

**RECEIVED**

**Feb 17 2026**

**S.C. SUPREME COURT**

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
IN THE SUPREME COURT

---

Certiorari to McCormick County

Honorable David P. Caraker, Jr, Circuit Court Judge

---

JOE ROSS WORLEY,

PETITIONER

V.

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA,

RESPONDENT

APPELLATE CASE NO. 2025-000928

---

APPENDIX

---

LARA M. CAUDY  
Senior Appellate Defender

ALAN WILSON  
Attorney General

South Carolina Commission on Indigent Defense  
Division of Appellate Defense  
PO Box 11589  
Columbia, SC 29211-1589  
(803) 734-1330

D. RUSSELL BARLOW, II  
Senior Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
P. O. Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211-1549  
(803) 734-3737

ATTORNEY FOR PETITIONER

SAMUEL R. HUBBARD, III  
Solicitor, Eleventh Judicial Circuit  
205 East Main Street, Suite 309  
Lexington, SC 29072  
(803) 785-8352

ATTORNEYS FOR RESPONDENT

**VOLUME II OF V**  
**PAGES 501-1000**

## INDEX

|                                                                          |      |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| INDEX .....                                                              | i    |
| IMMUNITY HEARING TRANSCRIPT DATED MAY 31 – JUNE 1, 2011.....             | 1    |
| RECONSTRUCTION HEARING TRANSCRIPT DATED JUNE 14, 2013.....               | 232  |
| TRIAL TRANSCRIPT DATED DECEMBER 16-20, 2013.....                         | 292  |
| SENTENCING TRANSCRIPT DATED JUNE 30, 2014.....                           | 1227 |
| AMENDED INITIAL BRIEF OF APPELLANT.....                                  | 1248 |
| STATE’S MOTION TO REMAND AND MOTION TO STRIKE.....                       | 1287 |
| RETURN TO STATE’S MOTION TO REMAND AND MOTION TO STRIKE.....             | 1336 |
| REPLY TO RETURN TO STATE’S MOTION TO REMAND AND MOTION TO<br>STRIKE..... | 1340 |
| APPELLANT’S MOTION TO REMAND .....                                       | 1344 |
| RETURN TO APPELLANT’S MOTION TO REMAND .....                             | 1353 |
| REPLY TO RETURN TO APPELLANT’S MOTION TO REMAND .....                    | 1382 |
| ORDER GRANTING STATE’S MOTION TO REMAND .....                            | 1385 |
| APPELLANT’S MOTION FOR PARTIAL REMAND .....                              | 1386 |
| RETURN TO APPELLANT’S MOTION FOR PARTIAL REMAND.....                     | 1390 |
| REPLY TO RETURN TO APPELLANT’S MOTION FOR PARTIAL REMAND.....            | 1424 |
| MOTION TO DISMISS .....                                                  | 1428 |
| ORDER OF DISMISSAL.....                                                  | 1434 |
| PETITION FOR REHEARING.....                                              | 1436 |
| ORDER DENYING REHEARING.....                                             | 1441 |
| PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI .....                                    | 1442 |

|                                                                                                               |      |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| ORDER DENYING PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI.....                                                            | 1459 |
| REMITTITUR .....                                                                                              | 1460 |
| MOTION TO HOLD IN ABEYANCE AND REMAND FOR RECONSTRUCTION .....                                                | 1461 |
| RETURN TO MOTION TO HOLD IN ABEYANCE AND REMAND FOR<br>RECONSTRUCTION.....                                    | 1926 |
| REPLY TO RETURN TO MOTION TO HOLD IN ABEYANCE AND REMAND FOR<br>RECONSTRUCTION.....                           | 1927 |
| ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO HOLD IN ABEYANCE AND REMAND FOR<br>RECONSTRUCTION.....                               | 1928 |
| REPORT REGARDING RECONSTRUCTION OF THE RECORD.....                                                            | 1930 |
| ORDER TAKING CASE OUT OF ABEYANCE .....                                                                       | 1944 |
| MOTION TO HOLD IN ABEYANCE .....                                                                              | 1945 |
| ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO HOLD IN ABEYANCE.....                                                                | 1950 |
| FINAL BRIEF OF APPELLANT .....                                                                                | 1951 |
| FINAL BRIEF OF RESPONDENT .....                                                                               | 2003 |
| <u>THE STATE V. JOE ROSS WORLEY</u> , OP. NO. 2018-UP-327 (S.C. CT. APP. FILED JULY<br>18, 2018) .....        | 2062 |
| PETITION FOR REHEARING.....                                                                                   | 2064 |
| REQUEST FOR RETURN TO PETITION FOR REHEARING.....                                                             | 2086 |
| RETURN TO PETITION FOR REHEARING .....                                                                        | 2087 |
| ORDER DENYING REHEARING.....                                                                                  | 2093 |
| <u>THE STATE V. JOE ROSS WORLEY</u> , OP. NO. 2018-UP-327 (S.C. CT. APP. REFILED<br>SEPTEMBER 26, 2018) ..... | 2094 |
| PETITION FOR REHEARING.....                                                                                   | 2097 |
| REQUEST FOR RETURN TO PETITION FOR REHEARING.....                                                             | 2120 |
| RETURN TO PETITION FOR REHEARING .....                                                                        | 2121 |

|                                                                            |      |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| ORDER DENYING REHEARING.....                                               | 2136 |
| PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE COURT OF APPEALS .....              | 2137 |
| RETURN TO PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE COURT OF<br>APPEALS ..... | 2165 |
| ORDER DENYING PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI.....                         | 2193 |
| REMITTITUR .....                                                           | 2194 |
| APPLICATION FOR POST-CONVICTION RELIEF .....                               | 2195 |
| RETURN.....                                                                | 2203 |
| AMENDED APPLICATION FOR POST-CONVICTION RELIEF .....                       | 2209 |
| POST-CONVICTION RELIEF HEARING TRANSCRIPT DATED AUGUST 26, 2024.....       | 2211 |
| ORDER OF DISMISSAL.....                                                    | 2245 |
| INDICTMENTS .....                                                          | 2287 |
| SENTENCE SHEETS .....                                                      | 2291 |

1       **A**     Over here, not at the house. Don't try to tell  
2       me where I was at. We was over here.

3       **Q**     You were where?

4       **A**     Over in this area, between the houses.

5       **Q**     Okay. You were between the houses.

6             You and Melissa had started walking back, as I  
7       understand it; is that correct?

8       **A**     Yes.

9       **Q**     Y'all got no response from the Worley home?

10      **A**     Yes.

11      **Q**     So y'all started walking back, and then y'all  
12      met up with Bobby?

13      **A**     Yes.

14      **Q**     Okay. At some point, the light come back on,  
15      flickered on and off. Then y'all decided to walk  
16      back down to the house?

17      **A**     Say that again.

18      **Q**     The light came on. At some point, y'all  
19      decided to walk back down. Wherever y'all had met  
20      up, y'all decided, when you saw the light turn on,  
21      you walked back down to the house?

22      **A**     Yes.

23      **Q**     All right. Now -- so at 4:29:22, dispatch said  
24      they weren't getting any response from the  
25      residence, but at 4:29:35, headquarters, I'm

1 speaking with them?

2 **A** Uh-huh.

3 **Q** And then at 4:31:22, what does Melissa say?

4 **A** Shots fired. We need an ambulance.

5 **Q** All right. And the time between 4:29:35 and  
6 4:31:22 is how much time?

7 **A** Close to two minutes.

8 **Q** Is that 147 seconds? Excuse me, 107 seconds?

9 **A** Close to two minutes.

10 **Q** Okay. All right. So let me make sure I  
11 understand that. Looking back at this diagram now,  
12 and I'm looking at State's Exhibit Number 2 -- and  
13 y'all were back down towards the corner of the house  
14 again?

15 **A** When?

16 **Q** After y'all met back up and went back down  
17 there.

18 **A** Yeah. After we went back down there, after the  
19 light came on and then back off, we would have went  
20 to the -- back to the corner of the house.

21 **Q** All right. So then you went back to the corner  
22 of the house, then the exchange of what happened out  
23 there. And then you took off going in this  
24 direction, and you said you lost sight, I think, for  
25 a few moments of Melissa; is that correct?

1       **A**       (No audible response.)

2       **Q**       But Melissa is the one --

3               **COURT REPORTER:** I'm sorry. Did he answer?

4               **THE WITNESS:** Yes.

5               **MR. GARRETT:** He said yes.

6       BY MR. GARRETT:

7       **Q**       Melissa had taken off and had started running  
8       to the car to get a call out; is that correct?

9       **A**       To go -- yes, sir, to go get a call out to get  
10      a cell phone to try to get help because Bobby had  
11      just been shot.

12      **Q**       With your finger, please show us the direction  
13      that she would have taken to get to where her car  
14      was.

15      **A**       I have no idea what direction she would have  
16      taken. Her car would have been in this general area  
17      {indicating}, but I have no idea which direction she  
18      would have taken. I can't do that. I mean --

19      **Q**       Well, she wouldn't have run in front of the  
20      house for sure; right?

21      **A**       I wouldn't assume, but I have no way of  
22      knowing.

23      **Q**       So she probably would run behind the house  
24      before the ditch that you described earlier and came  
25      over to get to her car in the other driveway? I

1 mean, that's where her car was, wasn't it?

2 **A** Yeah, her car was over there.

3 **Q** All right. Thank you.

4 Now, let's move on from there, after shots were  
5 fired.

6 **A** Okay. Melissa again says, We need an  
7 ambulance.

8 **Q** And dispatch 107?

9 **A** Yep.

10 **Q** And 107 is whose car number?

11 **A** Nobody's car number. It would have been my  
12 call sign.

13 **Q** It was your call sign.

14 **A** Yeah.

15 **Q** Dispatch?

16 **A** Any unit contact dispatch.

17 **Q** Okay. Next?

18 **A** We got an officer.

19 **Q** Next?

20 **A** Headquarters, where is that ambulance going to  
21 be at?

22 **Q** Okay. When you were doing this, where were you  
23 at? When you were making these calls, had you  
24 gotten back to your car?

25 **A** No. That's why it's incomplete, because you



1 can't copy the radio transmissions.

2 **Q** Okay. So how were you communicating with them  
3 wherever you were at when you were communicating?

4 **A** On my walkie-talkie. They're taking down what  
5 they can copy.

6 **Q** Okay. You had a mic on; is that right?

7 **A** No.

8 **Q** Are you sure you didn't?

9 **A** I'm positive. I hadn't wore one in 15 years.

10 **Q** Would you know why the record said that you  
11 did?

12 **A** What record?

13 (Pause.)

14 **MR. MAYE:** This is hearsay. I object.

15 **THE COURT:** Just one moment.

16 Madame Forelady, will you take the jury back to  
17 the jury room, please?

18 (The jury retires to the jury room.)

19 **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, I think this is as good  
20 a time as any. We had a Castle Doctrine hearing,  
21 and it was in front of Judge Keesley; it was not in  
22 front of the jury. We let all kind of things go in  
23 that were hearsay and let officers get  
24 cross-examined about all sorts of things just in the  
25 interest of economy and not to object to that. But

1       he's basically trying to take a summation of events  
2       printed by Officer Joe Collier and cross-examine  
3       this officer off of that. I know that it's written  
4       by someone else.

5               **THE COURT:** Okay. Let me make sure I  
6       understand. You say it's a summation of events, so  
7       it is an incident report?

8               **MR. MAYE:** No, sir. It is basically the --  
9       Officer Collier's recollection of the incidents.  
10      It's not the official incident report, but it's what  
11      he wrote down that he did out there. So he's  
12      basically trying to take words recorded by somebody  
13      other than this officer and impeach him with it,  
14      which is hearsay.

15              And we've also got an issue -- he's already  
16      brought up at one point in time on opening  
17      statement. We had ATF come out because he had these  
18      bullets that have been modified, and he also had a  
19      failure to stop conviction. He can't possess a  
20      firearm under federal law.

21              An agent from ATF came out and looked at this,  
22      about picking it up in federal prosecution. He  
23      interviewed the officers and collected their  
24      incident reports. He recommended that a U.S.  
25      attorney, that they pick it up; the U.S. attorney

1       did not. It was basically prosecuted for possession  
2       of a weapon by somebody who had more than a year  
3       conviction.

4               **THE COURT:** All right. Let's keep it straight  
5       to what we're dealing with. I'm not --

6               **MR. MAYE:** I'm basically saying now I'm going  
7       to object in limine to him going into anything  
8       that's in Investigator Stallo's {phonetic} report  
9       and cross-examine him, because it's hearsay, and I'm  
10      going to object to him trying to cross-examine this  
11      officer off something that Officer Joe Collier  
12      wrote.

13              If it's any statement of his, he can certainly  
14      cross-examine him and attempt to impeach him, but  
15      taking something prepared by an ATF agent to  
16      transfer to the U.S. Attorney's Office, taking some  
17      statement from Investigator Collier, it's just pure  
18      hearsay.

19              **THE COURT:** You may be right. Let's deal with  
20      this report right here --

21              **MR. MAYE:** Yes, sir.

22              **THE COURT:** -- and then when it come up, just  
23      raise it. Okay, sir?

24              **MR. MAYE:** That's it. And I'm raising that  
25      now, that's hearsay.

1           **THE COURT:** Got ya.

2           Now, tell me why that is not hearsay.

3           **MR. GARRETT:** This is a response to our request  
4           for discovery concerning the condition of the  
5           uniform --

6           **THE COURT:** That doesn't mean it's not hearsay.

7           **MR. GARRETT:** It's the government's response.  
8           It's the government's response to our discovery  
9           request about the conditions that evening.

10          **THE COURT:** Well, Mr. Maye says this is  
11          essentially a --

12          **MR. GARRETT:** I can put it in through --

13          **THE COURT:** Hang on. It's an unofficial  
14          incident report that was a narrative drafted by one  
15          of the officers the night in question; is that  
16          correct?

17          **MR. GARRETT:** That's not correct.

18          **THE COURT:** Okay. Then what is it?

19          **MR. GARRETT:** This is specific answers to  
20          specific requests for discovery that we sent and  
21          made a request for it --

22          **THE COURT:** Let me look for --

23          **MR. GARRETT:** -- and they responded.

24          **THE COURT:** I mean, just because it's produced  
25          in discovery doesn't mean it's exempted from the

1       hearsay rule and other discovery rules -- I mean,  
2       not discovery rules -- evidence rules.

3               (Pause.)

4               **THE COURT:**   So which number are we talking  
5       about, Mr. Garrett?

6               **MR. GARRETT:**   15, I believe.

7               **THE COURT:**   It's 15.   Deputy R.E. Rushton not  
8       wearing any type of body --

9               **MR. GARRETT:**   It's right in that -- I think  
10       it's the next one down, that Moore was.   It's right  
11       in there.

12              **MR. MAYE:**    But again, Your Honor, like I said,  
13       it's hearsay.   It's what another officer wrote.

14              **THE COURT:**   Hang on.

15              **MR. MAYE:**    Yes, sir.   Sorry.

16              **THE COURT:**   Go ahead.   Tell me which one it is.

17              **MR. GARRETT:**   Number 17, Your Honor.   I  
18       apologize.

19              **THE COURT:**   That's all right.   I'm just -- get  
20       to the point.

21              So, basically, this is a printout of the  
22       microphone that he had on during the incident?

23              **MR. GARRETT:**   Yes, sir.   That's what I'm --

24              **THE COURT:**   Under what evidence rule does it  
25       come in?

1           **MR. GARRETT:** It's an admission by a party  
2           opponent, that he was wearing a mic. He said he  
3           wasn't. I think that's proper impeachment.

4           **THE COURT:** Say that again, please, sir.

5           **MR. GARRETT:** I said, I think it's an admission  
6           by a party opponent that he, in fact, had a  
7           microphone on, and if he wants to say that he  
8           didn't, then it's impeachment.

9           **THE COURT:** I mean, I think the fact that he  
10          was wearing or not wearing a microphone is an  
11          admission, but the contents of the microphone, I  
12          believe, is hearsay.

13          **MR. GARRETT:** He just said that he didn't have  
14          a microphone on him is the point.

15          **THE COURT:** Okay. And please correct me. I've  
16          been listening to it; I thought I was pretty  
17          intently. I thought the objection was the contents  
18          what he's saying that it's hearsay, okay.

19          **MR. GARRETT:** No.

20          **THE COURT:** To the extent that that is your  
21          objection, it's sustained. To the extent you're  
22          asking him whether or not he had a microphone on or  
23          not at the time of questioning, it's overruled  
24          because that is admitted to.

25          **MR. GARRETT:** Okay. Thank you.

1           **MR. MAYE:** Again, Your Honor, I just want to be  
2           sure I follow the Court's --

3           **THE COURT:** Okay. And I'm sorry. What I  
4           understood your objection was were the contents of  
5           this statement or this microphone, somebody typed up  
6           the contents. I sustain your objection as being  
7           hearsay.

8           **MR. MAYE:** Yes, sir.

9           **THE COURT:** The response as to whether or not  
10          he was wearing a microphone is not. And I overruled  
11          the objection to the extent that you allege that  
12          it's hearsay because it would fall under admission  
13          from the State in this matter based on your  
14          discovery responses.

15          **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, I'm just making sure.  
16          He's basically taking not what this officer said,  
17          but what any other person in here said and trying to  
18          impeach him by saying it's true by saying Officer  
19          Collier said that.

20          **THE COURT:** Number one, I'm not asking for  
21          argument.

22          **MR. MAYE:** Yes, sir. I understand.

23          **THE COURT:** You asked for clarification. Let  
24          me give you clarification what it is.

25          **MR. MAYE:** Yes, sir.

1           **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett can inquire as to  
2 whether or not this other officer had on a body mic  
3 based on number 17 in the discovery responses that  
4 said he did. As to the contents of what that body  
5 mic might have revealed is sustained.

6           **MR. MAYE:** Okay. Thank you, Your Honor.

7           **THE COURT:** Very good.

8           You ready? Anybody -- any question about my  
9 ruling?

10          **MR. GARRETT:** I understand, Your Honor.

11          **THE COURT:** Okay. Are y'all ready to proceed,  
12 Mr. Garrett?

13          **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, Your Honor.

14          **THE COURT:** State?

15          **MR. MAYE:** State's ready, Your Honor. Thank  
16 you.

17          **THE COURT:** Very good.

18          Would you bring the jury in?

19          (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

20          **THE COURT:** All right. Mr. Garrett.

21          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you.

22          **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

23          BY MR. GARRETT:

24          **Q**     Officer, you say you were not wearing a body  
25 mic?



1       **A**     No, I was not.

2       **Q**     Okay.  What about Rushton?  Was he wearing a  
3       body mic?

4       **A**     Yes, he was.

5       **Q**     And what about Melissa?  Was she wearing a body  
6       mic?

7       **A**     She generally does, but for that night, I can't  
8       say for sure.

9       **Q**     Well, can you explain how -- can you explain 15  
10      and 17?  Read 15.

11      **A**     15?

12      **Q**     Yeah.

13             **MR. MYERS:**  Not out loud.

14             **THE COURT:**  Read silently.

15      BY MR. GARRETT:

16      **Q**     Silently read 15.

17      **A**     Okay.

18      **Q**     Okay.  Well, why would I be told that it had --  
19      that you had a body --

20      **A**     I can't answer what somebody else told you.  I  
21      didn't have one on.  That's all I can tell you.  
22      Never have wore one in my 15-year career.  My belt's  
23      wore out from taking the radio on and off, if you  
24      want to look at it.

25      **Q**     And as it relates to Bobby, it says he wasn't

1 wearing a mic.

2 **A** If I recall correctly, he had one on.

3 **Q** Did you have any way to record any of this  
4 other than what we're doing here, as far as  
5 dispatch?

6 **A** Did I have any other way?

7 **Q** Have any way to record what all was going on at  
8 that time, your phone or any other source?

9 **A** Phone was in the car.

10 **Q** Okay. So you didn't have any source to record  
11 it with.

12 Did you have a handheld radio?

13 **A** Walkie-talkie?

14 **Q** Walkie-talkie?

15 **A** Yes.

16 **Q** Okay. All right. So is that what you were  
17 working from?

18 **A** Yes.

19 **Q** Okay. Let's pick back up.

20 **A** Okay.

21 **Q** All right. You got shots fired at 4:31:22, and  
22 then we went on down. We've got an officer -- and  
23 4:36:37, you said, Headquarters, where is that  
24 ambulance?

25 **A** Yeah. Headquarters, where is that ambulance

1 going to be at?

2 Q You recall that.

3 Looking at Defendant's Number 3, that's  
4 4:36:50. Is that your --

5 A That's me. I said, We'll get this son of a  
6 bitch later.

7 Q Okay. And 4:37:05?

8 A I told dispatch to contact Junior, who is the  
9 chief deputy, and the sheriff.

10 Q All right. Have a seat.

11 A (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

12 Q Now, you've given several versions of the  
13 events from that evening; is that correct?

14 A To whom?

15 Q Well, you gave a -- you gave your initial --  
16 your incident report that you prepared; is that  
17 correct?

18 A Uh-huh. Yes, sir.

19 Q And you prepared that incident report, looks  
20 like, on 11/15/09, that day; is that right?

21 A I would have to look at it, but I would say,  
22 yeah.

23 Q Okay. And then on a later time, you also  
24 talked to an Officer Stallo; do you recall that?

25 A Yes.

1           **Q**     Okay.  An ATF officer, federal officer?

2           **A**     Yes, I did.

3           **Q**     And you gave him a statement?

4           **A**     I gave him a copy of my actual statement, yes.

5           **Q**     All right.  And then there was a trial in front  
6           of a hearing officer.  And you testified under oath  
7           at that time as well on May 31 and June 1 of 2011;  
8           is that correct?

9           **A**     I don't know the dates.  I've testified a lot.  
10          I've talked about this a lot.

11          **Q**     Okay.  Now, effectively, they took your written  
12          statement and made that the incident report; is that  
13          correct?

14          **A**     Who did?

15          **Q**     Whoever prepared the incident report, took your  
16          statement and made it the incident report and put  
17          your name and Melissa's name on it; is that correct?

18          **A**     I'd have to see what you're talking about to  
19          answer that.

20          **Q**     Do you recognize this incident report?

21          **A**     Yes, this is mine.

22          **Q**     Is that yours and Melissa's, at the bottom  
23          where it's signed as the reporting officers?

24          **A**     Yes.  Her name is on it, but that does not mean  
25          it's 100 percent hers.  It would have been mainly

1 mine. Her name would have been on there because she  
2 was just a witness to the incident.

3 **Q** All right. And do you recognize that document?

4 **A** Yes.

5 **Q** And what is that?

6 **A** That's my statement.

7 **Q** All right. So is it -- now, have you looked at  
8 your statement in relationship to the incident  
9 report to see basically it did not follow that  
10 incident -- your incident report and your statement  
11 was all one and the same?

12 **A** I'd have to take time to read both of them to  
13 double-check that.

14 Yes, they appear to be close to the same.

15 **Q** All right. And you've had an opportunity now  
16 to review them?

17 **A** Yes, sir.

18 **Q** Okay. I'd like to kind of go over these with  
19 you. Okay?

20 The incident report, 11/15/09, when it gets  
21 down to the part where it's talking about, Rushton  
22 went to speak with the Sheffields, it only says in  
23 your incident report, does it not, that he only went  
24 to talk to them one time, doesn't it?

25 **A** I'd have to look at it to tell you what it

1       says.

2               Yeah, that's what it says in here, but I  
3       can't -- once again, I can't exactly tell you what  
4       Rushton did the whole time.

5       **Q**     I understand, but you reported in there that he  
6       went over to talk to the Sheffields while you and  
7       Melissa went to knock on the door. And that was  
8       what you testified here to today.

9               Now, is there any room in there for him to go  
10      back over to the Sheffields again later on?

11      **A**     Once again, I can't a hundred percent say  
12      whether he went back over there or not.

13      **Q**     So you don't know where Bobby Rushton was  
14      during this limited time?

15      **A**     Not the whole time we were out there while he  
16      was speaking with the complainant and I was knocking  
17      on the door, no. I can't account for his every  
18      single action.

19      **Q**     Okay. So he was over there talking --

20      **A**     And I wrote this statement, also, after he had  
21      been shot, and I had been shot at, too. We were  
22      both scare -- I was scared to death when I wrote  
23      this statement. So, you know, there may be some  
24      typos in it. I'm sorry for that.

25      **Q**     Well, a typo is one thing; I'm okay with that.

1 But saying Mr. Rushton went over there a second  
2 time, now as we sit here today, is there any way --

3 **A** I can't tell you where Rushton was at --

4 **THE COURT:** Just one second. Let me stop both  
5 of you. Let Mr. Garrett finish his question before  
6 you begin because the court reporter can't take  
7 everything down. Okay?

8 **THE WITNESS:** Yes, sir.

9 BY MR. GARRETT:

10 **Q** I understand you can't account for him, but you  
11 didn't see him go back over there a second time that  
12 evening; is that correct?

13 **A** I can't tell you where Deputy Rushton was at  
14 the whole time.

15 **Q** All right. In your statement, you say that you  
16 and Melissa went to the door, the Worley door, and  
17 you knocked several seconds -- rang the doorbell and  
18 knocked; is that correct?

19 **A** You said that's in my statement?

20 **Q** Yes, sir.

21 **A** Okay.

22 (Witness reviewing document.)

23 Help me out and show me where I say that  
24 because I'm...

25 **Q** Okay. {Indicating.}

1       **A**     Okay. It says: I, Deputy Moore, went to the  
2       door and rang the doorbell and knocked. It doesn't  
3       say that McAllister went with me.

4       **Q**     Okay. She didn't?

5       **A**     Well, it don't say that.

6       **Q**     My question is, Did she?

7       **A**     And rang the doorbell?

8       **Q**     Went behind you or went down there with you  
9       while you rang the doorbell?

10      **A**     Once again, she was in the general area, but I  
11      can't account for her every move.

12      **Q**     Okay.

13      **A**     I can't say that she rang the doorbell or not.  
14      I know I did, and I announced, Sheriff's office,  
15      numerous times while ringing the doorbell and  
16      knocking on the door.

17      **Q**     All right. And at some point in time, you  
18      decided that the person inside wasn't coming out?

19      **A**     Yes.

20      **Q**     And you turned around and you went back?

21      **A**     Yes. I was going to leave, yes.

22      **Q**     Okay. And as you turned around to go back,  
23      assuming you were down here at this -- you were down  
24      here at this area right here at the door?

25      **A**     At what point?



1           **Q**     When you were ringing on the doorbell.

2           **A**     Yes.

3           **Q**     All right. You decided, at some point, you  
4           needed to leave and you left. And which direction  
5           -- can you help the jury see which direction you  
6           were, and in your area there, where did y'all meet  
7           up to go back down there?

8           **A**     That one would help me more on that.

9           **Q**     All right. Talking about --

10          **A**     Wait a minute. Let me use this one for just a  
11          second, and then that one was...

12          **Q**     Referring to State's Exhibit 4 first. Go  
13          ahead.

14          **A**     The door would have been under this window;  
15          that's where I'd been knocking. And I left, I would  
16          have left out this way {indicating}.

17          **Q**     Okay.

18          **A**     And we would have met up somewhere in this  
19          general area {indicating}.

20          **Q**     Okay. Now, this is all wooded right here;  
21          right?

22          **A**     It's a patch of thin woods.

23          **Q**     Okay. And there's actually a gully that goes  
24          down here; isn't that correct?

25          **A**     I have no idea.

1           **Q**     You don't remember that?

2           **A**     No, I don't remember that.

3           **Q**     You never transversed the gully then, so you  
4           probably were in this area here?

5           **A**     In that general area. I can't pinpoint an  
6           exact location on where I was at.

7           **Q**     And so where was Melissa?

8           **A**     At that point?

9           **Q**     At that point.

10          **A**     She had come over to where we were.

11          **Q**     Okay. So now all three of you are together?

12          **A**     Yes.

13          **Q**     Okay. And I'm assuming that the reason he came  
14          over there was the light in the Worley home on that  
15          corner came on and then went off immediately; is  
16          that right?

17          **A**     He came where?

18          **Q**     Is that why you and Bobby -- Bobby left the  
19          Sheffields and headed in this direction, and then  
20          you turned back around --

21          **A**     He left the Sheffields because the light came  
22          on? Is that what you're asking me?

23          **Q**     Yeah.

24          **A**     I don't know. I mean, I don't know why he  
25          would have left. I can't --

1       **Q**     We can ask him that.

2       **A**     Yeah.

3       **Q**     But the bottom line is, for some reason then  
4       y'all turn back around to go back down there, why  
5       did y'all do that?

6       **A**     I went back down there because the light came  
7       on.

8       **Q**     Okay. The light came on --

9       **A**     And back off.

10      **Q**     Went back off. And y'all met up in the back  
11      there, approximately in this area here that we're  
12      talking about. Y'all met up somewhere in here,  
13      according to you, or in here?

14      **A**     At which point?

15      **Q**     After the light came on and went off.

16      **A**     No. No, sir.

17      **Q**     All right. Well, help me.

18      **A**     No, sir. You twisted that up. The light never  
19      came on before we went back here. We went back here  
20      because I didn't get a response at the door.

21      **Q**     I understand. That's what I'm saying.

22      **A**     Okay. Then the light came on and back off.  
23      That's why we went back down there.

24      **Q**     That's my point. So y'all didn't meet up until  
25      after the light came back on is the point.

1       **A**     No.

2       **Q**     Y'all didn't have any reason to go back down  
3       there because you were leaving.

4       **A**     We didn't -- we met up, the light was off. We  
5       went back down there when the light came on. We met  
6       up when I decided wasn't nobody coming to the door.  
7       The light didn't have nothing to do with us meeting  
8       up.

9       **Q**     Okay. All right. So y'all all were going to  
10      leave right then. As far as you knew, Rushton was  
11      going to leave, Melissa was going to leave, and you  
12      were going to leave?

13      **A**     When?

14      **Q**     After you made the decision that you couldn't  
15      get anybody to the door and you went back --

16      **A**     After I rang the doorbell, announced, Sheriff's  
17      office, numerous times, nobody came to the door,  
18      yes, I was going to leave.

19      **Q**     Okay. And then --

20      **A**     Then I met with Bobby and Melissa.

21      **Q**     Okay.

22      **A**     That's when the light came on.

23      **Q**     Then the light came on?

24      **A**     And went back off.

25      **Q**     And went back off. And y'all decided to go

1 back down there?

2 **A** Yes.

3 **Q** I got you. Okay.

4 Now, all this is happening during that 107  
5 seconds that the light goes off and y'all meet up,  
6 and then the call for shots fired, was all within  
7 107 seconds; is that right?

8 **A** I don't know how many seconds it was.

9 **Q** Okay. Now, I announce Sheriff -- we went back  
10 down there, and you announced, Sheriff's office.  
11 You can go back to your report there. And then I  
12 knocked on the door again.

13 And it's important because, this time, you  
14 didn't say you rang the doorbell, did you?

15 **A** Yeah, that's what I said. I knocked on the  
16 door again. I didn't say anything about ringing the  
17 doorbell.

18 **Q** Did you say anything about announcing,  
19 Sheriff's office, at that point?

20 **A** Yeah. Just before I knocked on the door, I  
21 announced, Sheriff's office.

22 **Q** Okay. So you announced, Sheriff's office, you  
23 knocked on the door, you didn't ring the doorbell,  
24 and then you say you heard the subject say, What do  
25 y'all want? Is that what you said?

1       **A**     That's what I said, yes, sir.

2       **Q**     Okay. Now, while this allegedly, What do y'all  
3       want, was said, was the light on or was the light  
4       off?

5       **A**     The light would have been off.

6       **Q**     Would have been off; right?

7       **A**     Uh-huh.

8       **Q**     Okay. Then you heard {sic}, I heard the door  
9       open from the upper deck. I'm assuming that's the  
10      sliding glass door?

11      **A**     Yes.

12      **Q**     So you've done that, now you hear a door  
13      opening; is that correct? And you announce --

14      **A**     I've done what?

15      **Q**     You say you announce, Sheriff's office -- as  
16      that door is opening, you're announcing, Sheriff's  
17      office. Is that what you're saying?

18      **A**     It says -- according to my statement, it says,  
19      What do y'all want? Then I announced, Sheriff's  
20      office, and he yelled, I don't give a fuck, is what  
21      my statement right here says.

22      **Q**     All right. So I'm assuming that in order for  
23      him to have said that, he would have had to be out  
24      there on the deck to say that. He'd have to come  
25      out and be on the deck to say that?

1       **A**     I can't assume.

2       **Q**     Well, I mean, how could you hear him otherwise?  
3       You're saying he was in the house hollering that or  
4       what are you saying?

5       **A**     I don't know where exactly he was at. He was  
6       up above me, but I can't say exactly where his  
7       location was when he said that.

8       **Q**     All right. And then Rushton says -- yells,  
9       Gun; right?

10      **A**     When?

11      **Q**     Right then. Rushton yells, Gun, right about  
12      this time. I mean, that's the next thing in your  
13      sentence, isn't it?

14      **A**     Yeah.

15             (Witness reviewing document.)

16             Okay. Yeah.

17      **Q**     And then it says you drew your weapon; is that  
18      correct?

19      **A**     Correct.

20      **Q**     Did you see -- were you able to see Joe?

21      **A**     I could see a silhouette.

22      **Q**     A silhouette. Was the light on or was the  
23      light off?

24      **A**     The light was off.

25      **Q**     The light was still off; is that correct?

1       **A**     Off.

2       **Q**     All right.  So then you heard a gunshot?

3       **A**     No.  The light came on before there was a  
4       gunshot.

5       **Q**     Okay.  Let's look and see what you said in your  
6       statement.  Where does it say in there that the  
7       light come on?

8       **A**     I don't know.  You got to remember, this  
9       statement was written after I worked 17 hours and my  
10      partner had just been shot and I had felt like I had  
11      been shot at, too.  I was scared.  I typed a  
12      statement, went home to get some rest.

13      **Q**     And so the fact that you're saying now that the  
14      light came on is something is an afterthought that  
15      you put into something after?

16      **A**     No.  It's not something that's an afterthought.  
17      It's the truth.

18      **Q**     All right.  Let's -- how have you prepared for  
19      this hearing today?

20      **A**     How -- how --

21      **Q**     How have you prepared for this hearing today?

22      **A**     What do you mean exactly?

23      **Q**     How did you get ready for this hearing today?

24      **A**     I spoke with the officers involved.  I read  
25      over my notes.



1           **Q**     Okay. And did you work with the prosecution?

2           **A**     Yeah, I spoke with them.

3           **Q**     Okay. And did you figure out how to deal with  
4 your inconsistent statements?

5           **A**     No --

6           **MR. MYERS:** Objection. That's improper.

7           **THE COURT:** I sustain that objection.

8           **MR. GARRETT:** Pardon me, Your Honor.

9 BY MR. GARRETT:

10          **Q**     All right. So then you say you hear a gunshot  
11 and Rushton said he was hit, and we both found cover  
12 to get away from the residence. I advised  
13 McAllister to get to her vehicle, come around to  
14 give us cover. And then, Where are you, you SOB?  
15 Started more distance, arriving 300 yards, maybe a  
16 few feet. Is that correct?

17          **A**     Say that again.

18          **Q**     It says you had also drawn your weapon. Then I  
19 heard a gunshot and saw Rushton go down. Rushton  
20 stated he'd been hit. Rushton then made it to me  
21 and we both found cover due to the fact that they  
22 were in an unknown location. Is that correct?

23          **A**     Uh-huh. Yes, sir.

24          **Q**     All right. Now, are you telling this jury that  
25 after somebody has just told you that they don't

1       give an F and y'all can't see him, that Bobby walked  
2       right out there in front, is that what you're  
3       saying, after having heard that?

4               And I think you said he was walking in this  
5       direction {indicating}. He might have fell over  
6       the --

7               **COURT REPORTER:** I didn't hear the last part.

8               **MR. GARRETT:** He may have fell over the railway  
9       tie.

10              **THE WITNESS:** He walked backwards, in my  
11       assumption, to see who was on the top deck or to get  
12       a visual when he heard that door open, but I can't  
13       speak exactly for what Bobby was doing.

14       BY MR. GARRETT:

15       **Q**     Okay. Now, if the person was out on the deck,  
16       it's impossible then to go in and cut the light on,  
17       isn't it?

18       **A**     I have no idea.

19       **Q**     You hadn't been out there and y'all haven't  
20       sent an electrician out there to find that out?

21       **A**     I hadn't.

22       **Q**     All right. Are you aware, now that you said  
23       you reviewed all the statements and everything about  
24       everybody about this, are you aware that there is a  
25       light that is on the inside that, in order to turn

1       it on, he would have had to have been inside the  
2       house to turn it on?

3       **A**     I have not discussed anything about what the  
4       electrician did, where the light switches were  
5       inside that residence.

6       **Q**     So if it's found out that the only way possible  
7       for Mr. Worley to turn his light on, he would have  
8       had to leave the deck and go inside the house and  
9       turn on the light?

10      **A**     I don't know.

11      **Q**     You just don't know?

12      **A**     I don't have any idea where his light switches  
13      are.

14      **Q**     Okay. Now, on Wednesday, July 21st, 2010, did  
15      you have an opportunity to talk with the federal  
16      agent, Stallo?

17             **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, I object if he's going  
18      into anything --

19             **THE COURT:** Just one second.

20             Madame Forelady, would you take your jury to  
21      the jury room, please?

22             (The jury retires to the jury room.)

23             **THE COURT:** Okay. What's the nature of the  
24      objection?

25             **MR. MYERS:** We probably didn't make it clear,

1 but I swear I thought a little while ago, when the  
2 jury was out, that we asked them to let's take that  
3 up not in front of the jury.

4 **THE COURT:** What I was saying a few minutes ago  
5 in my understanding was that under Number 17 of the  
6 responses by the State's discovery, an officer was  
7 identified, other than Officer Moore, as having a  
8 body mic on. What I said was that Mr. Garrett  
9 cannot question him as to the contents of what that  
10 mic might have had on -- reflected, because that  
11 would be hearsay, but the response that this  
12 gentleman or person was wearing a mic was an  
13 admission by the State, and I let him ask whether or  
14 not that person had a mic on.

15 Now, as to Stallo, I said to Mr. Maye that he  
16 very well may have a good objection, but let's wait  
17 until it comes up. So he raised his objection at  
18 the time.

19 **MR. MYERS:** I'm sorry. I thought he made a  
20 motion in limine that we take it up before --

21 **THE COURT:** That's okay. And I didn't really  
22 -- I just said bring it up at the time. Well, tell  
23 me what the --

24 **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, it would be helpful --  
25 like I said, I've got it, that I can hand up here.

1           Agent Stallo came and -- like I said, they were  
2           reviewing this to prosecute him on the federal side.  
3           Agent Stallo came out. He basically collected the  
4           statements. He looked out -- he wrote up his own  
5           summation of a narrative, a summary of events and a  
6           narrative that this agent wrote up. I'm going to  
7           pass this up to you.

8           But in there, he says he collected the written  
9           statements from all these guys, and he incorporated  
10          and made that a part of it. He was basically  
11          preparing his own little summation and the documents  
12          in this case to pass forward to the U.S. Attorney's  
13          Office.

14          And I know at the -- we have the benefit of  
15          having been through the Castle Doctrine hearing, and  
16          they attempted to basically take the narrative that  
17          Stallo wrote and said, Well, there's nothing in here  
18          in this narrative of which Stallo wrote about X, so  
19          you didn't say that. And there's -- you said this  
20          or Stallo said something in a different order than  
21          you said it in there, so I'm going to impeach you  
22          with Stallo's comments. And like I said, we think  
23          that that's total hearsay.

24          Now, they can get Stallo here, if this officer  
25          testifies and they want to put up in their case and

1 call Stallo and say, Isn't it true he told you X,  
2 isn't it true he told you Y, but to have this  
3 officer have to respond to what Stallo wrote and be  
4 cross-examined on what Stallo wrote is pure hearsay.  
5 And it's what we would --

6 **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett, why would Stallo's  
7 report, as opposed to the officer's incident report,  
8 not be hearsay?

9 **MR. GARRETT:** The question, Your Honor, is not  
10 that. The question is, is whether or not the  
11 officer actually told Stallo these things. He can  
12 either say, yes, he did or, no, he didn't.

13 **THE COURT:** Well, I mean, you can ask him  
14 whether he said it or not, but you cannot impeach  
15 him with the report because it does not say it.

16 **MR. GARRETT:** I understand.

17 **THE COURT:** Because that would be his own  
18 reflection of what --

19 **MR. GARRETT:** That would be from Stallo.

20 **THE COURT:** -- he thought he heard or didn't  
21 hear from this officer.

22 Now, the question as to whether or not this  
23 officer told him, I think is appropriate, but to the  
24 extent you try to impeach him by what's in this  
25 report, I would sustain the objection. Okay?

1           **MR. GARRETT:** All right.

2           **THE COURT:** Do you understand what I'm saying,  
3 so we're all clear?

4           **MR. GARRETT:** I'm clear.

5           **THE COURT:** Okay. Any questions?

6           **MR. MAYE:** No, sir, Your Honor. Thank you.  
7 And I apologize. Like I say --

8           **THE COURT:** And, please, don't thank me. This  
9 is part of the process.

10          **MR. MAYE:** Yes, sir. But like I said, we went  
11 through that in the previous. Thank you, Your  
12 Honor.

13          **THE COURT:** All right. Mr. Garrett, are you  
14 ready to resume?

15          **MR. GARRETT:** I am, Your Honor.

16          **THE COURT:** Mr. Maye, are you ready?

17          **MR. MAYE:** Yes, sir, Your Honor. Thank you.

18          **THE COURT:** Bring the jury back in, please.

19               (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

20          **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett.

21          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor.

22 BY MR. GARRETT:

23 **Q** Did you have occasion to meet with a Officer  
24 Stallo on Wednesday, July the 21st, 2010?

25 **A** Yes, I did.

1           **Q**     All right. Was it an interview?

2           **A**     We spoke.

3           **Q**     Okay. I'm just going to ask you a few  
4           questions and ask you whether or not you told Stallo  
5           these things. Okay?

6           **A**     Okay.

7           **Q**     Do you have a copy of the statement?

8           **A**     I do.

9           **Q**     Have you had sufficient time to review it?

10          **A**     Yes.

11          **Q**     All right. Did you tell Officer Stallo that  
12          Deputy Rushton, Moore, and McAllister arrived at the  
13          incident location; Deputy Rushton approached the  
14          complainant, Sheffield, while Deputy Moore knocked  
15          on the door of the Worley's residence?

16          **A**     To be honest with you, I can't tell you what I  
17          told Stallo. This is a summary of his report, and  
18          it says on here that my statement was attached to  
19          his. But I can't sit here and tell you exactly what  
20          I told him on that day.

21          **Q**     All right. So you --

22          **A**     This says, A narrative, summary of events --

23          **Q**     That's fine. You don't recall?

24          **A**     -- that he would have written down, so.

25          **Q**     I understand. You don't recall. Is that your



1 answer?

2 **A** Yes.

3 **Q** Okay. The next thing, that Deputy Moore  
4 knocked on the door for several minutes and was  
5 leaving when the top deck floodlights turned on.  
6 Did you say that?

7 **MR. MYERS:** Your Honor, he's reading the  
8 report.

9 **THE WITNESS:** Deputy Stallo wrote --

10 **THE COURT:** Just one second.

11 **MR. MYERS:** It's hearsay.

12 **THE COURT:** I'm going to sustain the objection  
13 as to the way the question's asked.

14 Rephrase your question, please, sir.

15 BY MR. GARRETT:

16 **Q** Did you tell Officer Stallo these things?

17 **A** I can't say. He wrote this, not me.

18 **Q** I understand. I'm just asking you, did you  
19 tell him that?

20 **A** I don't recall.

21 **Q** Okay. Did you say to him, Deputy Moore  
22 returned to the door and heard someone walking on  
23 the top deck above his head?

24 **A** I can't recall what I told him.

25 **Q** That's fine.

1           **A**     That's why I give him a copy of my statement.

2           **Q**     That's fine.

3                   And did you tell him, Deputy Moore knocked on  
4     the door for several minutes and was leaving when  
5     the top floodlights turned on? Is the answer you  
6     don't recall?

7           **A**     No, I don't recall.

8           **Q**     Okay. All right. Then Deputy Moore witnessed  
9     Deputy Rushton walk towards the top deck and heard  
10    Deputy Rushton yell at the person on the top deck,  
11    Sheriff's office, and then yelled, Gun. Did you  
12    tell him that?

13          **A**     I give him my statement.

14          **Q**     Okay. Deputy Moore next heard gunfire and saw  
15    Deputy Rushton fall to the ground. Do you recall  
16    telling him that?

17          **A**     (Witness shook head.)

18          **Q**     Is that a no?

19          **A**     No. No, I don't recall -- I give him a copy of  
20    my statement. What he wrote is what he wrote.

21          **Q**     I understand.

22                   **MR. MYERS:** At this time, Your Honor, under  
23    Rule 106 for completeness, we ask that his statement  
24    that he made, that he wrote out, it now be  
25    introduced into evidence, because he's taking

1       piecemeal stuff out. It's incomplete. So we would  
2       like everything Mr. Garrett gave him as to this  
3       witness, that it be offered in evidence under Rule  
4       106.

5               **THE COURT:** I will grant that motion. Would  
6       you make that statement a part of this, please, sir?

7               **MR. GARRETT:** Is this Stallo?

8               **MR. MYERS:** No, sir. The thing that this  
9       officer --

10              **THE COURT:** His statement -- I got it.

11              **MR. GARRETT:** The incident report?

12              **MR. MAYE:** No, sir. His written statement,  
13       Your Honor, which I have.

14              **THE COURT:** One at a time.

15              **MR. MAYE:** Sorry.

16              **THE WITNESS:** Yeah, I have a copy of my  
17       statement.

18              **THE COURT:** Would you show that to the State to  
19       make sure that's the statement we're referring to?

20              **MR. MYERS:** And the incident report that he  
21       questioned him about piecemeal.

22              **THE COURT:** Just one second.

23              Would you please -- let's go ahead and take an  
24       afternoon break, and then we'll bring you back.

25              (The jury retires to the jury room.)

1           **THE COURT:** Just for the record, Mr. Myers  
2 moved that the witness' statement and the witness'  
3 incident report be included or admitted into  
4 evidence for completeness. I granted that motion,  
5 and that's what we're in the process of doing.  
6 That's why I sent the jury out to give you an  
7 opportunity to get those together. Okay, sir?

8           **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you for doing that, Your  
9 Honor. I have handed it to him. I think Mr. Maye  
10 has got it.

11           Will that be a Defense Exhibit or a State's  
12 Exhibit?

13           **THE COURT:** I'll make it a Court's Exhibit.  
14 The written statement will be Number 3. The  
15 incident report will be Number 4. If you don't  
16 mind, Madam Court Reporter.

17           **COURT REPORTER:** Sorry?

18           **THE COURT:** The written statement of this  
19 witness will be Exhibit Number 3 -- Court Exhibit  
20 Number 3. The incident report will be Number 4.

21           While y'all are marking those, let's take about  
22 a 5, 10-minute break, and then we'll make sure we're  
23 all good to go. Okay?

24           You can't talk to anyone.

25           **THE WITNESS:** I just need to use the restroom.

1           **THE COURT:** That's fine.

2                   (Court's Exhibit Number 3, statement, and  
3 Court's Exhibit Number 4, incident report, marked  
4 for identification.)

5                   (Brief Recess.)

6           **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett, for the record, did we  
7 get those exhibits, the statement and the incident  
8 report, marked as Court Exhibits?

9           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, Your Honor.

10          **THE COURT:** Okay. Very good.

11                   Any other administrative matters before we  
12 bring the jury back? From the defense?

13          **MR. GARRETT:** Nothing from the defense, Your  
14 Honor.

15          **THE COURT:** From the State?

16          **MR. MYERS:** No, sir.

17          **THE COURT:** Okay. Are you ready to proceed?

18          **MR. GARRETT:** I am.

19          **THE COURT:** The State?

20          **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

21          **THE COURT:** All right. Would you bring the  
22 jury in?

23                   (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

24          **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett.

25          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor.

1           **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

2           BY MR. GARRETT:

3           **Q**     In addition to your statement and then your  
4           incident report and your discussions with Stallo,  
5           you also have given sworn testimony on May 31st and  
6           June 1st of 2011; is that correct?

7           **A**     I'm not sure of the dates.

8           **Q**     (Hands document to witness.)

9                     In that examination, the question was asked  
10           about whether or not once the light came on, whether  
11           or not it stayed on and was on when Officer Rushton  
12           stepped out. It was your position at that time that  
13           the light stayed on the entire time, wasn't it?

14                     I'll refer you to page 165, line 22.

15           **A**     Yes. That's what I said in that line, but then  
16           right up under it, I say, again, that once he cut  
17           the light off and back on and back on -- or off, he  
18           left it on, just shortly up under that.

19           **Q**     Well, that's my point. The light was on when  
20           Rushton walked out there. As he was walking, the  
21           light came on while Rushton was out there --

22           **A**     Out where?

23           **Q**     -- is that correct? Is that correct?

24           **A**     Out where?

25           **Q**     Out in front of the house where you said

1 Rushton had walked.

2 **A** The light came on seconds before he was shot or  
3 instantaneously.

4 **Q** Okay. And in your prior statements, you've  
5 always said that the first thing you heard was the  
6 step out. And earlier on, you said the light came  
7 on at that time. When he stepped out, the light  
8 came on at about the time he stepped out. Isn't  
9 that in your testimony?

10 **A** He stepped out, the light came on, Bobby was  
11 shot. It was all within {snapping fingers} matter  
12 of seconds.

13 **Q** All right. Like seconds?

14 **A** Like seconds.

15 **Q** All right. And so -- and that's the point.  
16 This alleged discussion about, Who y'all, we the  
17 police, or the sheriff's department, or drop y'all's  
18 gun and all that, that just didn't happen, did it?

19 **A** Yes, that did happen.

20 **Q** Well, the gun -- you said in your testimony,  
21 the moment you heard the word gun, you heard a shot;  
22 is that correct?

23 **A** Within seconds. When Bobby said, Gun, we said,  
24 Sheriff's office, put the gun down. It all happened  
25 within seconds.

1       **Q**     Before you even got it out, there was a shot,  
2       wasn't it?

3       **A**     Your timeline has that all that transmission  
4       happened in less than a second.

5       **Q**     That's not my timeline, sir, that's yours.

6       **A**     Well, that's the one you presented.

7       **Q**     It's the EMS --

8       **A**     It's not mine --

9       **Q**     -- that's your record.

10       **MR. MAYE:**   Your Honor, objection.

11       **THE COURT:**   I sustain that.   Let me warn both  
12       counsel and the witness:   We're not going to engage  
13       in argumentative.   He ask questions, you answer the  
14       question.   You understand?

15       **THE WITNESS:**   Yes, sir.

16       **THE COURT:**   You understand?

17       **MR. GARRETT:**   I do, Your Honor.

18       **THE COURT:**   Okay.   Thank you.

19       BY MR. GARRETT:

20       **Q**     You don't challenge any of those -- on the EMS  
21       records, you don't challenge any of those statements  
22       or the times on it, do you?

23       **A**     (No response.)

24       **Q**     You don't challenge any of those dates or times  
25       on that time stamp?



1       **A**     It's not mine. I can't say for sure.

2       **Q**     Okay. But if it's EMS, your dispatch logs, you  
3       would disagree with them?

4       **A**     I have no control over dispatch or dispatch  
5       logs.

6       **Q**     And so you're saying they're inaccurate?

7       **A**     I didn't say that. I said I have no control  
8       over them. Somebody higher up than me has control  
9       over that.

10      **Q**     Okay. Now, when Bobby was shot, your partner  
11     had just been shot, what did you do?

12      **A**     At which point? When he had --

13      **Q**     Immediately. He's shot. He goes down. You  
14     said it was quick. What did you do?

15      **A**     I told him to come to me, once I saw that he  
16     was moving.

17      **Q**     Okay. And did you hear the second shot?

18      **A**     I did. When he got up to come towards me is  
19     when I heard the second shot.

20      **Q**     All right. And in prior testimony, you said  
21     that then you heard the statement, Where you at, you  
22     SOB? Right after you heard -- right after he shot  
23     -- on his way to you, you've stated in previous  
24     testimony that he -- that Bobby, as he was coming  
25     towards you, the second shot rang out, and that was

1 a statement made by Mr. Worley, Where you at, you  
2 son of a bitch? Is that correct?

3 **A** When did I say this?

4 **Q** You talking about in your prior testimony?

5 **A** Yes.

6 (Pause.)

7 **Q** So you've heard no statement -- you're telling  
8 the jury you've heard no statement by Mr. Worley at  
9 or about the time the second shot rang out?

10 **A** I told -- after the second shot and we was  
11 retreating, I later heard him. You just said that I  
12 said it immediately after.

13 **Q** You haven't said that to anybody?

14 **A** Immediately after?

15 **Q** Or -- or --

16 **A** No.

17 **Q** -- during those seconds you said he was --

18 **A** "Where you at, you son of a bitch" would have  
19 been a short time later, after we had retreated to  
20 the backyard.

21 **Q** Okay. Back here you said you heard it coming  
22 from this direction here?

23 **A** Coming from this direction. We would have had  
24 retreated into this general area by the time I heard  
25 that, not immediately after he fired the shot.

1           **Q**     That's the only door right there, isn't it?

2           **A**     Down here?

3           **Q**     Yeah.

4           **A**     I do believe so. There's a garage door and  
5           this door and the upper door.

6           **Q**     But that's the only way to get in and out of  
7           here; right?

8           **A**     I do believe so.

9           **Q**     All right. And he was -- he was coming back  
10          towards the door when you were over here in this  
11          area. He was coming back towards the house the  
12          second time, wasn't he?

13          **A**     Who was?

14          **Q**     Mr. Rushton.

15          **A**     He was coming towards me. I was back here.

16          **Q**     Okay. But that's towards the Worleys' door;  
17          right?

18          **A**     The door's over this way. I was over this way.  
19          He came towards me.

20          **Q**     All right. You said you saw Joe in silhouette.  
21          Did Joe see you?

22          **A**     I have no idea.

23          **Q**     Okay. Could he have seen you from where you  
24          were at?

25          **A**     He should have been able to.

1       **Q**     Why is that?  If he was shooting in this  
2       direction, how could he see you up here?

3       **A**     If he'd a looked, he would have seen me, but I  
4       can't say whether he seen me or not.

5       **Q**     Okay.  And he did use the term SOB as opposed  
6       to plural S -- sons of bitches?

7       **A**     To the best of my recollection, he said, Son of  
8       a bitch, but he could have said --

9       **Q**     So it sounded like he was talking about one  
10      person he was talking about?

11      **A**     To the best of my recollection, yes.

12      **Q**     Now, when he shot him, did you have your gun  
13      aimed at him?

14      **A**     At Joe?

15      **Q**     At Joe.  When the bullet rang out and struck  
16      Mr. Rushton, did you have your gun --

17      **A**     I drew my gun and pointed it in the general  
18      direction.  It never was -- would have been pointed  
19      at Joe, because I couldn't have actually had a safe  
20      -- good enough target on him to point it directly at  
21      him.

22      **Q**     Okay.  So what you saw -- the target you saw  
23      was not a good enough target for you to make out to  
24      be able to properly shoot?

25      **A**     It was not a good -- I did not have a safe

1 shoot situation.

2 Q All right. And did you know where the gunshot  
3 flashed? Because it's completely dark out there;  
4 right?

5 A Do I know what now?

6 Q Do you know where the gunshot flashed -- which  
7 way the gunshot flashed on the second flash?

8 A I have no idea about a gunshot flash.

9 Q Did you see the first gunshot flash from the  
10 .30-06?

11 A No, I did not.

12 Q Did you see the second one?

13 A No, I did not.

14 Q All right. And have you done an examination of  
15 the ground at or around where you say that Bobby  
16 fell to determine whether or not you could find a  
17 bullet in or about his location?

18 A Have I? No, I have not.

19 Q Well, you were part of the investigation team,  
20 weren't you?

21 A Yes. I was out there.

22 Q You were part of the investigation team,  
23 weren't you?

24 A Yes.

25 Q All right. And did y'all look in the area at

1 or about where Bobby fell and whereabouts the second  
2 shot you heard to see whether or not there was any  
3 bullets or anything in the ground at or about his  
4 location?

5 **A** I did not.

6 **Q** Do you know whether any member of your team  
7 did?

8 **A** No, I have no idea.

9 **Q** Wouldn't that be relevant?

10 **A** I have no idea.

11 **Q** Well, you heard Joe testify that he shot it up  
12 into the air; right?

13 **MR. MYERS:** Objection.

14 **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor --

15 **THE COURT:** I sustain that objection.

16 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, may we have --

17 **THE COURT:** All right. Madame Forelady, will  
18 you mind going to the jury room for a second,  
19 please?

20 (The jury retires to the jury room.)

21 **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett, your client has not  
22 taken the stand. We don't know at this point  
23 whether or not he's going to exercise his rights  
24 under the Fifth Amendment. Until such time, I'm not  
25 going to allow you to get in any prior testimony by

1           this witness at all.

2           **MR. GARRETT:**   Yes, sir.

3           **THE COURT:**   And if I'm -- if there's a rule  
4           that tells me I'm wrong, please point it out to me,  
5           but it seems inherently unfair for you to be able to  
6           bring up testimony by this witness and then turn  
7           around and claim the privileges under the Fifth  
8           without having the right to be able to be  
9           cross-examined on this witness -- on that statement.

10          **MR. GARRETT:**   He was cross-examined, Your  
11          Honor.

12          **THE COURT:**   Not in this trial he hadn't.

13          **MR. GARRETT:**   And they lost our transcript.

14          **THE COURT:**   You know, I understand the inherent  
15          unfairness of that or what appears to be. I'm faced  
16          with this trial now. And at such time, you know, if  
17          you want me to not excuse this witness and you can  
18          call him back, if your client chooses to testify --  
19          and we'll go over the Fifth Amendment rights with  
20          him at the appropriate time -- then I'll let you  
21          call him back. But I'm not going to let you go into  
22          his statements at this point with this witness  
23          without him taking the stand.

24          **MR. GARRETT:**   Will that be for any witness then  
25          who is in the courtroom? It's not an out-of-court

1 statement, Your Honor. It's, in fact, an in-court  
2 statement that they heard -- they heard the  
3 testimony.

4 **THE COURT:** Well, here's the problem, as I  
5 said, and y'all -- I'm asking all the attorneys to  
6 correct me if I'm making an incorrect -- y'all prove  
7 to me if I'm wrong or tell me -- show me where I'm  
8 wrong. For you to sit there and cross-examine this  
9 officer or any other witness, State or defense,  
10 concerning prior testimony by this defendant and  
11 then for him to exercise his right under the Fifth,  
12 which is his absolute constitutional right, is  
13 inherently unfair in this matter because it doesn't  
14 allow cross-examination on those grounds. Now, if  
15 there's a rule that shows me I'm wrong, tell me, and  
16 I'll be glad to reevaluate it.

17 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, it's not an  
18 out-of-court -- it's not an out-of-court statement.  
19 In fact, it's an in-court statement, so it's not --  
20 it can't be hearsay. It's cross-examined testimony.  
21 And he was --

22 **THE COURT:** So Mr. Garrett --

23 **MR. GARRETT:** -- in here because the judge  
24 didn't sequester them.

25 **THE COURT:** -- let me ask you this.



1           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

2           **THE COURT:** On the converse side of that, if  
3 your client were to choose to exercise his rights  
4 under the Fifth Amendment, but chose to testify at a  
5 Jackson Denno hearing or another type of preliminary  
6 hearing, do you think it's appropriate that his  
7 statements, although sworn, be brought up in trial  
8 even though he exercised his rights under the Fifth  
9 Amendment?

10          **MR. GARRETT:** No, sir.

11          **THE COURT:** No. That would be reversible  
12 error. I can't imagine that you could. So the  
13 converse is, you know, you can't do the other side  
14 either that I can see.

15           You know, I hear what you're saying, and I  
16 don't disagree that it's in-court testimony and it's  
17 not -- it's not a hearsay testimony. I think it's a  
18 matter of -- I'm not being very eloquent about it,  
19 but for him to be shielded by the Fifth Amendment  
20 but use it as a sword at the same time is not  
21 appropriate.

22          **MR. GARRETT:** But he wasn't shielded by the  
23 Fifth Amendment in this case, Judge. He got up in  
24 sworn testimony and testified.

25          **THE COURT:** Well, my understanding of the rules

1       -- and y'all correct me -- Jackson Denno testimony  
2       is not subject -- doesn't waive your Fifth Amendment  
3       rights at trial, neither does one of these immunity  
4       hearings.

5               **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, he testified in full  
6       is all I'm trying to say. And the Solicitor's had a  
7       shot at him in full on --

8               **THE COURT:** So, Mr. Garrett, you're telling me  
9       that anything he said, even if your client exercises  
10      his rights in this trial not to testify, that any of  
11      his prior sworn testimony can be brought out by the  
12      State in this case?

13              **MR. GARRETT:** Absolutely.

14              **THE COURT:** I disagree with you on that. If  
15      you can prove to me I'm wrong, I'll give you an  
16      opportunity to show me I'm wrong and to present it  
17      to this jury, but I don't believe that's correct.

18              **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

19              **THE COURT:** Do y'all need a minute or two?

20              **MR. GARRETT:** Can we have just a moment?

21              **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

22                      (Pause.)

23              **MR. GARRETT:** We're ready.

24              **THE COURT:** And let me make sure I'm clear from  
25      my ruling on the record. My ruling -- and I'm

1       having my law clerk look at it further. So, number  
2       one, that the defendant -- at this juncture in the  
3       trial, the defense cannot use pretrial sworn  
4       testimony of the defendant to cross-examine the  
5       State's witnesses or its own witnesses while the  
6       defendant may exercise his rights under the Fifth  
7       Amendment not to testify. If he chooses to testify,  
8       then it may be subject to cross-examination since it  
9       is sworn testimony. Okay?

10             If I'm incorrect in my ruling, I will give the  
11       defense an opportunity to present that testimony  
12       which it wants to have. Okay?

13             **MR. GARRETT:** Beg the Court's indulgence.

14             (Pause.)

15             **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, I understand what His  
16       Honor is saying as to all fact witnesses; that there  
17       may be a different rule as it relates to an expert  
18       witness. Is that --

19             **THE COURT:** Okay. It may be a different rule  
20       for expert witnesses?

21             **MR. GARRETT:** Expert witnesses on that.

22             **THE COURT:** We'll cross experts when we get  
23       there.

24             **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

25             **THE COURT:** Everybody clear on that?

1           **MR. GARRETT:** I'm clear.

2           **THE COURT:** Are you ready to go?

3           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

4           **THE COURT:** All right. The State ready?

5           **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

6           **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury in,  
7 please?

8                   (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

9           **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett.

10          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor.

11          BY MR. GARRETT:

12          **Q**     Officer Moore, then, as it relates to all these  
13 statements -- and we're getting back to the first  
14 statement that you made -- is it true that, because  
15 you had just experienced this bad circumstance and  
16 whatnot, that your memory may not have been as good  
17 as you would have liked for it to have been?

18          **A**     On the morning that I wrote the statement?

19          **Q**     Uh-huh.

20          **A**     That is correct.

21          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you. No further questions.

22          **THE COURT:** Redirect?

23          **MR. MAYE:** Nothing else. Thank you.

24          **THE COURT:** You may step down, sir.

25                 Would you call your next witness, please?

1           **MR. MAYE:** The State would call Donald Garman  
2 to the stand.

3                               DONALD GARMAN,  
4           having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

5           **THE COURT:** Sir, if you'll state your name for  
6 the record and spell your last name for the record,  
7 please.

8           **THE WITNESS:** My name is Donald Garman,  
9 G-a-r-m-a-n.

10                              DIRECT EXAMINATION

11           BY MR. MAYE:

12           **Q**     Mr. Garman, if you would, as to your  
13 involvement on November the 15th of 2009 -- where do  
14 you live now?

15           **A**     I live in Savannah Lakes Village.

16           **Q**     You live in Savannah Lakes Village.

17                       And where did you originally work? And I  
18 assume you retired from somewhere and came from  
19 somewhere else?

20           **A**     I was -- most of my adult life in Rochester,  
21 New York.

22           **Q**     Okay. Did you work up in Rochester, New York,  
23 as an EMT and did you participate in EMT training  
24 when you were in New York?

25           **A**     I was involved in emergency medical services.

1 I was an EMT, advanced EMT, EMT instructor, hazmat  
2 instructor. I was a safety engineer in the  
3 industry.

4 **Q** Okay. Mr. Garman, since you've come here to be  
5 a McCormick County resident, have you volunteered  
6 your services and expertise to the county? And if  
7 you have, would you tell the ladies and gentlemen of  
8 the jury in what capacity?

9 **A** I joined the Sandy Branch Fire Department and  
10 Edmire First Responders in the summer of 2009.

11 **Q** Let me ask you about the date that Officer  
12 Rushton, Bobby Rushton, was shot in the hand in this  
13 case. Did you respond as part of your duties as a  
14 first responder for the fire department there?

15 **A** Yes. We were paged out to respond, and we were  
16 told to respond to the location of the firehouse on  
17 Holiday Road, as law enforcement was going in to try  
18 and control the site. And we were told to hold  
19 there.

20 **Q** Okay. Did you have an occasion to assist and  
21 render medical treatment to Bobby Rushton at that  
22 time when he was transported up there in a patrol  
23 car?

24 **A** Yes. When he was brought back there, I worked  
25 with Mike Sharp, who was our chief, and I was

1 responsible to work with him. I was working on  
2 controlling the bleeding, stopping the bleeding,  
3 while Mike was doing other things, such as getting  
4 ready to start an IV.

5 **Q** Could you describe the condition of Officer  
6 Bobby Rushton's hand when you got there and what  
7 steps it was necessary for you to take in order to  
8 treat the trauma to his hand?

