING  
16 OF THIS TRIAL, AND WE NEED TO SEE IF THEY CAN CASH IT.  
17 AND I KNOW MR. SORENSON TO BE A GREAT LAWYER, BUT HE  
18 TOLD YOU THERE WAS NO DOUBT AT ALL, AND AT THE END OF  
19 THE TRIAL YOU WOULD HAVE NO DOUBT AS TO WHAT HAPPENED.  
20 WELL, I AGREE WITH HIM AND THEN I DON'T. LET'S TALK  
21 ABOUT WHAT THERE'S NO DOUBT ABOUT.

22 THERE'S NO DOUBT THAT THIS GENTLEMAN IS DECEASED.  
23 THERE'S NO DOUBT THAT THE CAUSE OF HIS DEMISE WAS  
24 INJURY BY GUN SHOT WOUNDS. THERE'S NO DOUBT THAT IT  
25 HAPPENED AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD, AND I HOPE I

1 GOT THE ADDRESS RIGHT.

2 BUT NOW THE DOUBT COMES IN. AND I'LL TELL YOU  
3 WHY, BECAUSE THE STATE'S CASE IS BUILT ON A FOUNDATION  
4 OF SAND. THE STATE'S CASE DEPENDS AND REVOLVES SOLELY  
5 ON THE TESTIMONY OF PATRICK TYLER WHO TOOK THIS -- WHO  
6 CAME INTO THIS COURTROOM, TOOK THIS STAND AND TOLD US  
7 THAT HE HAD EVERY REASON TO TESTIFY AGAINST WALTER LEE  
8 HARRIS, AND THE REASON IS, IS THAT HE'S GOT A DEAL.  
9 AND WE ALL KNOW WHAT THAT MEANS. AND IF YOU REMEMBER,  
10 WHEN I CROSS-EXAMINED THIS GENTLEMAN, THIS YOUNG MAN I  
11 ASKED HIM OVER AND OVER AGAIN, PLEASE ADMIT THAT YOU  
12 WILL BENEFIT FROM TESTIFYING AGAINST MY CLIENT.  
13 EVERYBODY IN THE ROOM KNOWS HE'S GOING TO. AND YOU  
14 KNOW WHAT? HE WOULD NOT ADMIT IT. AND IF HE HAD  
15 ADMITTED IT, IT WOULD HAVE BEEN OKAY, BUT HE WOULDN'T.  
16 AND THAT'S GOT TO TELL YOU THAT HE'S NOT BEING HONEST  
17 WITH US.

18 NOW, HIS TESTIMONY IS THAT HE AND TWO OTHERS, NOT  
19 INCLUDING MR. HARRIS, TWO OTHER GUYS STARTED TO PLAN  
20 THIS WHOLE CAPER. THEY STARTED LONG BEFORE WALTER  
21 HARRIS WAS EVEN AROUND. THEY GOT THE GUNS, THEY LOADED  
22 THEM IN THE TRUCK IN THE BACK, THEY WERE SMOKING WEED,  
23 THEY GOT IN, AND THE PLAN WAS UNDERWAY. AND I'M JUST,  
24 I'M NOT SAYING THAT THESE ARE FACTS, I'M SAYING THAT  
25 THIS IS WHAT HE SAID. AT SOME POINT THEY DECIDED THEY

1 NEED ANOTHER STRAP, AND LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT CONFIRMED  
2 WHEN I ASKED HIM THAT THE STRAP IS A TERM FOR THE GUN  
3 NOT THE GUNMAN. THEY NEEDED ANOTHER GUN. OKAY. SO,  
4 THEY CALLED MR. HARRIS. NOW, THERE'S NOT A SHRED OF  
5 EVIDENCE WHAT THEY TOLD HIM, AND THERE'S NO EVIDENCE  
6 THAT HE HAD ANYTHING TO BELIEVE OTHER THAN THEY WERE  
7 GOING TO GO OUT AND BUY SOME WEED. NOW, THE ORIGINAL  
8 PLAN, ACCORDING TO TYLER, WAS THAT HE WAS GOING TO GO  
9 IN AND GET THE WEED, BUT IT DIDN'T TURN OUT THAT WAY.  
10 THERE'S NO EVIDENCE BEEN SUPPLIED TO SAY WHAT CHANGED  
11 THE PLAN. WHY DID TYLER NOT GO IN TO INITIALLY BUY  
12 THE WEED? AND LET ME SUGGEST SOMETHING, THERE'S A  
13 THEME THAT JUST JUMPS OUT AT ME IN THIS CASE. THERE'S  
14 TWO KINDS OF PLAYERS THAT ARE BECOMING APPARENT IN  
15 THIS TRIAL, THERE'S THE BAD GUYS AND THERE'S THE FALL  
16 GUY. THEY CALL UP MR. HARRIS, AND THIS IS ACCORDING  
17 TO HIM, IF YOU CHOOSE TO BELIEVE ANY OF HIS TESTIMONY  
18 THIS IS WHAT HIS VERSION OF THE PLAN WAS, THEY CALL  
19 MR. HARRIS, AND APPARENTLY SEND HIM IN TO BUY THE  
20 WEED. THERE'S NOT A SHRED OF EVIDENT THAT EVEN IF YOU  
21 BELIEVE THAT IT HAPPENED THAT WAY, THAT WALTER HARRIS  
22 KNEW ANYTHING OTHER THAN HE WAS SUPPOSED TO GO IN AND  
23 BUY SOME WEED. BUT THEN PATRICK TYLER SAYS HE COMES  
24 OUT AND SAYS, I'M NOT DOING THIS ANYMORE, I QUIT,  
25 HERE'S MY GUN.

1           NOW, JUDGE DICKSON IS GOING TO CHARGE YOU ON THE  
2           LAW, AND PART OF WHAT HE'S GOING TO CHARGE YOU IS THE  
3           DEFENSE OF WITHDRAWAL. AND WHAT WITHDRAWAL MEANS IS,  
4           IF YOU ARE INVOLVED IN SOME SORT OF PLAN OR  
5           CONSPIRACY, AND I'M NOT SAYING THAT MY CLIENT WAS, BUT  
6           IF YOU ARE, AND AT SOME POINT BEFORE THE ACTUAL PLAN  
7           IS UNDERWAY YOU WITHDRAW, YOU TAKE YOURSELF OUT OF IT,  
8           IT'S AN ABSOLUTE DEFENSE. NOW, DON'T TAKE MY WORD FOR  
9           IT, -- AND BY THE WAY, ANYTHING THE LAWYERS TELL YOU  
10          IN THIS CASE ARE NOT NECESSARILY FACTS AND ARE NOT  
11          NECESSARILY THE LAW. THE FACTS COME FROM YOU FINE  
12          LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, THAT'S YOUR JOB IN THIS CASE,  
13          AND THE LAW COMES FROM JUDGE DICKSON.

