

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA
IN THE SUPREME COURT

RECEIVED

SEP 15 2016

S.C. SUPREME COURT

Appeal from Orangeburg County
Honorable Kristi Lea Harrington, Circuit Court Judge

WALTER HARRIS,

PETITIONER

V.

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA,

RESPONDENT

APPELLATE CASE NO. 2016-000891

APPENDIX

ROBERT M. PACHAK
Appellate Defender

South Carolina Commission on Indigent Defense
Division of Appellate Defense
PO Box 11589
Columbia, SC 29211-1589

ATTORNEY FOR PETITIONER

ALAN WILSON
Attorney General

J. CROOM HUNTER
Assistant Attorney General
Rembert Dennis Building
1000 Assembly Street, Room 519
Columbia, SC 29201

ATTORNEYS FOR RESPONDENT

INDEX

INDEX.....	i
TRIAL TRANSCRIPT DATED DECEMEBER 10-17, 2010	1
APPLICATION FOR POST-CONVICTION RELIEF FILED JANUARY 17, 2013.....	1129
AMENDMENT TO POST-CONVICTION RELIEF APPLICATION FILED JANUARY 22, 2013.....	1136
RETURN DATED MAY 2, 2013	1139
POST-CONVICTION RELIEF HEARING DATED OCTOBER 29, 2014	1146
ORDER OF DISMISSAL FILED JANUARY 15, 2015.....	1210
INDICTMENTS.....	1125

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA

COURT OF GENERAL SESSIONS

COUNTY OF ORANGEBURG

FIRST JUDICIAL CIRCUIT

VOLUME ONE OF THREE

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA)

TRANSCRIPT OF RECORD

versus)

DATE:

DECEMBER 10 - 17, 2010

CHRISTIAN COLEMAN,)
RALPH BERNARD COLEMAN)
WALTER LEE HARRIS,)
DANNY RYANT, JR.,)
MARIO MONTEZ SHIVERS)

CASE NOS.

2010-GS-38-802, 803, 805

2010-GS-38-808, 810, 811

2010-GS-38-812, 813, 814

2010-GS-38-817, 818, 819

2010-GS-38-822, 823, 824

DEFENDANTS)

BEFORE:

HONORABLE EDGAR DICKSON, PRESIDING JUDGE

AND A JURY.

APPEARANCES:

DAVID M. PASCOE, ESQUIRE
SOLICITOR
DONALD N. SORENSON, ESQUIRE
ASSISTANT SOLICITOR
FOR THE STATE

RICHARD LACKEY, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT CHRISTIAN COLEMAN

JILLIAN ULLMAN AND MARK WISE, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT RALPH BERNARD COLEMAN

SCOTT PALMER, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT WILLIE HARRIS

DOUGLAS MELLARD, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT DANNY RYANT, JR.

JOSHUA KOGER, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT, MARIO MONTEZ SHIVERS

HARRY A. WALKER (MRS.)
COURT REPORTER, FIRST JUDICIAL CIRCUIT
POST OFFICE BOX 127
ROWESVILLE, SOUTH CAROLINA 29133

I N D E XPAGE

PRETRIAL MOTIONS - DECEMBER 10, 2010

13

TRIAL - BEGINS DECEMBER 13, 2010EXAMINATION OF: DIRECT CROSS REDIRECT RECROSSDANNY RYANT, JR.,
IN CAMERA

THE COURT 62

CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS

SOL. PASCOE 183 206

MR. LACKEY 194

MS. ULLMAN 196

MR. PALMER 202

MR. KOGER 204

ASHLEY D. PARSLEY

SOL. SORENSON 214

MR. LACKEY 245

MS. ULLMAN 248

MR. PALMER 264

MR. MELLARD 271

MR. KOGER 273

NATHANIEL HUBBARD

SOL. SORENSON 287

I N D E X (CONTINUED)EXAMINATION OF: DIRECT CROSS REDIRECT RECROSS

PATRICK TYLER

SOL. PASCOE	296		425	
MR. LACKEY		343		433
MR. WISE		351		435
MR. PALMER		384		437
MR. MELLARD		406		
MR. KOGER		414		441

JUROR KIA JAMES

THE COURT	463			

GERALD DAVID CARTER

SOL. SORENSON	476		541	
MR. LACKEY		528		
MR. ULLMAN		531		
MR. KOGER		535		

SHANNON R. MITCHELL

SOL. SORENSON	545		567	
MR. WISE		558		
MR. PALMER		563		
MR. KOGER		566		

I N D E X (CONTINUED)EXAMINATION OF: DIRECT CROSS REDIRECT RECROSS

ANDRE WASHINGTON

SOL. PASCOE	569		
MS. ULLMAN		579	
MR. PALMER		580	
MR. KOGER		582	

MONEAK R. BUSBY

SOL. SORENSON	583		603
MR. MELLARD		595	607
MR. KOGER		601	608

YVONNE SHARPERSON

SOL. SORENSON	610		
MR. MELLARD		616	

DR. JANET E. ROSS

SOL. SORENSON	622		
MS. ULLMAN		635	
MR. PALMER		637	

JAMES GREEN

SOL. SORENSON	639		
MR. LACKEY		663	
MS. ULLMAN		667	
MR. KOGER		673	

I N D E X (CONTINUED)

<u>EXAMINATION OF:</u>	<u>DIRECT</u>	<u>CROSS</u>	<u>REDIRECT</u>	<u>RE CROSS</u>
DARRIUS GARNER				
SOL. PASCOE	681			
MR. LACKEY		695		
MR. PALMER		696		
MR. KOGER		697		
JAMES SHUMPERT				
SOL. SORENSON	707			
MR. LACKEY		749		
MR. WISE		780, 808		
JAMES SHUMPERT, IN CAMERA				
MR. WISE		804		
JAMES SHUMPERT				
MR. PALMER		810		
MR. MELLARD		826		
MR. KOGER		828		
CHRISTIAN COLEMAN RALPH COLEMAN WALTER LEE HARRIS DANNY RYANT, JR. MARIO SHIVERS, IN CAMERA				
THE COURT	875			

I N D E X (Continued)

	<u>PAGE</u>
OPENING STATEMENT BY SOLICITOR SORENSON	157
OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. LACKEY	165
OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. WISE	168
OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. PALMER	172
OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. MELLARD	177
OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. KOGER	178
CLOSING ARGUMENT BY SOLICITOR PASCOE	927
CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MR. LACKEY	939
CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MS. ULLMAN	945
CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MR. PALMER	974
CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MR. MELLARD	986
CLOSING ARGUMENT BY MR. KOGER	997
FINAL CLOSING ARGUMENT BY SOLICITOR PASCOE	1011
CHARGE BY THE COURT	1039
VERDICT OF THE JURY AS TO CHRISTIAN COLEMAN	1077
VERDICT OF THE JURY AS TO RALPH COLEMAN	1079
VERDICT OF THE JURY AS TO WALTER LEE HARRIS	1084
VERDICT OF THE JURY AS TO DANNY RYANT, JR.	1089
VERDICT OF THE JURY AS TO MARIO SHIVERS	1094
SENTENCE BY THE COURT OF CHRISTIAN COLEMAN	1108
SENTENCE BY THE COURT OF RALPH COLEMAN	1112
SENTENCE BY THE COURT OF WALTER LEE HARRIS	1115
SENTENCE BY THE COURT OF DANNY RYANT, JR.	1120
SENTENCE BY THE COURT OF MARIO MONTEZ SHIVERS	1123

I N D E X (CONTINUED)E X H I B I T S

<u>NUMBER</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>ID.</u>	<u>EV.</u>
ST. 1	PHOTO LINEUP	60	591
ST. 2	PHOTO LINEUP	60	592
ST. 3	PHOTO LINEUP	60	238
ST. 4	PHOTO LINEUP	60	241
ST. 5	PHOTO LINEUP	60	243
ST. 6	PHOTO	60	190
ST. 7	PHOTO	60	192
ST. 8	PHOTO	60	192
ST. 9	PHOTO	60	456
ST. 10	PHOTO	60	456
ST. 11	PHOTO	60	456
ST. 12	PHOTO	60	456
ST. 13	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 14	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 15	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 16	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 17	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 18	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 19	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 20	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 21	PHOTO	457	490

I N D E X (CONTINUED)E X H I B I T S (CONTINUED)

<u>NUMBER</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>ID</u>	<u>EV</u>
ST. 22	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 23	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 24	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 25	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 26	PHOTO	457	490
ST. 27	PHOTO	60	456
ST. 28	PHOTO	60	311
ST. 29	PHOTO	60	457
ST. 30	PHOTO	60	457
ST. 31	PHOTO	60	457
ST. 32	PHOTO	60	305
ST. 33	PHOTO	60	305
ST. 34	DIAGRAM	60	488
ST. 35	PHONE INFORMATION	50	289
ST. 36	PHONE INFORMATION	60	289
ST. 37	PHONE INFORMATION	60	289
ST. 38	ROLL OF DUCT TAPE	211	499
ST. 39	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 40	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 41	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 42	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504

I N D E X (CONTINUED)E X H I B I T S (CONTINUED)

<u>NUMBER</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>ID</u>	<u>EV</u>
ST. 43	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 44	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 45	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 46	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 47	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 48	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 49	NINE MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	504
ST. 50	FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASING	211	506
ST. 51	FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASING	211	506
ST. 52	FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASING	211	506
ST. 53	FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASING	211	506
ST. 54	FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASING	211	506
ST. 55	FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASING	211	506
ST. 57	FORTY CALIBER SHELL CASING	211	506
ST. 58	7-62 MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	510
ST. 59	7-62 MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	510
ST. 60	7-62 MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	510
ST. 61	7-62 MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	510
ST. 62	7-62 MILLIMETER SHELL CASING	211	510
ST. 63	BAG WITH BULLET FRAGMENTS	211	514
ST. 64	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514

I N D E X (CONTINUED)E X H I B I T S (CONTINUED)

<u>NUMBER</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>ID</u>	<u>EV</u>
ST. 65	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514
ST. 66	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514
ST. 67	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514
ST. 68	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514
ST. 69	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514
ST. 70	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514
ST. 71	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514
ST. 72	BULLET FRAGMENT	211	514
ST. 73	FORTY CALIBER PISTOL	211	527
ST. 74	MAGAZINE FROM FORTY CALIBER PISTOL	211	527
ST. 75	PHOTO OF RIFLE	339	651
ST. 76	PHOTO LINEUP	330	726
ST. 77	PHOTO LINEUP	331	726
ST. 78	PHOTO LINEUP	332	734
ST. 79	PHOTO LINEUP	333	736
ST. 80	WRITTEN STATEMENT OF BUSBY	603	
ST. 81	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 82	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 83	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 84	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630

I N D E X (CONTINUED)E X H I B I T S (CONTINUED)

<u>NUMBER</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>ID</u>	<u>EV</u>
ST. 85	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 86	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 87	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 88	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 89	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 90	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 91	BULLET FRAGMENT	620	630
ST. 92	BODY DIAGRAM	620	627
ST. 93	AERIAL VIEW OF AREA	60	744
ST. 94	CALENDAR	60	710
ST. 95	ADVISEMENT OF RIGHTS FORM	60	720

DEFENDANT MARIO SHIVERS

NO. 1	WRITTEN STATEMENT OF ASHLEY PARSLEY	274

NO. 2	WRITTEN STATEMENT OF PATRICK TYLER	424

DEFENDANT CHRISTIAN COLEMAN

NO. 1	WRITTEN STATEMENT OF PATRICK TYLER	344

I N D E X (CONTINUED)E X H I B I T S (CONTINUED)

<u>NUMBER</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>ID</u>	<u>EV</u>
CT. 1	JUDGE'S NOTES-RE: SUBSTITUTING JUROR JAMES FOR JUROR LOVETTE		471
CT. 2	NOTE-ELECTION OF JURY FORELADY		621
CT. 3	POLYGRAPH REPORT ON ASHLEY PARSLEY		798
CT. 4	CASE CITE ON ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY		917
CT. 5	NOTE FROM JURY		1068
CT. 6	REPORT OF KENNY KINSEY ON CARTRIDGE FOUND IN COURTROOM		1074

1 DATE:

2 DECEMBER 10, 2010

3 PRETRIAL MOTIONS

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, I HAVE FOUR DEFENSE
5 ATTORNEYS HERE, AND I NOTICE THAT THEY'RE NOT SEATED
6 IN THE SAME ORDER THAT WE WERE DOING THEM, BUT THAT'S
7 OKAY. WE'LL WORK THROUGH THAT. LET'S SEE, MR.
8 SORENSON, DO YOU MIND REMINDING ME THE NAMES OF
9 EVERYBODY, BECAUSE I DON'T HAVE MY NOTES?

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

11 COURT REPORTER: AND I NEED WHO THEY REPRESENT.

12 THE COURT: YEAH, WE'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH THAT.
13 THAT'S WHAT HE'S HERE FOR.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, MA'AM. WE HAVE FIVE
15 DEFENDANTS IN THIS CASE. AS YOUR HONOR INDICATED,
16 THERE ARE FOUR DEFENSE LAWYERS PRESENT. SCOTT PALMER
17 IS PRESENT, MR. PALMER REPRESENTS WALTER LEE HARRIS.
18 JILL ULLMAN AND MARK WISE ARE PRESENT, THEY REPRESENT
19 RALPH BERNARD COLEMAN. RICHARD LACKEY IS PRESENT, HIS
20 CLIENT, CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING HE IS
21 WAIVING HIS PRESENCE HERE TODAY. DOUG MELLARD IS
22 HERE, MR. MELLARD REPRESENTS DANNY RYANT, AND I
23 UNDERSTAND THERE MAY HAVE BEEN -- MR. RYANT MAY HAVE
24 BEEN, MR. RYANT MAY HAVE REFUSED TO BE TRANSPORTED
25 THIS MORNING SO HE IS NOT HERE. AND THEN THE FIFTH

1 CO-DEFENDANT WOULD BE MARIO MONTEZ SHIVERS, AND HE IS
2 REPRESENTED BY MR. KOGER, AND IT IS MY UNDERSTANDING
3 THAT YOUR OFFICE CONTACTED MR. KOGER YESTERDAY AND HE
4 INDICATED THAT THERE WERE NO MATTERS THAT HE NEEDED TO
5 ADDRESS BEFORE THE COURT THIS MORNING, SO THEREFORE,
6 HE NOR HIS CLIENT ARE HERE.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR. AND MR.
8 LACKEY, LET ME JUST TAKE CARE OF -- MR. SORENSON HAS
9 INDICATED THAT MR. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN DOES NOT WISH TO
10 BE HERE TODAY?

11 MR. LACKEY: WHAT -- HE IS IN THE BACK BUT I
12 BROUGHT HIM OVER BASICALLY OUT OF AN ABUNDANCE OF
13 CAUTION IN CASE ANYTHING EVOLVED FROM ANY MATTERS
14 TODAY THAT WE COULD CLEAR, BUT I AM NOT JOINING IN THE
15 MOTIONS TO SEVER TRIAL.

16 THE COURT: OKAY, ALRIGHT, SIR. OKAY.

17 COURT REPORTER: YOU ARE NOT JOINING?

18 MR. LACKEY: I'M NOT, SO HE'S NOT IN COURT RIGHT
19 NOW.

20 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MR. MELLARD, YOUR CLIENT,
21 MR. RYANT, DID NOT APPEAR?

22 MR. MELLARD: THAT'S RIGHT, YOUR HONOR. HE
23 REFUSED TO BE TRANSPORTED.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MR. MELLARD, IF YOU DON'T
25 MIND, I KNOW YOU'VE BEEN TALKING ON AND OFF WITH MR.

15

1 RYANT. IF YOU WILL REMIND MR. RYANT THAT IF HE CHOOSES
2 NOT TO BE PRESENT I'M STILL GOING FORWARD WITH THIS
3 TRIAL.

4 MR. MELLARD: I SPOKE TO HIM AT LENGTH ABOUT THAT
5 YESTERDAY.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. NOW, HE CAN BE HERE OR NOT BE
7 HERE, BUT I'M TRYING THIS CASE.

8 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR. HE KNOWS THAT, I'VE
9 SPOKEN WITH HIM YESTERDAY, AND THE INVESTIGATOR IS AT
10 THE JAIL RIGHT NOW SPEAKING TO HIM ABOUT THIS SAME
11 THING.

12 THE COURT: OKAY, THANK YOU, SIR. I DIDN'T MEAN,
13 I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE -- IF YOU WILL CLEARLY
14 ADVISE HIM. THANK YOU, SIR.

15 ALRIGHT, SO, MR. PALMER, DO YOU HAVE A MOTION?

16 MR. PALMER: I DO, YOUR HONOR.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MR. PALMER, WHAT IS YOUR
18 MOTION?

19 MR. PALMER: WELL, ACTUALLY, I MAY HAVE TWO, YOUR
20 HONOR, BUT MY FIRST ONE IS A MOTION TO SUPPRESS.

21 THE COURT: OKAY.

22 MR. PALMER: SPECIFICALLY, YOUR HONOR, I'M MOVING
23 PRETRIAL TO SUPPRESS CERTAIN EVIDENCE THAT I
24 ANTICIPATE THE STATE'S GOING TO TRY TO ENTER INTO
25 EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE.

1 THE COURT: OKAY.

2 MR. PALMER: WHAT I'M REFERRING TO IS SOME
3 TELEPHONE RECORDS, AND THE STATE HAS PROVIDED
4 DISCOVERY AND THERE IS A LEDGER OR A PRINTOUT OF SOME
5 TELEPHONE RECORDS, IT LOOKS LIKE IT'S FROM ALLTEL.
6 THE NUMBER THAT'S THE SUBJECT OF THESE RECORDS IS AREA
7 CODE 803-860-██████, WHICH I UNDERSTAND THE STATE IS
8 GOING TO PURPORT HAS SOME CONNECTION WITH MY CLIENT,
9 WALTER LEE HARRIS. YOUR HONOR, IT APPEARS THAT THESE
10 RECORDS WERE PROVIDED BY THE ALLTEL TELEPHONE COMPANY
11 BY VIRTUE OF A SUBPOENA DUCES TECUM ISSUED BY
12 MAGISTRATE DERRICK DASH ON THE TWENTY-FOURTH OF MARCH,
13 TWENTY-TEN. NOW, I'M JUST GOING TO QUOTE A LITTLE BIT
14 FROM THE SUBPOENA, YOUR HONOR. THE HEADER ON THE
15 SUBPOENA IS MAGISTRATE'S COURT, COUNTY OF ORANGEBURG,
16 AND IT'S ADDRESSED TO ALLTEL, ATTENTION: CUSTODIAN OF
17 RECORDS. AND IT'S, "YOU ARE HEREBY DIRECTED AND
18 ORDERED," AND I'M PARAPHRASING SOME OF IT BUT, "ANY
19 AND ALL APPLICATION AND ACCOUNT INFORMATION, NAME AND
20 ADDRESS, SOCIAL SECURITY NUMBER, FOR THE TELEPHONE
21 803-860-██████. ANY OUTGOING AND INCOMING CALLS BETWEEN
22 MARCH TWELFTH, TWENTY-TEN TO MARCH FOURTEENTH, TWENTY-
23 TEN." AND THEN IT READS, YOUR HONOR, "THIS
24 INFORMATION IS NEEDED IN REFERENCE TO A HOMICIDE CASE
25 THAT I AM CURRENTLY INVESTIGATING." AND IT'S SIGNED

1 BY JUDGE DERRICK DASH. THE BASIS OF MY MOTION, YOUR
2 HONOR, IS THAT THIS SUBPOENA IS IMPROPER, UNLAWFUL,
3 AND ANY EVIDENCE DERIVED FROM IT IS ESSENTIALLY THE
4 FRUIT OF THE POISONOUS TREE. IN SUPPORT OF MY MOTION,
5 YOUR HONOR, I OFFER ETHICS ADVISORY OPINION NUMBER TWO
6 THOUSAND AND ONE, DASH, ZERO FIVE, WHICH SAYS, IN PART
7 THAT, "MAGISTRATES AND MUNICIPAL COURTS HAVE NO
8 SUBPOENA DUCES TECUM AUTHORITY EXCEPT IN A DUI CASE."
9 AND THEREFORE, YOUR HONOR, ANY RESPONSE TO THIS
10 SUBPOENA WOULD HAVE BEEN EVIDENCE THAT SHOULD NOT BE
11 ADMITTED. IT'S PREJUDICIAL AND SHOULD NOT BE ADMITTED
12 AGAINST MY CLIENT.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. THEY COULD HAVE TAKEN IT TO A
14 CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE, THOUGH, HOWEVER, RIGHT?

15 MR. PALMER: I SUPPOSE THEY COULD HAVE, YOUR
16 HONOR.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. WHICH ONE OF YOU
18 GENTLEMEN CARE TO RESPOND?

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: WELL FIRST OFF, I GUESS THE
20 FIRST THING I NEED TO ADDRESS IS, I BELIEVE, AND I
21 DIDN'T BRING ALL MY RECORDS, BUT LOOKING AT MR.
22 PASCOE'S COPY, THE RECORDS THAT HE'S ACTUALLY
23 REFERRING TO IS NOT EVEN HIS CLIENT'S RECORDS, IT
24 WOULD BE CO-DEFENDANT PATRICK TYLER'S RECORDS, 860-
25 [REDACTED]. SO, I GUESS THAT WOULD BE THE FIRST THING I

1 NEED TO ADDRESS IS THE FACT THAT I THINK THAT AS TO
2 THAT, THOSE RECORDS HE IS WITHOUT STANDING TO
3 CHALLENGE THE ADMISSIBILITY, THOSE AREN'T HIS CLIENT'S
4 PHONE RECORDS.

5 THE COURT: OKAY.

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: BUT EVEN ASSUMING SO, AND I
7 WILL JUST KIND OF, BECAUSE I KNOW WHEN YOU GET TO THIS
8 POINT, THERE ARE ANOTHER SET OF PHONE RECORDS THAT WE
9 DO ATTRIBUTE TO HIS CLIENT THAT WERE OBTAINED, I
10 BELIEVE, AT THE SAME TIME PERIOD. I MEAN, WE ARE IN
11 THE POSITION, YOUR HONOR, THAT OBVIOUSLY THEY COULD
12 HAVE BEEN OBTAINED BY A SEARCH WARRANT AT THAT POINT
13 IN TIME, THEY COULD HAVE BEEN OBTAIN, AS YOUR HONOR
14 INDICATED, BY A SUBPOENA SIGNED BY A CIRCUIT COURT
15 JUDGE, OR WE COULD GO AND ISSUE A SUBPOENA RIGHT NOW
16 OURSELVES THAT WOULD CURE THAT ANYWAY. I'M NOT SURE
17 THAT, I MEAN, INEVITABLY THEY WOULD HAVE BEEN
18 DISCOVERED.

19 THE COURT: AND THOSE RECORDS HAVE BEEN PROVIDED
20 TO HIM? YOU'VE GOT THOSE RECORDS?

21 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR, AND YOUR HONOR, LOOKING AT
22 THIS, THERE IS ANOTHER NUMBER, AND I BELIEVE THEY'RE
23 GOING TO TRY TO ATTRIBUTE IT TO MR. HARRIS, IT'S 803-
24 347-██████, WHICH WAS OBTAINED BY A VERY SIMILAR
25 SUBPOENA ISSUED BY JUDGE DASH BACK IN MARCH, I BELIEVE

1 IT WAS, OR APRIL.

2 THE COURT: OKAY.

3 SOLICITOR SORENSON: BUT WE WERE NOT INVOLVED AT
4 ALL IN OBTAINING THEM, THAT WAS LAW ENFORCEMENT PRIOR
5 TO, YOU KNOW, PRIOR TO CHARGES BEING INSTITUTED, SO IT
6 WOULD BE PRIOR TO OUR OFFICE HAVING ANY INVOLVEMENT.

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR. AND YOUR ARGUMENT IS,
8 YOU CAN ISSUE A SUBPOENA AND MAKE THEM -- RIGHT NOW.

9 SOLICITOR SORENSON: RIGHT, I'M NOT SURE OF THE
10 REMEDY, I MEAN, MAYBE THE MAGISTRATE, I MEAN, THERE'S
11 SOME DISCIPLINARY ACTION AGAINST THE MAGISTRATE OR
12 SOMETHING FOR DOING THAT, I DON'T KNOW, BUT I DON'T
13 SEE WHERE THAT REMEDY THAT THOSE RECORDS COULD BE
14 SUPPRESSED, ESPECIALLY NOT WHEN THEY COULD OBVIOUSLY
15 HAVE BEEN DISCOVERED THROUGH SEVERAL OTHER MEANS.

16 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR. ANYTHING IN
17 RESPONSE TO THAT?

18 MR. PALMER: WELL, YOUR HONOR, I JUST WOULD
19 SUBMIT, THIS ETHICAL, ETHICS ADVISORY OPINION WHICH
20 ACTUALLY ...

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: LET ME LOOK AT THAT.

22 MR. PALMER: SURE.

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THIS WAS JUST BROUGHT UP
24 THIS MORNING, SO ...

25 THE COURT: I UNDERSTAND.

1 MR. PALMER: AND ACTUALLY, IT SAYS IT'S UNETHICAL
2 TO USE IT, IF IT'S BEEN OBTAINED IN THIS WAY. NOW, OF
3 COURSE, IF THEY WANT TO SUBPOENA THEM NOW AND GET THEM
4 BY MONDAY, I GUESS THAT'S A DIFFERENT ISSUE, BUT AS IT
5 STANDS NOW, WE OBJECT TO IT.

6 THE COURT: OKAY.

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IT BASICALLY SAYS IT WOULD
8 BE UNETHICAL FOR AN ATTORNEY TO ...

9 COURT REPORTER: I'M SORRY?

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IT WOULD BE UNETHICAL FOR AN
11 ATTORNEY TO OBTAIN THE RECORDS IN THIS FASHION. AS I
12 HAVE INDICATED, I MEAN, WE WERE NOT INVOLVED IN
13 OBTAINING THESE RECORDS, IT WAS LAW ENFORCEMENT THAT
14 DID THAT.

15 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. PALMER, I -- AND I'LL BE
16 GLAD TO LOOK AT IT IF YOU WANT TO HAND IT UP TO ME.
17 THANK YOU, SIR, I APPRECIATE IT. ALRIGHT, THANK YOU,
18 SIR. YOU CAN KEEP A COPY OF THAT.

19 ALRIGHT, MR. PALMER, I NOTE YOUR OBJECTION. I AM
20 GOING TO DENY YOUR MOTION, BUT I WILL NOTE YOUR
21 OBJECTION TO MY RULING AND PRESERVE IT FOR ANY
22 POSSIBLE APPEAL YOU MIGHT WANT TO MAKE.

23 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, APPRECIATE IT.

25 MR. PALMER: I HAVE ONE MORE MOTION BUT I'LL MAKE

1 IT BRIEF.

2 THE COURT: OKAY.

3 MR. PALMER: MY NEXT MOTION, YOUR HONOR, AND I
4 BELIEVE THIS WILL BE IT FOR NOW, IS A MOTION TO SEVER.

5 THE COURT: OKAY.

6 MR. PALMER: NOW AGAIN, FOR THE RECORD, I
7 REPRESENT WALTER LEE HARRIS. YOUR HONOR, MR. HARRIS'S
8 SITUATION IS A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT THAN SOME OF THE
9 OTHER DEFENDANTS, AND I'LL TELL YOU WHAT I'M GETTING
10 AT IS, YOUR HONOR OBVIOUSLY REMEMBERS THE NEAL VERSUS
11 BIGGERS HEARING WE HAD THE OTHER DAY, AND THERE WAS
12 SOME TESTIMONY FROM A WITNESS THAT TALKED ABOUT
13 IDENTIFYING MR. HARRIS AS TRYING TO MAKE A BUY OF SOME
14 MARIJUANA PRIOR TO THIS INCIDENT THAT LED TO THESE
15 CHARGES, AND THE MENTION OF A GUY NAMED SHANNON AS
16 BEING A POSSIBLE EYE WITNESS. NOW, I HAVE IT ON GOOD
17 AUTHORITY THAT ONE OF THE CO-DEFENDANTS, IF NOT MORE
18 OF THE CO-DEFENDANTS MAY WANT TO CALL THIS GUY,
19 SHANNON, AS A WITNESS, AND WE THINK THAT, YOUR HONOR,
20 THIS MAY PREJUDICE OUR CASE AND THAT -- AND BESIDES
21 THAT, A LOT OF WHAT I BELIEVE IS GOING TO BE THE
22 STATE'S CASE IS THE CO-DEFENDANTS' STATEMENTS AGAINST
23 EACH OTHER OR THEIR EXPECTED TESTIMONY AGAINST EACH
24 OTHER.

25 THE COURT: YEAH, I DON'T BELIEVE THERE ARE ANY

1 STATEMENTS, IS THAT CORRECT? WE DON'T HAVE ANY
2 STATEMENT ISSUES, IS THAT CORRECT?

3 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NONE THAT WE INTEND ON
4 INTRODUCING AT THIS TIME.

5 THE COURT: SO, IT'S JUST GOING TO BE TESTIMONY.

6 MR. PALMER: I WOULD MODIFY THAT ARGUMENT TO
7 REFER TO EXPECTED TESTIMONY.

8 THE COURT: RIGHT.

9 MR. PALMER: AND WE'VE BEEN RECENTLY NOTICED,
10 YOUR HONOR, OF TESTIMONY, OR I EXPECT THAT HE'S GOING
11 TO TESTIFY ABOUT A GENTLEMAN NAMED RONNIE WASHINGTON
12 WHO I DON'T BELIEVE IS CHARGED WITH ANYTHING BUT IS
13 APPARENTLY AN EYE WITNESS IF NOT A PERIPHERAL
14 PARTICIPANT IN THIS CASE, AND WHO BY HIS WRITTEN
15 STATEMENT HAS SOME INFORMATION THAT MAY IMPLICATE MY
16 CLIENT. YOUR HONOR, WE JUST THINK THAT OVERALL MY
17 CLIENT FINDS HIMSELF IN AN UNTENABLE POSITION OF
18 ALMOST HAVING TO TAKE THE STAND TO PRESENT, TO ADDRESS
19 SOME OF THESE STATEMENTS. AND WE THINK, YOUR HONOR,
20 BESIDES THAT, JUST THE APPEARANCE OF ALL THESE GUYS
21 SITTING TOGETHER WITH DIFFERENT ALLEGATIONS AGAINST
22 EACH ONE OF THEM REALLY DENIES HIM THE RIGHT TO HAVE
23 HIS DAY IN COURT ON A LEVEL PLAYING FIELD. WE THINK,
24 YOUR HONOR, THAT THOSE CIRCUMSTANCES COMPEL SEVERANCE
25 OF THE CASE AND LET MR. HARRIS BE TRIED INDIVIDUALLY.

1 THE COURT: AND WHAT IS -- AND MR. PALMER, YOU
2 SAID THAT THEY MAY WANT TO CALL A, SOMEBODY BY THE
3 NAME OF SHANNON AS A WITNESS AND THAT'S GOING TO
4 PREJUDICE YOUR CLIENT. WHAT UNUSUAL PREJUDICE IS HE
5 GOING TO HAVE BY -- I MEAN, CAN YOU TELL ME WHAT
6 THAT'S GOING TO BE?

7 MR. PALMER: WELL, YOUR HONOR, I DON'T KNOW WHAT
8 INVOLVEMENT THIS SHANNON HAS IN THE CASE. WE HAVEN'T
9 BEEN PROVIDED REALLY MUCH BY THE WAY OF
10 IDENTIFICATION. WE DON'T KNOW WHAT HIS RAP SHEET IS.
11 I DON'T KNOW ANYTHING ABOUT HIM. AND IF THEY OFFER
12 HIM AS A WITNESS MONDAY, WE NEED AN OPPORTUNITY TO
13 KNOW WHO THIS PERSON IS AND WHAT HIS BACKGROUND IS SO
14 THAT WE CAN TRY TO IMPEACH HIM. AND YOUR HONOR, I
15 JUST THINK THAT HAVING MR. HARRIS TRIED SEPARATELY
16 WOULD FACILITATE THAT AND, YOU KNOW, APPARENTLY HE'S
17 GOING TO BE OFFERED AS AN EYE WITNESS TO PUT MY GUY IN
18 THERE, AND ...

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. I HAVE FIVE DEFENDANTS AND
20 ALL INVOLVED IN ONE INCIDENT, IS THAT CORRECT?

21 MR. PALMER: ALLEGEDLY.

22 THE COURT: ALLEGEDLY, EXCUSE ME, EXCUSE ME,
23 ALLEGEDLY ALL INVOLVED IN ONE INCIDENT.

24 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

25 THE COURT: OKAY. AND APPARENTLY, THE TRIAL IS

1 GOING TO TAKE A GOOD BIT OF TIME, I MEAN, FROM
2 EVERYBODY'S ...

3 MR. PALMER: I WOULD HAVE TO AGREE.

4 THE COURT: OKAY. AND I'M GOING TO HAVE THE SAME
5 WITNESSES REGARDLESS OF WHICH TRIAL I'M IN. I MEAN, IN
6 OTHER WORDS, IF I TRIED EACH ONE OF THESE DEFENDANTS
7 SEPARATELY, FOR THE MOST PART I'M GOING TO HAVE NINETY
8 PER CENT OF THE SAME WITNESSES EACH TIME, IS THAT
9 CORRECT?

10 MR. PALMER: I DON'T KNOW, YOUR HONOR, I REALLY
11 DON'T KNOW.

12 THE COURT: AND, OF COURSE, I DON'T KNOW EITHER.

13 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

14 THE COURT: MR. SORENSON, DID YOU ...

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: FROM OUR STANDPOINT, IF WE
16 TRIED EACH OF THEM SEPARATELY YOU WOULD HAVE A HUNDRED
17 PER CENT OF THE SAME STATE'S WITNESSES IN EACH OF THE
18 FIVE TRIALS.

19 THE COURT: OKAY. AND THE ONLY THING THAT WOULD
20 BE DIFFERENT IS, I WOULD HAVE A DIFFERENT JURY EACH
21 TIME, CORRECT?

22 MR. PALMER: I FOLLOW YOU, YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: WELL, I'M JUST -- HERE IS THE PROBLEM
24 FROM THE COURT'S PERSPECTIVE, IS WHEN I HAVE ONE
25 INCIDENT INVOLVING HOWEVER MANY PEOPLE ARE INVOLVED,

25

1 TO ME EVERY DEFENDANT HAS THE SAME RIGHT TO TESTIFY OR
2 NOT TESTIFY. AND I'M NOT GOING TO HAVE MULTIPLE
3 JURIES HERE, MULTIPLE, THIS CASE OVER AND OVER, YOU
4 KNOW. SO, I MEAN, THAT'S JUST NOT MY PERSPECTIVE ON
5 THIS, PARTICULARLY IF I'VE GOT TO GET THE SAME
6 WITNESSES IN EVERY TIME. EVEN IF I -- I KNOW THE
7 SOLICITOR'S OFFICE HAS INDICATED A HUNDRED PER CENT,
8 EVEN IF IT'S ONLY NINETY PER CENT, YOU KNOW. SO, YOU
9 KNOW, I'M GOING TO DENY YOUR MOTION TO SEVER. I WILL
10 NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO MY RULING, I WANT IT PRESERVED,
11 AGAIN, AS YOUR EARLIER MOTION IS ALSO PRESERVED FOR
12 THE RECORD.

13 MR. PALMER: AND JUST ONE MORE - - -

14 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

15 MR. PALMER: --- JUST VERY MINOR MATTER, YOUR
16 HONOR, AND I DON'T REALLY -- IT'S NOT GOING TO BE
17 APPRAISED AS A MOTION, MORE OR LESS, AN INQUIRY, BUT
18 WE RECENTLY RECEIVED SOME ADDITIONAL DISCOVERY, I
19 THINK IT WAS DATED DECEMBER FIRST, AND THE DISCOVERY
20 INCLUDED A STATEMENT FROM THIS INDIVIDUAL, RONNIE
21 WASHINGTON.

22 THE COURT: OKAY.

23 MR. PALMER: AND THE GIST OF IT WAS, IS THAT THIS
24 WASHINGTON MAN WAS SUPPOSED TO HAVE DRIVEN SOME OF
25 THESE GUYS AWAY FROM THE SCENE. AND MY UNDERSTANDING

1 IS, YOUR HONOR, I WASN'T HERE FOR THAT HEARING, BUT AT
2 A PREVIOUS HEARING THE STATE INDICATED THAT THEY
3 INTENDED TO PROVIDE RAP SHEET INFORMATION FOR ALL OF
4 THEIR WITNESSES, AND I DON'T BELIEVE WE HAVE A RAP
5 SHEET FOR THIS PARTICULAR INDIVIDUAL. AND IF THEY
6 INTEND TO CALL HIM I WOULD APPRECIATE THE STATE
7 PROVIDING THAT AHEAD OF TIME SO THAT WE COULD, I CAN
8 PREPARE TO CROSS-EXAMINE THIS WITNESS SHOULD THEY PUT
9 HIM ON THE STAND.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. OKAY, SO IT'S JUST AN -- YES,
11 SIR.

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, I HAVE THE RAP
13 SHEETS ON OUR LAY WITNESSES WITH ME HERE TODAY. AS I
14 TYPICALLY HAVE DONE IN THE PAST, I DO NOT PROVIDE
15 COPIES OF WITNESSES' RAP SHEETS TO THE DEFENSE
16 LAWYERS, I HAVE THEM WHERE THEY ARE WELCOME TO SIT AND
17 REVIEW THEM THIS MORNING - - -

18 THE COURT: OKAY.

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: TO MAKE, OBVIOUSLY, WHATEVER
20 NOTES AND ALL THEY WANT TO MAKE OFF OF THEM, BUT, SO
21

22 THE COURT: OKAY. THEY'VE GOT THEM THERE FOR YOU
23 TO LOOK AT TODAY.

24 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR, THANK YOU
25 VERY MUCH.

1 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, MR. PALMER.

2 ANYTHING ELSE, MR. PALMER?

3 MR. PALMER: NOT AT THIS TIME, YOUR HONOR.

4 THE COURT: OKAY. WELL -- AND MS. ULLMAN, IS IT
5 YOU OR MR. WISE?

6 MS. ULLMAN: ME.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, MS. ULLMAN, LET ME
8 HEAR FROM YOU, PLEASE, MA'AM.

9 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, FIRST I WOULD RENEW MY
10 MOTION TO SEVER. I THINK THAT THERE ARE THREE REASONS
11 THAT THIS CASE SHOULD BE SEVERED IN MY CASE
12 SPECIFICALLY.

13 THE COURT: AND MS. ULLMAN, BEFORE YOU GO FORWARD
14 ON THAT, YOU'VE ALREADY HAD A MOTION TO SEVER ONE
15 TIME.

16 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

17 THE COURT: WHAT'S DIFFERENT?

18 MS. ULLMAN: I HAVE NEW EVIDENCE, AT THAT POINT
19 YOU TOLD ME THAT I SHOULD RENEW IT BUT THAT I WAS SURE
20 THAT IT WOULD ...

21 THE COURT: IF YOU'VE GOT SOMETHING NEW. WHAT IS
22 IT?

23 MS. ULLMAN: TWO THINGS. FIRST, WE DID RECEIVE A
24 STATEMENT DATED NOVEMBER THIRTIETH FROM THE ALLEGED
25 DRIVER IN THIS CASE. THE STATEMENT ACTUALLY, RONNIE

1 WASHINGTON STATES THAT HE PICKED UP ALL OF THESE
2 DEFENDANTS, DROVE THEM TO THIS INCIDENT SITE TWO
3 SEPARATE TIMES, WAITED OUTSIDE, THEY CAME OUT AND THEN
4 HE DROVE THEM AWAY. THIS STATEMENT OBVIOUSLY IS VERY
5 INCONSISTENT WITH EVERYBODY ELSE'S STATEMENT THAT THEY
6 ARE GOING TO OFFER SUCH AS PATRICK TYLER OR ASHLEY
7 PARSLEY.

8 THE COURT: WELL, ISN'T THAT GOOD FOR YOU?

9 MS. ULLMAN: I'M GETTING THERE.

10 THE COURT: OKAY, SORRY.

11 MS. ULLMAN: IF THIS WERE TO BE SEVERED, YOUR
12 HONOR, I WOULD HAVE THE ABILITY TO QUESTION
13 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT ABOUT WALTER HARRIS'S STATEMENT.
14 I UNDERSTAND THAT IN CERTAIN INSTANCES THAT STATEMENT,
15 OR ALL THREE STATEMENTS WOULD BE CONSIDERED HEARSAY.
16 IN THIS SITUATION, THOUGH, YOUR HONOR, THEY ARE NOT
17 HEARSAY. HEARSAY AS THE RULE STATES IS AN OUT OF
18 COURT STATEMENT OFFERED FOR THE TRUTH OF THE MATTER
19 ASSERTED. IN ONE OF THOSE STATEMENTS WALTER HARRIS
20 ACTUALLY STATES THAT RALPH COLEMAN HAD A RIFLE.
21 OBVIOUSLY, I'M NOT USING THAT STATEMENT FOR THE TRUTH
22 OF THE MATTER ASSERTED, I'M NOT TRYING TO PROVE RALPH
23 COLEMAN HAD A RIFLE. WHAT I'M SHOWING THROUGH WALTER
24 HARRIS'S THREE STATEMENTS COMPARED TO ASHLEY PARSLEY'S
25 TESTIMONY, PATRICK TYLER'S TESTIMONY, AND RONNIE

1 WASHINGTON'S TESTIMONY IS THAT ALL OF THE PEOPLE WHO
2 WERE EYE WITNESSES TO THIS HAVE COMPLETELY DIFFERENT
3 STORIES ABOUT WHO DID WHAT, WHO WAS WHERE, WHO HAD
4 WHAT. YOUR HONOR, I THINK THAT THAT EQUATES TO A
5 THIRD PARTY GUILT TYPE EVIDENCE. IN A TRIAL WHERE WE
6 ARE TRYING TO CLAIM THIRD PARTY GUILT, OBVIOUSLY WE
7 WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO DO THAT IF THAT PERSON WERE PART
8 OF THE TRIAL, AND IT SHOULD BE SEVERED. THIS IS NOT A
9 THIRD PARTY GUILT ISSUE BUT I THINK IT'S COMPARABLE
10 BECAUSE IF WE WERE SEVERED WE WOULD CERTAINLY BE ABLE
11 TO STATE THAT INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT SPOKE TO WALTER
12 HARRIS AND WALTER HARRIS X, Y AND Z, NOT BECAUSE WE'RE
13 OFFERING IT FOR THE TRUTH OF THE MATTER ASSERTED BUT
14 RATHER TO SHOW THE INCONSISTENCIES. WE DO NOT HAVE TO
15 HAVE WALTER HARRIS ON THE STAND, WE COULD GET THAT
16 THROUGH SHUMPERT. THE UNITED STATES SUPREME COURT HAS
17 STATED THAT THE WITNESS IS ALLOWED TO TESTIFY
18 REGARDING WHAT HE HAS HEARD AS LONG AS THAT TESTIMONY
19 IS NOT OFFERED FOR THE TRUTH OF THE MATTER ASSERTED.
20 AND AS I STATED, OBVIOUSLY, I WOULD NOT OFFER
21 TESTIMONY THAT MY CLIENT HAD A RIFLE FOR THE TRUTH OF
22 THE MATTER ASSERTED, THAT WOULD CERTAINLY BE AGAINST
23 MY CLIENT'S DEFENSE.

24 ALSO, YOUR HONOR, I THINK THAT IF WE DO HAVE
25 ANTAGONISTIC VIEWS IN THIS SITUATION, ONE OF MY -- ONE

1 OF MY ARGUMENTS IN THIS CASE IS THAT OBVIOUSLY, RALPH
2 COLEMAN WAS NOT THERE AND DID NOT PARTICIPATE IN THIS,
3 AND THAT WHILE HE WAS PICKED OUT BY PATRICK TYLER AND
4 THIS DRIVER, RONNIE WASHINGTON, HE CERTAINLY COULD
5 HAVE BEEN PICKED OUT BECAUSE HE IS CHRISTIAN COLEMAN'S
6 BROTHER. THEY LOOK ALIKE, EVERYBODY KNOWS THEY'RE
7 BROTHERS, THEY HANG AROUND EACH OTHER OFTEN, AND THEY
8 CERTAINLY COULD HAVE COME UP WITH THIS NAME, DUDE, AS
9 BEING CHRISTIAN COLEMAN'S BROTHER. OBVIOUSLY THEY'RE
10 CLAIMING THAT TO ARGUE THAT, I'M PUTTING CHRISTIAN
11 COLEMAN AT THE SCENE PARTICIPATING IN THIS. AND
12 CERTAINLY, I BELIEVE THAT HIS ATTORNEY WOULD FIND THAT
13 THAT IS AN ANTAGONISTIC VIEW. NOW, THE COURTS HAVE
14 DECIDED THAT JUST BECAUSE THERE ARE ANTAGONISTIC VIEWS
15 DOES NOT REQUIRE A SEVERANCE, IT ONLY REQUIRES
16 SEVERANCE WHEN THE JURY WOULD BELIEVE THAT BECAUSE
17 THOSE VIEWS ARE SO OPPOSITE THAT MOST -- THAT BOTH OF
18 THEM MUST BE WRONG AND THEY BOTH MUST BE GUILTY, AND
19 I THINK THAT THAT IS CERTAINLY A PROBLEM THAT WE COULD
20 HAVE HERE WITH ALL FIVE OF THEM SITTING HERE, AND MY
21 CLIENT SAYING, IT WASN'T ME, IF THEY PICKED ME IT MUST
22 HAVE BEEN BECAUSE OF MY BROTHER, THEY CERTAINLY WOULD
23 THINK THAT IT'S POSSIBLE THAT THEY BOTH MUST HAVE DONE
24 THIS BECAUSE THEIR VIEWS ARE SO OPPOSITE.