9 **A** Okay. Well, obviously, we gloved up first, but  
10 the hand was pretty well torn up. There was a lot  
11 of open tissue. There was an avulsed finger.

12 **Q** What does avulsed mean?

13 **A** Torn like as opposed to a clean cut with a  
14 laceration or with a knife. This is literally  
15 ripped apart from trauma.

16 I started using compresses to control the  
17 bleeding, trying to pull the hand together, steady  
18 the hand so that Mike could get a site for putting  
19 the IV in.

20 **Q** Did y'all administer an IV to him and put an IV  
21 in at that time?

22 **A** Mike did put an IV in as I bandaged the hand,  
23 and he continued to -- he finished bandaging the  
24 hand.

25 **Q** The wound that you're describing sounds as if

1       it is an extremely serious wound to a hand; is that  
2       a fair --

3       **A**       It was a very serious wound.  There were parts  
4       of the hand -- the inner workings, if you will, of  
5       the hand, some tendon, ligament, blood vessels  
6       exposed.

7       **Q**       And you helped stabilize him in order for him  
8       to be transported on further for treatment in a  
9       hospital setting; is that correct?

10      **A**       Yes, I did.

11               **MR. MAYE:**  Answer any questions that the  
12      defense has for you.

13               **MR. GARRETT:**  I don't have any.  Thank you for  
14      your services.

15               **THE COURT:**  Cross-examination?

16               **MR. GARRETT:**  None.

17               **THE COURT:**  May this witness be excused?

18               **MR. MAYE:**  Yes.  Thank you.

19               **THE COURT:**  Thank you, sir.  You may be  
20      excused.

21               **MR. MAYE:**  The State would call Dr. Robert  
22      Densmore to the stand.

23                                       \*\*\*\*\*

24                                       \*\*\*\*\*

25                                       \*\*\*\*\*



1 ROBERT CHARLES DENSMORE,  
2 having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

3 DIRECT EXAMINATION

4 BY MR. MAYE:

5 **Q** Dr. Densmore, if you would, state your full  
6 name for the record in this case.

7 **A** It's Robert Charles Densmore.

8 **Q** Dr. Densmore, what type of doctor are you? I'm  
9 referring to you as doctor, but what type of doctor  
10 are you?

11 **A** I'm a plastic and reconstructive surgeon.

12 **Q** Okay. Dr. Densmore, where are you employed  
13 now? And let me ask you, where were you employed  
14 back November the 15th of 2009 and in the ensuing  
15 weeks afterwards?

16 **A** I am currently employed at the Medical College  
17 of Georgia at Georgia Regents University and at the  
18 Veterans Hospital at Charlie Norwood.

19 At the time I was there also, I was the chief  
20 of hand surgery for plastics, and I am still  
21 currently the chief of plastic surgery at the VA.

22 **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, at this point in time,  
23 I'm going to offer him as an expert in the area of  
24 hand surgery and treatment to hand injuries, subject  
25 to any cross-examination that he might be subject to

1 from the defense.

2 **THE COURT:** Any voir dire?

3 **MR. GARRETT:** None, Your Honor.

4 **THE COURT:** Do you stipulate to his expertise?

5 **MR. GARRETT:** We stipulate to his

6 qualifications, Your Honor.

7 **THE COURT:** Very good.

8 Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, let me say  
9 this: Usually a witness is limited in their  
10 testimony to what they see, they smell, they hear,  
11 they feel, basically their senses, and they're  
12 generally not allowed to give their opinion unless  
13 they are qualified as an expert. On the other hand,  
14 if, for reason of your education or your experience,  
15 you have developed an expertise in a particular  
16 area, you're allowed to give your opinion in the  
17 area of your expertise.

18 In this case, everyone agrees that Dr. Densmore  
19 is an expert in the field of hand surgery and  
20 treatment of hand injuries --

21 **MR. MAYE:** Yes.

22 **THE COURT:** -- and reconstructive surgery. As  
23 such, he'll be allowed to give his opinion in that  
24 area. Expert testimony is like any other testimony  
25 in this case. You may accept it, you may reject it,

1 or give it as much weight as you think is  
2 appropriate based on the testimony.

3 All right. Mr. Maye.

4 BY MR. MAYE:

5 **Q** Dr. Densmore, some time at November 15th, 2009,  
6 and forward, in the ensuing weeks and months, did  
7 you have an occasion to treat Officer Bobby Rushton  
8 from McCormick County Sheriff's Department for a  
9 gunshot wound and the subsequent injury to his hand  
10 in this case?

11 **A** I did.

12 **Q** Okay. Would you please describe to the ladies  
13 and gentlemen of the jury what type of trauma was  
14 associated with the injury that he suffered as a  
15 result of that gunshot wound and what steps you took  
16 to treat him as a result of that injury?

17 **A** He had severe injury to his right hand. This  
18 was a combination of a penetrating trauma from a  
19 high-velocity round, as well as a blast injury, for  
20 lack of a better term.

21 The entrance wound was on the back of his hand,  
22 and the exit wound was a much larger wound on the  
23 palm of his hand. The bones to the middle finger  
24 and the ring finger within the palm were both  
25 shattered. The middle finger had a section of bone

1       missing, and what we call the proximal nerve  
2       phalangeal joint, the first joint of the finger was  
3       completely destroyed.

4               He underwent a total of four operations with  
5       me. The first operation was an initial assessment  
6       and stabilization and an initial debridement of that  
7       wound.

8               So, on the first operation, we explored the  
9       wound, we removed any debris that was immediately  
10      apparent in the wound. We controlled the bleeding.  
11      We did a carpal tunnel release because the amount of  
12      swelling could compromise the nerve that goes  
13      through the carpal tunnel.

14              We repaired the index finger bone with K-wires.  
15      There was a segment of bone missing; we wired that  
16      back in. We did an extensor tendon repair to the  
17      index finger. We controlled the bleeding by  
18      ligating the blood vessels, and then we repaired the  
19      laceration to the top of his hand. And we amputated  
20      the middle finger because it was not viable, and  
21      without that joint being present, it was not  
22      something that we could reconstruct.

23              We then took him back to the operating room on  
24      the 17th for a relook. This is common when we have  
25      a trauma injury, and we think that there's going to

1       be tissue that is potentially not viable. We'll try  
2       to leave tissue that looks questionable in the first  
3       operation so that if it pinks up and does well, then  
4       we can leave that there for reconstruction and then  
5       kind of declares itself over the next 24 to 48  
6       hours.

7               In the second operation, we went back in the --  
8       in between the bones of your palm is what we call  
9       the interosseous muscles. These are the muscles  
10      that bend your fingers this way {indicating}. All  
11      of the other movement to your fingers are in your  
12      forearm, but the ones that bend the first joint are  
13      actually in your palm.

14             So on either side of the middle finger, there  
15      are muscles that come up and insert into the tendons  
16      of the finger. The bullet had gone right through  
17      there. And the common digital artery, the one that  
18      comes out, you have your radial artery and your  
19      ulnar artery that make an arch in the palm, and then  
20      they give off a single artery that comes up between  
21      the fingers that then branches out to the fingers.

22             So you have a common artery that comes up here  
23      and then it branches into the index and the middle  
24      finger, and common artery that comes up between the  
25      ring of the middle finger and splits, and then one

1       that goes up between there. So each common artery  
2       supplies two different fingers.

3               His common artery to the middle -- between the  
4       middle and the index and the middle and the ring was  
5       destroyed on both sides. So he had no blood flow to  
6       the distal middle finger, and he lost half the blood  
7       flow to his ring finger and his index finger.

8               So based on that and the muscles that were on  
9       either side of the middle finger, those were not --  
10      not doing well. So we did what's called a ray  
11      amputation. The first amputation was taken here  
12      {indicating}.

13              If he had stayed vital and the muscles had been  
14      okay, we might have been able to close it, but we're  
15      still given a gap in his hand when he makes a fist.  
16      Because the muscles weren't living and because the  
17      blood flow didn't look good, we took the bone to the  
18      middle finger all the way back and trimmed it there,  
19      and then bring the index finger over and the ring  
20      finger over to try to close that gap.

21              It mimics -- it's not the best term, but kind  
22      of a cartoon hand. In a cartoon hand, they usually  
23      draw three fingers. It converts it to  
24      three-fingered hand.

25              At that second operation, we debrided it. We

1 found some shrapnel that we weren't able to get out  
2 the first operation because it was in between the  
3 fingers. When we took the middle finger out, we  
4 were able to get to some of that and remove that.  
5 And then we used the skin from the back of the  
6 middle finger to close up the defect that was in the  
7 center of his hand because that had been blown away.

8 And those were the first two operations that we  
9 did. Then he entered into a period of  
10 rehabilitation, and then we came back four and a  
11 half months later in March, and we did a second  
12 operation.

13 Unlike a cut or a stabbing injury, which is a  
14 low-energy type of induration, or if you have just a  
15 fracture because you hit it on something or  
16 something like that, the blast was -- caused a lot  
17 of inflammation. So there was a lot of tissue  
18 damage, and then, afterwards, it causes a lot of  
19 inflammation and scarring. So we had hoped that we  
20 would be able to get the joints moving.

21 Your body is amazing, but it's not very smart.  
22 Things that don't move get stiff. Things that do  
23 move stay limber. If you break your forearm and  
24 don't put it in a cast, your body will actually make  
25 a pseudo joint there and it will flex, and never

1       heal. If you cast it, then it makes it hard and it  
2       forms a new bone.

3               In Bobby's situation, we had fractures to the  
4       two remaining bones in his hand, and we had to  
5       immobilize those, but we've got all this  
6       inflammation. The body is trying to heal everything  
7       and because it's not moving, because we've got to  
8       hold the fractures, it's forming scar tissue around  
9       the joints that should be moving. So we're trying  
10      to move those, get those to limber up. And after  
11      four and a half months, it was pretty clear that the  
12      fingers weren't going to move properly.

13             So we took him back for what's called a  
14      capsulotomy. A capsulotomy is where the joint  
15      capsule, all the ligaments around the joint, get so  
16      tight that the joint won't move anymore. So we cut  
17      those joint capsules to allow the joint to start to  
18      move again.

19             We did what's called a tenolysis. The tendons  
20      -- excuse me -- the tendons to the back of his  
21      finger and to the front of his fingers that are  
22      involved with straightening and flexing the finger  
23      had scarred into their tendon sheath so they  
24      wouldn't slip. It's like a cable system. And if  
25      you had a tunnel or a tube and you crimped that tube



1 down on a cable, it couldn't hold up and wouldn't be  
2 able to move it even if the joints were able to  
3 move. So we freed up all of the adhesions around  
4 the tendons.

5 And then we -- the index finger -- the index  
6 finger, we did the tendons, we did the capsulotomy  
7 of the MCP joints, and then the PIP, the first joint  
8 and middle joint, the most important one for flexing  
9 your finger, we did to the index finger, the long --  
10 the ring finger, and the small finger. So the three  
11 remaining fingers, we freed those up and started  
12 back on rehab.

13 The next operation -- the fourth operation was  
14 in October. Now, Bobby has an incredible pain  
15 threshold. He works hard. And what actually ended  
16 up happening was, he's working so hard at trying to  
17 free those joints up that the fracture of the  
18 metacarpal had not been able to heal. He was  
19 pulling so hard trying to bend here, it actually  
20 bent at the place where that joint is, and that  
21 causes what we discussed earlier, the nonunion to  
22 the joint.

23 Since the joint won't -- a fractured bone won't  
24 heal if you keep bending it, he had a nonunion to  
25 the index metacarpal, which we ended up putting a

1 plate on.

2 So when we went back later on, the joints still  
3 were not able to move enough to the index finger to  
4 allow him to do a good pinch. So because the first  
5 joint was so stiff and it had had this fracture  
6 which we plated, we wanted to get that plate out and  
7 we wanted to fuse this first joint. The idea is,  
8 Well, if it's not going to move, let's at least put  
9 it in a place where it'll be more functional. So if  
10 your finger is straight, you can't really do  
11 anything with it. So if we bring the finger in,  
12 then we can pinch with it, we can reach and put a  
13 key pinch to the side, and you can use it as a hook,  
14 but it's not much more than a hook. And that was  
15 the last operation that we did.

16 **Q** So, Doctor, what you're describing is a  
17 catastrophic injury to the hand?

18 **A** Correct.

19 **Q** He lost a finger, and he lost significant,  
20 meaningful, and useful function to the hand in this  
21 case?

22 **A** I have his Greenleaf evaluation, which is the  
23 evaluation that we did in March of 2011. So after  
24 that last injury, I talked to him about, you know,  
25 how do you feel about the function of your hand?

1           And, essentially, with the fusion of the first  
2           joint of his index finger, he can't move that joint  
3           at all; it's fixed. He has a small amount of  
4           movement here, and he's just barely able to pinch.

5           So the range of movement is -- in his  
6           evaluation is about 85 percent of the function of  
7           this finger is gone. It's just sort of sitting  
8           there as a hook. And I really wanted to know  
9           whether he wanted me to change the position of it,  
10          whether it was in the best position for him, and he  
11          said, I think it's about as good as it can get, and  
12          we'll go, you know, go on from here.

13          So, on that evaluation -- that evaluation, the  
14          thorough evaluation of the whole hand, it describes  
15          the sensory loss, the movement loss of that hand.

16          So the index finger, when we evaluate  
17          sensation, normal sensation, we'll touch you with  
18          two points. And somebody with really sensitive  
19          fingers might be able to tell that you're touching  
20          with two points even if those points come down to a  
21          couple millimeters apart because your fingers -- you  
22          can reach in your pocket and tell the difference  
23          between a penny and a dime or a penny and a nickel.  
24          Those are only a couple of millimeters' difference.  
25          You can't do that on your tummy. You put a penny on

1       your tummy, you might not even know it's there,  
2       because the nerves are spread out more. But there's  
3       a lot of nerves in your hand. And we do a thing  
4       called two-point discrimination. So normal is one  
5       to five.

6               Fair, if you're a heavy industrial worker and  
7       you use your hands for carpentry and you're -- it's  
8       a trade-off; you want your hands not to be sensitive  
9       because you'll be getting blisters all the time, but  
10      it costs you in the sense -- sensitivity of your  
11      hands, they're tougher, but they don't feel as well  
12      as somebody who does less strenuous work.

13             So fair sensation would be 6 to 10 millimeters.  
14      Poor sensation would be 11 to 15 millimeters. And  
15      then what they -- the step between that and  
16      anesthetic -- anesthetic means he doesn't feel  
17      anything -- is pressure. You can tell that it's  
18      being touched and that's it. You can't tell whether  
19      it's two or one, even at more than 15 millimeters,  
20      which is more than a half an inch. So you're  
21      touching him in two places on his finger more than  
22      15 millimeters apart, and he can't tell that there's  
23      two points there and they just call that pressure  
24      sensation.

25             So on his index finger, that's basically all

1       the sensation he has. To his other fingers and his  
2       thumb, he's got normal sensation, but when that  
3       common digital artery was involved, it also shocked  
4       the nerves. And on the side of his finger, very  
5       little sensation. And basically all except for the  
6       very, very tip of his finger, he's got minimal  
7       two-point discrimination.

8               I think probably from a functional outlook, if  
9       you look at what a hand does, you use your hand to  
10      manipulate your environment. You use it to pinch  
11      things, pick them up by the tips. You use it with a  
12      key pinch to turn the ignition on your car. You  
13      might pick up a ball and use all four in what we  
14      call a three-jaw clamp, where you're approaching it  
15      from other sides. Like if it were a ball, you'd  
16      take it from all sides so the ball doesn't go around  
17      everywhere. And then the last thing you'd do is you  
18      grip it with your whole hand.

19             So his right hand, his key pinch, pinching like  
20      this {indicating} to do an ignition -- the 2.6  
21      pounds is the average key pinch. Normal, on his  
22      left hand, his nondominant hand -- normally your  
23      right hand is your strong hand; your left hand is  
24      your weak hand -- his weak hand is 22 pounds. His  
25      strong hand is 2.6 pounds.

1           Three-jaw on his strong hand, almost 17 pounds,  
2           16.95. On his right hand, using all of his fingers,  
3           he managed to generate 4.7, a quarter of the  
4           strength of his noninjured hand.

5           And the tips pinch, just two fingers, 16  
6           pounds, just pinching. If you were going to pull an  
7           eyelash out or a splinter out, 16 pounds with the  
8           noninjured hand and 1.3 pounds with the injured  
9           hand.

10          Grip strength is when you're using your most  
11          powerful grip. It ranges, depending on how big of a  
12          an object you're trying to hold, on his nondominant  
13          hand, his weak hand, between 55 and 100 pounds of  
14          force that he can generate with that left hand. On  
15          his right hand, he's able to generate between 12 and  
16          20 pounds, roughly a quarter of what his normal hand  
17          can do.

18          Another way to look at it: With his left hand,  
19          he can hold on to these papers and hold them in his  
20          pinch grip as strong as he can grip the entire wad  
21          of paper using every muscle in his hand with his  
22          right hand, so about a quarter of his strength. So  
23          he's lost -- because he still has some function in  
24          terms of being able to grasp things, we evaluate the  
25          function of his hand by finger. He's lost 85

1       percent of the function -- excuse me -- 84 percent  
2       of the function of his index; middle finger is not  
3       there, so it's 100 percent gone; 53 percent of the  
4       function of his ring finger; and 18 percent of the  
5       function of his small finger.

6               Now, when you mix it all up and figure out how  
7       much those contribute to the overall function of his  
8       hand, he has a 44 percent reduced function to his  
9       hand. It's an 80 percent reduction in strength, but  
10      because a lot of the things that you do, you don't  
11      have to have a whole lot of strength, it only comes  
12      out to 44 percent total impairment, and that results  
13      in a 40 percent.

14             Because the whole purpose of your arm is to  
15      move your hand so that you can do things. It  
16      doesn't matter if your elbow works or your wrist  
17      works or your shoulder works. If you don't have a  
18      hand on the end of it, you've really lost most of  
19      the purpose of your arm. So he's lost 40 percent of  
20      the function in his dominant arm, which amounts to  
21      about 24 percent of the function of what we would  
22      consider an able-bodied individual.

23      **Q**       All right. Hold on just one second.

24             **MR. GARRETT:** We have a matter.

25             **THE COURT:** Madame Forelady, you can take your

1 jury to the jury room, please.

2 (The jury retires to the jury room.)

3 **THE COURT:** For the record, there was some  
4 photographs of Officer Rushton's hand that were  
5 being presented into evidence, and there was some  
6 objection as to how many or to the graphic nature of  
7 them; is that right?

8 **MR. GARRETT:** That's correct, Your Honor.  
9 We've reached a compromise and stipulate to the  
10 exhibits to put in.

11 **THE COURT:** Thank you very much.

12 (State's Exhibit Numbers 21 and 22,  
13 photographs, marked for identification.)

14 **MR. MAYE:** This one we'll mark for ID,  
15 fragments of the bullets.

16 **THE COURT:** How about the photos? Did you mark  
17 those?

18 **MR. MAYE:** They're in evidence, 22 and 21.

19 **MS. BALLARD:** I'm sorry. What are those?

20 **THE COURT:** 21 and 22.

21 **MR. HENDERSON:** What do you have --

22 **MR. MAYE:** Bullet fragments removed from his  
23 hand. I'm just going to mark it for ID at this  
24 point in time.

25 (State's Exhibit Number 23, bullet



1 fragments, marked for identification.)

2 (Pause.)

3 **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, I have State's 23 for  
4 ID, but by stipulation, it's going to come in as  
5 well.

6 **THE COURT:** And that is container holding the  
7 bullet fragments that was removed --

8 **MR. MAYE:** Bullet fragments removed from his  
9 hand.

10 **THE COURT:** Is that correct, Mr. Garrett?

11 **MR. GARRETT:** That is correct.

12 **THE COURT:** Exhibits 21 and 22 will be admitted  
13 without objection, as well as Exhibit 23.

14 (State's Exhibit Numbers 21 through 23 were  
15 admitted into evidence.)

16 **THE COURT:** State ready to proceed?

17 **MR. MAYE:** State's ready.

18 **THE COURT:** Defense ready to proceed?

19 **MR. HENDERSON:** Yes, sir, we're ready.

20 **THE COURT:** Thank you.

21 Will you bring the jury back?

22 (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

23 **THE COURT:** Mr. Maye.

24 BY MR. MAYE:

25 **Q** Dr. Densmore, I'm going to show you State's 21

1       and 22, photographs that were taken in the week  
2       after the injury. And I'll just ask you, in looking  
3       at State's 21 and 22, do those pretty fairly and  
4       accurately reflect the state of Bobby Rushton's hand  
5       in the early stages of the injury process and  
6       healing process?

7       **A**     Correct. This would be after the second  
8       operation, before his drains were removed. So this  
9       would probably be in the first or second week after  
10      the operation.

11     **Q**     All right. And 21 is the palm side of his  
12      hand?

13     **A**     Correct.

14     **Q**     And 22 would be the back side of the hand that  
15      was injured; correct?

16     **A**     Correct.

17     **Q**     And, Dr. Densmore, I'll show you what's already  
18      been marked into evidence as State's 23. Are those  
19      fragments of projectile that were removed from his  
20      hand as a result of your treatment in this case?

21     **A**     Correct.

22     **Q**     Okay. Dr. Densmore, I heard your descriptions  
23      of the degree of impairment, and very precise, but  
24      in a real-world situation, how would this impact  
25      somebody performing something like tying their shoe?

1       What type of diminution in function would you see  
2       when somebody performed -- did some menial task like  
3       that?

4       **A**     This is his dominant hand, so his dominant hand  
5       is the one that is most -- usually, the most  
6       dexterous and the most ability to manipulate  
7       objects: Tying your shoes and things like that.

8               This would make this extremely difficult  
9       because not only is the strength diminished by 70 to  
10      80 percent, depending on the finger, but the ability  
11      to move them independently and quickly in what we  
12      would call this dexterous nature would also be  
13      severely impaired.

14             Beyond that, if you look at his training and  
15      his career, he can't hold a weapon in that hand.  
16      That hand is not strong enough. It's not able to  
17      stabilize the weapon. He's not going to be able to  
18      fire a weapon with his dominant hand. This is a  
19      career-ending injury.

20             **MR. MAYE:** Thank you. Answer any questions the  
21      defense has for you. Thank you, Dr. Densmore.

22             **THE COURT:** Cross-examination?

23                       CROSS-EXAMINATION

24             BY MR. GARRETT:

25             **Q**     Could he be trained to shoot with his left hand

1 to firm up with his right hand?

2 **A** He can be trained to do that. My understanding  
3 is that it is required of all police officers to be  
4 able to fire their weapon with either hand.

5 **Q** Okay. But he may still be able to shoot in the  
6 future by doing that?

7 **A** With his left hand.

8 **Q** Be able to shoot, not necessarily to be a  
9 police officer, but be able to shoot?

10 **A** Correct.

11 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you.

12 **MR. MAYE:** Thank you, Doctor. I ask you to be  
13 released. Thank you so much for coming.

14 **THE COURT:** Any objection?

15 **MR. GARRETT:** Without objection.

16 **THE COURT:** Thank you for coming here. You're  
17 excused, Doctor.

18 Would you call your next witness, please, sir.

19 **MR. MAYE:** The State would call Bobby Rushton  
20 to the stand.

21 BOBBY RUSHTON,

22 having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

23 DIRECT EXAMINATION

24 BY MR. MAYE:

25 **Q** Investigator Rushton, please tell the ladies

1 and gentlemen of the jury where you're originally  
2 from, what led you to your employment at the  
3 McCormick County Sheriff's Office, a little bit  
4 about your background in law enforcement prior to  
5 that time.

6 **A** Originally, I'm from Saluda County, not much  
7 bigger than McCormick here. When I was 15, I moved  
8 to McCormick with my parents. Right after high  
9 school, I worked for the state parks for a while,  
10 went to work for the department of corrections.

11 **Q** What year did you start at SCDC?

12 **A** Yes. I started here at the prison here in  
13 McCormick for the department of corrections --

14 **Q** About what year was that?

15 **A** Around '93 maybe. I'm not exactly sure. It's  
16 been a while.

17 I worked there for the department of  
18 corrections for seven years. I left from the  
19 department of corrections and I worked for the  
20 Edgefield County Sheriff's Department for one year  
21 as a jailer. Then I was hired here at the Town of  
22 McCormick as a city police officer.

23 A position came open at the sheriff's  
24 department, where I really wanted to be, so I  
25 applied and was accepted at the sheriff's department

1 and worked there for approximately seven years.

2 **Q** When did you go to work for George Reid at the  
3 sheriff's department here? What year was that; do  
4 you remember exactly?

5 **A** '98, '99, somewhere around in there.

6 **Q** Okay. Did there come an occasion that you went  
7 to serve in another format prior to November the  
8 15th of 2009, and what was that service?

9 **A** Yeah. I had -- the Iraqi war had come out and  
10 I found out that the U.S. Department of State was  
11 looking for American police officers, and they were  
12 wanting us to go to Iraq and mentor and advise the  
13 Iraqi police.

14 I applied for the position. I went through the  
15 vetting system. I was accepted, and it took  
16 probably about eight months for it to go through the  
17 vetting system, but I got accepted. I went through  
18 the training. And I went to Iraq where I served for  
19 four years for the Department of State. It was  
20 through another company that actually paid us, but  
21 we had to follow directions of the Department of  
22 State. And, to be specific, it was a department in  
23 the Department of State, International Narcotics and  
24 Law Enforcement.

25 **Q** So you worked over there training Iraqi police

1       officers and acting as an advisor and assisting in  
2       the formation of their --

3       **A**     Yes.

4       **Q**     -- I guess, regrouped police department over  
5       there?

6       **A**     Yes. We were trying to get them more of a  
7       democratic policing instead of the Gestapo policing  
8       they were doing prior.

9       **Q**     Okay. All right. Officer Rushton, let's talk  
10      about you going back into service. You went back --  
11      you came back to the sheriff's department; is that  
12      correct?

13      **A**     I did. I returned back to the U.S. August or  
14      September of 2009. I took a few months, spent some  
15      time with my family; I had been away from them for  
16      quite a bit. I -- a position came open at the  
17      sheriff's department, and it was something that I  
18      loved, I loved doing.

19             I applied for the position. I was called in  
20      for an interview. I don't know how much -- the time  
21      period, but I got a phone call stating that I had  
22      been rehired -- they were going to hire me back.

23      **Q**     So you went back into your service with the  
24      sheriff's department?

25      **A**     Yes.

1       **Q**     Did you complete the necessary training that  
2             you needed to in order to get your certification  
3             back?

4       **A**     Yes, I did. Investigator Collier at the  
5             sheriff's department is also the training officer.  
6             Everyone knows McCormick's a very small sheriff's  
7             department, so everybody has to do a lot more than  
8             one specific job.

9             From my understanding, he had contacted the  
10            Criminal Justice Academy in Columbia, and they told  
11            him --

12           **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor.

13           **THE COURT:** Sustained.

14           BY MR. MAYE:

15       **Q**     Don't go into what anybody else said, but --

16       **A**     Okay. For the next two weeks, I had to watch a  
17             lot of videos, take some questionnaire tests, and  
18             things of that nature.

19       **Q**     Okay. And you took the oath of office again  
20             and were sworn back in as an officer; correct?

21       **A**     Yes.

22           **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor. He's  
23            leading.

24           **THE COURT:** Rephrase, please. Sustained.

25           **THE WITNESS:** On November -- I was rehired --



1 BY MR. MAYE:

2 Q Let me ask you this: What steps did you take  
3 prior to returning to service fully in your  
4 capacity?

5 A The first day back would have been November  
6 2nd, which was a Monday. Investigator Collier  
7 brought me here to the courthouse in the Clerk of  
8 Court's office, and I retook my oath.

9 Q Okay. All right. When did you resume service  
10 back in your regular day-to-day capacity as a deputy  
11 sheriff for Sheriff Reid here in McCormick County?

12 A It would have been at 6:00 p.m., November the  
13 14th, which was a Saturday.

14 Q On Saturday?

15 A The morning -- or the evening before the  
16 incident.

17 Q Okay. Let's talk about November the 15th of  
18 2009. Let's talk about the shift that would have  
19 gone from Saturday the 14th to Sunday the 15th, the  
20 day that you got shot. What happened?

21 A Well, we -- our shift started at 6:00 p.m. in  
22 the afternoon on the 14th, which is a Saturday. It  
23 was uneventful that night. Patrolled different  
24 areas of the county. There were three of us working  
25 that night: Myself, Deputy Moore, and Deputy

1 McAllister.

2           Shortly after 4:00 a.m., we had received a call  
3 of a disturbance in Little River subdivision on  
4 Presidents Drive. I was in Plum Branch, right where  
5 the four lane is, headed north which would have been  
6 coming toward town when I got the call and it was  
7 Presidents Drive. I turned onto Jefferson Street,  
8 which would have been to the left, right where the  
9 four lane ends. Go up Jefferson Street, and then  
10 I'm not sure exactly; it's a couple miles on  
11 Greenfield Road, and you take Greenfield Road, and  
12 it comes back out on 378. 378 to Holiday Drive,  
13 Holiday Drive to Independence Drive, Independence  
14 Drive to Presidents Drive.

15 **Q**     What happened when you got there? What was the  
16 first thing that you saw?

17 **A**     I actually -- I caught up to Deputy McAllister.  
18 We were actually given the incorrect numeric  
19 address, but we were given the Worley residence as  
20 the suspect in this.

21           Deputy McAllister actually went past the  
22 residence, which I don't recall seeing a numeric  
23 address; I just saw a plank of wood, like driftwood  
24 or something, that had Worley burned into it. So I  
25 knew -- I saw it. Deputy McAllister had went past

1       it. And I believe I called out over the radio that  
2       it was an incorrect residence, that this was it.

3               I turned into the residence. Deputy Moore  
4       actually went past me and turned into the driveway  
5       that Melissa had turned into, which is parallel to  
6       the Worley residence.

7               Upon arriving, there was some type of little  
8       small SUV/Crossover-type car or something parked in  
9       the yard. I parked back behind it.

10              I saw movement next door; I was assuming it was  
11       the complainants. We got out and kind of walked in  
12       that direction. I went over and talked to -- that  
13       was the complainants -- was Mr. and Mrs. Sheffield.

14              Melissa went to my left, and Nick went to my  
15       left. And Melissa was standing between Nick and I,  
16       where he went to the front of the house. I was  
17       talking with the Sheffields, getting information  
18       about why they had called. They informed me --

19              **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor.

20              **THE COURT:** Sustained --

21       BY MR. MAYE:

22       **Q**     Don't go into what they said, but let me ask  
23       you this --

24              **THE COURT:** Just one -- go ahead.

25              **MR. MAYE:** I'm sorry.

1 BY MR. MAYE:

2 Q Let me ask you this: What could you hear in  
3 regard to what Nick was doing, even over at the  
4 Sheffields' house? What could you hear that he was  
5 doing over there?

6 A Oh, I could hear him announcing, Sheriff's  
7 office. I could -- from where I was standing, I  
8 could hear that.

9 Q You're over at the Sheffields' house --

10 A Yes, I'm at the Sheffields.

11 Q -- but you could clearly hear that over there?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Okay. So after you gathered whatever  
14 information you got from the Sheffields, what was  
15 the next thing that you did?

16 A Well, I told Mr. and Mrs. Sheffield to go back  
17 in the house while we go over and talk to him.

18 Nick and Melissa were actually walking back  
19 toward me, as I was walking toward them. A light  
20 came on and immediately went back off.

21 Q Where was that light?

22 A It was in -- if you look at the setup of the  
23 house, the front of the house.

24 Q And if it'll help you, I'm going to show you  
25 what's already into evidence as two photographs that

1       are State's 5.

2       **A**     This is the front of the house. It would have  
3       been on this corner here {indicating}.

4       **Q**     You saw that light go on and off?

5       **A**     Yes.

6       **Q**     Okay. What did y'all do once you saw that  
7       light go on and off?

8       **A**     We walked on up to the house. I'll use the  
9       same evidence, State's 5.

10           We went onto the front porch -- well, Nick and  
11       I stepped up onto the front porch. Nick would have  
12       been to the left side of the door, and I was on the  
13       right side of the door.

14       **Q**     What were y'all doing all during that time that  
15       you were there? What did y'all start to do?

16       **A**     Well, I -- Nick was knocking on the door. I  
17       was ringing the doorbell and knocking; both of us  
18       announcing, Sheriff's department.

19       **Q**     Okay.

20       **A**     I heard something from up above, Who is it? We  
21       replied, Sheriff's department. The reply was, I  
22       don't give a fuck.

23           I'm walking backwards as this is happening so I  
24       can see. The door -- you could hear that sliding  
25       glass door open. And the next thing that I

1       actually -- when I was able to get far enough back  
2       to see over the railing, I saw the defendant  
3       standing in front of the stool.

4       **Q**     Okay. Let me ask you this: That exterior  
5       light that had come on and gone off, was it on or  
6       off at the time that you were looking up there at  
7       him?

8       **A**     It was off.

9       **Q**     It was off at that point in time?

10      **A**     Yes.

11      **Q**     Okay. But was there enough ambient light for  
12      you to see some at that point in time?

13      **A**     We also had our flashlights.

14      **Q**     You had a flashlight as well?

15      **A**     Yes.

16      **Q**     Okay. So you heard the glass. What happened  
17      next?

18      **A**     He was standing in front of the stool. And if  
19      you had the butt stock of the gun in your left hand  
20      and holding it like this {indicating}, and he was  
21      walking to his left when I saw him.

22      **Q**     Okay. If he was walking to his left, which way  
23      was he headed?

24      **A**     He was here, and he was headed toward where  
25      this white sheet's at {indicating}.

1       **Q**     How was he moving with the weapon as he was  
2     doing that?

3       **A**     Walking sideways.

4             When I saw that he had the gun, I yelled, Gun,  
5     alerting Nick and Melissa that -- letting them know  
6     that he had a weapon.

7       **Q**     Yes.

8       **A**     Immediately, Nick and I were yelling, Sheriff's  
9     department, drop your gun.

10      **Q**     Did he comply or did he do anything?

11      **A**     Not at that point. No sooner than we had said  
12     that, the light came on, and I was facedown in the  
13     ground.

14      **Q**     Okay. Did you -- you said the light came on  
15     and you were facedown on the ground. Why did you  
16     fall onto the ground?

17      **A**     I had realized I had been shot, and I even  
18     called out, I've been hit.

19             Nick had stepped around to the side and was  
20     yelling, Come to me, come to me.

21      **Q**     Once that light went on just before the shot,  
22     how did that affect your ability to see or  
23     comprehend what was going on?

24      **A**     I could see nothing. That light was pointed  
25     straight down and blinding me.

1           **Q**     Okay. What was the next thing that happened?

2           **A**     Nick was yelling, Come to me, come to me. As  
3           I'm trying to get up and run, there's a second shot.

4           **Q**     Okay.

5           **A**     He get -- I get with Nick or actually he gets  
6           me and leads me to the back of the house, and I'm  
7           not sure exactly where I was at in the back of the  
8           house, but I could hear, Where you at, you son of a  
9           bitches?

10                   And Nick is telling me that we got to go, we  
11           got to go. And I'm trying to get out of there. My  
12           radio comes off from my belt, wraps around my leg.  
13           Where my mic is attached to my shirt here with the  
14           cord, it trips me up; I can't move. I finally get  
15           free of it and make it to the -- Melissa had gotten  
16           her patrol car and come around.

17           **Q**     What was the next thing that happened?

18           **A**     I remember Nick opening the door, the driver's  
19           side rear door, opening that rear door, getting me  
20           in the car. I remember Melissa standing with the  
21           door open on the patrol car, the front door. Right  
22           where the door meets the car is the apex. I  
23           remember her standing in the apex of the door  
24           covering Nick while he gets me in the car.

25                   Melissa jumps in the car, goes over to the



1 passenger side, and she goes through the driver's  
2 door, flips over to the passenger side. Nick gets  
3 in, and we drive off and make it up to the Sandy  
4 Branch Fire Department.

5 I don't remember if the first responders were  
6 there, but it was just {snapping fingers} like that,  
7 somebody was there helping me. I don't know where  
8 they came from.

9 **Q** Okay. Were you -- do you remember being  
10 transported by the ambulance and the subsequent  
11 things?

12 **A** Oh, most definitely. The gentleman that was  
13 with the EMS that was here earlier, I'd never met  
14 him before that night. The other gentleman there  
15 that was Mike Sharp, I remember talking with Mike,  
16 trying to focus on him so they could treat my arm,  
17 because my hand was mutilated. I knew it was  
18 mutilated, and all I could do was just hold it,  
19 hoping that I didn't bleed out because I didn't know  
20 how bad I was.

21 **Q** What happened next? Where did they take you  
22 to?

23 **A** Well, the ambulance got there shortly after  
24 that. I was laying in the back of the ambulance,  
25 and I remember them trying to give me a shot of

1       morphine, and I told them that morphine does not  
2       work on me. And I remember them telling me that,  
3       We've given you four shots of morphine already, and  
4       it has no affect on me.

5       **Q**     So what was the next thing that happened?

6       **A**     They took me to the MCG, the Medical College of  
7       Georgia. I remember laying in the emergency room  
8       and a puddle of blood just all around the stretcher  
9       I was on.

10      **Q**     Okay. You were subsequently treated by  
11      Dr. Densmore and other physicians there?

12      **A**     Yes. Yeah, they finally came in and gave me  
13      some medication that did away with the pain and  
14      pretty much knocked me out.

15      **Q**     How many surgeries was the resulting of injury  
16      to your hand from being shot by him, what did they  
17      result in?

18      **A**     I've had a total of four surgeries.  
19      Dr. Densmore had said there were more, but I've had  
20      enough surgeries.

21      **Q**     Okay. 21 and 22, about what point in time are  
22      you in the recovery process or trying to recover?  
23      About when were those photos made?

24      **A**     Those pictures were made -- I got shot on a  
25      Sunday. Monday/Tuesday, I came home, and I had to

1 change the bandages every day, and it was extremely  
2 painful. And my wife was trying to help me, and we  
3 couldn't get the bandages off of my hand because  
4 they were caught up in the stitches, caught on the  
5 pins in my hand. The dried blood, it hurt. So the  
6 only thing I knew to do was come to the EMS, and I  
7 got some of the EMTs to help me get the bandages off  
8 my hand. And these were taken the very next day.

9 **Q** Okay. What did this do to your law enforcement  
10 career? Were you able to continue as an officer?

11 **A** It ended my career.

12 **Q** And so you're no longer able to be a law  
13 enforcement --

14 **A** No. I retired 2011. October 31st, 2011.

15 **Q** You retired on disability?

16 **A** Yes.

17 **Q** And I guess it's civilian Rushton now, but  
18 Bobby, let me ask you this: The night that you went  
19 out there, you said you had come back on the 14th,  
20 and this happened on the 15th. How were you  
21 dressed? What uniform were you wearing?

22 **A** I was wearing they're called 5.11 Tacticals.

23 **Q** What is 5.11?

24 **A** It's a clothing line. It's designed by and for  
25 law enforcement officers.

1       **Q**     Is that clothing that's commonly worn by law  
2       enforcement officers?

3       **A**     Most definitely.  It's probably the most common  
4       brand you'll find.

5       **Q**     How exactly were you dressed?

6       **A**     It was the khaki-colored 5.11 Tactical pants.  
7       And not that it's tactical, it's just the name that  
8       they give it.  And it was a 5.11 polo shirt that was  
9       green.

10      **Q**     Okay.  Did you have on your badge?

11      **A**     I had my duty belt.  My badge would have been  
12      clipped right in this area {indicating}.  That's  
13      where I've always clipped my badge.  And that's just  
14      where I put it.

15      **Q**     Were you carrying a radio that night?

16      **A**     My radio would have been on my left hip, with  
17      the cord coming around.

18             And on the 5.11 polo shirts, the tactical ones,  
19      there's a spot right here in the center where the  
20      buttons are that you can clip your radio on so it  
21      doesn't flip off and things, because it'll slip off  
22      easy.

23      **Q**     So, essentially, the same type of clothing, not  
24      with the tactical pants and all, but it's a similar  
25      outfit to what the officer has on right now?

1       **A**     Yeah. I just had a green shirt on; he's got a  
2       black shirt on.

3       **Q**     Was it similar to what the other officers at  
4       the sheriff's department were wearing at the time?

5       **A**     Yes.

6       **Q**     Was there any difference at all in between what  
7       you were wearing and what the other officers were  
8       wearing?

9       **A**     Just the color.

10      **Q**     Bobby, let me ask you this: At the time just  
11      before you got shot, did you identify yourself as a  
12      sheriff's deputy?

13      **A**     Oh, we most definitely need. And he  
14      acknowledged --

15      **Q**     Any doubt in your mind that he heard you?

16      **A**     Oh, there's no doubt, because he acknowledged  
17      when he --

18             **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor.

19             **THE COURT:** Just one second.

20             Madame Forelady...

21             (The jury retires to the jury room.)

22             **THE COURT:** All right. Mr. Garrett.

23             **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, question as to what  
24      my client can hear.

25             **THE COURT:** Did you hear what he said in follow

1 up?

2 **MR. GARRETT:** I didn't hear what he said.

3 **THE COURT:** I thought maybe you didn't, that's  
4 why I didn't want to say anything.

5 But he said, Because he responded to what I  
6 said. So I thought -- I assumed that your objection  
7 was going to be based on speculation. And I think  
8 that, by his response, he said, Could he hear you,  
9 and you said, yes, because he responded. Okay. So  
10 I'm going to overrule based on his response.

11 **MR. GARRETT:** All right.

12 **MR. MAYE:** Thank you.

13 **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury -- are you  
14 ready to proceed?

15 **MR. MAYE:** Yes, sir, absolutely.

16 **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett, are you ready to  
17 proceed?

18 **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, Your Honor.

19 (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

20 BY MR. MAYE:

21 **Q** Officer Rushton, you had testified that you  
22 knew he heard you because he responded back to you  
23 that you were a sheriff's deputy. What did he say  
24 to you in response to your statement that you were a  
25 deputy?

1       **A**     When he said, Who is it, Nick and I both  
2       yelled, Sheriff's department. And his reply was, I  
3       don't give a fuck.

4       **Q**     What kind of car were you driving? Was it  
5       unmarked, marked --

6       **A**     It was a fully marked white patrol car with the  
7       blue and gold strips and a blue light bar on the  
8       top.

9               **MR. MAYE:** Answer any questions the defense has  
10       for you.

11              **THE COURT:** Cross-examination?

12              **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, we have a matter.

13              **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

14              Ladies and gentlemen, let me remind you that I  
15       told you at the beginning of the case, sometimes  
16       you're going to feel like cattle, and that's just  
17       part of the methodology we go through in all trials.  
18       Okay? But I'm going to ask you to go back to your  
19       jury room. Go ahead, take a little bit of extra  
20       time for the afternoon, and then we'll bring you  
21       back in. Okay.

22              And, Madame Forelady, if you need anything,  
23       please let us know.

24              (The jury retires to the jury room.)

25              **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, we had issued a

1 subpoena for Deputy Rushton to bring all of his  
2 regalia, all of his gun and all of his materials,  
3 his uniforms, and whatnot. In order for me to  
4 properly cross-examine him, I would like for him to  
5 have that available.

6 **THE COURT:** Did you bring it?

7 **THE WITNESS:** Your Honor, I do not have any of  
8 that stuff. Everything that I did have has been  
9 returned to the sheriff's department on October  
10 31st, 2011, when I retired.

11 **THE COURT:** All right. Where is his  
12 information?

13 **MR. MAYE:** His clothing, it's my understanding,  
14 what he actually had worn that night, I'm going to  
15 have to defer to Officer Collier. My understanding  
16 is they destroyed those things because he had blood  
17 all over them, and they didn't keep the clothing.  
18 He had his gun and we brought that.

19 **THE COURT:** Hang on for a second. What exactly  
20 did you return to the sheriff's department?

21 **THE WITNESS:** My duty belt and -- as I was  
22 wearing that particular night?

23 **THE COURT:** No. I think -- and I'm not asking  
24 about specifically you had that night. I can  
25 understand it might be bloodied up, but I'm talking



1           about when you retired, what exactly did you return?

2           **THE WITNESS:** Boots, jacket, duty belt, weapon,  
3           radio. Anything that belonged to the sheriff's  
4           department, I returned to them. I have nothing.

5           **THE COURT:** Is that what you we're looking for?

6           **MR. GARRETT:** In his prior testimony, he  
7           testified that, although he wasn't wearing them that  
8           night, he had a hat that had sheriff on it. He had  
9           a coat that had sheriff across the back of it. He  
10          had a --

11          **THE WITNESS:** No, I did not testify to that.

12          **MR. GARRETT:** He said he had another jacket  
13          that, I believe, he said in his testimony that he  
14          had a police -- it said police on it, and it was  
15          highlighted like you see in the dark, that kind of  
16          thing where you see police officers wear those type  
17          of things. He had those available to him. And I  
18          want to just show --

19          **THE COURT:** Can you get exemplars of those over  
20          here?

21          **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, I will certainly give --

22          **THE COURT:** If they're under subpoena, you  
23          know, whether they'll be relevant or not --

24          **MR. MAYE:** I don't know when that was done. I  
25          think it was done very recently. When was that

1           done?

2           **MR. HENDERSON:** I gave it to Investigator  
3 Collier last night, the same one that testified,  
4 Your Honor. And Mr. Collier has been the one that's  
5 been gathering information for the State to the  
6 sheriff's department.

7           **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, obviously, we got this  
8 last night. We're going to do our best to comply.

9           **THE COURT:** I understand. Look, we're not  
10 talking about having to go down to the Nile and go  
11 look for something else. You're talking about  
12 jackets and hats --

13          **MR. MAYE:** No, sir. And we're going to get  
14 anything we possibly can.

15          **THE COURT:** -- jackets and hats and whatever,  
16 the belt. I mean, if it's there, go get it or have  
17 it brought over here, please.

18          **MR. MAYE:** Sure.

19          **THE COURT:** All right. Let's take about a  
20 few-minute break and come back.

21          **MR. GARRETT:** May we say one other thing, Your  
22 Honor?

23          **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

24          **MR. GARRETT:** About his duty -- his duty  
25 weapon. Is he going to bring his duty weapon to

1 court?

2 **THE COURT:** The duty weapon, I understand, is  
3 destroyed.

4 **MR. GARRETT:** They have it. It's in evidence.

5 **MR. MAYE:** We got it.

6 **MR. MYERS:** Yeah, we're going to put that in  
7 evidence.

8 **MR. GARRETT:** I'd like to have it for this  
9 cross-examination, if I may.

10 **THE COURT:** Any objection to that?

11 **MR. MAYE:** We'll go on and put it in evidence.

12 **MR. GARRETT:** That's fine.

13 **THE COURT:** Any other matters -- articulate  
14 what you want them to bring so they can get that  
15 over here, hat, jacket, shirt.

16 **MR. GARRETT:** If he had a shell, too, a vest.  
17 If he had a gun vest, a bullet vest. Just whatever  
18 he had that's marked with law enforcement.

19 **THE COURT:** All right. Let's take a few-minute  
20 break.

21 You can't talk to anybody about your testimony.

22 (Brief recess.)

23 **THE COURT:** Have you received your stuff?

24 **MR. GARRETT:** We have not yet, Your Honor, but  
25 they are making a diligent effort, I do believe, to

1 try to find it. But one of the problems is one of  
2 them is going to have to go to their house to get  
3 the flashlight, so they're on their way.

4 **THE COURT:** The flashlight, the exact --

5 **MR. GARRETT:** That he had that night.

6 **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, I believe  
7 Mr. Rushton has sent his wife --

8 **THE WITNESS:** Yes, Your Honor. I live three  
9 miles from here.

10 **THE COURT:** Well, thank you. I appreciate it.

11 Any reason why we can't start -- are you -- and  
12 I'm not trying to try your case, please, but would  
13 you rather wait till all this is here before you  
14 start?

15 **MR. GARRETT:** I would like to. I know it's  
16 4:30. If you want to go on till 5:00, I'm fine with  
17 that. But I think, for the very beginning of my  
18 examination, I want to have what he had access to  
19 and maybe even have somebody here who's got the  
20 uniform on that he should have been wearing that  
21 night.

22 **THE COURT:** So you want overnight to think  
23 about it?

24 **MR. GARRETT:** I'd love to.

25 **THE COURT:** Any reason why I shouldn't do that?

1           **MR. MAYE:** Other than it's December the 16th,  
2           and I'd like to get this done as quickly as possible  
3           because there are other places --

4           **THE COURT:** I do, too.

5           **MR. MAYE:** As much as I love my job -- at  
6           4:30 -- I'd sure hate to quit at 4:30. I want to  
7           roll. That's my only thing. I think we should  
8           fully utilize our court time.

9           **THE COURT:** Well, here's a few things. Take a  
10          minute, here they come in the door now, let's look  
11          at it.

12                   (Pause.)

13          **THE COURT:** For the record, we had a  
14          conversation before the break where the defense had  
15          subpoenaed certain clothing items of Officer  
16          Rushton's or original facsimiles thereof, and a  
17          jacket, a vest that is school yellow, and a armored  
18          vest, for lack of better terms, personnel vest has  
19          been presented. And my understanding is Officer  
20          Rushton has asked his wife to go to their home three  
21          miles, more or less, from here to bring back the  
22          flashlight that he had and used on the night in  
23          question.

24          **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

25          **THE COURT:** That being said, any reason why we

1           can't proceed?

2           **MR. GARRETT:** No, Your Honor.

3           **THE COURT:** And if you don't have it all, I'll  
4           keep the record open for you to continue on or if  
5           you don't finish, I'll let you continue on.

6           **MR. GARRETT:** How long will we go today? Until  
7           5:00 or --

8           **THE COURT:** You know, I'd like to go ahead and  
9           move things forward, but if five o'clock -- when I  
10          came here today, that was kind of my idea, since I  
11          kept everybody a little bit later last night, but if  
12          it gets to a good breaking point around that time,  
13          just let me know, and I'll be glad to break it.

14          **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

15          **MR. MAYE:** And, Your Honor, my understanding is  
16          they're not going to move to admit those into  
17          evidence, because like I said, that's stuff people  
18          are wearing now and jackets -- they're going to use  
19          that for demonstrative purposes and not admit it  
20          into evidence because it's cold, and these are  
21          jackets and vests that people are wearing right now.

22          **THE COURT:** I would just think that as long as,  
23          and you tell me, Mr. Garrett, or anybody else, as  
24          long as you have that for closing argument to be  
25          able to use demonstratively, that's what you're

1 looking for?

2 **MR. GARRETT:** Yes. Yes, sir, that's what I'm  
3 looking for, that these things were available to  
4 him.

5 **THE COURT:** Any problem with that?

6 **MR. MAYE:** No, sir.

7 **THE COURT:** With that being said, are you ready  
8 to begin?

9 **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, Your Honor, I am.

10 **THE COURT:** Oh, I'm sorry. Go ahead. I didn't  
11 see your client talking to you.

12 **MR. GARRETT:** Beg the Court's indulgence.

13 **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

14 (Pause.)

15 **MR. GARRETT:** I'm ready.

16 **THE COURT:** Is the State ready?

17 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

18 **THE COURT:** All right. Bring the jury in,  
19 please.

20 (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

21 **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett?

22 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor. May it  
23 please the Court.

24 **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

25 \*\*\*\*\*

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION

2 BY MR. GARRETT:

3 Q Officer Rushton, on the night in question, as I  
4 understood it, you hadn't gotten your uniform yet;  
5 is that correct?

6 A Correct.

7 Q And as I understand it, they had been ordered,  
8 and it was probably some two weeks after the  
9 incident before you even got your uniform; is that  
10 correct?

11 A I have no idea when they came in.

12 Q Some time after this night?

13 A It was after that particular night, yes.

14 Q All right. The outfit that you had on  
15 basically didn't have a badge on it, did it?

16 A Not embroidered like what they're wearing, it  
17 was not.

18 Q And that's what you had -- had been ordered for  
19 you was a badge where somebody could see your badge?

20 A One that had been ordered, yes.

21 Q Okay. And one of those officers was walking  
22 around earlier, and this gentleman here has a darker  
23 color. Did you also get some darker colors or what  
24 colors were the ones that you were supposed to have?

25 A The shirts?



1           **Q**     Shirts, yes, sir.

2           **A**     They were gray.

3           **Q**     They were gray? Okay. So you couldn't have  
4           got a black one or --

5           **A**     No, I never had a black shirt.

6           **Q**     Okay. As I understand it, you said that there  
7           is no -- y'all have no uniform code or uniform  
8           policy at McCormick; is that --

9           **A**     No. I've never seen one that said exactly what  
10          we have to wear on a day-to-day basis. So uniforms  
11          do not distinguish whether or not you're a law  
12          enforcement officer; your badge does.

13          **Q**     I'm going to get to that.

14                 Let's talk about, did you file an application  
15          when you came back from Afghanistan?

16          **A**     I was in Iraq.

17          **Q**     Or Iraq?

18          **A**     Yes, I did.

19          **Q**     You did? And you were hired?

20          **A**     Yes.

21          **Q**     Okay. And in your -- in some prior testimony,  
22          you didn't recall taking your oath of office; is  
23          that correct?

24          **A**     When you had asked me in the prior testimony, I  
25          did not, but as soon as Investigator Collier showed

1 me that paper, it clicked and I remembered.

2 **Q** Okay. And that's the only -- the one -- you've  
3 only taken one oath of office; is that correct?

4 **A** No, I actually took two: The very first time I  
5 came to work for the sheriff's department and when I  
6 came back from Iraq and reapplied at the sheriff's  
7 department, I took that oath of office again.

8 **Q** You took both -- you took two oaths of office  
9 or just one?

10 **A** Two.

11 **Q** I understand you took one a long time ago.

12 **A** Yes.

13 **Q** And when you got back, you took one?

14 **A** On November the 2nd.

15 **Q** Okay. You took one oath of office; is that  
16 correct?

17 **A** Yes.

18 (Defendant's Exhibit Number 4, Oath of  
19 Office, marked for identification.)

20 BY MR. GARRETT:

21 **Q** Mr. Rushton, can you look at this and identify  
22 that for me, please, sir?

23 **A** Yes. This is the oath of office that I took on  
24 November the 2nd.

25 **Q** Is that the only oath you took?

1           **A**     Once I came back from Iraq or --

2           **Q**     Yes, sir. Once you came back from Iraq, is  
3           that the only oath you took?

4           **A**     Yes.

5           **Q**     Okay. And did you take the oath and have it  
6           approved by a circuit court judge?

7           **A**     No, I did not. And it's my understanding, I've  
8           never met a law enforcement officer that has.

9                   **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, I'd ask the witness  
10           be responsive only.

11                   **THE COURT:** I'll grant that. And I'll direct  
12           the jury to disregard his last statement, please.

13                   **MR. GARRETT:** Defense moves into evidence 4.

14                   **THE COURT:** Any objection?

15                   **MR. MYERS:** No objection.

16                   **THE COURT:** Admitted without objection.

17                   (Defendant's Exhibit Number 4, Oath of  
18           Office, admitted into evidence.)

19           BY MR. GARRETT:

20           **Q**     All right. And you've never appeared in front  
21           of a circuit court judge to be approved?

22           **A**     No, I haven't.

23           **Q**     All right. And so, as I understand it, in  
24           order to get back, you met with Collier, who has  
25           testified earlier, and tried to determine what type

1 of work you needed to do in reference to your  
2 certification; is that correct?

3 **A** Yes.

4 **Q** Now, you had been gone how long from the  
5 department? Can you tell me when you left?

6 **A** I think it was in April of 2004 when I actually  
7 severed my services with the sheriff's department.

8 **Q** Okay. And you didn't start back until when?

9 **A** November the 1st was my hire date.

10 **Q** Was your hire date?

11 **A** Yes.

12 **Q** Of '09?

13 **A** Yes.

14 **Q** So, roughly, a little over four years?

15 **A** Just a little over four years.

16 **Q** All right. And is it true that if you're not  
17 in a Navy/Army type of setting, military setting,  
18 that after you are without any training for three  
19 years, you have to go back through certain parts of  
20 the academy?

21 **A** I'm not sure.

22 **Q** Okay. And in your previous testimony, you had  
23 said that, as far as you were concerned, you had  
24 done all that you were supposed to do to be  
25 certified on the night in question; is that correct?

1       **A**     That's what I was told, and that's what I  
2       believed to be true.

3       **Q**     All right. And if the true certification  
4       didn't come until some time later, like in 2010, you  
5       wouldn't dispute that as to the certifications  
6       necessary to make you certified?

7       **A**     I most definitely will dispute that.

8       **Q**     Okay. All right. And what did you say you did  
9       for those two weeks, from November 1, the hire date,  
10      until this night, the first night out?

11      **A**     There's certain classes that, as a law  
12      enforcement officer, you have to take annually, and  
13      I had missed those classes for the past four years,  
14      so I had to catch all of them up.

15      **Q**     And some of those classes, are you aware that  
16      your record indicated that you were actually there  
17      in 2007 at the academy? Did you look at your  
18      records?

19      **A**     No, I have not seen them.

20      **Q**     Can I have you just look at these and see if  
21      these are your records?

22      **A**     Are both of these the same thing -- no, I'm  
23      sorry.

24      **Q**     No. One's dated 12/14/09; would you agree with  
25      that?

1           **A**     I do not see...

2                   **THE COURT:**   Gentlemen, I've been asked to have  
3     you speak a little bit louder, please.

4                   **THE WITNESS:**   I'm sorry.   The date, I see where  
5     it says 12/13/09.

6     BY MR. GARRETT:

7           **Q**     Right.   And that's the first set right there.  
8     Is this your history?

9           **A**     I believe it is.

10          **Q**     Okay.   And it says that -- where it says  
11     7/2/05, 7/20/09, and then it's a Class 1  
12     certification, and it says, Reason:   Military?

13          **A**     Is that on the same page?

14          **Q**     Yes, sir.   Right here {indicating}.

15          **A**     Okay.   Yes, it does say military, or militar.

16          **Q**     Militar.   Did you go into any kind of United  
17     States military service?

18          **A**     No, sir.   I was under contract with the U.S.  
19     Department of State.

20          **Q**     Okay.   Is it possible, if you left in '05, that  
21     you could have actually got time for work?

22                   Look at these dates.   Start at '05.   Were you  
23     in South Carolina doing any of that work?

24          **A**     2005?

25          **Q**     Yes, sir.   3/31/05 in service.   In service, 16

1 hours?

2 **A** These are the updates that I took after I got  
3 back.

4 **Q** Well, that's my point. On 12/14/09, you hadn't  
5 made the updates yet, had you?

6 **A** Yes, I had. I took them for two straight  
7 weeks. I sat there and did the updates.

8 **Q** Okay. And they give you a course date of  
9 6/27/05?

10 **A** Why that date is there, I have no idea, but  
11 that would be the update, not the year that I took  
12 it, just the year that that update came out. And  
13 those are the ones I was catching up.

14 **Q** All right. Let's look at the next one. Let's  
15 look at the second one, and compare it -- compare  
16 it. Do you see any differences in it?

17 **A** I'm not sure what you're asking here.

18 **Q** Does it show you as an active or an inactive  
19 full-time appointment from 10/28/98 through 7/2/05?

20 **A** It says, Inactive from 10/21/1998 through  
21 07/02/2005. I have no idea what that means.

22 **Q** Okay. These courses, these mandatory courses,  
23 6/27/07, 6/27/07, did you complete those? And if  
24 you did, where did you complete them at?

25 **A** The ones that say, Make up legal?

1           **Q**     Yes.

2           **A**     They would have been completed right here at  
3           the McCormick Sheriff's Department when I came back  
4           from Iraq in that two-week period where I was taking  
5           these updates.

6           **Q**     Okay. Are you aware that to be a Class 3  
7           officer or Class 1 officer, if you have lost three  
8           years or more, you have to start back over? Are you  
9           aware of that?

10          **A**     I didn't lose three years.

11          **Q**     You were gone --

12          **A**     Because I was under that contract with the U.S.  
13          Department of State, my time was frozen, and it was  
14          considered the same thing as military time because I  
15          volunteered to go there and do something for this  
16          country.

17                   (Defendant's Exhibit Number 5, training  
18          records, marked for identification.)

19                 **MR. GARRETT:** Any objection?

20                 **MR. MYERS:** No objection.

21                 **THE COURT:** Admitted without objection. And  
22          that is?

23                 **MR. GARRETT:** It's Defendant's Number 5. And  
24          that is his training records.

25                 **THE COURT:** Training records.



1 (Defendant's Exhibit Number 5, training  
2 records, admitted into evidence.)

3 **MR. GARRETT:** It would be 5 and 6. I'm sorry.  
4 We've got two separate ones there. We've got one  
5 marked as 5 and one marked as 6.

6 (Defendant's Exhibit Number 6, Criminal  
7 Justice Academy letter, marked for identification.)

8 **MR. GARRETT:** And for the record, Your Honor,  
9 we move to introduce Number 6 as a December 21,  
10 2009, letter from the criminal justice academy.

11 **THE COURT:** Any objection?

12 **MR. MYERS:** Well, let me see that letter.

13 We object to the letter, unless they want to  
14 bring whoever wrote it.

15 **MR. GARRETT:** I'll take the letter off, Judge.

16 **THE COURT:** Okay, sir. So that has records  
17 behind that -- training records behind that?

18 **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

19 If I may, I'd like to remark these, Your Honor,  
20 then. This will be Number 5 and Number 6, will be  
21 remarked. Both of them had a letter on them, Your  
22 Honor.

23 **THE COURT:** Both of those without objection?

24 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

25 **COURT REPORTER:** Can you tell me which ones --

1           **THE COURT:** Clarify with the court reporter so  
2 she keeps her records straight, please, sir.

3           (Pause.)

4           **THE COURT:** 5 and 6 are admitted without  
5 objection.

6           (Defendant's Exhibit Number 6, Criminal  
7 Justice Academy Records, marked and admitted into  
8 evidence.)

9 BY MR. GARRETT:

10       **Q**     On the night in question, were you acting with  
11 full authority as a Class 1 officer with full arrest  
12 powers?

13       **A**     Yes.

14       **Q**     As a deputy sheriff?

15       **A**     Yes, I was, for McCormick County.

16       **Q**     Okay. Now, I'd like to go over some of this  
17 with you about the timing. In 107 seconds, all of  
18 this happened. Did it happen that fast?

19       **A**     Apparently. I never timed it. I had no idea  
20 until you said something earlier.

21       **Q**     Okay. Did you ever turn on your blue lights at  
22 all?

23       **A**     No. It's not the thing to do.

24       **Q**     From where your car was parked next to the  
25 house, is there any way that the person who stands

1 out on the balcony could see it?

2 **A** If you were standing on the balcony, yes, you  
3 could see my car. It depends on which side of the  
4 balcony you were on.

5 **Q** Well, on the side that you said he was on,  
6 could he see your car from that balcony?

7 **A** From that side of the house, no, he could not.

8 **Q** And I noticed that there was a phone call made  
9 to the Sheffields' residence to try to get in touch  
10 with the Sheffields, and I think you actually asked  
11 for that --

12 **A** Yes.

13 **Q** -- to contact them and try to see whether or  
14 not you could talk to them; is that correct?

15 **A** It is.

16 **Q** Okay. And that's proper police procedure?

17 **A** Yes.

18 **Q** And after you made that call, then you said,  
19 Well, they tried to call, actually call them up.

20 Was ever any attempt made to try to call Joe  
21 Worley or Mary Worley?

22 **A** Not to my knowledge there was not.

23 **Q** Okay. And you went and talked to the  
24 Sheffields. And in your testimony, you said you  
25 could hear the calling by the other officers who

1           were on the other side; is that correct?

2           **A**     I could hear Nick announcing, Sheriff's office.

3           **Q**     And there's no barriers in that woods between  
4           the two houses that would prohibit -- to prohibit  
5           y'all from being able to hear that, would there?

6           **A**     There's a few trees there, but most definitely  
7           would not prevent us from hearing each other.

8           **Q**     Okay. And Mr. Worley, I'm assuming, until he  
9           steps out of the house, would be inside the house  
10          the whole time?

11          **A**     I have no idea.

12          **Q**     Well, your first encounter with Mr. Worley was  
13          when? When did you first see him?

14          **A**     He was standing on the front porch or on the  
15          upper deck.

16          **Q**     Okay. And did you hear him step out?

17          **A**     I heard a sliding glass door open. I do not  
18          recall hearing actual footsteps. I heard a sliding  
19          glass door.

20          **Q**     So you walked out far enough to be able to look  
21          up. And did you use your flashlight?

22          **A**     I do not remember if I shined my flashlight or  
23          not.

24          **Q**     But, at some point, you recognized that there  
25          was a man standing there with a gun in the port

1 position? Is this the port position {indicating}?

2 **A** Well, he would have been doing it from this way  
3 {indicating} instead of -- right hand higher.

4 **Q** Right hand higher?

5 **A** Yes.

6 **Q** Okay. But when you saw him, he was --

7 **A** Yeah, he was about like that.

8 **Q** In this position. And he wasn't pointing the  
9 gun at you or anything like that, from what you  
10 could see?

11 **A** No. When I saw him, he was looking to his  
12 right, walking sideways with that rifle pointed at  
13 port position.

14 **Q** Okay. And at some point, you say he made some  
15 statement; is that correct? Is that your testimony?

16 **A** Yes, when we were up under the upper deck when  
17 Nick and I were announcing, Sheriff's department,  
18 his -- Who is it? Sheriff's department. I don't  
19 give a fuck.

20 **Q** Bobby, why would you walk out into somebody's  
21 line of fire if somebody had just said that?

22 **A** How was I supposed to know he had a rifle until  
23 I walked out to see? I did not see that rifle until  
24 I walked out.

25 **Q** Okay. Then you heard it, then you saw it, and

1           then you said what?

