



# The Supreme Court of South Carolina

JEAN HOEFER TOAL  
CHIEF JUSTICE, RETIRED  
SENIOR ACTIVE JUDGE

1220 SENATE STREET (ZIP CODE 29204)  
P.O. BOX 12456  
COLUMBIA, S.C. 29211  
TELEPHONE (803) 734-1584  
FAX (803) 734-1047  
E-MAIL: jtoal@sccourts.org

June 22, 2026

The Hon. Patricia A. Howard  
Clerk of Court  
South Carolina Supreme Court  
1231 Gervais Street  
Columbia, SC 29201

Re: John A. Tibbs and Margaret B. Tibbs, Plaintiffs, v. 3M Company, *et al.*, Defendants,  
and

Cape PLC, individually and as successor in interest to Cape Asbestos Company Limited, by  
and through its duly appointed Receiver Peter D. Protopapas, Third-Party Plaintiff,  
Respondent, v. Anglo American PLC, individually and as successor in interest to Anglo  
American Corporation of South Africa LTD., *et al.*, Third-Party Defendants,

Of which Mohed Altrad, Altrad Investment Authority SAS, ArranCo US, LLC, Hawk Bidco  
(US) Inc., Sparrows Offshore, LLC, Charter Consolidated Ltd., ESAB Corporation, and  
Central Mining & Investment Corporation Ltd. are the Petitioners.

Appellate Case Nos. 2024-001423, 2024-00001499, 2024-000916, 2024-002114, 2024-002116,  
2024-002117, 2025-000052

Dear Ms. Howard:

The above-captioned matter was remanded to me by the Supreme Court of South Carolina  
on June 26, 2025, with directives by the Supreme Court.

I hereby file my Twelfth Report to the Supreme Court as directed by the Tibbs Remand  
Order as of June 22, 2026.

I will continue to report my progress on this matter to the Court, and welcome any further  
guidance or directives given to me.

With my kindest personal regards,

I am, Sincerely yours,

Jean Hofer Toal

**RECEIVED**

JUN 22 2026

S.C. SUPREME COURT

CC: via email to  
The Hon. Jenny A. Kitchings [jkitchings@sccourts.org](mailto:jkitchings@sccourts.org)  
John Chandler [ichandler@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:ichandler@rplegalgroup.com)  
Peter Protopapas [pdp@rplegalgroup.com](mailto:pdp@rplegalgroup.com)  
Harry Lee [hlee@steptoe.com](mailto:hlee@steptoe.com)  
Todd Carroll [todd.carroll@wbd-us.com](mailto:todd.carroll@wbd-us.com)  
Elizabeth O'Neill [elizabeth.oneill@wbd-us.com](mailto:elizabeth.oneill@wbd-us.com)  
Kevin K. Bell [kbell@robinsongray.com](mailto:kbell@robinsongray.com)  
Wesley B. Sawyer [wsawyer@murphygrantland.com](mailto:wsawyer@murphygrantland.com)  
Theile McVey [tmcvey@kassellaw.com](mailto:tmcvey@kassellaw.com)  
Trey Branham [tbranham@dobslegal.com](mailto:tbranham@dobslegal.com)  
Cameron Berthelsen [cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cberthelsen@richardsonplowden.com)  
James Elliott [jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)  
Scott Balber [scott.balber@hsf.com](mailto:scott.balber@hsf.com)  
Benjamin Rubinstein [Benjamin.Rubinstein@hsf.com](mailto:Benjamin.Rubinstein@hsf.com)  
Maxwell Herman [Maxwell.Herman@hsf.com](mailto:Maxwell.Herman@hsf.com)  
A. Vic Rawl [vrawl@grsm.com](mailto:vrawl@grsm.com)  
John T. Lay [jlay@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:jlay@gwblawfirm.com)  
Jon Robinson [jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:jon@smithrobinsonlaw.com)  
Olesya Bracey [obracey@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:obracey@gwblawfirm.com)  
Shanon Peake [shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com](mailto:shanonp@smithrobinsonlaw.com)  
Paul A. Scudato [paul.scudato@morganlewis.com](mailto:paul.scudato@morganlewis.com)  
Andrew Melling [amelling@burr.com](mailto:amelling@burr.com)  
Elizabeth Kaminski [elizabeth.kaminski@hsfkramer.com](mailto:elizabeth.kaminski@hsfkramer.com)

**RECEIVED**

JUN 22 2026

S.C. SUPREME COURT

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
COUNTY OF RICHLAND

JOHN A. TIBBS and MARGARET B. TIBBS,

Plaintiffs,

v.