25 ALSO, YOUR HONOR, THERE WAS A SEARCH WARRANT DONE

1 AT WALTER HARRIS'S HOUSE. I OBVIOUSLY HAVE NO STANDING
2 TO OBJECT TO ANY OF THAT INFORMATION. THE SEARCH
3 WARRANT I BELIEVE PRODUCED A GUN, A TWENTY-TWO CALIBER
4 GUN AND SOME DRUGS. OBVIOUSLY, THAT INFORMATION COULD
5 PREJUDICE MY CLIENT. THERE'S EVIDENCE IN THIS THAT
6 THERE WERE WEAPONS USED. NONE OF THEM WERE A TWENTY-
7 TWO, BUT CERTAINLY, PUTTING A WEAPON IN A CO-
8 DEFENDANT'S HAND COULD PREJUDICE MY CLIENT, IT COULD
9 BASICALLY PUT BAD CHARACTER EVIDENCE AGAINST MY
10 CLIENT, AND WITH ME HAVING NO STANDING TO OBJECT TO
11 THAT, AND CERTAINLY, NO ABILITY TO REQUIRE HIS
12 ATTORNEY TO OBJECT TO IT, I WOULD STATE THAT THE TRIAL
13 NEEDS TO BE SEVERED DUE TO THAT. AND I DO HAVE OTHER
14 MOTIONS BUT I'M DONE WITH THAT ONE.

15 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. WHO WANTS TO ...

16 SOLICITOR PASCOE: VERY BRIEFLY, YOUR HONOR, GOOD
17 MORNING.

18 THE COURT: GOOD MORNING, MR. PASCOE.

19 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THERE ARE REALLY TWO POINTS
20 THAT DEFENSE COUNSEL MADE WITH REGARDS TO THE
21 SEVERANCE. FIRST, SHE SAID THAT THERE WERE
22 ANTAGONISTIC VIEWS. AS YOUR HONOR, WHENEVER, IN THE
23 HEARING LAST TIME THEY MENTIONED, AND YOU RULED THAT
24 THAT'S NOT A GROUND FOR SEVERANCE.

25 THE COURT: RIGHT.

1 SOLICITOR PASCOE: SO, THE NEXT ONE IS, THE
2 DEFENSE WANTS TO GET INTO WALTER HARRIS'S STATEMENT, A
3 CO-DEFENDANT. WELL, AS YOUR HONOR KNOWS, AND IT WAS
4 POINTED OUT THE LAST TIME YOU HAD A HEARING, THERE'S
5 ABSOLUTELY NO WAY THAT MS. ULLMAN CAN GET INTO THAT
6 STATEMENT BECAUSE IT WAS MADE BY A CO-DEFENDANT. BUT
7 MORE IMPORTANTLY, TO SHOW YOU, I HATE TO USE THE WORD,
8 RIDICULOUS, BUT HOW RIDICULOUS THAT ARGUMENT IS, I
9 WILL HAVE ABSOLUTELY NO OBJECTION IF MS. ULLMAN WOULD
10 LIKE TO ASK INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT, BUT ISN'T IT TRUE
11 THAT WALTER HARRIS SAID THAT MY CLIENT, RALPH COLEMAN,
12 HAD A RIFLE DURING THE MURDER? THERE'S NO WAY A
13 DEFENSE ATTORNEY WOULD EVEN WANT TO DO THAT AT TRIAL,
14 EVEN IF SHE WAS ALLOWED TO. AND OF COURSE, UNDER THE
15 RULES SHE'S NOT ALLOWED TO GO INTO A CO-DEFENDANT'S
16 STATEMENT.

17 THE COURT: OKAY.

18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: BUT I'LL TELL YOU, IF SHE
19 WANTS TO DO THAT, I'LL HAVE NO OBJECTION.

20 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR.

21 ALRIGHT, MS. ULLMAN, I UNDERSTAND YOUR CONCERNS
22 IN PREPARING, AS I UNDERSTAND -- I KNOW IT WOULD BE
23 EASIER ON ALL OF Y'ALL IF YOU JUST HAD, IF IT WAS JUST
24 ONE DEFENDANT CHARGED AND LIKE THAT, BUT I AM GOING TO
25 DENY YOUR MOTION FOR SEVERANCE. OKAY. AND I WILL NOTE

1 YOUR OBJECTION TO MY RULING AGAIN, AND AGAIN PRESERVE
2 IT AS HOPEFULLY WE'VE DONE FOR MR. PALMER'S. OKAY?

3 YES, MA'AM, MS. ULLMAN, WHAT ELSE?

4 MS. ULLMAN: NOT TO ANNOY THE COURT, BUT BEFORE
5 CLOSING ARGUMENTS I WOULD APPRECIATE, WITHOUT
6 ARGUMENT, IF I COULD JUST STATE THAT I RENEW MY
7 OBJECTION, OR MY MOTION TO SEVER BEFORE THE END OF THE
8 TRIAL, BEFORE THE JURY ACTUALLY ...

9 THE COURT: OKAY. NO, NO, NO, ANYTIME THAT,
10 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, ANYTIME Y'ALL WANT TO MAKE SURE
11 ANYTHING IS PRESERVED, IT DOES NOT BOTHER ME, IT DOES
12 NOT UPSET ME FOR Y'ALL TO MAKE THAT KNOWN ON THE
13 RECORD SO THAT WE CAN MAKE EVERY ATTEMPT POSSIBLE TO
14 PRESERVE ANY AND ALL OBJECTIONS Y'ALL HAVE TO MY
15 RULINGS, BECAUSE I KNOW NOTHING IS MORE FRUSTRATING TO
16 ME THAN READING OVER THE APPELLATE BRIEFS THAT SAYS,
17 WELL, IT DOESN'T LOOK LIKE THE ATTORNEY PRESERVED THE
18 OBJECTION ON THE RECORD. I THINK WE ARE TRYING TO DO
19 THAT SO HOPEFULLY WE HAVE PRESERVED THEM.

20 ANYTHING ELSE, MS. ULLMAN?

21 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

22 THE COURT: OKAY.

23 MS. ULLMAN: I WOULD ALSO MOTION THIS COURT TO
24 PRECLUDE ASHLEY PARSLEY FROM TESTIFYING ABOUT THE
25 IDENTIFICATION OF MY DEFENDANT, OR MY CLIENT.

1 THE COURT: ASHLEY?

2 MS. ULLMAN: ASHLEY PARSLEY, SHE WAS THE ALLEGED
3 WITNESS AT THE SCENE. I DO NOT DO THIS UNDER THE
4 NEAL-BIGGERS ISSUES THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN DECIDED. I
5 UNDERSTAND THAT THE PHOTO LINEUP HAS NOT BEEN FOUND TO
6 BE SUGGESTIVE AND THAT THAT COULD COME IN. MY BASIS
7 FOR THIS MOTION, YOUR HONOR, IS UNDER THE RULES OF
8 EVIDENCE. EVIDENCE RULE SIX O TWO REQUIRES A WITNESS
9 TO HAVE PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE OF ANY FACTS THAT THEY ARE
10 TESTIFYING ABOUT. DURING THE PRETRIAL NEAL- BIGGERS
11 HEARING, YOUR HONOR, ASHLEY PARSLEY TOOK THE STAND AND
12 WHEN SHE WAS QUESTIONED BY MR. WISE SHE SPECIFICALLY
13 STATED THAT SHE ACTUALLY WAS NOT SURE ABOUT HER
14 IDENTIFICATION OF RALPH COLEMAN. SHE ALSO STATED THAT
15 SHE DID NOT REALLY HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO SEE HIM
16 BECAUSE HER FACE WAS COMPLETELY DOWN AGAINST THE
17 GROUND. SHE ALSO STATED THAT SHE BASICALLY PICKED HIS
18 PHOTO OUT OF THAT LINEUP BASED ON INSTINCT, IT WAS NOT
19 BASED ON HER ABILITY TO PERCEIVE HIM OR SEE HIM. SHE
20 FLAT OUT SAID IT WAS INSTINCT, SOMETHING JUST TOLD ME
21 IT COULD HAVE BEEN HIM. IN HER OWN ACTUAL AFFIDAVIT
22 THAT GOES WITH THAT STATEMENT, OR GOES WITH THE LINEUP
23 SHE LITERALLY SAID, HE COULD HAVE BEEN ONE THAT CAME
24 IN THE APARTMENT, I'M NOT REALLY SURE. SO, I WOULD ASK
25 YOUR HONOR TO CONSIDER THE FACT THAT SHE HAS NO

1 PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE. SHE OBVIOUSLY DID NOT HAVE AN
2 OPPORTUNITY TO SEE MR. COLEMAN, AND SHE ACTUALLY
3 STATES THAT UNDER OATH IN HER TESTIMONY AT THE
4 PRETRIAL MOTIONS THAT WE HEARD A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO.
5 IN RELATION TO THAT, YOUR HONOR, I BELIEVE THAT SINCE
6 SHE HAS ABSOLUTELY NO FIRST HAND KNOWLEDGE OR ABILITY
7 TO PERCEIVE OR SEE MR. COLEMAN, THEN IF SHE WAS
8 ALLOWED TO TESTIFY, THE FACT WOULD BE CONSIDERED A LAY
9 WITNESS OPINION, AND THAT ANY OPINION OR INFERENCES
10 THAT ARE GIVEN BY A LAY WITNESS MUST BE RATIONALLY
11 BASED ON THAT WITNESS'S PERCEPTION AND HELPFUL TO
12 CLEAR THE UNDERSTANDING OF THE WITNESS'S TESTIMONY OR
13 DETERMINE A FACT AT ISSUE. OBVIOUSLY, SHE ADMITTED
14 SHE DIDN'T HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO PERCEIVE HIM. SHE
15 TOLD THAT BASICALLY ONE PERSON ENTERED THE HOUSE, PUT
16 A GUN IN HER FACE, PUT HER TO THE GROUND, AND SHE
17 NEVER LOOKED UP FROM THAT POINT ON. BASED ON INSTINCT
18 SHE PICKED RALPH COLEMAN OUT OF THE LINEUP. I WOULD
19 SAY THAT THAT IS AN OPINION AND SHE CERTAINLY HAD NO
20 ABILITY TO PERCEIVE ANYTHING TO BASE THAT OPINION ON
21 AND I WOULD ASK THAT HER TESTIMONY NOT BE ALLOWED
22 REGARDING THE IDENTIFICATION.

23 THE COURT: OF MR. COLEMAN, MR. RALPH COLEMAN?

24 MS. ULLMAN: OF MR. COLEMAN, RALPH COLEMAN.

25 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND WHICH ONE OF

1 Y'ALL WANTS TO ADDRESS THAT, OR IF ANYBODY WANTS TO?

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I'M NOT TOO SURE I KNOW
3 WHERE TO BEGIN, YOUR HONOR. I KIND OF THOUGHT WE HAD
4 ALREADY HANDLED THIS MATTER A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO, BUT
5 IT WOULD BE OUR POSITION THAT, JUST LIKE YOUR HONOR
6 RULED BACK THEN, THAT ALL OF THAT GOES TOWARDS THE
7 WEIGHT OF HER IDENTIFICATION, AND IT'S ONE OF THE
8 THINGS THAT MS. ULLMAN CAN CROSS-EXAMINE MS. PARSLEY
9 ON TO HER HEART'S CONTENT. SO, I MEAN, I THOUGHT THAT
10 WE HAD ADDRESSED THIS A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO ALREADY.
11 SO ...

12 THE COURT: AND I UNDERSTAND THAT, MR. SORENSON.
13 AND MS. ULLMAN, I -- YOU KNOW, I DO RECALL HER
14 TESTIMONY ABOUT THAT, AND WE HAVE HER TESTIMONY
15 PRESERVED FOR THE RECORD, SO IF SHE TRIES TO CHANGE IT
16 NOW, YOU KNOW, YOU'VE GOT THAT.

17 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

18 THE COURT: BUT I'M, I'M NOT GOING TO PRECLUDE
19 HER FROM MAKING ANY IDENTIFICATION IF SHE QUALIFIES
20 IT. YOU CAN GO OVER THE FACT WITH HER THAT SHE'S NOT
21 SURE. I THINK -- AND YOU GET TO EMPHASIZE THAT WITH
22 THE JURY AND AGAIN, MAKE IT AGAIN IN YOUR CLOSING.

23 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

24 THE COURT: SO, I'M GOING TO DENY YOUR MOTION TO
25 PRECLUDE HER IDENTIFICATION.

1 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

2 THE COURT: OKAY. AND I NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO
3 MY RULING AGAIN, WHICH I KNOW YOU WANT TO DO. OKAY?

4 MS. ULLMAN: MY NEXT MOTION IS IN REGARDS TO
5 EVIDENCE, OR A PICTURE WE RECEIVED THIS WEEK SOMETIME.
6 YOUR HONOR, I WAS GIVEN A PICTURE OF THE RIFLE, GIVEN
7 A PICTURE OF A RIFLE THAT THE STATE INTENDS TO USE
8 DEMONSTRATIVELY. THERE'S ABSOLUTELY NO EVIDENCE THAT
9 THAT RIFLE HAS ANYTHING -- THAT RIFLE IN THAT PICTURE
10 HAS ANYTHING TO DO WITH THIS INCIDENT. ACCORDING TO
11 BALLISTICS THERE ARE FIVE BULLETS FIRED THAT ARE SEVEN
12 POINT SIX-TWO, LIKE THEY'RE NINE MILLIMETER BULLETS.
13 ACCORDING TO THE BALLISTICS REPORTS THOSE BULLETS
14 COULD HAVE BEEN SHOT FROM UP TO NINE DIFFERENT
15 WEAPONS. OBVIOUSLY, ALL OF THOSE WEAPONS WOULD LOOK
16 DIFFERENT. CERTAINLY, THE SIZE OF THAT WEAPON SHOWN
17 THERE COULD CERTAINLY INCITE THE JURY. I UNDERSTAND
18 THAT IT'S DEMONSTRATIVE BUT THERE'S ABSOLUTELY NO
19 REASON THAT THEY COULDN'T GET INTO SIZE, WHAT IT
20 LOOKED LIKE WITH WHATEVER WITNESS THEY PLAN ON TRYING
21 TO GET THAT PICTURE IN THROUGH. CERTAINLY, IF PATRICK
22 TYLER SAW THAT WEAPON THEY COULD ASK HIM, DESCRIBE THE
23 WEAPON, WAS IT BIG, WAS IT LITTLE, WAS IT A RIFLE, WAS
24 IT A HAND GUN? USE YOUR HANDS AND TELL ME HOW BIG YOU
25 THINK IT WAS. BUT THAT RIFLE HAS NOTHING TO DO WITH

1 THIS, YOUR HONOR, AND I'M AFRAID THAT IT COULD INCITE
2 THE JURY TO BASICALLY PREJUDICE THE DEFENDANT BY
3 MAKING THE JURY THINK THAT THAT RIFLE WAS USED, AND
4 THERE'S NO WAY THAT THEY CAN PROVE THAT.

5 THE COURT: DO Y'ALL HAVE A COPY?

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: WE GAVE IT TO THEM, YES,
7 SIR.

8 MR. MELLARD: I DO, YES, SIR.

9 THE COURT: MR. PALMER, DO YOU HAVE SOMETHING TO
10 SAY TO THAT OR ARE YOU JUST HELPING ...

11 MR. PALMER: NO, I'LL JUST LET ...

12 THE COURT: OH, YOU'RE JUST BEING A GENTLEMAN.
13 THANK YOU, SIR. OKAY, I'M SORRY.

14 MR. SORENSON.

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: WE OBTAINED THOSE
16 PHOTOGRAPHS AND BASICALLY IT'S TWO PHOTOGRAPHS, IT'S
17 THE LEFT SIDE AND THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE SAME GUN. WE
18 OBTAINED THEM FROM THE FIREARMS EXPERT IN THIS CASE AT
19 SLED AS BEING ONE OF THE TYPE OF GUNS THAT POTENTIALLY
20 COULD HAVE FIRED FIVE OF THE CASINGS THAT WERE FOUND
21 IN THE RESIDENCE. AND IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING, AND LET
22 THE SOLICITOR CORRECT ME IF I'M MISTAKEN, THAT AT
23 LEAST ONE OF OUR WITNESSES WILL BE ABLE TO IDENTIFY,
24 FROM LOOKING AT THOSE PHOTOGRAPHS, AS THAT BEING
25 CONSISTENT WITH THE RIFLES THAT WERE USED IN THIS

1 CASE. SO, THEREFORE, THEY WOULD BE USED FOR
2 DEMONSTRATIVE PURPOSES, AND I JUST DON'T SEE HOW AN
3 EIGHT BY TEN PIECE OF PAPER SHOWING A PICTURE OF A
4 RIFLE CAN INCITE AND SOMEHOW, I MEAN, YOU KNOW. I
5 SUPPOSE WE COULD PROBABLY GO GET A SAMPLE OF THAT GUN
6 TO BE USED FOR DEMONSTRATIVE PURPOSES, AND I COULD SEE
7 MAYBE HOW THAT MIGHT BE, BUT JUST A PIECE OF PAPER
8 JUST TO GIVE THE JURY SOME IDEA OF, I MEAN, EXACTLY
9 WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WEAPON-WISE, BECAUSE WE WERE
10 NOT ABLE TO RECOVER EITHER OF THE RIFLES THAT WERE
11 ALLEGEDLY USED IN THIS CASE.

12 THE COURT: OKAY, YOU'RE INDICATING THAT THE
13 EXPERT WILL BE ABLE TO SAY THE BULLET CAME FROM THAT
14 TYPE OF WEAPON, IS THAT WHAT YOU'RE INDICATING?

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: RIGHT. HE GIVES A LIST OF
16 SEVERAL TYPES AND THAT BEING ONE OF THEM, IT'S AN SKS
17 RIFLE, THAT BEING ONE OF THEM THAT POTENTIALLY COULD
18 HAVE FIRED THOSE SHELL CASINGS, IT COULD BE THAT TYPE.
19 AND HE'LL BE ABLE TO EXPLAIN THAT, I MEAN, THAT ALSO,
20 BUT AS I SAID, WE HAVE AT LEAST ONE WITNESS THAT WILL
21 BE ABLE TO, LOOKING AT THOSE WOULD BE ABLE TO SAY
22 THAT, YES, THAT IS CONSISTENT WITH THE TYPE OF WEAPON,
23 AT LEAST ONE OF THE RIFLES THAT WAS USED IN THIS
24 INCIDENT. AND I THINK THAT WOULD AID THE JURY THEN IN
25 UNDERSTANDING WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT MORE SO THAN

1 SOMEHOW EXCITE OR INCITE THEM.

2 THE COURT: OKAY, MS. ULLMAN, LET ME HEAR FROM
3 YOU IN RESPONSE.

4 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, THE PROBLEM IS, THE SLED
5 PERSON WOULD SAY THAT THAT COULD BE ONE OF THE GUNS.
6 THEY'RE OBVIOUSLY NOT TRYING TO ENTER PICTURES OF ALL
7 NINE OF THE GUNS. THEY CERTAINLY DIDN'T SHOW PICTURES
8 OF ALL NINE OF THE POTENTIAL WEAPONS TO THIS POTENTIAL
9 WITNESS TO HAVE HIM PICK OUT. THEY'VE GOT THEIR
10 PICTURE, SHOW THE GENTLEMAN, AND OF COURSE, HE SAYS,
11 YEAH, THAT WAS JUST LIKE THE RIFLE THAT WAS USED.

12 THEY ALSO HAVE A BIG BAYONET ON IT, AND THERE'S
13 OBVIOUSLY ...

14 THE COURT: WHAT?

15 MS. ULLMAN: THERE'S A BAYONET ON THE END OF IT,
16 IT'S BASICALLY A MILITARY RIFLE.

17 COURT REPORTER: A BAYONET?

18 THE COURT: A BAYONET.

19 MS. ULLMAN: A BAYONET, WHICH I THINK COULD BE
20 USED TO INCITE THE JURY. THERE'S NO EVIDENCE ...

21 THE COURT: IN THE PICTURE, THEY HAVE A PICTURE
22 OF THE BAYONET? I DIDN'T...

23 MS. ULLMAN: IT'S FOLDED UNDER IT, YOUR HONOR, IT
24 FOLDS UP UNDER IT, BUT OBVIOUSLY, THE JURY'S GOING TO
25 HAVE THIS TO LOOK AT IN THE JURY ROOM AND STUDY. IF

1 WE'VE SEEN THAT THERE'S A BAYONET IT'S CERTAINLY NOT
2 IMPOSSIBLE TO SEE.

3 THE OTHER ISSUE, YOUR HONOR, THERE'S OTHER
4 EVIDENCE THAT THE BULLETS THAT BELONG TO A NINE
5 MILLIMETER, AND THE STATE IS CERTAINLY NOT TRYING TO
6 INTRODUCE ANY PICTURES OF A NINE MILLIMETER WEAPON TO
7 SHOW DEMONSTRATIVELY WHAT THAT GUN WOULD LOOK LIKE.
8 SO, IF ALL THEY'RE DOING IS TRYING TO SHOW THE JURY
9 WHAT THE GUN COULD HAVE LOOKED LIKE WHY ARE WE PICKING
10 THE GIGANTIC RIFLE WITH A BAYONET AND NOT THE NINE
11 MILLIMETER?

12 THE COURT: OKAY. WELL, I'M NOT -- YOU KNOW, I'M
13 NOT GOING TO RULE ON YOUR MOTION RIGHT NOW. I'M AWARE
14 OF IT. WHEN WE GET THERE AFTER I HEAR THE PERSON
15 TESTIFY I WILL DECIDE WHAT I'M GOING TO DO WITH THAT.
16 OKAY? I'M NOT INCLINED TO -- LET ME JUST SEE WHAT THE
17 EXPERT SAYS. OKAY?

18 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: OKAY, SO I WILL RESERVE ANY RULING ON
20 THAT AND YOU CAN RENEW YOUR MOTION AT THAT TIME.

21 ANYTHING ELSE, MS. ULLMAN?

22 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

23 THE COURT: HUH?

24 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

25 THE COURT: OKAY.

1 MS. ULLMAN: TWO THINGS REGARDING INVESTIGATOR
2 ETHERIDGE, WHO I UNDERSTAND IS NOT WITH THE SHERIFF'S
3 OFFICE ANY LONGER AND IS NOT GOING TO BE CALLED AS A
4 WITNESS. IN HIS REPORT THAT HE TURNS IN, HIS
5 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT HE STATES TWO THINGS: ONE, THAT
6 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT SPOKE WITH A WITNESS ABOUT A
7 NINE MILLIMETER THAT HE HAD RECOVERED THAT HE FELT
8 COULD HAVE BEEN USED IN THIS INCIDENT. THAT NINE
9 MILLIMETER HAS NEVER BEEN PRODUCED IN ANY FASHION,
10 IT'S THE ONLY TIME WE HEAR ABOUT IT. I'M NOT SURE IF
11 IT WAS A MISTAKE OR IF HE REALLY DID FIND A NINE
12 MILLIMETER, BUT THERE'S CERTAINLY NO BALLISTICS REPORT
13 ON ANY NINE MILLIMETER. SO, I WOULD JUST ASK YOUR
14 HONOR TO NOT ALLOW INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT OR ANYBODY
15 ELSE FROM THE STATE'S WITNESSES TO DISCUSS A NINE
16 MILLIMETER THAT HAS BEEN FOUND THAT COULD HAVE BEEN
17 TESTED, BECAUSE THERE IS NO EVIDENCE OF THAT OTHER
18 THAN INVESTIGATOR ETHERIDGE STATING SO.

19 THE COURT: AND ETHERIDGE IS NOT GOING TO
20 TESTIFY?

21 MS. ULLMAN: FROM WHAT I UNDERSTAND HE IS NOT.

22 SOLICITOR PASCOE: HE MIGHT OR MIGHT NOT, YOUR
23 HONOR.

24 THE COURT: OKAY.

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: BUT WE DON'T INTEND ON GETTING

1 ANYTHING IN ABOUT A NINE MILLIMETER.

2 THE COURT: OKAY, THAT TAKES CARE OF THAT. OKAY.

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: OTHER THAN, OF COURSE, THAT A
4 NINE MILLIMETER WAS USED DURING THE MURDER. WE'RE NOT
5 GOING TO PUT IT IN.

6 THE COURT: RIGHT, RIGHT.

7 MS. ULLMAN: WE JUST DON'T WANT TO GET INTO ONE
8 BEING FOUND.

9 THE COURT: OKAY.

10 MS. ULLMAN: ALSO IN REGARDS TO INVESTIGATOR
11 ETHERIDGE, HE STATES IN HIS INCIDENT REPORT, AND I
12 HAVE SPOKEN TO THE SOLICITOR ABOUT THIS, HE STATES IN
13 HIS INCIDENT REPORT THAT, "I DID OBTAIN A STATEMENT
14 FROM SHANNON MITCHELL," AND THAT ON A LATER DATE HE
15 CAME IN AND ADDED TO THIS STATEMENT. WE DO NOT HAVE A
16 STATEMENT FROM SHANNON MITCHELL. I ASKED SOLICITOR
17 SORENSON ABOUT THIS, HE TELLS ME THAT INVESTIGATOR
18 SHUMPERT TOLD HIM THAT THEY NEVER DID TAKE A WRITTEN
19 STATEMENT FROM HIM, THAT IT MUST HAVE BEEN A MISTAKE,
20 BUT OBVIOUSLY, INVESTIGATOR ETHERIDGE WROTE THAT THEY
21 TOOK A WRITTEN STATEMENT FROM HIM AND THAT HE HAD
22 ADDED TO THIS STATEMENT. YOUR HONOR, IN THE
23 DISCOVERY, I KNOW WHEN I RECEIVED MY DISCOVERY PACKET
24 WE HAD A RECEIPT OF PAYMENT FROM THE STATE FARM
25 INSURANCE WHERE INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT HAD PAID HIS

1 INSURANCE FOR HIS CAR. MY POINT IN BRINGING THIS OUT
2 IS, MAYBE THE STATEMENT THAT WE DON'T HAVE IS WHEREVER
3 HE MEANT TO PUT THIS. MY POINT IS, UNDER BRADY THE
4 STATE HAS A DUTY TO SEEK OUT AND TURN OVER ANY AND ALL
5 EVIDENCE. THERE'S EVIDENCE THE STATEMENT WAS TAKEN.
6 I'D JUST ASK THAT THEY OVER THE WEEKEND HAVE
7 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT CHECK EVERYWHERE HE POSSIBLY CAN
8 TO FIND THE STATEMENTS THAT COULD BE INCULPATORY, BUT
9 THEY CAN ALSO EXCULPATE MY CLIENT. AND I THINK THE
10 FACT THAT WE HAVE A RECEIPT FROM INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT
11 ON AN INCIDENT THAT HAS NOTHING TO DO WITH THIS CASE
12 SHOWS THAT MAYBE THERE WAS SOME SHUFFLING AND HE JUST
13 MADE A MISTAKE. I'M NOT ACCUSING ANYBODY OF ANYTHING,
14 OBVIOUSLY, I'M JUST STATING THAT THERE OBVIOUSLY COULD
15 HAVE BEEN A MISTAKE. THE AMOUNT OF EVIDENCE WE HAVE
16 IN THIS IS VERY BIG. I'M JUST ASKING THAT THEY MAKE
17 THE EFFORT THIS WEEKEND TO SEARCH EVERYWHERE THEY
18 POSSIBLY CAN, BECAUSE INVESTIGATOR ETHERIDGE STATES A
19 STATEMENT WAS TAKEN.

20 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. SORENSON, YOU --
21 OBVIOUSLY, Y'ALL HAVE ALREADY TOLD THEM THAT YOU DON'T
22 HAVE THE STATEMENT.

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR. CAN I ADDRESS A
24 COUPLE OF THINGS?

25 THE COURT: SURE.

1 SOLICITOR SORENSON: FIRST OF ALL, IN THE
2 INVESTIGATIVE REPORT IT DOES NOT SAY THAT THEY TOOK A
3 WRITTEN STATEMENT FROM MR. MITCHELL. IT SAYS, I DID
4 OBTAIN A STATEMENT FROM MITCHELL.

5 THE COURT: OKAY.

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OKAY. SO, I -- AND I MEAN,
7 I'VE LOOKED AT IT, AND ONE OF THE THINGS WHEN I WENT
8 MONTHS, WENT LOOKING BACK THROUGH, LOOKING TO SEE, AND
9 IT IS NOT IN THE CASE FILE, AND THERE'S NO INDICATION
10 -- SO, I THINK, I MEAN, YOU KNOW, IF SOMEBODY CAME IN
11 AND TALKED TO YOU AND YOU TAKE A STATEMENT FROM HIM,
12 AND THEY'RE TELLING YOU WHAT THEY SAID. BUT I'M NOT
13 AWARE OF A WITNESS STATEMENT. I MEAN, HONESTLY, I
14 DON'T KNOW WHERE ELSE, AND I'M NOT GOING TO HAVE THEM
15 GO BACK AND LOOK THROUGH EVERY CASE JACKET WHEN, I
16 MEAN, IT DOESN'T SAY, I MEAN, THAT'S SOMETHING THAT
17 MS. ULLMAN DID MIS-SPEAK ON, IT DOESN'T SAY, I TOOK A
18 WRITTEN STATEMENT FROM HIM.

19 THE COURT: OKAY. JUST A STATEMENT. OKAY, I'M
20 WITH YOU.

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: BUT THAT WOULD BE ALL I
22 WOULD HAVE WITH REGARD TO THAT. I MEAN, OBVIOUSLY,
23 I'LL ASK HIM AGAIN ABOUT IT. I'VE ASKED ABOUT IT,
24 I'VE LOOKED THROUGH, I'VE GOTTEN THEIR CASE FILE AND
25 I'VE GONE THROUGH IT MYSELF. SO ...

1 THE COURT: OKAY. IF YOU WILL DO THAT, THE COURT
2 WOULD APPRECIATE IT. OKAY?

3 ANYTHING ELSE, MS. ULLMAN?

4 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

5 THE COURT: OKAY.

6 MS. ULLMAN: I FILED A MOTION BASICALLY RIGHT
7 AFTER OUR LAST PRETRIAL MOTION HEARING FOR THE STATE
8 TO COMPEL THE IDENTIFY OF MEAT-G. HE IS A WITNESS
9 THEY INTEND TO CALL DURING REBUTTAL OR IMPEACHMENT OF
10 RALPH COLEMAN. HE OBVIOUSLY HAS A SIXTH AMENDMENT
11 RIGHT TO CONFRONT -

12 THE COURT: TO COMPEL WHO? WHO IS THE WITNESS?

13 MS. ULLMAN: MEAT-G. HE IS A NAME THAT'S BEEN
14 WRITTEN ON THESE LETTERS THAT WERE ALLEGEDLY PASSED
15 THROUGHOUT THE JAIL THAT THEY ARE TRYING TO ATTRIBUTE
16 TO MY CLIENT.

17 THE COURT: OKAY.

18 MS. ULLMAN: OBVIOUSLY, MY CLIENT HAS A SIXTH
19 AMENDMENT RIGHT TO PRESENT A FULL DEFENSE AND ALSO TO
20 BE APPRISED OF THE EVIDENCE AGAINST HIM. I ASKED THEM
21 TO IDENTIFY HIM AT THE LAST HEARING AND THEY TOLD ME
22 THEY ARE NOT READY TO DO THAT. WE START TRIAL
23 MONDAY. I WOULD APPRECIATE IT IF THEY DON'T WANT TO
24 TELL ME HIS NAME AND WHERE I CAN FIND HIM, IF THEY
25 WOULD MAKE HIM AVAILABLE FOR ME TO SPEAK WITH HIM IN

1 THEIR OFFICE. I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT AND IMPERATIVE
2 TO MY CLIENT'S CASE FOR ME TO KNOW WHAT THEY'RE GOING
3 TO SAY. I MEAN, OBVIOUSLY, IT MIGHT HAVE SOME BEARING
4 ON WHETHER OR NOT MY CLIENT DECIDES TO TAKE THE STAND.
5 AND I UNDERSTAND HE'S NOT WRITTEN ANY STATEMENTS SO
6 THAT THEY DON'T HAVE TO PRODUCE THOSE STATEMENTS TO
7 ME, AND I UNDERSTAND THAT. BUT BY NOT HAVING HIM
8 WRITE A WRITTEN STATEMENT ABOUT WHAT HE WOULD SAY,
9 IT'S ALLOWING THEM TO PRECLUDE ME FROM FINDING
10 ANYTHING OUT ABOUT HIM. THERE'S NO WAY FOR ME TO KNOW
11 WHO THIS GUY IS WITHOUT THEM TELLING ME.

12 THE COURT: AND YOUR BASIS OF THEM GIVING YOU
13 THIS INFORMATION PRIOR TO TRIAL IS?

14 MS. ULLMAN: HE'S A WITNESS AGAINST MY CLIENT,
15 AND I THINK THAT MY CLIENT, UNDER THE SIXTH AMENDMENT,
16 HAS THE RIGHT TO BE APPRISED OF THE EVIDENCE AGAINST
17 HIM SO HE CAN MAKE AN INFORMED DECISION AS TO HOW TO
18 PROCEED IN THE TRIAL, INCLUDING WHETHER OR NOT HE
19 WOULD TESTIFY. KNOWING WHAT HE WOULD SAY ON
20 IMPEACHMENT OR REBUTTAL WOULD OBVIOUSLY HAVE A BEARING
21 ON WHETHER MY CLIENT DECIDES TO TESTIFY OR NOT. AND I
22 HAVE NO WAY OF KNOWING THAT WHEN THEY WON'T EVEN TELL
23 ME WHO HE IS. NOW, I UNDERSTAND THAT IF THEY TOLD ME
24 WHO HE WAS OR WHERE HE WAS OR PRODUCED HIM THAT HE
25 COULD AT THAT POINT TELL ME, I REFUSE TO TALK TO YOU,

1 BUT I THINK IT'S HIS RIGHT TO DO THAT. AND WITH THEM
2 NOT TELLING ME WHO HE IS I HAVE NO ABILITY TO EVEN ASK
3 HIM, WOULD YOU BE WILLING TO TALK TO ME?

4 THE COURT: OKAY.

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YOUR HONOR, MR. EVINWORST AND
6 I CAME UP YESTERDAY WITH A TENTATIVE WITNESS LIST FOR
7 THE TRIAL ON MONDAY. WE ARE GOING TO GIVE ALL OF THE
8 ATTORNEYS IF THEY WANTED A COPY OF THIS TENTATIVE
9 LIST, AND ON THAT LIST IS MEAT-G'S REAL NAME. HIS
10 NAME IS DEMETRIUS JENKINS. SO, SHE'LL HAVE THAT ON
11 THE WITNESS LIST. HE HAS BEEN VERY COOPERATIVE, HE
12 WAS FRIENDS WITH RALPH COLEMAN, SO THEY SHOULD KNOW
13 EACH OTHER. BUT ANYWAY, WE'RE GOING TO GIVE THAT TO
14 HER TODAY.

15 THE COURT: OKAY.

16 COURT REPORTER: HOW DO YOU SPELL THAT MEAT-G?

17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: M-E-A-T -- IT WAS THAT KIND OF
18 MEAT, RIGHT? AND A G, JUST A G.

19 COURT REPORTER: OH, JUST THE LETTER, G?

20 THE COURT: OH, I SPELLED THAT WRONG, I'M SORRY.

21 COURT REPORTER: JUST THE LETTER, G?

22 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, MA'AM.

23 COURT REPORTER: OKAY.

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. MS. ULLMAN.

25 MS. ULLMAN: THREE VERY SHORT ...

1 THE COURT: YOU AND MR. WISE HAVE BEEN VERY BUSY.

2 MS. ULLMAN: THREE VERY SHORT MOTIONS, I

3 APOLOGIZE, YOUR HONOR.

4 THE COURT: OKAY.

5 MS. ULLMAN: THE TWO SIMPLE ONES, OBVIOUSLY,
6 WE'VE REQUESTED THAT THE WITNESSES BE SEQUESTERED IN
7 THIS SO THAT THEY ARE NOT IN THE COURTROOM TO HEAR
8 WHAT EVERYBODY ELSE IS SAYING.

9 THE COURT: I'M ASSUMING WE DON'T HAVE ANY
10 OBJECTION TO SEQUESTERING WITNESSES ON BOTH SIDES?

11 SOLICITOR SORENSON: BOTH SIDES, YES, YOUR HONOR,
12 THANK YOU.

13 THE COURT: OKAY.

14 MS. ULLMAN: AND WE OBVIOUSLY DON'T HAVE ANY
15 OBJECTION.

16 AND THE OTHER SIMPLE MOTION, I UNDERSTAND WE'RE
17 GOING TO HAVE FIVE DEFENDANTS IN HERE, ALL CHARGED
18 WITH MURDER AND OTHER VERY SERIOUS CHARGES. I ASSUME
19 THAT THERE WILL BE EXTRA SECURITY IN THE COURTROOM DUE
20 TO THAT?

21 THE COURT: WELL, NO, MA'AM, WE'RE JUST GOING TO
22 HAVE DEPUTY ASBERRY, THAT'S ALL WE NEED.

23 MS. ULLMAN: OKAY. IF THAT IS TRUE, I DON'T HAVE
24 A MOTION, BUT IF IT IS NOT TRUE I WOULD ASK THIS COURT
25 TO REQUIRE THE EXTRAS TO CARRY, WEAR CIVILIAN CLOTHES.

1 THE COURT: OH, WE HAVE ALREADY TAKEN CARE OF
2 THAT THIS MORNING. WE'RE GOING TO HAVE, WE WILL BE AN
3 ARMED CAMP. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO IT.

4 MS. ULLMAN: ONE LAST MOTION.

5 THE COURT: OKAY.

6 MS. ULLMAN: I WOULD MOTION YOUR HONOR TO HAVE
7 THE STATE TO ALLOW US TO LOOK AT THEIR JURY BOOK.
8 THEY KEEP A BOOK OF ALL OF THE RAP SHEETS ON ANY
9 POTENTIAL JURORS. MY BASIS FOR THIS MOTION, YOUR
10 HONOR, IS, THE STATE HAS THE ABILITY TO DO AN NCIC ON
11 ANY PERSON THEY CHOOSE. THE DEFENSE ATTORNEY HAS NO
12 ABILITY, WE COULD DO A SLED REPORT AT A COST OF, I
13 THINK, TWENTY-FIVE DOLLARS A PIECE. OBVIOUSLY, AS
14 APPOINTED ATTORNEYS WE CERTAINLY DON'T HAVE THE FUNDS
15 WITHIN OUR OFFICE, NOR AS A PUBLIC DEFENDER DO I THINK
16 HAVE THE ABILITY TO GET A FUNDING ORDER TO DO A RAP
17 SHEET ON TWO HUNDRED PEOPLE, WHICH IS WHAT THE LIST OF
18 THE JURY POOL IS. NOW, I UNDERSTAND THAT THEY DON'T
19 HAVE TO GIVE ME A COPY OF THIS, AND I'M NOT ASKING
20 THEM TO. NOW, I HAVE PREVIOUSLY RESEARCHED THIS,
21 YOUR HONOR, AND I CANNOT FIND THE CASE RIGHT NOW IN
22 LOOKING AND LOOKING FOR IT.

23 THE COURT: IT DOESN'T HELP YOU, THEN, DOES IT?

24 MS. ULLMAN: WHEN I FIND IT I WILL GET IT TO YOU,
25 BUT WHAT I CAN FIND IT ON ANOTHER STATE IS, IN THAT

1 CASE IT WAS A DEATH PENALTY, AND IN THAT CASE THEY
2 ACTUALLY DID RULE AGAINST MY ARGUMENT, STATING THAT
3 THE DEFENSE ATTORNEY DID NOT HAVE THE RIGHT TO SEE THE
4 JURY BOOK. BUT THE REASONING BEHIND THAT WAS BECAUSE
5 IT WAS A DEATH PENALTY THEY HAD EXTENDED VOIR DIRE AND
6 THEY COULD BASICALLY ASK THE JURORS ANY QUESTIONS THEY
7 WANTED. THEREFORE, IF THEY WANTED TO KNOW IF THEY HAD
8 EVER BEEN PROSECUTED AND IF THEY HAD EVER BEEN IN ANY
9 KIND OF TROUBLE, SIMPLE POSSESSION, DUI, YOU KNOW,
10 ANYTHING THAT YOUR HONOR WOULDN'T FIND OUT ABOUT
11 BECAUSE YOU ONLY ASK ABOUT FELONIES, THEY WOULD HAVE
12 THE ABILITY THROUGH THE EXTENDED DEATH PENALTY VOIR
13 DIRE TO ASK THOSE KINDS OF QUESTIONS. OBVIOUSLY, TIME
14 CONSTRAINTS AND THIS NOT BEING A DEATH PENALTY DOESN'T
15 ALLOW US TO DO THAT. SO, I WOULD ASK YOUR HONOR, ANY
16 WITNESS THAT THEY ARE WANTING TO -- WELL, BASICALLY ON
17 THE JURORS IN GENERAL WE HAVE THE ABILITY AND THE
18 RIGHT TO KNOW AS MUCH AS THEY DO. THERE'S NO REASON
19 THE STATE SHOULD BE IN A BETTER POSITION TO PICK A
20 JURY THAN THE DEFENSE. IT IS THEIR BURDEN TO PROVE
21 THIS, THE DEFENDANTS ARE SITTING THERE INNOCENT.

22 THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YOUR HONOR, I APPRECIATE
24 DEFENSE COUNSEL BEING HONEST ABOUT THAT, BUT EVEN IN
25 DEATH PENALTY CASES THEY'RE NOT ALLOWED TO LOOK AT OUR

1 JURY STRIKE BOOK BECAUSE THAT'S ALL WORK PRODUCT. SO,
2 I -- CERTAINLY, WE OBJECT TO THAT. SHE'S NOT ENTITLED
3 TO THAT.

4 BUT BEFORE I FORGET, I WOULD LIKE TO BRING UP ONE
5 THING, NOT REALLY A MOTION, BUT AS TO DEFENSE
6 ATTORNEYS, I KNOW THAT ONLY THREE OF THE DEFENDANTS
7 FILED ALIBI DEFENSES WITH US, OR FILED MOTIONS. I
8 BELIEVE IT'S RALPH COLEMAN, DANNY RYANT AND MARIO
9 SHIVERS. WE WOULD ASK -- AND THEY'VE BEEN UP FRONT IN
10 GIVING US THE NAMES OF THE WITNESSES IN THOSE CASES.

11 THE COURT: OKAY.

12 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I WOULD ASK ANYTIME NEXT WEEK,
13 MONDAY OR TUESDAY, IF THEY COULD GIVE US THEIR DATES
14 OF BIRTH SO WE COULD RUN RAP SHEETS ON THEM, SOMETIME
15 BEFORE THEY TESTIFY.

16 THE COURT: FOR THE WITNESSES?

17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, ON THEIR WITNESSES,
18 YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. BEFORE I GO TO THAT,
20 MS. ULLMAN, I DO THINK IT'S THEIR WORK PRODUCT OR PART
21 OF THEIR INVESTIGATION THING, SO I'M GOING TO DENY
22 YOUR MOTION ON THAT, BUT I WILL NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO
23 THAT AND PRESERVE YOUR REASONING FOR THE RECORD. OKAY?

24 MS. ULLMAN: I JUST HAVE ONE LAST THING.

25 THE COURT: OKAY.

1 MS. ULLMAN: IN REGARDS TO ALIBI WITNESSES, I DID
2 TURN IN AN ALIBI DEFENSE AND GAVE THE STATE MY
3 WITNESSES AND HOW TO FIND THEM. I DON'T HAVE BIRTH
4 DATES BUT I'LL GET THEM TO YOU, I HAVE NO PROBLEM WITH
5 THAT. BUT I HAVE SPOKEN WITH MY ALIBI WITNESS, AND
6 SHE TOLD ME THAT INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT WENT AND SPOKE
7 WITH HER, WHICH I EXPECTED AND UNDERSTAND. SHE TOLD
8 ME THAT SHE GAVE A WRITTEN STATEMENT TO INVESTIGATOR
9 SHUMPERT AND I HAVE NOT BEEN PROVIDED WITH THAT
10 STATEMENT SO I WOULD ASK THAT IT BE TURNED OVER, THE
11 STATEMENT OF SHANIQUA MOORE. AND THAT IS MY LAST
12 MOTION.

13 THE COURT: OKAY.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IT'S OUR POSITION SHE'S NOT
15 ENTITLED TO THAT. I MEAN, THAT'S HER WITNESS, THAT'S
16 NOT A WITNESS WE'RE INTENDING ON CALLING.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. IT'S ...

18 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IF SHE CHOOSES TO TESTIFY
19 THE WITNESS ALONG WITH MS. ULLMAN WILL BE PROVIDED A
20 COPY OF THE STATEMENT WHEN WE CROSS-EXAMINE HER, BUT I
21 DON'T THINK SHE'S ENTITLED TO THAT BEFORE THEN.

22 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR. WHY DO YOU
23 THINK YOU'RE ENTITLED TO IT BEFORE THEN? I MEAN, I
24 KNOW WHY YOU WANT IT.

