

RECEIVED

Mar 18 2026

SC Court of Appeals

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA

In the Court of Appeals

APPEAL FROM CHARLESTON COUNTY
Court of Common Pleas

Mikell R. Scarborough, Master-in-Equity

Case No.: 2018-CP-10-4083
Appellate Case No.: 2022-001114

Charleston CW, LLC.,

Appellant,

v.

Charleston Animal Society, Ellen Harley and
Charleston Carriage Horse Advocates, LLC,

Respondents.

RETURN TO MOTION FOR COSTS

March 18, 2026

/s/Thomas R. Goldstein

Thomas R. Goldstein, S. C. Bar No. 2186
Belk, Cobb, Infinger & Goldstein, P.A.

P. O. Box 71121

N. Charleston, S. C. 29415-1121

(843) 554 4291 (843) 554 5566 (fax)

tgoldstein@cobblaw.net

Attorneys for Appellant)

As authorized by Rules 222((d) and 240(e), *South Carolina Appellate Court Rules*, Appellant submits the following Return to the Respondents' Motion to Tax Costs:

A. Charleston Animal Society's Motion for Costs

The Charleston Animal Society's Motion to Tax Costs is correct, and Appellant will promptly pay it without objection.

B. Charleston Carriage Horse Advocates and Ellen Harley's Motion to Tax Costs

The Respondents' Motion to Tax Costs is overstated. The Respondents are entitled to an attorney's fee of \$2,500.00, but they are not entitled to double it. Rule 222 says in applicable part: "The return may oppose the request for costs **or seek a reduction of the amount of costs to be awarded.**" (emphasis added) The Respondents are entitled to a single award of costs as the prevailing party but not two separate awards. As Respondents' certificate attached to their appellate brief demonstrates, the two parties were amalgamated, submitting a single brief. (Respondent's Certificate of Compliance attached as Exhibit 1) Therefore, the application for costs is improperly doubled, and Appellant respectfully requests that the Court award the statutory costs of \$2,500.00 for attorney's fees for the preparation and submission of a single brief.

C. Conclusion

The Charleston Animal Society is entitled to an award of $\$2,500.00 + \$14.75 = \$2,514.75$ as requested. The Charleston Carriage Horse Advocates and Harley are entitled to an award of \$2,500.00.

Respectfully submitted

March 18, 2026

/s/Thomas R. Goldstein
Thomas R. Goldstein, S. C. Bar No. 2186
Belk, Cobb, Infinger & Goldstein, P.A.
P. O. Box 71121
N. Charleston, S. C. 29415-1121
(843) 554 4291 (843) 554 5566 (fax)
tgoldstein@cobblaw.net
Attorneys for Appellant

EXHIBIT 1

RESPONDENTS' CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

RECEIVED

Aug 21 2023

SC Court of Appeals

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA

In the Court of Appeals

APPEAL FROM CHARLESTON COUNTY
Court of Common Pleas

Mikell R. Scarborough, Master-in-Equity

Appellate Case No. 2022-001114
(Case No. 2018-CP-10-4083)

Charleston Carriage Works, LLC,Appellant,

v.

Charleston Animal Society, Ellen Harley, and
Charleston Carriage Horse Advocates, LLCRespondents.

Rule 211(b) Certificate

I hereby certify that the final brief of Charleston Carriage Horse Advocates, LLC and Ellen Harley complies with Rule 211(b), SCACR.

August 17, 2023

s/Jenkins Mann
Jenkins M. Mann (9986)
ROGERS LEWIS JACKSON & MANN LLC
1901 Main Street, Suite 1200
Columbia, SC 29201
Tel: 803-978-2832
803-256-1268
kmaroney@rogerslewis.com
jmann@rogerslewis.com
Attorneys for Respondents

RECEIVED

Mar 18 2026

SC Court of Appeals

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA

In the Court of Appeals

APPEAL FROM CHARLESTON COUNTY

Court of Common Pleas

Mikell R. Scarborough, Master-in-Equity

Case No.: 2018-CP-10-4083

Appellate Case No.: 2022-001114

Charleston CW, LLC,

Appellant,

v.

Charleston Animal Society, Ellen Harley and
Charleston Carriage Horse Advocates, Inc.,

Respondents.

PROOF OF SERVICE

I certify that I provided a copy of the Appellant's Return to the Respondents' Motion to Tax Costs upon the Charleston Animal Society by depositing a copy of it in the United States Mail, postage prepaid to Elizabeth Palmer at her office at Saxton & Stump, 151 Meeting Street, Suite 400, Charleston, South Carolina 29401 and to Jenkins Mann and Kevin Maroney at their office, Mann, Blake & Jackson at 1901 Main Street, Suite 1205, Columbia, South Carolina 29201 on March 18, 2026, and via electronic versions to all counsel and to Joseph Thompson and Spencer Gill at their office, Hall Booth Smith, P.C. at 111 Coleman Boulevard, Mt. Pleasant, S. C. 29464 (digital copies only).

March 18, 2026

/s/Thomas R. Goldstein

Thomas R. Goldstein, S. C. Bar No. 2186

Belk, Cobb, Infinger & Goldstein, P.A.

P. O. Box 71121

N. Charleston, S. C. 29415-1121

(843) 554 4291 (843) 554 5566 (fax)

tgoldstein@cobblaw.net

BELK, COBB, INFINGER & GOLDSTEIN, P.A.
P. O. Box 71121
N. Charleston, S. C. 29415-1121
(843) 729 0928
tgoldstein@cobblaw.net

RECEIVED
Mar 18 2026
SC Court of Appeals

March 18, 2026

Hon. Jenny A. Kitchings
Clerk of Court
S. C. Court of Appeals
P. O. Box 11629
Columbia, S. C. 29211

RE: Tracking No. 2022-001114, Case No. 2018 CP 10 4083
Charleston CW, LLC v. Charleston Animal Society, *et. al.*
Via electronic filing

Dear Ms. Kitchings,

I am e-filing Appellant's Return to the Respondents' Motion to Tax Costs along with a Proof of Service. Please let me now if you require anything further. With kind regards, I am

Very truly yours,

/s/ Thomas R. Goldstein, S. C. Bar No. 2186

Other counsel of record:
Elizabeth J. Palmer
Saxton & Stump
151 Meeting Street
Suite 350
Charleston, South Carolina 29401

Joseph D. Thompson, III
Spencer C. Gill
Hall Booth Smith, P.C.
111 Coleman Boulevard
Suite 301
Mt. Pleasant, S. C. 29464

Jenkins M. Mann
Rogers, Lewis, Jackson, Mann & Quinn, L.L.C.
P. O. Box 11803
Columbia, South Carolina 29211