14                OKAY, SO WHERE ARE WE? WALTER HARRIS, ACCORDING  
15                TO PATRICK TYLER, COMES OUT AND SAYS, FOR WHATEVER  
16                REASON, THERE'S A GUY IN THERE I KNOW, I'M OUT, HERE'S  
17                MY GUN. AND YOU KNOW WHAT CORROBORATES THAT ACCORDING  
18                TO TYLER IS, HE MUST HAVE MADE, BEEN SO ASSERTED THAT  
19                THE BAD GUYS SAID, OKAY, WELL, WE NEED ANOTHER GUY, SO  
20                LET'S GO OVER TO THE CORNER POCKET AND GET ANOTHER  
21                GUY, MEANING MR. RYANT. OKAY. AND THIS IS RIGHT OUT  
22                OF HIS STATEMENT AND HIS TESTIMONY.

23                NOW, THIS IS WHERE IT GETS INTERESTING, BECAUSE  
24                NOW WE'VE GOT FOUR GUYS -- EXCUSE ME, FOUR GUNS,  
25                ACCORDING TO HIS TESTIMONY, AND FIVE GUYS. AND SO,

1 WHAT TYLER WANTS US TO BELIEVE IS, HE WENT IN TO BUY  
2 THE WEED TO BUY THE WEED THE SECOND TIME AND THE REST  
3 OF THE OTHER GUYS DID EVERYTHING, ALL THE BAD STUFF.  
4 AND IN ORDER FOR HIM TO PULL THAT OFF, TO MAKE THE  
5 MATH WORK HE NEEDS FOUR GUNMEN AND HE NEEDS A GUY WITH  
6 TAPE. HERE COMES THE FALL GUY. THE ONLY WAY TO MAKE  
7 THAT WORK IS TO PUT WALTER HARRIS BACK IN THE MIX WITH  
8 THE DUCT TAPE. AND YOU KNOW WHAT? THIS IS ALL FROM  
9 HIS STATEMENT, WHICH, THIS VERSION I'VE MARKED UP A  
10 LITTLE BIT, BUT YOU'LL HAVE THE STATEMENT, IT'S IN  
11 EVIDENCE, IT WAS PUT IN EVIDENCE BY THE DEFENDANT AND  
12 NOT THE STATE, BUT READ THIS STATEMENT CAREFULLY,  
13 BECAUSE IT DOESN'T EVEN AGREE WITH ITSELF. THERE ARE  
14 SOME PARTS THAT SAY THAT MR. HARRIS DID ONE THING,  
15 THERE ARE SOME PARTS THAT SAY HE DID ANOTHER THING,  
16 THAT HE HAD THIS AND HE HAD THAT, AND I SUBMIT TO YOU,  
17 IF YOU'RE GOING TO CONVICT A MAN BASED ON A WRITTEN  
18 STATEMENT THAT WAS MADE BACK IN MARCH, AT LEAST  
19 REQUIRE, DEMAND THAT IT AGREE WITH ITSELF. AND NOT  
20 ONLY THAT, EVEN THOUGH, EVEN IF IT DOESN'T AGREE WITH  
21 ITSELF, WHAT HE TOLD YOU THIS WEEK DOESN'T EVEN AGREE  
22 WITH THAT.

23 THERE'S ONE THING I'VE LEARNED IN TRYING CASES  
24 AND LISTENING TO WITNESSES, IS THAT THE TRUTH IS THE  
25 SAME EVERY TIME YOU TELL IT. THINGS CHANGE WHEN YOU

1 START TO PUT THE SPIN ON IT, AND I WILL SUBMIT TO YOU  
2 THAT THIS WITNESS WAS SPINNING LIKE A TOP, AND THAT  
3 THE STATE'S CASE IS HANGING BY THE THREAD OF PATRICK  
4 TYLER. BECAUSE IF YOU CHOOSE NOT TO BELIEVE PATRICK  
5 TYLER, GUESS WHAT? IT'S GAME OVER. THAT'S ALL  
6 THEY'VE GOT. OF COURSE, THEY CAN PROVE THE VICTIM  
7 DIED. OF COURSE, THEY CAN PROVE HE WAS KILLED WITH  
8 GUNS. OF COURSE, THEY CAN PROVE THEY'VE GOT BULLETS  
9 AND FRAGMENTS AND SHELLS AND CASINGS AND ALL THAT.  
10 BUT WITHOUT PATRICK TYLER THEY DON'T HAVE THE WHO, AND  
11 THEY DON'T HAVE THE HOW, AND THEY DON'T HAVE THE WHO  
12 DID WHAT. AND THEY DON'T EVEN HAVE THESE GUYS AT THIS  
13 SCENE, ESPECIALLY WALTER HARRIS.

14 NOW, CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE IS VERY REAL, AND I  
15 DON'T AGREE -- EXCUSE ME, I DON'T DISAGREE WITH  
16 ANYTHING MR. PASCOE TOLD YOU ABOUT CIRCUMSTANTIAL  
17 EVIDENCE. WHAT DO THEY HAVE TO OFFER? THE BLACK  
18 FORTY CAL. NOW, LAW ENFORCEMENT TESTIFIED THAT THEY  
19 EXECUTED A SEARCH WARRANT WHERE MR. HARRIS STAYS. DID  
20 THEY FIND THE BLACK FORTY CAL THERE? NO. DID THEY  
21 FIND IT IN HIS POSSESSION? NO. WHAT DO THEY HAVE TO  
22 PUT THE FORTY CAL IN HIS HAND? ANOTHER GUY THAT  
23 SMOKES WEED AND LIKES TO HAVE GUNS, THAT BUYS THEM ON  
24 THE STREET, CAME UP AND SAID, I BOUGHT THE GUN FROM  
25 PETE. BAD GUY OR FALL GUY, WHY SHOULD YOU BELIEVE

1 THIS GUY? WHO WAS HE? AND THE REASON, THE ONLY WAY  
2 LAW ENFORCEMENT RECOVERED IT IS, HE SOLD IT TO ANOTHER  
3 GUY.

4 YOU KNOW, WALTER HARRIS WAS MENTIONED A LOT IN  
5 THIS CASE, BUT THINK ABOUT IT, WALTER HARRIS BECAME A  
6 PART OF THIS CASE, AND YOU HEARD ME ASK LIEUTENANT  
7 SHUMPERT TO CONSIDER THESE TWO INCIDENTS IN THIS  
8 APARTMENT, ALLEGED VISIT NUMBER ONE AND ALLEGED VISIT  
9 NUMBER TWO. ALLEGED VISIT NUMBER ONE IS WHEN WALTER  
10 HARRIS WAS SUPPOSED TO HAVE APPEARED IN THE APARTMENT,  
11 ASKED FOR THE PARTICULAR TYPE OF WEED THAT HE  
12 APPARENTLY LIKES. THEY DIDN'T HAVE IT AND HE LEFT.  
13 NO CRIME, AT LEAST ANY CRIME THAT'S CHARGED WAS  
14 COMMITTED DURING ALLEGED VISIT NUMBER ONE. BUT GUESS  
15 WHAT? THE ONLY WITNESS THAT HAS IDENTIFIED MR. HARRIS  
16 AS BEING IN THAT APARTMENT THROUGH A PHOTO LINEUP WAS  
17 DURING ALLEGED VISIT NUMBER ONE, AND THAT'S MS.  
18 PARSLEY. AND NO, MR. MITCHELL, TOO. THOSE ARE TWO  
19 STATE'S WITNESSES THAT BRING WALTER HARRIS INTO THIS  
20 CASE, BUT IT WAS DURING THE FIRST VISIT, WHEN NOTHING  
21 HAPPENED. THAT'S HOW HE GOT INVOLVED IN THIS CASE.  
22 AND YOU HEARD LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT SAY, WHEN THIS  
23 STATEMENT WAS WRITTEN WALTER HARRIS WAS ALREADY UNDER  
24 ARREST. SO, HOW COULD HE BE A SUSPECT IN THIS CHAIN  
25 OF EVENTS, BECAUSE THE STATEMENT HADN'T EVEN BEEN