25 MS. ULLMAN: BECAUSE UNDER RULE FIVE AND UNDER

1 BRADY, YOUR HONOR, THE STATE IS REQUIRED TO PROVIDE US
2 WITH ANY WRITTEN --- BASICALLY, ANY EVIDENCE THAT THEY
3 HAVE PRODUCED, WHETHER IT BE INCULPATORY OR
4 EXCULPATORY. JUST BECAUSE IT'S A STATEMENT TAKEN FROM
5 A WITNESS THAT I INTEND TO CALL DOESN'T MEAN THAT I
6 WOULDN'T GET A COPY.

7 THE COURT: OKAY.

8 MS. ULLMAN: YOU KNOW, BRADY STATES THAT THEY
9 MUST PROVIDE ANY INCULPATORY OR EXCULPATORY
10 INFORMATION THAT THEY HAVE IN THEIR HANDS.

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, YOUR HONOR, BRADY SAYS,
12 EXCULPATORY INFORMATION, NOT INCULPATORY.

13 THE COURT: THAT'S CORRECT.

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: FURTHERMORE, RULE FIVE SAYS
15 THAT THEY'RE ENTITLED TO THE STATEMENT PRIOR TO THE
16 WITNESS TESTIFYING.

17 THE COURT: YEAH, I MEAN, I SEE WHERE IT SAYS,
18 PRIOR TO THE WITNESS TESTIFYING, YOU KNOW, BECAUSE
19 I'VE GOT RULE FIVE RIGHT HERE IN FRONT OF ME AND I WAS
20 JUST TRYING TO -- BEFORE THAT PERSON TESTIFIES THEY
21 WILL GIVE YOU A COPY OF THE STATEMENT.

22 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. WELL, THAT'S WHERE WE'RE GOING
24 TO LEAVE IT.

25 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

1 THE COURT: OKAY? BUT I'LL NOTE YOUR OBJECTION
2 TO ME NOT REQUIRING THEM TO DO IT SOONER THAN THAT.

3 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

4 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, WHAT ELSE? I MEAN,
5 I'M SORRY, MS. ULLMAN.

6 MS. ULLMAN: I'M THROUGH.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MR. LACKEY?

8 MS. LACKEY: I HAVE NOTHING AT THIS TIME, YOUR
9 HONOR.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. MELLARD?

11 MR. MELLARD: JUST A FEW. YOU'VE ALREADY RULED ON
12 A LOT OF THESE MOTIONS, BUT JUST FOR THE RECORD, I'D
13 LIKE TO NOTE THEM.

14 THE COURT: OKAY.

15 MR. MELLARD: MR. RYANT IS ALSO ASKING THE COURT
16 TO SEQUESTER THE WITNESSES.

17 THE COURT: OKAY.

18 MR. MELLARD: HE'S ALSO REQUESTING THE JURY BOOK
19 FROM THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE. AND WE UNDERSTAND YOU'VE
20 ALREADY RULED ON THAT.

21 THE COURT: YEAH, OKAY. NO, I MEAN, YOU JUST
22 WANT TO GET IT IN THE RECORD FOR YOUR CLIENT. OKAY.

23 MR. MELLARD: I MEAN, FOR THE SAME REASON AS MS.
24 ULLMAN, YES, SIR.

25 THE COURT: SAME REASON, OKAY.

1 MR. MELLARD: AND AS FAR AS THE COURT SECURITY,
2 IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING YOU SAID THEY WOULD BE HERE AND
3

4 THE COURT: IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING, I'M GOING TO
5 HAVE A MINIMUM OF TEN DEPUTIES OR SLED AGENTS HERE, A
6 MINIMUM, AND I WILL HAVE MORE THAN THAT THAT ARE NOT
7 IN UNIFORM.

8 MR. MELLARD: WELL, WHAT I BELIEVE WE'RE ASKING
9 FOR, OR AT LEAST MR. RYANT IS ASKING FOR IS THAT THEY
10 COME IN CIVILIAN CLOTHES. I THINK IT CREATES AN AIR
11 OF -- IT CREATES A PROBLEM FOR THE DEFENSE IF YOU HAVE
12 ALL THESE ARMED PEOPLE IN THEIR UNIFORMS. IT MAKES
13 THEM LOOK GUILTY. SO, WE'D ASK THAT THEY COME IN
14 CIVILIAN CLOTHES. THERE'S NO PROBLEM WITH CIVILIAN
15 CLOTHES, EVERYBODY HAS THEM, AND SO, WE WOULD JUST ASK
16 THAT THEY COME IN, THAT THEY WEAR CIVILIAN CLOTHES,
17 THEY TRY TO BLEND IN AND MAKE IT AS INCONSPICUOUS AS
18 POSSIBLE.

19 MS. ULLMAN: AND I ACTUALLY JOIN THAT. WHEN YOU
20 SAID THAT THAT WAS DEALT WITH, I THOUGHT YOU MEANT
21 THAT IT WAS DEALT WITH THAT THEY WOULD NOT BE WEARING
22 THEIR UNIFORMS AND CARRYING GUNS . . .

23 THE COURT: OKAY. OH, THAT'S WHAT Y'ALL WERE
24 TALKING ABOUT, OKAY.

25 MS. ULLMAN: I APOLOGIZE. THAT'S WHAT I THOUGHT

1 YOU MEANT.

2 THE COURT: THERE WILL BE A CERTAIN NUMBER OF
3 OFFICERS HERE THAT WILL BE IN UNIFORM, YOU KNOW, I
4 MEAN, LIKE WE ALWAYS HAVE.

5 MR. MELLARD: AND THAT'S FINE AS LONG AS THEY'RE
6 AWAY FROM THESE DEFENDANTS. I DON'T WANT A BUNCH OF
7 PEOPLE ...

8 THE COURT: YOU WANT THE PEOPLE SITTING
9 IMMEDIATELY BEHIND THEM TO BE IN CIVILIAN CLOTHES?

10 MR. MELLARD: AS INCONSPICUOUS AS POSSIBLE.

11 MS. ULLMAN: OTHERWISE, IT MAKES THEM LOOK
12 DANGEROUS, YOUR HONOR, AND IT MAKES, GIVES THEM AN AIR
13 OF GUILT, AND THEY OBVIOUSLY ARE SITTING HERE INNOCENT
14 UNTIL THE JURY COMES BACK. IF THE JURY IS SITTING
15 OVER THERE, FIVE DEFENDANTS SITTING HERE AND YOU'VE
16 GOT AT LEAST, YOU SAID TEN SLED AND OFFICERS SITTING
17 BEHIND THEM ARMED IN UNIFORM, THAT OBVIOUSLY GIVES A
18 HUGE AIR OF ALL OF THEM BEING DANGEROUS AND ALL OF
19 THEM BEING GUILTY, AND YOU OBVIOUSLY NEED TO SECURE
20 THE COURTROOM BECAUSE THESE MURDERERS ARE SITTING
21 HERE. AND I CERTAINLY THINK THAT THAT IS PREJUDICIAL
22 TO OUR CLIENTS.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. MR. PASCOE, MR.
24 SORENSON, ANYTHING?

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO REAL POSITION, THAT'S UP TO

1 YOUR HONOR. I WILL SAY THIS, IN PAST CASES IT'S BEEN
2 BROUGHT UP THAT IT'S ALSO GOOD TO HAVE SOME UNIFORMED
3 DEPUTIES IN THE COURTROOM TO MAKE THE JURORS FEEL
4 SAFE.

5 THE COURT: OH, YEAH, I MEAN, THERE IS GOING TO
6 BE SOME, BUT I UNDERSTAND THE OFFICERS THAT ARE GOING
7 TO BE CLOSER TO THE DEFENDANTS I UNDERSTAND I NEED FOR
8 THEM TO BE IN CIVILIAN CLOTHES. SO WE WILL WORK
9 THROUGH THAT TO MAKE SURE, AND I WILL GET IN TOUCH
10 WITH, IS IT CAPTAIN FELDER? CAPTAIN FELDER AND WORK
11 THROUGH THAT. OKAY?

12 SOLICITOR PASCOE: SOUNDS GREAT, YES, SIR.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYTHING ELSE? I'M SORRY.

14 MR. MELLARD: JUST ONE MORE. I WOULD JOIN IN MR.
15 PALMER'S MOTION FOR SEVERANCE BASED ON THE FAIRNESS
16 GROUNDS. I UNDERSTAND YOU'VE ALREADY RULED ON THIS.

17 THE COURT: NO, AND I WANT YOU -- I WANT TO MAKE
18 SURE WE COVER ALL OF YOURS, TOO.

19 MR. MELLARD: IN MY SITUATION, OBVIOUSLY, IT'S
20 CREATING A SITUATION WHERE, BASED ON WHAT I'M HEARING,
21 THERE'S GOING TO BE SOME FINGER POINTING. AND THAT'S
22 CREATING A SITUATION WHERE THE DEFENDANT NOW IS ALMOST
23 FORCED TO TAKE THE STAND. SO, I THINK HE'S GIVING UP
24 HIS RIGHT NOT TO INCRIMINATE HIMSELF OR NOT TO PUT
25 HIMSELF WHERE HE COULD POSSIBLY BE INCRIMINATED BY HIS

1 PAST OR ANYTHING. SO, IT'S MY POSITION THAT IF THERE
2 IS GOING TO BE FINGER POINTING, WE HEARD THAT THERE
3 MIGHT BE, THAT IS CREATING A SITUATION WHERE HE NO
4 LONGER HAS THE RIGHT TO REMAIN SILENT.

5 THE COURT: TO REMAIN SILENT?

6 MR. MELLARD: TO REMAIN SILENT, HE HAS TO TAKE
7 THE STAND.

8 THE COURT: OKAY.

9 MR. MELLARD: ALSO, IN MY SITUATION, AS THE COURT
10 IS AWARE, MY CLIENT IS PROBABLY GOING TO REFUSE TO
11 COME TO TRIAL. WHILE I UNDERSTAND THAT'S HIS
12 POSITION, WHILE I UNDERSTAND THAT ANY PREJUDICE TO HIM
13 IS CAUSED BY HIM, YOUR HONOR, I WOULD ...

14 THE COURT: NOW, I WILL TELL YOU THAT IF HE -- I
15 WILL INSTRUCT THE JURY THAT THEY CAN'T ...

16 MR. MELLARD: WHAT I WOULD ASK THE COURT TO DO
17 IS, OBVIOUSLY, THERE'S GOING TO BE AN ISSUE OF WHETHER
18 HE WAIVED HIS RIGHT TO BE HERE. I WOULD ASK THE COURT
19 TO HAVE HIM BROUGHT OVER AND THE COURT TO SPEAK TO HIM
20 SO THAT WE ARE SURE THAT HE IS ACTUALLY WAIVING HIS
21 RIGHT TO BE HERE. I DON'T WANT THERE TO BE ANY ISSUE
22 ABOUT THAT, YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. I'LL BE GLAD TO TALK TO HIM.

24 MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, THEN ALSO, I WOULD MOVE
25 FOR GROUNDS TO SEVER, OBVIOUSLY, HIS PRESENCE OR LACK

1 THEREOF IS CAUSING, AGAIN, HIM HAVING TO TESTIFY. HE
2 DOESN'T HAVE TO BE HERE. IN A NORMAL TRIAL IT WOULD
3 BE ME VERSUS THE STATE. IF HE DIDN'T SHOW UP, FINE,
4 YOU KNOW. BUT IN THIS SITUATION WITH THE FINGER
5 POINTING FROM THE OTHER PEOPLE, THIS IS CREATING A
6 SITUATION WHERE HE ALMOST HAS TO BE HERE. SO, I'D ASK
7 THE COURT TO AT LEAST INQUIRE IF HE WAIVES HIS RIGHT
8 TO BE HERE.

9 THE COURT: I'LL BE GLAD TO DO THAT. AND JUST ---
10 AND WE'LL GO OVER THAT. WE'LL GET HIM HERE MONDAY.
11 OKAY? HOWEVER HE WANTS TO GET HERE. OKAY. THANK
12 YOU. ANYTHING ELSE?

13 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR.

14 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. Y'ALL HAVE A GREAT WEEKEND.

15 MR. MELLARD: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

16 (Recess for the day.)

17 DATE:

18 DECEMBER 13, 2010

19 (Plaintiff's Exhibits One through Twelve
20 Twenty-seven through Thirty-seven, and
21 Ninety-three through Ninety-five
22 premarked for id off the record.)

23 (The following takes place in
24 open court but out of the presence
25 of the jury venire.)

TRIAL BEGINS

1
2 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD, I NEED THE INDICTMENTS
3 AGAINST MR. RYANT, TO MAKE SURE HE WAS ARRAIGNED.

4 DEPUTY: HE'S BACK THERE.

5 THE COURT: OKAY. I WANT TO MAKE SURE, I'M GOING
6 TO RE-GO OVER THOSE INDICTMENTS WITH HIM BEFORE HE
7 DOES THIS. OKAY? CAN YOU GET THOSE INDICTMENTS TO ME
8 ON THE CASE SO I CAN DEAL WITH THAT RIGHT NOW? AND
9 THEN, ONCE HE GETS IN HERE I DON'T NEED ANYBODY ELSE,
10 I DON'T NEED ANY WITNESSES IN THE COURTROOM OR
11 ANYTHING LIKE THAT. OKAY? SO, WE'LL TAKE A MINUTE,
12 IF Y'ALL WILL GET THAT, AS SOON AS WE GET HIM OUT.

13 (Recess)

14 THE COURT: THIS IS MR. RYANT?

15 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

16 THE COURT: MR. RYANT, COME ON UP, PLEASE, SIR.
17 ALRIGHT, MR. RYANT, I NEED TO GO OVER SOME THINGS.

18 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
19 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
20 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
21 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
22 sequential continuation of record.)

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

62

EXAMINATION, IN CAMERA, OF DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR,

BY THE COURT:

Q. IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT WE ARE READY TO START
YOUR TRIAL THIS AFTERNOON.

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND YOU ARE REPRESENTED BY MR. MELLARD?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND MR. MELLARD HAS TOLD ME YOU DON'T WANT TO BE
PRESENT, IS THAT CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. WELL, FIRST OF ALL, LET ME GO OVER WITH --
I'M GOING TO GO OVER THE INDICTMENTS THAT YOU
HAVE AND MAKE SURE YOU UNDERSTAND THE INDICTMENTS
THAT YOU'RE FACING FOR THE JURY TRIAL TODAY.
OKAY?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. ALRIGHT. AND YOU ARE DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, IS
THAT CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND HOW OLD ARE YOU, MR. RYANT?

A. TWENTY.

Q. TWENTY? AND HOW FAR DID YOU GO IN SCHOOL?

A. I GOT MY DIPLOMA, G.E.D.

Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. WHERE DID YOU GET THAT FROM?

A. DUKE MARINE INSTITUTE.

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

63

- 1 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR. AND AFTER YOU GOT OUR
2 G.E.D., HAVE YOU WORKED ANYWHERE OR DONE ANYTHING
3 LIKE THAT?
- 4 A. I WAS DOING, WORKING IN COPE IN, LIKE, FARMING.
- 5 Q. OKAY. ARE YOU UNDER THE INFLUENCE OF ANY DRUGS
6 OR ALCOHOL HERE TODAY?
- 7 A. NO, SIR.
- 8 Q. OKAY. HAVE YOU EVER BEEN EVALUATED WITH ANY KIND
9 OF MENTAL ILLNESS OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT?
- 10 A. NO, SIR.
- 11 Q. OKAY. YOU ARE THINKING CLEARLY HERE TODAY?
- 12 A. YES, SIR.
- 13 Q. OKAY. YOU HAVE MET WITH YOUR ATTORNEY ON
14 NUMEROUS OCCASIONS, I'M SURE - - -
- 15 A. YES, SIR.
- 16 Q. --- IS THAT CORRECT?
- 17 A. CORRECT.
- 18 Q. OKAY. HE'S GONE OVER THESE CHARGES WITH YOU, IS
19 THAT CORRECT?
- 20 A. CORRECT.
- 21 Q. AND HE'S GONE OVER POSSIBLE SENTENCES WITH YOU?
- 22 A. CORRECT.
- 23 Q. OKAY. HE'S ADVISED YOU OF YOUR CONSTITUTIONAL
24 RIGHTS?
- 25 A. SOME.

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

64

1 Q. OKAY. WELL, DO YOU UNDERSTAND YOU'VE GOT THE
2 RIGHT TO HAVE A JURY TRIAL?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. AND THAT JURY TRIAL IS SCHEDULED TO BEGIN
5 THIS AFTERNOON, DO YOU UNDERSTAND THAT?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. AND I'M SURE, I DON'T KNOW IF - - -

8 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD, HAVE THERE BEEN SOME
9 NEGOTIATIONS BETWEEN YOU AND THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE?

10 MR. MELLARD: THERE HAVE, YOUR HONOR, YES. THE
11 SOLICITOR'S OFFICE MADE US A DEAL ON LAST FRIDAY. I
12 SPOKE TO HIM IN LENGTH ABOUT IT AND HE SAID HE DID NOT
13 WANT IT.

14 THE COURT: OKAY.

15 Q. AND MR. RYANT, HE'S TOLD YOU WHAT THE SOLICITOR'S
16 OFFICE HAS APPARENTLY MADE YOU AN OFFER TO GET
17 YOU TO PLEAD GUILTY, IS THAT CORRECT? THEY HAVE
18 MADE YOU A PLEA OFFER?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND YOU'VE TOLD HIM YOU DID NOT WANT TO ACCEPT
21 THE PLEA OFFER?

22 A. NO, NOT THAT ONE, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, BUT THEY'VE ONLY, THEY HAVEN'T
24 GIVEN YOU ANY OTHER OFFERS, IS THAT CORRECT?

25 MR. MELLARD: THE INITIAL OFFER WAS TWENTY TO

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

65

THIRTY, VOLUNTARY, YOUR HONOR. WHEN WE SPOKE TO THEM
ON FRIDAY THEY HAD A DIFFERENT OFFER.

THE COURT: OKAY. BETTER OR WORSE?

MR. MELLARD: BETTER, CONSIDERABLY BETTER.

THE COURT: OKAY.

Q. BUT YOU DIDN'T WANT TO TAKE THAT, YOU DIDN'T
WANT TO TAKE THE OFFER THAT THEY'VE GIVEN YOU,
THAT THEY OFFERED TO YOU ON FRIDAY, IS THAT
CORRECT?

A. THURSDAY.

MR. MELLARD: I'M SORRY, IT WAS THURSDAY.

THE COURT: THURSDAY.

COURT REPORTER: WHAT WAS YOUR ANSWER?

Q. YOU DON'T HAVE TO TELL ME WHAT IT IS, BUT I ...

A. OH, NO I DIDN'T WANT IT.

Q. YOU DIDN'T WANT IT?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. OKAY. SO, YOU UNDERSTAND THAT YOU ARE SCHEDULED
FOR TRIAL HERE TODAY?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. WELL, LET ME GO OVER THE
INDICTMENTS THAT I HAVE. THE FIRST INDICTMENT I
HAVE, MR. RYANT, IS INDICTMENT NUMBER 2010-GS-38-
817. THAT IS THE INDICTMENT FOR MURDER. IT WAS
TRUE BILLED BY THE GRAND JURY ON MAY TWELFTH, TWO

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

66

1 THOUSAND AND TEN, AND THE INDICTMENT ALLEGES, MR.
2 RYANT, THAT YOU DID, IN ORANGEBURG COUNTY, ON OR
3 ABOUT MARCH TWELFTH, TWO THOUSAND AND TEN, WITH
4 MALICE AFORETHOUGHT, KILL ONE CHARLES PRINGLE BY
5 MEANS OF SHOOTING THE VICTIM, AND THE VICTIM DIED
6 AS A PROXIMATE RESULT THEREOF. AND THIS IS A
7 VIOLATION OF COMMON LAW AND SECTION THREE TEN OF
8 THE SOUTH CAROLINA CODE OF LAWS. DO YOU
9 UNDERSTAND THE ALLEGATIONS CONTAINED IN THIS
10 INDICTMENT?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. THE NEXT INDICTMENT I HAVE IS
13 INDICTMENT NUMBER 2010-GS-38-818, IT WAS ALSO
14 TRUE BILLED BY THE GRAND JURY ON MAY TWELFTH, TWO
15 THOUSAND AND TEN. IT IS FOR BURGLARY IN THE
16 FIRST DEGREE, AND THE ALLEGATIONS OF THIS
17 INDICTMENT, MR. RYANT, ARE THAT YOU DID, IN
18 ORANGEBURG COUNTY, ON OR ABOUT MARCH TWELFTH, TWO
19 THOUSAND TEN, WILLFULLY AND UNLAWFULLY ENTER THE
20 DWELLING AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD,
21 ORANGEBURG, SOUTH CAROLINA, BELONGING TO CHARLES
22 PRINGLE WITHOUT CONSENT WITH THE INTENT TO COMMIT
23 A CRIME THEREIN, AND THAT THE DEFENDANT OR
24 ANOTHER PARTICIPANT WAS ARMED WITH A DEADLY
25 WEAPON, AND/OR CAUSED PHYSICAL INJURY TO A NON-

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

67

1 PARTICIPANT, AND/OR USED OR THREATENED TO USE THE
2 USE OF A DANGEROUS INSTRUMENT, AND/OR THE OFFENSE
3 OCCURRED AT NIGHT TIME. THIS OFFENSE IS AGAIN IN
4 VIOLATION OF THE COMMON LAW AND SECTION SIXTEEN
5 ELEVEN THREE ELEVEN OF THE SOUTH CAROLINA CODE OF
6 LAWS. DO YOU UNDERSTAND THE ALLEGATIONS
7 CONTAINED IN THIS INDICTMENT?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AND THE FINAL INDICTMENT I HAVE IS
10 INDICTMENT NUMBER 2010-GS-38-819. IT IS AN
11 INDICTMENT FOR ARMED ROBBERY, TRUE BILLED BY THE
12 GRAND JURY ON MAY TWELFTH, TWO THOUSAND, AND THE
13 ALLEGATIONS IN IT ARE, MR. RYANT, THAT YOU DID,
14 ON OR ABOUT MARCH TWELFTH, TWO THOUSAND AND TEN,
15 IN ORANGEBURG COUNTY, BY USE OF FORCE, THREATS OR
16 INTIMIDATION AND WHILE ARMED WITH A DEADLY WEAPON
17 OR WHILE ALLEGING EITHER BY WORDS OR ACTION THAT
18 YOU WERE ARMED WHILE USING A REPRESENTATION OF A
19 DEADLY WEAPON OR ANY OBJECT WHICH A PERSON
20 PRESENT DURING THE COMMISSION OF A ROBBERY
21 REASONABLY BELIEVED TO BE A DEADLY WEAPON, TAKE
22 AND CARRY AWAY GOODS AND/OR MONIES FROM THE
23 PERSON OR PRESENCE OF THE VICTIM, CHARLES
24 PRINGLE, WITH THE INTENT TO PERMANENTLY DEPRIVE
25 THE VICTIM OF POSSESSION OF SUCH GOODS AND

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

68

1 MONIES, AND SUCH WEAPONS OR ALLEGED WEAPONS
2 DESCRIBED AS A HAND GUN IN THIS, AND THIS IS A
3 VIOLATION OF SECTION SIXTEEN ELEVEN THREE THIRTY
4 OF THE SOUTH CAROLINA CODE OF LAWS. DO YOU
5 UNDERSTAND THE ALLEGATIONS CONTAINED IN THIS
6 INDICTMENT?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. ALRIGHT, SIR. NOW, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT
9 YOU HAVE TOLD -- NUMBER ONE, LET ME MAKE SURE, DO
10 YOU UNDERSTAND THAT WE'RE SCHEDULED TO GO
11 FORWARD ON THE JURY TRIAL AGAINST YOU ON THESE
12 CHARGES BEGINNING HERE TODAY?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. DO YOU UNDERSTAND -- AND I'VE BEEN MADE TO
15 UNDERSTAND BY YOUR ATTORNEY THAT YOU DO NOT WISH
16 TO BE PRESENT?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. IS THAT CORRECT?

19 A. FOR VARIOUS REASONS.

20 Q. OKAY. DO YOU WANT TO TELL ME WHY YOU DON'T WANT
21 TO BE PRESENT?

22 A. YES, SIR. SINCE DAY ONE IT WAS A LOT OF ISSUES
23 THAT I ADDRESSED

24 COURT REPORTER: SINCE DAY ONE IT WAS WHAT, A
25 LETTER?

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

69

1 MR. MELLARD: A LOT OF ISSUES.

2 COURT REPORTER: A LOT?

3 A. A LOT OF ISSUES THAT I ADDRESSED TO MR. MELLARD
4 THAT WEREN'T ADDRESSED IN COURT.

5 Q. OKAY.

6 A. SOME CONCERNED MY UNLAWFUL ARREST, YOU KNOW, AND
7 IT WAS JUST A LOT OF STUFF. AND THEN, LAST
8 THURSDAY ME AND HIM HAD, AFTER HE CAME TO ME WITH
9 THE OFFER AND I NOTARIZED HIM THAT I DIDN'T WANT
10 TO ACCEPT THE OFFER, IT CAME LUNCH TIME, AND HE
11 ASKED ME, I REFUSED IT, AND I WENT AND ATE LUNCH
12 AND CAME BACK, BUT BEFORE I CAME BACK MS. PEGGY
13 HINDS, SHE ASKED ME TO BE PRESENT IN THE MEETING.
14 I TOLD HER IT WOULD BE ALRIGHT, AND ONCE WE GOT
15 BACK IN I FELT THAT HE WASN'T JUST ASKING ME TO
16 INCRIMINATE MYSELF, HE WAS DETERMINED, LIKE,
17 BECAUSE THEY KEPT ASKING ME AFTER I REFUSED THE
18 OFFER, AND IT WAS LIKE I WAS BEING PRESSURED, AND
19 I FELT THAT THE BEHAVIOR WAS UNPROFESSIONAL. AND
20 I'M JUST TRYING TO DO WHAT'S IN MY BEST INTEREST.
21 AND IT'S HARD TO FIGURE OUT WHAT'S IN MY BEST
22 INTEREST WHEN THE REPRESENTATION IS INADEQUATE.

23 Q. OKAY. WELL, NOW, IF HE -- MS. HINDS SAT IN
24 THERE, I THINK, JUST TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU
25 UNDERSTOOD WHAT YOUR OFFER WAS.

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

70

1 THE COURT: IS THAT CORRECT, MR. MELLARD?

2 MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, THE FIRST MEETING IT
3 WAS ME AND DANNY AND INVESTIGATOR DANNY MCDANIEL.

4 THE COURT: OKAY.

5 MR. MELLARD: AND WE KIND OF EXPLAINED IT TO HIM.
6 AND THEN AFTER HE TURNED THAT DOWN, I PROBABLY THOUGHT
7 IF PEGGY HINDS WAS TO COME IN THERE SHE COULD MAYBE
8 PUT A DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE ON IT.

9 THE COURT: OKAY.

10 MR. MELLARD: SO, AT THE SECOND MEETING IT WAS
11 ME, DANNY AND PEGGY HINDS.

12 THE COURT: OKAY.

13 Q. AND HOW WOULD IT HELP YOU TO NOT BE PRESENT AT
14 THE TRIAL?

15 A. LIKE, I REALLY DO WANT TO BE PRESENT, BUT IT'S
16 LIKE NO TRUST BETWEEN US, AND JUST LIKE, WE GOT A
17 BAD VIBE, LIKE BETWEEN US, AND IT'S NOT WORKING
18 OUT.

19 COURT REPORTER: YOU HAVE WHAT BETWEEN YOU?

20 THE COURT: A BAD VIBE.

21 A. IT'S LIKE NO UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN THE TWO OF US,
22 SO I DON'T THINK IT'S APPROPRIATE THAT I GO
23 FORWARD WITH THE TRIAL WHEN, YOU KNOW ...

24 Q. OKAY. NUMBER ONE, MR. RYANT, LET'S GO OVER -
25 I'M GOING TO TREAT THIS SORT OF AS YOU WANT A NEW

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

71

1 COUNSEL.

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY? AND LET ME TELL YOU, MR. MELLARD HAS BEEN
4 PRACTICING LAW IN FRONT OF ME FOR TWO YEARS. I
5 KNOW HE'S BEEN PRACTICING WITH THE PUBLIC
6 DEFENDER'S OFFICE LONGER THAN THAT. HE'S APPEARED
7 IN FRONT OF ME, HE DOES AN EXCELLENT JOB. HE HAS
8 ALWAYS ADVISED HIS CLIENTS TRUTHFULLY AS TO WHAT
9 THEY'RE FACING, AND I'M ASSUMING HE HAS ADVISED
10 YOU TRUTHFULLY WHAT YOU'RE FACING.

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND IF YOU FELT ANY PRESSURE, IT'S MY OPINION
13 THAT HE WAS PROBABLY TRYING TO GET YOU TO DO WHAT
14 HE BELIEVED WAS IN YOUR BEST INTEREST, YOU KNOW.
15 AND I'M SORRY YOU FELT LIKE IT WAS PRESSURE, BUT
16 I THINK MY READING OF MR. MELLARD IN THE TIMES
17 THAT HE HAS APPEARED IS, HE WANTS TO DO THE BEST
18 FOR HIS CLIENTS, HE WANTS THE BEST FOR THEM, YOU
19 KNOW. AND I UNDERSTAND THAT YOU ARE IN A TOUGH
20 SITUATION. YOU'VE GOT SOME SERIOUS CHARGES FACING
21 YOU.

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND SOME VERY SERIOUS TIME FACING YOU IF A JURY
24 DETERMINES THAT YOU ARE GUILTY, OKAY?

25 A. YES, SIR.

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

72

1 Q. BUT I'M NOT GOING TO GIVE YOU A NEW ATTORNEY.
2 OKAY? OKAY, MR. MELLARD, YOU KNOW, HE'S YOUR
3 ATTORNEY AND HE IS THE ONE THAT'S GOING TO
4 REPRESENT YOU IN THIS TRIAL. OKAY? HE IS A
5 COMPETENT ATTORNEY, HE KNOWS WHAT HE'S DOING, AND

6
7 THE COURT: WAS HE HERE LAST FRIDAY WHEN YOU MADE
8 THE MOTIONS?

9 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR, HE DID NOT COME FRIDAY.

10 Q. YOU DIDN'T COME WHEN HE CAME OVER HERE AND MADE
11 ALL THE DIFFERENT MOTIONS FOR, ON YOUR BEHALF IN
12 FRONT OF THIS COURT. YOU WERE NOT HERE TO
13 WITNESS ALL OF THAT TO SEE WHAT HE WAS DOING ON
14 YOUR BEHALF. NOW, SO I'M NOT GOING TO GIVE YOU
15 A NEW ATTORNEY FOR THIS TRIAL. YOU'VE GOT MR.
16 MELLARD, HE IS PREPARED TO GO FORWARD WITH THIS
17 TRIAL. NOW, THE QUESTION NOW IS, DO YOU WANT TO
18 BE PRESENT AT TRIAL?

19 A. WELL, FIRST I JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND, WHAT WILL
20 BE THE OUTCOME IF I DON'T BE PRESENT?

21 Q. WELL, IF YOU'RE NOT PRESENT I WILL TELL THE JURY
22 THAT THEY CANNOT HOLD THE FACT THAT YOU ARE NOT
23 PRESENT AGAINST YOU. OKAY?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. IF YOU ARE NOT PRESENT AND YOU DON'T TESTIFY I

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

73

1 WILL TELL THE JURY THAT THE FACT THAT YOU DIDN'T
2 TESTIFY CANNOT BE HELD AGAINST YOU, THAT YOU ARE
3 PRESUMED INNOCENT. OKAY?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. AND THEY CAN'T USE THE FACT THAT YOU DID NOT
6 APPEAR OR DID NOT TESTIFY AGAINST YOU IN
7 DETERMINING WHETHER OR NOT YOU ARE GUILTY OR NOT.

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY? AND THAT WILL BE PART OF MY CHARGE TO THE
10 JURY. OKAY?

11 A. I JUST WANT TO, I WANT TO APOLOGIZE FOR LAST WEEK
12 TO MR. MELLARD, AND TODAY IF I CAUSED ANY
13 INCONVENIENCE, BUT, LIKE, MY FAMILY AND I DON'T
14 FEEL COMFORTABLE, LIKE, WITH ME PROCEEDING WITH
15 THE WHOLE TRIAL. SO, I THINK IT'S BETTER, YOU
16 SEE WHAT I'M SAYING, SIR?

17 Q. IT'S BETTER THAT YOU WHAT?

18 A. THAT I DON'T BE PRESENT.

19 Q. OKAY. BUT YOU UNDERSTAND THAT YOU -- HAS ANYBODY
20 FORCED YOU TO NOT BE PRESENT?

21 A. NO, SIR, IT'S LIKE, FROM MY UNDERSTANDING, LIKE,
22 FROM THE CONVERSATIONS WE HAD, LIKE, IT'S, LIKE,
23 OBVIOUS THAT, LIKE, I AIN'T GOT A GOOD CHANCE IN
24 TRIAL, AND I JUST FEEL UNCOMFORTABLE WITH GOING
25 FORWARD. NOBODY PRESSURED ME INTO NOT GOING, NO,

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

74

1 SIR.

2 Q. WELL, MR. RYANT, IF THAT'S THE WAY YOU BELIEVE
3 WHY ARE YOU GOING FORWARD WITH A TRIAL?

4 A. NO, I DON'T WANT TO GO FORWARD.

5 Q. NO, NO, I MEAN, AND MAYBE I'M NOT PHRASING THIS
6 CORRECTLY. YOU KNOW, YOUR OPTIONS OR EITHER TO
7 PLEAD GUILTY OR TO GO FORWARD WITH THE TRIAL.
8 OKAY? SO, YOU'RE TELLING ME THAT YOU DON'T WANT
9 TO PLEAD GUILTY, AND THEN YOU'RE ALSO TELLING ME
10 THAT YOU DO NOT WANT TO BE PRESENT FOR THE TRIAL.
11 IS THAT CORRECT? SIR?

12 A. I'M TRYING TO MAKE THE BEST CHOICE.

13 Q. LISTEN, MR. RYANT, I UNDERSTAND YOU'RE TRYING TO
14 MAKE THE BEST CHOICE. I WANT TO MAKE SURE YOU
15 UNDERSTAND I'M NOT HERE TO PRESSURE YOU, - - -

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. --- BECAUSE THIS IS, THIS IS SOMETHING THAT'S
18 GOING TO AFFECT YOUR LIFE. OKAY? BUT WE'RE
19 GETTING READY, THE JURY IS GOING TO BE HERE IN A
20 WHILE.

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. I HAVE GOT TO KNOW WHAT YOU WANT TO DO. OKAY?
23 AND DO YOU WANT ME TO GIVE YOU FIVE MINUTES TO
24 TALK WITH MR. MELLARD AGAIN?

25 A. I DON'T WANT TO PLEAD GUILTY TODAY, BUT ...

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT.

75

1 Q. AND HE -- LET ME JUST TELL YOU SOMETHING, I
2 DON'T KNOW -- AND THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE IS NOT
3 HERE SO I CAN'T SPEAK ON BEHALF OF THE
4 SOLICITOR'S OFFICE. AND MR. MELLARD HAS DEALT
5 WITH THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE HERE LONGER THAN I
6 HAVE, BECAUSE I'VE ONLY BEEN ON THE BENCH FOR TWO
7 YEARS, BUT GENERALLY SPEAKING, ONCE WE GET READY
8 TO GO TO TRIAL, ONCE THAT GETS STARTED THEY'RE
9 NOT GOING TO ACCEPT A PLEA. I MEAN, THEY WILL,
10 I'M ASSUMING, AND I DON'T KNOW IF THEY STILL
11 WOULD ACCEPT YOUR PLEA NOW. AND I WOULD
12 CERTAINLY ENCOURAGE THEM TO, OKAY? BUT I CAN'T,
13 OBVIOUSLY, I CAN'T FORCE THAT, YOU KNOW, BUT IF
14 YOU WANT -- I'LL GIVE YOU ABOUT FIVE MORE MINUTES
15 IF YOU'LL TALK WITH MR. MELLARD, AND I'LL BRING
16 YOU BACK OUT THERE. OKAY? I MEAN, WOULD THAT
17 HELP OR WOULD IT NOT HELP? I DON'T WANT TO FORCE
18 YOU TO DO ANYTHING YOU DON'T WANT TO DO.

19 A. I JUST, I DON'T WANT TO GO FORWARD, I DON'T WANT
20 TO GO FORWARD WITH THE TRIAL.

21 COURT REPORTER: ARE YOU SAYING, I DON'T?

22 Q. YOU DON'T WANT TO GO FORWARD WITH THE TRIAL?

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. WELL, YOU UNDERSTAND, I'M NOT GOING TO CONTINUE
25 THE TRIAL?

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

76

1 A. SIR?

2 Q. I'M NOT GOING TO CONTINUE THE TRIAL. I MEAN,
3 WE'RE GOING TO TRIAL TODAY, YOU KNOW. WE WILL GO
4 TO TRIAL TODAY WHETHER YOU ARE PRESENT OR WHETHER
5 YOU ARE NOT PRESENT.

6 A. ALRIGHT.

7 Q. AND YOU ARE GOING TO BE TRIED. OKAY? BECAUSE
8 WE'VE GOT ALL THE WITNESSES HERE, WE'VE GOT THE
9 OTHER FOUR DEFENDANTS, AND WE'RE GOING TO GO
10 FORWARD WITH THE TRIAL BEGINNING TODAY. AND THE
11 ONLY WAY, YOU KNOW, I NEED TO FIND OUT, IF YOU'RE
12 NOT GOING TO PLEAD GUILTY, THEN THE NEXT QUESTION
13 IS, DO YOU WANT TO BE PRESENT AT THE TRIAL OR
14 NOT? AND THAT'S WHERE, SO YOU'VE GOT TO DECIDE,
15 NUMBER ONE, IF YOU'RE NOT GOING TO PLEAD GUILTY
16 YOU NEED TO TELL ME YOU'RE NOT GOING TO PLEAD
17 GUILTY, THAT'S THE FIRST THING. AND THEN, THE
18 NEXT THING YOU HAVE TO TELL ME IS WHETHER YOU
19 WANT TO BE PRESENT AT THE TRIAL OR NOT. THAT'S
20 WHAT YOU'VE GOT TO DECIDE. BUT THOSE ARE THE
21 ORDER IN WHICH WE'VE GOT TO DECIDE THINGS. IF
22 YOU NEED TO TALK TO MR. MELLARD FOR A MINUTE OVER
23 WHETHER OR NOT YOU'RE GOING TO PLEAD GUILTY OR
24 NOT I'LL LET YOU DO THAT. AND THEN I'LL GIVE YOU
25 FIVE MINUTES TO TALK WITH HIM.

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

77

1 A. DO YOU THINK IT WILL BE ALRIGHT IF I GET IN
2 CONTACT WITH MY FAMILY TO SEE WHAT THEY THINK?

3 Q. IF THEY -- I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU CAN DO THAT. CAN
4 YOU DO THAT?

5 MR. MELLARD: THERE'S A PHONE BACK IN MS. HARRY
6 DOT'S OFFICE, IF WE COULD USE THAT.

7 Q. YOU'RE WELCOME, WILL SOMEBODY BE AT HOME THAT YOU
8 CAN TALK TO?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY.

11 MR. MELLARD: NOW, YOUR HONOR, I'D JUST LIKE TO
12 SAY, WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THE SOLICITOR WOULD BE
13 OFFERING AT THIS POINT.

14 THE COURT: I UNDERSTAND, I UNDERSTAND.

15 MR. MELLARD: SO, IT MAY BE A TWO STEP PROCESS,
16 IT MAY BE A PHONE CALL AND THEN

17 Q. I MEAN, WE'VE STILL GOT TO TALK TO THE
18 SOLICITOR'S OFFICE TO FIND OUT IF THEY'LL STILL
19 ACCEPT OUR PLEA AT THIS STAGE, DO YOU UNDERSTAND
20 THAT? I CAN'T GUARANTEE THAT, NEITHER CAN MR.
21 MELLARD, BUT WE WILL CERTAINLY -- IF THAT'S WHAT
22 YOU DECIDE TO DO I WILL CERTAINLY GET MR. MELLARD
23 TO TALK WITH THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE AND SEE WHAT
24 WE CAN DO. OKAY?

25 A. YES, SIR.

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

78

1 THE COURT: OKAY. DO Y'ALL WANT TO GO ON BACK
2 THERE?

3 COURT REPORTER: DOUG, YOU NEED TO PULL MY PHONE
4 OVER SO HE CAN GET TO IT.

5 MR. MELLARD: OKAY, THAT'S FINE.

6 (Recess)

7 THE COURT: MS. HARRY DOT, ARE YOU READY?

8 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

9 MR. MELLARD: AND YOUR HONOR, WE HAD CLEARED THE
10 COURTROOM THE LAST TIME. AND I NOTICE THE SOLICITOR'S
11 HERE, AND I DON'T KNOW IF HE'S GOING TO SAY ANYTHING
12 TO INCRIMINATE HIMSELF OR, I MEAN, I DON'T ...

13 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOU NEED ME TO GO OUT?

14 THE COURT: YEAH, HE CAME BACK IN AND I JUST
15 MENTIONED TO HIM THAT IF -- WE WERE STILL NEGOTIATING
16 AND IF, DEPENDING ON WHAT MR. RYANT SAID, WE MIGHT
17 WANT TO TALK TO HIM AGAIN. OKAY?

18 DEPUTY: WE HAVE ANOTHER DEFENDANT BACK THERE.

19 THE COURT: WHAT I NEED TO DO, IS THAT DOOR
20 CLOSED? IT'S NOT SOUND PROOF? OKAY. IF YOU'LL JUST
21 WAIT A SECOND WE'LL MOVE HIM. OKAY? IT'S JUST GOING
22 TO BE FOR A MINUTE. OKAY. IF YOU'LL JUST APOLOGIZE TO
23 YOUR CLIENT FOR HAVING TO TAKE HIM OUT FOR A SECOND.

24 OKAY, WE'VE GOT THE COURTROOM CLEARED AGAIN.
25 YES, SIR?

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

79

1 MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, WHEN WE LEFT THERE WERE
2 TWO QUESTIONS THAT YOU WANTED HIM TO ANSWER. THE
3 FIRST WAS, DOES HE WANT TO PLEAD? AND OBVIOUSLY, WE
4 DON'T KNOW WHAT THE RANGE WOULD BE IF HE AGREED TO
5 CONSIDER THAT OPTION.

6 THE COURT: RIGHT.

7 MR. MELLARD: IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING HE'S NOT
8 CONSIDERING THAT OPTION. I'LL LEAVE THAT UP TO HIM TO
9 TELL YOU.

10 Q. OKAY. SO, MR. RYANT, YOUR ATTORNEY HAS ADVISED
11 ME YOU ARE NOT INTERESTED IN PLEADING GUILTY. IS
12 THAT CORRECT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR. OKAY, SO THE NEXT QUESTION
15 I HAD IS, -- BECAUSE HE HAD MENTIONED EARLIER
16 THAT YOU DID NOT WANT TO BE PRESENT DURING THE
17 TRIAL. IS THAT A TRUTHFUL STATEMENT, YOU DON'T
18 WANT TO BE PRESENT AT THE TRIAL?

19 A. I DON'T WANT TO BE, BUT I'LL BE PRESENT, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR. AND THAT'S GOOD, I'M GLAD
21 YOU'RE GOING TO BE PRESENT. NOW, LET ME JUST
22 TELL YOU A COUPLE OF THINGS ABOUT BEING PRESENT.
23 YOU KNOW, I'M SURE MR. MELLARD WILL HAVE SOME WAY
24 THAT YOU CAN PASS NOTES OR ANYTHING, I DON'T KNOW
25 HOW YOU NORMALLY DO IT, I USED TO HAVE PEOPLE,

EXAM. IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

80

1 YOU KNOW, IF THEY WANTED TO WRITE SOMETHING THEY
2 COULD PASS ME A NOTE, BUT DURING THE TRIAL WHEN
3 THERE ARE BREAKS AND LIKE THAT YOU CAN TALK WITH
4 MR. MELLARD TO FIND OUT HOW THINGS ARE -- YOU
5 KNOW, SO Y'ALL CAN TALK BACK AND FORTH. BUT
6 WHILE WE'RE IN HERE DURING TRIAL, YOU KNOW, YOU
7 CAN'T MAKE ANY COMMENTS ABOUT WHAT THE WITNESS IS
8 SAYING, ---

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. --- NO FACIAL EXPRESSIONS, AND THINGS LIKE THAT.
11 DO YOU UNDERSTAND THAT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. YOU'VE GOT TO BE ON YOUR BEST BEHAVIOR, DO YOU
14 UNDERSTAND WHAT THAT MEANS?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR. SO, WE'RE GOING
17 TO START PICKING THE JURY, I THINK THE JURY COMES IN
18 AT ONE:THIRTY, AND WE'LL QUALIFY THE JURY, AND THEN
19 SHORTLY THEREAFTER THEY'LL CALL THE CASE AND WE'LL
20 START PICKING THE JURY. OKAY?

