

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
IN THE SUPREME COURT

RECEIVED

Dec 30 2025

Appeal from Richland County  
Court of Common Pleas

S.C. SUPREME COURT

The Honorable Jean H. Toal, Circuit Court Judge

Civil Action No. 2023-CP-40-01759  
Appellate Case Nos.: 2025-002104

John A. Tibbs and Margaret B. Tibbs.....PLAINTIFFS,

v.

3M Company; 4520 Corp., Inc.; A.O. Smith Corporation; A.W. Chesterton Company; ABB Inc.; Air & Liquid Systems Corporation; Aiw-2010 Wind Down Corandp.; Amentum Environment & Energy, Inc.; Anchor/Darling Valve Company; Armstrong International, Inc.; Asbestos Corporation Limited; ASCO, L.P.; Atlas Asbestos Co; Atlas Turner, Inc.; AWT Air Company, Inc.; Bahnson, Inc.; Banner Industries International, Inc.; Banner Industries, LLC; Banner Industries Of N.E., Inc.; Barretts Minerals Inc.; Beaty Investments, Inc.; Bechtel Corporation; The Bonitz Company; Brand Insulations, Inc.; BW/IP Inc.; Canvas Ct, LLC; Cape PLC; Carboline Company; CB&I Laurens, Inc.; Cleaver-Brooks, Inc.; Consolidated Electrical Distributors, Inc.; Copes-Vulcan, Inc.; Covil Corporation; Crane Instrumentation & Sampling, Inc.; Crosby Valve, LLC; Daniel International Corporation; Davis Mechanical Contractors, Inc.; Dezurik, Inc.; Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC; Duke Energy Corporation; Eaton Corporation; Ellington Insulation Company, Inc.; Emerson Electric Co.; Fisher Controls International LLC; Flame Refractories, Inc.; Flowserve Corporation; Flowserve US Inc.; Fluor Constructors International; Fluor Constructors International, Inc.; Fluor Daniel Services Corporation; Fluor Enterprises, Inc.; FMC Corporation; Foster Wheeler Energy Corporation; Gardner Denver Nash, LLC; General Boiler Casing Company, Inc.; General Cable Corporation; General Cable Industries, Inc.; General Electric Company; Gould Electronics Inc.; Goulds Pumps, Incorporated; Goulds Pumps LLC; Great Barrier Insulation Co.; Grinnell LLC; Hajoca Corporation; Howden North America Inc.; HPC Industrial Services, LLC; IMO Industries Inc.; ITT LLC; Joy Global Underground Mining LLC; K-Mac Services Incorporated; Metropolitan Life Insurance Company; Mine Safety Appliances Company, LLC; MP Supply, Inc.; The Nash Engineering Company; Occidental Chemical Corporation; Paramount Global; Patterson Pump Company; PECW Holding Company; Pfizer Inc.; Piedmont Insulation, Inc.; Plastics Engineering Company; Presnell Insulation Co., Inc.; Redco Corporation; Riley Power Inc.; Rockwell Automation, Inc.; RSCC Wire & Cable LLC; Schneider Electric USA, Inc.; Sequoia Ventures Inc.; Spirax Sarco, Inc.; SPX Corporation; Stafford Insulation Company; Standard Insulation Company Of N. C., Inc.; Starr Davis Company, Inc.; Starr Davis Company Of S.C., Inc.; Sterling Fluid Systems (USA) LLC; TE Wire & Cable LLC; Thermo Electric Company, Inc.; Union Carbide

Corporation; Valves And Controls Us, Inc.; Velan Valve Corp.; Viking Pump, Inc.; Vistra Intermediate Company LLC; The William Powell Company Wind Up, Ltd.; Yuba Heat Transfer LLC; Zurn Industries, LLC.....DEFENDANTS,

And

Cape PLC, individually and as successor in interest to Cape Asbestos Company Limited, by and through its duly appointed Receiver Peter D. Protopapas, Third-Party Plaintiff  
.....RESPONDENT,

v.