1 WRITTEN WHEN HE WAS PICKED UP? HE WAS PICKED UP BASED  
2 ON ALLEGED VISIT NUMBER ONE, WHEN NOTHING HAPPENED.

3 BACK TO PATRICK TYLER, IN ORDER FOR HIS STORY TO  
4 WORK HE NEEDS TO PUT MY CLIENT IN THAT APARTMENT. AND  
5 YOU KNOW HOW THAT HELPS HIM? IT'S BECAUSE WHEN HE  
6 STANDS BEFORE THE COURT, WHENEVER THAT IS, AND PLEADS  
7 GUILTY, HE WANTS TO BE ABLE TO SAY, I WAS JUST THERE  
8 BUT I DIDN'T DO ANYTHING. BECAUSE IT'S GOING TO HELP  
9 HIM. SO, WITH FOUR GUNS, AND A ROLL OF DUCT TAPE, HE  
10 NEEDS TO PUT ALL OF THESE GUYS IN THE APARTMENT, EVEN  
11 THOUGH BY HIS OWN TESTIMONY MY CLIENT HAD OPTED OUT  
12 BEFORE ANY OF THE VIOLENCE STARTED. AND THE ONLY  
13 EVIDENCE TO SHOW THAT HE, TO SHOW YOU THAT HE WENT IN  
14 THAT APARTMENT IS THIS GUY'S TESTIMONY. AND YOU'VE  
15 GOT TO THINK ABOUT WHY HE'S SAYING THAT, WHY HE'S  
16 TRYING TO THROW MY CLIENT UNDER THE BUS, BECAUSE  
17 WITHOUT MY CLIENT, THE FALL GUY, IT DOESN'T WORK.

18 SO, YOU KNOW, KEEP IN MIND THAT ALL OF THESE  
19 WITNESSES HAD SOMETHING TO GAIN. NOW, I CAN'T TELL  
20 YOU EXACTLY WHAT THE GUY THAT CAME IN ABOUT THE GUN,  
21 WHERE HE WAS COMING FROM. MAYBE HE DID BUY THE GUN  
22 FROM WALTER HARRIS, AND MAYBE WALTER HARRIS ENDED UP  
23 WITH THE GUN. BUT HE'S NOT CHARGED WITH POSSESSION OF  
24 A FIREARM, HE'S CHARGED WITH SOMETHING MUCH WORSE, AND  
25 THE ONLY STATE'S WITNESS SAID, EVEN IF YOU BELIEVE

1 THIS, SAID HE DIDN'T HAVE A GUN WHEN ALL THIS  
2 HAPPENED.

3 AND LET'S SAY THAT YOU DO BELIEVE IT, THAT  
4 WALTER HARRIS WENT IN AND TAPED THIS GUY UP, AND  
5 THAT'S THE ONLY EVIDENCE, BECAUSE WHEN SLED GOT THE  
6 DUCT TAPE, THEY DID AN ANALYSIS, THEY DID THEIR  
7 SCIENTIFIC THING ON IT, INCONCLUSIVE. THEY CAN'T PUT  
8 THAT DUCT TAPE IN WALTER HARRIS'S HAND. BUT EVEN IF  
9 YOU BELIEVE HIM, THE PLAN WAS ROBBERY. AND AT SOME  
10 POINT, AND I'M SURE IT HAPPENED QUICKLY, THE PLAN  
11 CHANGED FROM ROBBERY TO HOMICIDE, IF YOU BELIEVE THIS.  
12 WELL, AT THAT POINT, ACCORDING TO THIS TESTIMONY,  
13 THERE WERE FOUR GUYS WITH GUNS, AND ONE GUY WITH DUCT  
14 TAPE. AND THE VICTIM DIDN'T DIE FROM DUCT TAPE. SO,  
15 AT THAT INSTANT, AT THAT FLASH IN TIME WHEN THE PLAN  
16 CHANGED FROM ROBBERY TO MURDER, EVEN IF YOU BELIEVE  
17 THIS, WHICH YOU SHOULDN'T, MR. HARRIS DIDN'T EVEN HAVE  
18 THE MEANS TO CARRY OUT THE CRIME.

19 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, THIS IS AMERICA, WE'RE  
20 WORKING UNDER THE SAME LAWS THAT PROTECT US, THAT  
21 PROTECT MY CLIENT, THAT PROTECT EVERYONE IN THIS  
22 COURTROOM AND EVERY U. S. CITIZEN. THE STATE HAS THE  
23 BURDEN OF CARRYING THE PROOF IN THIS CASE, AND THAT  
24 BURDEN IS GREAT. IF ANYTHING ABOUT THIS CASE,  
25 ESPECIALLY WITH REGARD TO MR. HARRIS, GIVES YOU A

1 DOUBT TO WHICH YOU CAN ASSIGN A REASON IT'S YOUR DUTY  
2 TO FIND HIM NOT GUILTY. I WOULD SUBMIT THAT THERE'S  
3 ALL KIND OF DOUBT, AND I HOPE I'VE COVERED IT, I HOPE  
4 I'VE DONE A GOOD JOB PLAYING THIS OUT FOR MY CLIENT,  
5 BECAUSE WE CAN'T DECIDE THINGS ON IMPRESSIONS OR  
6 PROBABILITIES OR WHAT MIGHT HAVE HAPPENED OR, YOU  
7 KNOW, THIS GUY'S OUT THERE SMOKING WEED OR THIS OR  
8 THAT, WE'RE NOT RUNNING HIM FOR COUNTY COUNCIL, WE'RE  
9 NOT AUDITIONING HIM FOR THE CHURCH CHOIR, WE'RE TRYING  
10 HIM FOR MURDER, WE'RE TRYING HIM FOR ARMED ROBBERY,  
11 AND WE'RE TRYING HIM BURGLARY, FIRST DEGREE. THE  
12 PROOF HAS TO BE, THE PROOF HAS TO BE MAD, IT HAS TO BE  
13 MET, THE BURDEN HAS TO BE MET. IT HASN'T. WALTER LEE  
14 HARRIS IS NOT GUILTY OF ANY OF THESE CRIMES.

15 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

16 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. PALMER.

17 ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN OF THE JURY, MR.  
18 MELLARD IS ANXIOUS TO GET UP HERE AND DO HIS CLOSING  
19 FOR MR. RYANT, BUT WE'VE BEEN GOING FOR A LITTLE OVER  
20 AN HOUR, AND I REMEMBER WHEN I WAS IN SCHOOL I HATED  
21 SITTING IN CLASS FOR OVER AN HOUR, SO I'M GOING TO  
22 GIVE Y'ALL A BREAK. YOU HAVEN'T HEARD ALL THE  
23 CLOSING STATEMENTS, SO AGAIN, I'M REMINDING YOU, YOU  
24 CANNOT TALK ABOUT THIS CASE AT THIS TIME, BUT WE'RE  
25 GOING TO TAKE A SHORT TEN MINUTE BREAK, LET Y'ALL GET

1 UP, STRETCH YOUR LEGS, MAYBE GET SOME WATER OR  
2 SOMETHING LIKE THAT, AND THEN COME ON BACK IN HERE AND  
3 WE'LL FINISH UP WITH THE DEFENDANTS' CLOSING  
4 ARGUMENTS.

