

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Court of Appeals

APPEAL FROM CHARLESTON COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas

G. Thomas Cooper, Jr., Circuit Court Judge

Appellate Case No.: 2016-001140

**RECEIVED**  
NOV 07 2016  
SC Court of Appeals

PCS Nitrogen, Inc.,

Appellant,

v.

Continental Casualty Company, Admiral Insurance Company, United States Fire Insurance Company, ACE Property & Casualty Insurance Company, Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's London, the Aviva Companies, the Winterthur Companies, Certain London Market Insurance Companies, Providence Washington Insurance Company (as Successor in Interest by way of Merger to Seaton Insurance Company, f/k/a Unigard Security Insurance, f/k/a Unigard Mutual Insurance Company), Berkshire Hathaway Specialty Insurance Company (f/k/a Stonewall Insurance Company), Lexington Insurance Company, Starr Indemnity & Liability Company (f/k/a Republic Insurance Company), First State Insurance Company, Century Indemnity Company (f/k/a California Union Insurance Company and Insurance Company of North America),

Respondents.

---

**PROOF OF SERVICE**

---

At the time of service I was at least 18 years of age and not a party to this legal action. I certify that I have served the Respondents, Continental Casualty Company, Admiral Insurance Company, United States Fire Insurance Company, ACE Property & Casualty Insurance Company, Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's London, the Aviva Companies, the Winterthur Companies, Certain London Market Insurance Companies, Providence Washington Insurance Company (as Successor in Interest by way of Merger to Seaton Insurance Company, f/k/a Unigard Security Insurance, f/k/a Unigard Mutual Insurance Company), Berkshire Hathaway Specialty Insurance Company (f/k/a Stonewall Insurance Company), Lexington Insurance Company, Starr Indemnity & Liability Company (f/k/a Republic Insurance Company), First State Insurance Company, Century Indemnity Company (f/k/a California Union Insurance Company and Insurance Company of North America) Joint Final Brief of Respondents on all counsel of record by depositing a copy of it in the United States Mail, postage prepaid, on **August 26, 2016**. I am readily familiar with this business's practice of collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. On the same that correspondence is placed for collection and mailing, it is deposited in the ordinary course of business with the U.S. Postal Service, in sealed envelope(s), as follows:

Wm. Howell Morrison, Esq.  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, P.A.  
134 Meeting Street, 3rd Floor  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[hmorrison@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:hmorrison@hsblawfirm.com)

-and-

Michael H. Ginsberg, Esq.  
Mathew R. Divelbiss, Esq.  
Jones Day  
500 Grant Street, Suite 4500  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219-2502  
[mhginsberg@jonesday.com](mailto:mhginsberg@jonesday.com)  
**ATTORNEYS FOR APPELLANT**

J.R. Murphy, Esq.  
Adam J. Neil, Esq.  
Wesley B. Sawyer, Esq.  
Murphy & Grantland, PA  
4406 Forest Drive, Suite B  
Columbia, SC 29260  
[jrmurphy@murphygrantland.com](mailto:jrmurphy@murphygrantland.com)  
[aneil@murphygrantland.com](mailto:aneil@murphygrantland.com)

**ATTORNEYS FOR ADMIRAL INSURANCE COMPANY**

Robert H. Hood, Jr., Esq.  
Hood Law Firm, LLC  
172 Meeting Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[bobbyjr.hood@hoodlaw.com](mailto:bobbyjr.hood@hoodlaw.com)

-and-

Robert Walsh, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Thomas M. Going, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Patricia Santelle, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
White and Williams LLP  
1650 Market Street  
One Liberty Place, Suite 1800  
Philadelphia PA 19103-7395  
[walshr@whiteandwilliams.com](mailto:walshr@whiteandwilliams.com)  
[goingt@whiteandwilliams.com](mailto:goingt@whiteandwilliams.com)  
[santellep@whiteandwilliams.com](mailto:santellep@whiteandwilliams.com)  
**ATTORNEYS FOR ACE PROPERTY & CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY, U.S. FIRE INSURANCE COMPANY (WITH RESPECT TO POLICIES GLA 284022 AND GLA 5400797517), AND CENTURY INDEMNITY COMPANY**