2           **A**     I said, Gun, alerting Nick and Melissa that the  
3           subject had a gun; said, Sheriff's department, drop  
4           your gun. And no sooner than I said it, lights came  
5           on. I'm blinded. I can't see a thing. I hit the  
6           ground face-first, and that's because I was shot.

7           **Q**     All right. Now, let's talk about those lights  
8           a minute, because that's critical. Where was the  
9           light switch?

10          **A**     I have never been in the house. I have seen a  
11          picture, and I've actually seen a couple light  
12          switches -- pictures of light switches.

13          **Q**     And you actually sent, as I recall, or y'all  
14          had your investigation sent an electrician out there  
15          to see whether or not there was any lights that just  
16          cut on automatically?

17          **A**     Yes. Mr. Burt went out there.

18          **Q**     Because, at some point, you said you thought  
19          maybe that's why the light came on, because  
20          Mr. Worley was outside. He couldn't have very well  
21          stopped this whole thing and walked back in the  
22          house and went in there and cut the light on for the  
23          light to be on for him to blind you?

24          **A**     To the best of my recollection, what I was -- I  
25          asked other officers, Did we walk in front of a

1 motion sensor? Because I did not know how those  
2 lights turned on. I don't who turned them on. I  
3 didn't know if we walked in front of a motion  
4 sensor. I don't know how they came on.

5 **Q** You were seriously shocked, I'm sure. Did you  
6 even see -- I've read some of your testimony.  
7 Sometimes you said you heard the shot, and sometimes  
8 you said you didn't. Sometimes you said you saw --  
9 I don't think you said you saw the flash. I don't  
10 think you ever acknowledged seeing the flash.

11 **A** I never saw the flash. I never heard the shot  
12 -- the first shot that struck me. The second shot,  
13 as I'm scrambling to my feet trying to retreat and  
14 get out of there, there's a second shot fired. That  
15 is the only shot that I actually heard.

16 **Q** In the investigation, they never found any  
17 shots around you. You never heard where the shot  
18 hit, I guess?

19 **A** I have no idea where that shot hit. I was  
20 trying to get out of there. I was in fear of my  
21 life.

22 **Q** So it could have very well been up into the  
23 trees, as has been testified?

24 **MR. MYERS:** Objection.

25 **THE WITNESS:** I don't know where that shot

1           went.

2           **MR. MYERS:**   Objection.

3           **THE COURT:**   Just one second.

4           Y'all come around here for a second.

5                       (Whereupon, a bench conference was held off  
6           the record, in the presence of the jury, but out of  
7           the hearing of the jury.)

8           BY MR. GARRETT:

9           **Q**       Now, I'm back with you about this light --  
10          excuse me -- I'm with you about this shot up into  
11          the trees.

12                    To your knowledge, was there ever any bullet,  
13          like the fragments that were found in your hand, was  
14          there any fragments like that found in the ground  
15          with metal detectors or whatever right in there, in  
16          the area where you fell?

17          **A**       I have no clue to what was found.  I was not  
18          there.  And you said something about a shot up in  
19          the trees, I don't know there was a shot up into a  
20          tree.

21          **Q**       What I'm asking you, Mr. Rushton, is if he had  
22          you in his sights sufficient to knock you down on  
23          the floor and he's standing there with a gun and he  
24          just shot the gun out of your hand, if he wanted to  
25          put one in you, laying there --



1           **MR. MYERS:** Objection; speculation.

2           **THE COURT:** I sustain that.

3           BY MR. GARRETT:

4           **Q**     Well, do you know anything that would have  
5           prohibited him from shooting you in that  
6           circumstance?

7           **MR. MYERS:** Objection.

8           **THE COURT:** Overruled.

9           BY MR. GARRETT:

10          **Q**     Anything that would have prohibited Joe from  
11          killing you where you lay?

12          **A**     He missed the second shot, that's what  
13          prohibited it.

14          **Q**     All right. But there's been no finding of any  
15          kind of bullet or anything like that in the ground?

16          **A**     Not that I'm aware of, but that doesn't mean  
17          there wasn't.

18          **Q**     He shot in such a way as not to kill you, but  
19          to knock the gun out of your hand?

20          **A**     It happened so fast, and I -- there's no way he  
21          aimed at my gun and shot my gun out of my hand.  
22          This isn't the Wild West.

23          **Q**     Well, did you tell the EMS workers that this  
24          was a gun fight? You'd been involved in a gun  
25          fight?

1       **A**     I told EMS workers that? I don't remember  
2       that.

3       **Q**     Okay. You just don't remember it?

4       **A**     I doubt I said it.

5       **Q**     Did you say it was a shootout?

6       **A**     I said I got shot.

7       **Q**     Did you tell them you'd been in a shootout?

8       **A**     No. If I said that, I do not remember it, and  
9       I seriously doubt that I would ever say that. I  
10      told them that I had been shot, and I had been shot.

11      **Q**     Did you give a statement to the medical people  
12      that were working on you at MCG Health, Inc., the  
13      Emergency Express Care Center, on 11/15/09?

14      **A**     I have no idea. Shortly after I got to the  
15      hospital at MCG, they pumped me so full of drugs, I  
16      don't know what was going on.

17      **Q**     It said they gave you some Dilaudid on down  
18      here.

19             But let me just let you look at that.

20      **A**     (Witness reviewing document.)

21      **Q**     Did you make that statement, to your knowledge,  
22      that you were involved in a shootout?

23      **A**     I just testified I don't remember what I said.  
24      I was so pumped full of drugs for the pain, I don't  
25      know what went on.

1           **Q**     So you may have?

2           **A**     They could have cut my arm off; I wouldn't have  
3           known it.

4           **Q**     So you may have?

5           **A**     I seriously doubt it, but I don't remember  
6           saying anything like that.

7           **Q**     So you suffered, obviously, a traumatic injury,  
8           and you're trying to recall the events of that  
9           night; is that correct?

10          **A**     Now or then?

11          **Q**     Then.

12          **A**     At the hospital?

13          **Q**     Yeah, at the hospital or any time after that,  
14          when you're writing your statement and those kinds  
15          of things.

16          **A**     I was trying to remember -- when I was writing  
17          the statement? I don't remember any of that at the  
18          hospital. I remember very little from the hospital.

19          **Q**     All right. So you don't know whether you told  
20          them you were in a shootout or not?

21          **A**     I don't even know that my wife was in the room  
22          with me at the hospital.

23          **Q**     I understand. I understand. I understand.

24                 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, this may be a good  
25          time -- beg the Court's indulgence.

1 (Pause.)

2 Q I'm just going to run something by you: Is  
3 this your flashlight that you were using that night?

4 A Yes, it is. It is.

5 Q Is that it?

6 A Yes, it is.

7 Q All right. And that's the type of flashlight  
8 you had in your hand that evening?

9 A Yes. I had that flashlight with me that  
10 evening.

11 Q And do you recall dropping it?

12 A I do not remember.

13 Q Okay.

14 A At some point, I dropped it. I don't know if I  
15 dropped it before I got shot or after I got shot.

16 Q And is this a vest that was available to law  
17 enforcement?

18 A It was not available to me.

19 Q If this is a sheriff issued, if you wanted to  
20 wear it, you could have?

21 A That?

22 Q Yeah, this.

23 A I don't know, because each vest, you have to go  
24 to Columbia and you have to be measured and fitted  
25 for your vest. You do not pass these vests down.

1 The life expectancy is only approximately two years  
2 of these vests.

3 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, I didn't ask that.

4 **THE WITNESS:** I had --

5 **THE COURT:** Stop, stop, stop, stop. You asked  
6 a question, Was it not available to you? And he was  
7 explaining why it wasn't. So I overrule your  
8 objection.

9 **MR. GARRETT:** I'm just saying --

10 **THE WITNESS:** May I finish my --

11 **THE COURT:** No, sir. Let him ask the question.  
12 Go ahead.

13 BY MR. GARRETT:

14 **Q** If you wanted to have one like this, you could  
15 have?

16 **A** Mine had been ordered. I had not had it. And  
17 one was not readily available for me.

18 **Q** I understand. Yours had been ordered, though,  
19 right?

20 **A** Mine had been ordered, but had not come in.

21 **Q** Okay. So you were out there in the field  
22 without your vest that you could have worn that  
23 night if you'd had it?

24 **A** If I had it. I don't wear the vest. It's an  
25 option.

1       **Q**     Your department could have made the decision  
2       not to let you go out there until such time as you  
3       had proper attire?

4       **A**     At the time, there was no policy whether or not  
5       we had to wear that vest. That was optional to the  
6       officer.

7       **Q**     This is protractive duty and those kinds of  
8       things, was one of these types of vests available  
9       for you {indicating}?

10      **A**     No, it was not. I have never been issued one  
11      of those vests.

12      **Q**     You haven't?

13      **A**     No.

14      **Q**     But you know that they're available at your  
15      department if you wanted one?

16      **A**     No, they're not, because I had asked for one,  
17      and there were none or they'd all been issued out.

18      **Q**     They had been. And you didn't say -- so you  
19      did feel like it's necessary to have one of these?

20      **A**     After I came back. I did not ask for it before  
21      I got shot. After I came back to work or tried to  
22      work, that's when I asked for it.

23      **Q**     Why did you decide that you wanted it after you  
24      came back to work?

25               **MR. MYERS:** Relevancy, Your Honor; objection.

1           **THE COURT:** Sustained.

2           **THE WITNESS:** Because if I came --

3           **THE COURT:** Huh-huh.

4           **THE WITNESS:** I'm sorry.

5           BY MR. GARRETT:

6           **Q**     Did you feel like that maybe if you would have  
7           had something like this that night, you would have  
8           been easier to be seen, recognized as a police  
9           officer?

10          **A**     That's a traffic vest.

11          **Q**     What I'm interested in is that, a sheriff's --

12          **A**     We would not wear that on calls such as a --  
13          anything other than traffic. That's what that vest  
14          is for, traffic.

15          **Q**     Your shirt didn't have the emblem on it like  
16          these two officers; right?

17          **A**     No, it did not.

18          **Q**     Okay. Did y'all have an overcoat?

19          **A**     A coat had been ordered for me.

20          **Q**     Okay. And it had that badge on it?

21          **A**     I believe that's the badge.

22          **Q**     And you didn't have -- you didn't have one of  
23          these?

24          **A**     No, I did not.

25          **Q**     The truth of the matter is, you were simply in

1 plain clothes?

2 **A** Plain -- no. Well, the shirt was. The pants  
3 would have been identical to what Deputy Romines is  
4 wearing now.

5 **Q** But the shirt is what's got the badge on it?

6 **A** That's irrelevant.

7 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you.

8 Your Honor, this is a good stopping point.

9 **THE COURT:** All right.

10 Madame Forelady, ladies and gentlemen of the  
11 jury, what we're going to do is go ahead and stop  
12 the testimony today since -- we're going to go ahead  
13 and stop the testimony tonight. We're going to ask  
14 that you be back in your jury room about 9:25, the  
15 same time we did this morning.

16 Let me remind you and instruct you that you're  
17 not to speak amongst yourselves or with anyone else  
18 about this case. You're not to read, hear or listen  
19 to anything about this case, if it happens to be out  
20 there. I'll ask you in the morning before we get  
21 started whether or not you have. Okay?

22 With that being said, thank you, and good  
23 night.

24 (The jury was excused for the day.)

25 **THE COURT:** Before we break for the day, let me



1 ask a couple of things or point out a couple of  
2 things. We're at ease, but I'm not sure if I  
3 understand, and that's not a big jump, but the  
4 relevance with whether or not Officer Rushton was  
5 certified or not or whether he took a proper oath or  
6 not for purposes of this trial today. I mean, is it  
7 more relating to the appeal, Ms. Ballard, or is  
8 it --

9 **MS. BALLARD:** Your Honor, it is related to  
10 today because of the issues that are going to be  
11 related to the Castle Doctrine and the right to be  
12 in a certain place at a certain time. So, yes, we  
13 will be arguing those issues relevant to the trial.

14 **THE COURT:** I got you.

15 Let me also say this so you can understand: I  
16 did -- earlier, based on my rulings was I'm not  
17 going to let you get into sworn statements made by  
18 the defendant without him taking the Fifth -- I  
19 mean, without him taking the stand. And I know that  
20 sometimes that statements by defendants are  
21 admissible, but my understanding is that if you have  
22 to take the stand to protect a constitutional right  
23 or a statutory right as in this case, then those  
24 statements can't be used against him.

25 And so my idea is and my ruling has been that

1           if he can't -- the State can't use it as a sword,  
2           you cannot either, without putting him on the stand.  
3           Okay?

4           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

5           **THE COURT:** Likewise, Judge Few's case by  
6           experts -- that's what I'm trying to lead up to --  
7           that even though an expert may use hearsay or other  
8           type of statements in formulating their opinion, if  
9           it's that -- and used by experts in the field,  
10          doesn't make those statements admissible. So I'm  
11          just trying to give you heads-up where I'm going.  
12          Okay?

13          **MR. GARRETT:** I understand. Thank you, Your  
14          Honor. I appreciate it.

15          **THE COURT:** All right. That's it. Anything  
16          else from the State before we -- okay. Go ahead.

17          **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, I believe Deputy  
18          Rushton put his small flashlight in his pocket to  
19          take home. Can we just leave it here as  
20          demonstrative evidence?

21          **THE COURT:** Do you have any problem with that?

22          **THE WITNESS:** I'd rather leave it with the  
23          Solicitors.

24          **MR. HENDERSON:** More than fine.

25          **THE COURT:** That's fine. If you would just

1 leave it here.

2 As you recall, no testimony -- I mean, no  
3 discussion about your testimony with anyone,  
4 including your spouse and including the State.  
5 Okay?

6 **THE WITNESS:** Yes, sir.

7 **THE COURT:** Okay. Thank you, sir. You may  
8 step down.

9 All right. Anything from the State before we  
10 break for the evening?

11 **MR. MYERS:** No, sir.

12 **THE COURT:** Anything from the defense?

13 **MR. GARRETT:** No, sir.

14 **MS. BALLARD:** Your Honor, I have to be at the  
15 Supreme Court at 10:30 in the morning. Again, I'll  
16 be here as quick as I can.

17 **THE COURT:** All right. Thank you.

18 (The proceedings were concluded for December  
19 17, 2013.)

20 (The following proceedings were held on  
21 December 18, 2013.)

22 **THE COURT:** All right. Anything from the State  
23 before we bring the jury in?

24 **MR. MYERS:** No, sir.

25 **THE COURT:** Anything from the defense?

1                   **MR. GARRETT:** No, sir.

2                   **THE COURT:** Would you ask the jury to come in,  
3 please, sir?

4                   (The jury enters the courtroom at 9:35 a.m.)

5                   **THE COURT:** Good morning, Madame Forelady and  
6 ladies and gentlemen of the jury. I hope you had a  
7 nice evening.

8                   Before we get started, as I told you I will do,  
9 let me ask if anyone has read, heard, or seen  
10 anything about this trial during our break; if so,  
11 would you raise your hand.

12                   Very good. Let the record reflect that no  
13 juror responded.

14                   Mr. Garrett, are you ready to proceed and  
15 continue on with your cross-examination?

16                   **MR. GARRETT:** We are, Your Honor.

17                   **THE COURT:** Mr. Rushton, would you come around.  
18 You are still under oath.

19                   **THE WITNESS:** Yes, sir.

20                   (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

21 BY MR. GARRETT:

22                   **Q** Good morning, Mr. Rushton.

23                   **A** Good morning.

24                   **Q** As a matter of just some housekeeping, do you  
25 have any idea of whether or not your oath is

1 recorded in the Clerk of Court's office?

2 **A** It should be.

3 **Q** Do you know whether it is?

4 **A** I've never personally checked.

5 **Q** Okay. Do you have a bond recorded and kept in  
6 the Clerk of Court's office?

7 **A** I have no idea. I never checked.

8 **Q** On the night of 11/15/09, were you acting at  
9 the direction and under the authority of Sheriff  
10 George Reid?

11 **A** Yes.

12 **Q** Yesterday when we were talking about the  
13 incident -- I want to go back over that with you a  
14 little bit. Do you acknowledge that it was a dark  
15 night?

16 **A** It was at night. I mean, it was night.

17 **Q** Okay. And there's no lights in the back area  
18 at the door?

19 **A** You mean the front of the house?

20 **Q** The front of the house towards the lake.  
21 There's no street lights or anything like that?

22 **A** There's no -- not what I would call a street  
23 light, no.

24 **Q** Okay. There's no yard lights or anything like  
25 that, other than the lights that we've talked about?

1       **A**     The two lights on the front upper deck are the  
2       only two lights that I'm --

3       **Q**     That you're aware of.

4       **A**     That I'm aware of.

5       **Q**     Okay. And when you were talking about that  
6       yesterday, you acknowledge that when you parked your  
7       car, you parked your car on the other side of Joe's  
8       house?

9       **A**     In the driveway.

10      **Q**     In the driveway. You didn't go all the way  
11     down the driveway. You just parked --

12      **A**     You can't go all the way down the driveway. I  
13     parked behind the vehicle that was in the driveway.

14      **Q**     Okay. And we've acknowledged that, unless Joe  
15     were to walk all the way over to the other side of  
16     the balcony, he wouldn't have been able to see that  
17     car?

18      **A**     From the balcony?

19      **Q**     From the balcony, he could if he had walked all  
20     the way over to the other side and looked around?

21      **A**     What I'm saying is, if he had -- I don't know  
22     the layout in the house, if there's windows on the  
23     lower level. He could have looked out the lower --  
24     I don't know.

25      **Q**     Okay. So you don't know. You didn't have your

1 blue light on?

2 **A** No, I would not have. That would be just  
3 something you don't do.

4 **Q** All right. And you hadn't called the Worleys'  
5 house or had it dispatched, do a -- or called the  
6 dispatched -- like you did or they did with the  
7 Sheffields? You didn't call the Worleys' house that  
8 way?

9 **A** I have no way of calling the Worley house. I  
10 don't know their number.

11 **Q** Okay. And you didn't ask dispatch to do that?

12 **A** No.

13 **Q** Okay. Now, after you had been to the  
14 Sheffields and y'all met back up, y'all were walking  
15 back and y'all both were under the deck. You said  
16 you were on the right side of the door --

17 **A** Yes.

18 **Q** -- and Nick Moore was on the left?

19 **A** Yes.

20 **Q** All right. And I want to talk about the timing  
21 of when the light came on, what you saw, and what  
22 you heard. Okay?

23 **A** Okay.

24 **Q** So let's just slow that down for just a minute.  
25 When you heard the sliding glass door open,

1           were you able to see Joe then?

2           **A**     As the door was opening? No, I was not.

3           **Q**     The moment the door opened, was the light on?

4           **A**     I don't know how far the door -- oh, no. When  
5           I heard the door opening, that light was not on.

6           **Q**     It was not on. And you and Moore, at that  
7           point, were underneath the deck?

8           **A**     Yes.

9           **Q**     Okay. Now, take it real slow from there. What  
10          do you recall happened then?

11          **A**     As the first -- as the door was opening --

12          **Q**     Okay.

13          **A**     Let me start at the beginning so I don't mess  
14          myself up.

15          **Q**     That's fine.

16          **A**     We're knocking on the door, ringing the  
17          doorbell, announcing.

18          **Q**     Okay. Both of you are?

19          **A**     Both of us are. We're announcing, Sheriff's  
20          department, sheriff's office.

21          **Q**     The door is closed at that point?

22          **A**     I don't know if it was closed. It could have  
23          been partially open. I don't know. I couldn't see  
24          it.

25          **Q**     You don't know. Okay. You couldn't see it.



1       **A**     I do not know.

2       **Q**     Okay.  You couldn't see it; is that right?

3       **A**     Yes.

4       **Q**     It was dark?

5       **A**     I'm under the balcony.  I can't see the door.

6       **Q**     There's no light under the balcony area --  
7 below the balcony area, is there?

8       **A**     Not to my knowledge.

9       **Q**     Okay.  Go ahead.

10      **A**     I hear, Who is it?  Nick and I both are  
11 announcing, Sheriff's office.  We hear, I don't give  
12 a fuck.

13      **Q**     Stop right there.  Stop right there.

14             Were you able to see -- when you heard those  
15 words, What y'all want, I don't give an F, were you  
16 able to see Joe Worley that second?

17      **A**     No.

18      **Q**     All right.  So where were you at when you heard  
19 those words?

20      **A**     Under the deck.

21      **Q**     Still under the deck.

22             Okay.  So now you've heard those words, it's  
23 still dark.  Then what did you do?

24      **A**     I'm backing up.  And then I hear the sliding  
25 glass door as I'm backing up away from the front

1 door.

2 Q I got you. So you don't hear the sliding glass  
3 door open until you're backing up?

4 A As I start -- yes. I take a step back from the  
5 door; I hear the door opening.

6 Q All right. So you hadn't heard the door open  
7 prior to that?

8 A No, I did not.

9 Q All right. He steps back -- or you step back,  
10 and you said you walked in a backward position?

11 A Yes, sir.

12 Q Is that correct?

13 A Yes, sir.

14 Q Was the light still off?

15 A It was off.

16 Q Okay. But you said you were announcing,  
17 Sheriff's department, and that type of thing?

18 A Yes, we were.

19 Q All right. And you were walking backward?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Was the light still off?

22 A It was off.

23 Q Okay. And then when did you finally recognize  
24 that there was a man, and your testimony was, with  
25 salt-and-pepper hair holding what appeared to be a

1           shotgun?

2           **A**     Yes.  Once I got back from the railing a little  
3           bit where I could actually see over the top railing  
4           of the upper deck, I realized he was standing there.  
5           And at that point is when --

6           **Q**     All right.  Hold on a minute.  I'm going to  
7           stop right there.

8                    The light is still out, but you had to walk --  
9           is this the railing that you're talking about here  
10          that you had to see through, above --

11          **A**     Well, you're pointing at the bottom railing.  
12          There's two railings right there.

13          **Q**     Okay.  There's a top railing and a bottom  
14          railing -- actually, there's three parts, would you  
15          agree, almost like a...

16          **A**     There's the bottom floor, second railing, third  
17          railing.  That right there is above the window.

18          **Q**     Okay.  So you've got two railings there?

19          **A**     Yes.

20          **Q**     Okay.  Now, in order for you to see Joe, you  
21          had to be able to see through those two boards; is  
22          that correct?

23          **A**     No, over them.

24          **Q**     Over them; right?

25          **A**     Yes.

1       **Q**     So you had to get out far enough to --

2       **A**     No, it's very possible that I could see a  
3       little bit through it, but to see over them to make  
4       out his upper features --

5       **Q**     To make out that he's got a shotgun in his  
6       hands.

7       **A**     Yes.

8       **Q**     What did you see him with --

9       **A**     That he had a long gun.

10      **Q**     A long gun in his hand. All right.

11             Now, isn't it fair -- wouldn't you think, if  
12      the light is still off, that just as you can't see  
13      him well, he can't see you well?

14      **A**     I don't know what he saw. I know what I saw.

15      **Q**     Okay. But he had -- Joe would also have to see  
16      you through those rails as you were walking back,  
17      too, wouldn't he, in the dark when all you had was a  
18      flashlight?

19      **A**     See me so he could shoot me?

20      **Q**     See you walking back, yes.

21      **A**     So he could shoot me?

22      **Q**     See you to do whatever.

23      **A**     I'm assuming he saw me. He shot me.

24      **Q**     All right. And you were carrying a flashlight?

25      **A**     I had a flashlight.

1           **Q**     All right. And you were backing up?

2           **A**     I was backing up.

3           **Q**     And that's the only light that was there?

4           **A**     My flashlight?

5           **Q**     Yeah, that flashlight.

6           **A**     It was there. If it was on or off, I do not  
7           know.

8           **Q**     All right. And then what happened?

9           **A**     I see his features. I recognize that it's a  
10          gun held at port arms. I yelled, Gun, alerting Nick  
11          and Melissa that he has a weapon. We're yelling,  
12          Sheriff's department, drop your gun. And no sooner  
13          than we get it out of our mouth, the lights come on,  
14          and I'm facedown in the dirt.

15          **Q**     Okay. So from his perspective from where he's  
16          at, the light shining on you doesn't shine until  
17          right before you get shot?

18          **A**     Yes, I'm assuming so.

19          **Q**     Okay. So as far as how much time he had to  
20          observe you and see if you were the real thing --

21          **A**     He already knew who we are. He acknowledged he  
22          knew who we are when he -- he acknowledged --

23          **Q**     Why is --

24                 **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, I object. He won't let  
25          him answer the question. Thank you.

1           **THE COURT:** All right. Let me get both of you  
2           -- let's go back over again. He'll ask the  
3           question, let him finish it, and then you'll answer.  
4           And if you need more time to answer, he'll allow you  
5           to have time to answer. Okay, sir?

6           **THE WITNESS:** Yes, sir.

7           **THE COURT:** Okay. Would you do it again, Mr.  
8           Garrett?

9           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

10          BY MR. GARRETT:

11          **Q**     We're at the point in time where the light  
12          comes on and you get shot.

13          **A**     Okay.

14          **Q**     Okay. And I was questioning how much time then  
15          did Mr. Worley have to observe you in the light?

16          **A**     I don't know if he saw me before I saw him or  
17          not.

18          **Q**     Okay. So how much time did he have to see  
19          whether or not you were, in fact, a police officer?

20          **A**     To see? He already knew.

21          **Q**     To see if you were a police officer.

22          **A**     I don't know what he saw.

23          **Q**     Okay. How much time did he have to see you?

24          **A**     I don't know that because he could have seen me  
25          before I saw him. I do not know.

1       **Q**     After the light --

2       **A**     After the light came on.

3       **Q**     The light came on. How much time did he have  
4       to see you?

5       **A**     It was a fraction of a second before he shot  
6       me.

7       **Q**     Okay. So he had a fraction of a second. If he  
8       only saw you -- was able to see who you were, not in  
9       uniform, he had less than a second to make a  
10      decision whether or not to shoot you?

11      **A**     I don't know if he saw me before, but I do know  
12      that he knew who I was.

13      **Q**     All right. Let me ask you this question: How  
14      long have you known Joe Worley?

15      **A**     Until that night, I have never met him.

16      **Q**     All right. Have you ever been on any calls  
17      down to his property down there?

18      **A**     Never.

19      **Q**     Okay. And so you've been in -- since you were  
20      15 years old, you've been in McCormick?

21      **A**     Yes.

22      **Q**     All right. And you've never had any encounters  
23      or anything like that with Joe?

24      **A**     No, I have not?

25      **Q**     So you don't know him and he doesn't know you,

1 as far as you know?

2 **A** As far as I know, he doesn't.

3 **Q** Now, the gun --

4 **MR. GARRETT:** Mr. Myers, do we have that gun?

5 **MR. MYERS:** I've got it back there.

6 (Pause.)

7 **THE COURT:** Has that gun been placed into  
8 evidence?

9 **MR. GARRETT:** It has not, Your Honor. Can we  
10 mark it for identification and put it in evidence,  
11 Your Honor?

12 **MR. MYERS:** We have no objection if they put it  
13 into evidence.

14 **THE COURT:** Let's go ahead and put it in  
15 evidence.

16 **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir. That's fine. We'll  
17 have it identified and put in as Defendant's  
18 Exhibit.

19 **MR. MAYE:** And it is secured, Your Honor. I  
20 was just checking it. I don't think it's functional  
21 at this point anyway.

22 **THE COURT:** I was just going to tell the jury,  
23 ladies and gentlemen, any weapon that you see during  
24 this trial will be disabled and not capable of  
25 firing.



1           And I'm going to instruct the attorneys and the  
2 witnesses not to point it at anybody, please.

3           **MR. GARRETT:** Absolutely.

4           **THE COURT:** Thank you.

5           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

6                   (Defendant's Exhibit Number 7, gun, marked  
7 and admitted into evidence.)

8 BY MR. GARRETT:

9           **Q**     Do you recognize Defense 7?

10          **A**     This appears to be the -- my duty weapon that I  
11 had on November the 15th of '09.

12          **Q**     All right. And would you agree with me that  
13 the round appears to have gone right through here  
14 {indicating}?

15          **A**     Yes.

16          **Q**     Right through this area right here  
17 {indicating}?

18          **A**     Yes.

19          **Q**     So in order for that round to have hit in that  
20 fashion, where would it have been pointing towards  
21 Mr. Worley?

22          **A**     It would have been pointed upwards. As a law  
23 enforcement officer, when you see someone with a  
24 weapon, you draw your weapon to protect yourself,  
25 and that's exactly what I was doing.

1       **Q**     All right. Had you already drawn your weapon  
2       up before the light came on?

3       **A**     I was in the process of coming up with it.

4       **Q**     Okay. But you had cleared your holster and had  
5       to get it up to point at him before he could have  
6       shot that gun with the .30-06?

7       **A**     If the sights were on him or not on him, I  
8       cannot say, but I did pull my weapon to protect  
9       myself, and it was in an upward position.

10      **Q**     All right. And so from his perspective, when  
11      the light came on, you were already there or on your  
12      way there?

13      **A**     I don't know what his perspective was.

14      **Q**     Well, we've just talked about it being dark  
15      when the light came on, and the question is -- you  
16      said, right after the light came on, bam.

17             The question is, How much time did he have to  
18      see who you were in relationship to that gun?

19      **A**     From the time the light came on, it was  
20      simultaneously.

21      **Q**     Boom {snapping fingers}?

22      **A**     Before that, like I said, he acknowledged who I  
23      was.

24      **Q**     Okay. Do you recall, as you were coming up,  
25      you dropped your flashlight?

1       **A**     I do not know if I dropped my flashlight before  
2       I drew my weapon or I dropped my flashlight when I  
3       was shot.

4       **Q**     Okay. Now, when y'all went out there, Joe had  
5       -- no crime had been committed in your presence; is  
6       that correct?

7       **A**     No, it had not.

8       **Q**     And Joe had not threatened you any harm until  
9       he shot you?

10      **A**     Threatened me?

11      **Q**     Yeah. He hadn't threatened you?

12      **A**     Not a threat, no.

13      **Q**     Okay. And if -- let's suppose for a moment he  
14      was checking you out to see who you really were.  
15      You've heard of police officers before lying about  
16      being police officers, haven't you? Pulling people  
17      over acting like they're police officers?

18      **A**     I'm not pulling anyone over.

19      **Q**     I understand, but you've heard about that  
20      before, haven't you? Isn't that a crime to  
21      impersonate a police officer?

22      **A**     It is a crime, but...

23           **MR. MYERS:** Objection to the relevance, Your  
24      Honor. It's hypothetical, speculative, and has  
25      nothing to do with this case.

1           **THE COURT:** What is the relevance of that?

2           **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, the relevance of it  
3 is it's natural human nature to want to find out if  
4 somebody is really a police officer. People might  
5 tell you they are, but you've got an opportunity,  
6 you know, everybody's got an opportunity to check it  
7 out.

8           **MR. MYERS:** I don't know whether that's human  
9 nature or not.

10          **THE COURT:** I overrule your objection. Go  
11 ahead.

12          **THE WITNESS:** State it again.

13 BY MR. GARRETT:

14 **Q** I'm just -- you've heard before that people  
15 impersonate police officers? Haven't you heard  
16 that?

17 **A** I've heard that. Never encountered it.

18 **Q** All right. Now, he didn't threaten to harm any  
19 member of your team before he shot, did he?

20 **A** He did not verbally threaten anyone before he  
21 shot.

22 **Q** Okay. And, to your knowledge, Joe had not  
23 threatened anybody in his own household or you  
24 didn't have any knowledge that he had bothered or  
25 harmed anybody in his own household?

1           **MR. MYERS:** Objection. How could he know what  
2           went on in Mr. Worley's household?

3           **THE COURT:** Lay a foundation for your question.  
4           BY MR. GARRETT:

5           **Q**     I'm just -- you didn't receive any type of call  
6           or anything like that telling you that he was  
7           harming somebody in his residence that you needed to  
8           be prepared for?

9           **A**     I had no knowledge that he hadn't either.

10          **Q**     Right. I understand that.

11                 And you would agree that Mr. and Mrs. Worley  
12           have a right to be in their own house?

13          **A**     Yes, definitely.

14          **Q**     Occupy their own house?

15          **A**     Yes.

16          **Q**     And is it not unusual in a southern rural  
17           culture for people to have -- own or possess a  
18           firearm?

19          **A**     Yes.

20          **Q**     It's natural. You expect that in this area?

21          **A**     Yes.

22          **Q**     Now, as a homeowner and as a lawful or a lawful  
23           occupant, you can use your guns in self-defense; is  
24           that correct?

25          **A**     Certain circumstances.

1           **Q**     But you can?

2           **A**     It depends on the circumstances.

3           **Q**     Okay. You can also use your gun for your own  
4     defense and your defense of your family?

5                   **MR. MYERS:** He's asking about legal  
6     conclusions. That's not proper.

7                   **THE COURT:** I sustain the objection.

8     BY MR. GARRETT:

9           **Q**     All right. You don't -- let me ask it another  
10    way. You can defend yourself?

11          **A**     When threatened.

12          **Q**     Okay. And the other person can defend  
13    themselves, too, when threatened?

14                  **MR. MYERS:** He's going into legal matters.

15                  **THE COURT:** I sustain the objection.

16    BY MR. GARRETT:

17          **Q**     All right. Well, let me just ask you a common  
18    sense thing. If somebody points a loaded gun at  
19    you, do you have a right to be in fear of imminent  
20    harm?

21                  **MR. MYERS:** Same thing, Your Honor. He's just  
22    going on with legal matters. It's hypothetical.  
23    It's not appropriate for this. It's not based on  
24    what happened here. He's going out on speculation.

25                  **THE COURT:** I overrule that. Go ahead.

1           **MR. MYERS:** Thank you, sir.

2           **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

3           BY MR. GARRETT:

4           **Q**     Would it cause you to be in fear? If I pointed  
5           a loaded gun at you, would that cause you to be in  
6           imminent fear?

7           **A**     After making a comment that, I don't give a  
8           fuck, yeah --

9           **Q**     No, no comment.

10          **MR. MYERS:** Don't cut him off. Don't cut him  
11          off. Let him answer. He's cutting him off again.

12          **THE COURT:** The rule is, again, he asks the  
13          question, you answer the question. If you want to  
14          explain it after you answer the question, you may do  
15          so. Okay?

16          **THE WITNESS:** Yes, sir.

17          Rephrase it again or say it again.

18          BY MR. GARRETT:

19          **Q**     If somebody points a loaded gun at you, aims it  
20          at you, you've got a right to be in imminent fear?

21          **A**     If I have reason to believe they're going to  
22          shoot me and it's not an accident, yes. But on this  
23          night in case, I had reason to believe that there  
24          may be more going on because of the information I  
25          had gathered from Mr. and Mrs. Sheffield. And then

1       when we were knocking on the door, we identified  
2       ourselves; he acknowledged he knew who we were when he  
3       yelled out, I don't give a fuck.

4               So, yes, I had a right to pull my gun just in  
5       safety precautions and that he had a weapon to  
6       protect myself. He had already -- I already had  
7       some information that this individual...

8       **Q**     All right. And that's the point I'm making.  
9       I'm not talking about from your perspective now.  
10      When you aimed your gun at Joe, a light hadn't cut  
11      on yet, or it was in the process of cutting on. So  
12      the first thing that Joe gets to see is some human  
13      being pointing a gun at him --

14              **MR. MYERS:** He doesn't know what Joe gets to  
15      see. We object to that. He's been over -- he's  
16      just going over and over and over. Asked and  
17      answered.

18              **THE COURT:** Sustained.

19      BY MR. GARRETT:

20      **Q**     All right. Now, in the incident report that's  
21      into evidence --

22              **MR. MYERS:** Is that Mr. Rushton's incident  
23      report?

24              **THE COURT:** Which exhibit are we referring to?  
25      Was that the statement and Mr. Rushton's incident



1 report we entered into evidence yesterday? Is that  
2 what you're referring to?

3 **MR. GARRETT:** It was.

4 **MR. MYERS:** I didn't get that.

5 **THE COURT:** It was the incident report of  
6 Mr. Rushton, and along with the statement that was  
7 introduced yesterday.

8 **MR. MYERS:** No, sir. That was Nick Moore.

9 **THE COURT:** Oh, that's right. It was Nick  
10 Moore.

11 **MR. GARRETT:** It was Mr. Moore. But it is in  
12 evidence.

13 **THE COURT:** I stand corrected. I apologize.

14 **MR. MYERS:** It's in evidence, but he can't ask  
15 him about somebody else's report.

16 **THE COURT:** It depends on the question. I  
17 hadn't heard it yet.

18 **MR. MYERS:** Thank you, sir.

19 **THE COURT:** Go ahead. I'm sorry.

20 BY MR. GARRETT:

21 **Q** In the incident report, it says that the light  
22 went on and off. When y'all were down there, the  
23 light came on, and it's before y'all started  
24 knocking on the door?

25 **MR. MYERS:** We object to him using an incident

1 report by somebody else to pit this witness against  
2 that incident report.

3 **THE COURT:** Overruled.

4 Go ahead and ask your question. I'm going to  
5 listen to it.

6 BY MR. GARRETT:

7 **Q** I'm asking the question about this light. In  
8 the report, it says the light was on the whole time.

9 **MR. MYERS:** Wait, wait. Show him where it says  
10 that in the report, the light was on the whole time.

11 **THE COURT:** Hand him the report, please.

12 **MR. GARRETT:** It's Court's Exhibit Number 4,  
13 Your Honor.

14 BY MR. GARRETT:

15 **Q** If you'd just pick it up right there.

16 **MR. MYERS:** Which page are we talking about?

17 **MR. GARRETT:** We're on the front page. The  
18 first page.

19 **THE COURT:** It's Court's Exhibit Number 4.

20 **MR. GARRETT:** One, two, three, four, five --  
21 six lines down. Can I let him start there?

22 **MR. MYERS:** Where does it say on there, the  
23 light was on the whole time?

24 **MR. GARRETT:** I announced -- I did hear the  
25 door open upon the deck. The light came back on,

1           and I did --

2           **MR. MYERS:** And went off. So where did it say  
3           on there it was on the whole time?

4           He's distorting the facts.

5           **THE COURT:** All right. Let him look at the  
6           report.

7           **MR. GARRETT:** I will.

8           BY MR. GARRETT:

9           **Q**     Start right here.

10          **A**     Out loud or to myself?

11          **Q**     To yourself first.

12          **A**     Okay.

13          **Q**     Does it say that the light was on before the  
14          door opened?

15          **A**     In the report?

16          **Q**     In the report.

17          **A**     It does say that in the report.

18          **Q**     All right. And does it show anywhere after  
19          that -- in the report that's into evidence, does it  
20          show anywhere after that that the light was cut off?

21          **A**     Not that I read in here, but we --

22          **Q**     Okay. Thank you.

23          **A**     -- left the area as fast as we could after I  
24          was shot.

25          **MR. MYERS:** So is he talking about the time of

1 the shooting? We need to get the timeframe right  
2 about the light coming on --

3 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, is that an objection?

4 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir, it's an objection.

5 **THE COURT:** Just -- I want y'all both to direct  
6 everything to me, please.

7 **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

8 **THE COURT:** The report speaks for itself. It's  
9 in evidence and so the jury will have to look at it  
10 and make their own determination.

11 **MR. MYERS:** Thank you.

12 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor.

13 BY MR. GARRETT:

14 **Q** I want you to identify this, a civil lawsuit.  
15 Do you recognize that true copy?

16 **A** This is a lawsuit that I filed against  
17 Mr. Worley.

18 **Q** And his mother?

19 **A** Yes, and Ms. Worley.

20 **MR. MYERS:** We object to it. He can bring out  
21 the fact that there is a civil lawsuit, but this is  
22 another matter where the specifics are not involved  
23 in a criminal action.

24 **THE COURT:** All right. Let me look at it,  
25 please.

1           **MR. GARRETT:** May we be heard on that, Your  
2 Honor?

3           (Pause.)

4           **THE COURT:** It's your intent to question about  
5 the particulars contained in this complaint?

6           **MR. GARRETT:** Sir?

7           **THE COURT:** Is it your contention or is it your  
8 intention to question this witness about the  
9 particulars or the allegations contained in this  
10 complaint?

11          **MR. GARRETT:** The general allegations.

12          **THE COURT:** Okay. I'll sustain the objection.  
13 You can bring out this fact of the lawsuit, but not  
14 the particulars. I'll give this back to y'all.

15          **MR. GARRETT:** Then I can't talk about the  
16 particulars?

17          **THE COURT:** No, sir.

18          **MR. GARRETT:** All right. I won't talk about  
19 the particulars, but can I talk about it in  
20 generality?

21          **THE COURT:** Yes. The fact that it's there,  
22 yes, sir, you may.

23          **MR. MYERS:** Maybe we ought to take it up  
24 outside the presence of the jury.

25          **THE COURT:** All right, Madame Forelady.

1 (The jury retires to the jury room.)

2 **MR. MYERS:** The reason I objected, Your Honor,  
3 is that you said that he can't go into particulars,  
4 and he said he wanted to go into generalities. His  
5 definition of generalities and mine might not be the  
6 same, so I think it would be best to go into it  
7 outside the presence of the jury.

8 **THE COURT:** I understand. What I -- what my  
9 ruling is, the fact that he filed a lawsuit against  
10 the defendant and his mother is something that's  
11 been brought out in opening statement, it's already  
12 in evidence, and so you can bring that out. When  
13 you start asking him about the particular  
14 allegations, I'm not going to let you go there.  
15 Okay? It's not verified by him. It's his attorney  
16 who filed that, and that's the reason I'm not going  
17 to let you do that. Okay, sir?

18 **MR. GARRETT:** All right. So for my  
19 understanding, my desire was to be able to show  
20 that, in his lawsuit, he's alleging negligence,  
21 whereas in his --

22 **MR. MYERS:** No, sir.

23 **THE COURT:** Absolutely not.

24 **MR. GARRETT:** May I proffer that, Your Honor?

25 **THE COURT:** You may. You may go ahead and do

1 your proffer now, please, sir.

2 **MR. GARRETT:** I can do the proffer.

3 **THE COURT:** And I note your objection to my  
4 ruling.

5 **MR. GARRETT:** All right. Thank you.

6 **THE COURT:** Make that Court's Exhibit Number 5.

7 **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

8 (Court's Exhibit Number 5, civil lawsuit,  
9 marked for identification.)

10 IN CAMERA EXAMINATION

11 BY MR. GARRETT:

12 **Q** Is this the lawsuit that you filed?

13 **A** That my attorneys filed, yes.

14 **Q** Okay. And in that lawsuit, it alleges  
15 negligence against Mr. Worley and his mother?

16 **A** I believe it does say negligence.

17 **Q** It doesn't say any intentional conduct, does  
18 it?

19 **A** I don't know that. I've never read it in its  
20 entirety. I know that my attorneys, who are  
21 competent attorneys, filed it, and I trust them.

22 **Q** All right. It doesn't say anything about  
23 intentional. Do you need to read it?

24 **A** I do not know if it says anything about  
25 intentional.

1           **MR. GARRETT:** Beg the Court's indulgence.

2                   (Witness reviewing document.)

3           **THE COURT:** Are they seeking punitive damages?

4           **MR. GARRETT:** I think so.

5           **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, if it would save time, I  
6 mean, it's in evidence. I'm not sure of the purpose  
7 of making him read it. It's in evidence. I mean, I  
8 think the record --

9           **THE COURT:** As an officer of the Court,  
10 Mr. Garrett, if it doesn't say that he intended his  
11 conduct, then it doesn't say that. It is what it  
12 is.

13           **MR. GARRETT:** It is what it is.

14           **THE COURT:** That way we can go forward.

15           **THE WITNESS:** It does -- on page 2, line 11.

16           **THE COURT:** That's all right. That's all  
17 right.

18           **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor.

19                   So to make sure that I've got His Honor's  
20 instructions correctly, I can only say that he sued  
21 them and that's it.

22           **THE COURT:** And let me just say this to you,  
23 and I'm treating it as you're moving it in again  
24 after that -- I know I cut you off -- I don't know  
25 what good it's going to have him reading it, but I'm



1       treating it, for the record, so you're protected,  
2       that you were moving to have that come in now after  
3       you did your proffer, and I'm denying that under  
4       403. I think it is -- it's misleading to the jury,  
5       it's confusing the issues, two different standards:  
6       He didn't sign that, it's filed by his attorney, and  
7       it's not probative to anything.

8               Now, to show some bias on the part of this  
9       witness potentially, I'll let you bring up the fact  
10      that he did, in fact, file a lawsuit, so he may have  
11      some bias in that regard, but that's where you're  
12      limited. Okay?

13             **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir. Can I ask that he's  
14      seeking money?

15             **THE COURT:** Sure. And that's where you'll  
16      stop, though.

17             **MR. GARRETT:** I'll stop right there.

18             **THE COURT:** Everybody ready to go?

19             **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

20             **THE WITNESS:** I have a question, Your Honor.

21             **THE COURT:** Okay. Be careful when you ask me a  
22      question. What is it?

23             **THE WITNESS:** Am I going to be able to answer  
24      this and explain why.

25             **THE COURT:** We'll just have to wait and see.

1 Okay? Usually, when you're a witness, you're asked  
2 a question, you're generally allowed to answer it.

3 **THE WITNESS:** Okay.

4 **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury in,  
5 please?

6 (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

7 **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett.

8 BY MR. GARRETT:

9 **Q** Mr. Rushton, just to be sure: You did file a  
10 lawsuit against Joe Worley and his mother in this  
11 case; is that correct?

12 **A** My attorneys filed one on my behalf, yes.

13 **Q** And that was done after this night?

14 **A** Yes.

15 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you.

16 No further questions.

17 **THE COURT:** Any redirect?

18 **MR. MYERS:** No redirect, Your Honor.

19 **THE COURT:** Thank you, sir. You may step down.

20 Would you call your next witness, please?

21 ALAN SHEFFIELD,

22 having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

23 DIRECT EXAMINATION

24 BY MR. MYERS:

25 **Q** Would you state your name, please?

1       **A**     My name is Alan Sheffield.

2       **Q**     And spell your last name, please.

3       **A**     S-h-e-f-f-i-e-l-d.

4       **Q**     Mr. Sheffield, where do you live?

5       **A**     I live at [REDACTED] Presidents Drive in McCormick in  
6       Little River subdivision.

7       **Q**     And did you live there in 2009?

8       **A**     Yes, I did.

9       **Q**     Now, if I can show you, please, sir, State's  
10      Exhibit Number 4.

11      **A**     Okay.

12      **Q**     Do you recognize that?

13      **A**     Yes.

14      **Q**     I'll put this up there for you so you can see  
15      it.

16             Are you familiar with the Worleys that live out  
17      in that area?

18      **A**     Yes, I am.

19      **Q**     And this is their house right here on this  
20      diagram?

21      **A**     Correct.

22      **Q**     Do you live near them?

23      **A**     Yeah. It would be to the left.

24      **Q**     So you'd be living to the left over here?

25      **A**     Correct.

1           **Q**     Is there another residence over to the right?

2           **A**     Yeah. The Stevens' residence is over there.

3           **Q**     Okay. Now, the Worleys live right there?

4           **A**     Correct.

5           **Q**     Have you ever been inside of their home?

6           **A**     No, sir, I have not.

7           **Q**     Did you know them? Did you know Joe Ross  
8           Worley?

9           **A**     Yes. We -- I met the Worleys first when we  
10          first moved in, I believe, in '06. That would have  
11          been his dad, his mom, and him. But I -- I wouldn't  
12          say that I know him well.

13          **Q**     Did you know his mother? Did you ever have an  
14          occasion to talk with his mother?

15          **A**     Yes, yes. Quite often during the time we lived  
16          there, I think it was after Mr. Worley passed, I  
17          believe in November of -- I think it was November of  
18          '06, she would come over. She'd bring vegetables  
19          from her garden. She actually made me cookies a  
20          couple of times. And I think she even gave my wife  
21          a present, a hat, that she would wear when she was  
22          outside. So, yeah, we -- you know, just talked to  
23          her, neighborhood-type things.

24          **Q**     No ill feelings?

25          **A**     No. No.

1       **Q**     And I think you said not long after y'all moved  
2       in, in '06, Mrs. Worley's husband passed away?

3       **A**     Yes. I believe it was late November, around  
4       Thanksgiving, I believe, in '06.

5       **Q**     Now, do you and your wife, do you live out  
6       there part-time or full-time?

7       **A**     No. We're full-time. We're one of the few  
8       people that are.

9       **Q**     What about the Worleys?

10      **A**     No. They generally visited -- they would  
11      arrive usually Thursday noonish and then leave  
12      Sunday morning around noon also pretty much every  
13      weekend.

14      **Q**     Now, in September of 2009, was there anything  
15      unusual that occurred out there at the Worleys'  
16      residence?

17      **A**     Well, it was unusual in that -- as I said, they  
18      normally go home on Sunday, and they did that. It  
19      was actually Labor Day weekend, and they did go home  
20      on Sunday, but Joe returned by himself either Monday  
21      or Tuesday, which was unusual. Didn't think  
22      anything about it, but I believe it was the -- would  
23      have been early of the 9th -- no, early morning of  
24      the 10th, late on the 9th, we were awakened by what  
25      sounded like a gunshot and went outside and saw that

1 his light was on.

2 Q Now, which light are you talking about that was  
3 on?

4 A There were lights on his back deck there.

5 Q Now, let me ask you a question: Do you call  
6 this {indicating} the back of the house or this the  
7 back of the house?

8 A That would be the back of the house, towards  
9 the lake.

10 Q So you call that the back of the house?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And the light came on out at the part of the  
13 house towards the --

14 A Yes, it was on when I went out to look to see  
15 what was going on.

16 Q Okay. And what did you see was going on?

17 A I just saw the light. Like I said, I heard a  
18 gunshot from what sounded like a high-powered rifle,  
19 which startled the daylights out of me.

20 Q And about what time was this?

21 A About 2:00, 2:30 in the morning.

22 Q Anything accompanying that gunshot? Any other  
23 noise?

24 A He often would sit out and talk to himself, and  
25 I honestly don't recall, at that particular time,

1           whether or not he was doing that. My recollection  
2           is that -- I don't remember exactly.

3           **Q**     Sure. That's fine.

4           **A**     But the light went off after a little while, so  
5           we just kind of -- my wife and I discussed it and  
6           just kind of didn't really know what to do.

7           **Q**     Right.

8           **A**     We tried to go back to sleep. And I'd say  
9           about 20 minutes later, it happened again.

10          **Q**     A second shot?

11          **A**     A second shot, correct.

12          **Q**     And we're talking in September now; right?

13          **A**     Yes, in September, right.

14                 And, you know, the same situation. And, again,  
15                 we really didn't know what to do. It was a -- not  
16                 the kind of thing that we were prepared to deal with  
17                 at that time. And we went -- we tried to go back to  
18                 bed again, and it happened the third time. At that  
19                 time, we were discussing calling the police then.  
20                 And I didn't want to do that because I wanted to try  
21                 -- I knew that Mrs. Worley wasn't there at the time,  
22                 so what I wanted to do was wait and have a chance to  
23                 talk to her to see if I could resolve the situation  
24                 without involving law enforcement.

25                 So we went back to bed after the third one, and

1           that was the extent of the shooting that night. I  
2           didn't get a chance to see Mrs. Worley until Friday.

3           **Q**     Let me ask you this --

4           **A**     Sure.

5           **Q**     -- you said the first shot that night, 20  
6           minutes or so, a second shot?

7           **A**     Uh-huh.

8           **Q**     What was the timeframe between the second  
9           shot --

10          **A**     About the same. It was about three shots in  
11          about an hour.

12          **Q**     Now, you said you didn't call the police that  
13          night. You wanted to kind of resolve it within the  
14          area?

15          **A**     Correct.

16          **Q**     What did you do?

17          **A**     Like I said, I knew Mrs. Worley would probably  
18          be arriving during the weekend, and she did. And I  
19          saw her near their garage on Friday, and I went over  
20          and spoke to her and told her that there had been  
21          some gunshots. And I believe I discussed with her  
22          that, you know, I understood that, you know, I  
23          believe the words I used was Joe is a little  
24          eccentric, you know, the talking at night and all  
25          that kind of thing, but firing, you know,



1 high-powered rifles in the middle of the night was  
2 not acceptable. And we left it at that. I believe  
3 she indicated, you know, she'd find out --

4 **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor.

5 **THE COURT:** Sustained.

6 BY MR. MYERS:

7 **Q** Did you request her to do anything?

8 **A** Yes. I asked her to see if she could, you  
9 know, resolve the situation.

10 **Q** Was the situation resolved?

11 **A** No. Before she left on Sunday, she came over  
12 to our driveway.

13 **Q** That's okay. We'll get into that later on.

14 **A** Okay.

15 **Q** You can't say what she said.

16 **A** Okay. Sorry.

17 **Q** It wasn't resolved?

18 **A** No, it was not.

19 **Q** As a result of it not being resolved, what did  
20 you or your wife do?

21 **A** My wife felt very strongly about it that we  
22 should report the incident at least to get it on  
23 record that it happened, and that was done.

24 **Q** I think that was done on September the 9th,  
25 reported about the shooting?

1           **A**     The shooting was on September --

2           **Q**     The reporting.

3           **A**     Yes, the reporting that September 9th shooting,  
4           correct. Sorry.

5           **Q**     And did y'all request that law enforcement take  
6           any action?

7           **A**     No.

8           **Q**     You just wanted to report it?

9           **A**     Correct. I was still hoping that we'd be able  
10          to resolve it, you know, amongst neighbors.

11          **Q**     Yes, sir.

12                 Now, between September 9th when this was  
13          reported, to make a report with the McCormick County  
14          Sheriff's Department, up until November the 15th,  
15          did anything occur during that timeframe,  
16          September/October up to November 15th?

17          **A**     Yes. Typically, there were very generally a  
18          single gunshot nearly every weekend between  
19          September and November. Usually, it was just one  
20          shot sometime Friday or Saturday, and that was it.

21          **Q**     Were there ever more than one shot?

22          **A**     No.

23          **Q**     What about the talking?

24          **A**     Excuse me?

25          **Q**     What about the talking out there on the porch?

1       **A**     Yes. The talking continued. That was  
2       something that had been going on before the gunshot  
3       started, and that's just one of those things that we  
4       chalked up to, you know, just one of those things  
5       you got to deal with in the neighborhood.

6       **Q**     Now, you said that happened about every  
7       weekend; is that correct?

8       **A**     Yeah. I mean, I wasn't recording every single  
9       time it happened, but it happened on numerous  
10      occasions.

11      **Q**     Was that disturbing to you and your wife?

12      **A**     Extremely. We were struggling to figure out  
13      how to deal with the situation.

14      **Q**     Did you call the law enforcement any more in  
15      September or October?

16      **A**     No.

17      **Q**     Now, that leads us up to November the 15th.  
18      That Saturday night before daylight on Sunday  
19      morning, what happened?

20      **A**     Well, it had been an unusually warm night for  
21      November, so we typically leave the windows open  
22      whenever we can. The windows were open, so was the  
23      sliding glass door under the screen porch where our  
24      bedroom is. And about 3:15 in the morning, we were  
25      awakened by what sounded like a gunshot from a

1 high-powered rifle and noticed that the light,  
2 again, was on.

3 Q Now, you talk about the light being on. Is  
4 that the same light here on the lake side of the  
5 Worley house?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And what accompanied that gunshot at about 3:15  
8 in the morning?

9 A There was the normal, you know, talking. And  
10 we had our normal conversation about, you know,  
11 hopefully this will be the last shot for the night  
12 and we'll go back to sleep, but I would say maybe  
13 20, 30 minutes later -- I don't remember exactly how  
14 long between shots -- we had another one. And we  
15 had more discussion about what to do. And then the  
16 lights went off, and I figured, okay, it's over, you  
17 know, we're done for the night.

18 And maybe 10 or 15 minutes later, the lights  
19 came back on again, and I turned to my wife and  
20 said, I'm not going to wait for the third shot. And  
21 so roughly at four -- it's roughly four o'clock in  
22 the morning is when I called 9-1-1.

23 Q Now, when that light came on there, you said  
24 you weren't going to wait for the third shot, how  
25 much after that did you call the sheriff's

1 department?

2 **A** Oh, probably within five minutes. I mean, it  
3 was a decision -- I made the statement to my wife  
4 that I'm not going to wait for the third shot, you  
5 know, I got dressed, went and got the phone and made  
6 the call.

7 **Q** Do you know if that light was on when you made  
8 the call to the sheriff's department?

9 **A** I believe it was, but before -- before the  
10 deputies arrived, it had -- it went off again.

11 **Q** When you called the sheriff's department -- I  
12 know you can't be exact, but just roughly, how long  
13 did it take for some deputies to respond?

14 **A** It was probably 20, 30 minutes, in that  
15 neighborhood. I believe the officers arrived around  
16 4:30.

17 **Q** And by the time the officers got there, the  
18 light had been turned off?

19 **A** Correct.

20 **Q** Between your call and them arriving, the light  
21 was turned off?

22 **A** Yes, that's correct.

23 **Q** Now, did you see the deputies arrive?

24 **A** Yes. I noticed -- I noticed what appeared to  
25 be three cars. Some of them went into one driveway

1 and some went into Worleys' driveway, because the  
2 two driveways -- the Worleys' driveway and Stevens'  
3 driveway are very close together.

4 **Q** Right over here, there's two driveways right  
5 over here?

6 **A** Yeah, they're very close together.

7 **Q** Could you see if they were in marked cars?

8 **A** No, I couldn't. There's some light out there  
9 from a -- like a street light out near the garage,  
10 but my expectation was they were in marked cars, but  
11 I couldn't see them for sure.

12 **Q** But you knew they were law enforcement?

13 **A** At that point, it was my assumption. I  
14 certainly knew moments later when Officer Rushton  
15 came over to my house.

16 **Q** Okay. Tell us about that. When the officers  
17 got there, who came over to your house?

18 **A** Officer Rushton. About probably a couple of  
19 minutes after they came over, when they first  
20 arrived, we went to the house -- part of the house  
21 closest to that property, kind of our utility room,  
22 and that window was open, so I could see people  
23 walking with flashlights, and I could hear them  
24 identify themselves as sheriff's office or sheriff's  
25 department, something to that effect.

1           **Q**     I'm sorry. Repeat that.

2           **A**     They were identifying themselves as either  
3           sheriff's officers or sheriff's department,  
4           something like that.

5           **Q**     Where were they identifying themselves?

6           **A**     They were at the front of Worley's house, that  
7           I could see.

8           **Q**     And what you call the front, right here, the  
9           lake side?

10          **A**     No, no. The other side where I first saw them.

11          **Q**     And they were identifying even back there?

12          **A**     Yes.

13                 And then I noticed a flashlight coming through  
14           the woods, the short period -- the woods between the  
15           two houses. And I went out into the driveway and  
16           had a talk with Officer Rushton. He asked me about  
17           the complaint, and I filled him in on what the  
18           details were.

19          **Q**     So you gave him the background?

20          **A**     Yes.

21          **Q**     The other two officers, did they come over and  
22           talk with you?

23          **A**     No. They were continuing to identify  
24           themselves while I was talking to Officer Rushton.

25          **Q**     All right. At any time while you were talking

1 with Deputy Rushton, did you see any officer go down  
2 here on the lake side of the house and knock on the  
3 door?

4 **A** I didn't see them, but I could hear them.

5 **Q** What could you hear?

6 **A** I heard them identify themselves as sheriff's  
7 department.

8 **Q** You could hear that?

9 **A** Yes, as I was out in the driveway with Officer  
10 Rushton.

11 **Q** All right, sir.

12 Now, did Deputy Rushton stay over here with you  
13 or did he go somewhere else?

14 **A** We talked for several minutes, giving him the  
15 background, and during that conversation, the porch  
16 light came back on again. And he indicated --

17 **Q** Let me stop you right there. While you were  
18 talking with Deputy Rushton, that light was off when  
19 you first started talking with him?

20 **A** Yes. Yes.

21 **Q** All right. And during the time you were  
22 talking with him, thereafter this light came back  
23 on?

24 **A** Correct.

25 **Q** Did it stay on?



1       **A**     It stayed on for some period of time because  
2       Officer Rushton said that he had to go back to the  
3       scene, and at that point, my wife and I went back  
4       into the house. So there was some period of time,  
5       15, 20 seconds maybe or so, while we were walking  
6       back into the house, that I can't -- I can't see  
7       what's going on over there because I'm going in my  
8       house.

9       **Q**     And where did Deputy Rushton go?

10      **A**     Well, he went straight back across. And after,  
11      you know, where he exactly went, I don't know, until  
12      I got back into the house.

13      **Q**     Could you hear anymore announcement by the  
14      officers over here when Deputy Rushton went back  
15      over there with them?

16      **A**     No, I don't recall that I did. I was back in  
17      the house by that time.

18      **Q**     So that's the time you were going back  
19      inside --

20      **A**     Correct.

21      **Q**     -- and you couldn't tell what was going on back  
22      over there?

23      **A**     Right.

24      **Q**     When you got back in the house, did you have an  
25      occasion to look back over towards the Worleys'

1 residence?

2 **A** Yes, I did. When I got back in, I walked over  
3 to our -- kind of our eating area where I can see  
4 out through the door to our deck, which is pretty  
5 much lined up with the, you know, the back corner of  
6 their house. I can see that corner, about maybe 50  
7 yards.

8 At that point, I remember seeing a light. I  
9 don't remember whether it came on immediately or if  
10 it was already on, but I saw an officer standing  
11 down below this side, the left side of that deck.

12 **Q** Would the officer have been under the porch or  
13 outside the porch?

14 **A** No, no. He was -- he was outside of it,  
15 looking up at the deck.

16 **Q** Outside, looking up at the deck?

17 **A** Correct.

18 **Q** All right, sir.

19 **A** And then I heard another gunshot, and I saw  
20 Officer -- I found out to be Officer Rushton fall  
21 backwards. And then a period of maybe two or three  
22 seconds later, I heard another gunshot, and I saw  
23 Officer Rushton kind of scramble towards the  
24 treeline towards the front of the house.

25 **Q** Treeline around here?

1       **A**     Correct. To take some cover.

2       **Q**     Yes, sir. What else did you observe?

3       **A**     After that, honestly, I retreated further into  
4     my house at that point. I was pretty alarmed at  
5     that point.

6       **Q**     Yes, sir. The last time you saw the officers,  
7     you said were back over near this treeline?

8       **A**     Yeah, where I saw Officer Rushton, correct.

9       **Q**     In which direction were they headed?

10      **A**     They were heading towards the front, towards  
11     the street.

12      **Q**     Towards the street?

13      **A**     Correct.

14      **Q**     Now, when you get back around in this area  
15     here, is there any type of lighting right along in  
16     there?

17      **A**     Yes. There's a street light, kind of a light  
18     on a pole that comes on at night. It's on a timer  
19     or something.

20      **Q**     Does it light up this back area back here?

21      **A**     Yeah, pretty good.

22      **Q**     What did you do after you saw Deputy Rushton  
23     get shot, then going down the treeline and headed  
24     back towards the street?

25      **A**     Like I said, I retreated to the end of the

1 house, then I realized my garage door open was still  
2 open -- my garage was still open, and I immediately  
3 went out and closed it. And I believe we turned off  
4 some of the lights. We just wanted to stay out of  
5 the way.

6 **Q** Yes, sir.

7 Now, could you clearly hear the officers over  
8 here? And the door right here is on the lake side  
9 of the house into the Worley residence, isn't that  
10 right, down at the bottom?

11 **A** I don't know. I've never been back there.

12 **Q** Well, in this vicinity, could you clearly hear  
13 from your house them knocking and announcing,  
14 Sheriff's department, sheriff's department?

15 **A** I could hear them -- when I was outside with  
16 Officer Rushton and even before, because I was  
17 standing near the end of the house with my windows  
18 open, I could hear them identifying themselves, and  
19 I could hear knocking.

20 **Q** Even while you were inside your house?

21 **A** Yes, because I was at the end of the house  
22 where I was closest to their property and my window  
23 was opened.

24 **Q** Now, did you and your wife call anybody or make  
25 any calls or do anything or you just waited to see

1           what was going to happen?

2           **A**     No.  Actually, I received a call from I believe  
3           it was the 9-1-1 operator probably two, three, four  
4           minutes after Officer Rushton was shot, asking me  
5           what was going on.  And I told them that an officer  
6           had been shot and that's all I knew.

7                     Some time, I believe after that phone call, I  
8           noticed that one of the cars -- at least one of the  
9           cars left, and I was assuming that they were getting  
10          the injured officer out of the area.

11          **Q**     Later on, did you see some other law  
12          enforcement officials come back out?

13          **A**     Yeah, we did.  I would say it was probably  
14          maybe 20 minutes after the -- after the police car  
15          had left with Officer Rushton, more police cars came  
16          to the top of the street.  I don't remember --

17          **Q**     The street here?

18          **A**     Yes.

19                     I don't remember if any of them actually went  
20          in the driveway or not.

21          **Q**     Yes, sir.

22          **A**     But, yeah, other officers arrived.

23          **Q**     And you and your wife never left your house  
24          after the shooting, is that correct, until the  
25          police officers later got on there?

1       **A**       That's correct. At some point later, I believe  
2       it was either a SLED officer or South Carolina  
3       patrol, I'm not sure, an officer came into our  
4       driveway. This was after dawn, after it had become  
5       light. There had been a lot of people over there in  
6       the backyard scouring for evidence, I guess. Anyway  
7       -- but somebody came over and we went out and talked  
8       to them, and he told us, you know, that Officer  
9       Rushton had been shot --

10       **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor.

11       **THE COURT:** Don't say what he told you, please.

12       **THE WITNESS:** Okay. Sorry.

13       **THE COURT:** I sustain the objection.

14       BY MR. MYERS:

15       **Q**       He told you what had happened?

16       **A**       Correct. He just gave us an update.

17       **MR. MYERS:** If you would answer any questions  
18       they have, Mr. Sheffield. Thank you so much.

19       **THE COURT:** Cross-examination?