21 ANYTHING ELSE WE NEED TO GO OVER, MR. MELLARD?

22 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR. HE WASN'T HERE WHENEVER WE
23 HAD THOSE -- I THINK IT WAS FRIDAY WHEN WE HAD THOSE
24 HEARINGS, SO HE PROBABLY DOESN'T KNOW THAT THERE'S
25 GOING TO BE POLICE OFFICERS IN PLAIN CLOTHES HERE, SO

EXAM, IN CAMERA - DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR, BY THE COURT

81

1 I JUST KIND OF JUST LET HIM KNOW ABOUT THAT.

2 Q. YEAH, THERE WILL BE A NUMBER OF POLICE OFFICERS
3 HERE, AND THERE WILL BE POLICE OFFICERS IN PLAIN
4 CLOTHES HERE BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, WE'VE GOT A LOT
5 OF DEFENDANTS HERE, AND YOU JUST NEED TO BE AWARE
6 OF THAT. OKAY?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. AND I CAN'T -- IF I HAVE ANY OUTBURSTS OR
9 ANYTHING LIKE THAT DURING THE TRIAL OR PEOPLE
10 MAKING COMMENTS DURING THE TRIAL OR THINGS LIKE
11 THAT WHERE THE JURY CAN HEAR, WHETHER THEY'RE IN
12 THE AUDIENCE OR WHETHER IT'S, YOU KNOW, ONE OF
13 THE DEFENDANTS, OR ANY OF THE OTHER GENTLEMEN,
14 YOU WON'T BE ALLOWED TO BE IN THE COURTROOM UNDER
15 THOSE CIRCUMSTANCES. DO YOU UNDERSTAND THAT?

16 A. YES, SIR, I UNDERSTAND.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR. ALRIGHT, MR.
18 RYANT, THANK YOU, SIR. APPRECIATE IT.

19 (Recess)

20 (Wherein, the following
21 takes place in the presence
22 of the jury venire.)

23 THE COURT: IS THE STATE READY TO PROCEED?

24 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, YOUR HONOR.

25 THE COURT: ARE THE DEFENDANTS READY TO PROCEED?

1 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

2 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

3 MR. KOGER: YES, YOUR HONOR.

4 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

5 MR. LACKEY: YES, YOUR HONOR.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. AND Y'ALL CAN ALREADY TELL,
7 BECAUSE WE HAVE A NUMBER OF DEFENSE ATTORNEYS OVER
8 HERE, IT'S GOING TO BE A GOOD MANY QUESTIONS. MR.
9 PASCOE, IF YOU WANT TO CALL THE CASE, PLEASE, SIR.

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

11 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

12 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AT THIS TIME, LADIES AND
13 GENTLEMEN, THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA CALLS THE CASE
14 OF THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA VERSUS CHRIS COLEMAN,
15 RALPH COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR,
16 AND MARIO SHIVERS, EACH DEFENDANT CHARGED WITH ONE
17 COUNT OF MURDER, ONE COUNT OF BURGLARY IN THE FIRST
18 DEGREE, AND ONE COUNT OF ARMED ROBBERY. THANK YOU,
19 YOUR HONOR.

20 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, MR. PASCOE.

21 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN OF THE JURY, WHAT WE'RE
22 GOING TO DO NOW IS, I'VE GOT TO STILL GO THROUGH A
23 LIST OF QUESTIONS TO FIND OUT IF YOU ARE QUALIFIED TO
24 SERVE AS A JUROR ON THIS CASE. AND I'M GOING TO BE
25 INTRODUCING, OR HAVING SOME PEOPLE INTRODUCE

1 THEMSELVES TO YOU, AND THEN I'VE GOT A LIST OF
2 WITNESSES TO GO THROUGH AND THINGS LIKE THAT. NOW,
3 ALL OF THE WITNESSES' NAMES THAT I AM GOING TO MENTION
4 WHEN I GO THROUGH THIS LIST MAY OR MAY NOT BE CALLED,
5 BUT I'M GOING TO CALL THEIR NAMES OUT AND FIND OUT IF
6 ANYBODY IN THE JURY PANEL KNOWS ANY OF THE WITNESSES,
7 ANY OF THE ATTORNEYS OR ANY OF THE GENTLEMEN THAT HAVE
8 BEEN CHARGED IN THIS CASE. SO, IF Y'ALL WILL BEAR
9 WITH ME WHILE WE DO THIS. AGAIN, IF YOU NEED TO
10 ANSWER A QUESTION I NEED FOR YOU TO STAND UP AND
11 PLEASE DO NOT SAY ANYTHING WHEN YOU STAND UP. WHAT I
12 NEED TO DO FIRST IS RECOGNIZE YOU, MAKE SURE I HAVE
13 YOUR NAME AND YOUR NUMBER AND THEN I WILL ASK YOU A
14 SPECIFIC QUESTION AND I NEED FOR YOU TO RESPOND TO MY
15 QUESTIONS AS I GO THROUGH AND ASK THEM. AND I NEED
16 FOR YOU TO ALLOW ME PLEASE, BECAUSE SOME OF MY
17 QUESTIONS ARE SORT OF LENGTHY, SO IF YOU WILL ALLOW ME
18 TO FINISH THE QUESTION BEFORE YOU ANSWER IT. I KNOW
19 EVERYBODY IS A LITTLE NERVOUS, WHENEVER YOU STAND UP
20 IN FRONT OF A CROWD IT GENERALLY MAKES PEOPLE NERVOUS,
21 BUT IF YOU WILL JUST, YOU KNOW, TAKE A DEEP BREATH
22 WE'LL GO THROUGH THIS AND IT OUGHT TO GO FINE.

23 ALRIGHT, MR. PASCOE, WOULD YOU MIND STANDING UP,
24 IDENTIFYING YOURSELF, MR. SORENSON, AND GIVE THE NAMES
25 OF THE ATTORNEYS THAT WORK IN YOUR OFFICE, PLEASE,

1 SIR.

2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME AGAIN
3 IS DAVID PASCOE, I'M THE SOLICITOR FOR ORANGEBURG
4 COUNTY. TRYING THIS CASE WITH ME THIS WEEK IS ONE OF
5 MY ASSISTANT SOLICITORS, DON SORENSON, MY VICTIM'S
6 ADVOCATE, TAMMY FRAZIER, IS GOING TO BE WITH US A GOOD
7 BIT THIS WEEK, AND JAMES SHUMPERT FROM THE ORANGEBURG
8 COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE. OTHER ASSISTANT SOLICITORS
9 IN MY OFFICE ARE TOMMY SCOTT, SARAH FORD, CRYSTAL
10 CHAPMAN, LYN GUSTUS, AND ROSS CLARIDAY.

11 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR. IS ANY MEMBER OF THE
12 JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD, MARRIAGE, CLOSE PERSONAL
13 FRIEND OF ANY OF THE PEOPLE THAT MR. PASCOE HAS NAMED?
14 IF SO IF YOU WOULD PLEASE STAND AT THIS TIME.

15 (Negative response from jury panel.)

16 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.
17 ALRIGHT, MR. CHRISTIAN COLEMAN IS REPRESENTED BY MR.
18 RICHARD LACKEY. MR. LACKEY, IF YOU'D PLEASE STAND AND
19 INTRODUCE YOURSELF AND HAVE YOUR CLIENT STAND.

20 MR. LACKEY: I'M RICHARD LACKEY. THIS IS MY
21 CLIENT, CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

22 THE COURT: OKAY, THANK Y'ALL, APPRECIATE IT.
23 ALRIGHT, IS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY
24 BLOOD, MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF MR.
25 RICHARD LACKEY? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

1 (Negative response from jury panel.)

2 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

3 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
4 MARRIAGE, OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF MR. CHRISTIAN
5 COLEMAN? IF SO, PLEASE STAND AT THIS TIME.

6 (Negative response from jury panel.)

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

8 MS. ULLMAN, IF YOU WOULDN'T MIND STANDING AND
9 INTRODUCING YOURSELF AND YOUR CLIENT, PLEASE, MA'AM,
10 AND MR. WISE.

11 MS. ULLMAN: MY NAME IS JILLIAN ULLMAN, I'M AN
12 ATTORNEY IN THE PUBLIC DEFENDER'S OFFICE. MY CLIENT IS
13 RALPH COLEMAN. ALSO WITH ME IS GOING TO BE MARK WISE,
14 HE'S ANOTHER ATTORNEY IN THE PUBLIC DEFENDER'S OFFICE
15 WHO'S GOING TO BE HERE.

16 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, MA'AM. IS ANY
17 MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR MARRIAGE
18 OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF MS. JILL ULLMAN OR MR.
19 MARK WISE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

20 (Negative response from jury panel.)

21 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

22 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
23 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF RALPH BERNARD
24 COLEMAN? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

25 (Negative response from jury panel.)

1 THE COURT: MR. PALMER, YOU REPRESENT MR. HARRIS.
2 IF YOU'D PLEASE INTRODUCE YOURSELF AND MR. HARRIS.

3 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR, GOOD
4 AFTERNOON, MY NAME IS SCOTT PALMER, I'M A SOLE
5 PRACTITIONER WITH THE W. SCOTT PALMER LAW FIRM, WITH
6 OFFICES IN SANTEE AND RIDGEVILLE, SOUTH CAROLINA.
7 TODAY MY CLIENT IS MR. WALTER LEE HARRIS.

8 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR. THANK Y'ALL.
9 IS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD
10 OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF MR. PALMER
11 OR HAVE BEEN REPRESENTED BY MR. PALMER? IF SO, PLEASE
12 STAND.

13 (Negative response from jury panel.)

14 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

15 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
16 MARRIAGE, OR CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF MR. WALTER LEE
17 HARRIS? IS SO, PLEASE STAND.

18 (Negative response from jury panel.)

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

20 ALRIGHT, MR. MELLARD, WOULD YOU PLEASE STAND,
21 INTRODUCE MR. RYANT, AND ALSO IF YOU WOULD NAME THE
22 OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC DEFENDER'S, THE ATTORNEYS
23 IN THE PUBLIC DEFENDER'S OFFICE.

24 MR. MELLARD: MY NAME IS DOUG MELLARD. AS YOU
25 HEARD, I WORK FOR THE ORANGEBURG PUBLIC DEFENDER'S

1 OFFICE. THE OTHER ATTORNEYS IN THE OFFICE ARE,
2 BESIDES MR. ULLMAN AND MR. WISE, ARE MS. PEGGY HINDS,
3 MR. ASH CHISOLM, OUR STAFF IS COMPRISED OF DEBORAH
4 MARTIN, LINDA EASTERLIN, CARLOS HOLBECK, AND LAUREN
5 DRIGGERS, AND THIS IS MY CLIENT, DANNY RYANT.

6 THE COURT: OKAY, THANK YOU, SIR.

7 ALRIGHT, IS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED
8 BY BLOOD OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF MR.
9 MELLARD OR ANY OF THE OTHER DEFENDANTS OR PEOPLE NAMED
10 WITH THE PUBLIC DEFENDER'S OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE
11 STAND AT THIS TIME.

12 (Positive response from jury panel.)

13 THE COURT: YES, SIR, YOUR NAME, PLEASE, SIR?

14 JUROR MINTZ: GYRON MINTZ.

15 THE COURT: HOLD ON ONE SECOND, LET ME GET MY ...

16 CLERK: ONE TWENTY-SEVEN.

17 THE COURT: HUH?

18 CLERK: ONE TWENTY-SEVEN.

19 THE COURT: ONE TWENTY-SEVEN, OH, MR. MINTZ,
20 GYRON MINTZ?

21 JUROR MINTZ: YES, SIR.

22 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. MINTZ, YOU HAVE BEEN
23 REPRESENTED BY THE PUBLIC DEFENDER'S OFFICE OR ARE YOU
24 FRIENDS WITH SOMEBODY IN THAT OFFICE?

25 JUROR MINTZ: OH, NO, BUT I KNOW THE DEFENDANT

1 RYANT.

2 THE COURT: OH, YOU KNOW MR. RYANT?

3 JUROR MINTZ: YES, SIR.

4 THE COURT: OKAY. HOW DO YOU KNOW MR. RYANT?

5 JUROR MINTZ: EVER SINCE WE WAS LITTLE BOYS.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR. MR. MINTZ, THE
7 FACT THAT YOU KNOW MR. RYANT, WOULD THAT AFFECT YOUR
8 ABILITY TO LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AND
9 RENDER A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL VERDICT?

10 JUROR MINTZ: YES, SIR.

11 THE COURT: IT WOULD AFFECT YOU?

12 JUROR MINTZ: YES.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, MR. MINTZ, YOU ARE
14 EXCUSED, BUT THANK YOU, SIR.

15 HE JUMPED AHEAD. IS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL
16 RELATED BY BLOOD OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL
17 FRIEND OF DANNY RYANT, JUNIOR? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.
18 (Negative response from jury panel.)

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NOBODY ELSE IS STANDING.

20 AND FINALLY, MR. KOGER, IF YOU'D STAND UP AND
21 INTRODUCE YOURSELF AND YOUR CLIENT, PLEASE, SIR.

22 MR. KOGER: MY NAME IS JOSHUA KOGER, JUNIOR,
23 OWNER AND FOUNDER OF KOGER LAW FIRM IN ORANGEBURG,
24 SOUTH CAROLINA. THIS IS MY CLIENT, MARIO SHIVERS.

25 THE COURT: THANK YOU. THANK YOU, GENTLEMEN,

1 Y'ALL MAY BE SEATED.

2 ALRIGHT. IS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED
3 BY BLOOD OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OR
4 HAVE BEEN REPRESENTED BY MR. JOSHUA KOGER? IF SO,
5 PLEASE STAND AT THIS TIME.

6 (Negative response from jury panel.)

7 THE COURT: IS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL
8 RELATED BY BLOOD OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL
9 FRIEND OF MARIO MONTEZ SHIVERS? IF SO, PLEASE STAND
10 AT THIS TIME.

11 (Negative response from jury panel.)

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

13 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I'M GOING TO GO THROUGH AN
14 EXTENSIVE LIST OF POSSIBLE WITNESSES, SO IF Y'ALL WILL
15 BEAR WITH ME, I'M GOING TO GO THROUGH THE LIST. IF
16 THOSE WITNESSES ARE PRESENT IN THE COURTROOM I'D ASK
17 YOU TO STAND. IF NOT, WE'LL JUST GO THROUGH AND
18 HOPEFULLY YOU CAN IDENTIFY THEM. IF THEY'RE CLOSE
19 PERSONAL FRIENDS OR YOU ARE RELATED TO THEM YOU OUGHT
20 TO KNOW THEM BY THEIR NAMES. OKAY? OKAY, THE FIRST
21 PERSON IS SERGEANT CRAIG DAVIS OF THE ORANGEBURG
22 COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT. ANYBODY RELATED BY BLOOD
23 OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF SERGEANT
24 CRAIG DAVIS OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE?
25 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

1 (Negative response from jury panel.)

2 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

3 IS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD
4 OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF DEPUTY,
5 INITIAL B, WESTBERRY, OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY
6 SHERIFF'S OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

7 (Negative response from jury panel.)

8 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

9 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
10 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF DEPUTY RYAN
11 HARTER OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT?
12 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

13 (Negative response from jury panel.)

14 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

15 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
16 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF LIEUTENANT
17 GERALD CARTER OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S
18 OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

19 (Negative response from jury panel.)

20 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

21 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
22 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF INVESTIGATOR
23 JARED KITRELL OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S
24 OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

25 (Negative response from jury panel.)

1 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

2 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
3 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF LIEUTENANT
4 JAMES SHUMPERT OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S
5 OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

6 (Negative response from jury panel.)

7 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

8 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
9 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF DEPUTY
10 FREDERICK EVANS OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S
11 OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

12 (Negative response from jury panel.)

13 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

14 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
15 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF INVESTIGATOR
16 TONY TURKVANT OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S
17 OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

18 (Negative response from jury panel.)

19 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

20 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
21 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF KIMBERLY PUGH
22 OF THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE? IF SO,
23 PLEASE STAND.

24 (Negative response from jury panel.)

25 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

1 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
2 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF INVESTIGATOR
3 BILLY ETHERIDGE OF THE DORCHESTER COUNTY SHERIFF'S
4 OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

5 (Negative response from jury panel.)

6 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

7 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
8 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF DR. JANICE
9 ROSS, OF THE NEWBERRY PATHOLOGY OFFICE? IF SO, PLEASE
10 STAND.

11 (Negative response from jury panel.)

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

13 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
14 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF ILA SIMMONS, OF
15 SOUTH CAROLINA LAW ENFORCEMENT DIVISION? IF SO,
16 PLEASE STAND.

17 (Negative response from jury panel.)

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

19 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
20 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF JAMES GREEN, OF
21 THE SOUTH CAROLINA LAW ENFORCEMENT DIVISION? IF SO,
22 PLEASE STAND.

23 (Negative response from jury panel.)

24 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

25 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR

1 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF JEREMY WEIS, OF
2 THE SOUTH CAROLINA LAW ENFORCEMENT DIVISION? IF SO,
3 PLEASE STAND.

4 (Negative response from jury panel.)

5 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

6 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
7 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF ANDRENA BELTON
8 AT SLED? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

9 (Negative response from jury panel.)

10 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

11 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
12 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF JASPER HUMBERT
13 FROM SLED? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

14 (Negative response from jury panel.)

15 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

16 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
17 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF NIKKI PERRY,
18 EMPLOYED AT SLED? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

19 (Negative response from jury panel.)

20 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

21 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
22 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF PATRICIA
23 CROOKS, WHO WORKS AT SLED? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

24 (Negative response from jury panel.)

25 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

1 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
2 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF ASHLEY PARLSEY,
3 P-A-R-S-L-E-Y? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

4 (Negative response from jury panel.)

5 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

6 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
7 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF SHANNON
8 MITCHELL? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

9 (Negative response from jury panel.)

10 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

11 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
12 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF PATRICK TYLER?
13 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

14 (Negative response from jury panel.)

15 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

16 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
17 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF MONEAK BUSBY?
18 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

19 (Negative response from jury panel.)

20 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

21 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
22 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF YVONNE
23 SHARPERSON? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

24 (Negative response from jury panel.)

25 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

1 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
2 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF ANDRE
3 WASHINGTON? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

4 (Negative response from jury panel.)

5 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

6 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
7 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF DARRIUS GARNER?
8 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

9 (Negative response from jury panel.)

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

11 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
12 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF CHRISTOPHER
13 DWIGHT? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

14 (Negative response from jury panel.)

15 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

16 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
17 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF SHELDON DAVIS?
18 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

19 (Negative response from jury panel.)

20 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

21 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
22 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF DEMETRIUS
23 JENKINS? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

24 (Negative response from jury panel.)

25 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

1 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
2 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF CRYSTAL MONROE?
3 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

4 (Negative response from jury panel.)

5 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

6 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
7 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF RONNIE
8 WASHINGTON? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

9 (Negative response from jury panel.)

10 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

11 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
12 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF NATHANIEL
13 HUBBARD, AND HE MIGHT THE HAVE NICK NAME OF ALL TEL.

14 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT: THAT'S WHERE HE WORKS.

15 THE COURT: OH, THAT'S WHERE HE WORKS. OH,
16 SORRY. I'VE HAD SO MUCH FUN, OKAY, HE WORKS AT ALL
17 TEL. OKAY. IT WOULD BE BETTER IF YOU HAD SOMEBODY
18 NAMED ALL TEL, BUT THAT'S OKAY. DOES ANYBODY KNOW
19 NATHANIEL HUBBARD?

20 (Positive response from jury panel.)

21 THE COURT: YES, MA'AM. HOLD ONE, ONE SECOND.
22 WHAT'S YOUR NAME, PLEASE, MA'AM?

23 JUROR BAIR: VIVIAN BAIR.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. MS. BAIR, YOU KNOW NATHANIEL
25 HUBBARD?

1 JUROR BAIR: YES, SIR.

2 THE COURT: OKAY. AND IS HE A CLOSE PERSONAL
3 FRIEND OF YOURS OR A RELATIVE?

4 JUROR BAIR: I TAUGHT HIM, AND HIS MOTHER IS ONE
5 OF MY VERY CLOSE FRIENDS.

6 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THE FACT THAT YOU TAUGHT
7 MR. HUBBARD, AND YOU'RE A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF HIS
8 MOTHER, WOULD THAT AFFECT YOUR ABILITY TO LISTEN TO
9 THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AND RENDER A FAIR AND
10 IMPARTIAL VERDICT?

11 JUROR BAIR: NO, SIR.

12 THE COURT: OKAY, IF YOU'D PLEASE STAY WITH US,
13 MS. BAIR, I'D APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU, MA'AM.

14 ALRIGHT, ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY
15 BLOOD OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF
16 INVESTIGATOR WALT TURNER? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

17 (Negative response from jury panel.)

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

19 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
20 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF INVESTIGATOR
21 KENNY KINSEY? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

22 (Negative response from jury panel.)

23 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. NO ONE IS STANDING.

24 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
25 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF SHIRLEY ANN

1 MONROE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

2 (Negative response from jury panel.)

3 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

4 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
5 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF NICOLE RENEE
6 MONROE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

7 (Negative response from jury panel.)

8 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

9 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
10 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF MAKEBIA MONROE?
11 DID I PRONOUNCE THAT CORRECTLY? OKAY, MAKEBIA MONROE.
12 (Negative response from jury panel.)

13 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

14 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
15 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF SHANIQUEA MOORE?
16 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

17 (Negative response from jury panel.)

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

19 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
20 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF SHERRY CHRISTY?
21 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

22 (Negative response from jury panel.)

23 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

24 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
25 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF LINDA MOORER?

1 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

2 (Negative response from jury panel.)

3 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

4 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
5 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF CASSANDRA
6 MOORER? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

7 (Negative response from jury panel.)

8 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

9 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
10 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF BRENDA DASH?
11 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

12 (Negative response from jury panel.)

13 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

14 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
15 MARRIAGE TO DANIELLE MONROE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

16 (Negative response from jury panel.)

17 THE COURT: NO ONE IS STANDING.

18 ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD OR
19 MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF ERIC BOVAIN?
20 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

21 (Negative response from jury panel.)

22 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

23 I KNOW Y'ALL ARE AS HAPPY AS I AM TO GET THROUGH
24 THAT LIST OF POSSIBLE WITNESSES. NOW, LET ME REMIND
25 YOU, THAT'S JUST POSSIBLE WITNESSES, THAT DOESN'T MEAN

1 WE WILL CALL EVERYBODY, THAT EVERYONE WILL BE CALLED.

2 ALRIGHT, I'VE GOT SOME OTHER QUESTIONS TO ASK
3 YOU. IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL WHO IS
4 RELATED BY BLOOD OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL
5 FRIEND OF ANYONE WHO WORKS FOR A LAW ENFORCEMENT
6 AGENCY? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

7 (Positive response from jury panel.)

8 THE COURT: OKAY. YOUR NAME, PLEASE, MA'AM?

9 JUROR LADSON: LORETTA LADSON.

10 THE COURT: LAST NAME AGAIN?

11 JUROR LADSON: LORETTA LADSON.

12 THE COURT: OH, LADSON, OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND MS.
13 LADSON, ARE YOU RELATED OR A FRIEND OF SOMEONE IN LAW
14 ENFORCEMENT?

15 JUROR LADSON: YES, I'M MARRIED TO HIM.

16 THE COURT: OH, SO YOU MIGHT BE FRIENDS, RIGHT?

17 JUROR LADSON: YES, SIR.

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THAT'S RIGHT, YOUR HUSBAND
19 WORKS AT THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

20 JUROR LADSON: CORRECT.

21 THE COURT: OKAY. AND THE FACT THAT YOUR HUSBAND
22 WORKS IN THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE WOULD THAT AFFECT YOUR
23 ABILITY TO LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AND
24 RENDER A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL VERDICT?

25 JUROR LADSON: (Nods head in the negative.)

1 THE COURT: IS THAT A NO?

2 JUROR LADSON: NO.

3 THE COURT: OKAY. IF YOU'D STAY WITH US. MS.
4 LADSON, I'D APPRECIATE IT. OKAY? THANK YOU, MA'AM.

5 YOUR NAME, PLEASE, MA'AM?

6 JUROR HICKS: THOMASENIA HICKS.

7 THE COURT: OKAY, JUROR NUMBER SEVENTY-EIGHT, MS.
8 HICKS. YOU ARE, IS IT, YOU ARE RELATED TO SOMEONE WHO
9 WORKS IN LAW ENFORCEMENT?

10 JUROR HICKS: YES.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. AND WHERE DO THEY, WHAT LAW
12 ENFORCEMENT AGENCY DO THEY WORK FOR?

13 JUROR HICKS: ORANGEBURG COUNTY.

14 THE COURT: ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE.
15 OKAY. AND MS. HICKS, THE FACT -- WHAT TYPE RELATIVE
16 IS IT, A COUSIN OR - - -

17 JUROR HICKS: MY NEPHEW.

18 THE COURT: YOUR NEPHEW. OKAY. ALRIGHT, MS.
19 HICKS, THE FACT THAT YOUR NEPHEW WORKS FOR THE
20 ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT, WOULD THAT
21 AFFECT YOUR ABILITY TO LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE IN THIS
22 CASE AND RENDER A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL VERDICT?

23 JUROR HICKS: NO.

24 THE COURT: NO? OKAY. IF YOU'D STAY WITH US,
25 THEN, PLEASE, MS. HICKS, I'D APPRECIATE IT.

1 AND THE GENTLEMAN BACK THERE, YES, SIR, YOUR
2 NAME?

3 JUROR HEADDEN: JAMIE HEADDEN.

4 THE COURT: MR. HEADDEN, NUMBER SEVENTY-SEVEN.
5 MR. HEADDEN, DO YOU HAVE A RELATIVE THAT WORKS IN LAW
6 ENFORCEMENT?

7 JUROR HEADDEN: YES.

8 THE COURT: WHAT RELATIVE, A COUSIN OR -- A
9 COUSIN?

10 JUROR HEADDEN: YES.

11 THE COURT: FIRST COUSIN, SECOND COUSIN?

12 JUROR HEADDEN: FIRST, FIRST COUSIN.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. WHICH LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY DO
14 THEY WORK WITH?

15 JUROR HEADDEN: DEPUTY, IN ORANGEBURG.

16 THE COURT: IN ORANGEBURG. OKAY. THE FACT THAT
17 YOU HAVE A COUSIN THAT WORKS IN THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY
18 SHERIFF'S OFFICE, WOULD THAT AFFECT YOUR ABILITY TO
19 LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AND RENDER A FAIR
20 AND IMPARTIAL VERDICT?

21 JUROR HEADDEN: NO.

22 THE COURT: IS THAT A NO?

23 JUROR HEADDEN: NO, IT WOULD NOT.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. IF YOU WOULD STAY WITH US,
25 PLEASE, MR. HEADDEN, THANK YOU, SIR.

1 OH, I'M SORRY, I'M SORRY. YES, MA'AM, YOUR
2 NAME?

3 JUROR KITTRELL: WANDA KITTRELL.

4 THE COURT: JUROR NUMBER ONE TEN?

5 JUROR KITTRELL: YES, SIR.

6 THE COURT: OKAY, MS. KITTRELL, DO YOU HAVE A
7 RELATIVE THAT WORKS IN LAW ENFORCEMENT?

8 JUROR KITTRELL: JUST A PERSONAL FRIEND.

9 THE COURT: A PERSONAL FRIEND WORKS IN WHICH LAW
10 ENFORCEMENT AGENCY?

11 JUROR KITTRELL: SHERIFF BARBARA WALTERS.

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THE FACT THAT YOU KNOW THE
13 SHERIFF, WOULD THAT AFFECT YOUR ABILITY TO LISTEN TO
14 THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AND RENDER A FAIR AND
15 IMPARTIAL VERDICT?

16 JUROR KITTRELL: IT WOULD NOT.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. IF YOU'D STAY WITH US, MS.
18 KITTRELL, I'D APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU, MA'AM.

19 ALRIGHT. HAS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL OR ANY
20 MEMBER OF THEIR FAMILY, WHETHER RELATED BY BLOOD OR
21 MARRIAGE, BEEN EMPLOYED AT THE ATTORNEY GENERAL'S
22 OFFICE, THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE, OR ANY PROSECUTING
23 ATTORNEY'S OFFICE? ANYBODY IN THE PAST, ANY MEMBER OF
24 THE JURY PANEL, ANY MEMBER OF YOUR FAMILY, WHETHER BY
25 BLOOD OR MARRIAGE, WORKED FOR ANY LAW ENFORCEMENT

1 AGENCY OTHER -- I KNOW SOME OF YOU STOOD UP AND SAID
2 YOU WERE RELATED. ANYBODY ELSE?

3 (Negative response from jury panel.)

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE ELSE IS STANDING.
5 THANK YOU.

6 HAS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL EVER BEEN
7 EMPLOYED BY ANY CIVILIAN OR MILITARY LAW ENFORCEMENT
8 AGENCY? IF THAT'S -- AHH, THE RETIRED MARINE. YES,
9 SIR, YOUR NAME, PLEASE, SIR?

10 JUROR CILA: ANTHONY CILA.

11 THE COURT: OKAY, HOLD ON ONE SECOND. WHAT
12 NUMBER IS THIS?

13 CLERK: NUMBER THIRTY.

14 THE COURT: NUMBER THIRTY? OKAY. I'M SORRY. MR.
15 CILA, YOU TOLD ME YOU ARE A RETIRED MARINE, YOU HAD
16 BEEN IN SERVICE FOR THIRTY-FIVE YEARS?

17 JUROR CILA: THIRTY-FIVE YEARS, AND I SERVED
18 DIRECTLY WITH THE DEA AND THE SECRET SERVICE.

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR, THE FACT THAT YOU HAD
20 SERVED WITH DEA OR SECRET SERVICE, WOULD THAT AFFECT
21 YOUR ABILITY TO LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE
22 AND RENDER A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL VERDICT?

23 JUROR CILA: NO, NOT AT ALL.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR, IF YOU'D
25 PLEASE STAY WITH US.

1 AND YES, SIR, YOUR NAME, PLEASE, SIR?

2 JUROR POOR: RICHLAND COUNTY.

3 THE COURT: SIR?

4 JUROR POOR: ONE FORTY-ONE, RICHLAND COUNTY.

5 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, YOU'RE MR. POOR?

6 JUROR POOR: YES, SIR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. YOU -- THAT'S RIGHT, YOU SAID
8 YOU USED TO WORK AT THE RICHLAND COUNTY DETENTION
9 CENTER.

10 JUROR POOR: YES, SIR.

11 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR, THE FACT THAT YOU USED
12 TO WORK AT THE RICHLAND COUNTY DETENTION CENTER, WOULD
13 THAT AFFECT OUR ABILITY TO LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE IN
14 THIS CASE AND RENDER A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL VERDICT?

15 JUROR POOR: IT WOULDN'T AFFECT ME.

16 THE COURT: OKAY, THANK YOU, MR. POOR, IF YOU
17 WOULD STAY WITH US, PLEASE, SIR.

18 IS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL RELATED BY BLOOD
19 OR MARRIAGE OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND OF CHARLES
20 PRINGLE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

21 (Negative response from jury panel.)

22 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

23 HAS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL READ, HEARD,
24 SEEN ANYTHING ON T.V. ABOUT THIS CASE BEFORE TODAY, OR
25 EVEN TODAY BEFORE YOU CAME INTO COURT TODAY? HAS

1 ANYBODY HEARD ANYTHING ABOUT THIS CASE? IF SO, PLEASE
2 STAND.

3 (Negative response from jury panel.)

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING. THANK
5 YOU.

6 HAS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL FORMED ANY
7 OPINION ABOUT THIS CASE? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

8 (Negative response from jury panel.)

9 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

10 HAS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL, A MEMBER OF
11 YOUR FAMILY OR A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND EVER BEEN THE
12 VICTIM OF A CRIME? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

13 (Positive response from jury panel.)

14 THE COURT: OKAY, IF Y'ALL WOULD JUST STAND UP
15 I'LL CALL YOU ONE AT A TIME. ALRIGHT, YES, MA'AM,
16 YOUR NAME?

17 JUROR FRALIX: DONNA FRALIX.

18 THE COURT: OKAY, MS. FRALIX, BEAR WITH ME FOR
19 ONE SECOND. MS. FRALIX, YOU ARE JUROR NUMBER FORTY-
20 SIX?

21 JUROR FRALIX: YES, SIR.

22 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MS. FRALIX, HAVE YOU BEEN
23 THE VICTIM OF A CRIME?

24 JUROR FRALIX: NO, SIR.

25 THE COURT: OKAY, A CLOSE PERSONAL ...

1 JUROR FRALIX: MY SISTER -- MY SISTER-IN-LAW.

2 THE COURT: OKAY. YOUR SISTER-IN-LAW? ALRIGHT,
3 THE FACT THAT YOUR SISTER-IN-LAW WAS THE VICTIM OF A
4 CRIME, WOULD THAT AFFECT YOUR ABILITY TO LISTEN TO THE
5 EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AND RENDER A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL
6 VERDICT?

7 JUROR FRALIX: NO, SIR.

8 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, MA'AM. IF YOU'D
9 PLEASE STAY WITH US.

10 YOUR NAME AGAIN, PLEASE, SIR?

11 JUROR DEBAY: DEBAY.

12 COURT REPORTER: WHAT IS HIS NAME?

13 THE COURT: MR. DEBAY. HE IS BETWEEN NUMBERS
14 FORTY AND FORTY-FOUR, MR. DEBAY, CORRECT?

15 JUROR DEBAY: YES, SIR.

16 THE COURT: OKAY, MR. DEBAY, HAVE YOU BEEN THE
17 VICTIM OF A CRIME?

18 JUROR DEBAY: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR. THE FACT THAT YOU'VE
20 BEEN THE VICTIM OF A CRIME, WOULD THAT AFFECT YOUR
21 ABILITY TO LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AND
22 RENDER - - -

23 JUROR DEBAY: YES, SIR.

24 THE COURT: IT WOULD AFFECT YOUR ABILITY?

25 JUROR DEBAY: IT WOULD.

1 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR, YOU ARE EXCUSED,
2 MR. DEBAY.

3 JUROR DEBAY: THANK YOU.

4 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.

5 ANYBODY ELSE?

6 (Negative response from jury panel.)

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU. ALRIGHT, IS ANY
8 MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL, A MEMBER OF YOUR FAMILY, OR
9 A CLOSE PERSONAL FRIEND A MEMBER OF MADD, SADD, CAVE
10 OR OTHER SIMILAR TYPE ORGANIZATIONS, INCLUDING
11 NEIGHBORHOOD WATCH PROGRAMS WHICH HAVE THE GOAL OF THE
12 PROMOTION ON LAW ENFORCEMENT OR CRIME PREVENTION? IF
13 SO, PLEASE STAND.

14 (Negative response from jury panel.)

15 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

16 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WHEN SOLICITOR PASCOE
17 CALLED THE CASE HE ADVISED YOU THAT THIS IS A CASE
18 INVOLVING CHARGES OF MURDER, BURGLARY - - -

19 SOLICITOR PASCOE: BURGLARY, FIRST, YOUR HONOR,
20 AND ARMED ROBBERY.

21 THE COURT: --- AND ARMED ROBBERY. OKAY. WOULD
22 THE FACT -- WOULD ANYTHING IN THE NATURE OF THE
23 ALLEGATIONS OF THIS CASE CAUSE ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY
24 PANEL A PROBLEM SITTING AS A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL JUROR
25 IN THIS MATTER? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

1 (Negative response from jury panel.)

2 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

3 TESTIMONY IN THIS CASE MAY INVOLVE THE TESTIMONY
4 OF THE USE OF ALCOHOL AND ILLEGAL DRUGS AND THE
5 DISTRIBUTION OF ILLEGAL DRUGS. DOES ANY MEMBER OF THE
6 JURY PANEL BELIEVE THEY WILL HAVE ANY PROBLEM BEING A
7 FAIR AND IMPARTIAL JUROR IN A CASE WHEN YOU HAVE
8 TESTIMONY TO THAT EFFECT? IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

9 (Positive response from jury panel.)

10 THE COURT: OKAY. AGAIN, YOUR NAME, PLEASE
11 MA'AM, IS?

12 JUROR FRALIX: DONNA FRALIX.

13 THE COURT: OKAY, MS. FRALIX, YOU THINK YOU WOULD
14 HAVE A HARD TIME BEING A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL JUROR IN A
15 SITUATION ...

16 JUROR FRALIX: YES, SIR, I HAVE TWO BROTHERS,
17 BOTH ON DRUGS.

18 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, MS. FRALIX, YOU ARE
19 EXCUSED.

20 JUROR FRALIX: THANK YOU.

21 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, MA'AM. THAT'S
22 JUROR NUMBER -- YOU'RE JUROR NUMBER FORTY-SIX?

23 JUROR FRALIX: FORTY-SIX.

24 THE COURT: OKAY, THANK YOU, MA'AM.

25 HAS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL EVER RECEIVED

1 ASSISTANCE FROM THE VICTIM'S ADVOCACY PROGRAM? IF SO,
2 PLEASE STAND AT THIS TIME?

3 (Negative response from jury panel.)

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

5 HAS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL EVER BEEN
6 PROSECUTED HERE OR ANYWHERE, HAVE YOU EVER BEEN
7 PROSECUTED? IF SO, PLEASE STAND. ANY MEMBER OF THE
8 JURY PANEL OR YOUR FAMILY EVER BEEN PROSECUTED?

9 (Negative response from jury panel.)

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

11 IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL WHO
12 BELIEVES -- OTHER THAN THE ONES I'VE TALKED TO ALREADY
13 -- ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL BELIEVE THAT THEY WILL
14 HAVE ANY PROBLEMS SERVING AS A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL
15 JUROR IN THIS CASE?

16 (Negative response from jury panel.)

17 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING.

18 HAS ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL OR A MEMBER OF
19 YOUR FAMILY EVER BEEN INVOLVED IN LITIGATION, OR DO
20 YOU HAVE FRIENDS OR ASSOCIATES WHO ARE ATTORNEYS? IF
21 SO, PLEASE STAND.

22 (Positive response from jury panel.)

23 THE COURT: OKAY, MR. BEACH, YOU'VE ALREADY
24 TESTIFIED THAT YOU ARE AN ATTORNEY. THE FACT THAT YOU
25 ARE AN ATTORNEY IS NOT GOING TO AFFECT YOUR ABILITY TO

1 LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE AND RENDER A FAIR
2 AND IMPARTIAL VERDICT, IS IT?

3 JUROR BEACH: IT WOULD NOT, YOUR HONOR.

4 THE COURT: OKAY, THANK YOU, SIR.

5 ALRIGHT. ANY OTHER VOIR DIRE BY THE STATE?

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, YOUR HONOR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. LET'S SEE, MR. LACKEY, ANY
8 OTHER VOIR DIRE BY YOUR DEFENDANT?

9 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. MS. ULLMAN, ANY OTHER VOIR
11 DIRE?

12 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, MAY I APPROACH FOR A
13 MOMENT?

14 THE COURT: SURE.

15 (Whereupon, a bench conference
16 is had out of the hearing of
17 the jury panel and court reporter.)

18 THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, ONE OF THE
19 THINGS THAT I FAILED TO MENTION, EVEN THOUGH I ASKED
20 YOU A QUESTION ABOUT WHETHER YOU KNEW ANYTHING ABOUT
21 THE CASE, I DIDN'T REALLY GIVE Y'ALL A WHOLE LOT OF
22 INFORMATION. I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU JUST A LITTLE BIT
23 MORE INFORMATION AND REPHRASE THE QUESTION. THE
24 VICTIM IN THIS CASE WAS MR. CHARLES PRINGLE, WHOSE
25 NAME I ASKED YOU IF ANYBODY KNEW MR. PRINGLE. AND MR.

1 PRINGLE WAS KILLED ON MARCH THE SECOND OF TWO
2 THOUSAND AND TEN, I MEAN, MARCH THE TWELFTH, EXCUSE
3 ME, TWO THOUSAND TEN. NOW, I'M GOING TO ASK EVERYBODY
4 ON THE JURY PANEL AGAIN, DOES ANYBODY ON THE JURY
5 PANEL KNOW ANYTHING ABOUT THE CHARGES RELATED TO THE
6 DEATH OF MR. CHARLES PRINGLE HERE IN ORANGEBURG COUNTY
7 ON OR ABOUT MARCH THE TWELFTH, TWO THOUSAND AND TEN?
8 IF SO, PLEASE STAND.

9 (Negative response from jury panel.)

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, NO ONE IS STANDING. OKAY,
11 THANK YOU.

12 MS. ULLMAN, ANYTHING ELSE?

13 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. PALMER?

15 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. MELLARD?

17 MR. MELLARD: NO, YOUR HONOR.

18 THE COURT: MR. KOGER?

19 MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

20 THE COURT: OKAY. Y'ALL SEE HOW MUCH FUN I'M
21 GOING TO HAVE. OKAY? ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,
22 WE HAVE CONCLUDED ALL OF THE QUESTIONS THAT WE'RE
23 GOING TO ASK. WE'RE GOING TO TAKE ANOTHER BREAK WHILE
24 WE GET THE JURY LIST TOGETHER TO SEE WHO MIGHT GET
25 CHOSEN FOR THE JURY THIS TIME, SO KEEP YOUR FINGERS

1 CROSSED, YOU HAVE A CHANCE TO BE PICKED ON THE JURY.
2 BUT WHILE THEY'RE DOING THAT IT'S GOING TO TAKE A
3 WHILE. I'M GOING TO ALLOW Y'ALL TO GET UP, IF Y'ALL
4 WANT TO GO AND USE THE BATH ROOM.

5 AND DEPUTY ASBERRY, IT'S GOING TO BE A WHILE SO
6 IF SOMEBODY WANTS TO STEP OUTSIDE AND TAKE A SMOKE
7 THEY'LL HAVE TIME TO DO THAT.

8 DEPUTY ASBERRY: YES, SIR.

9 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, LADIES AND
10 GENTLEMEN, IF Y'ALL WILL JUST BEAR WITH US FOR A
11 LITTLE WHILE. OKAY? THANK YOU.

12 (Whereupon, the entire jury panel
13 leaves the courtroom and the following
14 takes place out of the presence
15 of the jury panel.)

16 THE COURT: OKAY, BEFORE WE GO ANY FURTHER, THE
17 COURT IS GOING TO STRIKE FREDDIE SHULER. OKAY? HE'S
18 NUMBER ONE SIXTY-TWO, SO Y'ALL TAKE HIM OFF THE LIST,
19 BECAUSE HE HAD THE PRIOR BURGLARY CONVICTION. SO, HE
20 IS OFF THE LIST. OKAY?

21 NOW, BEFORE WE GO AND START PICKING THE JURY, ANY
22 REQUESTS OR MOTIONS FROM THE STATE REGARDING THE
23 REMAINING PEOPLE ON THE LIST?

24 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE
25 FOR ONE SECOND.

1 THE COURT: OH, YEAH, TAKE YOUR TIME.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, I'M WAITING ON
3 SOME MORE INFORMATION ABOUT ONE SPECIFIC JUROR, TAMMY
4 SEAWRIGHT. I BELIEVE SHE WAS PROSECUTED BY MY OFFICE
5 IN TWO THOUSAND NINE AND RECEIVED A CONVICTION. AND
6 YOU ASKED THE QUESTION, HAS ANYBODY BEEN PROSECUTED BY
7 MY OFFICE AND SHE DIDN'T STAND UP.

8 JILL, DO YOU KNOW, DID YOU REPRESENT MS.
9 SEAWRIGHT?

10 MS. ULLMAN: PEGGY ACTUALLY REPRESENTED HER, SHE
11 WAS CONVICTED OF UNLAWFUL CARRYING OF A PISTOL, AND I
12 BELIEVE RECEIVED PROBATION.

13 SOLICITOR SORENSON: BUT SHE DIDN'T STAND UP.
14 THAT'S CERTAINLY OBVIOUSLY A REASON TO STRIKE HER FOR
15 CAUSE, BUT AT THE SAME TIME I MIGHT HAVE ENOUGH
16 STRIKES SO I COULD PROBABLY CUT HER.

17 THE COURT: WELL, PARTICULARLY, THE WAY THIS LIST
18 IS GOING, I WOULD, I WOULD RATHER NOT DO THAT.

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: WE HAVE TEN STRIKES, WHICH
20 IS UNCOMMON FOR FORTY-TWO JURORS. I'LL LEAVE IT UP
21 TO THE COURT IF YOU DON'T WANT ME TO STRIKE HER FOR
22 CAUSE.

23 THE COURT: I'D RATHER JUST, IF YOU DECIDE YOU
24 WANT TO STRIKE HER YOU CAN STRIKE HER.

25 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, THAT'S FINE.

1 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR. OKAY. MR. LACKEY,
2 ANYTHING FROM YOU REGARDING ANY OF THE REMAINING
3 JURORS?