5 ALRIGHT, THANK Y'ALL.

6 (Whereupon, the jury retires  
7 to the jury room and the  
8 following take place out  
9 of the presence of the jury.)

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. MELLARD, I APOLOGIZE, I  
11 KNOW YOU'RE READY TO GO, BUT A BREAK WOULDN'T HURT  
12 ANYBODY SO, WE'LL BE IN RECESS FOR ABOUT TEN MINUTES.  
13 OKAY? THANK Y'ALL.

14 (Recess)

15 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. MELLARD, ARE YOU READY?

16 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

17 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, IF YOU'LL GET THE JURY ON  
18 OUT.

19 (Whereupon, the jury enters  
20 the courtroom and the following  
21 takes place in the presence  
22 of the jury.)

23 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I  
24 APPRECIATE Y'ALL'S CONTINUED ATTENTION.

25 MR. MELLARD.

1           MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, THANK YOU.

2           THE COURT: YES, SIR.

3                   CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MR. MELLARD

4           I JUST WANT TO TALK TO Y'ALL BRIEFLY ABOUT THE  
5           FACTS AGAINST MY CLIENT, DANNY RYANT, BUT BEFORE I DO  
6           I WANT TO TALK TO Y'ALL ABOUT THE SCALES OF JUSTICE.  
7           ALRIGHT, NOW, THE SCALES OF JUSTICE, SOMETIMES YOU'LL  
8           SEE THEM IN A COURTROOM. AND WHAT THEY ARE IS, IS  
9           USUALLY A WOMAN, AND SHE'S HOLDING THESE TWO SCALES,  
10          AND THE WAY THESE SCALES USUALLY WORK IS, AT THE  
11          BEGINNING OF THE TRIAL THE SCALES ARE EVEN. ONE  
12          PERSON PUTS UP EVIDENCE, THE OTHER SIDE PUTS UP  
13          EVIDENCE, AT THE END OF THE TRIAL YOU LOOK TO SEE  
14          WHICH WAY THE SCALES TIP. THAT'S THE WAY IT USUALLY  
15          WORKS, BUT IN A CRIMINAL CASE IT'S ENTIRELY  
16          DIFFERENT. IN A CRIMINAL CASE THE SCALES OF JUSTICE  
17          DO NOT START OFF EVEN. IN A CRIMINAL CASE THE SCALES  
18          OF JUSTICE ARE TIPPED IN FAVOR OF THE DEFENDANT.  
19          THAT'S HOW THEY START OFF. AND THEY START OFF LIKE  
20          THAT BECAUSE OF TWO THINGS: NUMBER ONE, BECAUSE THE  
21          DEFENDANT IS PRESUMED INNOCENT, THAT'S THE FIRST  
22          REASON. THE SECOND REASON IS BECAUSE THE DEFENDANT  
23          DOESN'T HAVE TO PUT ANYTHING UP. HE DOESN'T HAVE TO  
24          DO ANYTHING. IT'S THE SOLICITOR WHO HAS THE DUTY TO  
25          ADD TO HIS SIDE OF THE SCALES, WHILE AT THE SAME TIME

1 REMOVING REASONABLE DOUBT FROM THE DEFENDANT'S SIDE OF  
2 THE SCALES. SO, WITH THAT IN MIND I WANT TO TALK TO  
3 Y'ALL ABOUT THE EVIDENCE AGAINST DANNY RYANT.

4 Y'ALL HEARD FROM SERGEANT CRAIG DAVIS, HE WAS THE  
5 FIRST WITNESS. AND WHAT DID HE TELL YOU? HE WAS THE  
6 PATROL OFFICER. HE GOT THE CALL, HE CAME TO THE  
7 SCENE, HE LOOKED AROUND, HE SECURED IT, AND THEN HE  
8 CALLED THE CRIMINAL ENFORCEMENT DIVISION. THAT'S WHAT  
9 HE TOLD Y'ALL. THE SCALES OF JUSTICE DIDN'T MOVE,  
10 NOTHING AGAINST DANNY RYANT.

11 THEN YOU HEARD FROM ASHLEY PARSLEY. SHE IS,  
12 WE'VE ALL HEARD ABOUT HER, SHE WAS THE LADY THAT WAS  
13 LIVING WITH CHARLES PRINGLE AT THIS TIME. SHE MET HIM  
14 AT A BAR, SHE MOVED IN WITH HIM. SHE'S IMPORTANT  
15 BECAUSE SHE'S AN EYE WITNESS TO THIS CASE. AND AS AN  
16 EYE WITNESS, WHAT DID SHE SAY? WELL, SHE SAID THAT  
17 PEOPLE CAME IN. THEY WERE, SHE HEARD, SHE WAS PUT  
18 FACE DOWN ON THE GROUND, SHE HEARD GUN SHOTS. SHE  
19 PICKED SOME PEOPLE OUT OF A LINEUP, BUT SHE DID NOT  
20 PICK DANNY RYANT OUT OF ANY LINEUP. ASHLEY PARSLEY  
21 DID NOT SEE DANNY RYANT AT THE SCENE OF THE CRIME.  
22 ASHLEY PARSLEY DID NOT PUT DANNY RYANT ANYWHERE NEAR  
23 THE SCENE OF THIS CRIME. THE SCALES, THEY HAVEN'T  
24 MOVED.

25 NEXT YOU HEARD FROM LIEUTENANT CARTER. HE'S THE

1 CRIME SCENES OPERATION FELLOW. HE'S THE GUY THAT GOES  
2 TO THE CRIME SCENE AND TAKES THE PICTURES, LOOKS AT  
3 THE EVIDENCE, COLLECTS THE EVIDENCE, SENDS IT OFF TO  
4 BE TESTED. NOW, HE'S THE EXPERT ON CRIME SCENE  
5 INVESTIGATION. WHAT DID HE DO? WELL, HE GETS THERE,  
6 HE SEES THIS BLACK LIGHT. THAT'S THE ONLY THING THAT  
7 WAS ILLUMINATING THIS HOUSE WAS THIS ONE BLACK LIGHT.  
8 SO, HE CAN'T SEE ANYTHING, SO HE TAKES A FLASH LIGHT  
9 AND HE STARTS LOOKING AROUND. ANOTHER OFFICER COMES,  
10 THEY CHANGE THE LIGHT BULB, PUT IN A LIGHT BULB THAT  
11 THEY COULD SEE, AND THEN HE STARTS HIS INVESTIGATION.  
12 WELL, HE DETERMINES THERE WAS NO FORCED ENTRY, NO  
13 FORCED ENTRY AT THE FRONT DOOR, THE BACK DOOR, OF  
14 COURSE, WAS LOCKED. HE STARTS TAKING PHOTOGRAPHS OF  
15 THE SCENE, AND Y'ALL HAVE SOME OF THE PHOTOGRAPHS INTO  
16 EVIDENCE HERE. AND THEN HE TAKES SOME YELLOW MARKERS,  
17 AND WE'VE HEARD WHAT THOSE YELLOW MARKERS ARE, SOME OF  
18 THEM ARE BULLET FRAGMENTS, SOME OF THEM ARE SHELL  
19 CASINGS, BUT HE STARTS GOING AROUND AND MARKING THOSE  
20 THINGS. AND REMEMBER, THIS GUY IS THE EXPERT IN CRIME  
21 SCENE INVESTIGATION. AND THEN -- AFTER HE PUTS THE  
22 MARKERS DOWN HE TAKES SOME MORE PICTURES. ALRIGHT, AT  
23 THAT POINT HE DECIDES HE SHOULD FINGERPRINT THE DOOR.  
24 NOW, WE'VE HEARD THAT HE FINGERPRINTS THE DOOR, HE  
25 DOESN'T FIND ANYTHING. WE'VE ALSO HEARD HE DIDN'T