Anglo American PLC, individually and as successor in interest to Anglo American Corporation of South Africa LTD., De Beers PLC, individually and as successor in interest to De Beers S.A., De Beers Centenary AG, De Beers Consolidated Mines Ltd., n/k/a De Beers Consolidated Mines Proprietary Ltd., De Beers UK Ltd., De Beers Jewellers LTD., De Beers Jewellers US, Inc., Anglo American US Holdings Inc., Element Six US Corp., Element Six Technologies US Corp., Element Six Technologies (OR) Corp., First Mode Holdings, Inc., Platinum Guild International (U.S.A.) Jewelry Inc., Lightbox Jewelry Inc., Forevermark US Inc., Anglo American Crop Nutrients (U.S.A.) LLC, Charter Consolidated Ltd., ESAB Corporation, Central Mining & Investment Corporation Ltd., Cape Holdco Ltd., The Law Debenture Corporation PLC, Cape Industrial Services Group Ltd., Mohed Altrad, Altrad UK Ltd., Cape UK Holdings Newco Ltd., Altrad Services, Ltd., f/k/a Cape Industrial Services Ltd., Altrad Investment Authority S.A.S., Sparrows Offshore Group Ltd., Hawk Bidco US Inc., Arran Co US, LLC, Sparrows Offshore, LLC, and The Sparrows Group, LLC.....THIRD-PARTY DEFENDANTS,

Of which Charter Consolidated Ltd., ESAB Corporation, and Central Mining & Investment Corporation Ltd.; Mohed Altrad; and Altrad Investment Authority SAS are the...APPELLANTS.

**PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, Elizabeth Moultrie, of Kassel McVey, hereby certify that the **RESPONDENTS’ JOHN AND MARGARET TIBBS’ FINAL RESPONSE BRIEF** were served on all parties to this appeal on December 30, 2025, via email to their counsel of record:

Todd Carroll (todd.carroll@wbd-us.com)  
Kevin A. Hall (kevin.hall@wbd-us.com)  
M. Elizabeth O’Neill (elizabeth.oneill@wbd-us.com)

*Counsel for Mohed Altrad and Altrad Investment Authority SAS*

G. Murrell Smith, Jr. (murrell@smithrobinsonlaw.com)

John T. Lay, Jr. (jlay@gwblawfirm.com)  
Gray T. Culbreath (gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com)  
Lindsay A. Joyner (ljoyner@gwblawfirm.com)  
Eleanor L. Jones (ejones@gwblawfirm.com)  
Troy S. Brown (troy.brown@morganlawis.com)  
Dana E. Becker (dana.becker@morganlewis.com)  
Brady Edwards (brady.edwards@morganlewis.com)  
Robert W. Jacques (robert.jacques@morganlewis.com)  
Paul A. Scrudato (paul.scrudato@morganlewis.com)  
Jonathan M. Robinson (jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com)  
Shanon N. Peake (shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com)

*Counsel for the Receiver for Cape PLC*

James H. Elliott, Jr. (jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)  
Cameron D. Berthelsen (cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com)

*Counsel for AA/DB Non-US Third-Party Defendants*

Steven J. Pugh (spugh@richardsonplowden.com)  
Benjamin P. Carlton (bcarlton@richardsonplowden.com)  
Carmen V. Ganjehsani (cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com)  
Ashwin R. Sanzgiri (asanzgiri@richardsonplowden.com)

*Counsel for ArranCo US, LLC; Hawk Bidco (US) Inc.; and Sparrows Offshore, LLC*

A. Victor Rawl, Jr. (vrawl@grsm.com)  
John Nichols (john@bluesteinattorneys.com)

*Counsel for ESAB Corporation; Central Mining and Investment Corp., Ltd.; and Charter Consolidated Ltd.*

Stephen L. Brown (sbrown@ycrllaw.com)  
James D. Gandy, III (tgandy@ycrllaw.com)  
Stephen A. Griffith (sgriffith@ycrllaw.com)

*Counsel for Asbestos Corporation Limited*

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Elizabeth Moultrie