20                   CROSS-EXAMINATION

21       BY MR. GARRETT:

22       **Q**       Thank you, Mr. Sheffield.

23               Can you tell us about this cat named Sweet Pea?

24       **A**       Yeah. They had a cat named Sweet Pea.

25       **Q**       Okay. And are you familiar with how they found

1 Sweet Pea and what they did to try to bring Sweet  
2 Pea to good health?

3 **A** No.

4 **Q** Okay. Are you aware that they were having  
5 trouble with some varmint or something down there  
6 trying to hurt Sweet Pea?

7 **A** No, sir.

8 **Q** You never -- you never knew anything about  
9 that?

10 **A** I knew that Sweet -- the cat had been -- had  
11 been injured. I have no knowledge of how or why.

12 **Q** Okay. And were you aware that there was a fox  
13 in your area?

14 **A** I had seen foxes in the area, yes.

15 **Q** Okay. And foxes usually come out around in the  
16 fall of the year?

17 **A** I guess. Okay. I don't know.

18 **Q** Okay. All right. And did you recall ever  
19 telling Ms. Worley about the fox?

20 **A** No. I do not recall any conversation about a  
21 fox.

22 **Q** Okay. In September when you heard shots fired,  
23 you said it concerned you, but you didn't feel it  
24 necessary, at least at that point, to call the law  
25 out to the scene because you wanted to try to take

1 care of it yourself?

2 **A** Correct.

3 **Q** There's a lot of people that shoot at and  
4 around that lake area, don't they?

5 **A** I've heard gunshots before, correct; generally  
6 not in the middle of the night.

7 **Q** Okay. And on this particular time in  
8 September, you're not really sure it was Joe that  
9 was shooting particularly that night?

10 **A** I did not see him directly, no, but there was  
11 no one else at residence at that time, and the  
12 lights were on. It was obviously very close. The  
13 sound of a high-powered rifle that close, you...

14 **Q** In your statements to the government or to  
15 dispatch, you said what sounded like gunshot?

16 **A** Correct.

17 **Q** Okay. Now, after you had made your -- or your  
18 wife, it sounds like, went down and wrote out a  
19 report about it; is that correct?

20 **A** Correct.

21 **Q** Okay. You never approached Joe yourself to  
22 talk to him about it?

23 **A** No. I didn't feel that --

24 **Q** That's fine. You never --

25 **MR. MYERS:** No, no, no, no. Let him answer.



1           **THE COURT:** Go ahead and finish your  
2 explanation.

3           **THE WITNESS:** I didn't feel comfortable  
4 approaching Joe directly. I didn't think he would  
5 take that conversation well.

6 BY MR. GARRETT:

7       **Q**     You'd never had any problems with Joe or his  
8 family all the years you were there from 2006 on,  
9 had you?

10       **A**     Not until these incidents, no.

11       **Q**     Okay. So, in 2006, you heard two gunshots or  
12 three gunshots in September of 2006?

13       **A**     No, 2009.

14       **Q**     I'm sorry. 2009. Okay.

15               September of 2009, you heard three gunshots,  
16 thought it would be good to talk to Mary about it,  
17 Ms. Worley about it. And do you have any knowledge  
18 as to whether or not Mary actually told Joe?

19           **MR. MYERS:** I'm sorry. I didn't hear the  
20 question, Your Honor. I apologize.

21           **THE COURT:** The question was whether or not he  
22 had knowledge of whether Ms. Worley told the  
23 defendant about the conversation.

24           **MR. MYERS:** I don't have any objection to what  
25 -- he had a conversation with Ms. Worley. I have no

1 objection.

2 **THE COURT:** The question was whether Ms. Worley  
3 -- he knew about Ms. Worley having a conversation  
4 with the defendant. Is that right?

5 **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

6 **THE WITNESS:** Based on a conversation that I  
7 had with her later?

8 **MR. GARRETT:** No.

9 **MR. MYERS:** No, no. That's what he asked you,  
10 whether he knows Ms. Worley talked with Joe. How  
11 could he know that unless he talked with Ms. Worley?  
12 Now, he asked the question; I didn't object.

13 **MR. GARRETT:** I'll rephrase.

14 **MR. MYERS:** No, I want his answer. He asked  
15 the question.

16 **THE COURT:** No. He withdrew the question.

17 BY MR. GARRETT:

18 **Q** Now, on the night in question, each time that  
19 you heard shots fired and even back into September  
20 of '09 when you saw shots fired or heard shots  
21 fired, the light was on, wasn't it?

22 **A** Yes.

23 **Q** Okay. And then on the night in question, you  
24 don't know whether the light was on until Rushton  
25 was shot because you were in the house? Is that

1           what you're telling me?

2           **A**     Are we talking about the -- when the officer  
3           was shot or the shots prior?

4           **Q**     The shots prior, the lights were on?

5           **A**     Correct.

6           **Q**     Okay. Now, I want to move down to where the  
7           officer gets shot.

8           **A**     Correct.

9           **Q**     Was the light on when the officer got shot?

10          **A**     Absolutely.

11          **Q**     Had it been on?

12          **A**     I don't know.

13          **Q**     Okay. Because you were back in the house?

14          **A**     I was walking into the house. I turned around  
15          and it all happened very quickly.

16          **Q**     And there's a wooded area between the two  
17          houses. It's about 137 feet; is that a fair --

18          **A**     Yes, that's fair.

19          **Q**     That's fair.

20                 And your windows were open, as I understand it;  
21          is that correct?

22          **A**     Correct.

23          **Q**     And do you know whether or not Joe and those  
24          had their air conditioning on or not?

25          **A**     I don't.

1       **Q**     Okay.  It's a rather loud air conditioner that  
2       sits between the house?

3       **A**     True.

4       **Q**     Right in this -- it's not drawn in here, but  
5       actually, it's right over in here.

6       **A**     Yeah, that's about right.

7       **Q**     But you were able to hear them announcing?

8       **A**     I was standing at the edge of my house closest  
9       to their property, so, yes, I was.

10      **Q**     Okay.  And you said you'd never been into the  
11      Worley home?

12      **A**     No, I have not.

13      **Q**     You don't know how well it's insulated?

14      **A**     I would have no knowledge of that.

15      **Q**     Do you have any knowledge as to whether any of  
16      his windows were open?

17      **A**     No, I have no idea.

18      **Q**     When Solicitor Myers was asking you about the  
19      other officers while Rushton was over talking to  
20      you, they were announcing, you said, towards the  
21      front of -- that would be the front of the house?

22      **A**     That's where I first saw them.

23      **Q**     You saw them.  And they were announcing right  
24      in here?

25      **A**     That's what it sounded like to me, but they

1 weren't within my sight the whole time, because I  
2 was -- I was talking to Officer Rushton.

3 **Q** Right. I understand there's some woods between  
4 there.

5 **A** Thin, yeah.

6 **Q** Between you and where they were --

7 **A** Sure.

8 **Q** -- supposedly?

9 **A** Yes.

10 **MR. GARRETT:** No further questions.

11 **MR. MYERS:** No further questions.

12 **THE COURT:** May this witness be excused?

13 **MR. GARRETT:** He may.

14 **THE COURT:** Thank you, sir. You're excused.

15 **MR. MAYE:** The State would call Investigator  
16 Joe Collier.

17 JOSEPH E. COLLIER, JR.,

18 having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

19 DIRECT EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. MAYE:

21 **Q** Investigator Collier, if you would, just state  
22 your name for the record.

23 **A** Joseph E. Collier, Jr.

24 **Q** Investigator Collier, tell the ladies and  
25 gentlemen of the jury where you're from.

1       **A**     I was born and raised in Plum Branch, right  
2       here in McCormick County.

3       **Q**     What was your first real career that took you  
4       away from McCormick and what did you do initially  
5       and how did you make your way into law enforcement?

6       **A**     Spent six years in the United States Navy on  
7       active duty, four in the Reserves -- both active and  
8       inactive Reserves -- where I specialized in  
9       electronic signals intelligence.

10           After I came back, I worked for the McCormick  
11       Police Department for a few months and eventually  
12       went to the sheriff's department, I believe, in  
13       February of '93.

14       **Q**     February of 1993. You've worn many hats at the  
15       sheriff's department, have you not?

16       **A**     Yes, sir. Still do.

17       **Q**     Okay. I believe you were in narcotics for many  
18       years; is that correct?

19       **A**     Yes, sir. I worked on the narcotics task force  
20       with Saluda and Edgefield from 1997 to 2001. At the  
21       sheriff's department, I serve as a training officer.  
22       I'm in charge of narcotics and special projects and  
23       special operations.

24       **Q**     Okay. Investigator Collier, during the time  
25       that you've been employed at the sheriff's

1 department, you have had a wide variety of  
2 specialized training; is that correct?

3 **A** Yes, sir.

4 **Q** Okay. Let's talk about your specialized  
5 training in the area of small arms and ammunition  
6 and the firearms that are associated with being used  
7 by the department and the ones that y'all encounter  
8 in your work as law enforcement officers.

9 Tell us a little bit about the specialized  
10 training that you've had in that area.

11 **A** Okay. In 1995, I believe it was, I was  
12 certified by the Criminal Justice Academy as a law  
13 enforcement firearms instructor and have been  
14 continuously certified since that time.

15 In 2001, I was certified by Blackwater  
16 International as a technical carbine instructor,  
17 which is M16, M4s, that type of weapon.

18 Later on, I was certified in 2004, I believe,  
19 by the National Rifle Association Law Enforcement  
20 Division as a law enforcement firearms instructor in  
21 handgun, shotgun, and tactical carbine, or patrol  
22 rifle, I believe they call it.

23 I've been certified by Glock as a Glock  
24 armorer, also, as a Glock instructor, and I believe  
25 that's -- that's typically pretty much all the

1 firearms training that I've had.

2 I've done some tactical training. I'm an ALERT  
3 instructor, which is Advanced Law Enforcement Rapid  
4 Response Training, which is active shooter training.  
5 And also, I've had some tactical narcotics training,  
6 which is firearms related, through the South  
7 Carolina Criminal Justice Academy, the New Jersey  
8 State Police Academy up in Sea Girt, New Jersey.

9 **Q** Now, you take care of the -- qualifying people  
10 and training people and certifying officers far and  
11 wide, not just in McCormick Sheriff's Department,  
12 but you take care of that for a wide number of  
13 agencies? They came to you as the fall; is that  
14 correct?

15 **A** Yes, sir, they do. I train all of the  
16 investigators for the Eleventh Circuit Solicitor's  
17 Office, the investigators and the director for the  
18 South Carolina Ethics Commission, various  
19 departments. I've done North Augusta. I've helped  
20 Edgefield, helped Saluda, I've done McCormick PD,  
21 and I also do McCormick County.

22 **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, at this time, I'm going  
23 to ask that Investigator Collier -- I'm going to  
24 offer him as an expert in the area of small arms and  
25 ammunition, in addition to the testimony that he's



1 going to give as a witness in this case, subject to  
2 any cross-examination by the defense as to his  
3 qualifications as an expert in small arms and  
4 ammunition.

5 **THE COURT:** Any voir dire?

6 **MR. GARRETT:** None, Your Honor.

7 **THE COURT:** Do you stipulate to his expertise?

8 **MR. GARRETT:** We do.

9 **THE COURT:** Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, I  
10 remind you about the expert witness. The  
11 explanation I gave you yesterday would equally apply  
12 to this witness.

13 Okay. Go ahead.

14 BY MR. MAYE:

15 **Q** Investigator Collier, let me first ask you --  
16 we'll get to the firearms expertise later, but let  
17 me first ask you: In participating in the  
18 investigation of this case, did you have an occasion  
19 to go out to the scene and perform a variety of  
20 measurements in this case?

21 **A** Yes, sir, I did. I believe it was in 2011.

22 **Q** Okay.

23 (State's Exhibit Number 24, measurement  
24 report, marked for identification.)

25 **MR. MAYE:** At this point in time, Your Honor,

1 I'm going to hand Investigator Collier State's  
2 Exhibit 24.

3 **Q** Talk to us a little bit about State's 24 and  
4 you generating that.

5 **A** I accompanied several of our officers, as well  
6 as I believe you were there that day, out to the  
7 Worley residence on May the 13th, 2011, and took a  
8 series of measurements from various locations to  
9 other locations, like from the Sheffields' house to  
10 the Worley residence and other areas. And this is  
11 the report that I generated.

12 **Q** Investigator Collier, I'm going to ask you to  
13 do this, if you will: I'm going to make these two  
14 exhibits, State's 2 and State's 4, available to you,  
15 and the Solicitor's pointer there, if you would talk  
16 to them a little bit about the measurements that you  
17 took there and how they relate to those two  
18 exhibits.

19 **A** This exhibit right here, this is the porch of  
20 the two-story residence, and the lake is actually  
21 down here. You cannot see it on the map here on  
22 this -- on this diagram. But we measured from --

23 **THE COURT:** Just one second. Would you turn  
24 that so this witness in the far corner can see,  
25 please?

1           **MR. MAYE:** Come wherever you need to.

2           **THE WITNESS:** I believe I can do it if I can  
3 stand up, Your Honor, if that's all right.

4           **THE COURT:** Absolutely.

5           **THE WITNESS:** The first measurement was from  
6 the Worley residence, which would have been probably  
7 the porch, the closest thing to the water line, it  
8 was 215 feet. Back in 2011, the water line -- the  
9 lake was down a good bit, so -- but it was 215 feet.

10           The Worley residence to the closest point of  
11 the lake property that belonged to the U.S. Corps of  
12 Engineers, we refer to it as the Corps of Engineers  
13 proclamation boundary, and it's marked clearly all  
14 the way around the lake. At that point, from  
15 probably, again, to the deck here or the porch, that  
16 measurement was 137 feet.

17           The Worley residence, the rear corner back here  
18 to the Sheffield residence, which is not visible on  
19 here, but it's actually up here, that distance was  
20 137 feet to the bottom of the deck on the  
21 Sheffield's residence to the bottom of the steps.  
22 And then we estimated another 10 to 20 feet to the  
23 window at the kitchen sink, which is the closest  
24 window to that residence.

25           The Worley residence to the Stevens' residence,

1       which is also not visible here -- it's visible on  
2       this other one.  Would you like for me to put it up?

3               Okay.  The Worley residence here to the  
4       Stevens' residence, which is over here -- actually  
5       right here, I'm sorry.  It's actually kind of a  
6       octagon-shaped thing.  It's kind of a strange  
7       residence.  But it was 159 feet.

8               And the distance from the back of the Worley  
9       residence here -- or, excuse me, the front of the  
10      Worley residence here to where Deputy Rushton  
11      indicated he was standing when he was shot was 20  
12      feet from the upper deck down to where he was  
13      standing.

14               (Pause.)

15              **MR. MAYE:**  Your Honor, I have one photograph  
16      that I have shared with the defense in this case.  
17      They've indicated they did not have any objection.  
18      By stipulation, we're going to enter it into  
19      evidence.

20              **THE COURT:**  Yes, sir.  Exhibit 25.

21               Did 24 -- it has not been admitted into  
22      evidence yet.  Did you move it into evidence?

23              **MR. MAYE:**  I'm going to do so in just a moment,  
24      Your Honor.  I will offer it next while we're taking  
25      care of that matter.

1 Any objection to that one coming in as well?

2 **MR. GARRETT:** No.

3 **THE COURT:** 24 and 25 come in without  
4 objection.

5 (State's Exhibit Number 24, measurement  
6 report, admitted into evidence, and State's Exhibit  
7 Number 25, photograph, marked and admitted into  
8 evidence.)

9 BY MR. MAYE:

10 **Q** Investigator Collier, I'm going to show you  
11 State's 25. How about tell the ladies and gentlemen  
12 of the jury about that photograph, how it was  
13 generated, and what it depicts.

14 **A** On that same date that we were out there, which  
15 was May the 13th, 2011, this is me standing right  
16 here. This is Chief Deputy Gable up on the deck of  
17 the Worley residence. This is where Officer Rushton  
18 indicated to us that he was standing, and this is  
19 where he indicated Mr. Worley was standing on the  
20 night of November 15th, 2009. And that's the  
21 measurement. It was 20 feet from here to up there.

22 **Q** Okay. And you pulled that with a tape measure?

23 **A** Yes, sir.

24 **Q** Investigator, point out with the pointer, if  
25 you would, on State's 4, show us where that railroad

1 tie is and about where he would have indicated that  
2 he was standing, if you can point it with the  
3 pointer.

4 **A** This is the railroad tie right here. This is,  
5 obviously, the deck, which is covered with the porch  
6 underneath. And it would have been approximately  
7 from right in this area here to over where Deputy  
8 Rushton indicated he was standing.

9 **Q** Okay. Investigator Collier, let me ask you  
10 this: Do you have with you two fired shell casings  
11 that were retrieved from the deck area?

12 **A** I have them in the back back here.

13 **Q** Could I ask somebody to retrieve them for you?

14 **A** Yes, sir. Yes, sir.

15 **Q** Thank you.

16 (Pause.)

17 **MR. GARRETT:** Without objection.

18 **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, I have a bag here marked  
19 Sheriff's Office Item Number 5. There's no  
20 objection, from my understanding, from the defense  
21 that this be entered as a State's Exhibit in this  
22 case.

23 **THE COURT:** No objection, Mr. Garrett?

24 **MR. GARRETT:** No objection, Your Honor.

25 **THE COURT:** Very good. That will be 26.

1 (State's Exhibit Number 26, shell casings,  
2 marked and admitted into evidence.)

3 BY MR. MAYE:

4 **Q** Investigator Collier, show you State's 26.  
5 What are those items in State's 26 that are bagged  
6 up?

7 **A** Two spent .30-06 shell casings. Two fired  
8 .30-06 rounds.

9 **Q** Those were retrieved from the deck area up top?

10 **A** By Sheriff Reid, yes, sir.

11 **Q** Okay. But you took custody of those, and y'all  
12 transferred them on to the South Carolina Law  
13 Enforcement Division for analysis?

14 **A** Yes, sir.

15 **Q** And you did so with all of the fired shell  
16 casings?

17 **A** Yes, sir.

18 **Q** And were transferred to Agent Whitler  
19 ultimately to be analyzed?

20 **A** I transferred them to Evidence, and then they  
21 ultimately went to him, yes, sir.

22 **Q** Okay. Investigator Collier, I'm going to show  
23 you at this point in time what's marked State's  
24 Exhibit 3. And I want you to change gears to the  
25 firearms expertise, small arms and ammunition.

1           Explain to the ladies and gentlemen of the jury  
2       what those items are and how they function. And  
3       let's talk to them a little bit about this Remington  
4       742 rifle that's already into evidence in this case.

5           Investigator Collier, what type of rifle is  
6       this? How does it function? Is it a bolt action, a  
7       semiautomatic? What does that mean?

8       **A**     It's a semiautomatic. It chambers a round  
9       automatically after a round is fired.

10      **Q**     Okay. As to the big black box there that's in  
11      exhibit -- what's that exhibit number?

12      **A**     Exhibit 3.

13      **Q**     Okay. What is the box magazine? What does  
14      that do and how does it function? And I'm going to  
15      hand you this rifle here.

16      **A**     This holds the additional rounds. It holds  
17      four rounds when it's totally -- totally full. The  
18      magazine would actually go into this area, the well  
19      of the gun, and then you can load -- if the gun were  
20      fully loaded, you could chamber a round, take the  
21      magazine out, put one more round into it so you  
22      could have five in the gun. You would have one  
23      inside the chamber and four in the magazine.

24      **Q**     And based on your training and experience, for  
25      example, with law enforcement, typically with a



1 Glock or anything -- a Glock has a stick magazine  
2 that would have gone in the butt of what's State's  
3 7, this weapon. It would have a magazine that  
4 sticks in here; right?

5 **A** Yes, sir.

6 **Q** Typically, law enforcement officers or anybody  
7 with a weapon like this that wants to have the  
8 maximum number of rounds available for their use,  
9 you put the mag in, load it with four, you charge  
10 it; with a Glock, you pull the slide. With that 742  
11 semiautomatic, you pull the bolt back, you strip it,  
12 you drop the box/magazine out. You take another  
13 round -- usually with a rifle, you'd have to put it  
14 down -- load that magazine with an additional round  
15 and put the mag back up there. Four in the mag, one  
16 in the chamber; correct?

17 **A** Yes, sir.

18 **Q** No way to get any more rounds --

19 **A** No, sir.

20 **Q** -- in that weapon?

21 **A** No, sir, not with this magazine.

22 **Q** I'm talking about the 742 rifle.

23 **A** No, sir. No, sir. No, sir.

24 **Q** Okay. All right. So can't hold any more than  
25 five; correct?

1       **A**     No, sir.

2       **Q**     Under any circumstances.

3             So that weapon -- let's talk about the rounds  
4     that it chambers. Let's talk about the power of the  
5     rounds in this case. Let's talk about a .30-06  
6     ammunition.

7             What are we talking about in regard -- I know  
8     that they say that there's low-powered rounds,  
9     high-powered rounds, low velocity, high velocity.  
10    Where in the family does that .30-06 fall?

11    **A**     A .30-06 is a very powerful round. It's  
12    probably the most popular hunting cartridge that  
13    there is available because of the myriad of various  
14    rounds that you can get. You can get heavy bullet  
15    weight. You can get light bullet weights. And it's  
16    used for everything from deer, people have actually  
17    taken Cape buffalo, and there are even some  
18    instances where elephants have been killed, not  
19    necessarily the elephant gun of choice, but it has  
20    that capability.

21    **Q**     You can kill anything in North America that  
22    walks on feet with a .30-06?

23    **A**     Yes, sir.

24    **Q**     It is an extremely high-powered hunting round  
25    or otherwise? The M1 Garand in World War II

1       chambered a .30-06; is that correct?

2       **A**     That's correct.

3       **Q**     It's a high-powered round. All right.

4             Investigator Collier, I would like for you, if  
5       you would -- at this point in time, I know it's  
6       sealed up. Why don't you open that bag and let's  
7       take out one of those rounds out of there.

8       **A**     (Witness complies.)

9       **Q**     Investigator Collier, if you'd hand me this.  
10      You have looked at this round in this case, and the  
11      unfired round -- this is a bullet that's got powder,  
12      primer, it's intact. This is a live bullet,  
13      unfired?

14      **A**     Yes, sir.

15      **Q**     I mean, the empties that you've got there have  
16      been fired. The firing pin struck the primer, it's  
17      ignited the powder, the gun's gone off. Those are  
18      empties that got chucked out of a gun; correct?

19      **A**     That's correct.

20      **Q**     Okay. Take a good look at that. I want you to  
21      tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury, is there  
22      anything unusual about that round, the bullet,  
23      within specificity, that's in the end of that  
24      cartridge?

25      **A**     The bullet has actually been altered and

1 appears to have what looks like a steel rod of some  
2 type inserted into it and sharpened.

3 **Q** How long have you been around firearms and been  
4 involved with firearms?

5 **A** I grew up hunting, my dad and I. I was hunting  
6 when I was five or six years old.

7 **Q** Have you ever encountered a homemade  
8 modification to a round like that?

9 **A** No, sir. I have never seen anything like this.

10 **Q** Okay. Let's talk about hunting rounds or  
11 standard hunting rounds. Let's talk about the  
12 various types of bullets that you would normally  
13 have. Let's talk about, for example, a full metal  
14 jacket bullet versus a hollow-point bullet. What is  
15 that? Tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury a  
16 little bit about that.

17 **A** A hollow-point would be a defensive round for a  
18 handgun and also a very good hunting round because  
19 the bullet expands rapidly and creates a wider wound  
20 channel. That's the whole design of it.

21 Now, being a hollow-point, there's some drag on  
22 the bullet when the bullet's fired so it slows the  
23 velocity down somewhat. But it's a very good  
24 hunting round and it's a very good defensive round  
25 if you're using it for a handgun.

1           A steel jacketed or a jacketed -- full metal  
2       jacket would be something that would be used for  
3       penetrating a hardened barrier, some type of hard  
4       surface, not typically a good hunting round because  
5       it does not create a significant wound channel.

6       **Q**     Okay. The hollow-point round gets that classic  
7       mushroom shape when it strikes something. It makes  
8       a big ol' channel when it goes through soft tissue  
9       or an animal. It makes them bleed out faster. It  
10      increases the lethality --

11           **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor; leading.

12           **THE COURT:** Sustained.

13           **THE WITNESS:** The hollow --

14           **THE COURT:** Don't answer that question.

15           Rephrase your question.

16           **MR. MAYE:** I'm sorry, Your Honor.

17       BY MR. MAYE:

18       **Q**     What is the difference with the hollow-point  
19       ammo bullet and a jacketed bullet in regard to  
20       lethality?

21       **A**     The hollow-point would typically -- is designed  
22       by a design to expand more rapidly. It creates --  
23       when it expands more rapidly, there's a faster  
24       transfer of energy. It's more substantial. It  
25       creates a larger wound channel, obviously, so that

1       if you're hunting, the animal would bleed out more  
2       quickly, and, thus, incapacitate the animal quicker.

3       **Q**     What happens when you take a round such as that  
4       and modify it in the fashion that that has been  
5       modified? What happens when you do that?

6       **A**     This round, with a steel rod or pin inserted,  
7       would be designed to penetrate some type of hard  
8       barrier. It could be light armor. It could be body  
9       armor. It could be the thin skin of a vehicle or  
10      the skin of a vehicle. I mean, it could be numerous  
11      things.

12             But, ballistically, it -- I'm not sure by  
13      design what it would be ballistically because it  
14      would go against everything that the bullet was  
15      designed for initially. There's a lot of weight  
16      forward in this round that there would not normally  
17      be, so that's going to cause -- up close it's not  
18      going to cause anything seriously, but a long ways  
19      away, this bullet may be tumbling, it may be  
20      flipping or whatever.

21             So I think, ballistically, inserting this is  
22      going to mess up the bullet by design. I mean, I  
23      don't know. I don't really understand why it was  
24      done from that standpoint.

25      **Q**     So if one were to use this for a hunting round

1 in this case, have you destroyed its functionality  
2 to use as a hunting round?

3 **A** I would think that hunting normally with a  
4 .30-06 is done at a relatively good range, 100  
5 yards, 150 yards, and that's a standard range for  
6 deer hunting in our area with a high-powered rifle.  
7 Your accuracy would be probably nonexistent. Now,  
8 up close, it would not be noticeable.

9 **Q** Let's talk about balance. And could you tell  
10 me something -- for example, compare it to something  
11 that somebody would know: A tire. What would that  
12 do?

13 **A** If you've ever had the tires balanced on your  
14 vehicle or thrown a weight, like most of us have on  
15 our vehicle, at slow speeds, there's no vibration in  
16 your tires. At higher speeds, you'll notice a  
17 vibration, and you'll feel the steering wheel doing  
18 that {indicating}. As a matter of fact, I've got  
19 one on my vehicle that needs to be balanced now, and  
20 you made me think of it.

21 That would be doing something similar because  
22 you're talking about, on a vehicle, the wheels not  
23 turning that often. You're talking about something  
24 that's probably going 2500 feet per second here, and  
25 that bullet is spinning because the rifling inside

1 the barrel of the gun is designed to impart a spin  
2 on the bullet when it's fired to enhance accuracy.

3 So from an accuracy standpoint, I would think  
4 it would be horrible.

5 **Q** So you've got a round, at any distance, it's  
6 going to go haywire?

7 **A** I would think probably anything -- just  
8 guessing -- probably past 25 or 50 yards accuracy  
9 would be nonexistent.

10 **Q** So you've got a round that's modified to  
11 penetrate a hardened surface only at a very close  
12 range?

13 **A** I would think so, because typically a steel  
14 cored bullet is a -- a referred to as an  
15 armored-piercing bullet or a -- it is designed  
16 simply to penetrate a hardened barrier, be the  
17 barrier what it may.

18 **Q** Okay. So I would ask you, to a reasonable  
19 degree of professional certainty, what is your  
20 opinion as to the purpose of the modification that's  
21 done to that bullet?

22 **A** It has been modified, again, to more -- to  
23 penetrate a barrier or -- and when I say hardened  
24 barrier, it can be anything. It can be thin armor.  
25 It can be body armor. It can be metal. It can be



1       very thick wood.

2               The thing that you wonder about is with the  
3       balance and everything on it, you know, what kind of  
4       effect it would have, because the bullet is not  
5       going to be stable in flight. So it can create  
6       probably a horrific wound particularly at close  
7       range.

8       **Q**     And, again, you've never seen anybody modify  
9       anything like that?

10      **A**     No, sir. I've never seen this done. And this  
11      is actually the first time I've ever held the bullet  
12      in my hand. It was in sealed plastic. And I had --  
13      this is the first time I could ever feel the weight.

14      **Q**     Okay. Let's talk to us about how that round or  
15      that bullet has been sharpened at the tip. What can  
16      you tell from your analysis in looking at it?

17      **A**     Well, apparently, the -- if you look at it  
18      close -- and I have not taken it apart -- but if you  
19      look at it close, the rod -- I'm not sure how it was  
20      sharpened. It almost looks like a nailhead like a  
21      nail -- a large nail that you would buy to nail a  
22      2x4 together, but it almost looks like that, and  
23      it's been sharpened. You know, it's just basically  
24      like driving a nail into something. That's an  
25      analogy, the only thing that I can think of.

1       **Q**     Now, Investigator Collier, it would take  
2       considerable skill and expertise to do this, to  
3       manufacture this, would it not?

4       **A**     I would think so. And to -- with any  
5       uniformity, you would have to have some skills.

6               **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, I object. The  
7       foundation is is that he has not actually taken one  
8       of these apart to see how it was built or whatever.  
9       So I would object that a foundation has not been  
10      properly laid.

11             **THE COURT:** Overruled.

12      BY MR. MAYE:

13      **Q**     Is there a pretty good degree -- look at each  
14      one of those rounds -- a pretty good degree of  
15      uniformity to all of them?

16      **A**     There is. It's -- some type of machining  
17      device was used. I'm not sure exactly how, but it's  
18      almost perfectly centered. I mean, with the naked  
19      eye, you can't tell exactly whether it's perfectly  
20      centered, but I mean, it appears to be. You can  
21      stand them up. They're all pretty much uniform in  
22      length and size.

23      **Q**     Okay. Investigator Collier, what would be the  
24      danger of modifying those as they are? Because the  
25      bullet, as it comes intact, is all assembled.

1       You've obviously got to drill out the inside of this  
2       bullet, do you not?

3               **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor; leading.

4               **THE COURT:** Rephrase it.

5               **MR. MAYE:** And, Your Honor, I thought that I  
6       did have leeway with an expert witness to ask  
7       leading questions, again, respectfully.

8               **THE COURT:** No, sir.

9               **MR. MAYE:** Thank you.

10       BY MR. MAYE:

11       **Q**     How would one manufacture that as opposed --  
12       when it's a assembled round? What's the danger of  
13       that?

14       **A**     Well, obviously, when you drill anything, you  
15       create heat by friction. Now, if it were drilled  
16       with the bullet intact in the round, you have powder  
17       back here. It's gunpowder. That's what it is. So  
18       we refer to it as cooking off a round. There's  
19       always the possibility that heat would -- it would  
20       generate a high enough heat to cook that powder off,  
21       thus causing the round to fire or explode.

22               You would have to chuck it in some type of  
23       device. Of course, there are devices made with  
24       rubber chucks and everything, or you could remove  
25       the bullet, insert it, and then put the bullet back

1       into the casing, which would obviously be the safest  
2       way to do it if you're going to modify it.

3       **Q**     Okay. Quite obviously, it was modified in some  
4       uniform fashion --

5       **A**     Yes, sir.

6       **Q**     -- all of them.

7       **A**     Yes, sir. All four were.

8       **Q**     Okay. Maximum number of rounds that can be  
9       chambered in that weapon, the 742?

10      **A**     With a full load, it would be one in the  
11      chamber and four in the magazine.

12      **Q**     So if someone fired two and that rifle was  
13      later discovered to have four rounds still in it,  
14      that would mean somebody had to reload it; correct?

15      **A**     Yes, sir, definitely.

16      **Q**     At least one round would have had to have been  
17      added to it after it was fired twice?

18      **A**     Yes, sir.

19      **Q**     All right. Investigator Collier, let's talk  
20      about certification. Do you help the sheriff's  
21      office keep the officers, basically, certified and  
22      trained? Is that part of your responsibility in  
23      this case?

24      **A**     Yes, sir. That's my total responsibility.

25      **Q**     Okay. Was Bobby Rushton -- had you taken care

1 of all those details to him or in regard to his  
2 certification and training when he came back on  
3 duty?

4 **A** Yes, sir.

5 **Q** Was he, in fact, a certified officer and  
6 trained appropriately in this case?

7 **A** Yes, sir.

8 **Q** Okay. What steps did you take, once he  
9 returned, in order to ensure that he was straight  
10 with the South Carolina Law Enforcement Academy and  
11 any training or certification that was necessary?  
12 What did you do in order to ensure that he was  
13 straight when he came back?

14 **A** Bobby had been gone for four years. I believe  
15 he left in 2005. He was working for us when he  
16 left.

17 He left in 2005 and he came back in 2009. That  
18 was a four-year period. Typically, the Criminal  
19 Justice Academy does not allow you to -- if you've  
20 been out of law enforcement over three years, they  
21 typically will not allow you to come back as a  
22 certified law enforcement officer without completing  
23 the academy again.

24 He was working for a company at the time called  
25 DynCorp International, which was working for the

1 State Department teaching, I believe, Iraqi police  
2 officers under contract. The South Carolina  
3 Criminal Justice Academy at the time treated DynCorp  
4 -- people who were working for DynCorp as military  
5 time. So they did not pull their certification;  
6 they froze their certification.

7 **Q** And you checked on all this, did you not?

8 **A** Yes, sir. I talked many times with the  
9 Criminal Justice Academy. I actually told Bobby  
10 when he came back that I figured he would have to go  
11 back through the academy. And after talking to the  
12 academy on numerous occasions, they advised me that  
13 he could take all of his legal updates -- because  
14 the State requires us once a year to do a two-hour  
15 legal update. Statutory law requires us to do a CDV  
16 or criminal domestic violence update once a year of  
17 four hours.

18 They told me that we could get all of his CDVs  
19 that he had missed from 2005 until he came back,  
20 that we could get all of them and show them to him  
21 and get him caught up, and they would unfreeze --  
22 basically unfreeze his certification.

23 Now, certification within South Carolina goes  
24 for a three-year cycle, and we call it an  
25 anniversary date. The day you graduate from the

1 Criminal Justice Academy is your initial anniversary  
2 date. His, I believe, was June the 26th. And I  
3 don't have those papers in front of me, but what it  
4 would work, like, if he -- 2001 to 2004, 2004 to  
5 2007, 2007 to 2010, 2010 to 2013. If he were still  
6 working for us, June the 26th of each year, being  
7 his anniversary date, when he came back in 2009, he  
8 was in his 2007 to 2010 cycle.

9 So when we got him caught up from '04 to '07  
10 for the time that he had missed, the academy unfroze  
11 his academy -- or unfroze his certification and  
12 granted his certification back to us. All of his  
13 paperwork was submitted to the academy by me on  
14 11/5/2009.

15 **Q** Okay. So he was straight with all of that?

16 **A** Yes, sir.

17 **Q** Did you have him come back and take an oath  
18 again in this case? Prior to him going out and  
19 working, did he come back and y'all redo the oath  
20 and all?

21 **A** Yes, sir. On November the 2nd, when he came to  
22 work -- he actually started on November the 1st,  
23 which was a Sunday, and obviously, you know, our  
24 county office building and the courthouse and  
25 everything is closed on Sunday.

1           So, on that Monday morning, which was November  
2           the 2nd, he and I came over to the clerk's office.  
3           He was sworn in -- and I normally follow this  
4           routine -- and then I take him to the admin office.  
5           They sign up for their insurance, everything like  
6           that. Then they come back to the department, and we  
7           start whatever we need to do at that time.

8           **Q**     So when he hit the ground and went back out  
9           patrolling for the first time, he was squared away  
10          and good to go?

11          **A**     Yes, sir.

12          **Q**     Okay. Let me ask you this: Let's talk about  
13          the uniforms of the sheriff's office, because that's  
14          one of the things that you help and assist them  
15          with; is that not correct? Purchasing guns,  
16          uniforms, and everything else?

17          **A**     Yes, sir.

18          **Q**     Let's talk about that 5.11 Tactical wear, what  
19          police officers are now wearing in the modern era.  
20          What kind of clothing did Bobby Rushton have on?

21                 **MR. GARRETT:** Leading.

22                 **THE COURT:** Overruled.

23                 Go ahead.

24                 BY MR. MAYE:

25          **Q**     What type of clothing did Bobby Rushton have



1 on?

2 **A** He indicated to me at that time on the day  
3 of --

4 **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor; hearsay.

5 BY MR. MAYE:

6 **Q** Don't go into what he said --

7 **A** Okay.

8 **Q** -- but what you know he was wearing from your  
9 direct experience in this case.

10 **A** Okay. He would wear 5.11 Tactical pants and a  
11 shirt.

12 **Q** Okay. And that is what he had on that night,  
13 the 5.11 Tactical pants and a shirt; correct?

14 **A** I believe so.

15 **Q** Okay. Well, you got those items back  
16 afterwards, and they were subsequently destroyed by  
17 the sheriff's department?

18 **A** No, sir. They were -- no, sir. They were  
19 destroyed by EMS and the hospital. We never got  
20 them back.

21 **Q** Is that accepted -- that 5.11 Tactical wear, is  
22 that accepted clothing for the sheriff's office?

23 **A** Yes, sir.

24 **Q** Okay. Were the other officers wearing similar  
25 clothing or do other officers in the department wear

1 similar clothing such as that?

2 **A** At that time, I believe, in 2009, all the  
3 patrol officers were wearing, I believe, blue pants  
4 and gray shirts, but they were 5.11 or either  
5 Tru-Spec, which are -- BDU pants is the  
6 military-style pants like I have on, the battle  
7 dress utilities.

8 I believe they were blue with a light gray  
9 shirt at that time. We have since switched to tan  
10 and a darker shirt.

11 **Q** Again, it's exactly the same kind of clothing;  
12 it's just a different color?

13 **A** Just a different color, yes, sir.

14 **Q** Okay. What happened with the old Barney Fife  
15 polyester uniforms? Do y'all wear those anymore?

16 **A** We haven't had those in a long time. We get a  
17 very limited budget from the county to buy uniforms  
18 with typically three or \$4,000 to outfit 15 people,  
19 plus a reserve -- at the time, we had two reserve  
20 officers; we have one now.

21 The older polyester blend uniforms did not hold  
22 up for us, and they were prohibitively expensive.  
23 We can buy two sets of these for what one of those  
24 cost us. So -- and these are much more -- I don't  
25 know if -- can I stand up?

1           **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

2           **THE WITNESS:** If you look, these have a lot of  
3 pockets and stuff; they carry a lot of gear. And  
4 this is like a ripstop material, so it's much, much  
5 hardier. It holds up much better. And we stomp  
6 around in the woods a lot.

7 BY MR. MAYE:

8           **Q** That type of clothing is used far and wide by  
9 sheriff's departments all over South Carolina, isn't  
10 it?

11          **A** All over the nation.

12          **Q** Is that 5.11 Tactical gear, would you say that  
13 that's the most popular line of clothing in the  
14 entire United States?

15          **A** Probably so, without a doubt.

16          **Q** Okay.

17          **MR. MAYE:** Beg the Court's indulgence.

18                   (Pause.)

19          **MR. MAYE:** Answer any questions the defense has  
20 for you. Thank you, Investigator Collier.

21          **THE COURT:** Madame Forelady, let's go ahead and  
22 take the morning break. If you need anything, let  
23 the bailiffs know, please, ma'am.

24                   (The jury retires to the jury room.)

25          **THE COURT:** All right. Officer, you may not

1 speak with anybody about your testimony during the  
2 break, please, sir.

3 **THE WITNESS:** Yes, sir.

4 **THE COURT:** Thank you. All right. 15 minutes.

5 (Brief recess.)

6 **THE COURT:** Let me ask the attorneys.

7 Stacy, our court reporter, brought to my  
8 attention that Officer Moore's incident report and  
9 narrative were marked as Court's Exhibits, meaning  
10 they will not go back to the jury unless we remark  
11 them as somebody else's exhibits.

12 **MR. MYERS:** You can mark them as State  
13 Exhibits.

14 **THE COURT:** Any objection to that?

15 **MR. GARRETT:** No, Your Honor.

16 **THE COURT:** So I'm going to direct, if you  
17 would, Stacy, to remark those and just number them  
18 in that way.

19 (Court's Exhibit Numbers 3 and 4 were  
20 remarked as State's Exhibit Numbers 27 and 28 and  
21 admitted.)

22 (A brief conversation was held off the  
23 record.)

24 **THE COURT:** Do you agree with that?

25 **MR. GARRETT:** I'm sorry, Your Honor?

1           **THE COURT:** They were just clarifying that it's  
2           3 and 4.

3           **MR. GARRETT:** 3 and 4, yes, now State's  
4           Exhibit.

5           **THE COURT:** Right.  
6           Thank you for bringing that to our attention.  
7           Anything from the State before we get started?

8           **MR. MYERS:** No, sir.

9           **THE COURT:** Anything from the defense?

10          **MR. GARRETT:** No, sir.

11          **MR. MYERS:** Stacy, they're going to be what  
12          now?

13          **COURT REPORTER:** Court's 3, the statement, will  
14          be Number 27 -- State's 27. The incident report,  
15          Court's 4, will be State's 28.

16          **MR. MYERS:** Thank you.

17          **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury in,  
18          please, ma'am -- or sir?

19                   (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

20          **MR. GARRETT:** May it please the Court.

21          **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett.

22          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you.

23                   CROSS-EXAMINATION

24          BY MR. GARRETT:

25          **Q**     I want you to look at State's Exhibit 15. And

1 can you identify what that is?

2 **A** 15 are all of these -- all of these together,  
3 sir?

4 **Q** Yes, sir.

5 **A** These are the eight bags of unfired 40 caliber  
6 rounds that were picked up at the scene out there,  
7 turned over to me by Deputy Nick Moore.

8 **Q** And do you know whereabouts they were located?

9 **A** No. Out there? No, sir.

10 **Q** And those bullets, can you tell us about the  
11 characteristics of those 40 caliber bullets?

12 **A** They are unfired 40 caliber bullets, our  
13 department-issued bullets. It's a Speer Gold Dot,  
14 180 grain hollow point.

15 **Q** It is a hollow point?

16 **A** Yes, sir.

17 **Q** Okay. So it's to do killing up close?

18 **A** It's for damage, yes, sir.

19 **Q** Damage up close?

20 **A** Yes, sir.

21 **Q** Okay. Are those bullets capable of inflicting  
22 imminent death?

23 **A** Yes, sir.

24 **Q** All right. And are those the bullets that  
25 were in -- I'm sorry -- Number 7? Can you identify

1 State's Exhibit Number 7 {sic}?

2 **A** This was Deputy Rushton's Glock Model 23.

3 **Q** All right. And those were the bullets that  
4 were in that gun?

5 **A** These were the bullets that were picked up out  
6 at the residence out there. So I'm assuming they  
7 were the bullets that were in the gun.

8 **Q** That were in the gun?

9 **A** Yes, sir.

10 **Q** Okay. And if those bullets are in that gun  
11 with a clip, is the clip still kind of stuck in  
12 there, or can you tell?

13 **A** The shell of the clip is. The floor plate and  
14 the spring and follower and stuff are gone.

15 **Q** Okay. Were they ever picked up to your  
16 knowledge?

17 **A** Not that I know of.

18 **Q** Okay. And how many of those bullets normally  
19 does that weapon carry?

20 **A** That weapon, fully loaded, with one in the  
21 chamber, will hold 14. It's a 13-round magazine.

22 **Q** And how many of those --

23 **A** There are eight over here.

24 **Q** Eight. So what happened to the remainder of  
25 them?

1       **A**     I don't know.

2       **Q**     All right. Did you conduct any type of testing  
3       at or about this area -- the 20 feet out area that  
4       you were referring to earlier -- did you look with  
5       any type of apparatus to see whether or not you  
6       could find any bullet fragments in or about the  
7       ground where he was at?

8       **A**     No, sir, I did not. It was two -- almost two  
9       years later.

10      **Q**     Okay. But you didn't -- that night, nobody did  
11      that?

12      **A**     I wasn't there. I don't know.

13      **Q**     Okay. And I guess you could do it now,  
14      couldn't you?

15      **A**     I guess so.

16      **Q**     I mean, unless somebody reached down into the  
17      ground and took it out?

18      **A**     I guess so.

19      **Q**     All right. But that hadn't been done?

20      **A**     Not that I know of.

21      **Q**     All right. The -- you can't identify as Joe  
22      being the person who owned those bullets, can you?

23      **A**     No, sir, I cannot.

24      **Q**     And you can't -- you can't say that Joe  
25      prepared those bullets in any way?



1       **A**     No, sir, I can't.

2       **Q**     All right. And let me ask you: Are there any  
3       other reasons that you would change a lead-based  
4       bullet to a steel-based bullet under any  
5       circumstances?

6       **A**     Not a normal hunting bullet, I wouldn't think  
7       that you would put a steel core in it. With shotgun  
8       rounds, it's typically done sometimes.

9       **Q**     And why do we do it with shotgun rounds? Why  
10      do we change it?

11      **A**     With shotgun rounds, they would switch from the  
12      lead to keep from poisoning the waterfowl.

13      **Q**     Okay. And so with ducks and that kind of  
14      thing, when we're hunting ducks and whatnot, we have  
15      to use steel shot. It's against the law for us --

16      **A**     I believe that's federal law.

17      **Q**     Federal law. Right.

18             And then so if someone is an environmentalist  
19      and they decide they want to modify their own .30-06  
20      to be environmental friendly, they can do that?

21      **A**     Yes, sir.

22      **Q**     Nothing against the law about that?

23      **A**     No, sir.

24      **Q**     Okay. And so -- and people do load their own  
25      weapons and they load their own bullets?

1       **A**     Reloading ammo, yes, sir.

2       **Q**     Can you tell me whether or not those shells  
3       were reloads?

4       **A**     I can't tell you, no, sir.

5       **Q**     Can you tell me when those shells were loaded?

6       **A**     When? No, sir, I can't tell you.

7       **Q**     Can you tell me the kind of powder that's in  
8       that bullet?

9       **A**     Not without taking one of them apart.

10      **Q**     All right. And you've not conducted any  
11      experiments on it by taking them apart and looking  
12      at them and see what they're consisted of?

13      **A**     No, sir.

14      **Q**     And really, in order to decide how it's done,  
15      you probably have to take one apart to do it?

16      **A**     Probably all the way to figure it out.

17      **Q**     Okay. And so you don't know whether it was  
18      built from the core, the cylinder itself, up with a  
19      primer, powder, and then, I guess, the bullet  
20      apparatus?

21      **A**     You mean as in reloaded with the bullet put in?  
22      No, sir, I can't tell you.

23      **Q**     Okay. So it might have been done that way?

24      **A**     It could have been.

25      **Q**     So if there's any kind of thing like drilling

1 going on or anything like that, it wouldn't cause it  
2 to blow up?

3 **A** Yes, sir. It could be.

4 **Q** Now, this uniform situation, I understand -- so  
5 McCormick County had a problem with the money, like  
6 all of us, I guess?

7 **A** Yes, sir.

8 **Q** All right. And so one of the reasons that  
9 y'all are having, I guess, a lesser uniform is  
10 because of money?

11 **A** Well, that would be one reason, but it's not a  
12 lesser. This is a more -- more of a  
13 utilitarian-type uniform for us for rural law  
14 enforcement.

15 **Q** Yesterday, I noticed you had something nice  
16 across the back of your shirt, Sheriff?

17 **A** Yes, sir. I have some with sheriff on it.

18 **Q** Okay. And is that a standard issue or do you  
19 want to do that yourself?

20 **A** That's not a standard issue. That was when I  
21 worked on the narcotics task force. We had sheriff  
22 or police on the back of our shirts.

23 **Q** And why do you have police and sheriff on the  
24 back of your shirts?

25 **A** Just makes you easier to identify.

1       **Q**     Okay. And what about arm patches? Do we have  
2       any arm patches?

3       **A**     No, sir, not on polo shirts.

4       **Q**     Okay. And on the night in question, he didn't  
5       have -- Bobby didn't have a sheriff's badge like  
6       that up on the shirt, did he?

7       **A**     Not that I know of, because he had not received  
8       his uniforms at that time.

9       **Q**     And that's what I wanted to ask you about. Why  
10      would we put somebody out in the field that didn't  
11      have the proper uniform?

12      **A**     That's -- we have to order uniforms because  
13      they are custom ordered to fit. So that's not  
14      unusual at all.

15      **Q**     But if we had two weeks of training that you  
16      had to go through to try to get him back up to  
17      snuff, why couldn't we have waited another week or  
18      two until we got the uniform before we put him out  
19      there in the public?

20      **A**     That's not unusual at all. It's no different  
21      than a detective walking around with a badge on his  
22      belt.

23      **Q**     Well, a detective may be different. I mean,  
24      you have a badge up here; right?

25      **A**     Sometimes, yes, sir, I do wear one.

1           **Q**     Ever have a cap that says, Sheriff, across it?

2           **A**     No, sir. We don't issue caps.

3           **Q**     Y'all don't issue those?

4           **A**     No, sir.

5           **Q**     Okay. And what about that coat, that big coat  
6 we saw yesterday? Is that an issued coat?

7           **A**     We do have coats, yes, sir.

8           **Q**     Okay. Do they have a big badge on them?

9           **A**     Most of them do, yes, sir.

10          **Q**     Okay. And what about the vest? Do they have  
11 the sheriff's office on the vest -- tactical vest?

12          **A**     If they have an external carrier, it has  
13 sheriff's department on it. If they wear it  
14 concealed, obviously it doesn't.

15          **Q**     And any other -- do you have any other  
16 apparatus? There was a -- I think it was traffic  
17 piece that you could wear that had sheriff on it  
18 that would illuminate by car light?

19          **A**     We do have some, yes, sir.

20          **Q**     Got some of those?

21          **A**     Yes, sir. Most of those aren't issued. Most  
22 of the people buy those themselves until recently.

23          **Q**     Okay. But with sheriff on it?

24          **A**     Yes, sir.

25          **Q**     You can go to any store and buy it with sheriff

1 on it?

2 **A** You can buy them from Galls or Lawmen's or  
3 anything.

4 **Q** Can I go buy that shirt right there?

5 **A** You're not supposed to be able to.

6 **Q** But we know we can, don't we?

7 **A** Sometimes people do.

8 **Q** Okay. And so anybody can buy that shirt if  
9 they wanted to?

10 **A** Not supposed to be able to, but I, you know,  
11 some people do sell them.

12 **Q** Okay. So somebody could impersonate you by  
13 wearing one of those?

14 **A** Yes, sir. It would be against the law, but  
15 they could do it.

16 **Q** But they could do it. Okay.

17 And if somebody's going to break in on you and  
18 they wanted to impersonate an officer, that could  
19 happen?

20 **A** It could happen, yes, sir.

21 **Q** Do y'all have any black patrol cars back in  
22 2009 with any of your fleet? Were any of your fleet  
23 black?

24 **A** I believe we had maybe two that were black at  
25 that time.

1       **Q**     And do you know what officers were driving the  
2       ones that were black?

3       **A**     It would have been Corporal Crowder and  
4       Corporal Romines. I believe they had those cars at  
5       that time.

6       **Q**     Corporal Crowder, he was -- his name is Manuel  
7       Crowder; is that correct?

8       **A**     Yes, sir.

9       **Q**     And on the night in question, he was the  
10      supervisor on shift, wasn't he?

11      **A**     I don't believe he was working that night.

12      **Q**     He had gotten off earlier?

13      **A**     I could not tell you. I just don't believe --  
14      I don't think he was working that night.

15      **Q**     Who was in charge?

16      **A**     Whoever was working. We don't -- we don't  
17      necessarily have to have a supervisor on duty.

18      **Q**     All right. If you come to a scene, who is in  
19      charge? If you come to a scene, if you've got three  
20      officers, you've got to have some kind of chain of  
21      command, don't you?

22      **A**     Chain of command in a small department is  
23      sometimes nonexistent, but typically, the first  
24      person on the scene will take charge.

25      **Q**     They'll take control of it?

1       **A**     Yes, sir, typically.

2       **Q**     All right. Now, when I asked you by letter and  
3       whatnot as to whether or not -- or what Mr. Rushton  
4       was wearing that night, did you not tell me that he  
5       was not wearing a mic?

6       **A**     By a letter, I don't know. I remember you  
7       can -- I can't remember. I believe I told you that  
8       he was wearing a green shirt and a tan pair of  
9       pants, by what he related to me. I didn't see him.

10      **Q**     Okay. Just glance through that real quick.

11      **A**     Okay.

12      **Q**     Does that refresh your memory --

13      **A**     Yes, sir.

14      **Q**     -- that Bobby was not wearing --

15              **MR. MYERS:** Can we see it, please?

16              **MR. GARRETT:** I don't intend to offer it, Your  
17       Honor. I'm just asking him about it.

18              **MR. MYERS:** Well, he's talking about what's in  
19       there. I want to see it.

20                     (Pause.)

21              **MR. MYERS:** I didn't hear which part of this he  
22       was asking about.

23              **THE COURT:** He was describing -- go ahead and  
24       show him which one.

25              **MR. GARRETT:** All right, sir.



1 (Pause.)

2 **MR. MYERS:** I thought he mentioned 17. I'm  
3 sorry.

4 **THE COURT:** Okay. Go ahead.

5 BY MR. GARRETT:

6 **Q** And now that you've refreshed your  
7 recollection, looking at the letter that you sent  
8 me, you said that he did not have a microphone on  
9 that night?

10 **A** He did not have one. I don't believe he had  
11 one available.

12 **Q** Okay. Is it also true that you have no written  
13 uniform policies and procedures for police  
14 operations in the County of McCormick Sheriff's  
15 Department?

16 **A** We have policies and procedures, but they are  
17 very vague and not really specific as far as  
18 response or anything like that.

19 **Q** So are they in writing somewhere?

20 **A** Yes, sir.

21 **Q** Now, I asked for the -- let me let you read it,  
22 down about policies and procedures.

23 **A** Okay.

24 **Q** So do you have any policies and procedures that  
25 are in writing?

1       **A**     Yes, sir, we do, but we don't have any which  
2       details how an officer should respond to a call when  
3       gunshots have allegedly been fired, which is what  
4       you have asked.

5       **Q**     Okay.

6       **A**     And we also don't have one which mandates or  
7       describes a required dress code or uniform for the  
8       sheriff's department.

9       **Q**     Okay. Thank you for clearing that up.

10            You got to look at this house. This door --  
11       this back door here, the back door of the house, did  
12       it have a peephole or anywhere where anybody could  
13       look out of that door; do you recall?

14       **A**     I can't recall. I went out there that one  
15       time, and I didn't really look at it that closely.

16       **Q**     When y'all were taking pictures, did you take  
17       any pictures from Mr. Worley's vantage point? I saw  
18       where you took one from Mr. Rushton's vantage point,  
19       but did you take one back to Mr. Worley's?

20       **A**     I can't recall. I didn't take pictures.

21       **Q**     Okay. That was you standing there, though?

22       **A**     Yes, sir.

23       **Q**     Okay. Somebody else was taking the pictures?

24       **A**     Yes, sir.

25       **Q**     And you were standing where Mr. Rushton was

1       alleged to have stand, and I think --

2       **A**     Chief Gable, yes, sir.

3       **Q**     -- Chief Gable was up on the thing. All right.

4             And do you recall whether or not there were any  
5       windows on this side of the house {indicating}, the  
6       left side of the house?

7       **A**     I don't remember, sir.

8       **Q**     Or whether or not there were any windows on the  
9       right-hand side of the house?

10       **A**     Is the right-hand side where the vehicle's  
11       park?

12       **Q**     Yes.

13       **A**     I don't think there were any on that side, but  
14       I can't recall. I don't recall seeing any.

15       **Q**     Okay. The only area of windows is in the back;  
16       is that correct?

17       **A**     I believe. And then over on this end where the  
18       deck and stuff --

19       **Q**     Front -- going front out?

20       **A**     Yes, sir. And I believe there were two on the  
21       back of the house.

22       **Q**     All right. But if the car was parked over  
23       here, then you really couldn't see it from the front  
24       or from the back?

25       **A**     I wouldn't think so.

1       **Q**     All right.  There was an electrician that went  
2       out there and was out there, actually, with y'all  
3       when y'all were out there doing those measurements;  
4       do you recall that?

5       **A**     Yes, sir.

6       **Q**     Did you actually go into the up-upstairs at  
7       all?

8       **A**     Yes, sir.

9       **Q**     Did you see the light panel on the inside of  
10      the house?

11      **A**     Yes, sir.

12      **Q**     Could you get up and describe to the jury where  
13      you recall seeing that?

14      **A**     Where I -- the switches?

15      **Q**     The switch to the lights.

16      **A**     I believe there was a sliding door up on the  
17      upper deck, and I believe it was over to this side  
18      of it, if I remember correctly, but I wasn't really  
19      out there doing the electrical.

20      **Q**     I understand.  But you did observe him doing  
21      that -- doing that study?

22      **A**     Yes, sir.

23      **Q**     And your recollection was there was a light  
24      switch over --

25      **A**     I believe it was where -- where is the door on

1       here? This is the door? I believe it was over this  
2       way. I can't recall. I really can't, because I was  
3       not really paying that much attention to that.

4       **Q**     That's fine. But it was on the inside, wasn't  
5       it?

6       **A**     On the inside of the room upstairs?

7       **Q**     Yes, sir.

8       **A**     Yes, sir.

9       **Q**     Inside?

10      **A**     Yes, sir.

11      **Q**     In order to turn it on, you'd have to go inside  
12      the room to turn it on?

13      **A**     Yes, sir. I believe that was correct.

14             **MR. GARRETT:** All right. Beg the Court's  
15      indulgence.

16             (Pause.)

17      **Q**     Isn't it true that Melissa McAllister was  
18      helping to gather evidence in this case?

19      **A**     I believe so. I wasn't out there.

20      **Q**     Is it unusual for persons who are involved in  
21      it to collect the evidence?

22      **A**     Not in a small department. We don't have a  
23      team to go do anything.

24      **Q**     I thought when a -- in an officer shooting, you  
25      always invited SLED, the South Carolina Law

1 Enforcement agencies to come in and do the  
2 investigation?

3 **A** That's the sheriff's call.

4 **Q** So when a citizen's shot, do they require you  
5 to have SLED come in?

6 **A** No, sir. That's the sheriff's call.

7 **Q** All right. So the sheriff has to make that  
8 decision whether or not to invite SLED --

9 **A** Yes, sir.

10 **Q** -- or somebody else in?

11 **A** Yes, sir.

12 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you. I have nothing  
13 further.

14 **THE COURT:** Redirect?

15 **MR. MAYE:** Please the Court.

16 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

17 BY MR. MAYE:

18 **Q** Stand up for me there, Officer Collier, if you  
19 would. Put your hand over and cover this up right  
20 here.

21 **A** (Witness complies.)

22 **Q** Other than the color of your shirts and  
23 uniform, that's exactly what Bobby Rushton had on  
24 that night; right?

25 **A** Yes, sir, with a duty belt.

1       **Q**     Only difference in between the clothing that he  
2       was wearing and what you have on there right now is  
3       you covering up that badge?

4       **A**     Yes, sir.

5       **Q**     Okay. You can sit back down.

6             So when you're talking about his uniform's  
7       coming in, the only difference would have been,  
8       other than this patch, was who paid for it. Bobby  
9       had 5.11 Tactical gear that he paid for; right?

10      **A**     It would have just been color and the badge.

11      **Q**     Okay. No other difference whatsoever?

12      **A**     No, sir.

13      **Q**     Would you be comfortable going out -- stand up  
14      again. Cover that up. Would you be comfortable  
15      going out and patrolling dressed like that, absent  
16      that?

17      **A**     I've done it many times when I've worked  
18      narcotics. Many times.

19             **MR. MAYE:** Okay. All right. Thanks. Nothing  
20      else.

21                       RECROSS-EXAMINATION

22             BY MR. GARRETT:

23      **Q**     This was not a narcotics case, was it?

24      **A**     No, sir.

25      **Q**     All right. And, obviously, in narcotics, you

1 work undercover often times where you certainly  
2 don't want somebody to see you to know you're a  
3 police officer and get killed out there?

4 **A** That's a lot of times, yes, sir.

5 **Q** Okay. And as it relates to that -- if that  
6 badge would have been displayed, it might have been  
7 easier to see than not; right?

8 **A** I don't know. I wasn't out there. I don't  
9 know what the lighting or anything was. I can't  
10 really tell you.

11 **Q** All right. Suppose it's dark.

12 **A** If it was dark, it wouldn't have made any  
13 difference whether there was a badge or not.

14 **Q** Until the what? Light come on?

15 **A** Until the light came on.

16 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you.

17 **THE COURT:** All right. Thank you, sir. You  
18 may step down.

19 **MR. MAYE:** The State calls Kenneth Whitler.

20 KENNETH H. WHITLER,

21 having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

22 **COURT REPORTER:** Can you state your name and  
23 spell your last name, please?

24 **THE WITNESS:** My name is Kenneth H. Whitler.  
25 Last name is spelled W-h-i-t-l-e-r.



1 DIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MR. MAYE:

3 Q Agent Whitler, where are you currently  
4 employed?

5 A I'm employed by the South Carolina Law  
6 Enforcement Division. It's also known as SLED. And  
7 I work in the Forensic Services Department, in the  
8 firearms department.

9 Q What's your background in law enforcement,  
10 Agent Whitler?

11 A Background, I started in 1968 as a deputy up in  
12 Chester County. Subsequently went to work for the  
13 Attorney General -- State Attorney General's Office  
14 in the '70s. And then, in 1976, I joined the FBI,  
15 retired from there in 1997.

16 When I retired from the FBI, I was assigned to  
17 the FBI laboratory in their firearms department or  
18 unit. And I also -- when I retired, I was hired by  
19 SLED to do basically the same job, firearms, in  
20 their lab. I've been there since 1997.

21 Q And you have, based on your very longstanding  
22 experience, a wealth of professional and advanced  
23 training in the area of firearms identification;  
24 correct?

25 A In firearms identification, there's no school

1       that you go to to get a degree in firearms  
2       identification. You have to learn it from other  
3       qualified examiners.

4               When I was in the FBI laboratory, their  
5       training program was about a two to  
6       two-and-a-half-year program where you work with all  
7       the trained qualified examiners in the unit on real  
8       cases, plus they give you fake cases to work on,  
9       plus you have to do a lot of research on your own.

10              During that time period, you shoot a lot of  
11       firearms, you look at a lot of fired bullets and  
12       cartridge cases and do a lot of comparisons. At the  
13       end of the training period when all the examiners  
14       think you've reached a level of qualifi -- of  
15       expertise needed to do the job, you're given a  
16       series of three tests, and if you successfully  
17       complete those three tests, then you're -- are  
18       allowed to conduct examinations for the FBI.

19              I successfully completed the program, and in  
20       1991, I was qualified to conduct examinations for  
21       the FBI laboratory. Like I said, in 1997, I retired  
22       on Friday, and on Monday, I started work for SLED.  
23       I had a two-day retirement.

24       **Q**       And so you're basically employed with the South  
25       Carolina Law Enforcement Division as an expert in

1           that same area, in firearms identification?

2           **A**       That's correct.

3           **Q**       Your SLED's ex -- one of SLED's experts in that  
4           regard?

5           **A**       That's correct.

6                   **MR. MAYE:** At this point in time, Your Honor --  
7           subject, of course, to any cross-examination -- I'm  
8           going to offer him as an expert witness in firearms  
9           identification.

10                   **MR. GARRETT:** Without objection.

11                   **THE COURT:** Without objection.

12                   Ladies and gentlemen, I'll remind you what I --  
13           further of my prior instructions on experts.

14                   With that in mind, go ahead, please, Mr. Maye.

15           BY MR. MAYE:

16           **Q**       Agent Whitler, I'm going to do this as directly  
17           as I can. I'm going to first show you a Remington  
18           742 rifle right there, Serial Number 7070652. I'll  
19           ask you, in your capacity as an expert witness, did  
20           you examine that weapon, test-fire it, and find it  
21           to be in working order?

22           **A**       Yes, sir, I did.

23           **Q**       Now, Agent Whitler -- and I apologize, these  
24           were disassembled.

25                   Agent Whitler, I'm going to show you State's

1 Exhibit Number 3 that is already in evidence, one  
2 magazine and four unfired 30-06 Springfield caliber  
3 cartridges. And I'm going to ask you, did you have  
4 an opportunity to examine that magazine and  
5 determine whether or not it was the correct magazine  
6 for that 742 rifle that you just identified?

7 **A** Yes, sir. I examined the magazine and each of  
8 the four cartridges that were submitted with it.

9 **Q** Agent Whitler, let me next ask you -- I'm going  
10 to hand you two items: Two fired 30-06 caliber  
11 cartridge cases that are in evidence as State's  
12 Exhibit Number 26 and State's Exhibit Number 11,  
13 collectively. They're two bags, but they're both  
14 marked and stapled together as State's 11 and 26.

15 I'm going to hand you those two separate  
16 State's Exhibits and ask you if you determined that  
17 those unfired cartridge casings had been fired by  
18 the same Remington 742 rifle, serial number 7070652?

19 **A** Yes, sir. I examined these four cartridge  
20 cases and microscopically compared them to  
21 test-fired cartridge cases fired by this rifle  
22 {indicating} and determined that these cartridge  
23 cases were fired by this rifle.

24 **Q** How were you able to do that? Do you do that  
25 by tool marks or what do you do?

1       **A**       When the gun fires, the breech face, which is  
2       the area of which the cartridge case is supported by  
3       the bolt, when it comes forward and locks into the  
4       chamber, the firing pin comes through the bolt, hits  
5       the primer, and the cartridge goes off.