1 FINGERPRINT ANYTHING ELSE IN THE HOUSE. HE DIDN'T  
2 FINGERPRINT THE LOVE SEAT, THE SOFA, THE END TABLE, HE  
3 DIDN'T FINGERPRINT ANYTHING. ALRIGHT, THEN HE FINDS  
4 SOME DUCT TAPE AND HE SENDS IT OFF TO SLED TO BE  
5 TESTED, AND SLED DOESN'T FIND ANY FINGERPRINTS ON THE  
6 DUCT TAPE, SLED DOESN'T FIND ANY DNA ON THE DUCT TAPE.  
7 WHETHER YOU FEEL LIEUTENANT CARTER DID A GOOD JOB OR  
8 A BAD JOB WITH HIS INVESTIGATION, ONE THINGS IS FOR  
9 CERTAIN, FOR PURPOSES OF DANNY RYANT, IT DOESN'T  
10 MATTER, BECAUSE HE FOUND NO EVIDENCE IN THAT HOME  
11 AGAINST DANNY RYANT. AGAIN, THREE WITNESSES, THOSE  
12 SCALES HAVEN'T MOVED.

13 SHANNON MITCHELL, WHAT DID HE SAY? HE WAS AT THE  
14 HOUSE BEFORE THIS THING EVEN OCCURRED. DID HE SEE  
15 DANNY RYANT THERE? NO. DID HE EVE KNOW ABOUT DANNY  
16 RYANT? NO. SHANNON MITCHELL DOESN'T KNOW ANYTHING,  
17 HE ADDS NO EVIDENCE TO THE SOLICITOR'S SIDE OF THE  
18 SCALE, AND HE REMOVES NO REASONABLE DOUBT FROM THE  
19 DEFENDANT'S SIDE OF THE SCALE. THE SCALES HAVEN'T  
20 MOVED.

21 WE HEARD FROM ANDRE WASHINGTON. HE'S THE GUY  
22 THAT BOUGHT A GUN FROM, SUPPOSEDLY FROM WALTER HARRIS  
23 AND THEN TURNED AROUND AND HE SELLS THE GUN TO SOME  
24 OTHER FELLOW, CHRISTOPHER DWIGHT. ANDRE WASHINGTON,  
25 HE DOESN'T KNOW DANNY RYANT AT ALL, DOESN'T EVEN KNOW

1 HIM. ONCE AGAIN, NO EVIDENCE PRESENTED BY THE STATE  
2 AGAINST DANNY RYANT, NO, NOTHING REMOVED ANY  
3 REASONABLE DOUBT FROM OUR SIDE OF THE SCALES.

4 ALRIGHT, WHAT ABOUT MONEAK BUSBY? MONEAK BUSBY  
5 WAS AT THE CORNER POCKET ON THE NIGHT OF MARCH THE  
6 TWELFTH. ALRIGHT, SHE SAID SHE GOT THERE AROUND EIGHT  
7 OR EIGHT:THIRTY, AND THE REASON SHE GOT THERE EARLY,  
8 OF COURSE, IS BECAUSE SHE SAID YOU'VE GOT TO PAY LIKE  
9 FIVE BUCKS TO GET INTO THE CLUB AND SHE DIDN'T WANT TO  
10 PAY. ALRIGHT, SO SHE GETS THERE EARLY. AND WHAT DOES  
11 SHE SEE? SHE SEES DANNY RYANT. NOW, THE CORNER  
12 POCKET, AS WE'VE HEARD, IT'S A BAR, IT'S A POOL ROOM,  
13 IT'S A PLACE WHERE YOU CAN EAT, AND IT'S GOT A PLACE  
14 WHERE YOU CAN DANCE. ALRIGHT, IT'S GOT FIVE DIFFERENT  
15 PLACES IN THERE THAT YOU CAN DO FIVE DIFFERENT THINGS.  
16 AND AS YOU REMEMBER, SHE SAID SHE DID NOT, MONEAK  
17 BUSBY DID NOT LEAVE THE CORNER POCKET. AND WHY?  
18 BECAUSE IF SHE LEAVES SHE WOULD HAVE TO PAY MORE MONEY  
19 TO GET BACK IN. SO, SHE STAYS THERE FROM AROUND EIGHT  
20 OR EIGHT:THIRTY UNTIL SHE LEAVES AROUND TWELVE O'CLOCK  
21 AT NIGHT. OKAY. AND SHE TESTIFIES THAT SHE SEE A  
22 PERSON THAT SHE IDENTIFIED AS MARIO SHIVERS COME TO  
23 THE DOOR. ALRIGHT, YOU KNOW, WHETHER YOU BELIEVE THAT  
24 OR NOT IT DOESN'T MATTER BECAUSE WHAT MATTES FROM THE  
25 POINT OF DANNY RYANT IS, THERE'S NO TESTIMONY THAT SHE

1           SAW DANNY RYANT LEAVE THE CORNER POCKET, NONE, NO  
2           TESTIMONY.  THERE'S NO TESTIMONY THAT SHE SAW HIM GET  
3           INTO A CAR WITH ANYBODY, NO TESTIMONY.  ALRIGHT, THE  
4           ONLY THING MONEAK BUSBY KNOWS IS THAT HE WASN'T IN THE  
5           SAME PART OF -- DANNY RYANT WAS NOT IN THE SAME PART  
6           OF THE CLUB THAT SHE WAS.  THAT'S THE ONLY THING SHE  
7           KNOWS.  SO, THE SOLICITOR IS MAKING A BIG DEAL ABOUT  
8           THE FACT THAT MONEAK BUSBY DOESN'T KNOW WHERE DANNY  
9           RYANT IS EVERY MINUTE OF THAT NIGHT, BUT YOU'VE GOT TO  
10          REMEMBER, MONEAK BUSBY IS IN A BAR, RIGHT.  SHE'S  
11          SITTING THERE, SHE'S THERE TO DRINK BEER AND SHE'S  
12          THERE TO SOCIALIZE.  SHE'S NOT THERE TO LOOK FOR DANNY  
13          RYANT.  SO, AGAIN, THE SCALES HAVEN'T MOVED.  THEY  
14          HAVE NOT ADDED EVIDENCE THAT SHOWS DANNY RYANT'S PART  
15          OF THE CRIME, AND THEY HAVE NOT REMOVED REASONABLE  
16          DOUBT FROM OUR SIDE OF THE SCALES.