R. Scott Wallinger, Jr., Esq.  
Christian Stegmaier, Esq.  
Collins & Lacy, PC  
1330 Lady Street, 6th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29211  
[swallinger@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:swallinger@collinsandlacy.com)  
[cstegmaier@collinsandlacy.com](mailto:cstegmaier@collinsandlacy.com)

-and-

John S. Favate, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Hardin, Kundla, McKeon & Poletto  
673 Morris Avenue  
Springfield, NJ 07081  
[jfavate@khmpp.com](mailto:jfavate@khmpp.com)  
**ATTORNEYS FOR UNITED STATES FIRE  
INSURANCE COMPANY**

John T. Lay, Esq.  
Laura W. Jordan, Esq.  
Gallivan, White & Boyd, P.A.  
1201 Main Street, Suite 1200  
Columbia, SC 29201  
[jlay@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:jlay@gwblawfirm.com)  
**ATTORNEYS FOR CERTAIN LONDON MARKET  
INSURANCE COMPANIES**

John C. Bonnie, Esq.  
Weinberg Wheeler Hudgins Gunn & Dial  
3344 Peachtree Road NE, Suite 2400  
Atlanta, GA 30326  
[jbonnie@wwhgd.com](mailto:jbonnie@wwhgd.com)  
**ATTORNEYS FOR LEXINGTON INSURANCE  
COMPANY**

Elizabeth J. Palmer, Esq.  
Rosen, Rosen & Hagood, LLC  
151 Meeting Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[epalmer@rrhlawfirm.com](mailto:epalmer@rrhlawfirm.com)

and

R. Michael Ethridge, Esq.  
Carlock Copeland  
40 Calhoun Street, Ste. 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[methridge@carlockcopeland.com](mailto:methridge@carlockcopeland.com)

-and-

Wayne S. Karbal, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Paul Parker, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Karbal Cohen Economou Silk Dunne, LLC  
150 S. Wacker Drive, 17th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60606  
[wkarbal@karballaw.com](mailto:wkarbal@karballaw.com)  
[pparker@karballaw.com](mailto:pparker@karballaw.com)  
**ATTORNEYS FOR FIRST STATE INSURANCE  
COMPANY**

Edward K. Pritchard, III, Esq.  
Pritchard Law Group, LLC  
129 Broad Street  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[epritchard@pritchard-elliott.com](mailto:epritchard@pritchard-elliott.com)

and

Richard McDermott, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Seth M. Jaffe, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Hinkhouse Williams Walsh LLP  
180 North Stetson Street, Suite 3400  
Chicago, IL 60601  
[rmcdermott@hww-law.com](mailto:rmcdermott@hww-law.com)  
[sjaffe@hww-law.com](mailto:sjaffe@hww-law.com)  
**ATTORNEYS FOR BERKSHIRE HATHAWAY  
SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY  
(FORMERLY KNOWN AS STONEWALL  
INSURANCE COMPANY), STARR INDEMNITY &  
LIABILITY COMPANY (FORMERLY KNOWN AS  
REPUBLIC INSURANCE COMPANY), CERTAIN  
UNDERWRITERS AT LLOYD'S, LONDON,  
CERTAIN AVIVA COMPANIES, CERTAIN  
WINTERTHUR COMPANIES, NEW LONDON  
REINSURANCE COMPANY LIMITED, AND THE  
SCOTTISH LION INSURANCE COMPANY  
LIMITED**

Molly Poag, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Harry Lee, Esq. (*pro hac vice*)  
Steptoe & Johnson LLP  
1330 Connecticut Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20036

**ATTORNEYS FOR PROVIDENCE WASHINGTON  
INSURANCE COMPANY, (AS SUCCESSOR IN  
INTEREST BY WAY OF MERGER TO SEATON  
INSURANCE COMPANY, F/K/A UNIGARD  
SECURITY INSURANCE, F/K/A UNIGARD  
MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY**



Sarah Jane Schrodetzki, Paralegal for  
Morgan S. Templeton, Esquire  
Wall Templeton & Haldrup, P.A.  
145 King Street, Suite 300  
Post Office Box 1200  
Charleston, South Carolina 29402  
(843) 329-9500

and

Patrick F. Hofer (*pro hac vice*)  
Troutman Sanders LLP  
401 9th Street, N.W., Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
(202) 274-2950  
Attorneys for Respondent, Continental Casualty  
Company