6               When that happens, the bullet is pushed down  
7       the barrel by the pressure from the gunpowder  
8       burning. It also pushes the -- against the  
9       cartridge case face, or head, which is the backside  
10      of the cartridge case. And this material is softer  
11      than the steel in the rifle, and so any machining or  
12      manufacturing marks put on the breech face, which is  
13      what we call that area, are transferred to the  
14      softer material of the cartridge case in many cases.

15             In this instance, we had enough marks  
16      transferred that we're able to say that the marks  
17      produced by the test-fired cartridge cases matched  
18      those on the submitted cartridge cases.

19             And the reason we test-fire them is so that --  
20      I test-fire this rifle. I shoot it. I collect the  
21      cartridge cases. There's absolutely no doubt where  
22      the cartridge cases came from. I can say without a  
23      doubt I know that the test-fired cartridge cases  
24      came from this gun because I put them in them, shot  
25      them, and collected them. So that gives us a known

1 standard.

2 And then you compare the marks on those  
3 cartridge cases to the submitted cartridge cases, or  
4 the questioned one, and if you're able to find  
5 sufficient agreement, you're able to say they were  
6 fired by the gun. If you don't have enough  
7 agreement, then you have to go with another  
8 conclusion.

9 **Q** I'm going to show you what's been marked as  
10 State's 23, which are fired bullet fragments -- one  
11 metal fragment, four small lead fragments that are  
12 in evidence as State's 23, and ask you, did you  
13 examine those and were you able to reach any  
14 conclusion in regard to whether or not they had any  
15 relation to the 742 rifle that you previously  
16 examined in this case?

17 **A** I examined these, but they were so damaged and  
18 they were so small, they didn't have sufficient  
19 marks to allow me to conduct an examination or a  
20 comparison of the test bullets with these -- with  
21 these fragments. There just weren't enough marks  
22 available.

23 **Q** Okay. Agent Whitler, basically, just to sum up  
24 in this case, in regards to the Remington 742 rifle  
25 there, to a reasonable degree of scientific

1       certainty, your expert opinion is you examined that  
2       weapon and it's capable of being fired; correct?

3       **A**     Yes, sir, I know it can be fired.

4       **Q**     Okay. As to the box magazine in this case,  
5       same thing: Your expert opinion is that magazine's  
6       capable of being inserted in that weapon and it's an  
7       appropriate magazine for that type of weapon?

8       **A**     Yes, sir. That's the magazine I used for  
9       test-firing.

10      **Q**     And is it not also, to a reasonable degree of  
11      scientific certainty, your expert opinion that all  
12      of those shell casings, all four of them, were fired  
13      by that exact Remington 742 rifle?

14      **A**     That's correct.

15      **Q**     Okay. Did you generate a written report to  
16      support and document those findings?

17      **A**     Yes, sir.

18      **Q**     Could I see a copy of that written report?

19      **A**     (Witness complies.)

20               (Pause.)

21              **MR. MAYE:** Your Honor, I'm going to move,  
22      without objection from the defense, to admit the  
23      report generated by Agent Whitler into evidence as a  
24      State's Exhibit in this case.

25              **THE COURT:** Admitted without objection, 29.

1 (State's Exhibit Number 29, SLED report,  
2 marked and admitted into evidence.)

3 **MR. MAYE:** Agent Whitler, thank you so much.  
4 Answer any questions that the defense has for you.

5 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you.

6 CROSS-EXAMINATION

7 BY MR. GARRETT:

8 **Q** When you had those cartridges that had not been  
9 fired of the .30-06 in your possession, did you take  
10 any steps to take them apart to look at them?

11 **A** No, sir, I didn't.

12 **Q** Okay. And so you're not able then to  
13 accurately say that the bullets that were fired by  
14 those, the ones that are empty, contain the same  
15 type of material in the ones that remain?

16 **A** No, we didn't do it. That would be another  
17 department. That would be an elemental analysis.  
18 And you could have the situation where the cartridge  
19 that was fired used a different bullet than the ones  
20 that remained. In many cases, the magazines are  
21 loaded with different cartridges.

22 **Q** So that's not unusual?

23 **A** That's not unusual.

24 **Q** Okay. And were you asked, by chance, to  
25 examine any of these 40 caliber bullets?



1       **A**     No, sir.

2       **Q**     Were you asked to do any kind of investigation  
3       on that pistol right there?

4       **A**     No, sir.

5       **Q**     Okay. And if you haven't done an investigation  
6       on it, you really don't know whether that pistol got  
7       fired that night?

8       **A**     No, sir, there would really be no way to tell.

9       **Q**     But you could, if you wanted to do the  
10      analysis?

11      **A**     No, sir. You can't tell how long it's been  
12      since a pistol was fired.

13      **Q**     I got you. So time --

14      **A**     The timeframe would be -- I know everyone sees  
15      on television the hero smells the gun and says it  
16      was fired in the last three and a half hours, but  
17      you can have a gun sit a week and still have a smell  
18      to it.

19           **MR. GARRETT:** All right. Thank you. That's  
20      all I have.

21           **THE COURT:** Redirect?

22           **MR. MAYE:** Nothing else. Thank you.

23           **THE COURT:** May this witness be excused?

24           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes.

25           **THE COURT:** Thank you, sir. You may be

1       excused.

2               Are you getting your next witness?

3               **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir, Sheriff George Reid.

4                       GEORGE H. REID,

5               having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

6                       DIRECT EXAMINATION

7       BY MR. MYERS:

8       **Q**     Sheriff, would you state your name and spell  
9       your last name, please, sir?

10      **A**     My name is George H. Reid, R-e-i-d.

11      **Q**     And you're the Sheriff of McCormick County?

12      **A**     That's correct.

13      **Q**     Approximately, how long have you been the  
14      sheriff?

15      **A**     I think it's going on my 27th year as the  
16      sheriff.

17      **Q**     Now, in 2009, on November the 15th, 2009, you  
18      were the sheriff then; is that correct?

19      **A**     That's correct.

20      **Q**     And Melissa McAllister, she was one of your  
21      deputies?

22      **A**     That is correct, yes.

23      **Q**     She's a certified law enforcement with the  
24      McCormick County Sheriff's Department?

25      **A**     That's correct.

1           **Q**     Getting paid by the County?

2           **A**     That's correct.

3           **Q**     Nick Moore, is he a certified law enforcement  
4           officer with the McCormick County Sheriff's  
5           Department?

6           **A**     That's correct.

7           **Q**     Getting paid by the sheriff and the County?

8           **A**     That's correct.

9           **Q**     Bobby Rushton, certified law enforcement  
10          officer in McCormick County Sheriff's Department,  
11          getting paid by the County on November 15th, 2009?

12          **A**     That's correct.

13          **Q**     All working for you?

14          **A**     That's correct, yes.

15          **Q**     Now, did you have an occasion to respond out to  
16          the shooting site on the early morning of November  
17          the 15th?

18          **A**     Yes, sir.

19          **Q**     And who all accompanied you out there, Sheriff?

20          **A**     Nick Moore, Melissa, and the EMS. They was  
21          there, too. I know my guys were there, were  
22          working.

23          **Q**     And somebody with the City, too?

24          **A**     Yes, sir.

25          **Q**     Jessie Wideman?

1       **A**     Yes, sir. I remember seeing Jessie.

2       **Q**     Now, did you have an occasion, when you got out  
3       there, to see Bobby's car there at the house?

4       **A**     When I first arrived there and I stopped on  
5       Holiday Road where the ambulance was working on  
6       Bobby, and I guess they had to hurry up and go, and  
7       so they left.

8       **Q**     When you got out to the Worley house right  
9       there where the shooting occurred, did you see  
10      Bobby's car still out there?

11      **A**     That's correct.

12      **Q**     And what did you see inside on the passenger  
13      side?

14      **A**     A pistol Glock -- a Glock 40.

15      **Q**     That was Bobby's pistol?

16      **A**     That's correct.

17      **Q**     And later on that morning, a lady let y'all go  
18      inside the house. Mrs. Worley gave y'all consent to  
19      go inside the house; is that right?

20      **A**     Yes, sir, that's correct.

21      **Q**     Now, Sheriff, I want to direct you now. If you  
22      look at this diagram right here, can you see it from  
23      where you are?

24      **A**     (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

25             This?

1           **Q**     Yes, sir.

2                   Upstairs on that porch right up there -- and  
3           I'm going to show you State's Exhibit Number 5; this  
4           picture right here. Upstairs on the porch, some  
5           chairs were up there right by that window?

6           **A**     Yes, sir.

7           **Q**     Show the jury where those chairs were upstairs  
8           by that window.

9           **A**     (Witness complies.)

10          **Q**     Now, I'm going to show you three photographs  
11          here.

12          **A**     (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

13          **Q**     What does that photograph depict there?

14          **A**     The photograph shows where the empty case for  
15          the -- from the bullet, the empty round.

16          **Q**     And how close were they around those chairs?

17          **A**     Sort of -- they were sort of real close around  
18          the chairs.

19          **Q**     Now, I'm going to hand you these two  
20          photographs and ask you what those two are.

21          **A**     This one, the empty shell was laying on the  
22          floor of the deck.

23          **Q**     And what's the other one?

24          **A**     This one also, an empty shell was found on the  
25          deck floor.

1 (Pause.)

2 **MR. GARRETT:** Without objection.

3 **THE COURT:** 30, 31, 32.

4 (State's Exhibit Numbers 30 through 32,  
5 photographs, marked and admitted into evidence.)

6 BY MR. MYERS:

7 **Q** 32, Sheriff, are those the chairs we were  
8 talking about?

9 **A** That's correct.

10 **Q** And you said those chairs were right up here by  
11 this large window on the left of the sliding glass  
12 door?

13 **A** Yes. {Indicating.}

14 **Q** And then you found 30 and 31, two shells up  
15 there had been fired?

16 **A** That's correct.

17 **Q** And these shells were -- where were they in  
18 relation to these chairs?

19 **A** They were sort of right in front of the chairs  
20 on the floor of the deck.

21 **Q** All right, sir. And I'm referring now to  
22 State's Exhibit 26. It says here that these shells  
23 were recovered by Sheriff Reid on the top deck. Are  
24 those the two shells in those photographs?

25 **A** Yes, sir.

1       **Q**     Now, Sheriff, I want to ask you: When you  
2       arrived out here, did y'all pull down -- on this  
3       diagram up here, this Number 4 -- did y'all pull  
4       down in the driveway, or where did y'all stay when  
5       y'all got out here, when y'all first pulled up?

6       **A**     When we first pulled up, we pulled up on the  
7       side of the road. I think that's Presidents Road.

8       **Q**     Out on the highway out there?

9       **A**     Yes, sir.

10      **Q**     And then how did y'all approach coming down  
11      through the residence?

12      **A**     We park and walked down.

13      **Q**     Okay. Now, as you walked down that driveway,  
14      did you encounter anyone?

15      **A**     Yes, sir. I saw two person have lights,  
16      flashlights.

17      **Q**     It's still dark?

18      **A**     Yes, that's correct.

19      **Q**     Okay. And those two persons, where did you  
20      encounter them? Is it shown on this diagram? This  
21      is that metal building back here and the driveway  
22      goes on off.

23      **A**     (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

24             This is supposed to be the drive --

25      **Q**     Yes, sir.

1       **A**     The driveway.

2       **Q**     Yes, sir.

3       **A**     It's like coming down -- I'm getting confused  
4       now.

5       **Q**     You remember that metal building that was out  
6       there?

7       **A**     Yes, sir.

8       **Q**     Right there. And here's the driveway, and then  
9       the woods start up above off this.

10      **A**     Okay. It's -- we got approached right down in  
11      here, coming down.

12      **Q**     Now, those two people, did you know who they  
13      were?

14      **A**     No, sir, didn't know -- didn't know who they  
15      were.

16      **Q**     Okay. And as you approached them, you said  
17      they had flashlights?

18      **A**     That's correct.

19             (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

20      **Q**     What, if anything, did you say to them or what,  
21      if anything, did they say to you?

22      **A**     I said, Do not shine the flashlight in my face.

23      **Q**     Did anybody respond?

24      **A**     No, sir. Then I quickly asked, Who is you?

25      Then it was respond back and said, Who is you? Then



1 I identified myself as Sheriff Reid. So, by that  
2 time, we were walking towards each other at the  
3 time.

4 Q And there was two people that you were coming  
5 in contact with?

6 A That's correct.

7 Q What happened when y'all got up face-to-face?

8 A When we got face-to-face, the defendant told me  
9 that, I put your deputy gun in his car.

10 Q I put your deputy's gun in his car?

11 A That's correct.

12 Q And what was said next?

13 A Then I said, Well, some shooting going on down  
14 here. Then he responded back, I did it.

15 Q I did it?

16 A I did it.

17 Q And what did you say?

18 A Then I said, Did you know you shot my deputy?  
19 Then he said, He didn't have no business ringing my  
20 damn doorbell.

21 Q Said what now?

22 A He didn't have no business ringing my damn  
23 doorbell.

24 Q And what did y'all do then?

25 A Then I placed him under arrest.

1           **Q**     And the person y'all arrested was who?

2           **A**     Was the defendant over there {indicating}.

3           **Q**     Mr. Worley?

4           **A**     That's correct.

5           **Q**     When he said that the deputy didn't have any  
6           damn business ringing his doorbell, or words to that  
7           effect, he said deputy? The deputy didn't have any  
8           reason for ringing my doorbell?

9           **A**     Well, he said, He didn't have -- He didn't have  
10          no business ringing my damn doorbell.

11          **Q**     Did he ever say anything like he shot him by  
12          mistake or he didn't know who he was or anything  
13          like that?

14          **A**     No, sir, he didn't tell me that.

15          **Q**     And then y'all took him on to jail?

16          **A**     One of the city officers carried and  
17          transported him on to the detention center.

18                 **MR. MYERS:** Thank you, Sheriff. Answer any  
19          questions they have.

20                 **THE COURT:** Cross-examination?

21                 **MR. GARRETT:** Beg the Court's indulgence.

22                         (Pause.)

23                                 CROSS-EXAMINATION

24           BY MR. GARRETT:

25           **Q**     Sheriff, when you came down there that evening,

1           were you in a uniform?

2           **A**     Early that morning?

3           **Q**     Yes, sir. Early in the morning, yes, sir, at  
4           four or five o'clock?

5           **A**     No, sir, I wasn't in no uniform.

6           **Q**     Okay. And were you in a police car?

7           **A**     Yes, sir.

8           **Q**     Were you in a marked or an unmarked police car?

9           **A**     Unmarked police car.

10          **Q**     Did anybody have any blue lights on at the top  
11          of the hill up there?

12          **A**     I'm not a hundred percent sure.

13          **Q**     Okay. And Ms. Worley was standing there with  
14          Joe during this time, wasn't she?

15          **A**     That's correct. They walked up.

16          **Q**     And when they walked up, both of them had  
17          flashlights and they walked up to speak to you?

18          **A**     Yes, sir.

19          **Q**     Okay. And you didn't feel like you needed to  
20          take any kind of -- take a shotgun or take any kind  
21          of protective steps as y'all were walking to them,  
22          did you?

23          **A**     No, sir. I didn't know who I was walking  
24          toward.

25          **Q**     They were unarmed, is what I'm --

1           **A**     Yes, they were.

2           **Q**     And it's pretty clear to you that they were?

3           **A**     Yes, sir.

4           **Q**     And it was pretty clear to you they were  
5     listening to you and were coming to you?

6           **A**     I'm assuming that they was listening to me  
7     because I did said, Do not shine the flashlight to  
8     my face.

9           **Q**     I got you.

10                   Now, how long have you known Joe Worley?

11          **A**     I think probably about the first, maybe the  
12     second time I ever seen him.

13          **Q**     Okay. And under what circumstances had you  
14     seen him?

15          **A**     Well, the -- I can't remember the first time,  
16     but -- well, I can say the first time, that was out  
17     there.

18          **Q**     That was out there. So the first time you ever  
19     saw Joe Worley -- what about his mama, Ms. Mary?

20          **A**     I think that's the first time I met her, too.

21          **Q**     All right. Now, Sheriff, you are a smart man  
22     and you know all the people in McCormick County and  
23     they love you; ain't no question about it?

24          **A**     I don't know all the peoples in McCormick  
25     County, but.

1       **Q**     Well, what I'm getting at is this, Sheriff:  
2       You know the bad element in your county?

3       **A**     I would say, yes, sir.

4       **Q**     Okay. And you had never had a call out to the  
5       Worley residence or to the Sheffields' residence  
6       prior to this, had you?

7       **A**     No, sir. I don't remember answering no call  
8       out there.

9       **Q**     Okay. So -- and that's a pretty nice place out  
10      there in Little River?

11      **A**     Fairly nice place.

12      **Q**     And real nice people, but some of them live  
13      there year-round and some of them don't live there  
14      year-round?

15      **A**     That's correct.

16      **Q**     And during the investigation of this case, did  
17      you discover that at one time or maybe twice in the  
18      past, maybe even three times, that the trailer that  
19      was down there had gotten broken into? Did you do  
20      any investigation on that to see whether or not  
21      there had been any history of break-ins down there  
22      at the --

23      **A**     The trailer of who?

24      **Q**     Where the Worleys -- where the Worleys'  
25      property was, there used to be a trailer there. It

1       was a small trailer before Mr. Worley built the --  
2       built a little building down there.

3       **A**     I can't remember.

4       **Q**     Okay. And did you go in and look at your  
5       details to see whether or not you had any record of  
6       this place ever being burglaried or anything like  
7       that?

8       **A**     No, sir, I didn't.

9       **Q**     Oh. Do y'all ever have any burglars in  
10      McCormick County?

11      **A**     Yes, sir.

12      **Q**     Okay. Do you ever have any home invasions in  
13      McCormick County?

14      **A**     Probably so.

15      **Q**     Okay. Any gang activity going on in McCormick  
16      County?

17      **A**     They said gang activity.

18      **Q**     Okay. Any bad drug people buying and selling  
19      drugs here in this community?

20      **A**     Yes, sir.

21      **Q**     You got a big job, don't you?

22      **A**     Yes, sir.

23           **MR. GARRETT:** Sheriff, thank you. I appreciate  
24      the job you're doing.

25           **THE COURT:** Redirect?

1           **MR. MYERS:** No redirect, Your Honor. And with  
2           that witness, the case -- the State would rest its  
3           case in chief.

4           **THE COURT:** Very good.

5           Ladies and gentlemen of the jury -- Sheriff,  
6           you may step down. Thank you, sir.

7           The State indicates that it has rested. In  
8           other words, they have completed their case in  
9           chief. Therefore, I'm going to go ahead and call a  
10          lunch break at this juncture and ask that you be  
11          back in your jury room at 2:15, and then we'll  
12          resume the trial at that point.

13          Remember, do not speak with anyone or let  
14          anybody speak with you about this case during the  
15          break, please. Thank you.

16          (The jury was excused for lunch.)

17          **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett, do you have any  
18          motions?

19          **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, we do, Your Honor. Could we  
20          have just a few moments to prepare them?

21          **THE COURT:** Sure.

22          **MR. HENDERSON:** Or would it be a good time to  
23          break for lunch and let us work through --

24          **THE COURT:** Let's go ahead and do it. I want  
25          to move this case along.

1           I tell you what we can do, while y'all are  
2       working with that, do you have a problem with me  
3       giving your client his Fifth Amendment rights while  
4       you're doing that?

5           **MR. GARRETT:** I don't have any problem with  
6       that, Your Honor.

7           **THE COURT:** Are you sure?

8           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

9           **THE COURT:** I'll be glad not to, if you prefer  
10      me not to.

11          **MR. GARRETT:** No, that's fine.

12          **THE COURT:** Would you please stand, Mr. Worley?

13                       JOE ROSS WORLEY,

14      having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

15          **THE COURT:** If you don't understand anything I  
16      say, please let me know. Okay, sir? I'm going to  
17      ask that you give me verbal responses and that you  
18      speak loud enough so I can hear you and this lady  
19      over here to my left can hear you. Okay?

20          **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

21          **THE COURT:** First, we're at that point in the  
22      trial where you have a right to present a defense, a  
23      constitutional right. You also have the right to  
24      claim the protections that are afforded by you by  
25      the Fifth Amendment to the United States



1       Constitution in which the relevant part provides as  
2       follows: It says that no person shall be compelled  
3       in any criminal case to be a witness against  
4       himself. And first, Mr. Worley, have these rights  
5       been explained to you prior to today?

6               **DEFENDANT:** No.

7               **THE COURT:** Sir?

8               **DEFENDANT:** No.

9               **THE COURT:** Nobody's explained to you your  
10       Fifth Amendment rights against self-incrimination?

11              **DEFENDANT:** No.

12              **THE COURT:** Okay. Now, do you understand that  
13       you have the right under our Constitution against  
14       incriminating yourself in court today? Do you  
15       understand that?

16              **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

17              **THE COURT:** Okay, sir. What that means is,  
18       just to make sure that you do understand it, is that  
19       you cannot be required by me, your attorneys, or by  
20       the State to testify in this case. Do you  
21       understand that?

22              **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

23              **THE COURT:** Now, if you decide to, you have a  
24       right, a constitutional right to testify; however,  
25       nobody can make you do that. And so this is a

1       personal right that you and only you can accept --  
2       or, I mean, choose to make or not choose to make.  
3       Do you understand that?

4               **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

5               **THE COURT:** Now, if you decide that you are  
6       going to testify, you'll be subject to the same  
7       rules that govern other witnesses, you'll be subject  
8       to direct examination and cross-examination. Do you  
9       understand that?

10              **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

11              **THE COURT:** Do you understand that if you have  
12       any convictions that involve dishonesty or a false  
13       statement or for crimes that are punishable by more  
14       than a year in prison, and if I find that the  
15       probative value of those prior charges or  
16       convictions or pleas outweigh the prejudice to you,  
17       then the State will have the opportunity to  
18       cross-examine you on those prior convictions or  
19       guilty pleas. Do you understand that?

20              **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

21              **THE COURT:** And the obvious reason would be to  
22       impeach or attack your credibility in this case. Do  
23       you understand that?

24              **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

25              **THE COURT:** Now, if you decide to testify in

1       this case, that decision is yours and yours alone to  
2       make, and it must be made by you freely,  
3       voluntarily, and intelligently knowing your rights  
4       under the Fifth Amendment and knowing the  
5       consequences of your decision if you decide to  
6       testify. Do you understand that?

7               **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

8               **THE COURT:** Now, if you decide in this case  
9       that you will not testify, I'll tell you now that I  
10      will instruct the jury when I charge them on the law  
11      at the end of this case, that they cannot and they  
12      shall not consider your failure to testify  
13      whatsoever, because that is your right under the  
14      Fifth Amendment to the Constitution, and the burden  
15      of proof is on the State of South Carolina to prove  
16      your guilt by proving each and every element of the  
17      charges against you by proof beyond a reasonable  
18      doubt. Do you understand that?

19              **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

20              **THE COURT:** Now, have you understood everything  
21      that I've explained to you up to this point?

22              **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

23              **THE COURT:** Do you have any questions of me?

24              **DEFENDANT:** No, sir.

25              **THE COURT:** Do you have any questions of your

1 attorneys?

2 **DEFENDANT:** No.

3 **THE COURT:** Now, at this stage, I'm going to  
4 let you speak with anyone who you would reasonably  
5 want to speak to, your family members, friends, your  
6 attorneys, or anybody who's reasonably in touch with  
7 you to help you and aid you in making a decision as  
8 to whether or not you wish to testify at the  
9 appropriate time in this case. However, at the end  
10 of the day, the decision as to whether or not you  
11 will take the stand is yours and yours alone to  
12 make. Do you understand?

13 **DEFENDANT:** Yes, sir.

14 **THE COURT:** Thank you, sir.

15 **MR. HENDERSON:** If it pleases the Court, Your  
16 Honor.

17 **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

18 **MR. HENDERSON:** There's a lot going on here and  
19 you've heard a lot, Your Honor, but I think a lot of  
20 what you've heard is uncontradicted. And it's  
21 coming straight from the State's witnesses, Your  
22 Honor, specifically Mr. Rushton, that when they're  
23 back over at the house standing outside the door and  
24 there is this talking going on, it's undisputed  
25 what's already in the record is that they couldn't

1       see Mr. Worley, and I think the fair inference from  
2       that is Mr. Worley could not see them, and that  
3       Deputy Rushton testified that, when he backed out,  
4       that's when the light came on and shot, boom, that  
5       it happened that quick. And I believe the phrase  
6       was a fraction of a second between the light and the  
7       shooting.

8               And, Your Honor, the reason I believe that's  
9       important -- and I call the Court's attention to the  
10      State versus Curry case that just came out last  
11      week, Your Honor.

12             **THE COURT:** I read it.

13             **MR. HENDERSON:** It's a Castle Doctrine case  
14      dealing with some different Castle Doctrine issues  
15      than here, but I think it's very informative in that  
16      it discusses that in order for the Castle Doctrine  
17      to apply, you've got to meet the elements of  
18      self-defense.

19             I think this is the first case we've got that  
20      says that. Because Mr. Worley is in his home, you  
21      don't have to deal with the duty of retreat issue  
22      because, as a matter of law, there is no duty of  
23      retreat.

24             Your Honor, as it relates to him, Mr. Worley,  
25      or any other homeowner arming themselves in their

1 home, have an absolute right to do that, Your Honor.

2 **THE COURT:** Didn't I hear something in this  
3 case -- my clerk and I were talking about this in my  
4 chambers -- that Mr. Worley did not have the right  
5 to possess a rifle or a weapon?

6 **MR. HENDERSON:** That is not testimony before  
7 the Court, Your Honor. That was not presented to  
8 the jury.

9 **THE COURT:** Okay. Well, I don't know where we  
10 got that. I was curious about that myself.

11 **MR. MYERS:** Not under the federal law, Your  
12 Honor.

13 **MR. HENDERSON:** He's not prohibited under the  
14 state statute to possess any type of firearm because  
15 he was not convicted of a felony at all. Arguably,  
16 the ATF was looking at it -- and I know this is kind  
17 of off point, Your Honor --

18 **THE COURT:** Okay. I did that. I'm sorry. Go  
19 ahead.

20 **MR. HENDERSON:** The ATF was looking at it and  
21 decided not to prosecute. So there has been no  
22 evidence before this trial jury that Mr. Worley is  
23 prohibited from possessing or using any type of  
24 firearm or any type of ammunition. And I think  
25 there's been no testimony that this modified

1       ammunition is against the law, any state or federal  
2       law.

3               Your Honor, I would call the Court's attention  
4       to a case called State versus Hendrix. And to give  
5       the Court the cite, it's 244 S.E.2d 503 from 1978.  
6       And it pretty well stands for the proposition -- and  
7       I'll let the Court read it to make sure I'm quoting  
8       it accurately -- that if someone on their property  
9       who perceives any type of threat can lawfully arm  
10      themselves, and that, as a matter of law, that's not  
11      bringing on any type of provocation. That's not --

12             **THE COURT:** Well, what if you -- and you  
13      brought up the question that I've been researching,  
14      and that is this gentleman was at night, by the  
15      testimony, shooting a .30-06, which is against the  
16      law, and normally that would, you would anticipate,  
17      bringing on law enforcement when you were out  
18      shooting a .30-06 at night. Okay?

19             So why is he not, at least a question of fact,  
20      as to whether or not he did bring on this  
21      confrontation or, as a matter of law, that he's  
22      entitled to self-defense?

23             **MR. HENDERSON:** Two things: Number one,  
24      there's been no testimony that he was violating any  
25      law.

1           **THE COURT:** That's not the testimony that  
2           somebody can give. That's up to me to make that  
3           determination.

4           **MR. HENDERSON:** Well, what I will represent to  
5           Your Honor, that, from our research, there is no  
6           county ordinance against shooting guns.

7           **THE COURT:** Well, there is -- the testimony was  
8           that Mr. Worley was shooting a gun at a fox. In  
9           other words, he was hunting a fox at night.  
10          Regardless of whether it's to protect some Sweet Pea  
11          cat or whatever, he was hunting at night with a  
12          .30-06.

13          But if you look at 50-11-710, it says night  
14          hunting is prohibited, and it also says exceptions  
15          to that. And with regard to fox, it says you can  
16          hunt them, but you can't shoot them with any rifle  
17          any bigger than a .22 rimfire.

18          **MR. HENDERSON:** And, Your Honor, I think the  
19          testimony was they were shooting at it and not  
20          seeking to kill it, not seeking to harm it, motivate  
21          it.

22          **THE COURT:** I didn't gather that.

23          **MR. HENDERSON:** Okay. I mean, I don't think,  
24          in the classic sense, there was evidence of hunting,  
25          you know, what you and I would call deer hunting or



1 along those lines.

2 **THE COURT:** When you shoot at an animal at  
3 night, I would say it's hunting. It may not be with  
4 the Elmer Fudd, the cap and the garb, but you know  
5 what I'm saying. He's shooting, protection of this  
6 cat or whatever, but he's still hunting in my view.

7 **MR. HENDERSON:** But assuming that's the case,  
8 that is not -- and assume law enforcement gets  
9 called because of that, that's not bringing on the  
10 problem.

11 **THE COURT:** And that's where I'm looking at.  
12 And tell me why that is not.

13 **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, one thing: The  
14 Sheffields said this happened around 3:15, I think  
15 the first shot, and I believe their testimony was 20  
16 minutes thereafter, the second shot. It might be  
17 off a hair, but assuming they're somewhat right,  
18 3:15 a.m., 3:35 a.m.

19 **THE COURT:** Okay.

20 **MR. HENDERSON:** Deputies get called at 4:06.  
21 We know that. It's in the record.

22 **THE COURT:** Okay.

23 **MR. HENDERSON:** So between Mr. Worley shooting  
24 and turning out the lights and going back inside,  
25 there's a waiting time with the Sheffields that they

1 call law enforcement.

2 Then, on top of that, it's 20 to 30 minutes  
3 before law enforcement arrives. The Worley  
4 residence now is back still.

5 **THE COURT:** So you think there is a sufficient  
6 break in to cause to warrant there not being that --  
7 the connection or the nexus is broken.

8 **MR. HENDERSON:** That is correct, Your Honor. I  
9 know it's kind of a negligence, you know, a civil  
10 negligence concept, but you're right. The nexus has  
11 been broken. I mean, that's not the cause. In  
12 fact, there's been a lot of time that went on  
13 between these shots being fired and law enforcement  
14 arriving on the scene.

15 **THE COURT:** Well, let me ask you a question if  
16 I may.

17 **MR. HENDERSON:** Yes, sir.

18 **THE COURT:** What if -- this is hypothetically  
19 -- what if the officers were riding by the road and  
20 this gentleman shot out of his porch at 3:30 in the  
21 morning at a fox with a .30-06, and he drove up  
22 there then. The same scenario is happening in this  
23 case, but the time is different. So he turns around  
24 and shoots this officer under those circumstances.  
25 Would there be a sufficient nexus at that point?

1           **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, that's -- and your  
2           hypothetical is hard to answer. And I'll tell you  
3           why --

4           **THE COURT:** I don't know the answer either,  
5           that's why I'm asking.

6           **MR. HENDERSON:** Because if we assume all the  
7           other facts being the same, no blue light, no  
8           uniform, I mean, under that scenario, I don't think  
9           time makes a difference because --

10          **THE COURT:** Would that be a sufficient  
11          connection? In other words, would that be bringing  
12          on the cause?

13          **MR. HENDERSON:** That would be closer to  
14          bringing on the cause. It would have to be just --  
15          just from a mathematical standpoint, it would be  
16          closer to bringing on the cause.

17                 But I think something that happens arguably an  
18          hour -- it starts an hour and 15 minutes before law  
19          enforcement ever gets on the scene, I think that is  
20          a sufficient gap in time, but that's not bringing on  
21          the problem.

22          **THE COURT:** And I interrupted you,  
23          Mr. Henderson. I apologize. Go ahead.

24          **MR. HENDERSON:** No, no, no. I appreciate that,  
25          Your Honor.

1           But you hear Officer Rushton's testimony that  
2           all of this conversation happens underneath the  
3           deck, underneath the porch. And again, Your Honor,  
4           you see why everybody agrees that the jury ought to  
5           go out and see this property because -- and when all  
6           this conversation is going on and then Deputy  
7           Rushton, by his own testimony, he backs out, draws  
8           his weapon while the light is still out, the light  
9           comes on, and boom {snapping fingers}. And his  
10          testimony was a fraction of a second.

11          And you've heard all the testimony of him not  
12          being in uniform or at least not wearing any indicia  
13          saying sheriff.

14                **THE COURT:** I also heard the testimony where  
15                they identify themselves as being law enforcement  
16                and the response allegedly made by your client.

17                **MR. HENDERSON:** Oh, I understand that, Your  
18                Honor.

19                **THE COURT:** And the reason I ask that is,  
20                because I was debating this with my law clerk, it  
21                almost seems to me that the fraction of a second can  
22                be construed one way or the other, meaning he had to  
23                make -- he saw a gun, bang, and he shot. I know  
24                that's what you're trying to foister up here for the  
25                jury, it seems to me.

1           On the other hand, when you just shoot without  
2           having a better recognition than that --

3           **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, say you're right  
4           about that, this lawsuit that Officer Rushton  
5           brought, that's the proper forum under that  
6           scenario. I mean, because that's truly negligence,  
7           you shooting before you gather everything that's  
8           going on. I mean, that is a negligence theory. I  
9           think that's why Officer Rushton brought this  
10          negligence lawsuit.

11          But, again, that's a different issue here. Our  
12          issue here is Mr. Worley, when the lights come on  
13          and a gun is aimed at him -- and we know it's aimed  
14          at him because we've got the pistol, we see where  
15          the rifle cartridge went in. We know, as a matter  
16          of law that -- well, not a matter of law, just  
17          common sense, that Deputy Rushton is aiming at him,  
18          he's aiming at him with a handgun, with ammunition  
19          that is designed to kill somebody, can kill  
20          somebody.

21          We heard Officer Collier testify that the  
22          testimony -- the uncontroverted testimony is that  
23          Mr. Worley is standing on the porch with his rifle  
24          in the port position. He is actually exercising  
25          more gun safety than Officer Rushton was.

1           You know, he's got it out here in the port of  
2           arms, not aiming at anyone. You know, the lights  
3           come on, he sees a gun, a pistol aimed at him, and  
4           in a fraction of a second, he shoots.

5           Your Honor, if that's not -- he's got every  
6           right to act on appearances when somebody is aiming  
7           a gun at him. I mean, as a homeowner -- well, in  
8           his mother's home -- again, no duty to retreat, he  
9           can lawfully -- he can possess that gun in the home.  
10          There's no evidence that he can't.

11          And I believe Officer Collier testified that  
12          it's imminently believable that if somebody's aiming  
13          a gun at you -- maybe it was Officer Rushton --  
14          they're intending to shoot you.

15          **THE COURT:** The problem with that analysis to  
16          me is, from a directed verdict standpoint, would be  
17          that it ignores the fact that the officers  
18          identified themselves repeatedly at the scene, as  
19          witnessed -- as testified to by the officers and  
20          heard by the neighbors, or Mr. Sheffield who  
21          testified as well.

22          **MR. HENDERSON:** In the light most favorable to  
23          the State, I agree that's how you've got to analyze  
24          this. But, Your Honor, all this is going on under  
25          the deck when Mr. --

1           **THE COURT:** It doesn't matter. I don't care if  
2           it's going on on the beach side. If somebody  
3           identifies himself as an officer and you split  
4           second shoot somebody, you know, I just -- at least  
5           makes it a jury question to me, okay, at the  
6           minimum.

7           **MR. HENDERSON:** And, Your Honor, one thing that  
8           we raised in the appeal -- I mean, Your Honor knows  
9           the history.

10          **THE COURT:** Yeah, I want you to have a good  
11          record, so go ahead and get it.

12          **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor -- if I may pass  
13          this up to His Honor, too.

14                 And you asked Ms. Ballard a question yesterday,  
15          Where are you going with this oath and stuff? Isn't  
16          that an appellate issue? And, yes, it was raised  
17          under the appeal, and we know the appeal has been  
18          dismissed, but we've still got these collateral  
19          issues going on.

20          **THE COURT:** Right.

21          **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, the uncontroverted  
22          testimony that came from the witness stand is that,  
23          under 23-13-10 -- and I'd like to get that packet  
24          marked as a Court's Exhibit, Your Honor.

25          **THE COURT:** Which packet?

1           **MR. HENDERSON:** This little packet I just gave  
2           you. It's like three or four sheets.

3           **THE COURT:** Okay. Sure. Court's Exhibit  
4           Number 6.

5                     (Court's Exhibit Number 6, Code of Laws, was  
6           marked for identification.)

7           **THE COURT:** I don't know that we necessarily  
8           need to make the statute an exhibit, but if you want  
9           to, I'll be glad to. It's a copy of Section  
10          23-13-10, 23-13-20, Constitution Section 26 oath of  
11          office, 23-13-50.

12          **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, 23-13-10, The  
13          sheriff may appoint one or more deputies to be  
14          approved by the judge of a circuit court or any  
15          circuit judge presiding therein. First sentence of  
16          it.

17                     The uncontroverted testimony by Deputy Rushton,  
18          he's never been approved by any circuit judge.

19          **THE COURT:** Are you saying "ever" is being from  
20          the first time he was with the department or the  
21          second time?

22          **MR. HENDERSON:** He said he's never been in  
23          front of a judge, circuit judge.

24                     Such appointment shall be evidenced by a  
25          certificate thereof, signed by the sheriff. None of



1           that was produced, Your Honor.

2           **THE COURT:**   So it's your position that in order  
3           for any law enforcement person to be certified, they  
4           have to appear before a judge and receive the oath  
5           of office by that judge?

6           **MR. HENDERSON:**   Your Honor, let me correct  
7           that -- let me clarify that, not correct it.

8           **THE COURT:**   Please.

9           **MR. HENDERSON:**   Deputy sheriffs are different.  
10          They are different than city police officers,  
11          they're different from SLED.   And the reason, Your  
12          Honor, if you look at these statutes, all these  
13          statutes came out of reconstruction, and I think  
14          there's a good reason why they came out of  
15          reconstruction.

16          Mr. Garrett is a Civil War buff, but at that  
17          point in time, there was a lot of questioning of  
18          people giving allegiance to the federal government.  
19          I mean, we just fought a war about it, about what  
20          government are we going to be adhering to.

21          **THE COURT:**   All right.   That's well and good,  
22          but bring it back to whether or not they need to  
23          appear in front of me or another circuit court  
24          judge.

25          **MR. HENDERSON:**   Okay.   On the first one, yes.

1       The deputy has got to appear in front of a circuit  
2       judge and be approved. And, Your Honor --

3               **THE COURT:** Where in the statute does it say  
4       appear?

5               **MR. HENDERSON:** May appoint to be approved by  
6       the judge. He's got to be approved. He said he's  
7       never been in front of any judge, never been  
8       approved by any judge.

9               **THE COURT:** Okay.

10              **MR. HENDERSON:** 23-13-20, the next page, Your  
11       Honor: Bond and oath. You know, Each deputy  
12       sheriff shall, before entering into the discharge of  
13       his duty, enter into a bond.

14              There's no evidence that Deputy Rushton did  
15       that or that that bond has been filed with Madame  
16       Clerk of Court and kept there. The law requires  
17       here, in 23-13-20, it sets forth an oath that each  
18       deputy has to take, and that oath has to be filed  
19       and recorded with the clerk.

20              Also, it sets forth -- if you'll skip to the  
21       next page -- a second oath that every deputy has got  
22       to take. South Carolina Constitution, Article III,  
23       Section 26, it also has to be, you know, like an  
24       oath, affirmation, notarized by all and recorded in  
25       the clerk's office, because the statute clearly says

1 all of this has to be done and filed with the Clerk  
2 of Court before entering the discharge of their  
3 duties.

4 And then you've got 23-13-50: When duly  
5 qualified, a deputy sheriff may perform any and all  
6 duties appertaining to the office of the principal,  
7 i.e., the sheriff.

8 So, yes, this is why deputy sheriffs are  
9 different, Your Honor. Every deputy, before he or  
10 she can be duly qualified -- forget whether or not  
11 they're a law enforcement officer -- before they can  
12 be duly qualified, they've got to be approved by a  
13 circuit judge, they've got to enter into these two  
14 oaths that have to be filed and recorded in the  
15 clerk's office, they have to enter into a bond that  
16 is filed and recorded in the clerk's office, and at  
17 that point in time, they are duly qualified to  
18 exercise the authority of the sheriff, you know,  
19 i.e., arrest people, you know, the standard what you  
20 think of as the sheriff having authority to do.

21 In this case, Your Honor, at most, Deputy  
22 Rushton entered into one of these oaths, which has  
23 been entered into evidence. There's been no  
24 testimony, and upon information and belief, it's not  
25 filed and recorded in the clerk's office.

1           So I think, Your Honor, as a matter of law, I  
2       don't think Deputy Rushton is entitled to any  
3       protections that he otherwise would have as a deputy  
4       sheriff because arguably -- and I think, based upon  
5       his own testimony and other testimony, he has not  
6       been duly qualified to act under the sheriff. And  
7       his testimony was that he's out there that night  
8       enforcing policy at the sheriff's direction.

9           And, Your Honor, there is a case, I believe  
10      1941. It's cited in this material, and I probably  
11      got a copy, but it's the Willis case out of Aiken.  
12      I think it's 1939, 1941.

13           **THE COURT:** I'm not familiar with it.

14           **MR. HENDERSON:** It's a workers' comp case, Your  
15      Honor. I know it's civil, but it's talking about  
16      what it takes to be a duly-qualified deputy sheriff.  
17      And our Supreme Court goes through this entire  
18      litany, you know, the oaths, the going in front of a  
19      circuit judge.

20           **THE COURT:** Well, let me ask you this: For  
21      purposes of what we're doing right now, do you  
22      contend the burden is on the State of South Carolina  
23      to prove that every time they have a criminal case,  
24      that each one of their officers is duly certified  
25      and qualified?

1           **MR. HENDERSON:** If a good defense lawyer's  
2 holding them to their burden of proof, absolutely.  
3 Absolutely.

4           **THE COURT:** And I know you both -- all three of  
5 you are fine lawyers. That's interesting. Okay.

6           **MR. HENDERSON:** And, Your Honor, this issue --  
7 and I won't bore the Court with it on the record  
8 because you probably don't want --

9           **THE COURT:** No, I just want to make sure you're  
10 protected.

11          **MR. HENDERSON:** Right. And that is our  
12 position, Your Honor. And it's not only my  
13 position, it's our Supreme Court's position --

14          **THE COURT:** Assume for the sake of argument  
15 today that Officer Rushton was not qualified or  
16 certified, what difference does that make under the  
17 factual scenario in this case?

18          **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, all this police,  
19 police, police stuff, don't get it.

20          **THE COURT:** Well, there were two undisputed  
21 police officers out there.

22          **MR. HENDERSON:** They've dropped those  
23 indictments, Your Honor. I mean, that is -- that's  
24 gone.

25          **THE COURT:** It doesn't matter. They're still

1 out there. He just happened to hit one --

2 **MR. HENDERSON:** They might be out --

3 **THE COURT:** Hold on. He just happened to hit  
4 the one who was not certified, under your argument.

5 **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, if they had gone  
6 forward with the indictments against these other  
7 two, we were going to raise these issues.

8 **THE COURT:** So he can shoot somebody who's not,  
9 and otherwise he can't shoot the ones that are?

10 **MR. HENDERSON:** No, not at all. That's not --

11 **THE COURT:** I mean, that's what I'm hearing.

12 **MR. HENDERSON:** No, that's not what I'm saying,  
13 Your Honor.

14 The issue is I think because he's not a  
15 duly-qualified deputy sheriff, the fact that he's  
16 allegedly yelling, Police, I'm wearing a badge, all  
17 of that stuff doesn't amount to a hill of beans as  
18 it relates to Mr. Rushton.

19 And the reason I say that that's important, if  
20 you go under the Castle Doctrine, one way that  
21 someone loses their protection under the Castle  
22 Doctrine is if they have reason to know it's law  
23 enforcement or if they have -- or they have reason  
24 to know that law enforcement's acting in their --

25 **THE COURT:** Well, based on the evidence that's

1 in the record at this juncture, what evidence is  
2 there of any reason that this gentleman had that  
3 would say that this was not law enforcement, other  
4 than the testimony about the lack of the markings on  
5 his uniform? Is there anything other than that?

6 **MR. HENDERSON:** That he could not see -- they  
7 could not see him. Obviously, he could not see  
8 them; just use deduction there. No blue lights.  
9 Dispatch had not called the residence. No sirens.  
10 No nothing.

11 And, again, there are no backlights. I mean,  
12 they're walking around in the dark. Truly in the  
13 dark. Darkest night of the month, for what it's  
14 worth; no moon. And Officer Rushton is not in  
15 uniform, or at least not in uniform that's got  
16 sheriff emblazoned on it. He's not giving any  
17 indicia that he's any type of law enforcement.

18 **THE COURT:** Other than saying I'm law  
19 enforcement.

20 **MR. HENDERSON:** Your Honor, he's saying that  
21 under a deck. Granted, in the light most favorable  
22 to the State, he said it underneath the deck at a  
23 point where he couldn't see Mr. Worley, I believe  
24 was his testimony; Mr. Worley could not see him.

25 And, again, I don't think you have to rely on

1        what somebody in the blind is telling you in the  
2        middle of the night when you think somebody might be  
3        trying to break in on you.

4            And I think, as it relates to self-defense, I  
5        think we can put up other -- duty of retreat's not  
6        relevant here. But I think of the other three  
7        elements, there is good evidence in the record that  
8        Mr. Worley had a right to defend himself, and we  
9        would ask that you direct a verdict saying that he  
10       had a right to defend himself in self-defense.

11           **THE COURT:** Other than the fact that I  
12       vehemently disagree with your position in this case,  
13       I find that, at least at a minimum, in the light  
14       most favorable to the State, that these are  
15       questions of fact that need to be resolved by the  
16       jury. But I respect your argument; I'm going to  
17       look at it a little bit further.

18           Both of you, since I asked you to go ahead at  
19       this juncture to make your directed verdict motion,  
20       if you have any additional grounds that you think of  
21       over the break, I'll let you put them on the record.

22           **MR. GARRETT:** Appreciate that, Your Honor.

23           **MR. HENDERSON:** Thank you, Your Honor. We  
24       appreciate it.

25           **THE COURT:** Thank you. I appreciate it.



1           **MR. HENDERSON:** Yes, sir.

2           **THE COURT:** Let's go ahead -- anything from the  
3 State before we take a lunch break?

4           **MR. MYERS:** No, sir. What time are we coming  
5 back?

6           **THE COURT:** 2:15.

7                   (Whereupon, there was a luncheon recess.)

8           **THE COURT:** From the defense side, any  
9 additional grounds to support their motion for a  
10 directed verdict?

11           **MR. GARRETT:** We do, Your Honor. We would like  
12 Ms. Ballard to --

13           **THE COURT:** Ms. Ballard.

14           **MS. BALLARD:** Thank you very much, Your Honor.  
15 Separate and apart from what Mr. Henderson has  
16 argued, even if Your Honor does not grant the motion  
17 for a directed verdict on self-defense or on the  
18 Castle Doctrine, we believe, as a matter of law,  
19 that the Court should rule on a directed verdict as  
20 to whether or not the State has established as a  
21 matter of law that Mr. Rushton was legally qualified  
22 as a deputy sheriff at the time he was at  
23 Mr. Worley's house. That will be a legal question  
24 not one that would be submitted to the jury.

25                   And as you know, it's our position that the

1 State had the burden of establishing that he was a  
2 legally qualified deputy sheriff at the time, and  
3 the absence of testimony is glaring.

4 There is no testimony that he took the bond  
5 that's required by statute. There is absolutely no  
6 testimony that he was sworn by a circuit judge as  
7 required by 23-13-10. There's no -- he took one  
8 oath, which was introduced into evidence as  
9 Defendant's Exhibit Number 4, but that was the  
10 constitutional oath.

11 So we believe that the Court has to establish  
12 at this point as a matter of law that Mr. Rushton  
13 was not qualified as a deputy sheriff at the time he  
14 was present on Mr. Worley's property.

15 We know -- his testimony was, he took his oath  
16 way back and then he went to Iraq. And then he  
17 testified that he did not come before a circuit  
18 judge, so we know that's true.

19 He signed the one that came into evidence as  
20 Defendant's Exhibit Number 4, but I think that has  
21 to be a legal determination.

22 **THE COURT:** I don't necessarily disagree with  
23 you. And I'm going to find for the record that the  
24 officer was certified and qualified based on what I  
25 heard. I know you have -- you challenge that, but

1 I'm also finding that regardless of whether or not  
2 this officer was certified or qualified, under the  
3 facts of this case, it doesn't make a difference.

4 And I think that you had two undisputed  
5 qualified, certified law enforcement officers at the  
6 scene --

7 **MS. BALLARD:** Yes, sir.

8 **THE COURT:** -- who are announcing, under the  
9 facts so far placed in the record, their presence.  
10 Even if Officer Rushton was not qualified or  
11 certified at the time, I don't think, under the  
12 facts, it makes a difference. I know you disagree  
13 with me, but --

14 **MS. BALLARD:** Well, just for the record, our  
15 position is that Mr. Rushton specifically had to be  
16 authorized and that the State has failed to  
17 establish that. And we think that his being in the  
18 company of people who were qualified did not sort  
19 of, by osmosis, turn him into a qualified deputy as  
20 well.

21 **THE COURT:** I got you.

22 **MS. BALLARD:** Thank you so much.

23 **THE COURT:** Thank you.

24 Anything further from the defense before we  
25 resume?

1           **MR. GARRETT:** Nothing at this time, Your Honor.

2           **THE COURT:** Okay. Anything from the State  
3 before we bring the jury in?

4           **MR. MYERS:** No, sir.

5           **THE COURT:** All right. Are you ready to call  
6 your first witness?

7           **MR. GARRETT:** I am, Your Honor.

8           **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury in?

9                   (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

10          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor. Call  
11 Mr. Robert Worley.

12                               ROBERT WORLEY,

13                   having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

14                               DIRECT EXAMINATION

15           BY MR. GARRETT:

16           **Q**     Would you tell us your name for the court  
17 record, please?

18           **A**     My name is Robert Worley.

19           **Q**     Mr. Worley, I'm going to ask you to speak up  
20 into that microphone. The acoustics in this room  
21 are sometimes difficult. So, if you don't mind, try  
22 to speak into that microphone so this jury can hear  
23 you. Okay?

24           **A**     Yes, sir.

25           **Q**     What is your relation to Joe Worley?

1       **A**     He's my younger brother.

2       **Q**     All right. Could you tell us a little bit  
3       about your family?

4       **A**     My father passed away in 2006.

5       **Q**     What was his name?

6       **A**     He is a senior; I am a junior. He's Robert  
7       Fred Worley, Sr., and I'm Robert Fred Worley, Jr.

8       **Q**     What did your father do for a living?

9       **A**     He worked at the Savannah River Plant. He was  
10      a civil engineer.

11      **Q**     What kind of responsibilities did he have for  
12      the government?

13      **A**     I think the -- he worked for Dupont, who was  
14      under contract with the government to run the plant.  
15      He worked in the reactor area, and he was actively  
16      involved in bringing the reactors up and down for  
17      the day-to-day operation. He wrote the manual for  
18      bringing them up and taking them down.

19      **Q**     And what about your mom? What did she do?

20      **A**     She basically took care of us. She was a  
21      housewife.

22      **Q**     Housewife. All right.

23             And where was your former home at? Where was  
24      y'all's former residence at growing up?

25      **A**     It was in Vanderbilt Drive in Aiken, South

1 Carolina.

2 Q So y'all lived there most of your life?

3 A Yes, we did.

4 Q Okay. And do you have any brothers or sisters?

5 A I have one brother, Joe, and a sister, Kay.

6 Q All right. And tell me about yourself. What  
7 kind of work do you do?

8 A Well, right now, I'm on vacation. I retired  
9 about ten years ago.

10 Q Okay. And let's go back through your history.  
11 What kind of work have you done over your days?

12 A Well, I worked for the Secret Service for a  
13 brief period of time in the early '70s.

14 Q Secret Service?

15 A Yes, sir.

16 Q Okay. What kind of -- what kind of work did  
17 you do for the government, the Secret Service?

18 A I was assigned to the White House to  
19 protection.

20 Q During which administration?

21 A It was during Nixon administration, and I left  
22 about a month before Watergate.

23 Q Okay. Watergate?

24 A Yes, sir.

25 Q You had to have security clearances for that

1 kind of thing?

2 **A** I had to have a top secret clearance for that  
3 job, yes, sir.

4 **Q** What about your dad? Did he have to have top  
5 secret clearance for his job?

6 **A** Yes, he did.

7 **Q** All right. And let's move on and talk about  
8 your sister. What does she do?

9 **A** My sister graduated from Clemson. She has  
10 worked for her entire career as an architect or in  
11 the real estate field of construction.

12 **Q** Okay. And where is she at now?

13 **A** She lives just south of me in Jacksonville,  
14 Florida.

15 **Q** And that's where you currently reside?

16 **A** Yes, it is.

17 **Q** Are you married?

18 **A** Yes, I am.

19 **Q** All right. How many children do you have?

20 **A** We weren't blessed with children. But I was  
21 blessed with a wife who's put up with me for over 40  
22 years.

23 **Q** I understand.

24 Now, what about Joe. Tell me a little bit  
25 about Joe.

1       **A**     Joe is my younger brother. I left, I guess,  
2       the house or the nest. And he's about ten years  
3       younger than I am.

4       **Q**     Okay. So when you left, what, about 18, he  
5       would have been, what, eight, something like that?

6       **A**     Yes, something like that.

7       **Q**     And where all did you -- how far would you  
8       stray from the family before you would get back to  
9       see your family?

10      **A**     During the years when my career was starting  
11      and my job was starting, probably during those  
12      years, two, three times a year.

13      **Q**     After you got out of the Secret Service, what  
14      kind of work did you do then? Or did you go to work  
15      or school?

16      **A**     The reason I went to work with the Secret  
17      Service was to earn enough money to finish my  
18      college degree.

19      **Q**     Did you finish that?

20      **A**     Yes, I did.

21      **Q**     Where did you finish and what type of degree  
22      did you get?

23      **A**     I finished at the University of South Carolina.

24      **Q**     In what year?

25      **A**     My degree is in finance with a minor in



1 economics, and it's a bachelor's degree.

2 **Q** After receiving that degree, what kind of work  
3 have you done throughout your career?

4 **A** Throughout my career, I've done real estate  
5 appraisal work.

6 **Q** All right. And in the process of doing real  
7 estate appraisals, do you have to size up houses,  
8 get inspections done on them, and that type of  
9 thing?

10 **A** Yes, sir, you do.

11 And I probably -- I don't know how many houses  
12 I've done over the years, but it's a considerable  
13 number.

14 **Q** How many years then, roughly, did you stay in  
15 that business until you retired some time ago?

16 **A** Probably in the neighborhood of 25.

17 **Q** Do you have knowledge of when your pop decided  
18 to buy this property down in Savannah Lakes or down  
19 at the Little River?

20 **A** My knowledge is sort of restrictive from the  
21 standpoint I was a child when he bought it. He  
22 bought it, I think, in 1958 to 1960, somewhere in  
23 that range. And we've been living or going up there  
24 on the weekends and spending holidays up there when  
25 I was a kid. And we've been, I guess, going to that

1 property for 50 years.

2 Q Okay. And during those years, you and your  
3 father and I guess your mother and sister and Joe,  
4 y'all would go over there and spend weekend times  
5 when y'all were in town?

6 A Yes, uh-huh, we would.

7 Q And after you folks had left the roost, so to  
8 speak, and you went on down to Jacksonville and your  
9 sister went to Jacksonville, is it your knowledge  
10 that your family would continue to have the family  
11 vacations there, as well as go to that place at  
12 least once a week?

13 A Yes. They were there at least once a week on  
14 average every week.

15 Q And did they continue to do that until about  
16 2006 when your father passed?

17 A Yes, they would, and they continued after that.

18 Q All right. When they first got the property,  
19 was it just plain land out there or farm land or --

20 A It was woods.

21 Q It was woods?

22 A Yes, sir.

23 Q All right. And at some point in time, did  
24 y'all pull a trailer out there?

25 A Yes, we did. After we cleared it off, we

1 pulled a trailer on it. It was a little 8 by 32, I  
2 think it was.

3 Q Eighty-five by 32?

4 A Eight. Eight feet wide by 32 feet.

5 Q So it was a real small trailer?

6 A Yes, it was.

7 Q All right. And when y'all would come out for  
8 the weekends, y'all would spend your time in this  
9 little trailer?

10 A That's correct.

11 Q And as I understand it, your father liked to  
12 fish a lot?

13 A Yes. We went fishing almost -- well, every  
14 weekend we went fishing.

15 Q Was he an environmentalist in the sense that he  
16 liked the outdoors?

17 A Yes, he was from that sense. You didn't throw  
18 a can in the water. You didn't put paper in the  
19 water. You put it in the boat and put it in the  
20 trash.

21 Q He trained you all that way?

22 A Pardon?

23 Q He trained you all that way?

24 A He pretty much trained all of us that way, yes.

25 Q And, at some point in time, I think you -- can

1       you tell us when a neighbor finally showed up down  
2       there for the first -- the years you finally saw  
3       some neighbors down there?

4       **A**     It was in the neighborhood of 1962, 1963. I  
5       believe the Stroms moved next door to us where the  
6       Sheffields currently live.

7       **Q**     The Stroms?

8       **A**     Yes, sir.

9       **Q**     What kind of house did they live in?

10      **A**     They lived in a mobile home. Mr. Strom had a  
11      drugstore uptown in McCormick.

12      **Q**     All right. And then how long did they stay  
13      before they finally went somewhere else or the  
14      Sheffields took over?

15      **A**     I believe Mr. Strom passed away and the family  
16      sold the property to the Sheffields, I'm assuming.

17      **Q**     Do you know what year that was?

18      **A**     No, I don't.

19      **Q**     All right. What I'd like to do is talk to you  
20      a little bit about y'all coming up there. How often  
21      would y'all come up there once the -- when the  
22      trailer ended, when did y'all build this house and  
23      tell me about the building of this house and why you  
24      did it.

25      **A**     The trailer was a little cramped, a little

1       small, awful hot in the summertime and awful cold in  
2       the wintertime. And pop decided he wanted to build  
3       a permanent structure, and he started it. My sister  
4       drew the drawings for it, and I think she drew them  
5       some time in 1974 to '76 timeframe. And then he  
6       started construction on it. Mom and dad built the  
7       place. Joe helped. Kay helped. I didn't help as  
8       much. And there were two shop teachers that are  
9       local that helped him build it.

10      **Q**     And did you and he discuss the plans for  
11       building that along with your sister as he was  
12       building it?

13      **A**     We did. We did discuss it.

14      **Q**     Are you familiar with the construction and what  
15       he actually did in the building of this house?

16      **A**     Yes, sir, I am. I'm familiar with it.

17      **Q**     One of the -- could you tell us one of his main  
18       reasons for wanting to do special things at this  
19       house?

20      **A**     He -- pop worked shift work at the plant, and  
21       he had a hard time sleeping. He was a light  
22       sleeper. And we were at the lake, and a lot of  
23       times, he would get off shift and he'd want to get  
24       some sleep. He'd stay up in the day and then try to  
25       sleep that night, and there's a whippoorwill.

1       Before it was built up, there were a lot of  
2       whippoorwills, and they would wake him up and  
3       they're nocturnal, and he often joked about having a  
4       whippoorwill for breakfast.

5       **Q**     I understand. So he wanted to do something to  
6       prevent him from having to hear these whippoorwills?

7       **A**     Yes, sir. In addition to that, he would have  
8       his buddies come up, and they would have a fishing  
9       weekend. And there were a couple of them that  
10      snored quite loudly, and he wanted to -- he couldn't  
11      sleep when they were there.

12      **Q**     All right. Because of the snoring at the  
13      trailer?

14      **A**     Yes.

15      **Q**     All right. So in response to that, what did  
16      your dad and sister and you and Joe and Mary do  
17      about building this thing?

18      **A**     Well, when he built the house, it's a little  
19      unique. He's an engineer by trade, and for  
20      instance, the slab to the property, the foundation  
21      for the floor, and he built what I would call a  
22      garage apartment.

23      **Q**     You would call the whole thing here?

24      **A**     Yes, sir. I would call it a garage apartment.

25      **Q**     I'm going to show you what's been marked as

1 State's 4, just a general representation of it, not  
2 to scale, but is that the -- that whole thing is a  
3 garage apartment, as you would call it?

4 **A** Yes, sir, it is. It's a garage apartment. My  
5 sister drew the floor plans and drew all the plans  
6 for it. She drew the specifications for it. And  
7 just to give you an example, the floor was designed  
8 to be four inches -- about a four-inch concrete  
9 slab, which is pretty standard. Pop put an  
10 eight-inch slab down.

11 The walls are eight-inch concrete block, and  
12 the web in the concrete block, every 48 inches, you  
13 fill it with concrete and you have rebar in them.  
14 Pop, instead of just doing it every 48 inches, he  
15 poured concrete on all of it. It's solid. The  
16 walls are solid concrete.

17 **Q** So rebar and concrete poured down into the webs  
18 of the --

19 **A** Yes. Uh-huh.

20 **Q** All the way around it?

21 **A** Yes, sir.

22 **Q** All around the exterior?

23 **A** All the way around the exterior, yes, sir.

24 **Q** And that's what the house then sits on?

25 **A** Yes, sir.

1           **Q**     Go ahead.

2           **A**     Then he wanted to be able to sleep, he wanted  
3           to have a quiet place, and he got a lot of kidding  
4           for it, but he would -- and he was also fairly  
5           thrifty. The exterior walls are double insulated,  
6           but what he did is he took three-and-a-half-inch  
7           fiberglass pad that you normally would find in a 2x4  
8           cabinet --

9           **Q**     Okay.

10          **A**     -- and he put two of them in there.

11          **Q**     So you had seven inches as opposed to three and  
12          a half inches inside of a 2x4?

13          **A**     Right, but he compressed it. And by  
14          compressing it, he formed sort of a sound insulation  
15          or more so than insulation for heating cold.

16          **Q**     Could you walk around there and show what areas  
17          that he did that? Were those interior or exterior  
18          walls?

19          **A**     Yes, sir. Actually, he did both the interior  
20          and the exterior.

21          **Q**     All right. Let's -- first, let's talk about  
22          that drawing there. Show us which walls you're  
23          referring to.

24          **A**     (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

25                 All of these walls here. All of the walls here



1           and here {indicating}.

2           **Q**     Okay. So all four corners, all of the walls  
3           all the way up to the roof structure?

4           **A**     Yes, sir.

5           **Q**     Were built with seven-inch insulation?

6           **A**     Yes, sir.

7                   (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

8           **Q**     All right. Now, as far as entrance and exit,  
9           is there an entrance door on this property?

10          **A**     The only entrance door to the property is on  
11          the first floor, pedestrian door.

12          **Q**     Would that be on the first floor under the deck  
13          here, the decking?

14          **A**     Yes, sir, that would be correct.

15          **Q**     All right. And the door itself, what kind of  
16          door is it?

17          **A**     It's a metal-clad insulated door. It has --  
18          it's solid. It doesn't have a peephole or anything  
19          in it.

20          **Q**     No peephole?

21          **A**     No, sir.

22          **Q**     Down below on the front, we'll call this the  
23          lake side of the house. I guess that's probably the  
24          best way to do it. In addition to that door that  
25          you talked about, are there any windows down here

1 below on this side?

2 **A** The only other openings in the building --

3 **Q** In the whole building there?

4 **A** On the first floor.

5 (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

6 **Q** Okay.

7 **A** There is a garage door here.

8 **Q** Okay.

9 **A** There's a small window high up here and a small  
10 window here. There are two on each side.

11 **Q** Down below?

12 **A** Yes, sir. This is on the first floor in the  
13 garage area.

14 **Q** Okay.

15 **A** But both of these windows or all four of these  
16 windows have been boarded up. And the reason he  
17 boarded them up is because he had problems with  
18 people trying to break in.

19 (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

20 **Q** All right. And could you tell the jury a  
21 little bit about that? When y'all had y'all's  
22 trailers down there, how many times or how often did  
23 they break into y'all's trailer down there?

24 **MR. MYERS:** Wait a minute. What's he basing  
25 that on? Was he there? I'm going to object to

1       hearsay. He hasn't laid a foundation for it.

2               **THE COURT:** Go ahead, if he knows.

3               **THE WITNESS:** May I answer the question?

4       BY MR. GARRETT:

5       **Q**     If you know.

6       **A**     Yes, sir. They attempted to break into the  
7       mobile home about four times. They were successful  
8       twice.

9       **Q**     All right. And did things get taken that  
10      belonged to the family?

11      **A**     Yes, sir, they did.

12      **Q**     So when dad was building the house, in addition  
13      to the concern about the snoring and the  
14      whippoorwills, he wanted to have something strong  
15      when he wasn't there?

16      **A**     Yes, sir. It didn't -- the windows were not  
17      originally boarded up. Someone attempted to break  
18      in -- after he built the building, attempted to  
19      break into it. And what they had done is jimmied  
20      the garage door and they jimmied it hard enough to  
21      where the rollers, it came off the track. And when  
22      that happened, he boarded up those windows.

23              Now, when you mentioned snoring, there is one  
24      thing that I didn't tell you about is all of the  
25      interior partitions --

1           **Q**     Yes, sir.

2           **A**     -- they also have two rows of  
3           three-and-a-half-inch fiberglass, side by side,  
4           shoved in.

5           **Q**     Inside of a 2x4 wall?

6           **A**     Yes, sir.

7           **Q**     2x4 studded wall?

8           **A**     Yes, sir.

9           **Q**     It also has seven inches of insulation through  
10          each of those interior walls?

11          **A**     Yes, sir.