17                 YVONNE SHARPERSON, SHE WAS AT THE CORNER POCKET.  
18          WHAT DID SHE SAY?  WELL, SHE SAID AT SOME POINT  
19          DANNY'S MOM WAS LOOKING FOR HIM.  THE STATE ASKED HER,  
20          YOU KNOW, DID SHE SEE DANNY RYANT IN THE CLUB WHEN SHE  
21          WAS LOOKING?  AND SHE SAID, LOOK, I WAS IN THERE  
22          DRINKING, I WASN'T IN THERE LOOKING FOR DANNY RYANT.  
23          SO, AGAIN, WE'VE GOT THE SCALES, THOSE SCALES HAVEN'T  
24          MOVED, HAVEN'T MOVED AN INCH.

25                 THEN WE HEARD FROM JANET ROSS, SHE'S THE

1 PATHOLOGIST. ALRIGHT, SHE'S THE PERSON THAT DID THE  
2 AUTOPSY. SHE TOLD YOU HOW SHE EXAMINED THE BODY, SHE  
3 TOLD YOU HOW SHE REMOVED BULLETS AND BULLET FRAGMENTS  
4 AND THEY WERE SENT TO SLED. BUT SHE DIDN'T PROVIDE  
5 ANY EVIDENCE THAT YOU CAN LINK DANNY RYANT TO THIS  
6 CRIME, NONE WHATSOEVER. AGAIN, THE SCALES HAVE NOT  
7 MOVED.

8 JAMES GREEN, HE'S THE SLED FIREARMS EXPERT, HE  
9 TOLD US ABOUT GUNS AND GUN CASINGS. THE SCALES HAVEN'T  
10 MOVED.

11 DARIUS GARNER, HE'S THE FELLOW THAT'S BEEN  
12 SMOKING DOPE EVERY DAY SINCE HE WAS ABOUT FOURTEEN  
13 YEARS OLD. HE SAYS HE KNOWS PATRICK TYLER, THAT'S HIS  
14 DOPE SMOKING FELLOW, THEY LIVE IN THE SAME  
15 NEIGHBORHOOD, HANG OUT EVERY DAY, BEEN SMOKING DOPE  
16 TOGETHER FOR ABOUT THE LAST THREE YEARS. WHAT DID HE  
17 TELL YOU? DID HE TELL YOU ANYTHING ABOUT DANNY RYANT?  
18 NO, NOTHING. NO EVIDENCE ABOUT DANNY RYANT.

19 AND THEN YOU HEARD FROM LIEUTENANT JAMES  
20 SHUMPERT, AND WHAT DID HE SAY? WELL, HE'S THE  
21 INVESTIGATOR, HE DOESN'T KNOW FIRST HAND KNOWLEDGE AS  
22 ALL THESE OTHERS HAVE TOLD YOU, NO FIRST HAND  
23 KNOWLEDGE ABOUT WHAT WENT ON. HE SHOWED ASHLEY  
24 PARSLEY A LINEUP AND THIS LINEUP CONTAINED DANNY RYANT  
25 IN IT. AND WHAT YOU HEARD WAS, ASHLEY PARSLEY DID NOT

1 PICK DANNY RYANT OUT OF ANY LINEUP. ASHLEY PARSLEY  
2 DID NOT PUT DANNY RYANT AT THE SCENE OF THE CRIME.  
3 AND AGAIN, NO MOVEMENT.

4 SO, WE'VE GOT ELEVEN WITNESSES HERE, DAVIS,  
5 PARSLEY, CARTER, MITCHELL, WASHINGTON, BUSBY,  
6 SHARPERSON, ROSS, GREEN, GARNER AND SHUMPERT, ELEVEN  
7 STATE'S WITNESSES, AND THEY HAVEN'T MOVE THAT SCALE  
8 ONE BIT. AND WHAT DID THESE WITNESSES DETERMINE?  
9 WELL, THEY DETERMINED THAT A MAN WAS SHOT AND A MAN  
10 WAS KILLED ON MARCH THE TWELFTH. BUT WHAT DID THESE  
11 WITNESSES ALSO SHOW YOU? THEY SHOW YOU THAT DANNY  
12 RYANT WAS PROBABLY AT THE CORNER POCKET WHEN THIS  
13 OCCURRED. SO, AGAIN, NO MOVEMENT.

14 NOW, THEN THERE'S THE LAST WITNESS, AND THAT'S  
15 THE PATRICK TYLER WITNESS, AND THAT'S THE ONE  
16 EVERYBODY IS TALKING ABOUT BECAUSE THAT'S THEIR WHOLE  
17 CASE. LIKE EVERYBODY SAID, THAT IS THEIR WHOLE CASE  
18 AGAINST DANNY RYANT. NOW, WHAT YOU HEARD -- WELL,  
19 WHAT YOU SAW, THE SOLICITOR PUT UP A BOARD HERE ABOUT  
20 THE CREDIBILITY OF WITNESSES. ALRIGHT, AND ONE OF THE  
21 THINGS YOU NEED TO DO WHEN YOU DETERMINE HIS  
22 CREDIBILITY IS LOOK AT HIS APPEARANCE, LOOK A PATRICK  
23 TYLER'S APPEARANCE AND HIS DEMEANOR. NOW, Y'ALL WERE  
24 WATCHING HIM ON THIS STAND, AND WHAT DID HE DO? WHEN  
25 HE WAS TALKING TO THE SOLICITOR, WHEN THEY WERE

1 PRESENTING THEIR CASE, HE WAS ALL, SITTING UP, HE WAS  
2 TALKING TO THEM, HE WAS ANSWERING THEIR QUESTIONS.  
3 BUT AS SOON AS HE GOT THROUGH, WHAT HAPPENED TO HIS  
4 DEMEANOR? HE KICKED BACK IN THE CHAIR, STARTED  
5 YAWNING. HE DIDN'T CARE. AND HE DIDN'T CARE BECAUSE HE  
6 KNEW ONCE HE TESTIFIED FOR THE STATE HIS JOB WAS DONE.  
7 HE HAD DONE WHAT HE WAS SUPPOSED TO DO IN ORDER TO GET  
8 A DEAL, AND HE DID WHAT HE WAS SUPPOSED TO DO, SO HE  
9 DIDN'T CARE AFTER HE TESTIFIED. HE WASN'T WORRIED ONE  
10 BIT AFTER HE TESTIFIED.