4 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

5 THE COURT: OKAY, MS. ULLMAN?

6 MS. ULLMAN: I HAVE TWO ISSUES. THE FIRST ISSUE
7 WOULD BE A MOTION FOR A CHANGE OF VENUE IN THIS CASE
8 REGARDING RALPH COLEMAN. I DON'T BELIEVE THAT THE
9 JURY WAS REALLY GIVEN OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS WHETHER
10 THEY HAD FORMED ANY SORT OF AN OPINION ABOUT THIS
11 CASE, AND THE REASON I SAY THAT IS, BASED ON THE
12 INFORMATION THEY RECEIVED I THINK IT WOULD BE VERY
13 HARD FOR THEM TO TRY TO REMEMBER WHAT HAD HAPPENED,
14 AND IF THEY DID REMEMBER ANYTHING FROM THAT. ALSO
15 WITH REGARDS TO THE CHANGE OF VENUE, YOUR HONOR, I
16 BELIEVE THAT ANY JURY PANEL PUT TOGETHER HERE IN
17 ORANGEBURG COUNTY AT THIS TIME WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO BE
18 FAIR AND IMPARTIAL JUST BASED ON WHAT'S BEEN GOING ON
19 IN THE COMMUNITY. I BELIEVE IN NOVEMBER THERE WERE
20 FOUR MURDERS, TWO ATTEMPTED MURDERS, AND SOME OTHER
21 VERY SERIOUS CRIMES, ALONG WITH NUMEROUS BURGLARY,
22 FIRST DEGREES, SECOND DEGREE CHARGES. WORKING IN THE
23 PUBLIC DEFENDER'S OFFICE, OBVIOUSLY, I HAVE KNOWLEDGE
24 ABOUT THE KIND OF CHARGES THAT HAVE BEEN COMING
25 THROUGH. THIS YEAR SPECIFICALLY HAS BEEN A VERY

1 VIOLENT YEAR INCLUDING NUMEROUS MURDERS, AND I DO
2 THINK THAT ANY JUROR FROM ORANGEBURG COUNTY CERTAINLY
3 KNOWS OF WHAT'S BEEN GOING ON AND CERTAINLY IS
4 PROBABLY FED UP WITH WHAT'S GOING ON AND VERY WELL
5 COULD BE BIASED BECAUSE OF THAT.

6 THE COURT: WELL, DID ANY OTHER DEFENDANT'S
7 ATTORNEY WANT TO JOIN IN THAT MOTION?

8 MR. LACKEY: WE WOULD JOIN IN THAT MOTION.

9 MR. PALMER: WE WOULD AS WELL, YOUR HONOR.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, I'VE READ THE
11 EXTENSIVE LIST OF WITNESSES. I HAVE A JURY PANEL WHO
12 DIDN'T KNOW ANYBODY EXCEPT FOR JUST A COUPLE OF
13 PEOPLE. THE -- GRANTED, I UNDERSTAND YOUR CONCERNS
14 ABOUT THE FACT THAT THE TIMES AND DEMOCRAT HAS DONE AN
15 EXCELLENT JOB OF REPORTING THE MANY INCIDENTS THAT
16 HAVE OCCURRED IN THE COUNTY DURING THE PAST YEAR. BUT
17 HAVING SAID THAT, I'M NOT CONVINCED THAT THAT IS A
18 REASON TO CHANGE VENUE. IT APPEARS TO ME THAT WE HAVE
19 A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL JURY PANEL WITH WHICH TO CHOOSE
20 FROM, SO I'M GOING TO DENY YOUR MOTIONS, ALL THREE
21 MOTIONS TO CHANGE VENUE, BUT I WILL NOTE YOUR
22 OBJECTION TO MY FAILURE TO CHANGE VENUE.

23 MS. ULLMAN: OKAY. I HAVE ONE MORE ISSUE, YOUR
24 HONOR, I WANT TO BRING UP.

25 THE COURT: YES, MA'AM.

1 MS. ULLMAN: EARLIER TODAY WE DISCUSSED A
2 POTENTIAL, JUROR NUMBER ONE THIRTY-TWO, LINDA MOORER,

3 - - -

4 THE COURT: OH, YEAH, THAT'S RIGHT.

5 MS. ULLMAN: --- IN OUR DISCUSSIONS. SHE READILY
6 ADMITTED THAT SHE WAS THE MOTHER OF MY CLIENT'S
7 FIANCÉ, - - -

8 THE COURT: RIGHT.

9 MS. ULLMAN: AND THE STATE REQUESTED THAT YOU
10 EXCUSE HER, I REQUESTED THAT YOU ALLOW HER TO COME IN
11 AND BE PART OF THE JURY AND INQUIRE AS TO WHETHER SHE
12 COULD BE FAIR AND IMPARTIAL JUST AS YOU DID WITH MR.
13 MINTZ, I BELIEVE, WHO SAID HE KNEW DANNY RYANT. THE
14 COURT OBVIOUSLY - - -

15 THE COURT: WHO SAID HE KNEW -- WHO?

16 MS. ULLMAN: MR. MINTZ SAID HE KNEW DANNY RYANT,
17 I BELIEVE.

18 THE COURT: RIGHT.

19 MS. ULLMAN: HE SAID HE COULD NOT BE IMPARTIAL
20 AND YOU EXCUSED HIM.

21 THE COURT: RIGHT.

22 MS. ULLMAN: THE POINT IS, I ASKED YOU ON LINDA
23 MOORER TO DO THE SAME. WE HAD DECIDED THAT DUE TO HER
24 RELATIONSHIP TO A POTENTIAL ALIBI WITNESS FROM THE
25 DEFENSE THAT SHE WOULD BE EXCUSED. SHE WAS NOT PART

1 OF THE PANEL AT ALL. I JUST WANTED THAT TO BE PART OF
2 THE RECORD.

3 THE COURT: OKAY. AND I DID DO THAT, AND YOU DID
4 WANT ME TO DO THAT BUT I DID NOT FEEL THAT, AS I TOLD
5 YOU PRIOR TO THE HEARING TODAY, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING
6 THAT MS. MOORER IS THE MOTHER OF, WHAT IS IT, SHANIQUA
7 MOORER?

8 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

9 THE COURT: AND MS. MOORER HAS A CHILD BY MR.
10 RALPH COLEMAN?

11 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. AND THAT WOULD -- I THINK THAT
13 COULD HAVE BEEN A PROBLEM FOR MR. COLEMAN, OR IT COULD
14 HAVE BEEN -- IT COULD HAVE BEEN A POSITIVE OR A
15 PROBLEM FOR HIM, BUT BECAUSE OF THAT CONNECTION I
16 EXCUSED HER, AND I ALSO EXCUSED HER BECAUSE I DIDN'T
17 WANT HER TO ACCIDENTALLY SAY SOMETHING IF I WAS
18 QUESTIONING HER THAT COULD INFLUENCE THE ENTIRE PANEL,
19 BUT I WILL NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO MY DOING THAT.

20 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR. I WOULD NOTE, MY DEFENSE
21 WITNESS HAS ADDED LINDA MOORER AS A POTENTIAL WITNESS.
22 SHE HAS NOTHING TO DO WITH THE ALIBI WE MAY PUT
23 FORWARD. IN SPEAKING WITH MY CLIENT AND EXPLAINING
24 WHAT HAPPENED WITH HER BEING EXCUSED HE DID TELL ME
25 THAT SHE MAY ABLE TO SUPPLY SOME CHARACTER EVIDENCE.

1 I DID PUT HER ON THAT LIST AFTER KNOWING SHE WAS NOT
2 GOING TO BE A POTENTIAL JUROR.

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: WHICH I WANT TO MAKE SURE
4 THAT'S ON THE RECORD, YOUR HONOR.

5 THE COURT: WELL, THIS IS ON THE RECORD, RIGHT.

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YEAH. SHE'S MAKING THIS
7 MOTION THAT YOU SHOULD HAVE KEPT LINDA MOORER IN THE
8 JURY POOL, BUT THEN SHE PUTS LINDA MOORER ON THE
9 WITNESS LIST.

10 THE COURT: NO, I -- WE -- YEAH.

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THAT'S INCREDIBLE.

12 THE COURT: IT'S ON THE RECORD. OKAY.

13 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

14 THE COURT: MR. PALMER, ANYTHING?

15 MR. PALMER: NOTHING ELSE, YOUR HONOR.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. MELLARD?

17 MR. MELLARD: NOTHING ELSE, YOUR HONOR.

18 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. KOGER?

19 MR. KOGER: NOTHING.

20 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. NOW, IT'S MY UNDERSTAND --
21 ARE WE READY TO RUN THE LIST? OKAY. NOW, WHAT WE'RE
22 GOING TO DO A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENTLY THIS TIME IS,
23 WHEN YOU DO IT I NEED TO PRINT, I'M GOING TO GO AHEAD
24 AND PRINT THE LIST AND GIVE IT TO ALL OF THE ATTORNEYS
25 RATHER THAN JUST CALL THEM UP HERE. OKAY? SO, ONE,

1 TWO, THREE, FOUR, FIVE, SIX, SEVEN, EIGHT - OH, NO,
2 WE'VE GOT TO PULL, YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO PULL
3 EVERYBODY.

4 CLERK: PULL EVERYBODY?

5 THE COURT: PULL EVERYBODY THAT'S LEFT ON THE
6 LIST, PULL THEM. OKAY.

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THEY JUST TOLD ME THAT
8 APPARENTLY, ONE OF THE JURORS IN THE BACK WITH A RED
9 SHIRT ON HAD TOLD, I GUESS, THE DEPUTY IN THE BACK
10 THAT HE HAD BEEN PROSECUTED IN THE PAST, AND I THINK
11 IT WAS DISMISSED, BUT DIDN'T STAND UP, I GUESS, WHEN
12 YOU HAD ASKED THAT QUESTION. SO ...

13 THE COURT: OKAY. I THINK MS. JACKSON, OR ...

14 MS. JACKSON: THE CHARGES WERE DROPPED WAS HOW HE
15 PHRASED IT.

16 COURT REPORTER: I'M SORRY, I DIDN'T HEAR THAT.

17 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THE CHARGES WERE DROPPED WAS
18 HOW HE PHRASED IT.

19 THE COURT: OKAY.

20 COURT REPORTER: AND WHAT WAS HIS NAME?

21 THE COURT: WE DON'T KNOW HIS NAME.

22 DEPUTY: I'LL FIND OUT.

23 THE COURT: IF YOU'LL JUST FIND OUT HIS NAME
24 WE'LL MAKE SURE EVERYBODY IS AWARE OF THAT. OKAY?
25 AND THEN YOU CAN GO AHEAD AND BRING -- WELL, WE'RE

1 GOING TO GIVE Y'ALL THE LIST OF EVERYBODY, AND THEN
2 WE'LL GIVE Y'ALL A FEW MINUTES TO -- WHERE DO Y'ALL
3 WANT TO GO?

4 MS. ULLMAN: WE COULD RECESS TO THE JURY ROOM
5 UNTIL IT BECOMES THE JURY ROOM.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. OKAY. Y'ALL CAN DO THAT, --
7 AND Y'ALL STAY RIGHT HERE.

8 SOLICITOR SORENSON: WE'LL SIT RIGHT HERE, YES.

9 THE COURT: OKAY. AND WHILE Y'ALL ARE IN THE
10 JURY ROOM YOUR CLIENTS ARE GOING TO GO BACK THERE?

11 MR. ULLMAN: WHEREVER YOU WOULD LIKE, YOUR HONOR.

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IF WE TAKE THEM BACK -- I'LL
13 LEAVE IT UP TO THEM, BUT MAYBE IT WOULD BE MORE
14 CONVENIENT JUST TO LEAVE THEM SITTING HERE.

15 THE COURT: WHAT'S EASIER FOR Y'ALL? BACK THERE?
16 OKAY. AND WE'LL TAKE A BREAK, AND I'LL GET Y'ALL --
17 IF YOU WANT TO, GO AHEAD AND TAKE THEM ON BACK THERE
18 RIGHT NOW. OKAY? AND GENTLEMEN, IF Y'ALL WILL GO ON
19 BACK THERE. THANK Y'ALL.

20 RICHARD -- I WANT TO SEE EVERYBODY WITH THE PRESS
21 BACK HERE. OKAY?

22 (Recess)

23 THE COURT: MS. WALKER, WE'RE GOING TO GO BACK ON
24 THE RECORD?

25 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

1 THE COURT: OKAY. IS THE STATE READY TO PROCEED?

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, YOUR HONOR.

3 THE COURT: OKAY. ARE THE DEFENDANTS READY TO
4 PROCEED?

5 MS. ULLMAN: I BELIEVE WE ARE.

6 MR. LACKEY: YES, YOUR HONOR.

7 MR. KOGER: YES, YOUR HONOR.

8 MR. MELLARD: YES.

9 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

10 THE COURT: OKAY, NOW LET ME ASK YOU A QUESTION,
11 DID Y'ALL, ARE Y'ALL GOING TO EACH DO FOUR OR DO Y'ALL
12 HAVE A SPOKESMAN TO DO ALL TWENTY, OR WHAT HAVE Y'ALL
13 DECIDED?

14 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, WE WENT THROUGH AND WENT
15 THROUGH THE LIST TOGETHER AND HAVE COME UP WITH OUR
16 STRIKES, AND I THINK PROBABLY ONE OF US COULD DO IT.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. WHO IS GOING TO BE THE LUCKY
18 PERSON?

19 MR. PALMER: YOUR HONOR, I'M FINE WITH MS. ULLMAN
20 DOING IT.

21 THE COURT: OKAY.

22 MS. ULLMAN: THAT WILL BE FINE.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND FOR THE STATE,
24 WHO'S GOING TO DO THE STRIKING FOR THE STATE?

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I'LL DO IT, YOUR HONOR.

1 THE COURT: OKAY. AND SINCE WE'RE DOING IT A
2 LITTLE DIFFERENTLY, WE'LL JUST CALL OUT THE NUMBERS
3 THAT YOU'RE GOING TO STRIKE, WE'LL ALTERNATE, YOU GO
4 FIRST, MR. PASCOE, AND THEN MS. ULLMAN, YOU'LL GO
5 SECOND, LIKE WE DO IN THE CIVIL CASES.

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: ARE WE GOING TO HAVE THEM COME
7 IN?

8 THE COURT: YEAH, I'M NOT GOING TO DO IT, I WANT
9 TO GET IT STRAIGHT BEFORE I GET THEM IN HERE.

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: OKAY.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. AND WHAT YOU WILL DO, MS.
12 ULLMAN AND MR. PASCOE, IF WE DO IT THAT WAY, MR.
13 PASCOE, YOU WOULD SAY YOU WOULD STRIKE, FOR EXAMPLE,
14 JUROR NUMBER ONE, USING THE NUMBER ON THE FAR LEFT
15 HAND SIDE, NOT THE JURY NUMBER, LIKE, JIMMY HEADDEN IS
16 NUMBER ONE - - -

17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I'VE GOT YOU, YES, SIR.

18 THE COURT: AND YOU STRIKE - - -

19 MS. ULLMAN: AND WE'LL GO DOWN THE LIST.

20 THE COURT: YEAH, AND YOU STRIKE BY EITHER -- THE
21 NUMBERS THAT YOU'LL BE STRIKING BY IS ONE THROUGH
22 FORTY-TWO. DOES EVERYBODY UNDERSTAND THAT?

23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: OKAY.

24 THE COURT: AND WE'LL ALTERNATE. MR. PASCOE,
25 YOU'LL GO FIRST, AND MS. ULLMAN, YOU'LL GO SECOND, AND

1 THEN WE'LL GO BACK TO YOU, MR. PASCOE. IS THAT
2 ALRIGHT WITH THE STATE?

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I THINK YOU'VE GOT TO GO - - -

4 THE COURT: WELL, I MEAN, I CAN GO THROUGH IT --
5 I CAN GO THROUGH JUROR NUMBER ONE, I CAN DO IT LIKE A
6 REGULAR, IF YOU WANT TO DO IT THAT WAY. HOW DO Y'ALL
7 WANT TO DO IT?

8 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YEAH, BECAUSE - - -

9 THE COURT: WOULD Y'ALL LIKE FOR ME TO GO DOWN
10 THE LIST? I CAN GO TO NUMBER ONE AND THEN ASK?

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, JUST IN AN ABUNDANCE
12 OF CAUTION.

13 THE COURT: OKAY, I'LL BE GLAD TO DO IT THAT WAY.

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YEAH, WE'LL JUST TREAT IT LIKE
15 REGULARLY PICKING A JURY. THE ONLY GOOD THING IS, WE
16 ALREADY, WE DON'T EVEN NEED REALLY TO TALK BARELY,
17 WE'LL BE READY TO SAY - - -

18 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, WE'LL JUST GO DOWN.

19 MS. ULLMAN: AND WE'LL BE IN THAT POSITION, TOO,
20 YOUR HONOR.

21 THE COURT: OKAY. SO, DO YOU WANT ME TO CALL THE
22 JURORS UP HERE LIKE WE NORMALLY DO?

23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. OKAY, WE'LL DO THAT. OKAY.
25 IF YOU'LL BRING THE JURY IN.

1 (Whereupon, the following takes
2 place in the presence of the
3 jury panel.)

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. PASCOE, THE STATE IS
5 AWARE OF THE ADDITIONAL INFORMATION PROVIDED ABOUT ONE
6 OF THE JURORS?

7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

8 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MS. ULLMAN, I KNOW YOU'RE
9 SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE OTHER, OF ALL OF THE
10 DEFENDANTS REGARDING PICKING THIS JURY. ARE THE
11 DEFENDANTS AWARE OF THAT ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ABOUT
12 ONE OF THE JURORS?

13 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. IS THE STATE READY TO PROCEED?

15 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, BUT WE WOULD LIKE
16 MORE INFORMATION ABOUT THAT JUROR, IF YOU COULD HAVE
17 HER COME UP.

18 THE COURT: OKAY. OKAY. LET'S SEE, IS MS.
19 STROMAN, KEYANA STROMAN, MS. STROMAN, COULD YOU COME
20 UP, PLEASE, MA'AM? JUST COME UP HERE.

21 (Whereupon, a bench conference is
22 had out of the hearing of the
23 remaining jury panel and court reporter.)

24 THE COURT: MS. STROMAN, JUROR NUMBER ONE
25 SEVENTY-ONE, IS -- LET'S SEE, HER MOTHER AND MR.

1 RYANT'S DAD ARE FIRST COUSINS AND SHE DOESN'T BELIEVE
2 SHE COULD BE A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL JUROR, SO SHE IS
3 EXCUSED. OKAY? YOU'RE EXCUSED. OKAY?

4 COURT REPORTER: AND SHE IS KEYANA STROMAN?

5 THE COURT: KEYANA STROMAN, NUMBER ONE SEVENTY-
6 ONE.

7 MS. ULLMAN, ARE THE DEFENDANTS READY TO PROCEED?

8 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

9 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,
10 WE'RE GETTING READY TO PICK THE JURY IN THIS CASE.
11 WHAT I'M GOING TO ASK YOU TO DO IS, WHEN THE CLERK
12 CALLS YOUR NAME IF YOU WOULD COME FORWARD, BRING --
13 LADIES, IF YOU'VE GOT A POCKET BOOK OR COAT OR
14 ANYTHING LIKE THAT, IF YOU'LL BRING THAT WITH YOU WHEN
15 YOU COME FORWARD. GENTLEMEN, IF YOU'VE GOT YOUR
16 COATS, MAKE SURE YOU BRING THEM WHEN YOU COME FORWARD.
17 IF YOU WILL COME FORWARD AND WALK IN FRONT OF THIS
18 PODIUM AND THEN TURN AND IF YOU WILL FACE THE
19 ATTORNEYS THEN WE'LL FIND OUT WHETHER YOU'RE GOING TO
20 GET PICKED FOR THIS JURY OR NOT. OKAY?

21 ALRIGHT, MADAM CLERK.

22 CLERK: JAMIE HEADDEN.

23 THE COURT: MR. HEADDEN, IF YOU'D TURN AROUND AND
24 FACE THE ATTORNEYS, PLEASE, SIR. ALRIGHT.

25 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

1 SOLICITOR PASCOE: IS IT MR. HEADDEN?
2 THE COURT: YES.
3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. HEADDEN.
4 CLERK: WHAT SAYS DEFENSE?
5 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT THIS JUROR.
6 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE JURY BOX, SIR.
7 THE COURT: YEAH, RIGHT UP THERE. FOLLOW MS.
8 JOHNSON. YES, SIR, YOU'RE DOING GOOD. THANK YOU,
9 SIR.
10 CLERK: CHARLES STRECKER. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. STRECKER.
12 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
13 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT THIS JUROR.
14 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE JURY BOX.
15 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.
16 CLERK: INDIA JAMISON. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. JAMISON.
18 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
19 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MS. JAMISON.
20 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE BOX.
21 JANICE BOGLIN. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
22 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. BOGLIN.
23 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
24 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. BOGLIN.
25 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT, MA'AM.

1 GUY CROUT. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. CROUT.
3 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
4 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. CROUT.
5 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.
6 ASIA WINE. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. WINE.
8 CLERK: KELLY WILLIAMS. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
9 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. WILLIAMS.
10 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
11 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MS. WILLIAMS.
12 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE JURY BOX.
13 DELORIS JEFFERSON. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. JEFFERSON.
15 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT, MA'AM.
16 JOSEPH GRIFFIN. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. GRIFFIN.
18 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
19 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. GRIFFIN.
20 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.
21 LORETTA LADSON. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
22 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. LADSON.
23 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
24 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. LADSON.
25 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.

1 EMMA JEFFERSON. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. JEFFERSON.
3 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.
4 TAMMY SEAWRIGHT. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. SEAWRIGHT.
6 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.
7 WANDA KITTRELL. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
8 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. KITTRELL.
9 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
10 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. KITTRELL.
11 CLERK: THOMASENIA HICKS. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
12 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. HICKS.
13 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
14 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. HICKS.
15 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT, MA'AM.
16 SUSAN HUGHES. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. HUGHES.
18 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
19 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. HUGHES.
20 CLERK: ALVIN SMOAK. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
21 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. SMOAK.
22 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
23 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. SMOAK.
24 CLERK: JEROME FRANKLIN. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. FRANKLIN.

1 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?

2 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MR. FRANKLIN.

3 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE JURY BOX.

4 OTIS BOYD. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. BOYD.

6 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?

7 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MR. BOYD.

8 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE JURY BOX.

9 CLAREY LIVINGSTON. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. LIVINGSTON.

11 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.

12 LADSON BEACH. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

13 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. BEACH.

14 CLERK: CANNETTE MOORER.

15 COURT REPORTER: WHAT WAS THAT LAST NAME?

16 THE COURT: MS. MOORER.

17 CLERK: CANNETTE MOORER. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. MOORER.

19 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.

20 VIVIAN BAIR. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

21 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. BAIR.

22 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?

23 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. BAIR.

24 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.

25 HATTIE JAMES. WHAT SAYS THE STATE

1 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE EXCUSE MS. JAMES.
2 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.
3 JERRY POOR. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
4 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. POOR.
5 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
6 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. POOR.
7 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.
8 KIA JAMES. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
9 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. JAMES.
10 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
11 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MS. JAMES.
12 CLERK: DAVID ROBERTS. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
13 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. ROBERTS.
14 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
15 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. ROBERTS.
16 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT, SIR.
17 COURTNEY ASBERRY. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. ASBERRY.
19 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
20 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MS. ASBERRY.
21 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE JURY BOX.
22 MERLINDA BUTLER. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. BUTLER.
24 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
25 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MS. BUTLER.

1 CLERK: ALLEN MILLER. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. MILLER.
3 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
4 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. MILLER.
5 CLERK: LORETTA COLTER. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. COLTER.
7 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
8 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MS. COLTER.
9 CLERK: SAMANTHA BENTON. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. BENTON.
11 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
12 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MS. BENTON.
13 CLERK: ELLIS THIGPEN. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. THIGPEN.
15 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
16 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. THIGPEN.
17 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.
18 TAMEKA JOHNSON. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?
19 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. JOHNSON.
20 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?
21 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT MS. JOHNSON.
22 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ACCORDING TO MY LIST THAT
23 IS THE JURY PANEL. IS THAT CORRECT?
24 CLERK: YES, SIR.
25 THE COURT: OKAY. NOW WE'LL GO AND DO THE FIRST

1 ALTERNATE. OKAY. ALRIGHT.

2 CLERK: LEON SMITH. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. SMITH.

4 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?

5 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE EXCUSE MR. SMITH.

6 THE COURT: HOLD ON, WAIT A MINUTE, MR. SMITH.

7 CLERK: RETURN TO YOUR SEAT.

8 THE COURT: I'M SORRY, YOU CAN RETURN TO YOUR
9 SEAT. OKAY. Y'ALL DID SAY EXCUSE?

10 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

11 THE COURT: OKAY.

12 CLERK: WAYNE LOVETTE. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

13 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MR. LOVETTE.

14 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?

15 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE SEAT THE JUROR.

16 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE JURY BOX.

17 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, AND WE'LL PICK ALTERNATE
18 NUMBER TWO.

19 CLERK: BRENDA HAYWARD. WHAT SAYS THE STATE?

20 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THIS IS MS. HAYWARD, RIGHT?

21 THE COURT: YEAH, BRENDA HAYWARD.

22 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PLEASE PRESENT MS. HAYWARD.

23 CLERK: WHAT SAYS THE DEFENSE?

24 MS. ULLMAN: JUST ONE MINUTE.

25 THE COURT: OKAY.

1 MS. ULLMAN: PLEASE PRESENT THIS JUROR.

2 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT IN THE JURY BOX.

3 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANY ISSUES REGARDING THE
4 SELECTION OF THE JURY FROM THE STATE?

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE.

6 THE COURT: SURE.

7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PROBABLY NOT FOR RIGHT NOW,
8 YOUR HONOR.

9 THE COURT: SIR?

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PROBABLY NOT, I'M SORRY.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, I'M GOING TO TAKE
12 THAT AS A NOT.

13 SOLICITOR PASCOE: OKAY, YEAH.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. ANY ISSUES -- MS. ULLMAN, ARE
15 YOU SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF ALL OF THE DEFENDANTS IN
16 THIS OR SHOULD I QUESTION EVERYBODY INDIVIDUALLY, OR
17 DO Y'ALL NEED SOME TIME TO TALK?

18 MS. ULLMAN: I NEED SOME TIME TO ANSWER. I WAS
19 TRYING TO GET A CLUSTERED ANSWER.

20 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. IF Y'ALL NEED TO RETIRE TO
21 TALK ...

22 MS. ULLMAN: IT SHOULDN'T TAKE BUT A MINUTE.

23 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, Y'ALL CAN STEP BACK IN MY
24 CHAMBERS FOR A SECOND.

25 (Whereupon, defense counsel

1 retires to judge's chambers.)

2 THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, IF Y'ALL WILL
3 JUST BEAR WITH US FOR A WHILE, THIS WILL JUST TAKE A
4 MINUTE. WE'RE NOT OUTSIDE, OKAY? SO IF Y'ALL CAN
5 JUST BEAR WITH US, YOU KNOW, WE WILL -- WHEN WE HAVE
6 THIS MANY ATTORNEYS YOU KNOW THERE'S GOING TO BE A LOT
7 OF TALKING. OKAY.

8 (Whereupon, defense counsel
9 enters the courtroom.)

10 THE COURT: MS. ULLMAN, ANY ISSUES REGARDING JURY
11 SELECTION?

12 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, WE WOULD HAVE A MOTION
13 THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO PUT BEFORE YOUR HONOR.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, IF YOU WOULD TAKE THE
15 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN IN THE JURY PANEL AND HAVE THEM
16 GO BACK INTO THE JURY ROOM. AND LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,
17 IF Y'ALL WOULD JUST STEP OUT INTO THE HALL. YOU CANNOT
18 LEAVE YET, I NEED FOR Y'ALL TO STEP OUT INTO THE HALL.
19 OKAY.

20 (Whereupon, the jury retires
21 to the jury room and the remaining
22 jury panel leaves the courtroom,
23 and the following takes place
24 in camera.)

25 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MS. ULLMAN, LET ME HEAR FROM

1 YOU.

2 MS. ULLMAN: OKAY. YOUR HONOR, WE WOULD ASK YOUR,
3 ASK THIS COURT TO CONSIDER THE CASE OF BATSON VERSUS
4 KENTUCKY. TODAY WHEN WE PICKED THIS JURY THE STATE
5 MADE SEVEN STRIKES. SIX OF THOSE STRIKES WERE OF
6 AFRICAN AMERICAN PEOPLE. ONLY ONE PERSON WAS A WHITE
7 PERSON. HE WAS THE LAWYER OF THIS COMMUNITY,
8 OBVIOUSLY, I'M SURE THAT IS THE REASON HE WAS STRUCK.
9 TAKING HIM OUT OF THIS WE HAVE SIX OTHER STRIKES, FIVE
10 OF WHICH ARE BLACK FEMALES AND ONE OF WHICH IS A BLACK
11 MALE. I THINK THAT IN AND OF ITSELF ESTABLISHES A
12 PRIMA FACIE CASE THAT THE STATE IS EXERCISING STRIKES
13 TO REMOVE MEMBERS OF THIS JURY BASED ON THEIR RACE
14 AND POSSIBLY GENDER, WITH FIVE OUT OF SEVEN PEOPLE
15 BEING FEMALES. I THINK AT THAT POINT THE STATE WOULD
16 HAVE THE BURDEN OF TRYING TO SHOW THIS COURT WHAT
17 REASON IT IS THAT THEY DID STRIKE ALL SIX OUT OF THE
18 SEVEN JURORS THAT ARE AFRICAN AMERICAN.

19 THE COURT: AND REALIZING THAT THE JURY PANEL
20 THAT YOU HAVE HAS, WHAT, EIGHT AFRICAN AMERICANS AND
21 FOUR WHITES, IS THAT CORRECT? THE IMPANELED JURY?

22 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE.
24 OKAY. ALRIGHT.

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU. I'LL JUST GIVE YOU

1 THE REASONS FOR - - -

2 THE COURT: OKAY.

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: --- RACE NEUTRAL REASONS FOR
4 EACH ONE WE STRUCK.

5 THE COURT: IF YOU WILL GO DOWN THE LIST FOR ME.

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I BELIEVE THE FIRST ONE - - -

7 THE COURT: IS MS. WINE.

8 SOLICITOR PASCOE: --- IS MS. WINE. SHE WAS JUST
9 ARRESTED BY THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE
10 THIS YEAR, TWENTY TEN. I THINK IT WAS FOR SHOPLIFTING,
11 BUT WE DIDN'T SEE ANY SIMILARLY SITUATED JURORS,
12 ANYONE THAT'S BEEN ARRESTED BY THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE.

13 THE NEXT JUROR WE STRUCK WAS DELORIS JEFFERSON. I
14 WAS INFORMED JUST, WHILE WE WERE DOING THE JURY VOIR
15 DIRE THAT SHE HAS A BROTHER IN PRISON FOR MURDER,
16 THAT'S WHAT SOMEBODY INFORMED ME. AND THAT'S JUROR
17 NUMBER NINETY-SEVEN, YOUR HONOR.

18 THE COURT: DID YOU FIND OUT THE NAME OF HER
19 BROTHER?

20 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, SIR, JUST ONE OF MY
21 EMPLOYEES INFORMED DON SORENSON THAT HER BROTHER WAS
22 IN PRISON FOR MURDER.

23 THE COURT: OKAY.

24 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AGAIN, WE SAT NO SIMILARLY
25 SITUATED JUROR.

1 EMMA JEFFERSON, HER BROTHER IS ACCUSED OF, WHAT
2 WAS IT? OF CHILD MOLESTATION.

3 NUMBER ONE SIXTY IS TAMMY SEAWRIGHT. MY OFFICE
4 PROSECUTED HER JUST LAST YEAR, YOUR HONOR. OBVIOUSLY,
5 THAT'S ANOTHER -- SHE REALLY COULD HAVE BEEN STRUCK
6 FOR CAUSE. I THINK THAT IF WE HAD PUSHED IT, BECAUSE
7 SHE NEVER STOOD UP AND SAID THAT SHE HAD BEEN
8 PROSECUTED BY MY OFFICE.

9 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THE NEXT JUROR THAT WE STRUCK
11 I BELIEVE WAS MR. LIVINGSTON. HE HAS A RECORD, YOUR
12 HONOR, OF NINETEEN SEVENTY-THREE SIMPLE POSSESSION OF
13 MARIJUANA, BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY, THE REASON WE STRUCK
14 HIM IS ON HIS QUESTIONNAIRE HE DID NOT -- HE CHECKED
15 THAT HE HAD NEVER BEEN CONVICTED OF A CRIME. HE HAS
16 AN EIGHTY-SEVEN DUI, BUT THE MAIN REASON WE STRUCK HIM
17 WAS NOT BECAUSE HE HAS THE PRIOR CONVICTION BUT HE
18 WENT OUT OF HIS WAY TO STRIKE ON THE JURY
19 QUESTIONNAIRE THAT HE DIDN'T HAVE ANY CONVICTIONS.

20 THE COURT: OKAY.

21 SOLICITOR PASCOE: WE STRUCK LADSON BEACH BECAUSE
22 HE IS AN ATTORNEY. WE STRUCK -- AND HE IS A WHITE
23 MALE.

24 WE STRUCK CANNETTE MOORER BECAUSE SHE STOOD UP,
25 YOUR HONOR, AND SAID THAT SHE HAD A GRANDCHILD THAT

1 SHE TAKES CARE OF AT HOME.

2 WE STRUCK MS. JAMES BECAUSE SHE APPROACHED THE
3 BENCH AND SAID THAT SHE HAS NOT ONLY THE HIGH BLOOD
4 PRESSURE, BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY, THAT SHE TAKES PILLS
5 FOR HER NERVES. WE WERE CONCERNED ABOUT HAVING HER ON
6 THE JURY IF SHE'S GOT A NERVOUS PROBLEM.

7 AND I BELIEVE THAT'S ALL WE STRUCK. IS THAT
8 RIGHT?

9 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU.

10 ALRIGHT, MS. ULLMAN, HE HAS GIVEN THE COURT RACE
11 NEUTRAL REASONS FOR STRIKING THESE PEOPLE.

12 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR, I APPRECIATE THE REASONS.
13 I'M NOT SURE THAT I CAN ARGUE THAT ANY OF THEM ARE --
14 BUT I JUST THOUGHT THAT IT SHOULD BE PLACE ON THE
15 RECORD AND EXPLAINED.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, MA'AM. I'M GOING
17 TO DENY YOUR MOTION.

18 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: OKAY. I APPRECIATE IT.

20 ALRIGHT, BEFORE I BRING THE JURY BACK IN HERE, IT
21 IS NOW ALMOST FIVE O'CLOCK. I KNOW THERE ARE SOME,
22 Y'ALL WERE GOING TO LOOK OVER THE PICTURES AND DO
23 THINGS LIKE THAT. WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS TELL THE
24 JURY TO BE BACK IN AT NINE TOMORROW MORNING. IS THAT
25 OKAY WITH EVERYBODY?

1 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

2 THE COURT: I'LL SWEAR THE JURY AT THAT TIME, AND
3 THEN WE'LL BEGIN DOING THE OPENING ARGUMENTS. I WILL
4 -- THERE'S NO REASON FOR US TO KEEP THE MAIN JURY
5 PANEL FOR ANYTHING ELSE LATER ON THIS WEEK, IS THERE?

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, SIR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, IF YOU'LL BRING THE
8 JURY PANEL BACK IN, AND IF Y'ALL WILL BRING THE OTHER
9 JURY PANEL BACK IN.

10 (Whereupon, the jury and the
11 remaining jury panel enter
12 the courtroom.)

13 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, YOU LADIES AND GENTLEMEN WHO
14 ARE MEMBERS OF THE JURY PANEL WHO WERE NOT PICKED FOR
15 THE JURY AND ARE DISAPPOINTED, I NEED TO TELL YOU, IN
16 ADDITION TO YOUR DISAPPOINTMENT FOR NOT BEING PICKED
17 ON THIS JURY THAT WE ARE NOT GOING TO HAVE ANOTHER
18 JURY IMPANELED THIS WEEK. SO, AS A RESULT, Y'ALL ARE
19 EXCUSED FOR THE REST OF THE WEEK. I WANT TO THANK
20 Y'ALL FOR YOUR WILLINGNESS TO SERVE AS JURORS. I KNOW
21 SOME OF Y'ALL COULD HAVE TAKEN ADVANTAGE OF SOME OF
22 THE EXEMPTIONS THAT WERE ALLOWED, AND I APPRECIATE YOU
23 NOT TAKING ADVANTAGE OF THOSE EXEMPTIONS AND BEING
24 WILLING TO SERVE, BUT AS IT STANDS NOW WE WILL NOT
25 NEED YOUR SERVICES FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE WEEK. I

1 HOPE Y'ALL HAVE AN ABSOLUTELY WONDERFUL AND HAPPY AND
2 MERRY CHRISTMAS, AND A WONDERFUL NEW YEAR. AND Y'ALL
3 ARE NOW EXCUSED. THANK Y'ALL VERY MUCH.

4 ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, CONGRATULATIONS.
5 Y'ALL GOT TO BE PICKED AS THIS JURY. I KNOW YOU MAY
6 NOT BE AS EXCITED AS YOU SHOULD BE, I UNDERSTAND THAT.

7 I'M GOING TO TELL Y'ALL SOME THINGS RIGHT NOW
8 JUST, THAT I WILL REPEAT DURING THE COURSE OF THE
9 TRIAL, BUT LET ME JUST TELL YOU A COUPLE OF THINGS IS,
10 NUMBER ONE IS, Y'ALL CANNOT TALK ABOUT THIS TRIAL TO
11 ANYBODY AT ALL. WHEN YOU HOME IF SOMEBODY ASKS YOU
12 WHAT YOU'RE DOING, TELL THEM YOU GOT PICKED FOR A JURY
13 TRIAL AND YOU CAN'T TALK ABOUT IT.

14 NOW, NUMBER TWO, THAT MEANS YOU CANNOT EVEN TALK
15 ABOUT IT AMONG YOURSELVES RIGHT NOW. WHEN Y'ALL HAVE
16 CONVERSATIONS ABOUT ANYTHING Y'ALL CAN TALK ABOUT
17 BASKETBALL SEASON, FOOT BALL SEASON, THE SHOPPING THAT
18 YOU NEED TO GET DONE FOR CHRISTMAS THAT YOU AREN'T
19 ABLE TO DO, YOU CAN TALK ABOUT ALL THOSE THINGS RIGHT
20 NOW BUT YOU CAN'T TALK ABOUT THE TRIAL.

21 NOW, ALL DURING THE TRIAL WHENEVER WE TAKE BREAKS
22 YOU CANNOT TALK AMONG YOURSELVES ABOUT THE TRIAL.
23 NOW, Y'ALL KNOW A LITTLE BIT ABOUT WHAT WE'RE HERE FOR
24 BECAUSE I GAVE YOU A DATE AND A NAME. NOW, WHEN
25 YOU'RE EXCUSED, AND I'M GOING TO EXCUSE Y'ALL TO GO

1 HOME THIS EVENING AND TELL Y'ALL TO COME BACK TOMORROW
2 AT NINE O'CLOCK, AND COME BACK TO THE JURY ROOM WHERE
3 Y'ALL WERE JUST IN. WHEN Y'ALL GO BACK HOME I DON'T
4 WANT YOU LOOKING UP ON THE INTERNET ANYTHING ABOUT
5 THIS CASE, BECAUSE Y'ALL ARE NOT SUPPOSED TO LISTEN TO
6 ANY NEWS REPORTS ABOUT THIS, YOU'RE NOT SUPPOSED TO
7 READ ANYTHING IN THE PAPER ABOUT THIS CASE, YOU'RE NOT
8 SUPPOSED TO TALK TO ANYBODY THIS CASE, AND YOU
9 CERTAINLY ARE NOT SUPPOSED TO INVESTIGATE ANYTHING
10 THAT YOU HEAR IN THE COURTROOM. EVERYTHING THAT Y'ALL
11 ARE GOING TO NEED TO MAKE A DETERMINATION IN THIS CASE
12 IS GOING TO COME FROM THIS WITNESS STAND AND ANY
13 EXHIBITS THAT GET BROUGHT INTO THE RECORD DURING THE
14 COURSE OF THIS TRIAL. OTHER THAN THAT, YOU DON'T NEED
15 TO KNOW IT. IF ANYBODY TRIES TO CONTACT YOU TO TALK
16 TO YOU ABOUT THIS I NEED TO BE MADE AWARE OF IT, I
17 NEED TO KNOW WHO IT WAS, BECAUSE NOBODY IS SUPPOSED TO
18 BE TALKING TO YOU ABOUT THIS CASE.

19 THE, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU KNOW ANY OF THE
20 ATTORNEYS PRESENT OR SEE THEM ON THE STREET. IF YOU
21 SEE THEM IN THE COURTROOM TOMORROW WHEN YOU ARE COMING
22 IN THEY ARE NOT GOING TO SPEAK TO YOU. THAT'S NOT
23 BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, IN THE SOUTH EVERYBODY SPEAKS, BUT
24 THEY ARE NOT TO SPEAK TO YOU UNDER MY DIRECTION,
25 BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT SUPPOSE TO HAVE ANY CONVERSATION

1 WITH YOU, AS ARE NONE OF THE WITNESSES THAT WERE ON
2 THE WITNESS LIST THAT I READ OUT. NO ONE SHOULD BE
3 TALKING TO Y'ALL ABOUT THIS.

4 TOMORROW MORNING I NEED FOR Y'ALL TO COME BACK,
5 BE IN THE JURY ROOM AT NINE O'CLOCK. WE WILL GET
6 STARTED WITH THE OPENING ARGUMENTS. BEFORE WE DO THAT
7 I'LL GIVE Y'ALL AN IDEA ABOUT WHAT'S GOING ON, AND
8 THEN AFTER WE DO THE OPENING REMARKS WE WILL GO AHEAD
9 AND GET STARTED WITH THE TESTIMONY IN THIS. OKAY?

10 SO, GO HOME TONIGHT, GET A GOOD NIGHT'S REST,
11 DON'T TALK TO ANYBODY ABOUT THIS CASE, AND I'LL SEE
12 Y'ALL FIRST THING IN THE MORNING AT NINE O'CLOCK. AND
13 THANK Y'ALL AGAIN FOR BEING WILLING TO SERVE ON THE
14 JURY. Y'ALL ARE GOING TO DO A GREAT JOB. OKAY?
15 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. OKAY. Y'ALL ARE EXCUSED.

16 (Whereupon, the jury leave
17 the courtroom, and the following
18 takes place out of the presence
19 of the jury.)

20 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING FROM THE STATE
21 BEFORE WE GO INTO RECESS?

22 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYTHING FROM THE DEFENDANTS
24 BEFORE WE GO INTO RECESS FOR THE NIGHT?

25 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, JUST AS CLARIFICATION, I

1 WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT BATSON MOTION WAS ON THE
2 RECORD AS BEING MADE BY, I BELIEVE ALL OF THE
3 DEFENDANTS.

4 THE COURT: ALL OF THE DEFENDANTS. FOR THE
5 RECORD, ALL OF Y'ALL MADE THE BATSON BUT Y'ALL ALLOWED
6 MS. ULLMAN TO MAKE THE ARGUMENT ON BEHALF OF ALL OF
7 Y'ALL.

8 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR.

9 THE COURT: OKAY.

10 MR. LACKEY: NOTHING ELSE.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYTHING ELSE?

12 MS. ULLMAN: NO, YOUR HONOR.

13 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

14 MR. MELLARD: NO, YOUR HONOR.

15 MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

16 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, WE ARE IN RECESS UNTIL NINE
17 O'CLOCK TOMORROW MORNING. IT IS MY UNDERSTANDING
18 Y'ALL ARE GOING TO LOOK OVER PICTURES AND THINGS LIKE
19 THAT?

20 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

21 THE COURT: OKAY. IF Y'ALL WILL DO THAT I WILL
22 SEE Y'ALL FIRST THING IN THE MORNING.

23 (Recess for the day.)

24 DATE:

25 DECEMBER 14, 2010

1 THE COURT: IS THERE ANYTHING FROM THE STATE
2 BEFORE WE GET READY TO START?

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, YOUR HONOR.

4 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYTHING FROM ANY OF THE
5 DEFENDANTS BEFORE WE GET READY TO START? MR. LACKEY?

6 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR, YOUR HONOR. IN THIS
7 MORNING'S TIMES & DEMOCRAT THEY HAVE AN ARTICLE HERE
8 CONCERNING THE TRIAL. FOLLOWING YOUR INSTRUCTIONS TO
9 THE JURY MEMBERS YESTERDAY NOT TO READ ANYTHING,
10 RESEARCH ANYTHING, I THINK IT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE TO
11 ASK THE JURY IF ANYONE READ THE ARTICLE.

12 THE COURT: OKAY.

13 MR. LACKEY: IT DOES ALLUDE TO AN EXECUTION STYLE
14 SLAYING, AND SPECIFICALLY, IT'S GOT A PICTURE OF MY
15 CLIENT HERE.

16 THE COURT: AND YOU.

17 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR, YOUR HONOR, AND ME. AND I
18 BELIEVE THAT TO BE PREJUDICIAL TO MY CLIENT, AND WOULD
19 LIKE THE JURY QUESTIONED ON THAT MATTER.

20 THE COURT: OKAY. I'LL BE HAPPY TO DO THAT,
21 YEAH, I'LL DO THAT. OKAY.

22 MR. LACKEY: THANK YOU.

23 THE COURT: ANYTHING FROM ANY OTHER DEFENDANTS?

24 MR. PALMER: I WOULD JUST JOIN IN THAT MOTION,
25 YOUR HONOR, ON BEHALF OF MR. HARRIS.

1 MS. ULLMAN: I WOULD ALSO.

2 THE COURT: OKAY.

3 MR. KOGER: ALSO, JUDGE, ON BEHALF OF MR.
4 SHIVERS.

5 THE COURT: OKAY.

6 MR. MELLARD: AND MR. RYANT DOES, TOO.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK Y'ALL ALL FOR JOINING IN
8 THAT MOTION.

9 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, THERE IS ONE OTHER
10 THING.