3M COMPANY, *et al.*,

Defendants.

and

CAPE PLC, individually and as successor in interest to CAPE ASBESTOS COMPANY LIMITED, by and through its duly appointed Receiver Peter D. Protopapas,

Third-Party Plaintiff,

v.

ANGLO AMERICAN PLC, individually and as successor in interest to ANGLO AMERICAN CORPORATION OF SOUTH AFRICA LTD.; DE BEERS PLC, individually and as successor in interest to DE BEERS S.A.; DE BEERS CENTENARY AG; DE BEERS CONSOLIDATED MINES LTD., n/k/a DE BEERS CONSOLIDATED MINES PROPRIETARY LTD.; DE BEERS UK LTD.; DE BEERS JEWELLERS LTD.; DE BEERS JEWELLERS US, INC.; ANGLO AMERICAN US HOLDINGS INC.; ELEMENT SIX US CORP.; ELEMENT SIX TECHNOLOGIES US CORP.; ELEMENT SIX TECHNOLOGIES (OR) CORP.; FIRST MODE HOLDINGS, INC.; PLATINUM GUILD INTERNATIONAL (U.S.A.) JEWELRY INC.; LIGHTBOX JEWELRY INC.; FOREVERMARK US INC.; ANGLO AMERICAN CROP NUTRIENTS (U.S.A.), LLC; CHARTER CONSOLIDATED LTD.; ESAB CORPORATION; CENTRAL MINING & INVESTMENT CORPORATION LTD.; CAPE HOLDCO LTD.; THE LAW

IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS  
FOR THE FIFTH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT

C.A. No. 2023-CP-40-01759

In Re: Asbestos Personal Injury Litigation  
Coordinated Docket

**TWELFTH REPORT TO THE  
SUPREME COURT OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
PURSUANT TO ITS ORDER OF REMAND  
DATED JUNE 26, 2025**

**RECEIVED**

**JUN 22 2026**

**S.C. SUPREME COURT**

DEBENTURE CORPORATION PLC; CAPE INDUSTRIAL SERVICES GROUP LTD.; MOHED ALTRAD; ALTRAD UK LTD.; CAPE UK HOLDINGS NEWCO LTD.; ALTRAD SERVICES LTD., f/k/a CAPE INDUSTRIAL SERVICES LTD.; ALTRAD INVESTMENT AUTHORITY S.A.S.; SPARROWS OFFSHORE GROUP LTD.; HAWK BIDCO US INC.; ARRANCO US, LLC; SPARROWS OFFSHORE, LLC; THE SPARROWS GROUP, LLC,

Third-Party Defendants.

**RECEIVED**

**JUN 22 2026**

**S.C. SUPREME COURT**

Pursuant to the South Carolina Supreme Court's Order of Remand in this matter, dated June 26, 2025, in which the Court asked that I submit monthly reports as to my progress in addressing the directives from the Court contained in its Remand Order, this will constitute my Twelfth Report.

Since my Eleventh Report to this Court, I have continued to review materials concerning cases on the Asbestos Docket, including matters involving the trial or settlement resolution of cases in which a Receiver has been appointed in the matter. I have also continued to administer the Asbestos Trial Docket, which includes hearing pre-trial matters considering Petitions for the approval of settlements and performing all other administrative duties involving the trial of cases on the Asbestos Docket.

On May 27, 2026, the South Carolina Supreme Court filed its decision in the above-captioned *Tibbs* appeal. The Court's very comprehensive Opinion gives this Court very specific directions as to the management of asbestos receiverships, and I am deeply grateful for the Supreme Court's guidance. The appellants, Charter, ESAB, Central Mining, and Altrad, have filed a very lengthy Motion with the Supreme Court for reconsideration of its rulings and Opinion in *Tibbs*. I will await the Court's action, but in the meantime the *Welch* and *Tibbs* decisions provide excellent guidance for my continued administration of this docket.

I continue to manage the Asbestos Docket, conduct pretrial hearings, and administer the trial blocks as indicated in my previous reports. I am pleased to report that the South Carolina Asbestos Receiverships continue to function productively and are being embraced by many of the insurers involved.

Respectfully submitted,



Chief Justice (Ret.) Jean Hoefler Toal  
Presiding Circuit Court Judge

Dated June 22, 2026,  
Columbia, South Carolina