11 NOW, YOU'VE GOT TO ASK WHETHER PATRICK TYLER'S  
12 TESTIMONY WAS CONSISTENT. AND YOU'VE HEARD THE OTHER  
13 ATTORNEYS, AND THEY SAY IT IS NOT, AND I WOULD ASK  
14 THAT YOU LOOK AT THIS EVIDENCE AND DETERMINE FOR  
15 YOURSELF WHETHER YOU FIND PATRICK TYLER'S TESTIMONY IS  
16 CONSISTENT. AND IF YOU FIND THAT IT IS NOT  
17 CONSISTENT, THEN YOU NEED TO QUESTION HIS CREDIBILITY,  
18 BUT MOST IMPORTANTLY, YOU NEED TO CONSIDER WHETHER  
19 PATRICK TYLER HAD AN INTEREST IN THE OUTCOME OF THIS  
20 TRIAL. WE'VE ALL TALKED ABOUT THAT. AND THE ANSWER  
21 IS DEFINITELY, YES. BECAUSE I WOULD SUBMIT TO YOU  
22 THAT PATRICK TYLER IS GUILTY OF MURDER. PATRICK TYLER  
23 IS GUILTY OF ARMED ROBBERY. PATRICK TYLER IS GUILTY  
24 OF BURGLARY. AND PATRICK TYLER, BY HIS OWN  
25 ADMISSION, IS LOOKING AT SPENDING THE REST OF HIS LIFE

1 IN PRISON. AND SO, PATRICK TYLER IS GOING TO DO  
2 EVERYTHING HE CAN TO HELP THE STATE AND GET HIMSELF  
3 OUT OF TROUBLE.

4 NOW, IN AMERICA WE ALL ENJOY FREEDOM TO THINK AND  
5 BELIEVE WHAT WE WANT TO BELIEVE. YOU KNOW, EVERY DAY  
6 IN OUR LIVES WE DRAW CONCLUSIONS WHEN THERE ARE  
7 ABSOLUTELY NO FACTS. FOR INSTANCE, IF YOU HEAR THAT  
8 YOUR NEIGHBOR IS HAVING AN AFFAIR YOU MIGHT CHOOSE TO  
9 BELIEVE IT, YOU MAY CHOOSE NOT TO BELIEVE IT. YOU  
10 DON'T HAVE ANY FACTS BUT YOU CAN JUST CHOOSE TO  
11 BELIEVE IT AND THAT IS YOUR RIGHT TO DO THAT IF YOU  
12 WANT TO DO IT. THE SAME WITH POLITICS, EVERY COUPLE  
13 OF YEARS SOME FELLOW OR SOME LADY RUNS FOR OFFICE, I  
14 DON'T KNOW ANYTHING ABOUT THEM, BUT EVERY COUPLE OF  
15 YEARS I LOOK AT HIM, AND I SAY, WELL, THIS PERSON  
16 LOOKS OKAY, AND THEN I GO AND VOTE FOR HIM. I HAVE NO  
17 FACTS, BUT I GO AND VOTE FOR HIM. AND THEN, IN A  
18 COUPLE OF YEARS, OR A COUPLE OF MONTHS I'M USUALLY  
19 DISAPPOINTED. BUT WE IN OUR EVERY DAY LIFE CAN DRAW  
20 CONCLUSIONS WHENEVER WE WANT TO. AND THAT'S FINE.  
21 BUT WHEN Y'ALL WALKED INTO THIS COURTROOM AND YOU ALL  
22 GOT CHOSEN FOR THIS JURY THINGS CHANGED. ALRIGHT,  
23 BECAUSE IT'S DIFFERENT, BECAUSE THERE IS SO MUCH AT  
24 STAKE HERE. SO, WHEN YOU'RE IN THIS COURTROOM AND YOU  
25 HAVE TO MAKE A DECISION IT DOESN'T MATTER WHAT YOU

1 THINK OR WHAT YOU BELIEVE OR WHAT YOU EVEN KIND OF  
2 FIGURE WHAT HAPPENED. THE ONLY THING THAT MATTES IS  
3 WHAT THE STATE PROVED BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT. AND  
4 IF YOU WANT A REASONABLE DOUBT, THE OFFICER WHO  
5 RESPONDED TO THE SCENE, CRAIG DAVIS, FOUND NO EVIDENCE  
6 LINKING DANNY RYANT TO THE CRIME. IF YOU WANT A  
7 REASONABLE DOUBT, ASHLEY PARSLEY, THE EYE WITNESS,  
8 CANNOT PUT DANNY RYANT AT THE SCENE OF THIS CRIME. IF  
9 YOU WANT A REASONABLE DOUBT, LIEUTENANT GERALD CARTER,  
10 HE'S AN EXPERT IN CRIME SCENE INVESTIGATION, HE CAN'T  
11 PUT DANNY RYANT AT THE CRIME. IF YOU WANT REASONABLE  
12 DOUBT, SHANNON MITCHELL, HE WAS THERE BEFORE THE CRIME  
13 OCCURRED, HE CAN'T PUT DANNY RYANT AT THE CRIME.  
14 ANDRE WASHINGTON, REASONABLE DOUBT, HE CAN'T PUT DANNY  
15 RYANT AT THE CRIME. MONEAK BUSBY, SHE DIDN'T SEE  
16 DANNY RYANT LEAVE, REASONABLE DOUBT. YVONNE  
17 SHARPERSON, SHE DIDN'T SEE DANNY RYANT LEAVE THE  
18 CORNER POCKET, THAT'S REASONABLE DOUBT. JANET ROSS IS  
19 REASONABLE DOUBT, JAMES GREEN IS REASONABLE DOUBT,  
20 DARIUS GARNER IS REASONABLE DOUBT, SHUMPERT, HE DIDN'T  
21 FIND ANYTHING, REASONABLE DOUBT, AND THEN THERE'S  
22 PATRICK TYLER. PATRICK TYLER HAS EVERY REASON TO GET  
23 ON THAT STAND AND LIE, THAT'S REASONABLE DOUBT.

24 THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA HAS THE BURDEN OF  
25 PROVING DANNY RYANT GUILTY BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT.

1 IF YOU THINK ABOUT THE SCALES OF JUSTICE YOU'LL SEE  
2 THEY DIDN'T ADD ANYTHING TO THEIR SIDE, AND THEY  
3 DIDN'T TAKE AWAY ANY REASONABLE DOUBT FROM OURS. WE'D  
4 ASK THAT YOU FIND DANNY RYANT NOT GUILTY.

5 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. MELLARD.

6 MR. KOGER.

7 MR. KOGER: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

8 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

9 MR. KOGER: MR. PASCOE, AND MR. SORENSON.

10 CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MR. KOGER

11 MR. SHIVERS, STAND UP, TO CLEAR UP ANY CONFUSION.

12 I REPRESENT MARIO SHIVERS ON THE CHARGES OF  
13 MURDER, ARMED ROBBERY -- YOU CAN SIT DOWN -- AND  
14 BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE.

15 WE ALL HAVE A QUIET PLACE, WE HAVE A QUIET PLACE  
16 THAT WE HAVE IN OUR HOMES THAT THERE'S A ROOM THAT WE  
17 GO TO REST, THERE'S A ROOM THAT WE GO TO PRAY, THERE'S  
18 A ROOM THAT WE GO TO READ. AND WHEN WE ARE NOT  
19 PHYSICALLY ABLE TO GET TO THAT QUIET PLACE, THINK OF A  
20 QUIET PLACE IN OUR MIND, BECAUSE THERE'S A PORTION OF  
21 OUR MIND THAT WE CAN GO TO, AND WE CAN THINK AND  
22 REFLECT. AND THIS IS WHAT I WANT YOU TO DO NOT ONLY  
23 NOW BUT WHEN YOU GO INTO THAT JURY ROOM, I WANT YOU TO  
24 GO TO THAT PLACE RIGHT NOW AND CONCENTRATE ON MARIO  
25 SHIVERS' CASE.