11 THE COURT: OKAY.

12 MR. LACKEY: IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING AT SOME POINT
13 IN THIS TRIAL THERE'S GOING TO BE DIAGRAMS AND THERE'S
14 GOING TO BE PICTURES SHOWN, AND USUALLY WHEN THAT
15 HAPPENS I LIKE TO GET OVER BY THE JURY AND KIND OF
16 LOOK AND SEE WHAT THEY'RE SEEING.

17 THE COURT: RIGHT.

18 MR. LACKEY: SO, THE PLACEMENT OF THE CAMERA MAY
19 BE A PROBLEM.

20 THE COURT: OH, WE CAN MOVE THE CAMERA. OKAY?
21 IS THAT GOING TO -- ARE WE GOING TO BE DOING THAT
22 EARLY THIS MORNING?

23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: WE WILL, YOUR HONOR, YES, SIR.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS, WE
25 DON'T NEED THE CAMERA ALL DAY ANYWAY, AND SO, HOW MANY

1
2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I'LL TELL YOU WHAT, NOT,
3 PROBABLY NOT THIS MORNING, YOUR HONOR. WE'LL PROBABLY
4 TAKE A BREAK BEFORE WE PUT UP THE WITNESS WITH THE
5 DIAGRAMS AND OTHER STUFF.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. WHEN WE GET READY TO TAKE THE
7 WITNESS WITH THE DIAGRAMS WE'RE JUST GOING -- YOU'VE
8 GOT ENOUGH PICTURES, OKAY? YOU KNOW, YOU'RE ONLY
9 GOING TO USE ONE IN THE PAPER ANYWAY, I MEAN, I KNOW
10 YOU WANT TO STAY HERE AND TAKE AS MANY AS YOU CAN, BUT
11 WHAT WE'LL DO IS, WHEN HE GETS READY TO DO THAT I'M
12 GOING TO JUST GET YOU TO SIT DOWN, SIT BACK THERE WITH
13 RICHARD OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT IF THAT'S ALRIGHT.
14 OKAY? WILL THAT WORK? OKAY.

15 ALRIGHT, ANYTHING ELSE?

16 MR. LACKEY: NO, YOUR HONOR.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. GO AHEAD AND BRING THE JURY ON
18 OUT, PLEASE.

19 DO YOU JUST WANT TO MOVE THE CAMERA BEHIND THAT
20 CORNER RIGHT THERE? THAT WAY THE JURY WON'T REALLY
21 EVEN SEE YOU THAT MUCH. OKAY? AND THEN YOU CAN JUST
22 STAY IN HERE. OKAY? THAT WAS A GOOD SUGGESTION,
23 RICHARD, YOU WERE TRYING TO POINT THAT OUT TO ME
24 EARLIER, WEREN'T YOU?

25 MR. LACKEY: THAT'S USUALLY THE ALTERNATE

1 LOCATION, YES, SIR.

2 THE COURT: OKAY. WE'LL DO THAT. THE OTHER
3 THING IS, I DON'T HOW MANY WITNESSES WE WERE GOING TO
4 HAVE. I SEE FAMILY MEMBERS HERE AND THINGS LIKE THAT.
5 I JUST WANT TO REMIND Y'ALL THAT DURING THE TESTIMONY
6 THERE'S NOT TO BE ANY COMMENT ABOUT THE TESTIMONY.
7 Y'ALL DON'T NEED TO, YOU KNOW, MAKE ANY KIND OF
8 GESTURES OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT. WE'RE JUST -- Y'ALL
9 WILL JUST HAVE TO SIT QUIETLY AND LISTEN. OKAY? I
10 KNOW Y'ALL WILL, BUT I JUST NEED TO REMIND EVERYBODY.
11 OKAY? THANK YOU.

12 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, COULD WE MAKE SURE THAT
13 ALL OF THE WITNESSES ARE OUT OF THE COURTROOM OTHER
14 THAN THE ONE BY STATUTE ARE ALLOWED?

15 THE COURT: OKAY. Y'ALL DON'T HAVE ANY WITNESSES
16 IN HERE, DO YOU?

17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THE ONLY WITNESSES THAT WILL
18 BE IN HERE IS LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT AND ALSO OUR
19 INVESTIGATORS. I MEAN, KENNY KINSEY AND WALTER TURNER
20 MAY BE - - -

21 THE COURT: OKAY. IN AND OUT? OKAY. BUT NO
22 INDEPENDENT FACT WITNESSES?

23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO OTHER LAY WITNESSES, OR ANY
24 OTHER WITNESSES AT ALL.

25 THE COURT: OKAY. AND Y'ALL DON'T HAVE ANY

1 WITNESSES IN HERE?

2 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

3 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, BRING THEM ON IN.

4 (Whereupon, the jury enters
5 the courtroom and the following
6 takes place in the presence
7 of the jury.)

8 THE COURT: GOOD MORNING, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I
9 APPRECIATE Y'ALL ALL SHOWING BACK UP. THANK YOU.

10 Y'ALL WERE CALLED YESTERDAY. WHEN I GOT READY TO
11 LET Y'ALL GO I TOLD YOU NOT TO DO, YOU KNOW, NOT TO
12 SEE -- IF YOU SAW ANYTHING ON T.V., DON'T READ
13 ANYTHING, DON'T DO ANY INVESTIGATION, DON'T LOOK ON
14 LINE OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT, DON'T READ THE PAPERS,
15 DON'T TALK ABOUT THE CASE OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT. I
16 WANT TO MAKE SURE FROM EACH ONE OF YOU THAT NO ONE
17 READ THE TIMES & DEMOCRAT THIS MORNING. DID ANYBODY
18 READ THE TIMES & DEMOCRAT THIS MORNING?

19 (Negative response.)

20 THE COURT: OKAY, GOOD. I NEED FOR Y'ALL NOT TO
21 READ THE TIMES & DEMOCRAT THIS WEEK. I KNOW THAT'S
22 GOING TO HURT THEIR CIRCULATION BUT YOU CAN'T -- YOU
23 CAN READ THE SPORT SECTION, YOU KNOW, BUT JUST DON'T
24 READ THE FRONT PAGE. BUT NOBODY READ THE PAPER TODAY?

25 (Negative response.)

1 THE COURT: DID ANYBODY SEE ANYTHING ON LINE
2 ABOUT THIS ARTICLE, ANYTHING ON T.V.?

3 (Negative response.)

4 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. MR. LACKEY, ANYTHING
5 ELSE?

6 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. ALRIGHT, LADIES AND
8 GENTLEMEN, THE FIRST THING I NEED TO DO IS, BEFORE WE
9 GET STARTED TODAY I NEED TO SWEAR Y'ALL AS THE JURY.
10 SO, IF Y'ALL WILL PLEASE RISE I WANT THE CLERK TO
11 SWEAR YOU.

12 CLERK: WOULD EVERYONE RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.
13 (Whereupon, the jury is duly
14 sworn and impaneled.)

15 THE COURT: OKAY, Y'ALL MAY BE SEATED. THANK
16 YOU.

17 NOW, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WE'RE GOING TO GET
18 READY TO BEGIN TRYING THE CASE, AND THIS CASE, YOU
19 HAVE A LITTLE BIT OF AN IDEA OF IT, IT IS THE CASE OF
20 THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA AGAINST CHRISTIAN COLEMAN,
21 RALPH BERNARD COLEMAN, WALTER LEE HARRIS, DANNY RYANT,
22 JUNIOR, AND MARIO MONTEZ SHIVERS. AND ALL OF THESE
23 GENTLEMEN ARE SITTING BEHIND THEIR ATTORNEYS ON THIS
24 FIRST ROW BEHIND THEM, AND THEY ARE ALL SITTING IN
25 ORDER. OKAY? THAT'S TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR ME. NOW,

1 HOPEFULLY, IT WILL ALSO MAKE IT EASIER FOR Y'ALL.

2 NOW, I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU AN IDEA, JUST AN IDEA
3 OF WHAT'S GOING TO BE GOING ON WITH THE TRIAL. ALL
4 FIVE OF THESE GENTLEMEN HAVE BEEN INDICTED FOR MURDER,
5 BURGLARY, FIRST, AND ARMED ROBBERY. NOW, THE ELEMENTS
6 OF EACH ONE OF THESE CRIMES I WILL EXPLAIN TO YOU
7 LATER WHEN I DO MY CHARGE ON THE LAW AT THE VERY END
8 OF THE CASE. I NEED TO TELL YOU, THOUGH, THAT THE
9 INDICTMENTS THAT CHARGE THEM WITH THESE OFFENSES ARE
10 SIMPLY THE CHARGES WHICH BRING THE CASE TO COURT AND
11 IT'S NOT EVIDENCE IN ANY WAY. ALL OF THESE DEFENDANTS
12 HAVE PLED NOT GUILTY TO THESE INDICTMENTS. THEREFORE,
13 THE STATE HAS THE BURDEN OF PROVING EACH OF THE
14 ELEMENTS TO EACH OF THESE CRIMES BEYOND A REASONABLE
15 DOUBT, AND THEY HAVE TO PROVE IT WITH REGARD TO EACH
16 ONE OF THESE DEFENDANTS. OKAY? IT WILL BE YOUR DUTY,
17 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, TO DECIDE WHETHER THE STATE HAS
18 MET THAT BURDEN OF PROOF.

19 YOUR DUTY AS JURORS IS TO FIND AND DETERMINE THE
20 FACTS. Y'ALL ARE THE SOLE JUDGES OF THE FACTS, AND IF
21 AT ANYTIME DURING THIS TRIAL I MAKE A COMMENT ABOUT
22 THE FACTS IN THIS CASE I'M GOING TO ASK YOU NOW TO
23 DISREGARD IT BECAUSE MY JOB IS NOT TO MAKE ANY
24 DETERMINATION ABOUT THE FACTS, THAT IS SOLELY YOUR
25 JOB.

1 NOW, THE WAY YOU'RE GOING TO DETERMINE THE FACTS
2 IN THE CASE IS BY THE EVIDENCE THAT YOU HEAR FROM THIS
3 WITNESS STAND AND ANY OTHER EVIDENCE THAT IS
4 INTRODUCED IN COURT AND ANY INFERENCES WHICH YOU
5 BELIEVE MAY BE PROPERLY DRAWN FROM SUCH EVIDENCE.

6 NOW, IT IS IMPORTANT THAT YOU DO YOUR JOB OF
7 DETERMINING THE FACTS DILIGENTLY AND CONSCIENTIOUSLY,
8 BECAUSE ORDINARILY THERE'S NO WAY TO CORRECT AN
9 ERRONEOUS DETERMINATION OF FACTS BY A JURY.

10 THE LAW IN THIS CASE, IN THIS STATE THAT MAKES
11 YOU THE JUDGES OF THE FACTS MAKES ME THE JUDGE OF THE
12 LAW. THE LAW AS GIVEN BY THE COURT IS THE ONLY LAW
13 THAT YOU MAY CONSIDER. YOU MUST ACCEPT THE LAW AS I
14 GIVE IT TO YOU AND FOLLOW IT, EVEN THOUGH YOU MAY
15 DISAGREE WITH IT. I CANNOT TELL YOU WHAT THE FACTS
16 ARE, AND YOU CANNOT DISAGREE WITH ME ABOUT WHAT THE
17 LAW IS OR SHOULD BE. YOUR JOB IS TO TAKE THE LAW AS I
18 GIVE IT TO YOU AND APPLY IT TO THE FACTS AS YOU FIND
19 THEM FROM THE TESTIMONY OF THE WITNESSES AND ANY OTHER
20 EVIDENCE THAT IS INTRODUCED IN THIS TRIAL. AFTER DOING
21 THAT YOU WILL RENDER A VERDICT, A TRUE AND JUST
22 VERDICT UNDER THE SOLEMN OATH THAT YOU JUST TOOK AS
23 JURORS.

24 NOW, AS I TOLD YOU YESTERDAY, UNTIL I ADVISE YOU
25 TO BEGIN YOUR DELIBERATIONS, AND I WON'T DO THAT UNTIL

1 THE CLOSE OF THE CASE AFTER I HAVE GIVEN YOU MY
2 INSTRUCTIONS ON THE LAW, YOU MUST NOT DISCUSS THIS
3 CASE WITH ANYONE, INCLUDING YOUR FELLOW JURORS,
4 FRIENDS, FAMILY MEMBERS AND ANYONE INVOLVED IN THE
5 CASE. AFTER THE CASE IS SUBMITTED TO YOU YOU MUST
6 DISCUSS IT ONLY IN THE JURY ROOM AND WITH YOUR FELLOW
7 JURORS. THE ATTORNEYS AND THE PARTIES IN THIS CASE,
8 AS I TOLD YOU EARLIER, HAVE BEEN ADVISED NOT TO EVEN
9 SPEAK, WAVE, SAY HELLO TO YOU DURING THE TRIAL. DURING
10 THE TRIAL, AGAIN I'M GOING TO REMIND YOU, AND I WILL
11 DO THIS ALL DURING THE TRIAL, YOU ARE NOT TO READ,
12 LISTEN TO, WATCH ANY NEWS REPORTS ABOUT THIS CASE, AND
13 THAT INCLUDES ANYTHING IN THE NEWSPAPERS, ON THE
14 INTERNET, RADIO OR TELEVISION. YOU MUST NOT CONSIDER
15 ANYTHING THAT YOU HAVE READ OR HEARD ABOUT THIS CASE
16 OUTSIDE THE COURTROOM, WHETHER BEFORE OR DURING THIS
17 TRIAL. AND AS I TOLD YOU, YOU MUST NOT DO ANY
18 SEPARATE INVESTIGATION ABOUT ANYTHING. IF YOU HAVE
19 ANY QUESTIONS, YOU KNOW, YOU'RE NOT SUPPOSED TO RIDE
20 BY THE SCENE OR DO ANYTHING LIKE THAT. EVERYTHING
21 THAT YOU'RE GOING TO GET, EVERYTHING YOU'RE GOING TO
22 NEED YOU'RE GOING TO GET FROM THE WITNESS STAND AND IN
23 THIS COURTROOM.

24 NOW, YOU NEED TO KEEP AN OPEN MIND AND NOT DECIDE
25 ANY ISSUE IN THIS CASE UNTIL ALL OF THE EVIDENCE HAS

1 BEEN PRESENTED AND THE PARTIES HAVE MADE THEIR CLOSING
2 ARGUMENTS AND I HAVE INSTRUCTED YOU ON THE LAW.
3 THAT'S ANOTHER REASON WHY I DON'T WANT YOU TALKING
4 DURING THE TRIAL, BECAUSE YOU HAVEN'T HEARD
5 EVERYTHING. THAT'S WHY I DON'T WANT YOU TALKING AMONG
6 YOURSELVES ABOUT WHAT YOU'VE HEARD.

7 NOW, IT IS YOUR SOLEMN RESPONSIBILITY TO
8 DETERMINE THE GUILT OR INNOCENCE OF EACH ONE OF THESE
9 DEFENDANTS, AND YOUR VERDICT MUST BE BASED SOLELY ON
10 THE EVIDENCE THAT IS PRESENTED TO YOU IN THIS TRIAL
11 AND ON THE LAW AS I INSTRUCT YOU DURING AND AT THE
12 CLOSE OF THE TRIAL.

13 NOW, EACH ONE OF THESE DEFENDANTS SHOULD BE
14 CONSIDERED SEPARATELY AND INDIVIDUALLY, AND I WANT TO
15 EMPHASIZE THAT. EVEN THOUGH THESE DEFENDANTS ARE
16 BEING TRIED AT ONE TIME, IT IS YOUR DETERMINE -- YOU
17 ARE GOING TO HAVE TO MAKE A DETERMINATION AT THE END
18 OF THIS TRIAL WHETHER OR NOT EACH ONE OF THESE
19 DEFENDANTS IS GUILTY OR NOT GUILTY OF THREE DIFFERENT
20 CHARGES.

21 NOW, IN A MOMENT THE SOLICITOR IS GOING TO MAKE
22 AN OPENING STATEMENT, AND IN THAT OPENING STATEMENT
23 THE SOLICITOR IS GOING TO TELL YOU WHAT HE THINKS THE
24 ISSUES ARE IN THIS CASE. NOW, AFTER HE MAKES HIS
25 OPENING STATEMENTS EACH OF THE DEFENDANTS' ATTORNEYS

1 MAY MAKE AN OPENING STATEMENT BUT THEY ARE NOT
2 REQUIRED TO DO SO. IN ANY EVENT, I NEED TO REMIND YOU
3 AGAIN THAT THE OPENING STATEMENTS ARE NOT EVIDENCE IN
4 THIS CASE, THEY ARE ONLY THE CONTENTION OF WHAT THE
5 ISSUES IN THE CASE ARE. THE EVIDENCE IN THIS CASE
6 WILL BE PRESENTED TO YOU BY THE SWORN TESTIMONY OF
7 WITNESSES FROM THIS WITNESS STAND AND ANY EXHIBITS
8 THAT MAY BE INTRODUCED INTO EVIDENCE.

9 NOW, AT SOME TIMES DURING THIS TRIAL YOU WILL SEE
10 THE ATTORNEYS COME FORWARD AND APPROACH THE BENCH, YOU
11 MAY HAVE EVEN SEEN THEM DO THAT A LITTLE BIT
12 YESTERDAY. OCCASIONALLY, BECAUSE OF SOME OF THE ISSUES
13 THAT COME UP DURING THE TRIAL YOU WILL BE EXCUSED TO
14 GO BACK TO THE JURY ROOM. THE REASON FOR THAT IS,
15 USUALLY I HAVE TO TAKE UP AN ISSUE OF LAW WITH THE
16 ATTORNEYS, AND SOMETIMES WHEN I TAKE UP AN ISSUE OF
17 LAW WITH THE ATTORNEYS IT REQUIRES ME TO MAKE A
18 COMMENT ON THE FACTS OF THE CASE, OR WHAT I PERCEIVE
19 TO BE THE FACTS OF THE CASE. SINCE I DON'T WANT TO
20 INFLUENCE YOU BY ANY OPINION I HAVE ABOUT THE FACTS,
21 YOU WILL BE EXCUSED SO THAT THAT WILL NOT HAPPEN,
22 BECAUSE REMEMBER, YOU ARE THE SOLE JUDGES OF THE
23 FACTS, NOT ME. IT IS Y'ALL'S DETERMINATION OF WHAT
24 THE FACTS ARE IN THIS CASE THAT IS THE MOST IMPORTANT
25 THING.

1 NOW, IN DETERMINING WHAT THE TRUE FACTS ARE IN
2 THIS CASE YOU MUST DECIDE WHETHER OR NOT THE TESTIMONY
3 OF A WITNESS IS BELIEVABLE. IT WILL BE MY
4 RESPONSIBILITY TO RULE AS A MATTER OF LAW WHETHER
5 CERTAIN TESTIMONY IS ADMISSIBLE, BUT ONCE THE
6 TESTIMONY IS ADMITTED, WHETHER OR NOT YOU BELIEVE IT
7 IS SOLELY FOR YOU TO DETERMINE. IN DECIDING WHETHER
8 TO BELIEVE A WITNESS YOU HAVE THE RIGHT TO CONSIDER
9 THE INTEREST OF ANY WITNESS, THE BIAS OF ANY WITNESS,
10 THE PREJUDICE OF ANY WITNESS, THE OPPORTUNITY FOR THE
11 WITNESS TO HAVE SEEN THE MATTERS AND THINGS ABOUT
12 WHICH THE WITNESS MAY TESTIFY, AND THE WAY THE WITNESS
13 ACTS ON THE WITNESS STAND. YOU HAVE A RIGHT TO
14 CONSIDER ANYTHING THAT IS IN THE RECORD THAT WILL HELP
15 YOU EVALUATE THE TESTIMONY OF A WITNESS. THAT MEANS
16 IT IS YOUR DUTY TO PAY CLOSE ATTENTION TO ALL OF THESE
17 WITNESSES, TO OBSERVE THEM, TO LISTEN TO THEM, AND TO
18 PAY CLOSE ATTENTION TO THE ATTORNEYS AND THE COURT.
19 PLEASE GIVE STRICT ATTENTION TO THE TESTIMONY IN THIS
20 CASE SO THAT AT THE END OF ALL THE TESTIMONY, AFTER
21 THE ARGUMENTS OF COUNSEL AND AFTER I CHARGE YOU WITH
22 THE LAW YOU WILL THEN BE IN A POSITION TO DETERMINE
23 WHAT THE TRUE FACTS ARE AND TO APPLY THE LAW TO THOSE
24 FACTS AND THUS RENDER A TRUE AND JUST VERDICT IN THIS
25 CASE.

1 ANY EXCEPTIONS TO WHAT I SAID BY THE STATE?

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, SIR.

3 THE COURT: OKAY, ANY EXCEPTIONS FROM THE
4 DEFENDANTS?

5 MR. LACKEY: NONE FROM ME, YOUR HONOR.

6 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

7 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

8 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR.

9 MR. KOGER: NO, SIR.

10 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK Y'ALL. OKAY, WE'RE
11 NOW GETTING READY TO BEGIN THE TRIAL, AND WHO'S GOING
12 TO DO THE OPENING? MR. SORENSON? ALRIGHT, MR.
13 SORENSON, THANK YOU, SIR.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT?

15 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

16 OPENING STATEMENT BY SOLICITOR SORENSON

17 GOOD MORNING, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN. THIRTY-EIGHT
18 YEAR OLD CHARLES PRINGLE SOLD MARIJUANA OUT OF HIS
19 APARTMENT. BACK ON THE NIGHT OF MARCH TWELFTH, TWO
20 THOUSAND TEN, MR. PRINGLE PAID THE ULTIMATE PRICE
21 BECAUSE OF THAT. THAT NIGHT, A LITTLE BEFORE TEN
22 O'CLOCK IN THE EVENING SIX MEN CAME INTO HIS APARTMENT
23 ARMED WITH FOUR GUNS, A NINE MILLIMETER PISTOL, A
24 FORTY CALIBER HAND GUN, AND TWO RIFLES. THEY CAME IN
25 THERE WITH THE INTENTION TO ROB HIM. THEY RANSACKED

1 HIS LIVING ROOM, STARTED TO WRAP HIS FACE UP WITH DUCT
2 TAPE, FORCED HIM ON THE GROUND, HE WAS ULTIMATELY
3 SHOT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, BY THOSE FOUR GUNS, NOT
4 ONE TIME, NOT TWO TIMES, NOT THREE TIMES, THE STATE
5 WILL PROVE HE WAS SHOT TWENTY-FOUR TIMES ON HIS LIVING
6 ROOM FLOOR AND LEFT TO DIE.

7 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, THERE WERE SIX MEN, AND
8 FIVE OF THEM ARE HERE IN COURT TODAY. THE NAMES ARE
9 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, RALPH COLEMAN, WALTER HARRIS, DANNY
10 RYANT, AND MARIO SHIVERS. THE SIXTH I'M GOING TO TALK
11 ABOUT IN A FEW MINUTES, HIS NAME IS A SIXTEEN YEAR OLD
12 NAMED PATRICK TYLER, AND I'M GOING TO TALK TO YOU
13 ABOUT HIM IN A COUPLE OF MINUTES. AND AS HIS HONOR
14 TOLD YOU, AS A RESULT OF THEIR ACTIONS THAT NIGHT AND
15 MR. PRINGLE'S DEATH, THE FIVE OF THEM HAVE BEEN
16 CHARGED, HAVE BEEN INDICTED BY THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY
17 GRAND JURY WITH THREE SEPARATE OFFENSES, ONE COUNT OF
18 MURDER, ONE COUNT OF BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE, AND
19 ONE COUNT OF ARMED ROBBERY. AND I WANT TO TAKE JUST A
20 COUPLE OF MINUTES AND TALK TO YOU JUST REAL BRIEFLY
21 ABOUT WHAT THOSE THREE CHARGES MEAN, WHAT THE ELEMENTS
22 ARE THAT WE HAVE TO PROVE TO YOU BEFORE YOU CAN FIND
23 THOSE DEFENDANTS OVER THERE GUILTY.

24 THE FIRST ONE I'M GOING TO START WITH IS MURDER.
25 MURDER, WHILE IT'S THE MOST SERIOUS CRIME WE HAVE ON

1 OUR LAW BOOKS, I SUBMIT TO YOU, IT PROBABLY HAS THE
2 SHORTEST AND SIMPLEST DEFINITION. MURDER, LADIES AND
3 GENTLEMEN, IS VERY SIMPLY THE UNLAWFUL KILLING OF
4 ANOTHER PERSON WITH MALICE AFORETHOUGHT. IT'S THE
5 UNLAWFUL KILLING OF ANOTHER PERSON WITH MALICE
6 AFORETHOUGHT. AND I SUBMIT TO YOU, IT DOESN'T GET
7 MORE MALICIOUS THAN WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM
8 THIS WITNESS STAND AND IN THIS COURTROOM OVER THE NEXT
9 COUPLE OF DAYS. SIX MEN GOING INTO ANOTHER PERSON'S
10 HOME, TYING HIM UP, WRAPPING HIS FACE UP WITH DUCT
11 TAPE AND ULTIMATELY SHOOTING HIM TWENTY-FOUR TIMES
12 WHILE RANSACKING HIS HOUSE, IT'S HARD TO IMAGINE HOW
13 YOU COULD GET MUCH MORE MALICIOUS THAN THAT. THAT'S
14 MURDER.

15 THE SECOND ONE IS BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE.
16 AND BURGLARY, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, IS THE UNLAWFUL
17 ENTRY INTO ANOTHER PERSON'S HOME WITHOUT THEIR
18 CONSENT, WITH THE INTENT TO COMMIT A CRIME. IT'S THE
19 UNLAWFUL ENTRY INTO ANOTHER PERSON'S HOME, WITHOUT
20 THEIR CONSENT, WITH THE INTENT TO COMMIT A CRIME. I
21 SUBMIT TO YOU, THE INTENT TO COMMIT A CRIME HERE IS,
22 THEY WERE GOING IN THERE TO ROB MR. PRINGLE. OKAY?
23 AND ONE THING I WANT TO TALK ABOUT, TWO MORE ISSUES OF
24 BURGLARY. YOU'LL NOTICE THERE'S NOWHERE IN THERE DID
25 I SAY YOU HAD BREAK INTO SOMEBODY'S HOME. YOU DON'T

1 HAVE TO CLIMB IN THROUGH A WINDOW, YOU DON'T HAVE TO
2 KICK IN THE FRONT DOOR. IT'S THE UNLAWFUL ENTRY INTO
3 ANOTHER PERSON'S HOME WITHOUT THEIR CONSENT. AND I
4 SUBMIT TO YOU, THAT PART, WITHOUT CONSENT, IF YOU
5 MISREPRESENT WHY YOU'RE GOING IN THE HOME, USE
6 TRICKERY OR DECEIT TO GET INTO THE HOME, THAT WOULD
7 QUALIFY AS BEING WITHOUT THE PERSON'S CONSENT.

8 AND LASTLY, THE LAST CHARGE THAT THE THREE OF
9 THEM, OR THE FIVE OF THEM ARE CHARGED WITH IS ARMED
10 ROBBERY. ARMED ROBBERY IS VERY SIMPLY STEALING FROM
11 SOMEBODY WHILE ARMED WITH A WEAPON. OKAY? IT'S
12 TAKING SOMEBODY ELSE'S PROPERTY THROUGH FORCE OR
13 INTIMIDATION WITH THE INTENT TO DEPRIVE IT OF THAT
14 PERSON WHILE ARMED WITH A DEADLY WEAPON.

15 THOSE ARE THE THREE CHARGES THAT THE FIVE OF
16 THEM, AND ALSO THE SIX OF THEM AS I INDICATED, AND I'M
17 GOING TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE SIXTEEN YEAR OLD
18 PATRICK TYLER, THE SIX OF THEM ARE CHARGED WITH AS A
19 RESULT OF THEIR ACTIONS BACK ON THE NIGHT OF MARCH THE
20 TWELFTH OF THIS YEAR.

21 NOW, ONE OTHER THING, KIND OF A LEGAL CONCEPT I
22 WANT TO BRIEFLY ADDRESS WITH YOU, YOU MAY HAVE
23 NOTICED, I TALKED TO YOU, THERE ARE SIX PEOPLE THAT
24 GOT CHARGED, THERE ARE FOUR WEAPONS THAT WERE USED,
25 FOUR WEAPONS THAT WERE USED. I WANT TO TALK TO YOU

1 ABOUT SOMETHING CALLED ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY. VERY
2 SIMPLY, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WHAT THAT MEANS IS WHEN
3 TWO OR MORE PEOPLE GET TOGETHER WITH THE INTENTION OF
4 GOING TO COMMIT AN UNLAWFUL, IN THIS CASE, WHEN SIX
5 PEOPLE GOT TOGETHER TO GO OVER THERE AND GO INTO MR.
6 PRINGLE'S APARTMENT TO ROB HIM AND TAKE ITEMS FROM
7 HIM. SO, THE SIX OF THEM CONSPIRED TOGETHER TO COMMIT
8 AN UNLAWFUL ACT. IF SOMEBODY THEN, IN TURN, IN THIS
9 CASE ENDED UP SHOOTING AND KILLING HIM, I SUBMIT TO
10 YOU, THEY'RE ALL JUST AS GUILTY. I SUBMIT TO YOU,
11 WHEN THE SIX OF THEM WENT IN THERE, IF MR. PRINGLE HAD
12 BEEN SHOT ONE TIME AND DIED AS A RESULT OF THAT, ALL
13 SIX OF THEM UNDER OUR LAW WOULD BE JUST AS GUILTY. IN
14 THIS CASE WE'RE GOING TO PROVE TO YOU THAT FOUR OF
15 THOSE WEAPONS WERE FIRED A TOTAL OF TWENTY-FOUR TIMES
16 STRIKING MR. PRINGLE. FOUR DIFFERENT PEOPLE AND, I
17 SUBMIT TO YOU, THE OTHER TWO WERE JUST AS GUILTY UNDER
18 OUR LAW. BASICALLY, YOU'VE PROBABLY HEARD THE PHRASE
19 BEFORE, THE HAND OF ONE IS THE ALL, AND THAT'S
20 BASICALLY WHAT IT MEANS, WHEN TWO OR MORE PEOPLE GET
21 TOGETHER, CONSPIRE TO COMMIT AN UNLAWFUL ACT, THE ACT
22 OF ONE IS THE ACT OF ALL.

23 I WANT TO ADDRESS TO YOU JUST REAL BRIEFLY THE
24 FACTS AND THEN I'M GOING TO SIT DOWN AND LET THE
25 DEFENSE LAWYERS, IF THEY WISH, HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO

COME BEFORE YOU, AND THEN WE'LL GET INTO ACTUALLY PUTTING WITNESSES UP SO YOU CAN HEAR FROM THEM. LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, AS INDICATED, YOU'LL HEAR THAT BACK ON THE EVENING OF MARCH THE TWELFTH OF THIS YEAR, SHORTLY BEFORE TEN O'CLOCK, NINE:FORTY, NINE:FORTY-FIVE, SOMEWHERE IN THAT RANGE, THAT SIX PEOPLE ULTIMATELY WENT INTO MR. PRINGLE'S HOME, HIS APARTMENT OVER ON KING'S ROAD HERE IN ORANGEBURG COUNTY. THEY HAD GONE IN THERE INITIALLY, GOT THE DOOR OPEN TO GO IN THERE UNDER THE PRETEXT THAT THEY WERE GOING TO GO BUY MARIJUANA, AND THEN ENDED UP RUSHING IN THERE WITH THE WEAPONS, PULLING THEM ON MR. PRINGLE, AND ALSO A YOUNG LADY YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM BY THE NAME OF ASHLEY PARSLEY. YOU'LL HEAR HOW ASHLEY WAS FORCED FACE DOWN ON THE APARTMENT FLOOR IN THE LIVING ROOM WHILE SHE HEARD MULTIPLE PEOPLE IN THERE RANSACKING, TEARING UP THE CUSHIONS ON THE SOFA AND THE LOVE SEAT, TEARING APART THE FURNITURE LOOKING FOR MARIJUANA AND MONEY INSIDE THAT APARTMENT. YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR HOW SHE HEARD THE DUCT TAPE BEING PULLED, AND ULTIMATELY HOW SHE HEARD A BARRAGE OF GUN FIRE, AND THEN HEARD THEM ALL RUNNING OUT OF THE APARTMENT. SHE CALLED NINE ONE ONE, LAW ENFORCEMENT GOT OUT THERE. YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR HOW OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL DAYS AS THE INVESTIGATION PROGRESSED IT ULTIMATELY LED TO THESE

1 SIX INDIVIDUALS BEING CHARGED. THE FIVE OF THEM OVER
2 THERE, TWENTY TO TWENTY-TWO YEAR OLDS SITTING OVER
3 THERE, AND A SIXTEEN YEAR OLD BY THE NAME OF PATRICK
4 TYLER.

5 YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM MR. TYLER, HE'S GOING
6 TO COME IN HERE AND TESTIFY ABOUT THE PLANNING OF THE
7 ROBBERY, WHO WAS INVOLVED IN THAT, HOW EACH OF THE SIX
8 OF THEM GOT INVOLVED IN IT, AND ULTIMATELY, HOW IT
9 WENT DOWN THAT NIGHT, AND THEN WHAT THEY DID
10 AFTERWARDS. AND I SUBMIT TO YOU, YOU'RE ALSO GOING TO
11 HEAR FROM OTHER WITNESSES THAT ARE GOING TO
12 CORROBORATE WHAT MR. TYLER TELLS YOU HAPPENED, BOTH
13 BEFORE AND AFTERWARDS.

14 YOU'RE ALSO GOING TO HEAR FROM A YOUNG MAN BY THE
15 NAME OF RONNIE WASHINGTON. HE'S GOING TO ALSO IDENTIFY
16 THE FIVE OF THEM AS BEING THE INDIVIDUALS THAT HE
17 PICKED UP THAT NIGHT ALONG WITH MR. TYLER AND
18 ULTIMATELY TOOK THEM OVER TO THAT APARTMENT FOR THE
19 PURPOSE OF GOING TO, HE THOUGHT TO GO BUY SOME
20 MARIJUANA, AND HOW WHEN THEY CAME RUNNING HE'LL TELL
21 YOU WHERE HE ENDED UP TAKING THEM AND DROPPING THEM
22 OFF THAT NIGHT.

23 I SUBMIT TO YOU, THAT'S JUST IN A VERY KIND OF
24 BRIEF BUT SHELL WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR, LADIES AND
25 GENTLEMEN.

1 THE LAST THING I WANT TO CLOSE WITH BEFORE I SIT
2 DOWN IS, I WANT TO THANK YOU, THANK YOU AHEAD OF TIME
3 FOR THE ATTENTION THAT I KNOW YOU'RE GOING TO GIVE TO
4 THIS MATTER. I KNOW THERE ARE PROBABLY A THOUSAND
5 OTHER THINGS THAT Y'ALL WOULD WANT TO BE DOING THIS
6 TIME OF YEAR. BUT NOT ONLY ON BEHALF OF THOSE FIVE
7 DEFENDANTS OVER THERE, BUT MORE SPECIFICALLY, ON
8 BEHALF OF THE FAMILY OF CHARLES PRINGLE, I WANT TO
9 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND YOUR ATTENTION THAT I KNOW
10 YOU'RE GOING TO GIVE TO THIS VERY SERIOUS AND
11 IMPORTANT MATTER.

12 THE ONLY THING I WANT TO CLOSE WITH NOW IS, ONE
13 THING I ASK OF YOU IS FOR Y'ALL TO PLEASE KEEP AN OPEN
14 MIND. OKAY? IT'S KIND OF LIKE PUTTING TOGETHER A JIG
15 SAW PUZZLE. YOU KNOW, EACH WITNESS YOU HEAR FROM THIS
16 WITNESS STAND, EACH PIECE OF EVIDENCE THAT'S
17 INTRODUCED TO YOU IS ONE PIECE OF THAT PUZZLE, ONE
18 PIECE OF THAT PUZZLE. AND WE ASK YOU, LADIES AND
19 GENTLEMEN, AS I SAID, KEEP THAT OPEN MIND AND GIVE THE
20 SOLICITOR A CHANCE AT THE CLOSE OF THE CASE TO PUT
21 THAT PICTURE TOGETHER, TO PUT THAT PICTURE TOGETHER.
22 I SUBMIT TO YOU, WHEN THAT'S DONE, LADIES AND
23 GENTLEMEN, NOT ONLY IS THERE GOING TO BE NO REASONABLE
24 DOUBT, I SUBMIT TO YOU, THERE'S GOING TO BE NO DOUBT
25 WHATSOEVER OF THE GUILT OF CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, RALPH

1 COLEMAN, WALTER HARRIS, DANNY RYANT AND MARIO SHIVERS,
2 THEIR GUILT AND THEIR INVOLVEMENT IN THE MURDER, THE
3 BURGLARY AND THE ARMED ROBBERY OF CHARLES PRINGLE BACK
4 ON MARCH THE TWELFTH. THANK YOU.

5 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. SORENSON.

6 MR. LACKEY.

7 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. LACKEY

8 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN OF THE JURY, I'M GOING TO BE
9 VERY BRIEF WITH YOU HERE TODAY. I KNOW YOU'VE GOT A
10 LOT OF ATTORNEYS TO LISTEN TO, BUT WHAT THE JUDGE
11 SAID, I JUST WANT TO REITERATE TO YOU. WHAT MR.
12 SORENSON TOLD YOU, WHAT MR. PASCOE MAY SAY DURING THIS
13 TRIAL, NONE OF THAT IS EVIDENCE. THE EVIDENCE WILL
14 COME IN THROUGH WITNESSES ON THIS STAND AND THROUGH
15 ITEMS PRESENTED THROUGH THOSE WITNESSES. SO,
16 EVERYTHING I'M SAYING RIGHT NOW, EVERYTHING HE JUST
17 SAID IS NOT EVIDENCE AT ALL, THAT'S JUST TELLING YOU
18 ABOUT THE CASE.

19 NOW, MY CLIENT IS CHRISTIAN COLEMAN. WHAT DOES
20 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN HAVE TO PROVE? NOTHING, ABSOLUTELY
21 NOTHING. SOME LAWYERS SAY SOMEONE WHO'S CHARGED WITH
22 SOMETHING IS SHROUDED IN A CLOAK OF INNOCENCE.
23 BASICALLY YOU'VE HEARD THE SAYING OF INNOCENT UNTIL
24 PROVEN GUILTY. WELL, THERE'S NO TRUER TEST OF THAT
25 THAN IN THIS COURTROOM HERE TODAY. THE BURDEN IS ON

1 THE STATE, THE STATE BEING THE SOLICITOR, LAW
2 ENFORCEMENT, TO PROVE THIS CASE, AND TO PROVE IT
3 BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT. NOW, BEYOND A REASONABLE
4 DOUBT IS THE MOST STRINGENT AND THE HIGHEST STANDARD
5 TO PROVE A CASE IN OUR JUDICIAL SYSTEM. IF YOU'VE EVER
6 BEEN INVOLVED IN A CIVIL SUCH AS A CAR WRECK,
7 SOMETHING SUCH AS THAT, THE STANDARD AND BURDEN OF
8 PROOF IS MUCH LOWER, IT'S CALL THE PREPONDERANCE OF
9 THE EVIDENCE. BASICALLY, WHAT THAT MEANS, YOU'VE
10 HEARD OF THE SCALES OF JUSTICE. IF IT EVER SO
11 SLIGHTLY TILTS IN ONE WAY, THE SCALES OF JUSTICE, YOU
12 HAVE TO GO AND RULE WITH THAT SIDE. IN THIS IT'S A
13 MUCH MORE STRINGENT TEST, BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT.
14 THAT'S WHAT THEY HAVE TO PROVE. MY CLIENT HAS TO PROVE
15 NOTHING.

16 NOW, AS THE JUDGE TOLD YOU, THERE ARE A LOT OF
17 MOVING PARTS IN THIS TRIAL. WE'VE GOT -- THIS IS A
18 LITTLE UNUSUAL, WE'VE GOT FIVE INDIVIDUALS OVER HERE
19 CHARGED WITH THESE CRIMES. EACH HAS TO BE JUDGED
20 SEPARATELY, EACH HAS TO BE JUDGED ON EACH ONE OF THE
21 CHARGES, EACH ONE OF THE INDICTMENTS THAT YOU'LL SEE.
22 THOSE INDICTMENTS, AS THE JUDGE SAID, MEAN NOTHING.
23 IT'S A PIECE OF PAPER THAT JUST GOT THEM IN THIS
24 COURTROOM TODAY. THIS EVIDENCE IS WHAT YOU'LL BE
25 LOOKING AT.

1 ALSO AS THE JUDGE SAID, YOU'RE THE TRIER OF THE
2 FACTS. YOU LISTEN, YOU GIVE THE WEIGHT, CREDIBILITY
3 OF THE WITNESSES. HE'S GOING TO TELL YOU THE LAW.
4 WHETHER YOU LIKE IT OR NOT, WHETHER I LIKE IT OR NOT,
5 IT'S THE LAW WE HAVE HERE IN THE STATE OF SOUTH
6 CAROLINA, SO THAT'S WHAT YOU'VE TAKEN AN OATH TO GO
7 BY.

8 THERE'S AN OLD SAYING THAT SOME ATTORNEYS USE,
9 SAYING THE DEVIL'S IN THE DETAILS. THAT IS EXACTLY
10 WHAT I WANT YOU TO KEEP IN MIND WHEN EVIDENCE IS
11 PRESENTED, SPECIFICALLY TO MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN
12 COLEMAN, THE DEVIL'S IN THE DETAILS. WHAT THEY'RE
13 GOING TO SAY AS TO THE EVIDENCE AGAINST MY CLIENT, I
14 SUBMIT TO YOU, AT THE END OF THE CASE, IF YOU TAKE
15 THAT INTO CONSIDERATION, SEE WHAT THEY'VE PRESENTED TO
16 YOU, YOU WILL COME BACK WITH A VERDICT OF NOT GUILTY
17 ON ALL THE CHARGES AGAINST MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN
18 COLEMAN.

19 THANK YOU.

20 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. LACKEY.

21 MS. ULLMAN, OR MR. WISE. Y'ALL ARE GOING TO HAVE
22 TO TELL ME WHO IS WHO, Y'ALL ARE GOING TO NEED TO
23 RAISE OUR HAND. OKAY.

24 MR. WISE: I APOLOGIZE.

25 THE COURT: NO PROBLEM.

1 MR. WISE: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

2 THE COURT: YES, SIR, MR. WISE.

3 MR. WISE: MR. SORENSON, MR. PASCOE.

4 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. WISE

5 GOOD MORNING. MS. ULLMAN AND I REPRESENT RALPH
6 COLEMAN, AND I'D LIKE YOU NOT TO TAKE ANY IMPLICATION
7 FROM THE FACT THAT HE HAS TWO ATTORNEYS. AS THE JUDGE
8 HAS INSTRUCTED YOU, WE ARE BOTH WITH THE PUBLIC
9 DEFENDER'S OFFICE, AND THIS IS SIMPLY HOW WE TRY CASES
10 SOMETIMES.

11 I'D LIKE TO, BECAUSE I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT, TALK
12 ABOUT SOME OF THE THINGS THAT MR. SORENSON SAID IN HIS
13 OPENING, BECAUSE I THINK HE'S DONE AN EXCELLENT JOB OF
14 FRAMING THE ISSUES IN THIS CASE FOR YOU. HE STARTED
15 BY SAYING YOU HAVE SIX MEN AND FOUR GUNS. THE JUDGE
16 HAS INSTRUCTED YOU THAT YOU, THAT THERE ARE THREE
17 CHARGES THAT YOU NEED TO CONSIDER SEPARATELY. HE ALSO
18 INDICATED IN HIS OPENING THAT IT WAS THE INTENT OF
19 THESE YOUNG MEN TO ROB MR. PRINGLE. WHEN YOU CONSIDER
20 THIS EVIDENCE AT THE END THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS I
21 WANT YOU TO FOCUS ON. IS IT AS HE SAID IT WILL BE,
22 THAT IT WAS THEIR INTENT TO ROB MR. PRINGLE? MR.
23 SORENSON TALKED ABOUT ACCOMPLICE LIABILITY AND THEN HE
24 USED THIS EXPRESSION, THEY CONSPIRED TOGETHER. HE
25 WENT ON TO TALK ABOUT, IF SOMEONE SHOOTS AND KILLS,

1 AND THEN HE TALKED ABOUT THE HAND OF ONE BEING THE
2 HAND OF ALL. THIS IS IMPORTANT, BECAUSE AS THE JUDGE
3 INDICATED A LITTLE WHILE AGO, YOU ARE THE JUDGES OF
4 THE LAW. SO, THE JUDGE IS GOING TO TELL YOU HOW TO,
5 THE LAW TO APPLY TO THE EVIDENCE THAT COMES BEFORE
6 YOU. HE THEN SAID A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT I THOUGHT
7 WERE INTERESTING, HE SAID THAT THE GROUP WENT IN
8 INITIALLY, AND HE USED THE WORD, PRETEXT TO BUY
9 MARIJUANA. THAT WILL BE IMPORTANT AS IT RELATES TO
10 MR. COLEMAN. AND HE A LITTLE WHILE LATER SPOKE ABOUT
11 RONNIE WASHINGTON. AND THE INTERESTING THING ABOUT
12 THAT WAS, WHEN HE SPOKE ABOUT RONNIE WASHINGTON HE DID
13 NOT USE THE WORD, PRETEXT. THERE'S A REASON FOR THAT.
14 THERE'S A REASON BECAUSE DIFFERENT PEOPLE KNEW,
15 THOUGHT, UNDERSTOOD DIFFERENT THINGS ABOUT WHAT WAS
16 GOING ON THIS DAY.