12          **Q**     Could you kind of step up there again and show  
13          the jury generally the layout --

14          **A**     Yes, sir.

15          **Q**     -- of the apartment.  If His Honor allows them  
16          to go see it, it may be that they'll recognize it.  
17          But if you'll just kind of point it out where the  
18          general layout of the house is and where those walls  
19          are.

20          **A**     (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

21                 In the back corner are the two bedrooms in the  
22          back.

23          **Q**     Is this upstairs or downstairs?

24          **A**     This is upstairs.  Upstairs.  I'm sorry.

25                 Bedroom here and bedroom here.

1           **COURT REPORTER:** Can you -- you're going to  
2 need to speak up, please.

3           **THE WITNESS:** Oh, I'm sorry.

4           In the back are the two bedrooms. Here would  
5 be the bathroom, a single bathroom. Entry -- stair  
6 entry coming up is about in here. You have a living  
7 room here in this quadrant. Your dining area --  
8 dining room is here, and your kitchen is right here  
9 {indicating}.

10 BY MR. GARRETT:

11       **Q** All right. So how many partitions would you  
12 say are in there on the interior -- in the interior  
13 walls? How many interior walls would you say you  
14 have that are insulated like that?

15       **A** Interior walls that are insulated are the walls  
16 in the bedrooms, and the rest of this area is open.

17       **Q** Is open?

18       **A** Yes, sir. And there's insulation also in this  
19 wall between the two bedrooms.

20       **Q** Okay. That prevents hearing snoring between  
21 bedrooms?

22       **A** Yes, sir.

23       **Q** All right. Now, tell me about the bottom  
24 floor. What's going on with the bottom floor?

25       **A** (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

1           The bottom floor, there is a partition that  
2           splits the bottom floor, as you first walk in the  
3           door to your right. And the door is right here  
4           {indicating}, the pedestrian door.

5           **Q**     Yes, sir.

6           **A**     So when you walk in, there's a partition to the  
7           right, and it's plywood siding and it's just on 2x4  
8           studs. But now this wall where this door is at,  
9           right here and up through here on the first floor,  
10          it has a sheet of plastic and then it's got foam  
11          insulation in it on the -- in 2x4 studs, and then  
12          it's got T1-11 on the outside of it, plywood siding.  
13          And that goes where the stairwell's at over to where  
14          this partition is. It splits this downstairs on the  
15          first floor.

16          **Q**     Okay. Would that have kept that area quieter  
17          than the rest of the back first floor?

18          **A**     That area -- the whole house is quiet. If you  
19          are familiar with motel construction, they often put  
20          a concrete block wall to separate the units in the  
21          motel for sound control and strength.

22          **Q**     Yes, sir.

23          **A**     In essence, that whole exterior wall is that  
24          way.

25          **Q**     Okay.

1       **A**     And if you're talking about sound quality, in  
2       addition to that, you've got the sheeting, the  
3       plastic sheeting on that first floor, and then  
4       you've got the foam insulation in the wall, and then  
5       you've got the siding. The only place that sound  
6       enters the building on the first floor would be  
7       through that pedestrian door and the garage door.

8       **Q**     Okay. And, at some point in time, did y'all  
9       decide to put the burglar alarm in this house?

10      **A**     Yes, sir. The burglar alarm was installed  
11      after the incident with the garage door.

12      **Q**     Do you know about what year that was?

13      **A**     I would have to say that particular incident  
14      took place probably in the late '70s or early '80s.  
15      It's been quite some time ago. If you ask me 1979,  
16      I couldn't say, yes, or if you asked me 1980, I  
17      couldn't say, yes, but it was back in that time  
18      period.

19      **Q**     In that timeframe?

20      **A**     Right.

21      **Q**     So y'all were trying to protect this, when you  
22      built it, you put a burglar alarm in it, in addition  
23      to building it the way that you did?

24      **A**     Yes, sir.

25      **Q**     And at what point in time did y'all decide to

1 go ahead and board up the windows and put that  
2 security system in? At about the same time or did  
3 you board up the windows a little later or --

4 **A** It was all done just about the same time. The  
5 security alarm went in right after the garage door  
6 got jimmied, and the windows were boarded up then  
7 because it was an access point.

8 **Q** Have they remained boarded up since then?

9 **A** Yes, sir.

10 **Q** Now, are they -- what about these windows out  
11 front? Are these boarded up? Here's some -- this  
12 is towards the water. Are those boarded up, those  
13 windows?

14 **A** The only windows up there are -- on the second  
15 floor you're referring to?

16 **Q** Yes, sir.

17 **A** Okay. No, sir, they're not.

18 **Q** Okay. And what kind of windows are they?

19 **A** To the right and the left of the two-panel  
20 sliding glass door, which is in the center, you have  
21 a double-hung wood window, single pane, on the right  
22 and a double-hung single pane window on the left,  
23 and both of those windows have storm windows on  
24 them.

25 **Q** In addition?



1       **A**     In addition to the single pane.

2       **Q**     And what about the sliding glass door? Does it  
3       have a storm door or not?

4       **A**     No, sir, it does not. It's a door pane, glass  
5       door. And it's aluminum and frame.

6       **Q**     Now, is that also -- can you describe the floor  
7       construction that's between the first floor and this  
8       door entrance and the second floor? Tell us about  
9       the floor construction and whether or not it's  
10      insulated.

11      **A**     The floor -- and you're talking about the floor  
12      on the -- for the second floor; right?

13      **Q**     Right. You've got your -- how -- is it like an  
14      eight or 10-foot wall first and then --

15      **A**     Yes, sir.

16      **Q**     And then you put your floor on?

17      **A**     Right.

18      **Q**     How is it constructed?

19      **A**     It's 2x10 joists that's going across. The  
20      actual subfloor is three-quarter-inch plywood, and  
21      it's tongue and groove, so it laps when you install  
22      it.

23      **Q**     Yes, sir.

24      **A**     It has a half-inch foam pad, and then it has  
25      carpet.

1           **Q**     Carpet on top of that?

2           **A**     Yes, sir. Now, the kitchen is linoleum and the  
3 bathroom is linoleum.

4           **Q**     Now, as far as a doorbell, do y'all have a  
5 doorbell?

6           **A**     Yes, sir. The doorbell was installed because  
7 pop couldn't hear people coming to visit.

8           **Q**     Okay. Do y'all have a -- can you describe, if  
9 I were to come to your house and knock on your  
10 door --

11          **A**     Yes, sir.

12          **Q**     -- and I was in that bedroom with that door  
13 closed, would I be able to hear you?

14          **A**     No, sir.

15          **Q**     Is there any question about that?

16          **A**     No, sir. When the driveway was gravel, which  
17 it stayed gravel a long time when we lived in the  
18 trailer, if somebody cut down the driveway, you  
19 could actually hear the tires on the gravel.

20                 In this house, you see them appear out in your  
21 front yard. You never hear them. And if you  
22 knocked on that door downstairs, you couldn't hear  
23 it upstairs.

24          **Q**     All right. At some later time, I'm assuming  
25 then you built these other outbuildings. And did

1       you build yourself a deck?

2       **A**     The -- actually, the way that was done,  
3       originally, the deck was by itself. If you look at  
4       it, it's got steel framing that comes back in to the  
5       building and is bolted onto the floor joists, and  
6       then the deck was cantilevered out.

7       **Q**     Okay. So the deck is up top. Tell us again  
8       about that. You're talking about this area here?  
9       Is it under the roof, that deck?

10      **A**     (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

11             Yes, sir, it is. Now, originally, the deck was  
12      built first, and those steel beams come back in here  
13      and tie to the floor joists. So the deck was  
14      self-supporting.

15      **Q**     Okay.

16      **A**     And then pop decided that he wanted to make a  
17      porch out of it and that's what he did. So now you  
18      have a cover over this deck and you've got a  
19      concrete patio on the bottom and this deck. And  
20      it's covered.

21      **Q**     All right. And then what about a dock? Did  
22      y'all, at some point, build you a dock down there?

23      **A**     (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

24             Yes, sir. The dock was built in 1969 or 1970.  
25      It's --

1       **Q**     Would you step up to that? Help me identify  
2       that one.

3       **A**     That would be the dock there, sir. Right there  
4       {indicating}.

5             My father likes concrete, and it's actually a  
6       floating concrete dock. It's been there since about  
7       1969 or 1970. And it's composed of concrete planks  
8       that he poured, and we set it on Styrofoam. And you  
9       put it together plank by plank, is the way you put  
10      it together. And it's tied together by rebar.

11      **Q**     All right. Did your father -- did your father  
12      hunt?

13      **A**     Yes, sir, he did.

14      **Q**     And tell us about his hunting habits or gun  
15      habits.

16      **A**     Gun habits was safety. He liked to think of  
17      himself a duck hunter, but he wasn't a real good  
18      duck hunter. He liked to hunt deer, and he did that  
19      until he got older.

20      **Q**     That weapon standing up there in front of you  
21      right there --

22      **A**     Yes, sir.

23      **Q**     -- do you recognize that weapon?

24      **A**     It appears to be --

25      **Q**     You were referring to State's Exhibit Number 6.

1 It appears to be what? I'm sorry.

2 **A** It appears to be a .30-06 that was at the lake.

3 **Q** Okay. Were there any other weapons there at  
4 the lake?

5 **A** Yes, sir. There was a single-barrel 12-guage  
6 shotgun, I believe.

7 **Q** There was a shotgun in there as well?

8 **A** Yes, sir. Now, there may be other weapons  
9 there, but I don't, you know, I didn't notice them.

10 **Q** Did you use any of those weapons after you  
11 moved out of your dad's house?

12 **A** No, sir. I don't recall using those weapons  
13 after I moved out of pop's house. Prior to moving  
14 out of the house, I used some of his weapons. I  
15 don't remember ever firing that particular .30-06.

16 **Q** You don't know particularly when your daddy got  
17 it or whatever?

18 **A** No, sir, I don't.

19 **Q** But you do know that he had that and that he  
20 actually owned that weapon?

21 **A** Yes, sir.

22 **Q** All right. And when your dad died, as I  
23 understand it, there was a will?

24 **A** Yes, there was.

25 **Q** And did it leave everything to your mama?

1       **A**     Yes, sir, it did.

2       **Q**     All right.  Let's talk about your mama for a  
3       minute.  How old is mama now?

4       **A**     She's 87, going on 88.

5       **Q**     And tell us a little bit about her condition.

6       **A**     She is doing good now.  She had a rough patch  
7       after pop passed away.  She's doing pretty good.  
8       She's dropped something on her foot the other day  
9       and now she's hobbling around a little, but I think  
10      she's doing fine for almost 88.  She'll be 88 in  
11      May.

12      **Q**     And so she would have been 84, approximately,  
13      in November of 2009?

14      **A**     Yes, sir.

15      **Q**     How is she about hearing?

16      **A**     Almost nonexistent.

17      **Q**     She has a hard time hearing?

18      **A**     Yes, sir.  Very hard time.

19      **Q**     All right.  Other than that, she's pretty  
20      healthy, though?

21      **A**     Yes, sir, she is.

22      **Q**     All right.  And after -- you said she hit a  
23      rough patch after your pop died.  Tell us a little  
24      bit about what you mean by that and what you and  
25      your family, if you did anything to try to, I guess,

1 help her through that.

2 **A** Well, she, of course, was depressed and lonely  
3 and she was forgetful, and I guess what you do when  
4 you go through mourning. And we weren't exactly  
5 sure if it was that or if she was having another  
6 problem. And that lasted for a couple of years.

7 **Q** Okay. Did you and your family take steps --  
8 did you, including Joe, take steps to try to help  
9 her?

10 **A** Yes, sir. Yes, sir.

11 **Q** Tell us -- tell the jury what kind of steps  
12 y'all took to take care of your mama.

13 **A** Well, my sister and I came by more often,  
14 visited more often. Joe stayed there to take care  
15 of mom. And even today, we continually, you know,  
16 we call every week. My sister calls every day. I  
17 call three to four times a week just checking up on  
18 her. She seems to be doing good. But there after  
19 pop passed away, she had a real rough patch.

20 **Q** Since the shooting down here --

21 **A** Yes, sir.

22 **Q** -- tell me how often does your mother go down  
23 there now?

24 **A** Mom usually tries to visit the lake place once  
25 a week now. Before, we spent -- in retirement, my

1 family -- my mom and dad would spend at least half  
2 the week there, probably sometimes a little more.  
3 She will not stay there at night because she's  
4 scared.

5 Q And has she spent a night there without anybody  
6 else there since this happened?

7 A No, sir, she hasn't. And we've only talked her  
8 into staying there one night. Or I correct that:  
9 Two nights. She stayed there two nights.

10 Q She stayed there two nights?

11 A Yes, sir.

12 Q Has this kind of upset -- this, obviously,  
13 upset your entire family?

14 A Yes, sir, this has.

15 Q Do y'all pay county taxes?

16 A Yes, sir.

17 Q To McCormick County?

18 A Yes, sir.

19 Q And have y'all done that since you bought this  
20 property back in the 50s?

21 A Yes, sir.

22 Q And have y'all ever had any problem with law  
23 enforcement down here? You described some  
24 burglaries and whatnot, but have you ever had any  
25 problem with law enforcement of any kind down here



1 in the McCormick area over all the years that you  
2 know?

3 **A** No, sir, not that I know of. I know I haven't.

4 **Q** Did you have a knowledge of a cat named Sweet  
5 Pea?

6 **A** Yes, sir.

7 **Q** All right. Help the jury understand why Sweet  
8 Pea's important to your family, how that is, and why  
9 that is?

10 **A** Sweet Pea was a stray.

11 **Q** A stray?

12 **A** Yes, sir. It was my parents' -- my father,  
13 especially, saw it. Eventually, over a period,  
14 coaxed it to him. And the cat had a flea collar on  
15 it that had been put on it when it was a kitten, and  
16 I don't know, if it was that big around, you know --

17 **MR. MYERS:** Your Honor, if he's here all the  
18 time and he's testifying from personal knowledge, I  
19 have no objection, but if he's not here and he's  
20 testifying on things that are told to him or that he  
21 read or he saw, I do have an objection.

22 **THE COURT:** All right. I agree with that. Lay  
23 some foundation, please, sir.

24 **MR. GARRETT:** I'll lay some foundation.

25 BY MR. GARRETT:

1       **Q**     This cat, is it a -- every time you come down  
2       to visit, is this cat a topic of conversation?

3       **A**     Yes, sir.

4       **Q**     All right. And the care for this cat, is it  
5       something that is traditional?

6               **MR. MYERS:** Objection to leading.

7       BY MR. GARRETT:

8       **Q**     Just tell us what you have personal knowledge  
9       of about this cat. What do you know about this cat  
10      from your personal knowledge? Have you helped with  
11      this cat?

12      **A**     Yes, I have.

13      **Q**     All right. And -- but go ahead and just tell  
14      us from your personal knowledge, not what somebody  
15      told you, but what you understand about what's  
16      happened with this cat.

17      **A**     I've seen the cat injured up at the lake. Two  
18      or three times the cat was injured.

19      **Q**     In what years? Can you help us understand what  
20      years those were?

21      **A**     I would say that was in the mid 90s --

22      **Q**     Okay.

23      **A**     -- to maybe 2000 that the cat was injured.  
24      Now, it did -- the injury did require it to go to  
25      the vet one time, and that was later, probably

1 closer to 2003, 2004.

2 **Q** Actually had to go to the vet?

3 **A** Yes, sir.

4 **Q** Okay. And would y'all have -- from time to  
5 time, have to take steps to try to protect that cat  
6 against the elements?

7 **MR. MYERS:** Well, now, wait a minute. Is he  
8 talking about him being here protecting the cat?  
9 He's saying y'all.

10 **THE COURT:** Well, he prefaced his comments to  
11 him earlier about personal knowledge.

12 And your answers need to be based on your  
13 personal knowledge. Okay, sir?

14 **MR. MYERS:** Your Honor, I request that he ask  
15 he and not y'all when he asks the questions.

16 **THE COURT:** Go ahead, please, sir.

17 BY MR. GARRETT:

18 **Q** Your personal knowledge of money spent or  
19 whatever to take care of the cat, do you have some  
20 knowledge of that? And if you don't, that's fine.

21 **A** I don't have a personal knowledge of the money  
22 spent on the cat. I do have personal knowledge of  
23 the cat with the bandage on his tail.

24 **Q** All right. And did your father and Joe do  
25 anything special around this house for this --

1           **MR. MYERS:** Can we have a timeframe, please?

2           **THE COURT:** Would you please identify the  
3 timeframe, please, sir?

4           **MR. GARRETT:** I am.

5 BY MR. GARRETT:

6           **Q** Do you have knowledge when your dad and Joe did  
7 anything towards building protection for the cat,  
8 and did you actually see that protection?

9           **A** Yes, sir, I did. When they left the cat -- or  
10 left on the weekends, they would leave the cat up  
11 there at first. And they built a catwalk. And it's  
12 -- if you look at the building there, it's on the  
13 left side towards the front.

14          **Q** Step down and show us where this catwalk is.

15          **A** The catwalk is located right along in here  
16 {indicating}. It's a part of the drawing.

17          **Q** Okay.

18          **A** And it allowed the cat to go from the first  
19 floor to the second floor onto the wood deck.

20               On the wood deck, in this corner right here  
21 {indicating}, there's a cathouse. And it's  
22 overbuilt, to say the least.

23          **Q** All right. And was that -- was that done for  
24 any particular reason?

25          **A** For the cat so it could sleep up there and not

1 have to sleep in the woods.

2 Q In the woods at or around you there?

3 A Yes, sir.

4 Q All right. As far as ammunition or anything,  
5 did your dad have a reloader?

6 A I saw my father with a reloader down in the  
7 basement twice.

8 Q Did you ever see Joe with a reloader during all  
9 your years?

10 A No, sir, I did not.

11 Q Do you know whether Joe reloads bullets or not?

12 A I do not know.

13 Q All right. And do you really know whether your  
14 dad reloaded bullets or not?

15 A Not -- I didn't see him do the reloading. I  
16 saw the reloader on the counter in the basement, and  
17 I saw pop putting it up.

18 Q Do you reload bullets?

19 A I have in the past.

20 Q Okay. And do y'all have a lathe -- at either  
21 location, does your family own a lathe machine?

22 A You mean like a wood lathe or a metal lathe?

23 Q A metal lath.

24 A Not a metal lathe, no, sir.

25 Q At your house in Aiken?

1       **A**     No, sir.  There's not one in Aiken.  There's  
2       not one at the lake, but, however, there is a wood  
3       lathe at the lake.

4       **Q**     There's a wood lathe at the lake?

5       **A**     Yes, sir.

6       **Q**     Okay.  Would you be able to turn metal on a  
7       wood lathe?

8       **A**     I don't think so.  It's apples and oranges, I  
9       believe.  I'm not real familiar with the operation  
10      of a lathe.

11           **MR. GARRETT:**  Beg the Court's indulgence.

12                   (Pause.)

13      **Q**     Are you familiar with the lighting on this  
14      property?

15      **A**     Somewhat familiar with it, yes, sir.  There are  
16      a lot of light switches on the property, if you  
17      looked at it, yes, sir.  And I'm always getting them  
18      confused.

19      **Q**     There's a -- or is there a light here and a  
20      light here?

21      **A**     There's a 300-watt floodlight in each corner of  
22      the wood deck.

23      **Q**     And how -- if I want to turn this one on, where  
24      do I have to go -- can I cut it on from the outside  
25      standing on the deck?

1       **A**     No, sir, you cannot.

2       **Q**     What would you have to do to be able to do it?

3       **A**     You would have to -- there's a sliding glass  
4       door that's in the center here {indicating}.

5       **Q**     Yes, sir.

6       **A**     If I was facing outside towards the lake,  
7       there's a switch right by where you open the door to  
8       cut that light on.

9       **Q**     Okay.

10      **A**     And it's an individual switch.

11      **Q**     Okay.

12      **A**     And you have to flip another switch to cut on  
13      the other light in the upper corner -- in the upper  
14      corner.

15      **Q**     And where is that light switch for this corner  
16      over here? Do you know where that light switch is?

17      **A**     It's in -- it's in the same spot. There's a  
18      row of about four switches there.

19      **Q**     Okay. And is there any question that they're  
20      all on the inside?

21      **A**     No, sir. They're all on the inside. There's  
22      not a light switch on the outside to cut those  
23      lights on or any other lights.

24      **Q**     Is there a light under the -- this decking  
25      area? If I were to look up under this decking area

1 right here that's out here, is there any of that,  
2 the wood porch, does any of that got a light on it  
3 under there?

4 **A** No, sir.

5 **Q** And then what about -- then you got the roof  
6 structure over the top of this thing?

7 **A** Yes, sir.

8 **Q** And does the roof on the outside, once you get  
9 out past the plate glass window, once you get out  
10 there, is there any lights on the inside up under  
11 the ceiling?

12 **A** No, sir, not that I recall. I've never seen a  
13 light up there. I haven't looked.

14 **Q** Okay. So as far as your knowledge -- and then  
15 I'm assuming each of these interior rooms has its  
16 own lighting?

17 **A** Yes, sir.

18 **Q** Is that correct?

19 **A** Uh-huh.

20 **MR. GARRETT:** Beg the Court's indulgence.

21 (Pause.)

22 **Q** If -- there's a light behind here, a large  
23 street light, a light pole?

24 **A** Yes, sir. It's a sodium light. It puts out an  
25 orange-type glow.



1       **Q**     Okay.

2       **A**     And it's what you would typically see perhaps  
3       on a street, a single-bulb light.

4       **Q**     Okay. Does it -- if I'm -- if it's dark and  
5       I'm standing here, am I getting any light? Or if  
6       I'm standing here {indicating}, am I getting any  
7       light from back there?

8       **A**     No, sir. The front yard is completely in the  
9       shadow, and by the time you get to the front yard,  
10      that light is very dim. If you're standing in the  
11      front yard, no, sir.

12      **Q**     Okay. And if we were to cut -- step inside and  
13      cut that light on right there --

14      **A**     Yes, sir.

15      **Q**     -- what area would it illuminate?

16      **A**     It would illuminate the whole front yard. It's  
17      a floodlight, and it would get this whole area out  
18      in here.

19      **Q**     All right. Now, what about the other  
20      floodlight, if you added it to it?

21      **A**     It would do the same thing.

22      **Q**     So it would basically cover maybe say like that  
23      {indicating}, and that would cover like that or  
24      something like that?

25      **A**     The lights would come out straight almost. But

1 the residual light would allow you to see on the  
2 other side.

3 **Q** Okay. And that light, the one that's pointed  
4 here, a light can be pointed out, it can be pointed  
5 down, medium, or just straight down. Do you know  
6 what the normal placement of that light was?

7 **MR. MYERS:** It's not the normal placement, Your  
8 Honor. We object as to what it was on November  
9 the 15th of 2009.

10 **MR. GARRETT:** I'm getting to that.

11 **THE COURT:** All right. Get to it.

12 BY MR. GARRETT:

13 **Q** Do you know --

14 **A** It's normally focused out in the yard is where  
15 it's normally focused.

16 **Q** And, to your knowledge, has anybody ever  
17 changed that?

18 **A** It's been changed now, but up until that point  
19 in time, no, it was set and left alone.

20 **Q** Okay. And did it also -- can you talk about --  
21 was there a tree in there back then in 2009 that had  
22 some limbs on it?

23 **A** Yes, sir. There were -- actually, there were  
24 two trees to -- may I?

25 **Q** Yes, sir.

1       **A**     To this side of the drawing {indicating}, there  
2       were two trees.  There's a bank here, it drops off  
3       fairly sharply.  And those two trees were in that  
4       drop-off area, and they came over into the yard.

5       **Q**     Well, to give you some scale --

6       **A**     Yes, sir.

7       **Q**     -- this railroad tie right here will give you  
8       scale.  Tell them, in relationship to that railroad  
9       tie, where those trees were.

10      **A**     The two trees -- one was right in here, I  
11      believe {indicating}, and one was here.  The stumps  
12      are still there.

13      **Q**     Okay.

14      **A**     And they flowed over -- one flowed over into  
15      the yard.

16      **Q**     All right.  Did you have to cut those down at  
17      some point?

18      **A**     Yes, sir.  They got the -- beetles in them, I  
19      believe, and they -- they were dead.  They were  
20      threatening the building, and we took them down.

21      **Q**     Do you know what year you took them down?

22      **A**     In the past two years.

23              **MR. GARRETT:**  Beg the Court's indulgence.

24                      (Pause.)

25      **Q**     And just for clarification, this has been

1 described. Can you describe this? Is this -- it  
2 says dirt driveway. Is it a dirt driveway that's in  
3 front of that metal building and comes all the way  
4 down?

5 **A** Yes, sir. The driveway actually goes to where  
6 the mobile home was setting. And the mobile home is  
7 setting in front of -- was setting in front of this  
8 building.

9 **Q** Yes, sir.

10 **A** What my father was doing, he was building this,  
11 I think, at one time with the thought of it being a  
12 guest cottage.

13 **Q** Right.

14 **A** And on the point or on the -- right before you  
15 start dropping off to the lake --

16 **Q** Right.

17 **A** -- he was going to build the main house. If  
18 you go to the lake, he's got a lot of wood that he  
19 cut off of that lot that he was going to use on that  
20 building, and it's stacked in back of this little  
21 building.

22 **Q** That little shed back there was wood that he  
23 had cut off of the property?

24 **A** Actually, there's --

25 **Q** A lumber pile?

1       **A**     Yes, sir.  There's a lumber pile back here.

2       **Q**     All right.

3       **A**     And that's what he was going to use the lumber  
4       for.

5       **Q**     And that landing where that -- if I were to  
6       follow that driveway all the way down to that  
7       landing where that new house was going to be built,  
8       do y'all use that as a driveway?

9       **A**     Yes, sir.  We turn around there.  We still use  
10      it.  It's still got -- it had gravel and I think now  
11      it's got some sort of asphalt -- broken up asphalt  
12      on it.

13      **Q**     Right.

14      **A**     And it's being grown up by the weeds now.

15      **Q**     Suppose a vehicle --

16      **A**     Yes, sir.

17      **Q**     -- is parked at or about, I think, this area  
18      right here, would anybody inside the house be able  
19      to see that under the construction as of November  
20      the 15th, 2009?

21      **A**     No, sir.  It wouldn't be visible from the back  
22      windows, and it would not be visible from the front  
23      or the deck unless you leaned around the side of the  
24      building.

25      **Q**     Okay.  In order to see it, you'd have to lean

1 around the side of the building?

2 **A** Yes, sir. You'd have to -- you'd have to go to  
3 the end of the wood deck and lean out to look back  
4 behind the building.

5 **Q** Now, you weren't there on the night in  
6 question, I'm assuming?

7 **A** No, sir, I was not.

8 **Q** So you really don't know anything about what  
9 happened out there that night?

10 **A** No, sir.

11 **MR. GARRETT:** All right.

12 **THE COURT:** Cross-examination?

13 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

14 CROSS-EXAMINATION

15 BY MR. MYERS:

16 **Q** Mr. Worley, you said that the house was built  
17 around 1976; is that correct or incorrect?

18 **A** I said in the vicinity of 1976. It could have  
19 been '78. I know that pop never finished it.

20 **Q** Pardon me?

21 **A** I say I know my father never considered it  
22 finished.

23 **Q** Yes, sir.

24 **A** It was finished to the point that you could  
25 occupy it somewhere between 1976, '78, somewhere in

1           that range.

2           **Q**     Now, you talk about -- you talked about  
3           concrete walls and concrete floors and rebars and  
4           double insulation.   Fiberglass?

5           **A**     Yes, sir.   It was three-and-a-half-inch  
6           fiberglass that you normally have in a normal 2x4  
7           stud wall.   And what he did was he took two -- a  
8           double layer, and he took the backing off of one  
9           layer, and he shoved it in that wall.

10          **Q**     He did that himself.   He didn't have anybody  
11          building it for him?

12          **A**     He did -- that's not exactly correct.

13          **Q**     What's correct?

14          **A**     He had two shop teachers help him build it.

15          **Q**     I'm sorry.   I can't hear good.

16          **A**     I'm sorry.   He had two local shop teachers.

17          **Q**     Who were they?

18          **A**     I do not know their names, sir.

19          **Q**     When you say local, local where?

20          **A**     Local to this county.

21          **Q**     McCormick County?

22          **A**     Yes, sir.

23          **Q**     And you never saw them?

24          **A**     Pardon me?

25          **Q**     You never saw them?

1       **A**     Yes, sir, I did see them.

2       **Q**     But you don't know who they are?

3       **A**     I don't remember their names, sir.

4       **Q**     Okay.

5       **A**     I'm sorry. I don't remember that -- that back.

6       **Q**     Yes, sir. And the two shop teachers built the  
7       house?

8       **A**     The two shop teachers helped my father and my  
9       mother build the house. My brother also helped. My  
10      sister helped. I'm the one that was -- did not help  
11      very much.

12      **Q**     So you did not help -- and I'm glad you brought  
13      that up, because I put down here. You did not help  
14      build it?

15      **A**     I did not help very much, sir.

16      **Q**     Well, how much did you help? Where were you  
17      living at the time?

18      **A**     At that point in time, I was living in  
19      Jacksonville.

20      **Q**     Well, how often would you come up here to help?

21      **A**     About once a month.

22      **Q**     Once a month?

23      **A**     Yes, sir.

24      **Q**     Every month?

25      **A**     Not every month, no, sir. Sometimes I would be



1 up every three weeks, sometimes once a month.

2 Q Well, during '76, how many times do you think  
3 you came up here?

4 A I really couldn't honestly give you an answer  
5 to that, sir, because I don't know.

6 Q In '77, how many times did you come up here?

7 A During the time it was constructed, I don't  
8 recall back that far, sir. I couldn't tell you '77,  
9 '78, or '79. I was here periodically, when my  
10 sister and I used to kid my father about the way he  
11 constructed the building and we --

12 Q I haven't asked you anything about that.

13 A Okay. I'm sorry.

14 Q Fiberglass has an opposite result. Rather than  
15 cutting out noise, fiberglass kind of expands out  
16 and allows noise; did you know that?

17 A Yes, sir. If you put a three-and-a-half-inch  
18 back in a four-inch stud.

19 Q Yes, sir.

20 A If you compress that back, it has a tendency to  
21 inhibit the transmission of sound.

22 Q Well, compressing it makes it worse; did you  
23 know that?

24 A No, sir. That's not correct. I don't think  
25 so.

1           **Q**     So you dispute that?

2           **A**     Yes, sir, I would.

3           **Q**     Well, let me ask you a question: Who was there  
4           the first time the house was broken into and what  
5           was the date the first time it was broken into?

6           **A**     The house?

7           **Q**     This garage apartment.

8           **A**     Garage apartment. Okay. Thank you, sir.

9           **Q**     I think you said it was broken into --  
10          attempted four times and successful twice? Is that  
11          what you said?

12          **A**     That's referring to the mobile home, sir.

13          **Q**     All right. The mobile home.

14          **A**     The mobile home, and it was back in the --

15          **Q**     All right. Let's see '76, '86, '96, 2006.  
16          Thirty-three years ago was the first time it was  
17          broken into?

18          **A**     I would say that that's probably correct.

19          **Q**     Probably 40 years, because '76 is when you  
20          started the house.

21          **A**     '76 is when we started it.

22          **Q**     Okay. Who was there when it was broken into?

23          **A**     No one was there.

24          **Q**     Pardon me?

25          **A**     No one was there when it was broken into.

1       **Q**     The second time, who was there and when was it  
2       broken into?

3       **A**     No one was there.

4       **Q**     No one was there. When was that?

5       **A**     And we're talking about the mobile home now?

6       **Q**     That'd be fine.

7       **A**     Okay. Okay, because the house --

8       **Q**     Who was there?

9       **A**     No one was there.

10      **Q**     The third time, who was there?

11      **A**     No one.

12      **Q**     The fourth time?

13      **A**     No one.

14      **Q**     We got anymore? Five, six, seven, eight? Who  
15      was there?

16      **A**     We had one attempt at the garage apartment, I  
17      would call it.

18      **Q**     Who was there?

19      **A**     And no one was there.

20      **Q**     So no one has ever been there when somebody  
21      tried to break into it?

22      **A**     That's correct.

23      **Q**     Who was arrested?

24      **A**     No one was arrested.

25      **Q**     Where is the police reports?

1           **A**     I don't know about the police reports, sir.

2           **Q**     Because none were ever filed?

3           **A**     That I don't know.

4           **Q**     But we don't have them.

5                   **MR. GARRETT:**  Objection, Your Honor, he said he  
6           didn't know.

7           BY MR. MYERS:

8           **Q**     Do you -- so to your knowledge --

9                   **THE COURT:**  Hang on, Mr. Myers.  Ask him if he  
10          knows whether or not there's one filed, please.

11          BY MR. MYERS:

12          **Q**     Do you know if any were filed?

13          **A**     No, sir, I do not.

14          **Q**     So if any weren't filed, it wasn't serious  
15          enough to bring it to the police's attention?

16          **A**     I don't think that there was enough taken  
17          because we didn't have much there, sir.  It wasn't  
18          worth it.

19          **Q**     It was a trespass thing.

20                   Now, let me ask you this:  Tell us about that  
21          sliding glass door up the stairs.

22          **A**     Yes, sir.

23          **Q**     Tell us how sturdy and soundproof that sliding  
24          glass door is.

25          **A**     The door on the second floor is not --

1           **Q**     I'm talking about the sliding glass door --

2           **A**     It's a standard sliding glass door.

3           **Q**     Oh, it's no specially built sliding glass door?

4           **A**     No, sir, not to my knowledge, it's not --

5           **Q**     Now, what about the window -- I'm sorry. Go  
6           ahead.

7           **A**     It is a standard sliding glass door.

8           **Q**     Now, what about the window to the left? See  
9           right here on this diagram, Number 4. What about  
10          the window to the left?

11          **A**     Both of those windows are the same. They're  
12          double-hung single pane wood windows.

13          **Q**     No specially soundproof windows?

14          **A**     No, sir, there is not.

15          **Q**     Now, what were you saying about this floodlight  
16          right up there? What were you saying about how that  
17          was on November the 15th, 2009?

18          **A**     Sir, I wasn't there November the 15th, 2009.

19          **Q**     I thought you --

20          **A**     I could -- I stated -- I hope I stated that  
21          that floodlight pointed out into the yard, and it  
22          had been set and left that way for years.

23          **Q**     For years. For years.

24                 Well, let me show you State's Exhibit Number 5.

25          **A**     Yes, sir.

1           **Q**     Is that how it was supposed to have been?

2           **A**     That's the floodlight there, yes, sir, but I do  
3     not -- I can't tell from this picture the angle of  
4     it. I'm sorry.

5           **Q**     Well, it's taken from the ground.

6           **A**     I know, sir, but I don't normally look at it  
7     from the ground.

8           **Q**     Well, step down here. Let's you and I talk to  
9     the jury about this.

10          **A**     I normally look at it from the wood deck.

11          **Q**     I understand that.

12          **A**     (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

13          **Q**     And whoever took this picture was standing down  
14     right here, right out the side on the ground down  
15     there. And it's shining down, isn't it?

16                 By the way, that was taken on the 15th of  
17     November 2009.

18          **A**     Uh-huh. It appears to be shining down, but I  
19     can't tell from that picture whether it was focused  
20     like it was focused out in the yard.

21          **Q**     Well, when was the last time you saw that light  
22     prior to November the 15th, 2009?

23          **A**     Two weeks before when I was there.

24          **Q**     Now, let me show you this picture, State's  
25     Number 25. This is taken in 2011. That light has

1       been moved then by someone after the fact, hadn't  
2       it? After the shooting?

3       **A**     That -- between these two pictures?

4       **Q**     Yes, sir.

5       **A**     I would say you're correct, it's been moved.

6       **Q**     After the shooting, on Number 25, somebody has  
7       moved that light; isn't that right?

8       **A**     It appears, from that photograph, that the  
9       light has been moved, yes, sir.

10      **Q**     But on the day of the shooting, it's pointing  
11      right down, isn't it?

12      **A**     I can't tell from the photo. It is pointing  
13      out, but I can't tell -- since we're looking at it  
14      this way, I can't tell the tilt.

15             (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

16      **MR. MYERS:** Excuse me one moment, please.

17             (Pause.)

18      **Q**     Now, y'all were talking about if someone were  
19      up on this deck right up here -- up here -- for  
20      example, your brother.

21      **A**     Yes, sir.

22      **Q**     And there was a white car parked right here and  
23      a police car parked behind it, how would you say  
24      that somebody would have to look around that corner  
25      to see the police car?

1       **A**     Yes, sir.  You would have to look around the  
2       corner.

3       **Q**     How would they have to do it?  Couldn't they  
4       just come right there and look?

5       **A**     You would have to come up -- this cathouse is  
6       right here.  You'd have to come up and work your way  
7       over because there's a little ramp for that  
8       cathouse.

9       **Q**     You mean if somebody's upstairs here --

10      **A**     Yes, sir.

11      **Q**     -- they couldn't look right there?

12      **A**     No, sir.  The cathouse is right here in this  
13     corner.  You'd have to walk over here and look back.

14      **Q**     Yes, sir.  So you couldn't see that?  Is that  
15     what you're telling me?

16      **A**     No, sir.  I'm telling you, if you walked over  
17     here and looked back, you could see something.

18      **Q**     And that cathouse went way out?

19      **A**     It comes out some, but there's a little ramp  
20     for the cat there.

21      **Q**     Where?

22      **A**     Down at the base of it.

23      **Q**     And where does that ramp go down?

24      **A**     And if you've got a picture.

25      **Q**     I've got a side picture here; I'm referring to



1           Number 16. Is the ramp on the outside?

2           **A**       (Witness reviewing document.)

3           **Q**       Is the ramp on the outside over here, just like  
4           you told the jury? Right over here, where is that  
5           ramp on the outside?

6           **A**       If you look --

7           **Q**       Don't show me, show them.

8           **A**       This right here may be a little ramp.

9           **Q**       I'm sorry. This lady has got to hear you.

10          **A**       Oh, I'm sorry.

11          **Q**       You said it may be?

12          **A**       I can't tell from this photo, sir.

13          **Q**       Well, if it's there, it would be on that photo,  
14          wouldn't it?

15          **A**       I can't tell. I can't see it well enough to  
16          tell you that's it, but you can walk to this corner  
17          and look back.

18          **Q**       So there's no problem with somebody walking  
19          around this corner and looking right behind that car  
20          that's about even and seeing a police car back here,  
21          is it?

22          **A**       No, sir. You can walk to that corner and look  
23          back, but you have to walk around the cathouse.

24          **Q**       Was it difficult to walk around?

25          **A**       No, sir, it's not.

1       **Q**     So the cathouse doesn't really make any  
2       difference, does it?

3       **A**     It doesn't make a lot of difference, no.

4       **Q**     Thank you.

5             Now, I want to ask you about this.  If I  
6       confuse you, you let me know.

7             **MR. GARRETT:**  Objection to the commentary, Your  
8       Honor.

9             **THE COURT:**  Overruled.

10       BY MR. MYERS:

11       **Q**     If someone -- in State's Exhibit Number 5, if  
12       someone were downstairs at this door here -- see  
13       that door downstairs?  It's the door right down  
14       there.

15       **A**     Yes, sir.  The pedestrian door going into the  
16       house.

17       **Q**     Someone's downstairs --

18       **A**     Yes, sir.

19       **Q**     -- and they knock on that door --

20       **A**     Yes, sir.

21       **Q**     -- you're saying that people upstairs couldn't  
22       hear it?

23       **A**     Yes, sir, that's correct.

24       **Q**     How do you know that?

25       **A**     I have tried knocking on that door.  I've had

1 my mom knock on that door.

2 Q Oh, no, no. Repeat that again.

3 A Wait a minute --

4 Q No, no. You had who?

5 A My mom knock on that door, but what I have done  
6 -- I questioned that myself, and I set up a boom box  
7 and I turned it on.

8 Q Where was the boom box?

9 A About two and a half feet from the door, two  
10 feet.

11 Q The door downstairs right here?

12 A Yes, sir. Facing -- the speakers facing the  
13 door, and I turned it up.

14 Q Uh-huh.

15 A And I couldn't hear it. Now, you can  
16 hear inside --

17 Q Where were you?

18 A When I couldn't hear it?

19 Q Yes, sir.

20 A On the second floor.

21 Q You were on the second floor?

22 A Yes, sir.

23 Q Okay. Let's get this straight. Somebody  
24 downstairs knocking on that door, you could not hear  
25 it upstairs?

1           **A**     No, sir.

2           **Q**     I'm going to ask you one more thing: You said  
3           your mom's hearing is almost nonexistent?

4           **A**     That's correct.

5           **Q**     And if someone were knocking on the door  
6           downstairs, your mom certainly couldn't hear it  
7           upstairs?

8           **A**     No, sir. That's correct.

9           **Q**     You're positive about that?

10          **A**     Yes, sir.

11          **Q**     Now, when did y'all cut these trees down over  
12          here you're talking about?

13          **A**     I would say in the last two years.

14          **Q**     Last two years?

15          **A**     Yes, sir.

16          **Q**     November the 15th, trees were right there where  
17          that cross tie is?

18          **A**     Yes, sir, there were two trees there.

19          **Q**     You don't happen to have a picture of that, do  
20          you, because we can't find them in our picture. Do  
21          you have a picture of that?

22          **A**     That would show both of those trees?

23          **Q**     That would show the trees over this cross tie.

24          **A**     I may have one, sir.

25          **Q**     Could I see it?

1       **A**     I don't have it with me. Could I go to  
2       counsel's table?

3       **Q**     Yes, sir.

4       **A**     (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

5             I've got two photos that I think will show  
6       those trees, sir.

7       **Q**     Yes, sir. And who took these photographs?

8       **A**     I may have taken them. I'm not sure.

9       **Q**     When did you take them?

10      **A**     In -- I don't --

11      **Q**     I don't see a date on them. When did you take  
12      them?

13      **A**     They would have been taken two years ago.

14      **Q**     Two years ago?

15      **A**     Wait a minute. This is not my photo. I did  
16      not take this photo.

17      **Q**     You don't know when they were taken?

18      **A**     No, sir, I don't. I don't know. I did not  
19      take this photo. That's not my mark on it.

20      **Q**     Okay. That's good.

21      **A**     (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

22      **Q**     What do those trees have to do with this case?  
23      Why did you bring that up?

24      **A**     (No response.)

25      **Q**     What do those trees have to do with this case

1 and why did you bring it up?

2 **A** The two trees?

3 **Q** You testified --

4 **A** I removed them from the property. It's  
5 changed.

6 **Q** You removed them from the property two years  
7 ago?

8 **A** Yes.

9 **Q** So they don't have anything to do with 2009, on  
10 November 15th?

11 **A** No, sir.

12 **Q** Well, why did you bring it up?

13 **A** Because I removed them from the property.

14 **Q** Did you change that light after the shooting,  
15 too?

16 **A** No, sir.

17 **MR. MYERS:** No further questions.

18 **THE COURT:** Redirect?

19 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. GARRETT:

21 **Q** Do you recognize these two photographs as being  
22 your property?

23 **A** Yes, sir, I do.

24 **Q** And the trees that you removed, are those limbs  
25 of the trees that you removed?

1           **MR. MYERS:** May we see them?

2           **THE WITNESS:** Yes, sir. And I think I did take  
3 those two pictures.

4                   (Pause.)

5 BY MR. GARRETT:

6           **Q**     Do those -- tell us what those leaves or limbs  
7 demonstrate.

8           **A**     That they're down low on the property.

9           **Q**     And what are they at or near?

10          **A**     They're near the cross tie.

11          **Q**     This area right here, railroad tie? Is that  
12 what we're talking about?

13          **A**     Yes, sir.

14          **Q**     Does it appear those actually -- the limbs  
15 actually go over the railroad tie?

16                  **MR. MYERS:** Objection; leading.

17                  **THE COURT:** Rephrase.

18 BY MR. GARRETT:

19          **Q**     Can you tell us what they appear to do as it  
20 relates to the railroad tie?

21          **A**     Yes, sir. They do appear to go, from this  
22 angle, go over the railroad ties.

23          **Q**     And did you take those photographs?

24          **A**     These, I believe I did take. These -- they're  
25 similar to photos I have taken.

1           **Q**     Do you recognize the time stamp on those? Are  
2           those yours?

3           **A**     Yes, sir, I think they are. They were taken  
4           May 17th, 2012.

5           **Q**     How long was it after that that you had to cut  
6           them down? It looks like they're --

7           **A**     Right after.

8           **Q**     -- they're dying there.

9           **A**     Right. Like I said, it was approximately two  
10          years ago.

11          **MR. GARRETT:** Move to introduce these two  
12          photos.

13          **THE COURT:** Any objection?

14          **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir, we object. It's 2012,  
15          not 2009. We're talking about three years later, so  
16          it's not relevant for 2009.

17          **THE COURT:** What is the relevance?

18          **MR. GARRETT:** Relevance shows that there was a  
19          tree that had overhang that was in existence and had  
20          been for years.

21          **MR. MYERS:** No, sir. 2009 is what we're  
22          talking about now. If he's got a 2009 picture, I  
23          don't have any problem.

24          **THE COURT:** I overrule your objection. They'll  
25          be admitted.



1 (Defendant's Exhibit Numbers 8 and 9,  
2 photographs, marked and admitted into evidence.)

3 **COURT REPORTER:** Defendant's 8 and 9.

4 **MR. GARRETT:** Move to admit them into evidence,  
5 Your Honor.

6 **THE COURT:** They're admitted.

7 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor.

8 BY MR. GARRETT:

9 **Q** Would you come around and show the jury these  
10 pictures and describe them for them so they can --  
11 and it's in relationship to this area right here?

12 **A** (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

13 Right. There's sort of a ditch running along  
14 through here and the land drops off real steep...

15 **COURT REPORTER:** Can you speak up, please?

16 **THE WITNESS:** Oh, I'm sorry.

17 There's a ditch running along the side of the  
18 property here. There's a railroad tie. Those trees  
19 were right in here. And if you look, not in this  
20 picture but in this picture, you can see how they  
21 come towards the railroad tie.

22 BY MR. GARRETT:

23 **Q** Walk on down so they can see it.

24 **A** (Witness complies.)

25 And you notice --

1           **THE COURT:** No, sir. No, sir.

2           **THE WITNESS:** Can't talk? I'm sorry.

3                   (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

4           BY MR. GARRETT:

5           **Q**     I believe Mr. Myers --

6                   **MR. GARRETT:** Beg the Court's indulgence, Your  
7           Honor.

8                   (Pause.)

9           **Q**     Do you recognize that tree as being an earlier  
10           photograph of the tree that you actually took the  
11           picture of in 2012?

12                   **MR. MYERS:** He just said a little while ago he  
13           didn't know when that photograph was being taken.

14                   **THE COURT:** I sustain that objection.

15                   **THE WITNESS:** It's --

16                   **THE COURT:** No, sir, you can't answer.

17                   **MR. GARRETT:** No further questions.

18                   **THE COURT:** Any recross?

19                   **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

20                                 RECROSS-EXAMINATION

21           BY MR. MYERS:

22           **Q**     Come down here, please, sir.

23           **A**     Yes, sir.

24                   (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

25           **Q**     Defense Number 8, show the jury where the cross

1 tie is in that.

2 **MR. GARRETT:** I'm sorry?

3 **MR. HENDERSON:** Didn't hear the question.

4 BY MR. MYERS:

5 **Q** Show the jury where the cross tie is in that  
6 picture.

7 **A** It's not in this picture, sir.

8 **Q** It's not in the picture?

9 **A** No, sir. It is in the picture you're holding.

10 **Q** Well, let's see this Number 9.

11 **A** Pardon me?

12 **Q** Show them where the cross tie is and where the  
13 tree is.

14 **A** It's right here.

15 **Q** And where is the tree?

16 **A** And this is the limb for the tree right here.

17 **Q** You had to cut that tree down for these little  
18 twigs right here?

19 **A** No, sir. The whole tree was that way. The  
20 whole tree was dead.

21 **Q** Oh, excuse me. I apologize.

22 The whole tree? Well, where is --

23 **A** You're only seeing --

24 **Q** Show them where the whole tree is.

25 **A** The whole tree is not in this photo, sir.

1           **Q**     But what is that?

2           **A**     That's the limb from the tree.

3           **Q**     Now, what's that got to do with this case?

4           **A**     Like I said --

5           **Q**     You don't know?

6           **A**     I -- the only reason I took that picture, it  
7           was in the picture --

8                   **MR. GARRETT:**   Calls for speculation.

9                   **THE COURT:**   Overruled.

10          BY MR. MYERS:

11          **Q**     The only reason you took that picture was why?

12          **A**     Because I was taking pictures of the property,  
13           and I removed those two trees.  That's the only  
14           thing.

15          **Q**     But where is that second tree you removed?

16          **A**     It is adjacent to this.

17          **Q**     It's not in that photograph?

18          **A**     No, sir, it's not.

19                   **MR. MYERS:**   That's all I have.  Thank you, sir.

20                   **THE COURT:**   May this witness step down?

21                   **MR. GARRETT:**   Yes, Your Honor.

22                   **THE COURT:**   Thank you, sir.

23                   Madame Forelady, let's go ahead and take a  
24           quick break for this afternoon, and then we'll bring  
25           you back for further testimony.

1 (The jury retires to the jury room.)

2 **THE COURT:** Let me ask you just some logistical  
3 issues right quick, not holding you to it, just to  
4 give me an idea, do you have any idea of how many  
5 witnesses you may call? I'm looking at when we need  
6 to be ready to take them out to the place to make  
7 sure we have some rules set for that as well.

8 **MR. HENDERSON:** Can we have one moment, Your  
9 Honor?

10 **THE COURT:** Sure. And if you don't want to  
11 answer, you don't have to.

12 **MR. HENDERSON:** No, I think we can.

13 (Pause.)

14 **MS. BALLARD:** Your Honor, it looks like we have  
15 one witness for this afternoon that might take the  
16 remainder of the afternoon, and then we have two  
17 short witnesses in the morning. I would suggest  
18 that the visit be scheduled for after lunch  
19 tomorrow.

20 **THE COURT:** Okay. Any problem, Mr. Myers or  
21 Mr. Maye, trying to get those logistics worked out  
22 so we can get everybody there?

23 **MR. MYERS:** That's fine, sir.

24 **THE COURT:** Is that okay?

25 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

1           **THE COURT:** And, also, I want y'all to be  
2           thinking about the ground rules, and I'll be quite  
3           honest with you, I've never visited a scene in any  
4           criminal case. I've done them in condemnation  
5           cases, but I anticipate that there will probably be  
6           some requests coming through from the jury, and be  
7           thinking in terms of how or if we're going to  
8           respond to them. Okay?

9           **MR. GARRETT:** Judge Keesley and I actually  
10          looked at a similar house in a civil case, and he  
11          instructed the jury not to even talk among  
12          themselves while they looked, and they couldn't ask  
13          any questions.

14          **THE COURT:** I understand that, and that may be  
15          -- that may be the way we go, may not. I hate to  
16          leave the jury in the dark and not answer their  
17          questions. At the same time, it may be -- without  
18          the court reporter, being able to respond to it out  
19          there --

20          **MR. MAYE:** They have an oath that the Clerk of  
21          Court in Lexington used to do, when I worked for  
22          Judge Baggett, numerous times the juries went out to  
23          the scene, and they have an oath in Lexington, I  
24          think, that the jurors had to take. They gave them  
25          something. I remember it. And I imagine that the

1       Lexington Clerk of Court would still have it.  It's  
2       like what the bailiffs are supposed to do and the  
3       drivers are supposed to do.

4               **THE COURT:**  All right, guys.

5               (Brief Recess.)

6               **THE COURT:**  Mr. Garrett, are you ready to  
7       proceed?

8               **MR. GARRETT:**  I am, Your Honor.

9               **THE COURT:**  Mr. Myers?

10              **MR. MYERS:**  Yes, sir.

11              **THE COURT:**  You need a few minutes for your  
12       folks to come back in?

13              **MR. MYERS:**  They'll come back in.

14              We're ready.

15              (Defendant's Exhibit Number 10, CD, marked  
16       for identification.)

17              **THE COURT:**  Would you bring the jury in,  
18       please?

19              (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

20              **MS. BALLARD:**  Your Honor, we'd like to play --  
21       and I understand we have no objection from the  
22       Solicitor -- we'd like to play for the jury the  
23       audio of the 9-1-1 call, as well as the radio  
24       traffic from that evening.  I understand there's no  
25       objection from the prosecution.

1           **MR. MYERS:** No objection.

2           **THE COURT:** All right. Go right ahead, please.  
3 Are you set up to go ahead and play it?

4           **MS. BALLARD:** And we've introduced the CD as  
5 Defendant's Exhibit Number 10 without objection.  
6 Mr. Henderson is going to bring his computer over.

7           **THE COURT:** Admitted without objection.

8                   (Defendant's Exhibit Number 10, CD, admitted  
9 into evidence.)

10          **THE COURT:** So you're going to set it up so the  
11 jury can hear it?

12          **MS. BALLARD:** So the jury can hear it, yes,  
13 sir.

14          **THE COURT:** All right. Ladies and gentlemen of  
15 the jury, when that is being played, if, for some  
16 reason, you can't hear it, raise your hand so we can  
17 try to adjust it so you can.

18                   (Whereupon, Defendant's Exhibit Number 10  
19 was played for the jury.)

20          **MR. MYERS:** Your Honor, that was -- I just want  
21 to make it clear, that was purported to be the  
22 entire tape. There was a lot of skips in there. I  
23 just want to make sure the entire tape was played.

24          **THE COURT:** Okay, sir.

25                   Would you call your next witness, please, sir?



1           **MR. GARRETT:** Call Nick Moore to the stand.

2           **THE COURT:** You're still under oath, Mr. Moore  
3 -- Officer Moore.

4           **MR. MYERS:** Your Honor, he's been presented and  
5 cross-examined. Is this for new material?

6           **THE COURT:** I am going to require that you go  
7 over new material. You were given wide latitude on  
8 cross-examination. I'm not going to let you go back  
9 over the same information again.

10          **MR. GARRETT:** The only point, Your Honor, is it  
11 relates to the oath of office and whether or not he  
12 has bonds.

13          **THE COURT:** Whether or not this one has oath --

14          **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

15          **THE COURT:** Okay. That was not gone over.  
16 I'll let you go over that.

17          **MR. MYERS:** Can we bring up a matter?

18          **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

19                Would you go to the jury room?

20                (The jury retires to the jury room.)

21          **MR. MYERS:** Your Honor, we've gone into it with  
22 Bobby Rushton, the victim in here, but as far as  
23 anything with Nick Moore, it's not an element of  
24 assault and battery with intent to kill, so we'd  
25 like to know what the purpose is for asking this

1 witness.

2 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, it's our position  
3 that there's an attempt on a law enforcement  
4 exception trying to tie Mr. Rushton and Mr. Nick  
5 Moore together as being the police officer exception  
6 for the Castle Doctrine. And we believe that it's  
7 relevant as to whether or not he was a lawful police  
8 officer on the night in question.

9 **THE COURT:** What does it do? Does it tie into  
10 self-defense?

11 **MR. GARRETT:** It does. It ties into both  
12 self-defense and the Castle Doctrine.

13 **MR. MYERS:** Is he talking about the statutory  
14 Castle Doctrine?

15 **THE COURT:** The Castle Doctrine, you know, the  
16 issue has been ruled upon earlier, it's not part of  
17 this trial, but the self-defense is. So if it ties  
18 into self-defense, I would agree with you.

19 **MR. GARRETT:** Well, that's true, but we also,  
20 we would make a motion at the end of our  
21 presentation of evidence for you to reconsider that  
22 earlier ruling.

23 **MR. MYERS:** Now, I'm lost now. Is he talking  
24 about the statutory act of the Castle Doctrine or  
25 the common law Castle Doctrine?

1           **THE COURT:** Let me just tell you this: The  
2           Castle Doctrine, as it was ruled on earlier, was  
3           statutory when I read it.

4           **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

5           **THE COURT:** I'm not dealing with the Castle  
6           Doctrine. That's a pretrial ruling. That's already  
7           been done. I'm not dealing with that. But the  
8           defense still has a right to raise the defense of  
9           self-defense or habitation.

10          **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

11          **THE COURT:** And I'm going to let -- as long as  
12          that goes into that, I'm going to let you do it, not  
13          as to the Castle Doctrine because that's not part of  
14          this case.

15          **MR. MYERS:** And the defense of habitation, a  
16          police officer is not an element of that either,  
17          under State versus Bryant.

18          **THE COURT:** Well, how does that apply then?  
19          Tell me what element of self-defense that this  
20          police officer being certified and qualified would  
21          come into you meeting your or putting your  
22          affirmative defense of self-defense.

23          **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, I believe the Curry  
24          case requires that the courts make a separate  
25          independent finding about whether or not he's a

1 police officer, and we're entitled to have you rule  
2 on that --

3 **THE COURT:** I've got the Curry case right here.

4 **MR. MYERS:** The Curry case said that the  
5 statutory Castle Doctrine is not a part of the  
6 trial.

7 **THE COURT:** It says it's not to be charged.

8 **MR. MYERS:** And it's not a part of the trial  
9 because it's not charged and it's not involved in  
10 it.

11 **THE COURT:** Where in the Curry case does it say  
12 I have to make an independent finding?

13 **MR. MYERS:** Curry says, once the ruling's been  
14 made, that's it. And a ruling has been made.

15 **MS. BALLARD:** Your Honor, if I could, as it  
16 related to our directed verdict motion, Your Honor's  
17 ruling was that, because Mr. Moore -- or Officer  
18 Moore and Officer McAllister were deputy sheriffs,  
19 that you -- there was sort of an osmosis theory that  
20 brought Mr. Rushton --

21 **THE COURT:** Well, I don't know if I would  
22 qualify it as osmosis, but I did, in the  
23 alternative, say that in the event that Officer  
24 Rushton was not qualified, the other two were.

25 **MS. BALLARD:** Correct. So we want to establish

1       that neither Officer Moore nor Officer McAllister  
2       have met the statutory requirements either.

3               **THE COURT:** Well, let me ask you this: In  
4       relevancy terms, where does that come into this  
5       case?

6               **MS. BALLARD:** We intend to ask for a jury  
7       instruction on the Castle Doctrine. The Curry case  
8       leaves it open --

9               **THE COURT:** Not going to get it. I'll tell you  
10      right now, the Curry case says you don't get it.

11              **MR. MYERS:** You don't get it.

12              **MS. BALLARD:** We believe what the Curry case  
13      says is that there's a pretrial determination made  
14      in the Curry case. The court said that the jury  
15      instruction on the Castle Doctrine was permissible  
16      under these facts, under the Curry facts.

17              **THE COURT:** I'll go back and look at it again.  
18      My recall of that case was Judge Goldsmith, they  
19      said that he had made a mistake in charging the  
20      Castle Doctrine in the case and he shouldn't have.

21              **MS. BALLARD:** I'm sorry. Well, I misspoke.  
22      But we are going to request a jury instruction on  
23      the Castle Doctrine under the -- since Your Honor  
24      has ruled that, as a matter of law, Mr. Rushton is a  
25      law enforcement -- is a deputy sheriff. We're going

1 to ask for a jury instruction on the Castle Doctrine  
2 as to whether or not Mr. Rushton and the others have  
3 a right to be there, which is relevant to  
4 self-defense and to the Castle Doctrine. We're  
5 going to request a jury instruction on that. I  
6 realize you're going to overrule it, but --

7 **THE COURT:** Well, I understand. Let's look at  
8 -- just take a minute for a second. Let me...

9 **MR. MYERS:** Curry case, Your Honor, I can tell  
10 you --

11 **THE COURT:** I've got it.

12 (Pause.)

13 **THE COURT:** If you'll look at page -- well,  
14 mine is five, but it's headnote -- section B under  
15 headnote eight. It says, Appellant contends the  
16 trial court erred in charging the jury on both the  
17 provisions of the act and the self-defense.

18 And it -- after the court previously held above  
19 that they -- that the -- in the trial, the elements  
20 of self-defense must be presented or disproven by  
21 the State.

22 Then it says under headnotes 12, 13, and 14,  
23 that appellant claims the charge is purposeful  
24 ambiguity, which confused the jury. It said, The  
25 charge under the act was indeed error, but one that

1       inured to the benefit of the appellant. And they  
2       denied that.

3               **MS. BALLARD:** I understand.

4               **THE COURT:** And the way I read that case is you  
5       don't charge that. That's purely pretrial immunity  
6       determination, but you don't charge the act. So --

7               **MS. BALLARD:** The way we read it is because of  
8       the social guest analysis in the Curry case, the  
9       court has not addressed the circumstances of that  
10      issue involving whether someone is or is not a law  
11      enforcement officer who has a right to be present  
12      under the circumstance where he is.

13              And the Curry case does, in fact, say there's a  
14      lot left to be answered about the way the Castle  
15      Doctrine applies, so we intend to request a jury  
16      instruction on that. And we would like to offer the  
17      testimony of Officer Moore and Officer McAllister to  
18      establish that they, too, have -- were not qualified  
19      properly under the statute.

20              **THE COURT:** Well, let me ask you this: Even if  
21      you're correct, or maybe we need a stipulation  
22      they're not found in the public records, but is  
23      there anything that indicates these officers were  
24      responsible for their filing of their qualification?  
25      I thought that was a duty by the sheriff or somebody

1 higher up.

2 **MS. BALLARD:** 23-13-10 requires the sheriff to  
3 file it, but it also says -- excuse me -- 23-13-20  
4 says, Each deputy sheriff shall, before entering  
5 upon the discharge of his duty, file a bond. That's  
6 not on the sheriff. That's on each individual  
7 officer.

8 **THE COURT:** Let me do this: I'm going to let  
9 you protect yourself on the record. I'm going to  
10 let you make a proffer of that evidence. I don't  
11 think it goes to the element of self-defense. I  
12 think that is what is germane here in the elements  
13 of assault and battery with intent to kill and  
14 possession of a weapon during the commission of a  
15 violent crime. Otherwise, it's not relevant. Okay?

16 I may be wrong. So make your proffer and then  
17 we'll move on, if that's okay.

18 **MS. BALLARD:** Thank you, Your Honor.

19 **THE COURT:** Okay. Go ahead and make your  
20 proffer, please, sir.

21 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor.

22 This would be a court exhibit, Judge, wouldn't  
23 it?

24 **THE COURT:** Yeah, let's make that actually --  
25 because we don't need to send that back to the jury.



1 I'm not going to charge the Castle Doctrine to the  
2 jury.

3 (Court's Exhibit Numbers 7 and 8, Oaths of  
4 Office, marked for identification.)

5 **MR. GARRETT:** Please the Court.

6 **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

7 NICHOLAS MOORE,  
8 having been previously duly sworn, resumed the  
9 witness stand and testified as follows:

10 DIRECT EXAMINATION

11 BY MR. GARRETT:

12 **Q** Mr. Moore, could I get you to review what's  
13 been marked as Court's Exhibit Number 7 and Court's  
14 Exhibit Number 8 and tell me if you recognize what  
15 those are.

16 **A** Yes, I recognize them.

17 **Q** Would you tell us what the first one is and  
18 identify it for us, please?

19 **A** It says it's an oath for county and state  
20 officers.

21 **Q** And what date was that one?

22 **A** That was October the 16th, 2007.

23 **Q** All right. And do you have another one there?

24 **A** I sure do.

25 **Q** Could you identify it?

1       **A**     It's also an oath for county and state  
2       officers. And the date on it is January the 8th,  
3       2009.

4       **Q**     All right. And are those your oaths that you  
5       signed and took?

6       **A**     Yes, sir.

7               **MR. GARRETT:** Move at this time to introduce  
8       those into the court's record.

9               **THE COURT:** It will be admitted as a court's  
10       exhibit.

11       BY MR. GARRETT:

12       **Q**     To your knowledge, are those oaths of office  
13       recorded in the Clerk of Court's office?

14       **A**     I don't know what they do with them.

15       **Q**     Okay. And do you have a bond -- did you take  
16       steps to make sure that you had a bond that was  
17       recorded and kept in the clerk's office?

18       **A**     I haven't.

19       **Q**     Have you been sworn in at any time by a circuit  
20       court judge?

21       **A**     No.

22       **Q**     Have you been accepted by appointment by a  
23       circuit court judge?

24       **A**     No.

25       **Q**     Have you ever appeared before a circuit court

1 judge for purposes of being a deputy sheriff?

2 **A** No.

3 **Q** There's -- have you taken any other bonds other  
4 than the two bonds that I've showed you or shown  
5 you?

6 **A** Bonds or oaths?

7 **Q** Oaths.

8 **A** I took one to be a city police officer in 1999.

9 **Q** All right. Have you taken any other than  
10 those?

11 **A** No, sir.

12 **Q** Okay. So, in 2009, the oath that you took was  
13 the one that we have here?

14 **A** Yes.

15 **Q** And, to your knowledge, you took no other  
16 oaths?

17 **A** The one before that.

18 **Q** Okay. On 11/15/09, were you acting at the  
19 direction and under the authority of the Sheriff  
20 George Reid?

21 **A** Yes, I was, as a certified police officer  
22 through the South Carolina Criminal Justice Academy.

23 **MR. GARRETT:** That's all I have for this  
24 witness, Judge.

25 **THE COURT:** Thank you, sir.

1 Any cross-examination?

2 **MR. MYERS:** No, sir.

3 **THE COURT:** Thank you. You may step down.

4 **MR. GARRETT:** Call Melissa McAllister.

5 **MS. BALLARD:** Your Honor, this will be for the  
6 same purpose.

7 **THE COURT:** Would you stipulate for the record  
8 just for the purpose of the proffer --

9 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

10 **THE COURT:** -- that the same evidence will be  
11 for the next witness?

12 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

13 **THE COURT:** And which witness is that? Melissa  
14 McAllister.

15 Well, Mr. Myers said he would stipulate that  
16 you would elicit the same testimony from  
17 Ms. McAllister that you just did from Officer Moore.