1           NOW, THE FIRST THING I'M GOING TO ADDRESS IS THE  
2 IDENTIFICATION BY ASHLEY PARSLEY. SHE IDENTIFIED, OR  
3 SHE ATTEMPTED TO IDENTIFY THAT MR. SHIVERS WAS AT THE  
4 SCENE ON THAT PARTICULAR EVENING. AND YOU CAN RECALL  
5 IN HER STATEMENT SHE STATED IT WAS A DARK SKINNED  
6 PERSON IN BLUE. AND AS YOU MAY RECALL FROM THE  
7 TESTIMONY, I HAD HER TO GO OVER DIFFERENT COMPLEXIONS,  
8 BECAUSE WE AS AFRICAN AMERICANS KNOW COMPLEXIONS, AND  
9 WE SIMPLY IDENTIFY EACH OTHER BY DIFFERENT  
10 COMPLEXIONS. AND I ASKED HER ON THE STAND, AND I  
11 MIGHT HAVE ASKED MY CLIENT, MARIO SHIVERS, TO STAND OR  
12 NOT, I CAN'T RECALL, BUT SHE SAID MARIO SHIVERS WAS  
13 LIGHT SKINNED. SHE SAID ATTORNEY WISE WAS FAIR OR  
14 LIGHT SKINNED, AND STATED THAT INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT  
15 WAS MORE LIKE HER COMPLEXION, DARK SKINNED. BUT SHE  
16 GAVE A STATEMENT THAT THE PERSON WHO HAD THE WEAPON ON  
17 THAT PARTICULAR NIGHT WAS DARK SKINNED. NOW, DO I  
18 THINK SHE HAS SOME TYPE OF EVIL INTENT WHEN SHE MADE  
19 THAT IDENTIFICATION IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR? NO, SHE  
20 WAS JUST BASICALLY MISTAKEN, AND THOSE THINGS HAPPEN.  
21 AS A MATTER OF FACT, I HATE TO ADMIT IT BUT SOMETHING  
22 SIMILAR HAPPENED TO ME TWO WEEKS AGO. MY OFFICE IS  
23 LOCATED AT THREE NINETY-SIX ST. PAUL STREET IN THE  
24 CAROLINA BUILDING, AND I'M IN THE VERY FRONT BUILDING,  
25 SUITE ONE HUNDRED. AND I HAVE A LARGE WINDOW. AND I

1 THINK IT HAPPENED ABOUT WEDNESDAY OR THURSDAY ABOUT  
2 TWO WEEKS AGO. AND I SAW THIS, TWO THOUSAND ONE  
3 BURGUNDY CHEVROLET SILVERADO DRIVE UP WITH A COPPER  
4 BOTTOM, AND I GOT KIND OF EXCITED BECAUSE THAT WAS THE  
5 TRUCK OF MY FATHER. YOU KNOW, USUALLY HE IS IN TOWN  
6 OR WORKING ON A JOB HE'LL COME BY AND WE HAVE GOOD  
7 CONVERSATION, YOU KNOW, AND I REALLY LOVE MY DAD, AND  
8 SO I GOT KIND OF EXCITED BECAUSE AT THREE O'CLOCK IN  
9 THE AFTERNOON, TO SEE WHAT DADDY HAD TO TELL ME TODAY.  
10 SO, I SAW THE TRUCK DRIVE UP RIGHT IN FRONT OF MY  
11 WINDOW, WE KEEP OUR BLINDS OPEN, AND I WAS WALKING TO  
12 THE DOOR, I SAW THE PERSON GET OUT OF THE TRUCK, HAD  
13 ON A HAT, AND MY FATHER IS KNOWN FOR HIS CAPS  
14 ESPECIALLY WHEN HE'S WORKING ON A JOB, HAD ON A PLAID  
15 WORK SHIRT, AND MY FATHER WEARS PLAID WORK SHIRTS WHEN  
16 HE WORKS ON HIS IRON WORKS AND STEEL JOB, SO I WENT TO  
17 THE DOOR, I OPENED MY DOOR AND WENT TO THE FRONT DOOR  
18 OF THE BUILDING, AND DISCOVERED THAT IT WAS LINFIELD,  
19 THE MAINTENANCE MAN IN THE BUILDING. NOW, THIS IS  
20 SOMEONE THAT I'VE KNOWN FOR FORTY-FOUR YEARS, RAISED  
21 ME, FED ME UNTIL AGE EIGHTEEN, I TRY TO GET FED NOW ON  
22 SUNDAYS, AND I MADE A MISTAKE IN IDENTIFICATION OF MY  
23 VERY OWN FATHER. SO, AGAIN, ASHLEY PARSLEY MIGHT HAVE  
24 THOUGHT THAT SHE SAW MARIO SHIVERS ON THAT PARTICULAR  
25 EVENING BUT SHE WAS MISTAKEN. AND THAT'S VERY

1           IMPORTANT BECAUSE -- AND YOU'RE GOING TO RECEIVE AN  
2           INSTRUCTION AT THE END OF THIS STATEMENT THAT THE  
3           STATE MUST PROVE BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT THAT AN  
4           IDENTIFICATION IS CORRECT, THAT AN IDENTIFICATION IS  
5           ACCURATE, THAT AN IDENTIFICATION IS TRUTHFUL, AND THAT  
6           AN IDENTIFICATION IS RELIABLE. AND IF THE STATE  
7           CANNOT PROVE, JUST ABOUT IDENTIFICATION, MEET THOSE  
8           THREE CRITERIA, YOU HAVE TO DISREGARD IT.

9           THE SECOND PERSON WHO MADE AN ATTEMPT AT  
10          IDENTIFICATION, NOT AT THE SCENE BUT AT THE CORNER  
11          POCKET WAS MONEAK BUSBY, AND SHE STATED THAT SHE COULD  
12          HAVE POSSIBLY SEEN MR. SHIVERS, MARIO SHIVERS AT THE  
13          DOOR. NOW, SHE STATED ON THE STAND WHEN I WENT INTO,  
14          WELL, WHAT TYPE OF CONDITION SHE WAS IN ON THAT  
15          PARTICULAR NIGHT, HOW MUCH SHE HAD TO DRINK, SHE SAID  
16          TWO TWELVE OUNCE BEERS. NOW, I NOTICE IN THE  
17          COURTROOM WE HAVE NUMEROUS LAW ENFORCEMENT HERE, AND  
18          SOME PROBABLY HAVE WORKED THE ROAD, BUT USUALLY IF A  
19          PERSON SAY THEY HAVE TWO BEERS THEY'RE ALWAYS UNDER  
20          REPORT, IT'S USUALLY FOUR. NOW, THIS IS WHAT I'M  
21          SAYING, THE SAME STANDARD THT WAS APPLIED TO MS.  
22          PARSLEY'S IDENTIFICATION THAT THE STATE MUST PROVE  
23          BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT THAT HER IDENTIFICATION WAS  
24          CORRECT, ACCURATE, TRUTHFUL AND RELIABLE, THE SAME  
25          STANDARD APPLIES TO MS. BUSBY. SO, YOU CAN TAKE THAT