17 THIS IS A VERY DIFFICULT CASE. THERE ARE FIVE
18 PEOPLE SITTING AT THAT TABLE. WE KNOW THERE SHOULD AT
19 LEAST BE ONE OTHER PERSON SITTING AT THAT TABLE
20 BECAUSE MR. SORENSON MENTIONED THAT. AND I SUBMIT
21 THERE SHOULD BE EVEN MORE BEYOND THAT. MR. SORENSON
22 SAID THERE WERE FOUR GUNS, THERE'S THREE CHARGES AND
23 IT'S YOUR JOB TO SORT IT ALL OUT. YOUR JOB IS MADE
24 MORE DIFFICULT BY THE FACT THAT THE WITNESSES WHO WILL
25 BE CALLED, I SUBMIT TO YOU, ARE NOT GOING TO CLARIFY

1 SOME OF THIS FOR YOU. THEY WILL BE, I SUBMIT,
2 WITNESSES CALLED WHO WILL TESTIFY TO SEEING THINGS
3 THAT THEY DID NOT SEE. THERE WILL BE ONE WITNESS
4 CALLED, MR. TYLER, WHO WAS CALLED AND WHO WILL TESTIFY
5 OUT OF HIS DESIRE TO SAVE HIS SKIN. AND YOUR ARE LEFT
6 WITH THE JOB OF DETERMINE WHO WAS INVOLVED AND WHAT
7 WAS THEIR INVOLVEMENT. AND YOU HAVE TO DECIDE, AS MR.
8 LACKEY SAID, EACH CHARGE AS TO EACH PERSON. THERE IS
9 AN OLDER EXPRESSION THAT THEN ONE MR. LACKEY USED THAT
10 IS, IN FOR A PENNY, IN FOR A POUND, BUT THAT IS NOT
11 HOW YOU HAVE TO DECIDE THIS CASE. AND THAT'S
12 IMPORTANT BECAUSE WHEN MR. SORENSON STARTED TO TALK
13 ABOUT CONSPIRING TOGETHER, AND I SUBMIT TO YOU THAT
14 WHAT THE STATE WANTS TO DO IS KIND OF CREATE AND AIR
15 OF CRIMINALITY AROUND THESE GUYS, A GROUP OF BAD GUYS,
16 BIRDS OF A FEATHER, IF YOU WILL. BUT THE GOOD THING
17 IS, YOU WON'T DO THAT BECAUSE YOU'VE TAKEN AN OATH AND
18 YOU SAID YOU WOULDN'T DO THAT.

19 THE STATE HAS TO PROVE THAT RALPH SET OUT TO
20 MURDER CHARLES PRINGLE. THE EVIDENCE WILL NOT SO
21 SHOW. AS THE JUDGE SAYS, HOW WILL YOU DETERMINE? YOU
22 WILL LISTEN TO THE EVIDENCE, FOCUS ON THE FACTS, AND
23 AS THE JUDGE INDICATED, EVALUATE THE WITNESSES AND
24 THEIR INTERESTS, BIAS, PREJUDICES, AND THE WAY THE
25 WITNESS ACTS ON THE STAND.

1 IT'S A DIFFICULT CASE, THIS IS SERIOUS CHARGES. I
2 ANTICIPATE A LOT OF PASSION IN THIS CASE. VOICES MAY
3 BE RAISED, FINGERS POINTED, TABLES POUNDED ON, I MAY
4 EVEN DO SOME OF THAT. BUT IF THAT HAPPENS AND WE GET A
5 LITTLE SNIPPY, DON'T, THAT SHOULDN'T BE CONSIDERED BY
6 YOU. FOCUS ON THE FACTS, FOCUS ON THE FACTS, IT'S NOT
7 A PROBLEM, WE DO THAT SOMETIMES.

8 ALL MS. ULLMAN AND I ASK IS THAT AFTER ALL THESE
9 ARGUMENTS ARE DONE, YOU GO INTO YOUR DELIBERATION
10 ROOM, SIT DOWN, TAKE A BREATH, HAVE A COKE, AND THEN
11 BEGIN TO SORT OUT THE EVIDENCE, ONE PERSON AT A TIME,
12 ONE CHARGE AT A TIME. AND THEN WHEN YOU GET TO RALPH
13 YOU FOCUS ON THIS, WAS THERE ANY CREDIBLE EVIDENCE
14 THAT HE WAS THERE? START WITH THAT. AND THEN IF YOU
15 FIND THAT THERE WAS CREDIBLE EVIDENCE THAT HE WAS
16 THERE, IS THERE CREDIBLE EVIDENCE THAT HE DID,
17 PARTICIPATED IN ANYTHING? AND IF YOU DO THAT CALMLY,
18 FREE OF PASSION, WE SUBMIT THAT YOU WILL FIND THAT THE
19 APPROPRIATE VERDICT AS TO RALPH IS NOT GUILTY.

20 THANK YOU.

21 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. WISE.

22 MR. PALMER.

23 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR, MAY IT PLEASE
24 THE COURT.

25 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

1 MR. PALMER: LET ME GET OUT OF MY HOLE HERE.

2 THE COURT: THAT'S GOOD EXERCISE.

3 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. PALMER

4 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, THE DEVIL MAY BE IN THE
5 DETAILS BUT WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT BASICS FIRST. AND
6 THE BASICS THAT APPLY TO THIS CASE ARE CONTAINED IN
7 THE U. S. AND THE SOUTH CAROLINA CONSTITUTION, AND THE
8 BEST WAY TO ILLUSTRATE WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT IS TO
9 TELL YOU A PERSONAL STORY. I'VE BEEN IN PRACTICE
10 TWENTY-TWO YEARS, AND FROM TIME TO TIME I HAVE LAW
11 CLERKS AND INTERNS COME IN AND WORK IN MY OFFICE.
12 THEY USUALLY WORK FOR FREE BECAUSE THEY HAVE TO GET
13 CREDITS FOR SCHOOL. A FEW YEARS AGO I HAD AN INTERN
14 THAT WAS AT A LOCAL TECHNICAL SCHOOL STUDYING
15 PARALEGAL STUDIES, CRIMINAL JUSTICE, THAT SORT OF
16 THING. AND I WAS WORKING A LITTLE LATE ONE DAY, AND
17 SHE CAME IN AND SAID, I HAVE TO ASK YOU SOME QUESTIONS
18 TO FULFILL MY SCHOOL REQUIREMENTS. I SAID, SHOOT, FIRE
19 AWAY. AND SHE ASKED ME A FEW QUESTIONS ABOUT WHAT'S
20 IT LIKE TO PRACTICE LAW AND WHAT DO YOU HAVE TO DO TO
21 GET QUALIFIED, AND WHAT'S THE SCHOOLING LIKE, AND I
22 TOLD HER THE ROUTINE ANSWERS, AND THEN SHE HIT ME WITH
23 ONE THAT JUST BLIND SIDED ME. SHE SAID, I KNOW YOU DO
24 CRIMINAL DEFENSE. I'VE ALWAYS WONDERED HOW LAWYERS
25 LIKE YOU CAN REPRESENT GUILTY PEOPLE? IT TOOK ME

1 TOTALLY ABACK. I DROPPED MY PEN, AND I SAID, YOU KNOW,
2 I'VE BEEN ASKED THAT QUESTION BEFORE AND I'VE ALWAYS
3 TRIED TO GIVE A REALLY LEARNED, TECHNICAL ANSWER, BUT
4 I'M GOING TO TRY A DIFFERENT APPROACH. I'M GOING TO
5 GIVE YOU A MULTIPLE CHOICE QUESTION, A AND B. WHICH
6 DO YOU FIND MORE TROUBLING, OPTION A, WATCHING AN
7 INDIVIDUAL BE ACQUITTED OF A CHARGE IF YOU THINK HE
8 PROBABLY OR LIKELY MIGHT HAVE DONE IT? OPTION B,
9 WATCHING AN INNOCENT PERSON GET CONVICTED AND
10 PUNISHED? WHICH DO YOU FIND MORE TROUBLING? AND SHE
11 SAID, WELL, CLEARLY, OPTION B. AND I SAID, WELL, I'M
12 GLAD YOU SAID THAT, BECAUSE IF YOU PICKED OPTION A, I
13 WOULD SUGGEST THAT YOU NEED TO GO BACK AND STUDY MORE
14 ABOUT AMERICA AND THE SYSTEM OF JUSTICE AND THE
15 CONSTITUTION, BECAUSE IN AMERICA U. S. CITIZENS AND
16 LIKE YOU AND I, AND THESE FIVE YOUNG MEN SITTING HERE
17 ARE ALL INNOCENT, WE'RE ALL INNOCENT UNTIL WE'RE
18 PROVEN GUILTY.

19 NOW, THE CONSTITUTION IMPOSES A BURDEN OF PROOF,
20 AND I LIKE THAT WORD, BURDEN, BECAUSE IT'S A PERFECT
21 WORD. IT IS A BURDEN THAT MUST BE CARRIED ACROSS THE
22 FINISH LINE BY THE STATE. WALTER LEE HARRIS, THIS
23 YOUNG MAN IN THE BLUE SHIRT, HAS ZERO BURDEN TO PROVE
24 ANYTHING. HE CAN SIT HERE THIS WHOLE WEEK, NOT UTTER
25 A WORD, NOT ENTER A SHRED OF EVIDENCE INTO THIS CASE,

1 AND UNLESS YOU FINE PEOPLE ARE CONVINCED BEYOND A
2 REASONABLE DOUBT THAT HE DID SOMETHING HE'S NOT
3 GUILTY, HE GOES HOME.

4 NOW, THE STATE HAS GIVEN YOU THEIR VERSION OF THE
5 CASE. MAKE NO MISTAKE, ANYTHING THE LAWYERS SAY IN
6 THIS CASE, ME INCLUDED, ARE NOT FACTS, THEY'RE
7 THEORIES. THE STATE'S GIVEN YOU THE THEORY OF THE
8 CASE, BUT I'LL SUBMIT TO YOU THAT NONE OF THE LAWYERS
9 IN THIS COURTROOM KNOW WHAT HAPPENED IN THIS CASE.
10 NOBODY KNOWS FIRST HAND THAT'S SITTING AT THESE TABLES
11 WHAT HAPPENED IN THIS CASE. AND IF THEY PRESENT THE
12 SO CALLED STAR WITNESSES, I WANT YOU TO MAKE THEM
13 PROVE TO YOU THAT THEY KNOW WHAT HAPPENED IN THIS
14 CASE, THAT THEY KNOW WHO DID WHAT. I WOULD SUBMIT TO
15 YOU THAT THE STATE DOESN'T REALLY EVEN KNOW THAT
16 THEY'VE GOT THE RIGHT GUYS. THEY'VE GOT TO PROVE
17 THAT, AND THEY'VE GOT TO PROVE THAT USING THEIR BURDEN
18 OF PROOF. THEY'VE GOT TO CARRY THE WATER IN THIS
19 CASE. AND IF THEY DON'T, GUESS WHAT? NOT GUILTY.

20 NOW, THESE MEN ARE BEING TRIED TOGETHER. ONE
21 REASON FOR THAT IS FOR EFFICIENCY. THESE ARE FIVE
22 SEPARATE TRIALS, MY CLIENT'S TRIAL IS HERE TODAY, AND
23 HE IS BEING TRIED INDIVIDUALLY, NOT AS A GROUP, NOT
24 WITH THE REST OF THESE GUYS, AND THE SAME GOES FOR
25 THEM. SO, IF YOU FIND -- AND JUDGE DICKSON WILL TELL

1 YOU THIS, TOO, DON'T TAKE MY WORD FOR IT, IF YOU FINE
2 ONE OF THESE GUYS GUILTY OF ANYTHING YOU DON'T HAVE TO
3 FIND THE REST OF THEM. OR YOU CAN FIND FOUR OF THEM
4 GUILTY, YOU CAN FIND SOME OF THEM GUILTY AND SOME NOT.
5 AND IF YOU DO THAT, THAT'S OKAY BECAUSE IT DOESN'T
6 MEAN THAT YOU'RE SOFT ON CRIME OR YOU DON'T SUPPORT
7 LAW ENFORCEMENT, OR YOU REALLY LIKE THEM. IT MEANS
8 THAT YOU'VE DONE YOUR JOB AS JURORS, BECAUSE YOU ARE
9 PLAYING JUDGES IN A WAY HERE TODAY. YOU'RE JUDGES OF
10 THE FACTS. THE INFORMATION THAT COMES FROM THIS CHAIR
11 ISN'T NECESSARILY A FACT, IT'S A STATEMENT OR AN
12 ASSERTION. THE EXHIBITS THAT COME IN ARE ASSERTIONS.
13 NOTHING THAT COMES OUT IN THIS TRIAL IS A FACT UNTIL
14 YOU DETERMINE COLLECTIVELY THAT IT'S A FACT. AND IF
15 IT'S NOT PROVEN TO BE A FACT THEN IT CAN'T BE USED TO
16 DETERMINE GUILT.

17 NOW, I'M NOT GOING TO TALK ABOUT WHAT MAY HAVE
18 HAPPENED, IT'S UP TO THE STATE TO PROVE THAT. THESE
19 GUYS ARE ALL INNOCENT, MY CLIENT IS INNOCENT UNTIL
20 PROVEN GUILTY. A COUPLE OF THINGS I WANT YOU TO KNOW,
21 THOUGH, AHEAD OF TIME, AND YOU'LL BE TOLD THIS LATER
22 IN THE TRIAL. NUMBER ONE, THE SAME CONSTITUTION THAT
23 PROVIDES THIS CONCEPT THAT I'M TALKING ABOUT ALSO
24 PROVIDES EVERY CITIZEN A CERTAIN RIGHT, AND THAT'S THE
25 RIGHT NOT TO INCRIMINATE HIM OR HERSELF. IN OTHER

1 WORDS, MY CLIENT DOES NOT HAVE TO TESTIFY. AND IF HE
2 DOESN'T, HE CHOOSES NOT TO, YOU CAN'T HOLD IT AGAINST
3 HIM. THAT'S NOT MY IDEA, THAT'S THE LAW. HE DOESN'T
4 HAVE TO TESTIFY.

5 THE HAND OF ONE IS THE HAND OF ALL. I'M NOT
6 DISPUTING THAT'S THE LAW, THAT'S A LEGAL CONCEPT THAT
7 WILL APPLY TO THIS CASE, BUT THERE ARE SOME
8 QUALIFIERS. MERE PRESENCE AT THE SCENE OF A CRIME
9 DOES NOT MEAN GUILT, DOES NOT MEAN THAT THE INDIVIDUAL
10 INTENTIONALLY PARTICIPATED IN WHATEVER THEY'RE
11 ACCUSING HIM OF. AND SO, THE HAND OF ONE, HAND OF ALL
12 IS NOT AN ABSOLUTE CONCEPT. EACH OF THESE CRIMES THAT
13 HAVE BEEN CHARGE ARE CRIMES OF INTENT. AND THEY HAVE
14 TO BE PROVEN. EACH DEFENDANT HAS TO BE PROVEN TO HAVE
15 INTENDED TO COMMIT WHAT THEY'RE SAYING THEY DID. AND
16 THAT APPLIES TO MY CLIENT, MR. WALTER LEE HARRIS.

17 NOW, I'M GOING TO HAVE THE PRIVILEGE AND THE
18 OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS YOU, LIKE THE OTHER LAWYERS, AT
19 THE END OF THE TRIAL WHERE WE'LL ARGUE WHATEVER
20 INFORMATION COMES OUT DURING THE TRIAL. AND I LOOK
21 FORWARD TO THAT.

22 LET ME JUST CLOSE BY SAYING THAT ALL OF US ARE
23 SYMPATHETIC TO THE VICTIM. THERE'S NO QUESTION, A
24 GENTLEMAN GOT SHOT AND KILLED IN THIS CASE. BUT
25 THERE'S FIVE YOUNG LIVES HERE IN THE BALANCE, AND MY

1 CLIENT IS ONE OF THEM. AND SO, THIS IS SERIOUS
2 BUSINESS, FOLKS, THIS IS WHERE, ALL I'M ASKING, THAT
3 YOU DO YOUR LEGALLY CHARGED DUTY, GIVE THESE MEN A
4 FAIR TRIAL, GIVE MY CLIENT A FAIR TRIAL, AND MAKE THE
5 STATE PROVE THEIR CASE.

6 THANK YOU.

7 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. PALMER.

8 MR. MELLARD.

9 MR. MELLARD: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

10 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

11 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. MELLARD

12 MY NAME IS DOUG MELLARD, AND I REPRESENT DANNY
13 RYANT.

14 DANNY, WOULD YOU PLEASE STAND UP?

15 I REPRESENT DANNY RYANT. AND YOU'VE HEARD A LOT
16 OF TALK ABOUT HOW THEY'RE ALL ON TRIAL. WELL, I DON'T
17 CARE ABOUT ALL THOSE PEOPLE OVER THERE. THE ONLY ONE
18 I CARE ABOUT IS DANNY RYANT. THAT'S WHO I REPRESENT
19 AND THAT'S WHO I CARE ABOUT. SO, I WANT YOU TO JUST
20 FOCUS ON ONE THING. AND I THINK MR. PALMER ALLUDED TO
21 IT EARLIER. THE SOLICITOR'S DON'T KNOW WHAT HAPPENED.
22 OKAY? THEY HAVE NO CLUE OF WHAT HAPPENED. SO, THEY
23 CAN COME IN HERE AND THEY CAN ACCUSE DANNY RYANT OF
24 ANYTHING THEY WANT TO AND POINT THEIR FINGER AT HIM,
25 THEY CAN SAY WHATEVER THEY WANT TO, BUT IN THE END

1 THEY'VE GOT TO PROVE IT. THEY'VE GOT TO PUT PEOPLE ON
2 THAT STAND AND THEY HAVE TO PROVE IT. AND I'M GOING
3 TO TELL YOU RIGHT HERE, THE ONE THING THEY ARE NOT
4 GOING TO BE ABLE TO DO IS PROVE THAT DANNY RYANT DID
5 ANYTHING IN THIS CASE. THEY'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE
6 TO PROVE HIM GUILTY BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT.

7 MY NAME IS DOUG MELLARD, AND DANNY RYANT IS NOT
8 GUILTY.

9 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. MELLARD.

10 MR. KOGER.

11 MR. KOGER: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

12 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

13 MR. KOGER: SOLICITOR PASCOE, ASSISTANT DEPUTY
14 SOLICITOR SORENSON.

15 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR. KOGER

16 MY NAME IS JOSHUA KOGER, AND I REPRESENT THE
17 FIFTH DEFENDANT IN THIS CASE, MARIO SHIVERS.

18 MR. SHIVERS, PLEASE STAND.

19 NOW, I'M FOLLOWING FOUR OTHER ELOQUENT LAWYERS,
20 AND ALL OF WHAT THEY SAY I CAN SIMPLY SAY, DITTO.

21 ON MARCH TWELFTH, TWO THOUSAND TEN, WHAT WILL
22 COME OUT IN THIS COURTROOM THIS WEEK IS GOING TO BE
23 DIFFERENT VERSIONS OF WHAT HAPPENED ON THAT PARTICULAR
24 EVENING. THERE'S GOING TO BE ALLEGED EYE WITNESS
25 IDENTIFICATIONS FROM THAT PARTICULAR EVENING, AND THE

1 SOLICITOR AND LAW ENFORCEMENT ARE GOING TO SUBMIT
2 MOUNDS AND MOUNDS OF PHYSICAL EVIDENCE THAT WAS
3 COLLECTED ON THAT PARTICULAR EVENING.

4 NOW, YOU HEARD FROM THE FIRST FOUR ATTORNEYS HERE
5 ABOUT THE BURDEN OF PROOF THAT THE STATE MUST MEET
6 BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT, AND THAT IS A BURDEN THAT
7 MUST BE MET IN ALL FIVE OF THE CASES RIGHT HERE. BUT
8 NOT ONLY THAT BURDEN MUST BE MET IN THE CASES, IT MUST
9 BE MET THROUGH WHAT COMES FORTH IN THIS COURTROOM HERE
10 TODAY. WHEN THE STATE PUT UP WRITTEN STATEMENTS THEY
11 MUST PROVE BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT THAT THE
12 STATEMENT WAS MADE, THAT THE STATEMENT WAS MADE FREELY
13 AND VOLUNTARILY, AND THAT THE PERSON MAKING THE
14 STATEMENT WAS NOT COERCED. WHEN THEY PUT PERSONS ON
15 THE STAND TO IDENTIFY ANY OF THE DEFENDANTS IN THIS
16 PARTICULAR CASE THEY MUST PROVE THAT IDENTIFICATION IS
17 ACCURATE AND RELIABLE AND CREDIBLE. AND THEN WHEN
18 THEY SUBMIT THESE PHYSICAL, THESE PORTIONS OR ITEMS OF
19 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE IN THIS PARTICULAR CASE THEY MUST
20 PROVE BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT, PARTICULARLY TO MY
21 CLIENT, MR. SHIVERS, THAT THAT, THAT THOSE PHYSICAL
22 COMPONENTS OR ITEMS OF EVIDENCE CONNECT HIM TO THESE
23 CRIMES. SO, THIS IS NOT JUST A BURDEN JUST OVERALL.
24 EVERYTHING THAT COMES OUT IN THIS COURTROOM,
25 TESTIMONY, PHYSICAL EVIDENCE, IDENTIFICATION, THEY

1 MUST PROVE BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT. AND AS ATTORNEY
2 PALMER STATED, THAT IS A LEGALLY AND A CONSTITUTIONAL
3 MANDATED REQUIREMENT.

4 FORMER CO-COUNSEL ALSO STATED, AND THIS IS VERY
5 IMPORTANT, THAT THESE ARE FIVE SEPARATE TRIALS. AS
6 MR. MELLARD SAID ABOUT HIS CLIENT, MR. RYANT, I'M
7 PRIMARILY CONCERNED WITH MR. SHIVERS ON THE END RIGHT
8 HERE. THIS IS HIS DAY IN COURT. HE HAS BEEN WAITING
9 SINCE MARCH OF THIS YEAR TO HAVE HIS DAY IN COURT.
10 HE IS TO BE JUDGED ALONE.

11 AS THE JUDGE STATED AT THE BEGINNING, THE JURY IS
12 THE SOLE JUDGES OF THE FACTS. Y'ALL ARE GOING TO --
13 IF THERE ARE WITNESSES ON THE STAND Y'ALL ARE GOING TO
14 OBSERVE THEIR DEMEANOR, YOU'RE GOING TO DETERMINE
15 CREDIBILITY, AND YOU'RE GOING TO JUDGE WHAT COMES OUT
16 OF THIS COURTROOM TODAY AS PHYSICAL EVIDENCE. THAT'S
17 A VERY IMPORTANT BURDEN, A VERY HIGH BURDEN, BUT
18 SOMETHING THAT YOU MUST DO TO GIVE, NOT ONLY MY
19 CLIENT, BUT THE FOUR OTHER DEFENDANTS THEIR DAY IN
20 COURT.

21 NOW, AS STATED PROBABLY FOR THE FIFTH TIME, WHAT
22 THE STATE STATED AT THE BEGINNING IS NOT EVIDENCE,
23 IT'S THEIR VERSION. LOOKING TO THE OVERALL SCENE, THE
24 OVERALL COMPONENTS OF THIS PARTICULAR CASE, YOU KNOW,
25 THE STATE PUT IT IN A NICE PACKAGE THAT WELL, HE SOLD

1 MARIJUANA. YOU KNOW HE WAS A DRUG DEALER. OKAY? HE
2 WAS A DRUG DEALER. THEY PUT, WELL, THAT THE
3 DEFENDANTS TOOK AWAY GOODS AND MONEY -- MARIJUANA AND
4 DRUG MONEY. NOW, THIS IS NOT TO DENIGRATE THE
5 DECEASED IN THIS CASE, BUT LET'S CALL IT LIKE WE SEE
6 IT. LET'S PUT IT ALL OUT ON THE TABLE RIGHT HERE.
7 OKAY? THERE'S AN ELEMENT OF BURGLARY, FIRST, ABOUT
8 CONSENT. WELL, HE WAS SELLING DRUGS OUT OF HIS HOUSE,
9 HE HAD PATRONS. OKAY? LET'S, THE EVIDENCE IS GOING TO
10 SHOW ALL OF THIS HERE. IT'S NOT A SECRET, THIS IS
11 WHAT IT IS. THIS IS WHAT IT IS.

12 GIVE MY CLIENT, MR. SHIVERS, A SEPARATE TRIAL,
13 ALONG WITH THE OTHER FOUR A SEPARATE TRIAL. I AM
14 CONFIDENT THAT ONCE YOU STEP INTO THIS COURTROOM THIS
15 WEEK, OBSERVE THE WITNESSES, OBSERVE THE TESTIMONY,
16 AND LOOK AT THE PHYSICAL EVIDENCE, I AM CONFIDENT THAT
17 YOU WILL GO BACK IN THAT JURY ROOM AND YOU WILL
18 DELIBERATE AND THINK ABOUT WHAT CAME OUT OF THIS
19 COURTROOM THIS WEEK, AND I AM CONFIDENT THAT YOU WILL
20 FIND NOT GUILTY ON MURDER FOR MARIO SHIVERS, NOT
21 GUILTY ON ARMED ROBBERY FOR MARIO SHIVERS, AND NOT
22 GUILTY ON BURGLARY, FIRST, FOR MARIA SHIVERS.

23 THANK YOU.

24 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. KOGER.

25 ALRIGHT, SOLICITOR, CALL YOUR FIRST WITNESS,

1 PLEASE, SIR.

2 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THE STATE CALLS SERGEANT CRAIG
3 DAVIS, YOUR HONOR.

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR.

5 CLERK: SIR, RAISE YOUR RIGHT AND PUT YOUR LEFT
6 HAND ON THE BIBLE.

7 (Whereupon, Craig Gilbert Davis
8 is duly sworn.)

9 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE YOUR FULL NAME FOR
10 THE COURT.

11 WITNESS: CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS.

12 SOLICITOR PASCOE: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

13 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

14 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
15 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
16 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
17 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
18 sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

183

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS

BY SOLICITOR PASCOE:

Q. GOOD MORNING, SERGEANT.

A. GOOD MORNING.

Q. WHERE DO YOU WORK, SIR?

A. ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE.

Q. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN WITH THE ORANGEBURG
COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

A. APPROXIMATELY FIVE YEARS.

Q. HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN IN LAW ENFORCEMENT
ALTOGETHER?

A. ABOUT SEVENTEEN YEARS.

Q. WHERE DID YOU WORK BEFORE YOU WORKED AT THE
SHERIFF'S OFFICE IN ORANGEBURG?

A. I SERVED A LITTLE LESS THAN A YEAR AT SOUTH
CAROLINA STATE UNIVERSITY POLICE DEPARTMENT, AND
PRIOR TO THAT, INVESTIGATOR WITH THE STATE OF NEW
JERSEY.

Q. WHAT ARE YOUR CURRENT DUTIES WITH THE ORANGEBURG
COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

A. I'M A PATROL SERGEANT.

Q. OKAY. AND TELL THE JURY WHAT ALL THIS ENTAILS
BEING A PATROL SERGEANT?

A. AS A PATROL SERGEANT I'M RESPONSIBLE FOR THE
SUPERVISION OF EVERYONE THAT'S ON MY SHIFT,

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

184

1 CURRENTLY, ALPHA SHIFT.

2 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT SORTS OF THINGS DO Y'ALL DO IN
3 PATROL?

4 A. JUST BASICALLY ENFORCE THE LAWS OF SOUTH CAROLINA
5 IN THE STATE AND COUNTY OF ORANGEBURG.

6 Q. AND YOU RESPOND TO CALLS?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. AND IF I CALLED NINE ONE ONE FOR A POLICE OFFICER
9 WHICH POLICE OFFICERS ARE THE FIRST TO ARRIVE?

10 A. PATROL.

11 Q. OKAY. AND YOU TESTIFIED YOU'RE ACTUALLY
12 SUPERVISOR OF A PATROL UNIT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. AND WERE THESE YOUR DUTIES BACK ON FRIDAY, MARCH
15 THE TWELFTH, OF THIS YEAR?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. I WANT TO ASK YOU ABOUT THAT DAY,
18 SERGEANT, WERE YOU ON DUTY THAT FRIDAY, MARCH
19 TWELFTH?

20 A. I WAS.

21 Q. AND ARE YOU USING ANYTHING TO ASSIST YOU IN OUR
22 TESTIMONY IF YOU NEED IT?

23 A. THE INITIAL INCIDENT FROM THAT EVENING.

24 Q. YOUR INCIDENT REPORT TO THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

25 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

185

- 1 Q. AND AGAIN, JUST TO REFRESH YOUR MEMORY IF YOU
2 NEED IT?
- 3 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 4 Q. WHAT SHIFT WERE YOU WORKING ON THAT FRIDAY?
- 5 A. SECOND SHIFT, ALPHA SHIFT, FROM ABOUT SIX:THIRTY
6 P.M. TO SEVEN O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING.
- 7 Q. OKAY, FROM SIX:THIRTY AT NIGHT TO ---
- 8 A. SEVEN A.M.
- 9 Q. --- SEVEN O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING?
- 10 A. YES, SIR.
- 11 Q. AND ANY PARTICULAR AREA OF THE COUNTY THAT YOU
12 PATROLLED OR SUPERVISED?
- 13 A. I SUPERVISE AND AM RESPONSIBLE FOR THE ENTIRE
14 COUNTY, BUT AT THIS TIME I WAS IN THE ORANGEBURG
15 AREA.
- 16 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT, IF ANYTHING -- AND YOU SAY,
17 ORANGEBURG AREA, CLOSE TO THE TOWN?
- 18 A. YES, SIR.
- 19 Q. OKAY. WHAT, IF ANYTHING, WERE YOU CALLED UPON TO
20 DO THAT FRIDAY NIGHT?
- 21 A. IN PARTICULAR, I WAS DISPATCHED TO A SHOOTING
22 INCIDENT AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD IN
23 ORANGEBURG.
- 24 Q. OKAY. AND THAT IS IN ORANGEBURG COUNTY?
- 25 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

186

- 1 Q. GIVE THE JURY AN IDEA OF WHERE KINGS ROAD IS IN
2 RELATION TO THE COURTHOUSE, HOW LONG WOULD IT
3 TAKE TO GET THERE FROM HERE?
- 4 A. TEN MINUTES, NORMAL, FIVE OR TEN MINUTES NORMAL
5 TRAFFIC DAY. IT'S SIX O ONE -- BETWEEN SIX O ONE
6 AND BELLEVILLE ROAD.
- 7 Q. BETWEEN SIX O ONE AND BELLEVILLE?
- 8 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 9 Q. AND WHAT TIME DID YOU RECEIVE THE DISPATCH OR THE
10 CALL TO GO TO KINGS ROAD?
- 11 A. WE WERE DISPATCHED AT TWENTY-ONE FIFTY-EIGHT
12 HOURS, WHICH IS NINE:FIFTY-EIGHT P.M.
- 13 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT TIME DID YOU ARRIVE AT THE SCENE?
- 14 A. APPROXIMATELY FIVE MINUTES AFTER, TWENTY-TWO O-
15 THREE, WHICH IS THREE MINUTES AFTER TEN P.M.
- 16 Q. DID ANYONE ELSE ARRIVE WITH YOU FROM THE
17 SHERIFF'S OFFICE?
- 18 A. YES, I HAD DEPUTY WESTBERRY AND DEPUTY RYAN
19 HARTER.
- 20 Q. ARE YOU THEIR SUPERVISOR?
- 21 A. YES, SIR.
- 22 Q. TELL THE JURY WHAT YOU OBSERVED WHEN YOU GOT THE
23 APARTMENT AT, AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD?
- 24 A. ONCE WE MADE ENTRY WE OBSERVED A DECEASED BLACK
25 MALE LYING ON THE LIVING ROOM FLOOR AND A REAL

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

187

1 DESPONDED BLACK FEMALE SITTING AT THE EDGE OF THE
2 COUCH.

3 Q. OKAY. CAN YOU DESCRIBE THE CONDITION OF THE
4 APARTMENT AS WELL?

5 A. THE LIVING ROOM AREA WAS IN DISARRAY. AGAIN,
6 THERE WAS A DEAD BODY ON THE FLOOR WITH DUCT TAPE
7 AND A BLACK FEMALE SITTING ON THE COUCH.

8 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU AND YOUR DEPUTIES FIRST
9 DO UNDER YOUR COMMAND WHEN YOU WENT INTO THE
10 APARTMENT.

11 A. THE FIRST THING WE DID WAS TO TRY TO ASCERTAIN
12 WHAT TRANSPIRED. WE MADE CONTACT WITH THE BLACK
13 FEMALE THAT WAS IN THE APARTMENT. SHE WAS,
14 AGAIN, DESPONDED, IN MY OPINION, IN SHOCK, SO WE
15 WENT AND SECURED HER IN MY PATROL VEHICLE. AND
16 THEN WE ENTERED THE APARTMENT AND CLEARED THE
17 APARTMENT TO MAKE SURE THERE WAS NO INTRUDER.

18 Q. AND YOU GOT THE INFORMATION ON THE DECEASED?

19 A. YES, WE DID. HE WAS LATER IDENTIFIED AS A MR.
20 CHARLES PRINGLE, A THIRTY-EIGHT YEAR OLD BLACK
21 MALE FROM SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD IN
22 ORANGEBURG.

23 Q. AND WERE THERE ANY ATTEMPTS TO REVIVE HIM WHILE
24 YOU WERE THERE?

25 A. HE WAS DOA, DEAD ON ARRIVE.

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

188

1 Q. AND YOU GOT THE INFORMATION. YOU TESTIFIED THAT
2 THE FEMALE WAS DESPONDENT AND IN YOUR OPINION, IN
3 SHOCK. YOU'VE BEEN A LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICER FOR
4 SEVENTEEN YEARS, BUT DID YOU GET HER INFORMATION?

5 A. WE DID. SHE WAS LATER DETERMINED TO BE THE
6 PERSON THAT CALLED THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE, AND SHE
7 WAS IDENTIFIED AS A TWENTY-THREE YEAR OLD BLACK
8 MALE -- BLACK FEMALE, PARDON ME, BY THE NAME OF
9 ASHLEY PARSLEY, OUT OF MARION, SOUTH CAROLINA.

10 Q. OTHER THAN HER BEING IN HER MENTAL STATE, DID SHE
11 HAVE ANY PHYSICAL INJURIES THAT YOU COULD SEE?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. DID YOU ATTEMPT TO TAKE A DETAILED STATEMENT FROM
14 HER THAT NIGHT?

15 A. WE DID NOT. AGAIN, JUST SIMPLE QUESTIONING JUST
16 TO TRY TO ASCERTAIN WHAT HAPPENED, AND AGAIN, SHE
17 WAS DESPENDED AND IN MY OPINION AGAIN WAS IN
18 SHOCK.

19 Q. AND LET ME ASK YOU THIS, WHO'S JOB IS IT TO TAKE
20 DETAILED STATEMENTS FROM WITNESSES?

21 A. IN A CASE LIKE THIS IT WOULD BE AN INVESTIGATION.

22 Q. OKAY. AND AFTER YOU SECURED THE SCENE AND MADE
23 SURE THE INTRUDERS WERE GONE, YOU SAW THAT THIS
24 WAS A HOMICIDE SCENE, WHO DID YOU END UP CALLING
25 TO COME?

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

189

1 A. WE INITIATED PROTOCOL. AS A SUPERVISOR THAT'S MY
2 RESPONSIBILITY. WE CALLED FOR THE ON CALL
3 INVESTIGATORS, CRIME SCENE INVESTIGATORS, IN THIS
4 CASE THE COUNTY CORONER, EMS.

5 Q. OKAY. AND DID THEY ALL ARRIVE?

6 A. THEY DID.

7 Q. WHEN DID YOU END UP LEAVING THE SCENE THAT NIGHT
8 AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD?

9 A. APPROXIMATELY TWO A.M., TWO O'CLOCK IN THE
10 MORNING.

11 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU DO DURING THAT BASICALLY
12 FOUR HOUR PERIOD OF TIME FROM TEN P.M TO TWO
13 A.M., WHAT WERE YOUR DUTIES AT THE SCENE?

14 A. PRIMARILY TO SECURE THE SCENE, AND PROTECT THE
15 INTEGRITY OF THE EVIDENCE, IF ANY.

16 Q. OKAY. MAKE SURE NOBODY TOUCHED IT UNTIL THE
17 CRIME SCENE GOT THERE?

18 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

19 Q. DID YOU HAVE ANYMORE INVOLVEMENT IN THIS CASE
20 AFTER THAT NIGHT, SERGEANT?

21 A. NO, SIR.

22 Q. I JUST HAVE A FEW MORE QUESTIONS, SERGEANT, I
23 HAVE TO WAIT UNTIL THEY LOOK AT THESE
24 PHOTOGRAPHS.

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I ASK THAT STATE'S EXHIBIT SIX

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

190

BE ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION.

MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

MR. LACKEY: WITHOUT OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR.

MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION

MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

COURT REPORTER: LET ME TAKE THAT.

SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, MA'AM.

THE COURT: STATE'S EXHIBIT SIX IS ADMITTED INTO
EVIDENCE.

(State's Exhibit Six
marked and filed.)

Q. AND IF YOU COULD, MAYBE, JUST TO GIVE AN IDEA,
I'LL LET YOU POINT TO WHERE SIX THIRTY, THE
APARTMENT WAS THAT YOU WENT INTO?

A. SIXTY-THIRTY-FIVE WAS THE LAST APARTMENT ON THE
REAR END SIDE.

Q. OKAY. THE LAST ONE ON MY LEFT HAND SIDE?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND YOU TESTIFIED ABOUT WHAT YOU SAW INSIDE THE
APARTMENT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. LET ME SHOW YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED AS STATE'S
EXHIBITS SEVEN AND EIGHT. TAKE A GOOD LOOK AT

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. - PASCOE

191

1 THOSE TWO PHOTOS AND TELL ME IF YOU RECOGNIZE THE
2 CONTENTS OF THOSE PHOTOS?

3 A. THIS IS THE APARTMENT WE OBSERVED ON THE DAY IN
4 QUESTION.

5 Q. OKAY. AND DOES IT ACCURATELY DEPICT THE WAY YOU
6 FOUND THE APARTMENT THAT NIGHT, ON MARCH THE
7 TWELFTH, ---

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. --- TWO THOUSAND AND TEN?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. WOULD IT ASSIST THE JURY IN SEEING HOW YOU FOUND
12 THE VICTIM THAT NIGHT IF THEY SAW THOSE
13 PHOTOGRAPHS?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND IT ACCURATELY DEPICTS THE DISARRAY IN SOME OF
16 THE APARTMENT, AND THE VICTIM?

17 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I'D ASK THAT STATE'S EXHIBITS
19 SEVEN AND EIGHT BE ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE, YOUR HONOR.

20 THE COURT: ANYTHING FROM THE ATTORNEYS?

21 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

22 MR. LACKEY: WITHOUT OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR.

23 MS. ULLMAN: NO, OBJECTION.

24 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

25 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

192

1 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, STATE'S EXHIBITS SEVEN AND
2 EIGHT ARE ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.

3 (State's Exhibits Seven and Eight
4 marked and filed.)

5 Q. I WANT TO SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVEN, AND
6 I'LL LET YOU HOLD IT UP TO THE JURY AND THEN I'LL
7 PUBLISH IT TO THEM. TELL THE JURY WHAT ALL THAT
8 DEPICTS THAT YOU SAW?

9 THE COURT: THIS IS NUMBER SEVEN?

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, YOUR HONOR, STATE'S
11 EXHIBIT SEVEN.

12 THE COURT: OKAY.

13 A. THIS IS THE LIVING ROOM AREA. AS SOON AS YOU
14 WENT THROUGH THE FRONT DOOR TO THE APARTMENT. IT
15 DISPLAYS THE COUCHES WITH THE CUSHIONS OF THE
16 COUCHES WERE PULLED UP AND, OF COURSE, THE
17 DECEASED BODY IN THE MIDDLE OF THE FLOOR.

18 Q. AND I'LL HOLD UP STATE'S EXHIBIT EIGHT. IF YOU
19 COULD TELL THE JURY WHAT ALL THAT DEPICTS IN
20 THERE?

21 A. THAT'S THE DECEASED, MR. PRINGLE, THAT WE FOUND
22 LAYING ON THE FLOOR RIDDLED WITH MULTIPLE GUN
23 SHOT WOUNDS.

24 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AND IF I COULD, AND YOUR
25 HONOR, I'LL PUBLISH SIX, SEVEN AND EIGHT TO THE JURY.

DIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

193

THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

SOLICITOR PASCOE: I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE
JUST ONE SECOND.

THE COURT: YES, SIR.

(Whereupon, State's Exhibits Six, Seven and
Eight are published to the jury.)

SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, SERGEANT, ANSWER
ANY QUESTIONS THAT DEFENSE ATTORNEYS HAVE FOR YOU.
THANK YOU.

THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY.

(NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MR. LACKEY

194

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS

BY MR. LACKEY:

Q. JUST A FEW QUESTIONS, SERGEANT DAVIS.

THE COURT: AND MR. LACKEY, I DON'T MEAN TO INTERRUPT YOU. THEY'RE PASSING THE PICTURES AROUND. IF YOU WANT, I DON'T KNOW WHETHER YOU WANTED THEM TO WAIT, IF YOU WANTED TO WAIT.

MR. LACKEY: THAT MAY BE A GOOD IDEA, THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: YEAH. LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WE WILL ALLOW THE PICTURES TO BE CIRCULATED BEFORE MR. LACKEY BEGINS HIS CROSS-EXAMINATION. THAT WAY HE'LL HAVE YOUR FULL ATTENTION.

ALRIGHT.

MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR.

Q. AS I SAID, SIR, JUST A FEW QUESTIONS. YOU SAID ON THE NIGHT IN QUESTION, ON MARCH TWELVE, YOU WERE ONE OF THE INITIAL RESPONDERS TO THE SCENE?

A. THAT'S CORRECT.

Q. OKAY. AND IN ADDITION TO THE DECEASED THERE WAS ALSO ONE OTHER PERSON YOU FOUND AT THE SCENE?

A. THAT'S CORRECT.

Q. AND THAT WAS MS. ASHLEY PARSLEY, IS THAT CORRECT?

A. THAT'S CORRECT.

Q. NO ONE ELSE WAS THERE, IS THAT CORRECT?

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MR. LACKEY

195

1 A. NO, SIR.

2 Q. AND, AND TO HELP YOU IN THE, RECALL THE EVENTS IN
3 CASE THIS CASE WENT TO TRIAL YOU MADE A REPORT OF
4 THAT?

5 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

6 Q. AND THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE REFERRING TO KIND OF
7 REFRESH YOUR MEMORY?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AFTER THAT YOU TURNED OVER THE CASE TO THE
10 INVESTIGATORS BASICALLY?

11 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

12 Q. AND SO, YOU DIDN'T HAVE ANYMORE INVOLVEMENT IN
13 THE INVESTIGATION AS TO POSSIBLE SUSPECTS?

14 A. NO, SIR.

15 MR. LACKEY: OKAY. NO FURTHER QUESTIONS, YOUR
16 HONOR.

17 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. LACKEY.

18 MS. ULLMAN.

19 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

20 THE COURT: OKAY, I GUESSED RIGHT. GOOD. MS.

21 ULLMAN, YOUR WITNESS.

22 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
23 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
24 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
25 required by the Court.)

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MS. ULLMAN

196

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS

BY MS. ULLMAN:

Q. I JUST WANTED TO DISCUSS REAL QUICK THE
APPEARANCE OF THE OUTSIDE OF THIS BUILDING.

THE COURT: YOU'RE LOOKING AT NUMBER SIX?

MS. ULLMAN: EXHIBIT SIX, YES, SIR.

THE COURT: OKAY.

Q. NOW, THE PICTURE OF THAT BUILDING IS WHERE THE
APARTMENT WAS, CORRECT?

A. THAT'S CORRECT.

Q. OKAY. NOW, THE CARS THAT WOULD BE PARKED FACING
THAT BUILDING, THEY'RE FACING THE BUILDING THAT
YOU ENTERED?

A. RIGHT.

Q. WHAT ARE THE CARS BEHIND THAT, IS THERE ANOTHER
BUILDING?

A. THERE'S OTHER BUILDINGS TO THE RIGHT. IT'S MAYBE
ABOUT FOUR, FIVE, SIX UNITS, LOOKS LIKE
BUILDINGS.

Q. SO, A BUILDING IDENTICAL TO THAT AND OPPOSITE OF
IT?

A. THAT'S CORRECT, UH-HUH.

Q. THANK YOU. YOU SAID THAT YOU RECEIVED A CALL
FROM DISPATCH, THAT'S HOW YOU ARRIVED AT SIX
THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD?