18 **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you. May I mark these as 8  
19 and 9?

20 **THE COURT:** Yes, sir. May be court exhibits.

21 **MR. GARRETT:** I'm sorry, 9 and 10.

22 (Court's Exhibit Numbers 9 and 10, Oaths of  
23 Office, were marked for identification.)

24 **MR. GARRETT:** Move at this time to introduce  
25 Court's Exhibits 9 and 10.

1           **THE COURT:** 9 and 10 will be admitted for the  
2 purposes of the proffer as court exhibits.

3           **MS. BALLARD:** Your Honor, it's not necessary  
4 for her to take the stand.

5           **THE COURT:** Thank you, ma'am. It's not  
6 necessary for you to take the stand at this time,  
7 but I'm just going to ask you to remain just in case  
8 you're needed. Okay?

9           Are you ready to go forward with further  
10 witnesses?

11          **MR. GARRETT:** I am, Your Honor.

12          **THE COURT:** State ready to go forward?

13          **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

14          **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury back in,  
15 please?

16                 (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

17          **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett.

18          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you, Your Honor. I call  
19 Dr. George Kirkham.

20                         GEORGE KIRKHAM,

21           having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

22                         DIRECT EXAMINATION

23   BY MR. GARRETT:

24   **Q**     Dr. Kirkham, get yourself set up there and pull  
25 that microphone close to you so this jury can hear

1       you.

2       **A**     Okay.

3       **Q**     All right.  You got you some water there in  
4       case you need it?

5       **A**     I do.

6       **Q**     You good to go?

7       **A**     Yes, sir.

8       **Q**     All right.  Tell us your name and address for  
9       our court record, please, sir.

10      **A**     Yes, sir.  My name is George Kirkham, and I  
11      live in Palm Beach Gardens, Florida.

12      **Q**     All right.  And what is your educational  
13      background?

14      **A**     I hold a bachelor's degree in the field of  
15      criminology from California State University at San  
16      Jose; also a master's degree in criminology from the  
17      same university; and a doctorate degree of  
18      criminology from the University of California at  
19      Berkeley.

20      **Q**     All right.  And what is your occupation at this  
21      time?

22      **A**     I'm a professor emeritus at the Florida State  
23      University College of Criminology and Criminal  
24      Justice and a private criminal justice consultant.

25      **Q**     What is a professional emeritus?

1       **A**     It means you're old.  It's an honor that the  
2       president of the university can confer on a retiring  
3       faculty member.  You don't get it simply because you  
4       retire.  I was full-time faculty for 20 years, and  
5       teaching a research there, but you have to make some  
6       major contribution to the field of knowledge.

7             In my case, I developed, under grants in the  
8       U.S. Department of Justice, the first police human  
9       relations training material for the United States  
10      that was issued into all 50 states and the FBI  
11      academy.

12      **Q**     How many professors of criminology at FSU have  
13      ever been awarded that title?

14      **A**     In the 60-year history of the College of  
15      Criminology and Criminal Justice, I think we've only  
16      had six or seven, and most of them have been deans  
17      or chairmen.

18      **Q**     What is a criminologist?

19      **A**     A criminologist is a scientist who is involved  
20      in studying the causes of crime and delinquency.  
21      Criminologists often specialize in the study of  
22      different types of crime:  Homicide, drug abuse,  
23      organized crime, terrorism, domestic security.

24             Sometimes we're mistaken for a criminalist, the  
25      people, you know, like you see on CSI who deal with

1 forensics, blood spatter and DNA and fingerprints  
2 and so on. That's a criminalist.

3 Criminologists also very often specialize in  
4 the study of our criminal justice system: Courts,  
5 corrections, and law enforcement.

6 **Q** And what's your particular area of specialty?

7 **A** My area of specialization for the past 40 years  
8 has been law enforcement, particularly standards and  
9 procedures of the American police profession.

10 **Q** As a criminologist specializing in standards  
11 and procedures of the law enforcement profession,  
12 have you authored any training material which is  
13 used to instruct police officers throughout the  
14 nation?

15 **A** Yes. I've authored, throughout my career, some  
16 26 training films, video -- videotapes for training,  
17 instructional manuals that are used throughout the  
18 United States.

19 **Q** Have you had occasion to personally train law  
20 enforcement officers on these and other subjects at  
21 academies -- police academies throughout the nation?

22 **A** Yes, I have.

23 **Q** When and where?

24 **A** I've been a lecturer, consultant or trainer to  
25 some 50 different law enforcement agencies



1 throughout the nation -- city, state, and federal.  
2 These include lecturing at the FBI Academy in  
3 Quantico, training for the consolidated federal law  
4 enforcement training center, which is the agency  
5 that trains everyone except the FBI. The Bureau has  
6 its own academy. All the other agencies are trained  
7 by the consolidated federal center, all the other 50  
8 state agencies and 50 federal agencies and 200 state  
9 agencies. I've instructed for the Maine State  
10 Police.

11 For many years, I trained all new troopers at  
12 the Virginia State Police Academy in Richmond. I've  
13 trained for the Florida Highway Patrol. I've  
14 trained many municipal police forces in a variety of  
15 subjects. At one time, I trained most of the  
16 Cincinnati, Ohio, Police Department, for example.  
17 Agencies pretty much throughout the country over the  
18 years.

19 **Q** What about Carolina? What about here in South  
20 Carolina?

21 **A** Yes. I've instructed at the South Carolina  
22 Criminal Justice Academy.

23 **Q** What about in addition to your formal education  
24 as a criminologist, have you had any personal,  
25 practical experience as a law enforcement officer?

1       **A**     Yes, I have.

2       **Q**     Can you explain?

3       **A**     Yes. I've been a police officer and deputy  
4       sheriff for four different law enforcement agencies  
5       throughout the course of my university career. I  
6       came into law enforcement in a little unusual way.

7       **Q**     All right. As an officer or deputy yourself,  
8       have you had, on occasion, to respond to shots fired  
9       and gun calls in a residential area?

10      **A**     Many times, yes.

11      **Q**     Have you arrested armed and dangerous  
12      individuals?

13      **A**     Yes. One of the last people I arrested was  
14      Phillip Michael Wheat, who was an armed interstate  
15      fugitive who's serving three life sentences. I  
16      arrested him following a car chase and a foot chase.  
17      I remember that because he nearly shot me.

18      **Q**     Is your experience working as a uniform patrol  
19      -- patrolman, as well as a plain clothes?

20      **A**     Yes. Uniform patrol and also plain clothes and  
21      undercover as part of a federal organized crime  
22      strike force.

23      **Q**     How did you go from being a criminologist to a  
24      police officer?

25      **A**     Well, it was an unusual exodus. When I got my

1       doctorate at UC Berkeley, I came to my first  
2       teaching post at Florida State University thinking I  
3       knew a lot about crime and criminals. I'd worked in  
4       a major state prison, Soledad State Prison for two  
5       years as a counselor. And I had a caseload of 300  
6       pretty tough felons in my cell block. I come  
7       through a riot there.

8               And I thought I knew quite a bit, but I would  
9       have, you know, prisoners sit across from me and  
10      everything was, yes, sir, no, sir. A guy who was  
11      very violent, I knew from his records was very  
12      violent, but he was very polite. I was preparing  
13      his parole board evaluation so he wasn't about to be  
14      discourteous to me.

15             After I came to Florida State University and  
16      started teaching, thinking I knew a lot about crime  
17      and criminals, I had a lot of police officers in my  
18      class that were coming back to school under federal  
19      funds to further their education, and we had some  
20      very heated discussions in class. And out of these,  
21      emerged a challenge. And one of these young men who  
22      was a sergeant, he said, You know, Doc, you guys run  
23      one of the oldest schools of criminology in the  
24      country here. You're always writing -- you're  
25      writing books and articles about the police this and

1       the police that, but none of you has ever been a  
2       part -- never seen our world up close and personal.

3               And I said, Well, wait a minute, I spent a few  
4       nights went out on the road with the police in San  
5       Jose. And he said, No, that's not what I'm talking  
6       about. I mean, for one of you to walk a mile in our  
7       moccasins. So literally go through a police academy  
8       and spend some time on the streets, spend some time  
9       as a uniform patrol officer in a high-crime area.  
10      He said, That's never been done, has it? And I  
11      said, Well, no, we don't really study things that  
12      way.

13             But the more these young guys talked to me, the  
14      more I -- I got interested in the idea. I  
15      approached my dean, and I went back to the sergeant,  
16      and I said, Look, Sergeant, if my dean was willing  
17      to let me do it and I could get a grant to do it,  
18      why would your sheriff in Jacksonville, Florida --  
19      both the sheriff's department and the police  
20      department are consolidated as one agency. I said,  
21      That's where they were talking about me going. I  
22      said, Why would he let me do it?

23             And he said, I'll let you ask him that  
24      question, and I did. I met with Sheriff Carson.  
25      And I said, Sheriff, I don't understand; I'm from

1       Berkeley, and why would you let me come into your  
2       department as a police officer and sponsor me  
3       through the academy and so on?

4               He said, I'll tell you, Doctor, he said, Years  
5       ago, I was a young police officer in Columbus, going  
6       to night school, and I used to listen to a lot of  
7       guys like you talk about, you know, the things cop  
8       do wrong and this and that. And I always swore that  
9       if I ever had a chance to expose one of you to the  
10      realities of our world, I'd take advantage of it,  
11      and here you are.

12             So I went through the police academy with his  
13      support and my dean's support. I had my hair back  
14      then, didn't wear glasses, and finally somebody -- I  
15      wound up one day standing on the steps of the  
16      Jacksonville Police Station, someone said -- looking  
17      like Charlie Chaplain in a police uniform. No one  
18      wanted to ride with me, but by prearrangement, I was  
19      assigned to the highest crime beat in the City of  
20      Jacksonville on the evening watch for three months.  
21      And it was a baptism of fire for me.

22             I came away with many things, one of them was a  
23      deep respect for my brother officers and sister  
24      officers and an appreciation of how tough the job is  
25      and how important it is, and also a great respect

1       for the importance of training, the training we  
2       receive in the academies, the police profession.  
3       And I think that's what kept me safe during those  
4       six months.

5               And I came back with more questions than  
6       answers. So after returning to my university, I  
7       joined the Tallahassee Police Department as a  
8       police, sworn, part-time officer working primarily  
9       in the uniform patrol division. And over the years,  
10      that became my laboratory. I worked mostly uniform  
11      patrol. The last five years I was there, I -- I  
12      started, with the chief's help, I started a crisis  
13      intervention unit, I worked that.

14             I worked -- while in Tallahassee, I worked  
15      criminal investigation, vice narcotics. I had the  
16      opportunity, in addition to working for the Leon  
17      County Sheriff's Department, while I was back at the  
18      university, working for them part-time. None of  
19      this was I paid for. This was all just my  
20      laboratory.

21             I also had a chance, under a federal grant, to  
22      go down to Fort Lauderdale and spend the summer  
23      working in a -- I mentioned the federal organized  
24      crime strike force. I worked undercover down there.

25             So, you know, I don't pretend to have the

1       experience of a veteran police officer, someone who  
2       has to support their family and have it as a career,  
3       but it's as close to their world as someone from my  
4       world can get. And everything I've been able to  
5       develop in the way of training material has been the  
6       result of having access to that invaluable  
7       laboratory. Nothing like that had ever been done.  
8       Now, there are a number of other professors who have  
9       done what I did.

10      **Q**     And so -- is there something called Ivory Tower  
11      Cop?

12      **A**     Yeah. What happened was, 60 Minutes -- CBS 60  
13      Minutes sat Dan Rather down to do a segment called  
14      Ivory Tower Cop, and the reason was that my  
15      colleagues were trying to block my tenure because I  
16      was a police officer. I would work a shift  
17      sometimes, then I would come to class, park a patrol  
18      car and come into class, teach my class and try to  
19      give the kids some understanding of what police  
20      really are and what they do and the difficulties of  
21      the job by way of develop training videos and bring  
22      them into class and show them problems involving the  
23      use of force and police/minority interactions and  
24      the use of authority, and, you know, just everything  
25      I could.

1           And a lot of my colleagues thought that was  
2           unseemly undignified. So they said, Look, if you  
3           resign your position with the police department, you  
4           know, we won't block your tenure. And I said, I  
5           can't do that. I'm proud to be a police officer.  
6           It's been a part of my life. And I'm --

7           **Q**     Scoot back just a little bit here.

8           **A**     Yeah.

9           I'm not going to do that. And so I stayed -- I  
10          did get tenure narrowly. And I -- so 18 of my 20  
11          years, I worked as --

12          **Q**     Hold on just a second. We're getting some  
13          sound back from you there.

14          **A**     Oh, too close?

15          **Q**     Probably too close.

16          **A**     Too close.

17          So for 18 of my 20 years, up until I was about  
18          50, I worked as a police officer.

19          **Q**     Did you receive any honors or awards for your  
20          contributions?

21          **A**     I did. I did receive a number: The Second  
22          Annual J. Edgar Hoover Award, Freedom Salvation and  
23          Valley Forge Award --

24                 **COURT REPORTER:** Say that again. I'm sorry.

25                 **THE WITNESS:** Freedom Salvation and Valley



1 Forge award, distinguished service award from the  
2 Reserve Officers Association of America, a variety  
3 of civic awards, awards from departments like the  
4 Toronto Metropolitan Police for assisting them in  
5 internal evaluations and use of force. So a number  
6 of those things.

7 BY MR. GARRETT:

8 **Q** Is any of the police training material you've  
9 authored used to train law enforcement officers in  
10 other countries?

11 **A** Yes. Yes, it is. I did some instruction  
12 myself for the British Metropolitan Police in  
13 London, had the opportunity to do that. They used a  
14 number of my training materials at The Peel Centre  
15 in London to train their police. But also France,  
16 Germany, Italy, India Switzerland, a number of other  
17 countries. Russia now uses some of it.

18 **Q** Have you previously been called upon to  
19 evaluate whether the conduct of officers in a  
20 particular situation conformed or violated standards  
21 and principals of the police profession?

22 **A** Yes.

23 **Q** When and where?

24 **A** Throughout the last 40 years, I think I've been  
25 called upon to make such evaluations of police

1       conduct in 46 of our states and in many different  
2       kinds of circumstances involving firearms and  
3       vehicle pursuits and just a lot of different things,  
4       use of different types of force.

5               So probably, I would say, somewhere in the  
6       order of 1200 times over the years.

7       **Q**     All right. And in what states have you been so  
8       qualified?

9       **A**     Well, I've had cases in, I mentioned, 46  
10      states. I have been in your fair state here many  
11      times. Most recently, I was in the U.S. District  
12      Court in Charleston just a few weeks ago. And  
13      during the summer, in Judge Culbertson's court in  
14      Georgetown, I testified in cases there on matters.

15      **Q**     In these type of criminal cases that involve --

16      **A**     These are civil -- these are civil cases that  
17      I've been involved in.

18      **Q**     Okay. As it relates to criminal cases, what  
19      percentage of time have you been an expert for law  
20      enforcement and what percentage of time have you  
21      been an expert for a defendant?

22      **A**     In criminal cases, it's been about half and  
23      half over the years.

24      **Q**     Okay. What do you charge for your professional  
25      services?

1       **A**     I charge the same flat fee. For every case  
2       evaluation I do, I charge a flat fee of \$6,000  
3       regardless of how much time and effort that it takes  
4       or whatever research I may do. That's the same in  
5       every case. And then I charge a separate fee for  
6       discovery depositions and for trial.

7       **Q**     And your fees, do you charge the defense and  
8       the prosecutors the same amount of money?

9       **A**     Exactly the same amount for everybody.

10      **Q**     All right. Do you keep a firearm in your home?

11      **A**     I do.

12      **Q**     Do you keep it loaded?

13      **A**     I do. I have my -- we bought our own firearms  
14      in Tallahassee. I have my Beretta Model Number 92F.  
15      I keep that loaded by my bedside, yes, in my  
16      nightstand.

17      **Q**     Have you assisted the National Rifle  
18      Association in the case of Winston Lee versus Port  
19      of New Jersey to help protect the Second Amendment  
20      rights of citizens?

21      **A**     I did assist as a consultant in a case where  
22      there was an attempt to block citizens from lawfully  
23      transporting firearms from one residence to another  
24      on the interstate. And the NRA, I worked with an  
25      attorney who worked with them on that matter, yes.

1           **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, at this time, I move  
2 to qualify Dr. Kirkham as a criminologist.

3           **MR. MYERS:** No objection.

4           **THE COURT:** Let me make sure, when you say  
5 criminologist, is it in law enforcement standards  
6 and procedures more particularly than  
7 just criminology?

8           **MR. GARRETT:** Yes. That's what I think he  
9 testified to. His particular area was standards of  
10 practices and procedures of law enforcement  
11 officers.

12          **THE COURT:** Okay. Do you stipulate to that,  
13 Mr. Myers?

14          **MR. MYERS:** No objection.

15          **THE COURT:** Very good.

16               Ladies and gentlemen, as I told you several  
17 times in this trial, an expert can give their  
18 opinion based on their education and experience  
19 where other people may not necessarily be allowed to  
20 during trial. Expert testimony is just like any  
21 other testimony, you may accept it, you may reject  
22 it or give it as much weight as you think is  
23 appropriate. All right.

24          **MR. GARRETT:** Thank you.

25 BY MR. GARRETT:

1       **Q**     Dr. Kirkham, in this particular case, have you  
2       had an opportunity to create a case file and to  
3       review and examine all of the materials related to  
4       this case?

5       **A**     Yes. I believe I've had a chance to examine  
6       everything that relates to the case. I've done a  
7       couple of site inspections as well at the location  
8       where the incident occurred.

9       **Q**     Are law enforcement officers trained in  
10      specific procedures that should be followed when  
11      responding to calls involving shots fired and/or  
12      armed individuals?

13      **A**     Yes. This is a profession that we have in law  
14      enforcement and there are standards and procedures  
15      that relate to events like that and many other  
16      things in the same way that there are standards and  
17      procedures for pilots and surgeons, paramedics, fire  
18      fighters. Yes, there are specific standards,  
19      specific procedures that relate to a man with a gun  
20      call, for example, and shots fired. They're very  
21      important.

22      **Q**     Is such training provided by the South Carolina  
23      Criminal Justice Academy?

24      **A**     Yes. You have an excellent academy here. I've  
25      known the gentleman who is the director for many

1 years, Mr. John O'Leary. He was totally at the  
2 academy for 16 years. And their curriculum is one  
3 of the best in the country. It's very good.

4 **Q** Was Deputy Rushton trained at the academy  
5 before he began his employment as the deputy sheriff  
6 with the McCormick County Sheriff's Department?

7 **A** Yes. He had the same standard training that  
8 other officers attending the academy would have had,  
9 and it's pretty comparable to what you find  
10 throughout the country. Some metro areas have  
11 longer academies, but the important thing is that  
12 every officer, whether it's a small department or a  
13 big agency -- the average American police force is  
14 only about ten -- ten officers -- that they all get  
15 the same basic training. Whether they get a lot  
16 more than that, they've got to have that.

17 **Q** All right. Have you had an opportunity to  
18 examine the specific training material that the  
19 South Carolina Criminal Justice Academy provides for  
20 officers on the subject of how to handle a man with  
21 a gun and shots fired calls?

22 **A** Yeah. This is their -- their module two. I  
23 believe I have a copy of it here. And it's very  
24 relevant to this tragic situation.

25 **Q** In your professional opinion, how adequate is

1 the South Carolina academy training material on the  
2 subject of how to respond to a man with a gun call  
3 compared to other law enforcement academies  
4 throughout the nation?

5 **A** It would be very comparable. It's easily as  
6 good as the other -- I checked with Mr. O'Leary. I  
7 find the material is -- it's supposed to be updated.  
8 It's essentially been the same for many, many years.  
9 It's very good.

10 **Q** In your professional opinion, did Deputies  
11 Rushton, Moore, and McAllister follow or violate the  
12 training that they had received on how to handle man  
13 with a gun and shots fired calls?

14 **A** Sadly, they did not follow, and in fact,  
15 committed very serious violations of the most basic  
16 police procedures; procedures that are designed to  
17 keep officers and citizens safe.

18 **Q** Are there a circumstance when an officer does  
19 not want to disclose his presence as an officer?

20 **A** Oh, there are, and I've been in those. I've  
21 been, you know, sitting in the car with felons down  
22 in Fort Lauderdale where looking like no one you'd  
23 want to have in your home, with a Fu Manchu beard,  
24 long hair, and dirty clothes. Where if the felons I  
25 was with knew I was an undercover police officer,

1       they'd put a bullet in the back of my head and dump  
2       me in the canal.

3               So there are circumstances where you want to  
4       not disclose your identity. And we have police  
5       officers that never report to the police departments  
6       that are in deep cover doing different narcotics or  
7       whatever it may be, terrorism, doing undercover  
8       operations.

9               But even with patrol officers, initially when  
10      you respond to a bad call -- unless it's something  
11      urgent, like an active shooter, you know, active  
12      shooter would be something like the tragedy at Sandy  
13      Hook Elementary. You get something like that or the  
14      Navy Yard shooting, you go and you put your --  
15      that's one of the things you do as an officer, you  
16      put your life on the line because you have to go to  
17      try to save lives. People are being shot.

18              And we learned a lot from Columbine, and no  
19      longer do we wait for SWAT. You go and do what you  
20      can.

21              So -- but absent -- we're not dealing here with  
22      an active shooter. So in a situation, a routine  
23      call that we get that is a potentially -- this a  
24      high-risk call. Any time you get a call, man with a  
25      gun, shots fired, you always err in the direction of



1       caution. You're always going to treat it as high  
2       risk, potentially high risk.

3               So, there, we don't even want to disclose our  
4       presence until we want it to be known, unless we've  
5       got something hot going on at the moment. We don't,  
6       like, you know, park your patrol car in the driveway  
7       or in front of the place. We've had officers killed  
8       doing that kind of thing.

9               We learn from mistakes over the years. That's  
10      where this body of training material comes from.

11      **Q**     All right. And what specific ways did the  
12      officers involved violate the training?

13      **A**     Well, the first major violation was -- and you  
14      got to give the officers the benefit of the doubt  
15      here. I think, I try to do that.

16              The call goes out initially, and Officer  
17      Rushton, I think, says, well, you know, it's a rural  
18      area, maybe it's somebody poaching deer. That's --  
19      probably they have a lot of contact with that kind  
20      of thing, or somebody shooting at foxes or whatever.  
21      That's okay as an initial assumption, but the first  
22      thing you do -- you don't know what you've got, and  
23      so the first thing you do is you make contact with  
24      what we call the RP, the reporting party. And if  
25      you're not -- I think there was a little trouble

1        locating the address. And so you clarify with  
2        dispatch. In this case, it would have been the  
3        Sheffields at [REDACTED] Presidential {sic} Drive.

4                So you're going to go over there first, and  
5        you're not going to spend hours, but you're going to  
6        try to get some real basic information as quickly as  
7        possible: What's going on? There's no shooting  
8        going on now, but what's been happening? What can  
9        you tell me about this guy? Any history of mental  
10       illness? Any threats to anybody in the  
11       neighborhood? Is he involved with any drugs,  
12       alcohol? How many people are over there? Do you  
13       know anything about the kind of weapon he was using?  
14       Those kind of questions. And, unfortunately, that  
15       -- that wasn't done.

16               By the dispatch records, you can see that  
17       Officer Rushton, four minutes before shots fired,  
18       radioed -- he radios he's still looking for the  
19       Sheffields' location. Okay, that's four minutes  
20       before. And then two more minutes go by, and he  
21       radios out, I found them, I'm talking to them now.  
22       And then two minutes later -- two minutes later,  
23       we've got shots fired.

24               Now, based on what -- again, giving the  
25       officers every benefit of the doubt -- based on what

1       they knew from the Sheffields, shots fired, a guy is  
2       out on his porch, loud, they haven't had any trouble  
3       with him themselves personally, but he's firing off  
4       his gun, and he's -- he's been talking loud out  
5       there; hey, I don't know if I'm dealing with a  
6       mental patient or somebody who's drunk or somebody's  
7       had a fight with a wife or whatever, so we're going  
8       to treat this as a high-risk thing. We're doing a  
9       threat assessment of it, what they call in the  
10      academy -- South Carolina and everywhere else --  
11      quick threat assessment, high risk.

12             What does that mean? It means that all the  
13      training material in the country, including this  
14      very good material here -- the name of the game  
15      here, you can see how it makes common sense, the  
16      name of the game is we want to get someone like this  
17      to come to us, unless we got an urgent situation,  
18      which we don't have here.

19             We've got a lot of dangerous situations --  
20      circumstances. It's dark. It's very dark. I've  
21      been out there, was out there on the same night,  
22      November 15th, two years later, couldn't see your  
23      hand in front of your face. It's dark. It's late.  
24      And we're at a residential neighborhood.

25             And a lot of people, as we Americans have the

1 right to do under the Second Amendment, and an awful  
2 lot of people, myself included as I mentioned, have  
3 guns. And there have been some tragic things  
4 that -- in the military, they're called friendly  
5 fire where you wind up killing or injuring your own  
6 people in the mistaken belief that they're the  
7 enemy.

8 And so we have had tragedies, and we've learned  
9 through this and fed it back into training. We've  
10 had tragedies where police officers have shot  
11 homeowners, homeowners have shot police officers,  
12 police officers have shot other police officers  
13 because they didn't know who they were.

14 I had a Washington D.C. police officer in plain  
15 clothes who was six months' pregnant was trying to  
16 stop a street robbery, was shot by a uniform cop  
17 because she didn't have her badge on. He didn't  
18 know.

19 I had an officer who shot his trainer. They  
20 were both in uniform. It was dark. They went  
21 around the building. They couldn't see each other.  
22 He killed the trainer.

23 So in a situation like this, you come to us.  
24 The sequence is talk somebody out before you ever do  
25 anything more as far as, you know, on television,

1       they're always crashing in and rushing in. What you  
2       see on television is the opposite of what real  
3       police are trained to do. I learned that early on  
4       in the streets.

5               So how do you do that? Well, there's a very  
6       safe -- safe way to handle it, and it's a way that  
7       we would not all be sitting here with this tragedy.  
8       This officer, Officer Rushton would not have  
9       suffered this horrible injury, and Mr. Worley  
10      wouldn't be in the trouble he's been in and none of  
11      us would be here.

12             What could you do? Very simply, radio  
13      dispatch, and you ask dispatch to check the county  
14      directory. These folks have a landline. You have  
15      dispatch call them up, say, McCormick County  
16      Sheriff's Office out here, need for you to step out.

17             And, in the meantime, you're not going down  
18      that dark driveway back there where you can draw  
19      fire and you could have a guy high on angel dust,  
20      methamphetamines. You can have a mentally ill, what  
21      we call an EDP, an emotionally disturbed person.  
22      You do not know. You do not know. And so you're  
23      going to act in a protective way.

24             So you're going to have dispatch call the RP.  
25      The phone rings in there and these folks would have

1        answered it.  McCormick County Sheriff's Department  
2        here; we need for you to come out.  If you look  
3        outside.

4                Now, by this time, you are down, you've got  
5        your doors open, as we do in a high-risk stop, and  
6        you are down in the apex or the break of the door  
7        behind the engine block, and you've got -- now, you  
8        turn on your blues, you hit your spotlight.  I just  
9        looked at one of the McCormick cars out here.  
10       They've got all the standard equipment.  Put your  
11       high beams on.

12               You are behind the curtain of light.  You've  
13       been concealed up till now.  Now, you're -- you want  
14       them to know -- you really want the homeowners to  
15       know, We're the police.

16               And so a person picks up the phone in there and  
17       they hear, Sheriff's department.  Okay, they're  
18       calling.  But now you look out and you're going to  
19       have those lights sweeping all over the place,  
20       trees, everything, the blue lights.

21               And if the person didn't -- let's say they  
22       didn't have a phone, which they did, and they would  
23       have answered the phone, Come on out.  If they  
24       didn't have a phone, though, you got a PA on there.  
25       You hit your PA.  And if you have to, I'd just --

1 looking again at the car out here, that's got a  
2 standard range of siren controls that go from whale,  
3 yelp, high, low, air horn, PA, very high-frequency  
4 noises. And that would have been heard.

5 I know that because when I was out there, and I  
6 heard Mr. Bob Worley talk about how acoustically  
7 well-insulated that place is, and I could experience  
8 that, but I could hear the doorbell faintly in  
9 Mr. Worley's bedroom. That's just enough to scare a  
10 homeowner. Anybody that rings your doorbell at four  
11 o'clock in the morning, if it's a police officer or  
12 anyone else, the first response is you're going to  
13 be scared, and I want to know who it is. I want to  
14 know it's the police. A police officer responds  
15 differently than a homeowner or a resident who might  
16 panic. So you can communicate with a PA.

17 Now, let's say they don't come out. Now, we've  
18 got another situation. But we've never gotten to  
19 that stage because you've got an 83-year-old lady in  
20 there and a man. There's no reason to believe they  
21 would have come on out.

22 That's one -- those are some of the problems.  
23 Then it gets worse, though, and that is that the  
24 officer, we have -- before we even gather enough  
25 information to know what -- basically what we've

1 got, we've already got Deputy Moore splitting up  
2 from his backup, going on down to start knocking on  
3 the door, walking through these dark woods to the  
4 house and knocking on the door, ringing the  
5 doorbell.

6 And he doesn't know -- suppose -- suppose he's  
7 down there, and the other officer learns from the  
8 folks next door that, you know, this guy's crazy.  
9 Things -- some of these things don't come out in  
10 dispatch. He said he's going to kill his wife, kill  
11 us, he's got all kinds of -- he's got explosives in  
12 there. And then here's Moore down there and  
13 McAllister hanging out in the open.

14 So you don't do stuff like that. It's  
15 dangerous. It's reckless. It endangers everybody.

16 So he's walked down there by himself, and  
17 that's something you just wouldn't do.

18 Another problem comes on. Officer -- Deputy  
19 Rushton -- remember the amount of time he spends  
20 gathering information, you could figure out the math  
21 from the dispatch. Seconds. A minute. A minute  
22 and a half, and he's gone. He's down there like a  
23 shot. Why? I don't know. It's not what we're  
24 trained to do. And officers die when you do things  
25 like that and homeowners get hurt and killed as



1 well.

2           So he's down there, and he is -- he's clearly  
3 -- he's essentially in plain clothes. Okay? Every  
4 police uniform -- I wore three police uniforms; I'm  
5 proud to wear all of them. They all had the dark  
6 uniforms -- green in the sheriff's department case  
7 -- but they had shoulder patches, they had initials,  
8 JP, Jacksonville Police, LCSO; shiny, silver on my  
9 collars; Marion {phonetic} County Sheriff's  
10 Department; all were very, you know, TPD,  
11 Tallahassee Police Department. I had a whistle  
12 chain on a lanyard, you know, with a -- a bright  
13 shiny whistle, a bright shiny badge, a name plate --  
14 a shiny name plate that said G.L. Kirkham, and so  
15 and so, a lot of -- lot of glitter. Still, even  
16 with all that on my uniform -- and these uniforms  
17 are dark, okay? That's just the way it is. They  
18 say it's budget, whatever.

19           But Officer or Deputy Rushton's uniform wasn't  
20 just dark, it was essentially nonexistent. I mean,  
21 he's wearing civies. And he's carrying a -- police  
22 officers typically carry a five-cell Maglite,  
23 Streamlight, Pro-light. Burglars carry little  
24 flashlights. And, you know, that's -- that's just a  
25 dangerous thing to do to walk around a place like

1           that.

2                   And then lights -- the lights come on. There  
3           are different accounts as to why -- I know different  
4           accounts as to what the lights did, but you put  
5           yourself in a position of terrible vulnerability.

6                   And as the deputies have testified, if there  
7           comes a point in time -- if someone says -- you say,  
8           deputy sheriff, sheriff's department, sheriff's  
9           department. Well, when I was out there, I just had,  
10          you know, I'm an old guy, but I had my hearing  
11          checked at my annual physical two months ago, and  
12          I've got perfect hearing. I couldn't hear anybody  
13          shouting as loud as they wanted downstairs.

14                   But, moreover, I found you could take a boom  
15          box, you could put on Little Deuce Coupe, The Beach  
16          Boys, at a hundred decibels, measured on a decibel  
17          meter downstairs; upstairs, you couldn't hear it.  
18          You could not hear it.

19                   So, you know, how -- how you could hear  
20          remarks, I don't care who y'all are or, you know,  
21          obscenities or so forth, that's -- but let's say  
22          that happened. Let's say that you heard Sherry  
23          said, Sheriff's department. And somebody replied  
24          from inside the house, that they could hear you  
25          somehow or other, they replied, I don't give a fuck,

1       what would that tell you in terms of the good  
2       training you've had? Drop back and punt. Back out.  
3       Get away from that house because you've got somebody  
4       that's hostile. Not walk out in the open. Not walk  
5       out in the open.

6               And, here again, we've got a question as to  
7       what happened. And there are things I can't  
8       explain. We've got Deputy Rushton saying, I looked  
9       up and I see him with a rifle at port arms, a guy  
10      with a, you know, a salt-and-pepper beard.

11             You know, when I was out there November 15th,  
12      2011, I couldn't see my hand in front of my face. I  
13      had somebody stand up there with a corn broom, point  
14      it -- point it at me, and I tried to take a, you  
15      know, assuming I -- pretending I had a weapon. I  
16      couldn't see anything. I couldn't see -- and I  
17      shoot pretty well on the range for an old guy. I  
18      couldn't see anything. I couldn't tell how many  
19      people were up there, where they were. So he would  
20      have had to go back inside, turn on the light, and  
21      then come back outside again.

22             So the core problem here is, I can tell you,  
23      ladies and gentlemen, from personal experience that  
24      you don't know what it's like to be looking into the  
25      muzzle of a loaded gun until you've done it. I've

1 had that happen to me as an undercover officer.  
2 Scary, unimaginably scary for anyone, a police  
3 officer, a citizen.

4 But we know that there came a point in time  
5 when the deputy was standing out there in the open,  
6 dressed as he was, pointing a Glock 40 caliber Model  
7 23, I think it was, pointing it at Mr. Worley, and  
8 Mr. Worley shoots.

9 My analysis of this matter is that in the  
10 hundreds of police cases that I've evaluated,  
11 police-related shootings over 40 years, this fits  
12 the profile, sadly, of a friendly-fire situation  
13 where homeowners shoot officers, officers shoot  
14 homeowners, not intending any harm, but out of a  
15 mistaken perception of identity. And this could and  
16 should have been avoided. It would have been so  
17 easy if they just followed what they were trained to  
18 do.

19 And we all make mistakes. I made lots of  
20 mistakes as a police officer, but this is -- if it's  
21 an airplane, you're going to crash it; if this is a  
22 patient in an operating room, they're going to die  
23 of arterial bleeding. You cannot, you know, Captain  
24 Sully would not have landed that plane in the Hudson  
25 safely as he did if he hadn't followed and done what

1 he was trained to do. That's it in a nutshell.

2 **Q** In your professional opinion, did Officer  
3 Rushton do anything that needlessly increased the  
4 danger to himself and the other officers, as well as  
5 Mr. Worley and his mother?

6 **A** All of these things that I've just discussed,  
7 which are in a category police call -- police refer  
8 to as jumping the call. You jump a call like this,  
9 a high-risk call, and you can -- you can look at the  
10 South Carolina training material on this, you make  
11 your own determinations, but this is what we're  
12 trained to do, do not do this.

13 If there had been a supervisor -- and I know this  
14 is a small department, and like I said, the whole  
15 country's average force is ten officers, I mentioned  
16 earlier. But if there's no supervisor and nobody in  
17 charge, just the three deputies out there, you've  
18 got to form -- you've got to form a plan quickly.

19 Unless you've got something, we say, exigent or  
20 emergency where you've got, you know, someone's  
21 going to harm a child, there are shots fired, active  
22 shooter, there's nothing like that, there are no  
23 shots being fired now, it's time to find out what's  
24 going on.

25 And we're in a handicap with it being dark.

1 And I don't care, the brightest uniform I ever had,  
2 I'm not going to be walking around a house anywhere  
3 in the dead of night unless I've got an emergency  
4 where I can, you know, where somebody can think I'm  
5 a burglar, and, you know, that's the rest of this  
6 tragedy.

7 **Q** What responsibility did Officer Rushton have to  
8 give to the Worleys about making sure it's clear and  
9 the knowledge was reasonable?

10 **A** This is another important point. An officer is  
11 trained -- again, going to the academy, you're  
12 trained that you are obliged to give notice of your  
13 purpose and presence. You know, it's like when  
14 you're pulled over by a police car, I mean, the  
15 lights come on, they hit the siren for a second:  
16 Notice I am a police officer. I'm taking action as  
17 a police officer. I'm stepping beyond normal rules  
18 of the road, driving to an emergency with my siren  
19 and lights.

20 You've got to give reasonable notice. And that  
21 becomes all the more important, critical, when  
22 you're doing something, you know, some of us are  
23 sound sleepers, some of us are light sleepers. When  
24 you're doing something in a setting like this --  
25 and, see, the problem I have as a criminologist and

1       ex-cop is I can't make sense -- I do it with a lot  
2       of people who kill police officers. I've been to  
3       brother officers' funerals. I can't make sense of  
4       why a guy who has got a cat that he loves or likes,  
5       Sweet Pea, and he wants to get the fox that hurt the  
6       cat, but a guy who has no history of violence, who's  
7       not drunk, who's not on drugs, who's not suicidal,  
8       why does a guy like that -- why would a guy like  
9       that intentionally shoot a law enforcement officer?  
10      It doesn't make sense.

11             It conforms to the pattern that I've seen over  
12      the years of friendly fire shootings. And sometimes  
13      those can't be avoided, but most of the time, they  
14      can, if you do what you were trained to do and you  
15      don't get caught up in the rush of adrenaline.

16             And, you know, the FBI and Law Enforcement  
17      Bulletin talks about staying out of the kill zone.  
18      Don't enter the kill zone. Resist the temptation to  
19      -- we all want to know what's going on when we get  
20      there. We want to take charge. Don't do that.

21             TV cops do that. Real cops don't do that.  
22      It's what LAPD Detective Pierce Brosnan called  
23      tombstone courage; don't do that.

24      **Q**     Dr. Kirkham, in your professional opinion, did  
25      the failure of Deputy Rushton to provide clear and

1 proper identification of himself as a law  
2 enforcement officer contribute in any significant  
3 way to Joe Worley's shooting at him? And explain  
4 the basis for your opinion.

5 **A** I think that it was a significant and proximate  
6 cause. I think it's the reason this man shot. He's  
7 looking into the business end of a gun instantly.  
8 And when you've got that -- when you're a police  
9 officer or a citizen, you've got tunnel vision on  
10 that and you've got a second to respond.

11 If I had been in that situation -- I've been in  
12 near-shoot situations -- thank God I've never had to  
13 shoot anyone -- I would have shot him. And I would  
14 have felt terrible when I learned he was a law  
15 enforcement officer, but I would have shot him.

16 And that was -- where he was hit was just a  
17 fluke. On TV, people shoot guns out of people's  
18 hands. Real people don't do that. It was just a --  
19 it just happened to be where the bullet went.

20 And, also, the cases I've examined over the  
21 years, people who are cop killers, and there are a  
22 lot of vicious people out there who take the lives  
23 of law enforcement officers every year, sadly, but  
24 they -- they often do things like overkill. They  
25 will, you know, they won't shoot you just once;



1           they'll shoot you multiple times.

2           He had a .30-06 with rounds left in the  
3           magazine. He was, what, 14 feet away? He could  
4           have killed this officer.

5           But once he was -- once he was no longer in a  
6           position of being threatened, he shot, the officer  
7           drops -- he didn't know he was an officer; he thinks  
8           he's a burglar, I think reasonably so -- he drops  
9           and then he fires a shot off in the air, and he shot  
10          something, so -- but he's not trying to kill this  
11          officer or this burglar. He's not trying to kill  
12          the burglar.

13          You know, that -- all these things -- and,  
14          honestly, I've got to tell you, with all due respect  
15          to the sheriff, whom I heard testify earlier, I  
16          couldn't believe that he would walk down a driveway.  
17          He just had a deputy sheriff shot. He's got an  
18          unknown subject with a gun, and he's walking down a  
19          driveway out in the open? I mean, what was he  
20          trained or how was he trained?

21          I mean, I don't mean any disrespect, but that  
22          -- it doesn't matter if it's a little department  
23          like McCormick or it's LAPD; if you do things this  
24          way, people are going to get hurt, people are going  
25          to die, and tragedies are going to happen.

1       **Q**     All right. And Dr. Kirkham, what would you  
2       have done if you had been in Worley's situation on  
3       the reverse, if you were up there seeing this  
4       transpire in front of you, using this scenario?

5               **MR. MYERS:** Objection.

6               **THE COURT:** Sustained.

7       BY MR. GARRETT:

8       **Q**     All right. Do you have an opinion as to why  
9       Deputy Rushton failed to follow the police  
10      procedures he had been trained in?

11              **MR. MYERS:** Objection.

12              **THE WITNESS:** Well --

13              **THE COURT:** Just -- no, sir.

14              State your question again. I missed what  
15      you --

16              **MR. GARRETT:** I asked him did he have an  
17      opinion as to why Deputy Rushton failed to follow  
18      the police procedures he had been trained in.

19              **MR. MYERS:** There's no way he can answer that,  
20      Your Honor, of why Deputy Rushton didn't follow --

21              **THE COURT:** Lay a foundation for how he may  
22      know that for me, please, sir.

23      BY MR. GARRETT:

24      **Q**     Are you familiar with the deputy's training?

25      **A**     Yes, I am.

1       **Q**     All right. And are you familiar with his  
2     police procedures training?

3       **A**     Specifically, yes, as it would relate to this  
4     call, the handling of this kind of call.

5       **Q**     All right. If he failed to perform, do you  
6     have an opinion as to why he failed to follow the  
7     procedures -- practices and procedures?

8             **MR. MYERS:** Again, objection.

9             **THE COURT:** Let me stop.

10            Madame Forelady, would you get the jury for one  
11     second. I need a little bit more information.

12            (The jury retires to the jury room.)

13            **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett, he testified earlier  
14     that the officers involved, Rushton included, went  
15     through the Criminal Justice Academy, and he gave  
16     them accolades for the type of training they  
17     received there. So -- you have not identified  
18     anything other than that for him to base his opinion  
19     on except for mere speculation. So you have to give  
20     me more foundation than what you've given me, okay,  
21     sir? Or given the witness.

22            **MR. GARRETT:** All right. I can let him -- I'll  
23     let him look at their records.

24            **THE COURT:** Sure.

25            **THE WITNESS:** These were things he took years

1       before. He'd had no subsequent remedial, you know,  
2       preparation. I mean, he was -- use the term rusty.  
3       I mean, my God, he'd been out of police service for  
4       four years. And the first night he's out, with no  
5       riding with another officer, not having any, you  
6       know, any real preparation for this. I mean, that's  
7       one possible explanation is he's, you know, learning  
8       -- I know -- I find, if I was in class all week long  
9       and I check out a patrol car and get in uniform and  
10      go out, it took me an hour or two to get my head,  
11      you know, get the cobwebs out of my head and start  
12      handling calls. That's a long time to be away.  
13      It's great that he came back into law enforcement,  
14      but that's one possible explanation.

15               Beyond that, sometimes -- I don't know the  
16      gentleman; I'm sure he's a good person -- but  
17      sometimes officers just jump the call. They get --  
18      it's a quiet night, there's nothing going on, and  
19      you get this -- all of a sudden, there's a call that  
20      sounds interesting and you jump the call. And  
21      that's how people get hurt.

22               **THE COURT:** Go ahead. Is that it?

23               **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, sir.

24               **THE COURT:** Mr. Myers.

25               **MR. MYERS:** I still have an objection.

1           **THE COURT:** Based on? What is your objection?

2           **MR. MYERS:** Based on just speculation of why  
3 this guy did or didn't do something. You can't just  
4 be an expert and say why he did or didn't do that.

5           **THE COURT:** I sustain that.

6           **MR. GARRETT:** May I say something as to cause?

7           **THE COURT:** Yeah. I mean, you can test it  
8 further if you want, I'm going to give you a little  
9 leeway, but right now, he's just saying, you know,  
10 this is possible, this is speculation.

11                           IN CAMERA EXAMINATION

12           BY MR. GARRETT:

13           **Q** All right. As to cause and effect, are there  
14 causes that put police officers in these positions  
15 where they're shooting homeowners or homeowners are  
16 shooting police officers or they're shooting fellow  
17 police officers? The causes that you've referred to  
18 earlier?

19           **A** Yes. The proximate cause of these kind of  
20 things, you've got four people that night who --

21           **Q** I need you to back up. I'm sorry.

22           **A** I'm sorry. I'm getting feedback in there.

23                   You've got four people who violated, with all  
24 due respect, these basic procedures. All three  
25 deputies. The two that hadn't been over working in

1 Iraq, they violated them, Moore and McAllister. And  
2 lo and behold, Sheriff Reid. You know, we talk  
3 about cover, they know all this stuff, cover and  
4 contact, you know, staying out of the kill zone,  
5 keeping the reactionary gap, all these things. You  
6 don't step out -- you don't step out and put  
7 yourself in harm's way. There's no reason to do  
8 that, and there's no benefit to anyone.

9 **Q** So is it your opinion that the lack of training  
10 recently and -- or a refresher, maybe riding with a  
11 police officer, may have been one of the reasons  
12 that they didn't perform as they should have  
13 pursuant to the practice?

14 **A** That may have been it, coupled with the fact  
15 that they, in practice if they -- it would appear  
16 from the way things were handled on this particular  
17 night, that that's the way they handled these calls.  
18 That's the way the sheriff did it. Come on out in  
19 the open. Two people out there; I don't know  
20 anything about them, I'm going to walk down the  
21 driveway.

22 **THE COURT:** I'm going to sustain the objection.  
23 It's still speculation.

24 And in addition, Mr. Garrett, he's already  
25 gotten in a number of opinions which touches on this

1 same issue anyway and so I'm going to sustain the  
2 objection.

3 Are you ready to proceed?

4 **MR. GARRETT:** I am, Your Honor.

5 **THE COURT:** Mr. Myers?

6 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

7 **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury back in?

8 (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

9 BY MR. GARRETT:

10 **Q** Dr. Kirkham, are there well-established police  
11 procedures for processing shooting scenes and  
12 collecting evidence?

13 **A** Oh, yes. Yes, there are.

14 **Q** And were such procedures followed in this case?

15 **A** No, they were not.

16 **Q** Can you explain why?

17 **A** Yeah. It's basic fundamental in the field of  
18 criminal investigation, one of my co-authors is the  
19 leading author, Dr. Leonard Territo, of criminal  
20 investigation --

21 **MR. MYERS:** Your Honor, I have to apologize,  
22 but I really can't understand him. I apologize.

23 **THE COURT:** If you would just try to find a  
24 happy medium. If you would kind of help him get  
25 that happy medium, because I'm off to the side and

1 I'm not hearing it projected out that way. So, Mr.  
2 Garrett, just kind of help us --

3 **THE WITNESS:** Yes. The fundamental procedure  
4 followed in -- when there's a shooting that involves  
5 police personnel where they are injured or alleged  
6 to have been the victims of a criminal attack or  
7 whatever it may be and there's evidence that the  
8 basic procedure is that all they do -- officers on  
9 the scene at something like this, all they ever do  
10 is secure the scene, establish a perimeter around  
11 the -- where evidence is. They don't process it.  
12 They don't photograph it. They don't pick up  
13 things.

14 And I understand that the sheriff, for whatever  
15 reason -- and I mean no disrespect -- but he does  
16 not use SLED, I guess, or I don't know, highway  
17 patrol here, whatever resources y'all have, but  
18 you're not supposed to be involved, as Deputy  
19 McAllister was, for example, in picking up evidence  
20 and moving things around.

21 Very important to preserve that crime scene.  
22 You just don't -- you're personally involved in it  
23 as a potential victim in this case. You don't do  
24 those kind of things.

25 BY MR. GARRETT:



1       **Q**     And did that concern you as you reviewed the  
2       entire case file, that that had happened in this  
3       case?

4       **A**     Yes. Yes. You don't know were things moved?  
5       Where, for example, in the Glock 22, where are the  
6       other six unfired rounds? It should be reasonably  
7       proximate to the other round. There are a lot of  
8       things that you just don't -- you don't have people  
9       who have a concern about what just happened. I  
10      mean, they're involved in it, so they -- and you can  
11      check any basic criminal investigation texts to  
12      affirm that.

13      **Q**     And a criminalist is different from a  
14      criminologist, but as a criminologist, if you're  
15      attempting to find bullets or particular fragments  
16      of bullets in the ground at or near a certain  
17      location, would you be able to perform that with  
18      your team to be able to perform that kind of  
19      investigation?

20      **A**     No, no. You would -- there's where you would  
21      use crime scene technicians. Crime scene personnel  
22      are highly trained, and I -- SLED has an excellent  
23      reputation. I don't know what their relationship is  
24      with the sheriff's department, but you should have  
25      an arrangement where you can get independent crime

1 scene techs to come in. They will paint the area  
2 with video. They'll take photographs, they'll take  
3 measurements, and they'll locate things so they're  
4 able to piece things back together.

5 But you don't have your own people,  
6 particularly people who are involved in the  
7 incident, doing that. They're supposed to be  
8 separated and you get independent statements from  
9 them. They shouldn't be involved.

10 **MR. GARRETT:** Beg the Court's indulgence.

11 (Pause.)

12 **MR. GARRETT:** I have no further questions at  
13 this time, Your Honor.

14 **THE COURT:** May I see the attorneys over here  
15 at the side bar, please?

16 (Whereupon, a bench conference was held off  
17 the record, in the presence of the jury, but out of  
18 the hearing of the jury.)

19 **THE COURT:** All right. Madame Forelady and  
20 ladies and gentlemen of the jury, I was checking  
21 with counsel about scheduling and logistics and what  
22 we're going to do. Since this is a good opportune  
23 time to break, and it's about 20 after 5:00, I'm  
24 going to go ahead and call recess for the day. I'm  
25 going to ask you to be back in your jury room the

1 same time you've been coming all week, and that is  
2 at 9:25. And we'll try to start right promptly at  
3 9:30.

4 I'm going to remind you that you're not to  
5 speak with yourselves or anyone else about this  
6 case; read, hear, or listen to anything about this  
7 case, and I will ask you that in the morning.

8 With that being said, I hope you have a good  
9 evening.

10 (The jury was excused for the day.)

11 **THE COURT:** Doctor, since you're on the stand,  
12 don't speak with anyone about your testimony.

13 **THE WITNESS:** Yes, sir.

14 **THE COURT:** I know you know, but I have to say  
15 it for the record. Thank you, sir. Have a nice  
16 evening.

17 All right, guys. Is there anything further  
18 from the defense in this matter?

19 **MR. GARRETT:** Nothing from the defense.

20 **THE COURT:** From the State?

21 **MR. MAYE:** Nothing from the State.

22 **THE COURT:** All right. We'll be in recess  
23 until 9:30 in the morning.

24 (The proceedings were concluded for December  
25 18, 2013.)

1                   (The following proceedings were held on  
2                   December 19, 2013.)

3                   **THE COURT:** Mr. Myers, are you ready to proceed  
4                   from the State?

5                   **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

6                   **THE COURT:** Defense ready to proceed,  
7                   Mr. Garrett?

8                   **MR. GARRETT:** Yes, Your Honor.

9                   **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury in?

10                   (The jury enters the courtroom at 9:40 a.m.)

11                   **THE COURT:** Good morning, ladies and gentlemen  
12                   of the jury. I hope you had a nice evening.

13                   As I told you yesterday and I've done before,  
14                   I'm going to ask each and every one of you if anyone  
15                   has heard, read, or seen anything about this trial  
16                   during the break overnight; if so, would you raise  
17                   your right hand.

18                   Let the record reflect that no juror responded  
19                   in the positive.

20                   With that being said, Mr. Myers, is the State  
21                   ready to proceed with cross-examination?

22                   **MR. MYERS:** The State's ready, Your Honor.

23                   **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett, is the defense ready  
24                   to proceed?

25                   **MR. GARRETT:** The defense is ready, Your Honor.

1           **THE COURT:** All right, sir. Would you come  
2 back around, and remind you that you're still under  
3 oath.

4           **THE WITNESS:** Yes, Your Honor.

5                           CROSS-EXAMINATION

6           BY MR. MYERS:

7           **Q**     When you first testified yesterday, I think you  
8 said you were a scientist; is that right?

9           **A**     Yes, that's correct.

10          **Q**     And you were an expert in standards and  
11 procedures in law enforcement?

12          **A**     Of the law enforcement profession, yes, sir.

13          **Q**     And that you had testified -- I forgot how many  
14 times.

15          **A**     In police-related cases, I've been involved and  
16 retained a total of about 1200, I think, to date.

17          **Q**     Twelve hundred times. And when you testify,  
18 you basically say you're a scientist?

19          **A**     I say I'm a criminologist, which is a social  
20 scientist, yes.

21          **Q**     Social scientist?

22          **A**     Yes.

23          **Q**     And that you have a degree from San Jose State?

24          **A**     Correct. Two degrees: Bachelor's and master's  
25 of science.

1       **Q**     And then a doctor of criminology from the  
2       University of California at Berkeley?

3       **A**     Yes.

4       **Q**     And it seems like you talk about standard  
5       procedure and your testimony is the same every time.  
6       Do you have a standard list of questions that you  
7       like to be asked?

8       **A**     It depends on the issues that are before us on  
9       a particular case.  You know, you may be talking  
10      about a use of force or hiring procedures or proper  
11      training, vehicle pursuit, use of a particular type  
12      of weapon.  There could be a lot of different  
13      questions.  I might suggest questions that would be  
14      dealt with.

15      **Q**     And when you suggest questions, that's pretty  
16      much the same thing:  Standards and procedures in  
17      law enforcement procedure.  And you talk about  
18      training and following the book and following rules  
19      and regulations.

20             And you have a list of questions that you kind  
21      of respond to.  It's kind of a standard testimony --

22      **A**     Well, the questions vary.  I mean, it's up to,  
23      ultimately, counsel for plaintiff or defense or  
24      prosecution or defense to decide what questions  
25      they're going to ask, but I do make suggestions as

1 to, depending on the nature of the case.

2 **Q** And when you make suggestions, you have a list  
3 of questions you like to be asked, don't you?

4 **A** Well, I have a list of questions that I think  
5 are relevant to the particular subject. I will  
6 often submit that for their consideration.  
7 Sometimes they don't request that.

8 **THE COURT:** Let me stop you. I'm sorry. Would  
9 you back off just a little bit? We're getting a  
10 little feedback --

11 **THE WITNESS:** I'm sorry. Y'all are getting  
12 feedback there?

13 **THE COURT:** Yes, sir.

14 BY MR. MYERS:

15 **Q** Because I noticed yesterday that Mr. Garrett  
16 didn't have a yellow pad; he had a list of typed-out  
17 questions that he just merely read to you. Those  
18 were your questions, weren't they?

19 **A** Yes. Those are questions I prepared.

20 **Q** So you take and show around and you have the  
21 questions for which you want to be asked and then  
22 you respond?

23 **A** Well, like, they're suggested questions that we  
24 -- I think, cover the issues that are in the  
25 particular case.

1       **Q**     Yes, sir. And you talk about South Carolina  
2       Criminal Justice Academy.

3       **A**     Yes, sir.

4       **Q**     And said you'd been there?

5       **A**     I've taught there, yes.

6       **Q**     And you said something about John O'Leary being  
7       the director. You mentioned that name.

8       **A**     He was the director for a number of years; I  
9       think was there totally for about 16 years at the  
10      academy.

11      **Q**     And when was the last time you were at the  
12      South Carolina Criminal Justice Academy?

13      **A**     Oh, it's been many years ago.

14      **Q**     Well, how many?

15      **A**     I would say back somewhere probably in the 80s.

16      **Q**     Because John O'Leary left -- he was no longer  
17      the director after 1980 -- the mid 1980s.

18      **A**     I don't know when he left.

19      **Q**     Do you know they've had five directors since  
20      then?

21      **A**     The director that I -- the name of the director  
22      when I came was Cliff. I can't remember his last  
23      name.

24      **Q**     Cliff? He was before John. That's back in the  
25      70s, 60s.



1       **A**     That may very well be.

2       **Q**     So we're talking about 45 years ago?

3       **A**     Well, it would have had to have been some time  
4       after I became a police officer. It would have to  
5       be somewhere, I think, in the mid 70s or maybe  
6       later.

7       **Q**     Well, who is teaching this training? You said  
8       that's an excellent training academy, at least it  
9       was back in the 80s?

10      **A**     Well, I've had occasion to -- I regularly  
11      review that curriculum in the course of looking at  
12      other cases. It's a good training program.

13      **Q**     Yeah, and who's teaching that now?

14      **A**     Well, they have different instructors teaching  
15      different --

16      **Q**     Well, give me the names of a few.

17      **A**     I wouldn't know the names of instructors.

18      **Q**     Well, you said they were excellent trainers.  
19      Who are they?

20      **A**     No. I said that the curriculum is excellent,  
21      the training curriculum. I don't know the  
22      individual instructors.

23      **Q**     Well, you can have a book, but if you don't  
24      have a good professor, it doesn't kind of  
25      communicate over to the students.

1       **A**     Well, that's true, but I'm assuming that, based  
2       upon the curriculum that I have, that they have  
3       competent instructors, experienced instructors.  
4       That's always been my impression.

5       **Q**     You're assuming that. Of course, you hadn't  
6       been there in 30 years or so.

7       **A**     That's true, I have not, but I have kept close  
8       touch with Mr. O'Leary over the years and have, you  
9       know, have learned some other things about the  
10      academy.

11      **Q**     Mr. O'Leary has been a defense lawyer since  
12      '85?

13      **A**     That's correct.

14      **Q**     And you said that, in responding to shots  
15      fired, that officers should contact the complainant.  
16      That's what you said?

17      **A**     Yes, that's correct.

18      **Q**     And they do not disclose their presence when  
19      responding?

20      **A**     Until they're ready to have it disclosed.  
21      Until they've got some -- until they have it -- what  
22      we call a threat assessment.

23      **Q**     Uh-huh. So they have to assess what's going  
24      on, but they do not disclose their presence when  
25      responding?

1       **A**     Not immediately.

2       **Q**     And they contacted the Sheffields, the  
3       complainant?

4       **A**     They did contact the Sheffields, and there was  
5       conversation with them very, very brief, a matter  
6       of, what, a minute, minute and a half.

7       **Q**     But however they did that, you said they did it  
8       wrong?

9       **A**     No. I said that it's correct to contact the  
10      RP, the reporting party, but you need to take time  
11      to gather information and not have some of the  
12      people going off on their own, as Deputy Moore did  
13      over at the house. You don't know what you've got  
14      over there. So you've got to gather information  
15      first.

16      **Q**     So when Bobby talked to the Sheffields, he  
17      didn't spend enough time with them?

18      **A**     He sure didn't.

19      **Q**     He should have stayed there how long? How long  
20      should he have stayed with them?

21      **A**     There's no calculus. I gave some examples  
22      yesterday about how you need to gather basic  
23      information: Has this man ever threatened anyone?  
24      Is he known to be mentally ill?

25      **Q**     Well, how would the Sheffields know if he's

1           ever threatened anyone?

2           **A**       May I finish my --

3                   **MR. GARRETT:**   Objection, Your Honor.   He's  
4           cutting him off, not letting him finish his answer.

5           BY MR. MYERS:

6           **Q**       I apologize.

7           **A**       That's okay.   Basic questions that need to be  
8           asked by the officer contacting the Sheffields are:  
9           Has he threatened you or anybody else?   Does he have  
10          any history of mental illness or mental  
11          hospitalization?   Do you know anything about any  
12          medications he's been taking?   They may not know  
13          anything about that.

14                 Do you know if he's -- does he drink?   Do you  
15          know if he's drunk at the present time?   Do you know  
16          if he uses drugs?   He might be using drugs at this  
17          time.   Do you know anything about the weapons that  
18          he may have over there?

19                 Now, some of these things, they may not know  
20          anything about, but you ask those basic questions.  
21          And the thing that's most key is that what starts  
22          out for Mr. Rushton as, oh, I think it could be a  
23          deer thing, now you get down there and you hear the  
24          Sheffields say, there were loud voices or a loud  
25          voice, he's talking loud, and he was firing a gun.

1 That changes the nature of the call to a gun call.

2 Again, the academy has very clear things to say  
3 about what you need to do in those kind of  
4 situations.

5 **Q** Are you through?

6 **A** Yes. Thank you.

7 **Q** So when they went over there and the Sheffields  
8 say, we've reported him cussing, yelling, and  
9 screaming in the middle of the night, shooting guns,  
10 it's been going on for months and he started back  
11 tonight, he's out there cussing and yelling 3:00,  
12 3:30, 2:00, whatever it was, and he shot two times,  
13 and we wasn't going to give him time to shot {sic}  
14 the third time, they should have said, now, wait a  
15 minute, when was he committed to the hospital; how  
16 drunk is he; is he on PCP; is he on meth; is he on  
17 angel dust? They should have gotten --

18 **A** No, sir. I think I've indicated to you -- how  
19 long did it take me to ask those sample questions?  
20 Maybe 45 seconds, a minute or so. But they're very  
21 important things to know.

22 **Q** But responding to a disturbance in the  
23 neighborhood, they should go into a background of  
24 the person doing all this? That's your testimony?

25 **A** They should learn whatever they can, from an

1 officer safety standpoint, from the reporting  
2 person, anyone else that's present that can tell  
3 them something about what's going on.

4 The key things here are talking loud and firing  
5 a gun. That makes it a gun call. And, again, the  
6 academy has very important things to say about what  
7 you don't do and what you do when you've got that  
8 kind of information.

9 Q And the Criminal Justice Academy teaches that  
10 in Columbia, South Carolina?

11 A Yeah, I can read what they say to do and not to  
12 do on a call like this if you'd like.

13 Q They teach that out there now?

14 A They do teach that, correct.

15 Q They teach that.

16 And these officers should have gone into all of  
17 that for somebody firing in the neighborhood in  
18 McCormick County.

19 A I'm sorry, sir?

20 Q These officers should have pulled out the book  
21 and gone over a checklist --

22 A No, sir.

23 Q -- for shots fired in McCormick County?

24 A No, sir. No one's suggesting they pull out the  
25 book. They should know to ask these basic

1       questions: Any evidence of mental illness, drugs,  
2       alcohol, any threats to anyone. Those are four key  
3       questions, and the answer's maybe, we don't know or,  
4       yeah, he does do drugs, he has made some threats  
5       against some other people. Those are things you  
6       need to know.

7                You already know some -- you already know the  
8       things that change it into a gun call, just shots  
9       fired, loud voices on the porch. Loud voice on the  
10      porch and shots fired change the nature of the call,  
11      it's not a deer.

12      **Q**       Yes, sir.

13                And don't pull out the book, but go by the  
14      book?

15      **A**       Well, you know, the book -- there are times  
16      when the book, you know, the book can't describe  
17      every last thing, but this is the best --

18      **Q**       Would you repeat that now?

19      **A**       The book can't describe every last situation.  
20      Obviously, every situation is different, but these  
21      are -- what you call a book here, this is the best  
22      material the American law enforcement profession,  
23      the police professionals themselves, police  
24      organizations have been able to come up with. So  
25      they're good guidelines.

1 I've already indicated yesterday that there can  
2 be exceptions. We talked about an active shooter,  
3 something like Sandy Hook or Columbine.

4 **Q** This is like Sandy Hook, like that school up  
5 there where they killed all those children?

6 **A** No, sir.

7 **Q** Well, why did you bring that up?

8 **A** I brought it up because you were asking about  
9 the book and I'm saying, to be fair, there are  
10 exceptions. There are times where you've got to  
11 rush in. This is isn't one of them. There's no  
12 reason to rush at all. There's every reason to get  
13 that information and devise a plan.

14 **Q** I just wanted to write down Sandy Hook.

15 Now, you said here that they should have  
16 contacted Mr. Worley. You said that they should  
17 have gotten dispatch to call him on the phone. If  
18 that didn't work, use a PA system or maybe a  
19 bullhorn, or you said something about a whistle  
20 yesterday. You used to carry a whistle around with  
21 you?

22 **A** That wasn't what I was talking about. I was  
23 talking about -- the whistle and the other bright  
24 pieces of metal on the uniforms that were -- tend to  
25 give off more indication of my presence as a police



1 officer than the uniform -- the plainclothes uniform  
2 that Deputy Rushton was wearing.

3 **Q** The Criminal Justice Academy of South Carolina  
4 tells officers to wear whistles now in 2000 --

5 **A** No, sir. They talk about -- the important  
6 thing they talk about, the approach and when you  
7 should approach and when you should not approach,  
8 and they say stay back. The material says, if  
9 you've got a gun call, you've got shots fired, stay  
10 back, get him to come to you.

11 And that's echoed by every standard text for  
12 law enforcement officers, Street Survival, Tactical  
13 Edge, material put out by the International  
14 Association of Chiefs of Police, the FBI. It all  
15 says the same thing: Get him to come to you.

16 If you've got a potentially high-risk call --  
17 this is clearly a high-risk call now. Any time  
18 you've got a gun, shots fired, you don't know what  
19 it is, so you get the person to come to you. The  
20 question is, how are you going to go about doing  
21 that? There are very simple ways that could have  
22 been done.

23 **Q** What's Street Survival? What's that?

24 **A** I'm sorry?

25 **Q** You said something about Street Survival.

1           What's that?

2           **A**       Street Survival is a widely used text  
3           throughout the United States for many years,  
4           authored by law enforcement specialists, people who  
5           have extensive experience.

6                    They talk about basic officer survival, things  
7           that you need to be aware of, cautions to take.  
8           They put on training -- they put on officer survival  
9           seminars throughout the country. I see that  
10          Mr. Rushton's curriculum contains material on  
11          officer survival training, so he must have had that,  
12          that sort of instruction.

13          **Q**       Street Survival was even published in a  
14          magazine called Police Magazine?

15          **A**       It's been published and reprinted in many  
16          different places. Published mainly by --

17                   **THE COURT:** Let me -- I don't mean to interrupt  
18          again. Scoot your chair back just a tad.

19                   **THE WITNESS:** I'm sorry. You let me know if  
20          I'm giving you feedback.

21                   **THE COURT:** I think -- you want it further  
22          away, not closer. I think that's what the  
23          feedback's coming from.

24                   **THE WITNESS:** Okay.

25                   Yeah, it was published by Calibre Press many

1 years ago, but it's become a very, very widely used  
2 source, a very respected source throughout the  
3 country.

4 BY MR. MYERS:

5 Q And I saw something in your material, you even  
6 refer to that magazine, Police Magazine?

7 A Police Magazine, yes, is one publication.

8 Q And you said if all that didn't work, they  
9 should cut on their sirens and maybe their blue  
10 lights?

11 A I said, if you, you know, the first thing you  
12 do is ask the dispatcher to check the county  
13 directory to see if there's a landline.

14 Q Check what? Check the county records?

15 A Check the county -- your county directory here  
16 and see if the Worleys have a phone listed for [REDACTED]  
17 Presidential {sic} Drive, the Worley residence.  
18 They did have one and it presumably was listed. You  
19 would then call there, and they would have answered  
20 the phone.

21 That's the first thing you try to do:  
22 Establish contact from a safe position. And that  
23 could be done very easily, and we wouldn't all be  
24 sitting here right now if that had been done.

25 Q So we wouldn't?

1       **A**     No, we wouldn't.

2       **Q**     Because you said if they had done all that,  
3       Mr. Worley would have come out. You said right  
4       here --

5       **A**     Yeah, that's right.

6       **Q**     -- if they would have done all that, people  
7       would have come out?

8       **A**     There's no reason to believe that he and his  
9       83-year-old mother, if they knew -- it's four  
10      o'clock in the morning now, you know, anybody can  
11      say, Sheriff's department. We've get a lot of home  
12      invasions where people say, sheriff, police  
13      department, open the door.

14             But this proves unequivocally, if you -- by the  
15      time you make the call -- the sheriff's department  
16      makes the call, you turn on your emergency lights,  
17      your protected, covered position at your vehicle,  
18      high beams on, spot light on, blue lights on, and  
19      they know it's police out there, and they're going  
20      to -- there's no reason to believe that these folks  
21      were just average folks who are going to do anything  
22      except come out.

23      **Q**     So when they rang the doorbell, when they  
24      knocked on the door and kept yelling, Sheriff's  
25      department, did they come out?

1       **A**     Well, they did not -- they did not come out.  
2       And the doorbell -- the doorbell could be heard  
3       upstairs, but that would just be enough to frighten  
4       the resident. It would frighten a law enforcement  
5       officer sleeping in the middle of the night. The  
6       knocking cannot be heard. Loud voices --

7       **Q**     Excuse me. The knocking could not be heard?

8       **A**     The knocking cannot -- I've been out there  
9       twice now. You cannot hear knocking, loud voices.  
10      You can't hear The Beach Boys at 100 decibels.

11     **Q**     You had a boom box, too?

12     **A**     Boom box.

13     **Q**     You have one?

14     **A**     I had a boom box and a decibel meter. You  
15     cannot hear The Beach Boys at 100 decibels on a  
16     decibel meter in that back bedroom. You can't hear  
17     it.

18     **Q**     Okay. So if somebody were downstairs at that  
19     door and they were knocking, somebody upstairs  
20     couldn't hear it and wouldn't respond?

21     **A**     That's correct.

22     **Q**     If somebody were downstairs knocking on that  
23     door, people upstairs couldn't hear it?

24     **A**     That's correct.

25     **Q**     That's your testimony?

1       **A**     That's my experience being out there.

2       **Q**     That's your testimony?

3       **A**     Yes. I've done that.

4       **Q**     Uniforms. You said the fellows here were  
5       dressed like plainclothes officers, civies, and that  
6       was bad. That's against the books.

7       **A**     I said Officer Rushton was essentially dressed  
8       as a plainclothes officer.

9       **Q**     What about Deputy Moore?

10      **A**     Deputy Moore had some signs of being a deputy  
11      sheriff. He had -- he had the star you see  
12      embroidered on the front of his shirt.

13      **Q**     He had the star on there?

14      **A**     Yeah. But he wasn't visible. McAllister  
15      wasn't visible. What Mr. --

16      **Q**     Now, how do you know they weren't visible?

17      **A**     My recollection of the testimony --

18      **Q**     Whose testimony?

19      **A**     Well, the file. I can't tell you specifically  
20      where in there, but I don't think that -- I don't  
21      think that they say that they were --

22      **Q**     Who's they?

23      **A**     Deputies Moore and McAllister were not in a  
24      position -- they said they don't know that he could  
25      see them.

1           **Q**     Well, they had windows in the back.

2           **A**     Yeah, but you'd have to walk over -- you'd have  
3           to walk over to the other side to look and see the  
4           police car.

5           **Q**     What's wrong with walking over? Ain't nothing  
6           to obstruct you.

7           **A**     That wasn't what he did. He came out --

8           **Q**     What who did?

9           **A**     Wasn't what Mr. Worley did.

10          **Q**     So you're giving Mr. Worley all the benefit of  
11          the doubt of what he did and didn't do.

12          **A**     No. No. No, I think you have to give everyone  
13          the benefit of the doubt.

14          **Q**     You give everyone the benefit of the doubt.

15          **A**     Including the officers. That's why I said, you  
16          know, for example, they responded with three  
17          officers. That's fine. It's good to have plenty of  
18          manpower on a call like this that involves guns and  
19          shots fired. I give them credit for that.

20          **Q**     And they should have worn bright suits, like  
21          you do, a lot of glitter, whistles like in  
22          Jacksonville, Florida; Tallahassee, Florida; and you  
23          mentioned a couple other cities. What other cities?

24          **A**     Leon County Sheriff's Department.

25          **Q**     Where is that?

1       **A**     It's in Tallahassee.

2       **Q**     So Tallahassee?

3       **A**     Yes.  It's a county that embraces Tallahassee.

4       **Q**     And Jacksonville?

5       **A**     Jacksonville.  Jacksonville police is also  
6       sheriff Jacksonville police.

7       **Q**     And what other cities?  You mentioned some more  
8       and I didn't catch them.

9       **A**     Well, those are the three uniforms I've worn.  
10      When I was in Broward, I was in plain clothes.  I  
11      was undercover, so I didn't wear a uniform.

12      **Q**     Forty years ago?

13      **A**     I'm sorry?

14      **Q**     Thirty-five, 40 years ago when you wore a  
15      uniform?

16      **A**     I was in Broward undercover in 1975.

17      **Q**     '75, '85, '95, 2005 -- 34 years ago?

18      **A**     Right.  I remained a law enforcement officer,  
19      though, until '90 -- I think I resigned my  
20      commission in '91.  '90 to 91.

21      **Q**     So they should have glitter, lights, and  
22      whistles on them to brighten themselves up?

23      **A**     Well, I'm not being -- I'm not trying to pick  
24      them apart.  As far as whistles, some agencies don't  
25      carry whistles.  I'm saying that it's an advantage



1 to have as much reflective material or metal badges  
2 and -- but even with that, you don't -- I don't care  
3 if you're lit up like the tin man on The Wizard of  
4 Oz, you shouldn't be walking around on a gun call, a  
5 darkened residence. The reason is that people get  
6 killed. Innocent people, deputies, officers get  
7 killed by homeowners, homeowners get killed by  
8 officers. I've seen it many times.

9 That's not -- that's not an early thing that  
10 you do. You're not going to be walking around out  
11 there, whatever you're wearing.

12 **Q** How many deputies of the McCormick County  
13 Sheriff's Department have been killed in the last 40  
14 years?

15 **A** I'm not aware of any deputies that have been  
16 killed in this department.

17 **Q** And what's the budgets for Tallahassee and  
18 Jacksonville for uniforms?

19 **A** I couldn't tell you that. I've been gone from  
20 there a long time.

21 **Q** Is it more than \$3,000?

22 **A** I'm sure it is. These are larger departments.  
23 You have a small department here.

24 **Q** Now, let me ask you something: What do these  
25 officers over there in Aiken County over here wear?

1       **A**     I'm not familiar with Aiken County.

2       **Q**     What do the officers right next door in  
3       Edgefield County wear?

4       **A**     Also, I'm not familiar with Edgefield --

5       **Q**     What do officers right down in Saluda County  
6       wear?

7       **A**     I don't know.

8       **Q**     What do the officers over in Barnwell County  
9       wear?

10      **A**     Don't know, sir.

11      **Q**     How about down in Hampton County?

12      **A**     In where, sir?

13      **Q**     Hampton. H-a-m-p--

14      **A**     I'm really not familiar with all the counties.

15      **Q**     What about Allendale County?

16      **A**     Don't know, sir.

17      **Q**     You just don't know?

18      **A**     No, I don't know.

19      **Q**     And in Police Magazine, we've talked about that  
20      before, you said -- and you've quoted that. This is  
21      Police Magazine right here.

22      **A**     Yes.

23      **Q**     And this is what they have on the first page,  
24      officers' uniforms?

25      **A**     Right. That's -- a lot of officers wear light

1 uniforms like that. Some officers wear BDUs, battle  
2 dress uniforms that are dark, tactical. I've been  
3 on plainclothes patrol.

4 **Q** And they have a contest for people to win the  
5 national best uniform, and this is it. Do you see  
6 that?

7 **A** I do.

8 **MR. MYERS:** I offer this into evidence, Your  
9 Honor.

10 **THE COURT:** Any objection?

11 **MR. GARRETT:** Can I see it, please?

12 (Pause.)

13 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, we're fine to put it  
14 in evidence.

15 **THE COURT:** Are you attempting to do the whole  
16 magazine or just that piece of the magazine?

17 **MR. MYERS:** This right here is all we need.

18 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, under the  
19 completeness rule, we'd like the entire magazine.

20 **MR. MYERS:** I'll put it in.

21 **THE COURT:** Okay. Admitted without objection.

22 (State's Exhibit Number 33, Police Magazine,  
23 marked and admitted into evidence.)

24 BY MR. MYERS:

25 **Q** Looks like on page 58 and 59 -- come down here,

1       please, sir.

2       **A**     Sure.

3               (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

4       **Q**     Other than this microphone being up on his  
5       shoulder -- because Bobby said he had his microphone  
6       right here on this little hook -- how is he dressed  
7       differently than this man?

8               Oh, I take that back. He had long-sleeve  
9       shirts rather than short-sleeve shirts.

10      **A**     He had long-sleeve shirts.

11      **Q**     Other than that.

12      **A**     Well, this -- there are no insignia -- there  
13      were no insignia of sheriff's department on his  
14      uniform at all.

15      **Q**     Any on this one?

16      **A**     Well, this is a model. This is a display.  
17      And, of course, certainly this officer works for  
18      some agency.

19      **Q**     I'll give you that. He didn't have any  
20      insignia.

21      **A**     Most -- a lot of our officers in south Florida  
22      wear shorts, short pants, for example. They wear  
23      polo shirts like this, but they have insignia,  
24      usually, and badges or -- embroidered badges on  
25      there.

1           The idea is to be, you know, visible as police.  
2       You'd have to have -- I mean, you couldn't go around  
3       like this, as they're showing a model in uniform.  
4       You have to have some things on here that tell  
5       people you're a police officer.

6       **Q**     You've got to have something on there to tell  
7       you're a police officer?

8       **A**     Yeah.  You're not -- this is not an  
9       undercover --

10      **Q**     Where is the book that says that?

11      **A**     Well, the book is the principle that says you  
12      must give notice of your purpose and presence when  
13      you're taking enforcement action.  You've got to let  
14      people know, I'm a police officer.  I'm telling you  
15      to do something, I'm not just Joe Blow.

16           Now, this is just a model here, but he's going  
17      to surely have -- and when he's in uniform, he's  
18      going to have insignia.

19      **Q**     And he should have had an insignia.  He should  
20      have had more glitter.  He should have had more  
21      bright stuff.  Should have had a whistle.  Anything  
22      else?

23      **A**     I'm not saying he should -- he had to have a  
24      whistle.  I'm saying that, you know, in a uniform  
25      like this -- and these are becoming very popular --

1       that they -- you will see -- typically there will be  
2       shoulder patches, there will be a patch sewn on  
3       here, there will be some things that will say  
4       police.

5             You can't just go up to someone and say, Hey,  
6       I'd like to see some identification or whatever, and  
7       you don't -- you haven't established your identity  
8       to the police officer.

9       **Q**     Anything else?

10      **A**     No, sir.

11      **Q**     Did y'all wear this back 35, 40 years ago?

12      **A**     No.

13      **Q**     Thank you.

14      **A**     (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

15      **Q**     Now, we talked about couldn't hear. You said  
16       the house was soundproof, couldn't hear your boom  
17       box.

18      **A**     Sir, could you speak up just a little bit? I'm  
19       sorry.

20      **Q**     I said that we've talked about you giving  
21       Mr. Worley the benefit that he couldn't hear  
22       upstairs. You had a boom box, and you've been out  
23       there.

24      **A**     Yes.

25      **Q**     But if he could hear, he just ignored the

1 police, didn't he?

2 **A** If you assume that he could hear --

3 **Q** Well, let's assume that he could hear, he  
4 ignored the police?

5 **A** Yes. If he could hear police or them saying  
6 deputy sheriff, sheriff's department, if he could  
7 hear it --

8 **Q** He ignored it?

9 **A** -- then he would be ignoring it, that's  
10 correct.

11 **Q** But if they would have called him on the phone,  
12 he would have come out?

13 **A** Well, what we know about him and his mother,  
14 they're not criminals. They're just two people  
15 living up there with their cat. There would be no  
16 reason, if they knew it was the sheriff's  
17 department, why wouldn't they -- why wouldn't they  
18 come out?

19 **Q** Even when they yelled sheriff's department, and  
20 he said, I don't give an F --

21 **A** Well, was it --

22 **Q** -- did he ignore them then?

23 **A** If he could hear that. But if I can't hear the  
24 Beach Boys at 100 decibels, how is he going to hear  
25 an utterance like that?

1       **Q**     Now, see, you're giving him too much benefit of  
2     the doubt.

3             When he stepped out on that porch -- somebody  
4     on the porch, can you hear somebody under the porch  
5     talking, yelling, hollering, Sheriff's department?

6       **A**     You'd be able -- on the porch, you'd be able to  
7     hear.

8       **Q**     And when they said, Sheriff's department,  
9     sheriff's department, he said, I don't give an F, he  
10    ignored them, didn't he?

11    **A**     If you assume that happened.

12    **Q**     Well, do you assume that happened? Did you  
13    hear the officers testify when you were sitting out  
14    here?

15    **A**     I take that as a hypothetical of the officer.  
16    This is the officer's version of what happened.

17    **Q**     So you don't believe the officer then?

18    **A**     It's not important what -- that's up to the  
19    jury to decide.

20    **Q**     Sure. It's up to the jury to decide whether he  
21    could hear them, whether Worley could hear them,  
22    too, isn't it?

23    **A**     Well, by the same token, as a criminologist,  
24    I'm entitled to conduct an experiment out there in  
25    terms of the acoustics of the place, which are



1       remarkable.

2       **Q**     Remarkable.

3             Did you get upstairs on the patio up there?

4       **A**     I did.

5       **Q**     Could you hear that boom box downstairs?

6       **A**     I didn't go out on the patio. I went in the  
7       bedroom where Mr. Worley was when this knocking and  
8       doorbell ringing. You can hear the doorbell  
9       ringing.

10      **Q**     You could?

11      **A**     Sure. And a high-pitch frequency like that,  
12      you could also have heard sirens. You've got a  
13      range of siren controls on a cruiser, can be -- make  
14      no question at all as to who was out there.

15      **Q**     You can't hear a loud boom box at the front  
16      door, but you can hear a siren up the road. Is that  
17      what you're saying?

18      **A**     I'm saying if -- that, you know, I'm not an  
19      acoustics expert, but I'm telling you that that --  
20      the visor bar on the top of that police car has a  
21      siren control range -- high, low, yelp, you know,  
22      air horn. You can make a great deal of police-type  
23      noise that would erase any question as to who you  
24      were. A phone would do that, too.

25      **Q**     Yes, sir.

1           And giving everybody the benefit of the doubt,  
2           the defendant and the officers, you're saying the  
3           defendant couldn't hear the officers when he was on  
4           that upstairs porch and they yelled, Sheriff's  
5           department?

6           **A**     No. I'm saying that if -- giving him the  
7           benefit of the doubt, if he was out on the porch and  
8           they were yelling, sheriff's department, that you  
9           would be able to hear.

10          **Q**     And when he said, I don't give an F, he ignored  
11          them, disregarded them, didn't he?

12          **A**     If that happened.

13          **Q**     Well, you don't believe that happened?

14          **A**     It's not my role to say what happened. I don't  
15          -- I don't know --

16          **Q**     Well, you are saying --

17          **A**     Here's what I'm saying: I don't know why two  
18          people who are just living in a home there would say  
19          something like that. What would be their motivation  
20          in doing that?

21          **Q**     Well, let me ask you this: Let's assume that  
22          Mr. Worley heard them and let's assume that  
23          Mr. Worley responded, I don't give an F, is that  
24          proper standard and procedure for a law-abiding  
25          citizen?

1       **A**     No.  If a citizen -- if the citizen knows that  
2       they are law enforcement officers, he's supposed to  
3       respond accordingly.  However, anyone can say,  
4       police, sheriff's department.  The question is what  
5       proves that?

6               We have home invasions all over the country  
7       regularly by people who are -- we have people  
8       pulling over cars saying that they're police.

9       **Q**     Did we have a home invasion on November the  
10      15th of 2009?

11      **A**     No, that's not a home invasion.  But if you're  
12      awakened at four o'clock in the morning by somebody  
13      ringing your doorbell, you're going to be scared.  
14      You're not going to know what it is.  You're going  
15      to want to know who is this.

16      **Q**     When he was out there after three o'clock --  
17      between 3:00 and 3:30 shooting that .30-06 rifle,  
18      was he home -- was he home and afraid and scared  
19      then?

20      **A**     No.  He was doing what he was doing.  He says  
21      he was trying to motivate a fox to leave his cat,  
22      Sweet Pea, alone.

23      **Q**     So we go back to the fox and the cat; right?  
24      And, of course, you believe that?

25      **A**     Sir, it's a hypothetical for me.  I'm assuming

1       that, too.

2       **Q**     You said another agency should have been called  
3       in to process the scene; is that right?

4       **A**     Yes.

5       **Q**     You said that they could have collected  
6       evidence better; they could have used crime scene  
7       technicians; they would have been independent; they  
8       would have made records better; they would have had  
9       recordings, whatever that is; more photographs; they  
10      could have collected evidence; and they could have  
11      done a better job?

12      **A**     There's no accusation of bias when it's an  
13      independent source. It's very important in a  
14      shooting situation that there be an independent  
15      source that does the investigation.

16      **Q**     Have you looked at all these photographs we've  
17      got in evidence here?

18      **A**     When you say all of them, I've looked at quite  
19      a number of photographs.

20      **Q**     Well, if you need to see more, you can. But  
21      what could an independent agency -- how many more  
22      photographs could they have taken that would have  
23      been relevant?

24      **A**     It's not a matter of number. It's a matter of  
25      skill. I don't think that Ms. Melissa McAllister

1 was an evidence technician. She was a deputy  
2 sheriff.

3 **Q** Oh, so the McCormick County Sheriff's  
4 Department now has to hire a what now? A  
5 technician?

6 **A** Well, we should have access to independent  
7 evidence technicians to do independent collection of  
8 evidence in a situation where your own officers are  
9 involved. You don't investigate your own case.  
10 These people are -- these deputies are purportedly  
11 the victims of a crime, and they're investigating  
12 it.

13 **Q** What other photographs could an independent  
14 agency have taken that would have been relevant to  
15 the jury?

16 **A** You would have to look at -- they would be  
17 painting the scene. For example, they'd be taking  
18 videos. They'd be taking their own measurements,  
19 which are objective. They're not -- and I'm not  
20 suggesting that there was anything improperly done,  
21 but it avoids --

22 **Q** You just said that they weren't --

23 **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor.

24 BY MR. MYERS:

25 **Q** Go ahead. I'm sorry. You finish. You finish.

1       **A**     It avoids any suggestion of impropriety when an  
2       outside agency like SLED, for example, is conducting  
3       the investigation.

4       **Q**     So they weren't objective and they weren't  
5       honest. Is that what you're saying?

6       **A**     I'm not saying that. I'm just saying --

7       **Q**     Well, what are you saying?

8       **A**     I'm telling you that it is a standard of the  
9       American law enforcement profession that that is  
10      normally what is done that in a police shooting  
11      situation, that -- involving -- the involved  
12      officers are not part of the investigation of the  
13      scene. Their role is only to secure the scene  
14      pending the arrival of an independent source.  
15      That's all I'm saying.

16             I'm not making any judgments as to were there  
17      any improprieties, was anything moved or anything  
18      discarded. I'm just saying that's the standard.

19      **Q**     That's an American standard?

20      **A**     Yes. I can refer you to many texts if you like  
21      to --

22      **Q**     I don't care about that.

23             Now, they've got Bobby's gun. Could an  
24      independent agency have gotten Bobby's gun somehow  
25      better than they do?

1       **A**     Again, you're asking me to critique --

2       **Q**     Yes, I am. I'm asking you to --

3       **A**     I'm not able to do that. I wasn't out there.  
4       I'm not trying to argue with you. All I'm trying to  
5       tell you is that it is a standard of the American  
6       police profession, if you look in any criminal  
7       investigation texts, that that is done by an agency  
8       that does not involve or by people, at least  
9       investigators in that agency, that are not directly  
10      involved in the incident to be sure that it's  
11      objective and unbiased in every respect.

12      **Q**     So, here again, they violated your standards  
13      and American standards and procedures and didn't go  
14      by the book?

15      **A**     They're not my standards, sir. They're  
16      standards of the --

17      **Q**     I'm sorry. American standards --

18              **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor. He was  
19      trying to complete his sentence.

20      BY MR. MYERS:

21      **Q**     Not your standards, the American standards.

22              **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, I'd ask that he be  
23      allowed to complete his sentence that he was  
24      trying --

25              **MR. MYERS:** Oh, I'm sorry. You can say

1           whatever you --

2           **THE COURT:** All right. Just one second. We  
3 all know the rules here. Let's just make sure you  
4 observe the question and answer procedure, please.

5           Go ahead.

6           BY MR. MYERS:

7           **Q**     Go ahead.

8           **A**     I'm just saying these are -- I'm representing  
9 to you that these are the standards of the American  
10 law enforcement profession. I have not encountered  
11 situations where what was done here is done by law  
12 enforcement agencies, in other words, where officers  
13 who are directly involved who are claiming to be  
14 victims of an event are themselves investigating  
15 that event. That's not proper in terms of the  
16 standards of the profession.

17          **Q**     It would have been more proper for another  
18 agency to collect all of these fragments?

19          **A**     Yes.

20          **Q**     It would have been more proper for another  
21 agency to go to the hospital and get these fragments  
22 that -- took Worley's bullet fragments out of  
23 Bobby's hand?

24          **A**     Yes. All that the agency people there have to  
25 do is just preserve the scene, be sure nobody's



1       traipsing onto the property, nobody else go in,  
2       unauthorized persons are coming, and let -- I've  
3       seen SLED work before and they're very thorough,  
4       very competent, let something like that come and  
5       process the scene.

6       **Q**     Do you know if SLED -- I'm sorry. Go ahead.

7       **A**     I don't know, you know, the Glock Model 23, 40  
8       caliber, I have one and shoot it quite often. It  
9       holds, I believe, 14 rounds. There were eight  
10      bullets -- eight unfired rounds unaccounted for.  
11      Where were the other six? The weapon's not terribly  
12      deformed. Why weren't those recovered?

13             I'm not criticizing. I'm just saying that  
14      questions like that would be easier addressed if you  
15      had professional crime scene people out there. And  
16      I understand it's a small department; I'm not  
17      criticizing them for not having those resources.  
18      But I am saying that they should have arranged to  
19      have somebody else come in, an outside source, so  
20      that, you know, sort of like, as we said, Caesar's  
21      wife, Calpurnia, she had to avoid not only  
22      wrongdoing, but even the appearance of wrongdoing.  
23      You want to avoid any question about whether this  
24      was properly handled.

25      **Q**     You have to avoid the appearance of wrongdoing?

1       **A**     Yes.

2       **Q**     And, of course, you here; you're not biased?

3       **A**     I try not to be biased.

4       **Q**     And you're dealing at arm's length.  You're  
5       giving the officers the benefit of the doubt?

6       **A**     Yes.

7       **Q**     And you're fair?

8       **A**     I'm trying to be fair.  I'm trying to, you  
9       know, I'm asking questions like why -- why couldn't  
10      we have -- even taking your hypothetical that he  
11      didn't come to the phone, why couldn't we place a  
12      phone call in the interest of safety?  Why couldn't  
13      we have done these other things to avoid putting  
14      ourselves potentially in harm's way being confused?

15             It's four o'clock in the morning.  It's very  
16      dark.  It's in the woods.  Most people, I'm sure,  
17      have weapons out there, as they're entitled to.  Why  
18      put ourselves and other people in harm's way when  
19      there are so many tragedies born of mistaken  
20      identification?

21      **Q**     You're fair, giving officers the benefit of the  
22      doubt, you're honest, and you're ethical?

23      **A**     Yes.

24      **Q**     But what about your dissertation here at the  
25      University of California at Berkeley?  You've been

1       asked about this before?

2       **A**     Oh, yes, many times.

3       **Q**     What was -- that was you, was getting your  
4       doctor's of criminology?

5       **A**     I was out there on a full scholarship,  
6       obtaining a doctorate in criminology from the  
7       University of California at Berkeley.

8       **Q**     And you had to write a dissertation to get your  
9       doctor's degree?

10      **A**     That's correct.

11      **Q**     And what was the dissertation about?

12      **A**     The dissertation was entitled, Transsexualism:  
13      A Study in the Management of Gender Stigma.

14      **Q**     What does that mean?

15      **A**     I'm sorry?

16      **Q**     What does that mean?

17      **A**     What it means is that, at Berkeley, it was just  
18      -- been the number one public university for 50  
19      years. They expect you to do something very  
20      creative in terms of a dissertation.

21             I happened to, when I was doing a jail work  
22      release study, I made contact with a physician  
23      surgeon from Stanford Medical Center named Dr.  
24      Donald Laub, who was changing physical stigma of  
25      inmates, people who had deformed faces and cleft

1 palates and so on. And we became professionally  
2 associated.

3 And years later, when I was at Berkeley and I  
4 was casting a ballot for a dissertation topic, I  
5 became aware of the fact that Dr. Laub and the  
6 Stanford Medical Center, one of the finest medical  
7 centers in the country, were treating a group of  
8 people that are called transsexuals. I'm sure  
9 you've heard of them. These are people who are  
10 undergoing change of sex. They're going from male  
11 to female or female to male.

12 And, not surprisingly, they often have a  
13 history of a lot of psychiatric problems, some of  
14 them have criminal histories, attempted suicide.  
15 And so Dr. Laub approached me, he said, Look,  
16 Mr. Kirkham, we could work together on this. We, at  
17 the Stanford Medical Center are evaluating these  
18 people trying to make a grave decision, whether or  
19 not to alter their genitals, male to female, female  
20 to male. We can't go back and change it.

21 I said, Well, how can I help? He said, Well,  
22 we will give you access to our patient pool of 50  
23 people in the Bay area, many of whom are members of  
24 a group called COG, Change Our Gender. And, in  
25 return, you'll give us information about what you

1       learned from these people to see if they're still  
2       practicing heterosexuals, because if they are and we  
3       perform this surgery, then we will have worsened  
4       their situation. And we, as medical practitioners,  
5       don't want to do that.

6               Seemed like a reasonable thing to do. So I did  
7       my dissertation. I was completely honest about my  
8       methodology, my contact with Dr. Laub. And one of  
9       my major professors took exception to that, a  
10      gentleman I had, and he's deceased now and I have  
11      the greatest respect for him, a psychiatrist named  
12      Dr. Bernard Diamond. He was very upset. He said,  
13      Mr. Kirkham, you are -- by working with the Stanford  
14      Medical Center, you are -- and not telling the  
15      research subjects what you're doing, that you're  
16      going to be giving this information to them, you are  
17      limiting their chances to have the surgery.

18             I said, Doctor, with all due respect, I am  
19      doing that, but these are medical practitioners at  
20      one of the finest medical centers in the country  
21      trying to help these people and they're trying not  
22      to harm them in any way, and I believe that what I'm  
23      doing helps them. And I've been completely honest  
24      with you about that.

25             He was upset about that. He never filed a

1 university ethics complaint on it, but he did  
2 require me to write a section in my dissertation  
3 indicating that it was not my intention to, in any  
4 way, damage these people's lives, which it certainly  
5 wasn't. And that's sort of the long and short of  
6 it.

7 **Q** And you said something about you used honest  
8 methodology or ethical methodology?

9 **A** I was completely honest about my methodology.  
10 I didn't try to conceal any of it. So I wrote up  
11 what I had done.

12 **Q** And when you write in here that they brought to  
13 your attention and for inducing on your part an  
14 awareness --

15 **A** Sir, could you speak up just a little? I'm  
16 having trouble --

17 **Q** I'd be glad to.

18 When they put in here, and you wrote this in  
19 here, an acknowledgment, you acknowledge the doctors  
20 and the review committee reviewing this, for  
21 inducing on your part awareness of the significant  
22 ethical flaw in the research project, a significant  
23 ethical flaw in your research project. You put that  
24 in there?

25 **A** I was required by Dr. Diamond as a condition of

1 finishing my degree to do that. He resigned from  
2 the committee and was replaced by Dr. Chrisberg  
3 {phonetic}. None of the other committee members,  
4 none of the other four scholars had any problem with  
5 that. Dr. Diamond was the only one. So, you know,  
6 that's what it was.

7 **Q** So Dr. Diamond had it in for you?

8 **A** I'm sorry?

9 **Q** Dr. Diamond had it in for you?

10 **A** No, no. He was a very honorable gentleman who  
11 just disagreed with what I was doing, and he  
12 disagreed with the actions of the Stanford Gender  
13 Identity Clinic made up of eminent psychiatrists and  
14 surgeons.

15 **Q** And you said because of this criticism, it has  
16 led you to conclude that your research project was  
17 characterized by the ethical and methodological --

18 **A** Methodological.

19 **Q** -- just discussed, ethical flaw?

20 **A** Yes. Dr. Diamond required that -- required me  
21 to put that in the dissertation, and I resented  
22 having to put it in. I did put it in, because I  
23 was, you know, in order to receive my degree.

24 But I think the situation speaks for itself. I  
25 was working with eminent medical practitioners

1       trying to help these people in the process of doing  
2       my research, and I don't think there was anything  
3       wrong with what I had done.

4       **Q**     Because you revealed some things about these  
5       people wanting to have sex change operation that  
6       they disagreed with you revealing it?

7       **A**     Well, right. Dr. Diamond believed that I was  
8       limiting their chances of having the surgery by  
9       telling the Stanford Medical Center's people that  
10      they were still having heterosexual relations. But  
11      you think about that for a moment. If they'd gone  
12      ahead without that information, they would have gone  
13      ahead, removed these people's genitalia, and that  
14      could have precipitated, as it has in the past, a  
15      psychotic break, a worsening of their condition,  
16      suicide.

17             So none of the medical specialists I worked  
18      with at that fine medical center, including  
19      Dr. Laub, had any problems with it. I had no  
20      problems with it either, and that's sort of the long  
21      and short of it.

22      **Q**     Said you employed a methodology which involved  
23      the conscious deception of your subjects. Conscious  
24      deception, that means purposely lying, doesn't it?

25      **A**     No. It means purposely withholding information



1 from them as to what I was doing. I didn't feel  
2 that I was required to tell them that I was working  
3 with the Stanford Medical Center personnel in their  
4 best interest.

5 **Q** So you were lying by not telling them  
6 something?

7 **A** You can call it whatever you want. I was  
8 withholding --

9 **Q** Well, you put down here conscious deception.  
10 What does that mean to you, conscious deception? If  
11 you consciously, intentionally deceive somebody,  
12 what does that mean?

13 **A** You're consciously deceiving, you're  
14 withholding information from them. No question  
15 about that. And I did that in the course of  
16 completing my research.

17 **Q** And you wrote in here that it's clear by, in  
18 your actions, that you took upon yourself a right  
19 which no human being has, that of determining the  
20 righteousness or wrongness of another person's  
21 values and goals in life; is that right?

22 **A** Those are specific words that Dr. Diamond wrote  
23 and required that I put in my dissertation and, you  
24 know, it--

25 **Q** Did Dr. Diamond sign this?

1       **A**     Pardon me?

2       **Q**     Did Dr. Diamond --

3       **A**     No. I signed it. I'm not trying to argue with  
4       you. I did what I did.

5       **Q**     Is Dr. Diamond's signature on here?

6       **A**     Dr. Diamond resigned from the committee, was  
7       replaced by Dr. Chrisberg. None of the other four  
8       members of the committee saw any problem. The  
9       University of California at Berkeley takes, as the  
10      number one public university in the nation, takes  
11      ethics issues very seriously. There was never any  
12      basis for even filing an ethical complaint against  
13      what I did.

14             You would have to -- to criticize me, you would  
15      have to criticize Stanford Medical Center, their  
16      gender identity clinic, all those psychiatrists, all  
17      those practitioners, who are well-respected.

18      **Q**     Sir, I'm not criticizing anybody. I'm just  
19      bringing out your ethical problems here, and I'm  
20      sorry that you feel like I'm --

21             **MR. GARRETT:** Objection, Your Honor. He's not  
22      asking a question.

23             BY MR. MYERS:

24      **Q**     Well, I'll ask this question: You took it upon  
25      yourself to determine the rightness and the

1 wrongness of other people's values and goals in  
2 life?

3 **A** I did not feel that I was doing that. I've  
4 never felt that. I --

5 **Q** So when you wrote -- oh, I'm sorry.

6 **A** I was required by the chairman of my  
7 dissertation committee, Dr. Bernard Diamond, eminent  
8 psychoanalyst and a great man, to write that  
9 apologia. I resented it then. I was, you know, I  
10 was in Tallahassee, had a university post already,  
11 my dean is asking me, When are you going to get your  
12 doctorate? And I said, We're trying to work out  
13 this wrinkle right now, Dean, you know.

14 So my future was very much hanging in the  
15 balance, and I had no choice but to do what I did.

16 **Q** So you put this in here and you disagreed with  
17 it and you thought this was wrong?

18 **A** It was either that or resign from the  
19 university and not complete my doctorate degree. I  
20 felt there was nothing ethically -- as I say, what I  
21 did was identical to what the university committee  
22 people were doing. And we were all working in the  
23 best interest of these patients, and I didn't feel  
24 there was anything wrong with it and never have felt  
25 it.

1       **Q**     So you put this in here just to get your  
2       doctor's degree in criminology? You put this in  
3       here just to get your doctorate's degree in  
4       criminology?

5       **A**     I had to put that apologia in there, written by  
6       Dr. Diamond, in order to receive my doctorate.

7       **Q**     I don't see Dr. Diamond's signature on this  
8       thing.

9       **A**     Well, you don't, sir, because he resigned from  
10      the committee and was replaced by Dr. Christberg.

11      **Q**     Okay.

12      **A**     And I will reiterate again that no aide, that  
13      no member of my committee had any problem with that,  
14      filed any complaint with the university ethics  
15      committee. There was no investigation by any  
16      university ethics committee, and, you know, it is  
17      really a tempest in a teapot.

18      **Q**     And then you put in here something about, when  
19      confronted, there was a specific denial about you.  
20      That, further, the researcher's specific denial that  
21      anything said might influence a candidate's chances  
22      for obtaining the operation extant was ethically  
23      untenable procedure. That you specifically denied  
24      you did anything wrong. So you lied twice?

25      **A**     I do not regard that as a lie. I regard that

1 as a caveat that I could -- most of which was  
2 prepared by Dr. Diamond. He said, If you want me to  
3 -- if you want my blessing on the dissertation,  
4 you're going to have to issue this apologia. And I  
5 resented it, Dr. Laub resented it, the Stanford  
6 people did as well, but that's the way it went.

7 **Q** Where in here does it say all these people  
8 resented it?

9 **A** I'm telling, there's -- that document does not  
10 contain any commentary from the Stanford University  
11 medical personnel. But I'm telling you that they --  
12 they were the ones that proposed this methodology to  
13 me, and it seems sound and reasonable. We were all  
14 working in the best interest of their patients. If  
15 they did not have the information I gave them, they  
16 could have made some grave mistakes.

17 **Q** Maybe you didn't understand my question. Where  
18 in here does those people say that?

19 **A** That they resented the requirement that I have  
20 to put that caveat in there?

21 **Q** Uh-huh, or whatever --

22 **A** They wouldn't say that in the dissertation.

23 **Q** Well, it says in here about you being  
24 unethical.

25 **A** Sir, you're reading -- I feel like -- I'd be

1 happy to read the exact section that you're talking  
2 about there aloud, if you like. We're talking about  
3 a very small section of a 400-page dissertation.

4 **Q** Dr. Diamond had it in for you?

5 **A** No, he didn't. He was a very fine man. He  
6 helped me immeasurably. I look up to him. I've  
7 always looked up to him. I have the greatest  
8 respect -- he disagreed with the methodology that I  
9 had utilized.

10 **Q** So you did what you had to do to get your  
11 doctor's degree, basically?

12 **A** That's correct. That's correct.

13 **Q** Now, you said something I didn't quite get  
14 yesterday. You said you were somewhere and you were  
15 volunteering as a police officer, but your  
16 colleagues at the university were going to block you  
17 getting tenure at the college if you didn't quit  
18 being a cop.

19 **A** That was basically the reason why 60 Minutes  
20 sent Dan Rather and a crew down to do a segment  
21 called Ivory Tower Cop. The situation was that my  
22 colleagues were senior faculty. I was a junior  
23 professor --

24 **Q** What senior faculty? From which college now?

25 **MR. GARRETT:** Your Honor, allow him to finish

1 his answer.

2 **THE COURT:** Go ahead. Overruled. Go ahead.

3 BY MR. MYERS:

4 **Q** Which -- did we shift it from California to  
5 somewhere else now?

6 **A** We're at Florida State University.

7 **Q** Florida State. Okay.

8 I'm sorry. Go ahead.

9 **A** Home of the national champions, soon-to-be,  
10 Seminoles.

11 So while I was a junior professor there, I was  
12 up for tenure. I had embarked on this experiment on  
13 my own. I was unable to get a research grant to do  
14 it. With the help of my dean and the help of  
15 Sheriff Carson -- I talked to you yesterday about  
16 how I worked as a police officer for six months,  
17 high-crime beat -- I came back to FSU and joined the  
18 Tallahassee Police Department and continued working  
19 as a police officer in Tallahassee on a part-time  
20 basis.

21 And as part of doing that, I would come to the  
22 university in uniform, teach classes, and talk to  
23 the students about what police actually do. And I  
24 was trying to get across the idea of how am I  
25 different in uniform today than I was yesterday in a

1 suit and a tie. What's different about me? And I  
2 would bring in training videos that I developed with  
3 police and for police.

4 All of these things, senior faculty, full  
5 professors, did not approve of, and a number of  
6 those faculty sought to block my tenure. I was  
7 otherwise very well-qualified. I had the  
8 second-highest student instructional rating  
9 evaluations on the faculty of about 18 at the time.  
10 But they undertook to block my tenure. That's what  
11 60 Minutes came down to do a segment.

12 And if you look at that segment, you'll see  
13 Mr. Rather moderating an interview between myself  
14 and Dr. Ted Chiricos, who is one of my major  
15 detractors in which they are expressing -- he's  
16 expressing his disapproval, basically, of what I was  
17 doing.

18 My dean said, Look, if you resign from the  
19 police department, this thing will go away. I said,  
20 I'm proud to be a police officer. It's important to  
21 my work, my research. I'm not going to do that,  
22 even if I don't get tenure. That's what happened.

23 **Q** Who is this professor that was blocking your  
24 tenure?

25 **A** There were a number of senior faculty. I never



1       knew who all of them were. That is a private --  
2       it's a confidential proceeding, and a lot of it was  
3       done, you know, behind the scenes. So I never  
4       really knew.

5               I knew Chiricos was opposed to it, a number of  
6       others were. There was enough to cause me a  
7       potential blockage of my tenure.

8       **Q**     So in that Florida State, there are people on  
9       the faculty and they're trying to take action  
10      against you to block tenure?

11      **A**     Not all of my colleagues, but a significant  
12      number -- a significant-enough number of senior  
13      faculty because I was a police officer, but it was  
14      all about -- they said it was unseemly for a faculty  
15      member to be going, you know, going out in a police  
16      uniform, working the streets and, moreover, coming  
17      on campus. That really upset them when they see a  
18      patrol car and a uniform on campus.

19      **Q**     You were working as a police officer, right?

20      **A**     Fully sworn, uncompensated at my own election.

21      **Q**     What?

22      **A**     I was uncompensated. I was not paid. I was  
23      fully sworn, had all the arrest powers, worked by  
24      myself, made arrests.

25      **Q**     You just volunteered to help your research?

1       **A**     Well, I was trying to. That was my laboratory.  
2       I discovered -- in Jacksonville, I found that by  
3       getting out with the men and women who were police  
4       officers, at their suggestion originally, as you  
5       know, I could learn more about their problems,  
6       issues, develop all the training tapes, all the  
7       training material I developed over the years as a  
8       direct result of that ongoing experiment. I wanted  
9       to continue it and I did continue it for 18 years.

10      **Q**     And the streets were your laboratory?

11      **A**     They were my laboratory.

12      **Q**     And you never were paid?

13      **A**     I'm sorry?

14      **Q**     You never were paid?

15      **A**     At my own election, I was the only part-time  
16      officer in the City of Tallahassee Police Department  
17      who was not paid. No, I was not paid.

18      **Q**     But you said something about getting federal  
19      grants to be a police officer?

20      **A**     I had a federal grant from the U.S. Department  
21      of Justice to take a summer and work as an  
22      undercover officer in a organized -- federal  
23      organized crime strike force in Fort Lauderdale.

24      **Q**     So you got federal grants to take your  
25      laboratory on the streets?

1       **A**     I got a federal grant for the summer to pay my  
2       university salary so that I could go down to Fort  
3       Lauderdale and work as a plainclothes undercover  
4       officer in organized crime strike force.

5             I was trying to get different experience.  
6       Mostly, it was uniform patrol. I had some detective  
7       experience, I had some vice narcotics, and then I  
8       had undercover organized crime experience. I was  
9       trying to see as many different kinds of aspects of  
10      the police role as I could.

11      **Q**     Haven't you written or stated that when people  
12      go to academies and then get back out on the  
13      streets, that they should disregard 75 percent or  
14      more of what they learned at the academy and really  
15      learn the reality of life on the streets?

16      **A**     No. I've said that it's important to know --  
17      to temper what you've learned with the reality of  
18      life on the streets. The classroom instruction  
19      would be of no use if you couldn't relate it to the  
20      field. But the idea of disregarding what you  
21      learned at the academy is not correct.

22      **Q**     Didn't you say in a book you wrote that they  
23      teach you at the academies about who, what, when,  
24      and where, but they don't really teach you the how  
25      of law enforcement?

1       **A**     That's true. The how -- you have to -- you  
2       have to take the information you get in the academy  
3       and apply it on the street.

4       **Q**     Didn't you pretty much say that this is best  
5       relegated to the police training academy and,  
6       ultimately, to the street where experience is the  
7       best and, indeed, often the only teacher? The  
8       street's the teacher?

9       **A**     The street is the teacher, but always with the  
10      backdrop of the training that you received. You  
11      wouldn't know how to do -- how to handle calls if  
12      you hadn't had the instruction and what to do, what  
13      is -- what about covering contact? When do you use  
14      concealment? What's a safe position? How do you do  
15      a felony car stop? You have to have been instructed  
16      in that before you actually do it.

17      **Q**     Well, didn't you say this: The police  
18      organization, from its academy training instructors  
19      and field supervisors, to the upper levels of its  
20      command hierarchy is committed to articulating such  
21      myths as full and equal enforcement of the law in  
22      all situations and rigid adhering to formal  
23      departmental regulations despite the fact that these  
24      things bear little resemblance to the actual  
25      realities of police work on the street?

1       **A**     I don't know which article you're reading from.

2       **Q**     Well, I'm taking it from the introduction of  
3       law enforcement, which you wrote.

4       **A**     Okay. I wrote that back in the 70s.

5       **Q**     In the 70s?

6       **A**     Right. Very inexperienced at the time.

7               But it is true that everything you learn in the  
8       academy has to be tempered with experience on the  
9       street. It doesn't mean, though -- and I've never  
10      said that you should disregard the training that you  
11      get. It's vitally important, and it's getting  
12      better all the time.

13      **Q**     And in the same book, didn't you say numerous  
14      times: Officers, once they leave the training  
15      academy, have to ignore 75 percent of what they  
16      learned there because they find it conflicts with  
17      reality as it is out on the streets?

18      **A**     I wrote those words back in probably 1974, '75,  
19      when I'd had two years' experience in law  
20      enforcement.

21              As I went on during the 18 years that I  
22      remained in law enforcement, I began to appreciate  
23      more and more the importance of the things that I  
24      had been taught in the academy and that I was taught  
25      each year in in-service training and the relevance

1 of those things to the job that I was doing.

2 **Q** And then you further say: Officers are faced  
3 with situations where who knows the year, the month,  
4 the weeks people sit down and dissect every single  
5 move the officers make to see if everything was done  
6 perfectly according to the book. That happens,  
7 doesn't it?

8 **A** Well, that happens with the ivory tower. That  
9 was my criticism of other professors who don't get  
10 out on the streets and see what's going on, and  
11 people who sit back and Monday morning quarterback  
12 what police -- well, you could have done this, you  
13 should have done this.

14 But we're talking here about things that should  
15 have been very, very obvious, almost in accord with  
16 common sense. If you start from the position that  
17 officers should not put themselves and other people  
18 unnecessarily in danger, then certain things make  
19 sense in terms of the things you're trained to do.

20 **Q** And, of course, you're not in the ivory tower  
21 now looking back and judging what police officers  
22 do, are you?

23 **A** I'm no longer a university professor. And we,  
24 in this process here, this is one of the few  
25 countries in the world where people are not afraid

1 of the police, and one of the reasons for that is  
2 that we have checks and balances. We critique. We  
3 look at -- we have to look at what officers do in  
4 its correctness or propriety, and that's a special  
5 thing. That's why our citizens are not afraid of  
6 our police because they are -- they go through  
7 checks and balances, they're constantly critiquing  
8 themselves, and they're changing and evolving.

9 **Q** And you've also written: It seems so wrong to  
10 me, so consummately unjust, that we, who so often  
11 find ourselves forced to make the gravest of human  
12 decisions in a matter of seconds, should then be  
13 judged by outsiders, people who enjoy the luxury of  
14 quantities of time in which to dissect and examine a  
15 policeman's every action retrospectively after the  
16 fact. Didn't you write that?

17 **A** Yes. You're quoting from an article I was  
18 invited by the FBI to write for their law  
19 enforcement bulletin --

20 **Q** What article was that?

21 **A** Huh?

22 **Q** What article was that?

23 **A** I'm sorry?

24 **Q** What article was that?

25 **A** It was called, A Professor's Street Lessons.

1       **Q**     No, I'm quoting from Signal Zero, the book you  
2       wrote.

3       **A**     Okay. That is from Signal Zero, but I said  
4       much the same thing in the FBI article, and I  
5       believe that. And that was the gospel I was  
6       preaching to my colleagues at the university, that  
7       you need to get out and see the things that these  
8       officers -- at least ride around some and see the  
9       things these officers are subjected to to better  
10      understand it, rather than sitting in the classroom  
11      criticizing it.

12      **Q**     And when you volunteered down in Jacksonville,  
13      you were riding with other officers out on the  
14      streets; is that right?

15      **A**     In the highest crime beat of the city on the  
16      evening watch.

17      **Q**     And out on the streets, you were going by the  
18      book?

19      **A**     We went by the book a substantial amount of the  
20      time. There were things in that particular beat --  
21      it was an extremely violent beat. Three of my  
22      partners, a few years after I left, were shot. And  
23      there were things that we did that were not always  
24      by the book.

25      **Q**     So you didn't go by the book?



1           **A**     Not always, no.

2           **Q**     Not always.

3                   As a matter of fact, out on the streets, after  
4                   four months of you volunteering, you had burnout and  
5                   asked to be transferred, didn't you?

6           **A**     No.  No, I had -- I had been contacted by vice.  
7                   They requested -- they asked for some -- they were  
8                   having a problem -- a sex vice problem and put me  
9                   over there for about two weeks, and then I went back  
10                  to patrol again.

11          **Q**     Haven't you made this statement in court:  Yes,  
12                   I was reaching a point of burnout and being  
13                   overwhelmed.  Having come from academia into the  
14                   core of the city area, I considered a short transfer  
15                   to vice because of burnout?

16          **A**     That's what I just said.

17          **Q**     Now, let's get on to something else.  You give  
18                   the officers the benefit of the doubt; is that  
19                   right?

20          **A**     I try to, yes.

21          **Q**     And you said that this case fits in the profile  
22                   of friendly fire.  I wrote that down.  You said,  
23                   friendly --

24          **A**     Yeah, it's a military expression, but I used  
25                   the term friendly fire because that's essentially

1           what this kind of case boils down to.

2           **Q**     And you were giving Bobby Rushton the benefit  
3           of the doubt when you said he was shot by a friend?

4           **A**     No. I'm saying that he was shot by a  
5           homeowner, I believe, who mistook him for a burglar.

6           **Q**     Mistook him for a burglar? I hadn't heard that  
7           in here in the courtroom. I hadn't heard that.

8           **A**     Mistook him for an intruder, someone on his  
9           property who was there to do him harm.

10          **Q**     Intruder? Who intruded into his house?

11          **A**     No one went into his house, but he is  
12          frightened. He hears a doorbell ringing --

13          **Q**     Yes, sir.

14          **A**     -- and he encounters a man in plain clothes  
15          with a gun in his yard who points a gun at him. The  
16          person intends to cause him harm --

17          **Q**     How do you know he pointed a gun at him?

18          **A**     I'm sorry?

19          **Q**     How do you know that Bobby pointed a gun at  
20          him?

21          **A**     My recollection is, ballistically, that Glock  
22          23 shows a bullet strike. The weapon was -- had to  
23          have been pointed to sustain the damage.

24          **Q**     Have you heard anybody in this courtroom say  
25          Bobby pointed his gun at him?

1       **A**     My recollection from the aggregate of the  
2       record is that the Glock model 23, 40 caliber, had  
3       to have been pointed at the time the .30-06 round  
4       was fired.

5       **Q**     Show me that. Show me that.

6       **A**     It struck the --

7       **Q**     Show me that where it says that. I haven't  
8       seen that. Show me where it says that.

9       **A**     I'm happy to go through the entire court record  
10      if you like.

11      **Q**     I don't care what you have to do. Show me what  
12      you're relying on, him pointing the gun at Joe  
13      Worley.

14      **A**     I am taking it as a hypothetical based on the  
15      voluminous record that I have been through that  
16      there came a point in time outside when the light  
17      was allegedly on where Mr. Worley -- it's a  
18      hypothetical -- looks down and sees a gun pointed at  
19      him, and he fires, and the gun is blown apart,  
20      damaged by the .30-06 round.

21      **Q**     Did Bobby testify to that? Did he testify he  
22      pointed a gun?

23      **A**     He did not testify.

24      **Q**     So you're not giving him the benefit of the  
25      doubt. You're giving Joe Worley the benefit of the

1 doubt.

2 **A** I'm taking that as a hypothetical.

3 **Q** A hypothetical.

4 You're giving a hypothetical benefit to  
5 Mr. Worley and not to the police officer?

6 **A** I'll entertain any hypothetical, sir, that  
7 you --

8 **Q** I don't deal in hypotheticals. I deal in  
9 facts.

10 Who testified that Bobby pointed his gun at Joe  
11 Worley?

12 **A** I have seen in the record -- the case record  
13 that -- that evidence is clear from the damage that  
14 was done to the weapon. The firearm had to have  
15 been pointed in the direction of Mr. Worley in order  
16 to have sustained the damage from the .30-06.

17 **Q** Would you like to see that SLED agent's report  
18 and show me in there where it says that?

19 **A** I'm just telling you what I concluded from  
20 the -- are you suggesting that the gun was not  
21 pointed?

22 **Q** I'm not suggesting anything. I'm just asking  
23 why are you saying it was pointed by Bobby at Joe  
24 Worley?

25 **A** My recollection is that the Glock was struck

1 and blown apart, essentially, or severely damaged  
2 by --

3 **Q** It blew Bobby's hand apart.

4 **A** I'm sorry?

5 **Q** It blew Bobby's hand apart.

6 **A** By definition, the Glock was in his hand. The  
7 Glock was damage; his hand was tragically damaged as  
8 well.

9 **Q** So you want to talk about the gun being damaged  
10 and not Bobby's hand?

11 **A** No. I think it's tragic that the officer's  
12 hand was damaged.

13 **Q** And then you said that, in this case, there was  
14 all kind of violations of American standards and  
15 procedures. And then --

16 **A** Police standards and procedures.

17 **Q** Yeah, police.

18 And then you said something that caught my  
19 attention, and you said: Not only that, George  
20 Reid, the Sheriff of McCormick County for 27 years,  
21 who Mr. Garrett says knows McCormick County, he  
22 violated all the procedures by walking down and  
23 confronting Mr. Worley and his mother.

24 **A** Right. Right. I did say that.

25 **Q** The sheriff?

1       **A**     Yeah. You know why I said that?

2       **Q**     Yeah.

3       **A**     Suppose, suppose he's got -- well, he knows  
4       he's got a deputy shot out there. He knows that.  
5       It's dark, and he doesn't know if the person that  
6       did that is a crazed crystal meth addict, is a  
7       deranged mental patient, and he violates every basic  
8       procedure by walking out there in the dark,  
9       abandoning cover, you know, every basic kind of  
10      thing you're taught.

11             Suppose that guy -- suppose, instead of Mr. Joe  
12      Worley and his cat in that place and his mother,  
13      suppose this had been a crack head with an AK-47 or  
14      an AR-15 30-round magazine, you'd have three dead  
15      officers out there. That's why they have these  
16      standards.

17      **Q**     Suppose it was a terrorist in this house with a  
18      bazooka and he blew his car up before he got out  
19      while we're supposing.

20      **A**     That's fanciful, Counselor. That's a highly  
21      absurd conjecture. It's not absurd at all because  
22      I've seen it happen.

23      **Q**     A bazooka?

24      **A**     Sir, that's absurd to suggest that somebody had  
25      a bazooka there.

1           **Q**     It's not absurd.

2           **A**     But there are people who lure police officers  
3           to ambush them and kill them in situations similar,  
4           that's why you want to be careful.

5                   What's the downside -- what's the downside to  
6           using caution, the kind of things I suggested: A  
7           simple phone call using the car's PA system and so  
8           on, what's the downside to that? Forming a plan,  
9           getting information. Instead of rushing in in a  
10          matter of -- what was he over there at -- for 45  
11          seconds, a minute, talking to the Sheffields?

12          **Q**     I'm talking about Sheriff Reid.

13          **A**     Yeah. Well, Sheriff Reid is the -- he's the  
14          chief law enforcement officer.

15          **Q**     Yes, he is.

16          **A**     What in the world is he doing walking down a  
17          darkened road when he's just had a deputy shot,  
18          exposing himself? Is that the way they do things --  
19          is that the way people would want them to do things  
20          in McCormick County?

21          **Q**     Obviously for 27 years it is.

22          **A**     Well, it's dangerous as hell.

23          **Q**     Is he dead?

24          **A**     Luckily.

25          **Q**     Did he arrest the man who shot his deputy?

1       **A**     He arrested the gentleman that shot his deputy,  
2       yes.

3             And fortunately -- but I'm saying he could have  
4       had a very different outcome here, and that's why --  
5       that's why police are trained not to do this kind of  
6       thing.

7       **Q**     And he violated all the procedures when he  
8       confronted Joe Worley, and Joe Worley said, I put  
9       your deputy's in his patrol car {sic}? He was  
10      violating rules then, standards and procedures?

11      **A**     As far as the issue of the gun being put in the  
12      car, that has no relevance to this directly. What  
13      I'm talking about is a sheriff walking down a dark  
14      road, confronting a couple people with flashlights,  
15      and telling one of them, Don't shine the light in my  
16      eyes.

17             He exposes himself to being -- having a  
18      flashlight put on him, out in the open, totally  
19      uncovered. I mean, that's a reckless thing to do,  
20      and it violates every basic precept that police are  
21      trained to follow.

22      **Q**     And when the sheriff said, You shot my deputy,  
23      and Joe Worley said, The deputy didn't have any  
24      business ringing my damn doorbell, the sheriff was  
25      still violating American standards and procedures in



1 law enforcement?

2 **A** No. No. I mean, those are things that are for  
3 the jury to assess as far as what was said, what  
4 wasn't said. Was the person upset? Why did he say  
5 what he said? That's not for me.

6 **Q** And you're here to give the officers the  
7 benefit of the doubt and not Joe Worley?

8 **A** Sir, I've always tried to be fair and  
9 objective. I'm not an advocate.

10 **Q** Let me ask you if you agree with this: I love  
11 Andy Griffith?

12 **A** Yeah, I like Andy Griffith, too.

13 **Q** And they were getting on him one time for not  
14 following the book, and Andy said, You know, he  
15 said, In a small town, it's a whole lot better if  
16 you go less by the book and more by the heart. Do  
17 you agree with that?

18 **A** More by the what?

19 **Q** Go less by the book and more by the heart. Do  
20 you agree with that?

21 **A** I'm sorry. What was the last word? More by  
22 the --

23 **Q** I'm sorry. Andy Griffith said, In a small  
24 town, it's a whole lot better if you go less by the  
25 book and more by the heart. Do you agree with that?

1       **A**     You know, it's a sweet sentiment. I don't know  
2       what he means, but I sure hope that professionals in  
3       aviation, in law enforcement, in medicine don't  
4       throw out the book when they're doing their jobs.

5             Those books are written for a reason. You  
6       can't use them all the time. Sometimes there are  
7       times when your heart, your emotions come into play.  
8       But the procedures, these are basic procedures that  
9       keep police safe and keep the homeowners safe.  
10      These tragedies that occur, I've seen many of them  
11      during the course of my career of innocent people,  
12      officers shooting officers, officers shooting  
13      homeowners, homeowners shooting officers, things  
14      like this -- this could have been avoided so  
15      readily.

16      **Q**     And Bobby's hand is blown to bits now because  
17      he, Nick, Melissa, and Sheriff George Reid didn't go  
18      by the book. That's what you're saying?

19      **A**     That tragedy occurred because they failed to  
20      follow the most basic police procedures that relate  
21      to officer safety. And I'm sorry for that. I'm  
22      sorry for what happened to Mr. Worley, but this  
23      whole tragedy, we shouldn't even be sitting here  
24      having this conversation. If procedures -- basic  
25      safety procedures had been followed, this wouldn't

1 have happened.

2 **Q** You say you were sorry for what happened to  
3 Mr. Worley? That's what you just said?

4 **A** Yeah, he suffered. This gentleman has  
5 suffered, yes.

6 **MR. MYERS:** Thank you, sir. I have nothing  
7 further.

8 **THE COURT:** Madame Forelady, ladies and  
9 gentlemen of the jury, we've been going about an  
10 hour and a half. Let's take about a ten-minute  
11 break, and then we'll start back again.

12 (The jury retires to the jury room.)

13 **THE COURT:** Doctor, don't talk to anyone.

14 **THE WITNESS:** No, sir, I won't.

15 (Brief recess.)

16 **THE COURT:** All right. Mr. Garrett, are you  
17 ready to proceed?

18 **MR. GARRETT:** I am, Your Honor.

19 **THE COURT:** Mr. Myers?

20 **MR. MYERS:** Yes, sir.

21 **THE COURT:** Would you bring the jury in,  
22 please?

23 (The jury returns to the courtroom.)

24 **THE COURT:** Mr. Garrett, redirect?

25 **MR. GARRETT:** Please the Court.

1 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MR. GARRETT:

3 Q Dr. Kirkham, could I have you step down in  
4 front of the jury, please?

5 A (Witness leaves the witness stand.)

6 Q I'd like for you to go through this magazine,  
7 if you would, and tell us what this picture is right  
8 here. What's this picture about?

9 A This is a picture of an officer demonstrating a  
10 piece of equipment beside a patrol car.

11 Q All right. And is he in uniform?

12 A Yes, he's wearing a uniform.

13 Q Is that the kind of uniform you were talking  
14 about?

15 A Yes. Most police in the United States today  
16 wear conventional police uniform. You can drive  
17 through most any city, and this is -- even though we  
18 have these other uniforms, most police wear a  
19 conventional uniform. You see patches and so on.

20 And the model you saw in here is just a model.  
21 I mean, the person would have to have other insignia  
22 on there to demonstrate that they're police. I  
23 can't just walk up to you in a pair of fatigues and  
24 a green shirt and say I'm the police.

25 Q And when you were testifying the other day

1       about lapels there, but is that an example of what  
2       you were testifying --

3       **A**     Yeah. A lot of police agencies -- some don't  
4       have it, but a lot of them have lapel insignias that  
5       will say, you know, JP, Jacksonville Police, or in  
6       this particular case, it's denoting your position of  
7       either chief or deputy chief. And you see a metal  
8       badge.

9             But my point was that even with those things,  
10       you -- training-wise, you do not go walking around a  
11       house at four o'clock in the morning in the woods.  
12       It's a dangerous, dangerous thing to do. It's not  
13       necessary. You get the suspect to come to you.

14            Here's another example.

15       **Q**     Another example of a --

16       **A**     Yeah, yeah.

17            I'm sure if you get pulled over by your state  
18       police here, in most places, it's pretty much what  
19       you're going to see: Shoulder patches -- shoulder  
20       patches, badge, nameplate, things that -- here in  
21       this case shows insignia of police.

22            So there are a lot of different, you know,  
23       we've got 40,000 municipal police agencies in this  
24       country, and they all have different uniforms,  
25       different colors. But the idea is that you're

1       supposed to give clear notice of your purpose and  
2       presence. When people look at you, they've got to  
3       know this is a police officer or a deputy sheriff.

4       **Q**     Can you describe what this is about? I know  
5       it's an article, but can you describe the way the  
6       officer is standing? Is that a proper stance?

7       **A**     Yeah. This is an officer. He's apparently  
8       demonstrating what looks like it might be a Glock  
9       sidearm with a light supplement, tactical light on  
10      the bottom of it. Yeah, these are the -- this is  
11      one of the covered positions that you maintain, like  
12      on a felony car stop or high-risk situations I was  
13      talking about earlier.

14             When you confront or try to get somebody to  
15      come out, you're behind a curtain of light at night,  
16      and you've got your high beams on, you've got your  
17      spot on, you've got your overhead lights on to make  
18      it very clear to them that you're police. And  
19      you're going to be in a protective position behind  
20      the break of the door and the engine block, which  
21      gives you some mass there. You're not going to be  
22      out walking around -- the basic principle we call  
23      cover and contact.

24             There's another uniform there.

25      **Q**     Okay. Can you describe why these people would

1 have sheriff's on them?

2 **A** Yeah. Well, this is, apparently, a tactical  
3 entry kind of team. They've got helmets. They've  
4 got heavy flak vests on. They've got other  
5 insignia. But, you know, this is a different mode  
6 of operation. When you're talking about -- even  
7 with SWAT teams, on television, they go in  
8 immediately. In fact, it's the last thing that  
9 happens.

10 The sequence is: Talk them out, force them  
11 out, gas, CS, so -- type of stuff. Then taking them  
12 out is always the last thing you do. You don't  
13 expose yourself. This is dangerous stuff if you're  
14 making an entry. Sometimes they've got to make  
15 entries.

16 **Q** Is that similar to a vest we saw in here the  
17 other day?

18 **A** Yeah, yeah. This is, you know, again, the  
19 purpose here being twofold: To save police and also  
20 to protect the officer with a ballistic vest.

21 **Q** All right. So this magazine, it appears to be  
22 -- well, I think it belongs to Mr. Willis.

23 So in addition to that one uniform, this shows  
24 a tremendous number of other uniforms?

25 **A** Right. And, you know, like I said earlier, in

1 South Florida where I live, a lot of officers,  
2 because of the heat and everything, we wore shorts,  
3 short-sleeve shirts, ride bicycles some of the time  
4 and all that. But the idea -- daytime is one thing.  
5 It's easier to tell that they're police.

6 But night, you know, night, around people's  
7 residences where it's dark -- in this case, I mean,  
8 you're talking about an extremely dangerous  
9 situation in terms of --

10 **COURT REPORTER:** I'm sorry? I didn't hear the  
11 last part.

12 **THE WITNESS:** A very dangerous situation in  
13 terms of innocent people shooting at each other.

14 (Witness resumes the witness stand.)

15 BY MR. GARRETT:

16 **Q** And that was State's Exhibit 33 you were  
17 referring to?

18 **A** Yes. It shows a good spread of diverse  
19 uniforms. I wasn't trying to create the impression  
20 that the plainclothes uniform was -- it may be very  
21 popular, it's very comfortable, but that still is --  
22 you'll find a lot more conventional uniforms than  
23 you will those.

24 **Q** This is Exhibit 7. This is awful dirty, so be  
25 careful with it, but can you examine it and just