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MS. ULLMAN

197

- 1 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 2 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THROUGH DISPATCH THEY TOLD YOU WHAT
- 3 ADDRESS TO GO TO?
- 4 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 5 Q. AND THEY ALSO WERE TRYING TO FEED YOU ANY OTHER
- 6 INFORMATION THEY HAD RECEIVED, SUCH AS WHETHER
- 7 THERE WERE SUSPECTS STILL PRESENT, CORRECT?
- 8 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 9 Q. AND THEY COULD NOT TELL YOU, THEY TOLD YOU NO ONE
- 10 ELSE WAS PRESENT?
- 11 A. RIGHT.
- 12 Q. ASHLEY PARSLEY HAD TOLD THEM?
- 13 A. RIGHT.
- 14 Q. NOW, THEY ALSO TOLD YOU THAT ASHLEY PARSLEY COULD
- 15 NOT GIVE ANY DESCRIPTION OF WHO WAS THERE, OR YOU
- 16 WERE NOT GIVEN ANY DESCRIPTION THROUGH DISPATCH?
- 17 A. WE WERE NOT PROVIDED ANY OF THAT INFORMATION AS I
- 18 TO A POSSIBLE SUSPECT.
- 19 Q. YOU WEREN'T PROVIDED ANY INFORMATION REGARDING
- 20 ANY VEHICLE THEY MAY HAVE BEEN IN, WHETHER THERE
- 21 WAS A VEHICLE?
- 22 A. NO.
- 23 Q. YOU WERE PROVIDED NO INFORMATION EXCEPT A
- 24 SHOOTING AND THE ADDRESS TO RESPOND TO?
- 25 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MS. ULLMAN

198

1 Q. NOW, WHEN YOU DID ARRIVE YOU WENT TO THE BACK
2 DOOR, IS THAT CORRECT?

3 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

4 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THAT DOOR WAS SECURED?

5 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

6 Q. YOU COULD NOT ENTER UNLESS SOMEONE LET YOU IN?

7 A. RIGHT.

8 Q. AND WHEN YOU DID GO INTO THE APARTMENT DID YOU GO
9 THROUGH THE FRONT DOOR OR THE BACK DOOR?

10 A. WE ENTERED THROUGH THE FRONT DOOR.

11 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU WAITED AT THE BACK DOOR AND THEN
12 WENT AROUND AND WENT IN THE FRONT DOOR?

13 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

14 Q. NOW, WHEN YOU WENT IN THAT APARTMENT, LET ME SHOW
15 YOU STATE'S SIX AND SEVEN, THE APARTMENT --
16 EXCUSE ME -- LOOKING AT THOSE PICTURES, THOSE
17 PICTURES ARE PRETTY WELL LIT, AM I CORRECT?

18 A. YES, MA'AM.

19 Q. NOW, THE APARTMENT DIDN'T LOOK EXACTLY LIKE THAT,
20 AM I CORRECT? THE LIGHTS WEREN'T THAT BRIGHT,
21 THEY WERE - - -

22 A. WELL, OF COURSE, THE LIGHTING - - -

23 Q. GO AHEAD.

24 A. ASIDE FROM THE LIGHTING, THAT'S HOW THE APARTMENT
25 WAS.

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MS. ULLMAN

199

1 Q. ASIDE FROM THE LIGHTING?

2 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

3 Q. SO, SPECIFICALLY, THE LIGHTING, IT WAS NOT BRIGHT
4 LIKE THAT?

5 A. JUST GENERAL LIGHTS, WHATEVER THEY HAD IN THE
6 APARTMENT.

7 Q. YOU DON'T REMEMBER WHAT KIND OF LIGHTS WERE IN
8 THE APARTMENT?

9 A. SOME LAMPS AND WHATEVER LIGHTS THEY HAD, NOTHING
10 ILLUMINATED.

11 Q. BUT YOU SAY YOU'RE ASSUMING LAMPS, AM I CORRECT,
12 YOU DON'T REMEMBER?

13 A. HUH-UH.

14 Q. NOW, WHEN YOU WENT IN, YOU SAID THAT THERE WAS A
15 FEMALE SITTING ON THE EDGE OF A COUCH?

16 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

17 Q. WAS SHE SITTING ON THE EDGE OF THE COUCH THAT'S
18 IN THIS PICTURE, AND THAT WOULD BE STATE'S SEVEN?

19 THE COURT: THAT'S NUMBER SEVEN YOU'RE REFERRING
20 TO?

21 MR. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

22 A. I BELIEVE SHE WAS SITTING ON THE COUCH THAT WAS
23 ON THIS SIDE THAT'S NOT IN THE PICTURE I BELIEVE.

24 Q. SO, ON THE OTHER SIDE OF THIS LIVING ROOM WHERE
25 THIS CUSHION IS, THERE'S ANOTHER COUCH THAT'S

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MS. ULLMAN

200

- 1 NOT PICTURED?
- 2 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 3 Q. AND SHE WAS SITTING OVER THERE?
- 4 A. UH-HUH.
- 5 Q. NOW, YOU SAID THAT YOU ESCORTED MS. PARSLEY
- 6 OUTSIDE?
- 7 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 8 Q. AND YOU STUCK HER IN YOUR PATROL CAR?
- 9 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 10 Q. DID SHE SIT IN THE FRONT OR THE BACK?
- 11 A. IN THE FRONT.
- 12 Q. IN THE FRONT, WAS SHE ALONE?
- 13 A. YES.
- 14 Q. AND YOU LEFT HER OUT THERE ALONE?
- 15 A. I DID.
- 16 Q. NOW, I UNDERSTAND YOU DID NOT TAKE A STATEMENT
- 17 FROM HER BUT YOU DID TRY TO ASCERTAIN FROM HER
- 18 WHAT HAD HAPPENED?
- 19 A. THAT'S CORRECT.
- 20 Q. SHE COULDN'T TELL YOU WHO WAS INVOLVED?
- 21 A. HUH-UH.
- 22 Q. HOW MANY PEOPLE WERE INVOLVED
- 23 A. NO, MA'AM.
- 24 Q. HOW THEY GOT THERE, HOW THEY LEFT?
- 25 A. NO, MA'AM.

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MS. ULLMAN

201

1 Q. SHE COULDN'T TELL YOU HOW MANY GUNS WERE
2 INVOLVED?

3 A. NO, MA'AM.

4 MS. ULLMAN: NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

5 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MA'AM.

6 MR. PALMER, WHICH WAY DO YOU WANT TO GO?

7 MR. PALMER: I CAN STAY HERE, YOUR HONOR.

8 THE COURT: THAT'S FINE WITH ME.

9 MR. PALMER: IF THAT'S OKAY WITH YOU.

10 THE COURT: THAT'S FINE WITH ME, IF IT'S FINE
11 WITH YOU.

12 MR. PALMER: I'VE GOT A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS.

13 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
14 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
15 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
16 required by the Court... See next ensuing page for
17 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MR. PALMER

202

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS

BY MR. PALMER:

Q. HOW ARE YOU, DEPUTY?

A. I'M FINE.

Q. I'VE GOT JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTION ABOUT THE LIGHTS, AND I'VE SEEN THE EXHIBITS. THE ONE -- I DON'T KNOW WHICH EXHIBIT IT IS, SIX, SEVEN OR EIGHT, BUT THE ONE THAT SHOWS THE VICTIM LYING ON THE FLOOR, THE LIGHTING WASN'T THE SAME, WAS IT?

A. I DON'T RECALL IT WAS. AGAIN, THOSE PHOTOGRAPHS I DID NOT TAKE SO I DON'T KNOW IF THERE WAS SOME KIND OF ILLUMINATION USED.

Q. DO YOU KNOW HOW LONG AFTER YOU ARRIVED AT THE SCENE THAT THOSE PHOTOGRAPHS WERE TAKEN?

A. I COULD NOT ADVISE.

Q. AND YOU WERE THERE FOUR HOURS, IS THAT CORRECT?

A. THAT'S CORRECT.

Q. AND DURING THAT FOUR HOURS DID ANY OF THE INVESTIGATION TEAM DO ANYTHING TO ENHANCE THE LIGHTING IN THE APARTMENT?

A. I COULDN'T ANSWER THAT, I DON'T KNOW.

Q. ALRIGHT. SO, YOU DON'T KNOW WHEN THE PHOTOGRAPH WAS TAKEN, WHETHER OR NOT THE LIGHTING HAD BEEN CHANGED BEFORE THAT PHOTOGRAPH WAS TAKEN?

A. I CAN'T, I DON'T KNOW.

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MR. PALMER

203

1 Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER OR NOT THE PHOTOGRAPHER USED
2 A FLASH?

3 A. I DON'T KNOW.

4 Q. OKAY.

5 MR. PALMER: THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

6 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. PALMER.

7 MR. MELLARD: I HAVE NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.

8 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MR. KOGER.

9 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
10 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
11 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
12 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
13 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MR. KOGER

204

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS

BY MR. KOGER:

Q. SERGEANT DAVIS, YOU STATED THAT YOU WERE THERE
PRIMARILY TO SECURE THE SCENE?

A. THAT'S CORRECT.

Q. OKAY. YOU DIDN'T PARTICIPATE IN ANY TYPE OF
COLLECTION OF THE EVIDENCE?

A. I DID NOT.

Q. OKAY. AND YOU SECURED THE SCENE UP UNTIL, I
THINK, TWO O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING?

A. THAT'S CORRECT.

MR. LACKEY: LET ME SEE THE EXHIBITS.

THE COURT: THEY SHOULD BE RIGHT UP THERE.

Q. ON EXHIBIT NUMBER SIX YOU TESTIFIED THAT IT'S THE
APARTMENT AT THE END?

A. THAT'S CORRECT, THE LAST APARTMENT ON YOUR LEFT
IF YOU'RE FACING IT FROM THE ROADWAY, RIGHT IF
YOU'RE FACING THE ROADWAY.

Q. OKAY. AND I NOTICE, THIS IS AN ACCURATE
DEPICTION OF THE APARTMENT. I NOTICE THE OUTSIDE
OF THE DOOR THERE IS SOME TYPE OF PORCH LIGHT OR
SOMETHING, IF I'M NOT MISTAKEN?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND YOU WERE THE FIRST ONE ON
THE SCENE ON THAT PARTICULAR NIGHT, CORRECT?

CROSS - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY MR. KOGER

205

1 A. YES, SIR, I WAS.

2 Q. AND I THINK YOU TESTIFIED YOU WENT TO THE BACK
3 DOOR FIRST?

4 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

5 Q. DO YOU RECALL WHETHER THE PORCH LIGHT WAS ON WHEN
6 YOU ARRIVED AT THE SCENE?

7 A. I DON'T RECALL.

8 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU, NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

9 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.

10 ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: JUST VERY BRIEFLY, YOUR HONOR.

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR.

13 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
14 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
15 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
16 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
17 sequential continuation of record.)

REDIRECT - CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS BY SOL. PASCOE

206

REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF CRAIG GILBERT DAVIS

BY SOLICITOR PASCOE:

Q. YOU TESTIFIED YOU WERE THE FIRST AT THE SCENE,
WERE YOU THE FIRST TO COME INTO CONTACT WITH
ASHLEY?

A. NO, SIR, IT WAS DEPUTY WESTBERRY AND DEPUTY
HARTER.

Q. OKAY. AND HOW LONG AFTER THAT WERE YOU IN
CONTACT WITH HER?

A. SECONDS AFTER. AS SOON AS THEY MADE CONTACT, THEY
ESTABLISHED CONTACT AT THE DOOR THEY RADIOED TO
ME AND I CAME AROUND TO THE FRONT.

Q. AND YOU'VE ALREADY TESTIFIED THAT YOU COULDN'T
GET ANY INFORMATION FROM HER BECAUSE SHE WAS IN
SHOCK?

A. THAT'S CORRECT.

Q. WHO WAS SHE TURNED OVER TO?

A. INVESTIGATIONS, WHEN THEY ARRIVED.

SOLICITOR PASCOE: THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

THE COURT: ALRIGHT. MR. LACKEY, DO YOU HAVE
ANYTHING ON RECROSS?

MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: OKAY. MS. ULLMAN, ANYTHING ON
RECROSS?

MR. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

1 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

2 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR.

3 MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

4 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. SERGEANT DAVIS, THANK YOU,
5 SIR.

6 SERGEANT DAVIS: THANK YOU.

7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: CAN HE BE EXCUSED, YOUR HONOR?

8 THE COURT: HE MAY BE. AND WE'LL TAKE A BREAK
9 RIGHT NOW. OKAY?

10 LADIES AND GENTLEMEN OF THE JURY, Y'ALL HAVE BEEN
11 SITTING HERE FOR A WHILE, AND I TOLD Y'ALL WHEN Y'ALL
12 GOT PICKED THAT WE'D GO ABOUT AN HOUR OR AN HOUR AND A
13 HALF BEFORE WE TAKE BREAKS, AND WE'RE GOING TO TAKE A
14 BREAK RIGHT NOW. REMEMBER WHAT I TOLD YOU YESTERDAY,
15 AND I'M GOING TO REMIND YOU AGAIN, I'M GOING TO TRY
16 AND REMIND -- IF I FORGET TO REMIND YOU SOMETIME I
17 WANT YOU TO JUST REMEMBER IT. YOU'VE ONLY HEARD ONE
18 PERSON TESTIFY SO FAR, SO YOU'VE NOT HEARD ALL THE
19 TESTIMONY. YOU CANNOT TALK ABOUT THIS CASE. YOU CAN
20 TALK ABOUT ANYTHING ELSE BUT YOU CAN'T ANYTHING YOU'VE
21 HEARD OR SEEN IN THIS CASE. SO, Y'ALL ARE EXCUSED TO
22 THE JURY ROOM FOR A FEW MINUTES. WE'LL TAKE A BREAK
23 AND THEN WE'LL GET Y'ALL BACK OUT HERE AND CONTINUE
24 WITH THE TRIAL.

25 (Whereupon, the jury retires

1 to the jury room and the following
2 takes place out of the presence
3 of the jury.)

4 THE COURT: WE'RE GOING TO RECESS FOR A MINUTE.
5 WE'VE HAD SOME MORE PEOPLE COME IN SINCE THE TRIAL
6 STARTED. I JUST NEED TO REMIND EVERYBODY, Y'ALL ARE
7 DOING VERY GOOD. THERE IS GOING TO BE SOME TESTIMONY
8 IN HERE THAT PROBABLY PEOPLE ARE NOT GOING TO LIKE, SO
9 I JUST WANT TO REMIND EVERYBODY THAT THERE'S GOING TO
10 BE -- THERE'S NO REACTION TO ANY OF THE TESTIMONY.
11 EVERYBODY HAS GOT TO REMAIN CALM. I DON'T WANT EYES
12 ROLLED, I DON'T WANT COMMENTS ABOUT ANYTHING THAT
13 ANYBODY SAYS. IF YOU -- YOU'RE ACTING LIKE YOU NEED TO
14 ACT RIGHT NOW, BUT IF ANYBODY ACTS UP AT ALL THEY WILL
15 BE ASKED TO LEAVE THE COURTROOM AND YOU WILL NOT BE
16 ALLOWED TO COME BACK IN. OKAY? I WANT TO MAKE SURE
17 EVERYBODY UNDERSTANDS THAT.

18 ALRIGHT, NOW, ADDITIONALLY, I JUST NEED TO --
19 THERE IS ONE JUROR THAT MAY NEED, THAT WHEN WE WERE
20 PICKING THE JURY I SAID THEY'VE JUST HAD SURGERY AND
21 AT CERTAIN POINTS THEY MAY HAVE TO TAKE A BREAK. THEY
22 ARE TO RAISE THEIR HAND IF THEY NEED TO DO THAT. SO,
23 IF Y'ALL, ANY OF YOU ATTORNEYS, IF YOU HAPPEN TO SEE A
24 JUROR GET UNCOMFORTABLE AND HAVE TO RAISE THEIR HAND,
25 WE'LL PICK A PLACE AND WE WILL STOP AND THEN COME

1 BACK, AND I JUST WANT YOU ALL TO BE AWARE OF THAT.

2 OKAY, WE'RE GOING TO BE IN RECESS FOR ABOUT TEN
3 MINUTES. OKAY?

4 (Recess)

5 THE COURT: IS THE STATE READY TO PROCEED?

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. ARE DEFENDANTS READY TO
8 PROCEED?

9 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR.

10 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

11 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, WE WOULD ASK THAT THE
12 COURT REMIND ANY WITNESSES THAT ARE IN THIS COURTROOM,
13 YOU NEED TO ASK THEM.

14 THE COURT: OKAY, IF THERE ARE ANY WITNESSES HERE
15 YOU NEED TO BE OUT OF THE COURTROOM RIGHT NOW. NO
16 WITNESSES NEED TO BE IN THE COURTROOM. I MEAN, EXCEPT
17 -- THAT'S THE NEXT PERSON YOU CALL, YEAH, NEXT
18 WITNESS. OKAY. ALRIGHT.

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, MAYBE JUST REAL
20 QUICK WHILE WE'RE DOING THIS, I DON'T KNOW IF WE'LL
21 GET ANOTHER BREAK BEFORE THAT, WHICH IS HER
22 TESTIMONY, BUT I MARKED DURING THIS PAST BREAK SEVERAL
23 ITEMS OF EVIDENCE. THOSE ITEMS ARE STATE'S THIRTY-
24 EIGHT, WHICH IS A PARTIAL ROLL OF DUCT TAPE, AND THEN
25 STATE'S THIRTY-NINE THROUGH SEVENTY-TWO, WHICH ARE

1 SHELL CASINGS AND/OR BULLET FRAGMENTS COLLECTED AT THE
2 SCENE, AND THEN ADDITIONALLY, ITEM SEVENTY-THREE IS A
3 FORTY CALIBER PISTOL, AND SEVENTY-FOUR IS THE MAGAZINE
4 THAT WAS WITH THAT PISTOL. THOSE HAVE ALL BEEN
5 MARKED, AND I GUESS I NEED TO FIND OUT IF THERE'S ANY
6 OBJECTION TO THEM JUST BECAUSE, I MEAN, I HAVE THEM
7 MARKED FOR ID, SO - - -

8 THE COURT: YOU JUST PUT THE NUMBER DOWN?

9 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I PUT THE NUMBER AND THE
10 DATE ON THEM, SO ...

11 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY, ANY OBJECTION --
12 YOU'VE HAD A CHANCE TO REVIEW, LOOK AT ALL OF THESE
13 ITEMS?

14 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR. I'VE HAD AN OPPORTUNITY
15 BEFORE TRIAL AND TODAY. I DON'T HAVE ANY OBJECTIONS.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. MS. ULLMAN?

17 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR.

18 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. PALMER?

19 MR. PALMER: I'VE SEEN THEM, YOUR HONOR.

20 THE COURT: OKAY. ANY OBJECTION TO THEM BEING
21 ...

22 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY.

24 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

25 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

1 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD AND MR. KOGER, NO
2 OBJECTION. OKAY, SO THEY WILL BE INTRODUCED INTO
3 EVIDENCE WITHOUT OBJECTION.

4 COURT REPORTER: JUDGE, GIVE ME TIME TO CHECK
5 THOSE OFF, PLEASE.

6 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, THEY ARE THIRTY-EIGHT
7 THROUGH SEVENTY-FOUR.

8 COURT REPORTER: OKAY. HOLD ON.

9 THE COURT: AND MR. KOGER AND MR. MELLARD, I
10 DON'T MEAN, BY THE TIME I GET DOWN TO Y'ALL MY,
11 SOMETIMES I MAY HESITATE WHILE I'M TRYING TO REMEMBER
12 WHOSE NAME IS WHO. IT'S NOT THAT I DON'T KNOW WHO YOU
13 ARE, IT'S JUST THAT, YOU KNOW, IT'S JUST AN OLD MIND.
14 Y'ALL BEAR WITH ME.

15 MS. WALKER, YOU LET ME KNOW WHEN YOU'RE READY.
16 (State's Exhibits Thirty-eight through
17 Seventy-four marked for identification.)

18 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR. I'M READY.

19 THE COURT: YOU'RE READY?

20 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

21 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. IS THE STATE NOW READY TO
22 PROCEED?

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

24 THE COURT: OKAY. AND THE DEFENDANTS ARE READY
25 TO PROCEED?

1 MR. LACKEY: YES, YOUR HONOR.

2 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

3 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

4 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

5 MR. KOGER: YES, SIR.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, IF YOU'D BRING THE
7 WITNESS, I MEAN, BRING THE JURY BACK IN. THANK YOU.
8 (Whereupon, the jury enters
9 the courtroom and the following
10 takes place in the presence
11 of the jury.)

12 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WE
13 TOOK JUST A LITTLE BIG LONGER BECAUSE WE WERE TRYING
14 TO GET SOME THINGS MARKED AND LIKE THAT, SO THAT
15 THINGS WOULD GO A LITTLE SMOOTHER WHEN WE'RE TAKING
16 THE TESTIMONY. AND NOW WE'RE GETTING READY TO RESUME
17 TAKING THE TESTIMONY IN THIS CASE. SO, IF Y'ALL WILL
18 BEAR WITH US.

19 CALL YOUR NEXT WITNESS, MR. SORENSON.

20 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU. THE STATE CALLS
21 ASHLEY PARSLEY.

22 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR. YES, MA'AM, IF YOU'D
23 COME RIGHT UP HERE, PUT YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE
24 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND, AND IF YOU'D LOOK AT THE
25 CLERK.

1 (Whereupon, Ashley Parsley
2 is duly sworn.)

3 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE OUR FULL NAME FOR
4 OUR COURT.

5 WITNESS: MY NAME IS ASHLEY RONNELLE PARSLEY.

6 COURT REPORTER: SPELL YOUR LAST NAME, PLEASE.

7 WITNESS: P-A-R-S-L-E-Y.

8 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
9 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
10 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
11 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
12 sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

214

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF ASHLEY R. PARSLEY
BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

Q. ALRIGHT, NOW, ASHLEY, I KNOW YOU'RE FAIRLY SOFT
SPOKEN SO I NEED YOU TO MAKE SURE YOU KEEP YOUR
VOICE UP NICE AND LOUD SO ALL THESE LAWYERS ALONG
HERE CAN HEAR YOU BUT ALSO SO THE JURY CAN HEAR
YOU. OKAY?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. ALRIGHT, NOW, IF YOU WOULD, ASHLEY, TELL THE
JURY, HOW OLD ARE YOU CURRENTLY?

A. TWENTY-FOUR YEARS OLD.

Q. OKAY. AND BACK IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR HOW OLD
WERE YOU IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR?

A. TWENTY-THREE YEARS OLD.

Q. AND BACK IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR WHERE,
SPECIFICALLY, FRIDAY, MARCH THE TWELFTH OF THIS
YEAR, WHERE WERE YOU LIVING AT AT THAT TIME,
ASHLEY?

A. AT AN APARTMENT ON KINGS ROAD.

Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S HERE IN ORANGEBURG?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND WHO WERE YOU STAYING WITH IN THAT APARTMENT
ON KINGS ROAD?

A. CHARLES PRINGLE.

Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU KNOW CHARLES BY ANY PARTICULAR

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

215

1 NICK NAME?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. WHAT WAS THAT?

4 A. OLD SCHOOL.

5 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SIX, IS
6 THAT A, DOES THAT PICTURE SHOW THE APARTMENT THAT
7 YOU WERE STAYING IN?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. AND IF YOU WILL KIND OF POINT THAT OUT FOR THE
10 JURY. OKAY, SO AS YOU'RE FACING THAT BUILDING,
11 WAS IT THE APARTMENT ALL THE WAY ON THE END?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. AND BACK IN MARCH OF TWO THOUSAND TEN, WAS THERE
14 ANYBODY ELSE STAYING THERE BESIDES YOU AND MR.
15 PRINGLE?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND HOW LONG, HOW LONG -- ON FRIDAY, MARCH
18 THE TWELFTH, HOW LONG HAD YOU BEEN STAYING WITH
19 MR. PRINGLE BEFORE THAT?

20 A. FOR ABOUT A WEEK.

21 Q. OKAY. AND HOW LONG HAD YOU KNOWN MR. PRINGLE?

22 A. FOR ABOUT A WEEK.

23 Q. AND WHERE, TELL THE JURY WHERE AND HOW YOU HAD
24 MET MR. PRINGLE?

25 A. I MET HIM AT LAY LOW'S IN SUMMEVILLE.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

216

1 COURT REPORTER: WHERE?

2 Q. WHERE?

3 A. SUMMERVILLE.

4 COURT REPORTER: I MEAN, WHERE IN SUMMERVILLE?

5 Q. WHAT WAS THE NAME OF THE PLACE?

6 A. LAY LOW'S.

7 Q. LAY LOW'S. AND IS THAT A CLUB IN SUMMERVILLE?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AND AFTER THAT YOU ENDED UP MOVING AND
10 STAYING WITH MR. PRINGLE?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. AND IF YOU WOULD, DESCRIBE THE APARTMENT
13 THERE ON KINGS ROAD WHERE YOU WERE STAYING WITH
14 HIM FOR THAT WEEK LEADING UP TO MARCH THE
15 TWELFTH?

16 A. IT WAS A SMALL APARTMENT WITH A DEN, A KITCHEN,
17 TWO BEDROOMS AND A BATHROOM.

18 Q. OKAY. AND WERE YOU STAYING IN THE SAME BEDROOM
19 AS MR. PRINGLE?

20 A. NO, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. HE WAS IN ONE BEDROOM AND YOU WERE IN, I
22 GUESS, THE GUEST BEDROOM OR THE OTHER BEDROOM?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. AND ASHLEY, I WANT TO TURN YOUR ATTENTION,
25 IF I COULD, BACK TO THAT FRIDAY EVENING, OKAY?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

217

1 DO YOU RECALL WHAT YOU HAD BEEN DOING KIND OF
2 LATE THAT AFTERNOON, EARLY EVENING?

3 A. I WAS SITTING BY THE COFFEE TABLE.

4 Q. OKAY. HAD YOU GONE OUT ANYWHERE, YOU KNOW, THAT
5 EVENING OR THAT LATE AFTERNOON?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. NOW, WHAT ABOUT, WHAT ABOUT MR. PRINGLE, WAS HE
8 THERE?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT WAS MR. PRINGLE DOING THAT
11 EVENING?

12 A. HE WAS SLEEPING IN HIS ROOM.

13 Q. OKAY. NOW, DID THERE COME A TIME WHEN SOMEBODY
14 CAME OVER TO HANG OUT OVER THERE AT THE
15 APARTMENT?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND WHO WAS THAT THAT CAME OVER TO THE
18 APARTMENT THAT EVENING TO HANG OUT?

19 A. SHANNON.

20 Q. OKAY. AND WHO WAS SHANNON?

21 A. OLD SCHOOL'S HOME BOY.

22 Q. SO, HE WAS A FRIEND OF MR. PRINGLE'S?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. AND DID SHANNON COME OVER AND HANG OUT AT
25 THE APARTMENT FREQUENTLY?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

218

- 1 A. YES, SIR.
- 2 Q. OKAY. AT LEAST FOR THE WEEK THAT YOU HAD BEEN
- 3 THERE?
- 4 A. YES, SIR.
- 5 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU KNOW SHANNON PRIOR TO THAT
- 6 WEEK THAT YOU WERE STAYING WITH MR. PRINGLE?
- 7 A. NO, SIR.
- 8 Q. AND LET ME ASK YOU, DO YOU KNOW ABOUT WHAT TIME
- 9 IT WAS THAT SHANNON GOT OVER TO THE APARTMENT
- 10 THAT NIGHT?
- 11 A. I'D SAY AROUND NINISH.
- 12 Q. OKAY. AND YOU HAD INDICATED THAT MR. PRINGLE WAS
- 13 ASLEEP, IS THAT CORRECT?
- 14 A. YES, SIR.
- 15 Q. OKAY. WHEN SHANNON CAME OVER WAS MR. PRINGLE
- 16 STILL IN THE BEDROOM ASLEEP?
- 17 A. YES, SIR.
- 18 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT THEN DID YOU AND SHANNON DO?
- 19 A. WE TALKED.
- 20 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE WAS IT THAT Y'ALL WERE TALKING?
- 21 A. WE WAS TALKING IN THE DEN.
- 22 Q. OKAY. AND YOU HAD INDICATED EARLIER, WHERE WERE
- 23 YOU SITTING IN THE DEN?
- 24 A. BESIDE THE WINDOW BY THE COFFEE TABLE.
- 25 Q. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVEN,

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

219

- 1 DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT PHOTOGRAPH?
- 2 A. YES, SIR.
- 3 Q. OKAY. AND DOES THAT SHOW WHERE YOU WERE SITTING
- 4 IN THAT PHOTOGRAPH?
- 5 A. YES, SIR.
- 6 Q. POINT IF YOU WOULD, POINT THAT OUT FOR THE JURY?
- 7 OKAY, SO THAT LITTLE, I GUESS, KIND OF KITCHEN
- 8 TYPE CHAIR, KITCHEN TABLE CHAIR THAT'S SEATED
- 9 KIND OF NEAR THE WINDOW?
- 10 A. YES, SIR.
- 11 Q. THAT'S WHERE YOU WERE SITTING?
- 12 A. YES, SIR.
- 13 Q. OKAY. AND HOW ABOUT WHEN YOU WERE SITTING
- 14 TALKING TO SHANNON, WHERE WAS SHANNON SITTING, DO
- 15 YOU RECALL?
- 16 A. HE WAS SITTING IN THE LOVE SEAT.
- 17 Q. OKAY. IN THAT LOVE SEAT RIGHT THERE?
- 18 A. YES, SIR.
- 19 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU, YOU SEE THE CONDITION
- 20 OF THE LOVE SEAT IN THIS PICTURE, RIGHT?
- 21 A. YES, SIR.
- 22 Q. WAS IT IN THAT CONDITION WHEN SHANNON WAS SITTING
- 23 IN THERE TALKING TO YOU?
- 24 A. NO, SIR.
- 25 Q. IN WHAT CONDITION WAS IT IN?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

220

1 A. IT WAS IN A VERY GOOD CONDITION.

2 Q. CUSHIONS IN IT?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. WERE THEY TORN UP AT ALL?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. NOW, DID THERE COME A TIME WHEN THE TWO OF Y'ALL
7 WERE SITTING THERE, A LITTLE AFTER NINE O'CLOCK
8 TALKING WHEN SOMEBODY ELSE CAME TO THE APARTMENT?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. AND HOW, HOW DID THEY COME ABOUT COMING
11 IN?

12 A. THEY RUNG THE DOOR BELL.

13 Q. OKAY. AND DID SOMEBODY GET UP AND LET THEM IN?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER, WAS THAT YOU OR SHANNON?

16 A. SHANNON.

17 Q. OKAY. AND IF YOU WOULD, DESCRIBE THAT PERSON
18 THAT CAME TO THE DOOR AND RUNG THE DOOR BELL AND
19 CAME IN WHEN SHANNON OPENED THE DOOR?

20 A. HE WAS LIGHT SKINNED, WITH TWISTIES IN HIS HAIR,
21 LIKE, MEDIUM HEIGHT.

22 COURT REPORTER: WHAT IN HIS HAIR?

23 A. TWISTIES.

24 Q. OKAY. SO, KIND OF LIKE TWISTS IN HIS HAIR IN
25 LITTLE TWISTS?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

221

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A. YES, SIR.

Q. LET ME ASK YOU, DID YOU KNOW THAT PERSON?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. EVER SEEN HIM BEFORE THAT NIGHT THAT YOU CAN
RECALL?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. OKAY. HOW ABOUT SHANNON, DID HE APPEAR TO KNOW
WHO THAT PERSON WAS?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY, WHAT DID THIS
PERSON WANT THAT CAME INTO THE APARTMENT THEN
THAT EVENING?

A. HE WANTED DROE.

Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, BACK IN MARCH OF TWO
THOUSAND TEN, WHEN YOU WERE STAYING WITH MR.
PRINGLE AT THAT APARTMENT ON KINGS ROAD, WAS
SOMEBODY SELLING MARIJUANA OUT OF THAT APARTMENT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND WHO WAS THAT THAT WAS SELLING
MARIJUANA?

A. OLD SCHOOL.

Q. MR. PRINGLE?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND DURING THOSE DAYS THAT YOU WERE
STAYING THERE WERE YOU HELPING HIM SELL

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

222

1 MARIJUANA?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. NOW, YOU'VE INDICATED THAT THE PERSON WAS ASKING
4 FOR DROE?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHAT DROE IS?

7 A. IT'S A SPECIAL TYPE OF MARIJUANA.

8 Q. OKAY. AND WERE YOU ABLE TO HELP HIM AT THAT
9 POINT IN TIME?

10 A. NO, SIR.

11 Q. HOW ABOUT SHANNON, WAS HE ABLE TO HELP HIM AT
12 THAT POINT IN TIME?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. AND SO, WHAT DID Y'ALL DO THEN?

15 A. I CALLED OLD SCHOOL.

16 Q. OKAY. AND DID HE GET UP AND COME OUT INTO THE
17 LIVING ROOM?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID MR. PRINGLE DO WHEN HE GOT
20 OUT INTO THE LIVING ROOM?

21 A. HE ASKED THE DUDE FOR HIS ID.

22 Q. OKAY. DID HE APPEAR TO KNOW WHO THE PERSON WAS?

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU THIS, DID THE GUY GIVE
25 MR. PRINGLE HIS ID?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

223

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. WHAT HAPPENED THEN, AFTER HE LOOKED AT
3 THIS GUY'S ID?

4 A. HE ASKED HIM HAD HE EVER BEEN THERE BEFORE,
5 BECAUSE HE HAD NEVER SEEN HIM.

6 Q. OKAY. AND DID THE GUY RESPOND OR ...

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. DO YOU RECALL WHAT HE TOLD MR. PRINGLE?

9 A. HE BEEN THERE WITH HIS HOME BOY.

10 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU, FROM WHAT YOU WERE ABLE TO
11 OBSERVE, DID MR. PRINGLE GIVE THIS INDIVIDUAL
12 THAT YOU DESCRIBED, YOU KNOW, LIGHT SKINNED,
13 MEDIUM HEIGHT WITH THE TWISTIES IN HIS HAIR, DID
14 HE GIVE HIM ANY MARIJUANA AT THAT POINT IN TIME
15 THAT YOU OBSERVED?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 Q. AND DID THAT PERSON ULTIMATELY LEAVE?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE WAS SHANNON AT WHILE ALL OF THIS
20 WAS GOING ON?

21 A. HE WAS STILL SITTING IN THE LOVE SEAT.

22 Q. AND HOW FAR, I MEAN, DESCRIBE THE LIVING ROOM, IS
23 IT A BIG LIVING ROOM OR A SMALL LIVING ROOM?

24 A. NO, SIR, IT'S A SMALL LIVING ROOM.

25 Q. AND WHEN THIS PERSON CAME IN, LET ME ASK YOU, DID

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

224

1 HE HAVE ANYTHING COVERING HIS FACE OR ANYTHING
2 LIKE THAT?

3 A. NO, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. WERE YOU ABLE TO OBSERVE HIM WITHOUT
5 ANYTHING IN THE WAY?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT, LET ME ASK YOU THIS, WHAT WAS
8 THE, WHAT WAS THE LIGHTING LIKE INSIDE THAT
9 LIVING ROOM THAT EVENING WHEN YOU WERE SITTING IN
10 THERE?

11 A. IT WAS DIM.

12 Q. DIM?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU, DID IT HAVE LIKE
15 REGULAR LIGHTS IN THE LIGHT FIXTURES?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 Q. DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHAT KIND OF LIGHTS WERE IN
18 THAT LIVING ROOM?

19 A. IT WAS DIFFERENT COLORS.

20 Q. DIFFERENT COLORED LIGHTS?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU, COULD YOU SEE?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. IT JUST WASN'T SUPER BRIGHT IN THERE?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

225

1 Q. ALRIGHT. AND HOW FAR AWAY DO YOU THINK WHEN MR.
2 PRINGLE WAS TALKING WITH THIS PERSON AND ASKING
3 HIM FOR HIS ID, HOW FAR AWAY FROM HIM WERE YOU
4 SITTING IN THE CHAIR THERE?

5 A. ABOUT THE SAME DISTANCE RIGHT NOW.

6 Q. FIVE, SIX FEET OR SO?

7 A. YES.

8 MR. PALMER: OBJECTION TO THE LEADING.

9 THE COURT: OVERRULED.

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I MEAN, THERE'S NO - LIKE I
11 SAY, THERE'S NO WAY SHE COULD TAKE DOWN. THANK YOU.

12 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, YOU'VE INDICATED THAT THIS
13 INDIVIDUAL ENDED UP LEAVING THEN AFTER TALKING TO
14 MR. PRINGLE?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. OKAY. AND HOW ABOUT SHANNON, DID HE END UP
17 STAYING AROUND AFTER THIS ALSO OR ...

18 A. HE LEFT AROUND LIKE TEN MINUTES AFTER.

19 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND WHAT, AFTER SHANNON THEN
20 LEFT ABOUT TEN MINUTES LATER, WHAT ...

21 MR. PALMER: OBJECTION, LEADING.

22 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT'S JUST A FOLLOW UP TO
23 THE LAST ANSWER SHE JUST GAVE.

24 THE COURT: I OVERRULE YOUR OBJECTION. THANK
25 YOU, MR. PALMER.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

226

1 GO AHEAD.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. SO, YOU JUST TESTIFIED A SECOND AGO
4 THAT SHANNON HAD LEFT, RIGHT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. AFTER SHANNON LEFT WHAT DID MR. PRINGLE
7 DO?

8 A. HE WENT TO THE KITCHEN.

9 Q. OKAY. AND IF YOU WOULD, DESCRIBE THEN, THE
10 KITCHEN, WHAT ROOM IS THE KITCHEN OFF OF IN THE
11 APARTMENT?

12 A. THE DEN.

13 Q. OKAY. CAN YOU, FROM SITTING IN THE DEN CAN YOU
14 SEE INTO THE KITCHEN?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND OBVIOUSLY, IF YOU'RE STANDING IN THE KITCHEN
17 CAN YOU THEN SEE INTO THE DEN?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. AND CAN YOU SEE THE FRONT DOOR FROM THE KITCHEN
20 ALSO?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. ALRIGHT. WHAT, TELL THE JURY WHAT HAPPENED,
23 WELL, LET ME ASK YOU THIS, WHAT WAS MR. PRINGLE
24 DOING IN THE KITCHEN, DO YOU KNOW?

25 A. HE WAS MAKING BAGS.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

227

1 Q. OKAY. MAKING BAGS OF WHAT?

2 A. MARIJUANA.

3 Q. AND AT THAT TIME WAS THERE ANYBODY ELSE BESIDES
4 YOU AND MR. PRINGLE IN THE APARTMENT?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, DID HE HAVE, WERE THERE ANY
7 ANIMALS IN THE APARTMENT?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT KIND OF ANIMALS WERE IN THE
10 APARTMENT?

11 A. IT WAS A DOG.

12 Q. OKAY. AND CAN YOU DESCRIBE TO THE JURY WHAT,
13 YOU KNOW, BIG DOG, LITTLE DOG?

14 A. IT WAS A BIG DOG.

15 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE WAS THE DOG LOCATED AT?

16 A. IN THE KITCHEN.

17 Q. WAS HE JUST KIND OF LOOSE IN THE APARTMENT OR WAS
18 HE SOMEHOW CONFINED IN THE APARTMENT?

19 A. SHE WAS, SHE WAS CHAINED UP.

20 Q. SHE WAS CHAINED UP IN THE KITCHEN?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, WELL, MR. PRINGLE NOW IS IN THE
23 KITCHEN. WHAT, WHERE WERE YOU SITTING AT, WERE
24 YOU STILL IN THE SAME CHAIR?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

228

1 Q. OKAY. AND TELL THE JURY WHAT HAPPENED THEN?

2 A. IT WAS ANOTHER DOOR BELL RING.

3 Q. AND ABOUT HOW LONG AFTER SHANNON LEFT DO YOU
4 THINK, TO JUST KIND OF PUT IT IN PERSPECTIVE
5 TIME-WISE, HOW LONG AFTER SHANNON HAD LEFT DID
6 THAT HAPPEN?

7 A. ABOUT TEN MINUTES.

8 Q. OKAY. AND WHO ANSWERED THE DOOR WHEN IT RANG
9 THEN THAT SECOND TIME?

10 A. I DID.

11 Q. OKAY. AND WAS MR. PRINGLE STILL IN THE KITCHEN?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. AND NOW WAS THERE SOMEBODY AT THE DOOR?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND DID THEY COME IN?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID THEY WANT WHEN THEY CAME IN?

18 A. THEY WANTED A DIME OR A NICK BAG.

19 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S OF MARIJUANA?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. AND DID MR. PRINGLE HELP THEM OR DID YOU
22 HELP THEM?

23 A. I HELPED THEM.

24 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE, DID YOU HAVE ANY MARIJUANA OUT
25 THERE IN THE LIVING ROOM AREA?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

229

- 1 A. YES, SIR.
- 2 Q. OKAY. AND HOW WAS THAT MARIJUANA OUT THERE
- 3 PACKAGED THAT WAS OUT THERE IN THE LIVING ROOM
- 4 AREA?
- 5 A. IT WAS IN A JAR BY THE WINDOW.
- 6 Q. OKAY. AND WAS IT IN LITTLE INDIVIDUAL PACKAGES
- 7 OR SOMETHING AT THAT TIME?
- 8 A. YES, SIR.
- 9 Q. AND DESCRIBE THAT FOR THE JURY.
- 10 Q. IT'S LIKE LITTLE TINY ZIP LOCK BAGS IN A JAR.
- 11 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND DID YOU END UP GIVING THAT
- 12 PERSON ANY MARIJUANA?
- 13 A. I END UP REACHING DOWN TO GIVE IT TO HIM.
- 14 Q. OKAY. AND TELL THE JURY WHAT HAPPENED THEN AS
- 15 YOU WERE REACHING DOWN TO GIVE IT TO HIM?
- 16 A. AS I WAS REACHING DOWN HE PULLED A GUN OUT ON ME
- 17 AND TOLD ME IT WAS A STICKUP.
- 18 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU DO -- LET ME ASK YOU, DID
- 19 YOU HAVE ANYTHING ELSE THAT YOU HAD IN YOUR
- 20 POSSESSION AT THAT POINT IN TIME IN YOUR HAND OR
- 21 ANYTHING?
- 22 A. YES, SIR.
- 23 Q. TELL THE JURY WHAT YOU HAD IN YOUR HAND?
- 24 A. I HAD THE PISTOL - - -
- 25 Q. OKAY.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

230

- 1 A. --- THAT CHARLES LET ME HOLD.
- 2 Q. OKAY. DO YOU REMEMBER WHAT KIND OF PISTOL THAT
- 3 WAS OR ANYTHING ABOUT IT?
- 4 A. IT WAS A SMITH AND WESSON.
- 5 Q. OKAY. AND WHOSE PISTOL WAS IT THAT YOU HAD?
- 6 A. CHARLES PRINGLE'S.
- 7 Q. AND, SO, WHEN THE PERSON PULLED THE GUN OUT AND
- 8 SAID, IT'S A STICK UP OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT, IS
- 9 THAT WHAT YOU SAID?
- 10 A. YES, SIR.
- 11 Q. WHAT DID YOU -- FIRST OF ALL, WHAT HAPPENED THEN?
- 12 A. HE TOOK THE PISTOL FROM ME, AND HE SAID, BITCH,
- 13 GET ON THE FLOOR AND DON'T SAY NOTHING AND DON'T
- 14 MOVE.
- 15 Q. OKAY. DID YOU GET DOWN ON THE FLOOR AT THAT
- 16 TIME?
- 17 A. YES, SIR.
- 18 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE ON THE FLOOR THEN WERE YOU
- 19 LYING?
- 20 A. IN FRONT OF THE LOVE SEAT.
- 21 Q. KIND OF IN THIS AREA RIGHT HERE?
- 22 A. YES, SIR.
- 23 Q. NOW, WHAT ABOUT MR. PRINGLE, WHAT -- DO YOU KNOW
- 24 IF HE STAYED IN THE KITCHEN OR COME OUT OF THE
- 25 KITCHEN?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

231

1 A. HE CAME OUT OF THE KITCHEN, AND THEN THEY STARTED
2 TALKING.

3 Q. NOW, LET ME ASK YOU THIS, YOU TESTIFIED ABOUT
4 THAT ONE PERSON THAT HAD COME IN AND ENDED UP
5 PULLING THE GUN ON YOU AND TAKING THE GUN THAT
6 YOU WERE HOLDING. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER OTHER
7 PEOPLE CAME INTO THE APARTMENT ALSO?

8 A. I NOTICED A CHUBBY GUY.

9 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU THIS, DO YOU KNOW
10 WHETHER JUST -- ONCE YOU HIT THE GROUND, DID YOU
11 LOOK UP AFTER YOU WERE ON THE GROUND?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU KNOW WHETHER THERE WERE MORE
14 THAN JUST THOSE TWO PEOPLE IN THE APARTMENT?

15 A. I FELT LIKE IT WAS MORE THAN TWO PEOPLE IN THE
16 APARTMENT.

17 Q. DID YOU HEAR PEOPLE MOVING AROUND?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. NOW, TELL THE JURY, AS YOU ARE DOWN THERE ON THE
20 GROUND, YOU'VE GOT YOUR FACE IN THE CARPET
21 BASICALLY?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. TELL THE JURY WHAT WAS GOING ON INSIDE THE
24 APARTMENT WHILE YOU WERE FACE DOWN ON THE CARPET?

25 A. IT WAS A LOT OF TALKING, A LOT OF YELLING, A LOT

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

232

1 OF RIPPING UP STUFF, ASKING WHERE THE MONEY IS,
2 AND I HEARD, LIKE, TAPE BEING TORN, AND THEN
3 AFTER THAT, THAT'S WHEN I HEARD GUN SHOTS.

4 Q. HOW MANY GUN SHOTS DID YOU HEAR?

5 A. IT JUST SOUNDED OFF.

6 Q. IT JUST WHAT?

7 A. IT SOUNDED OFF.

8 Q. A LITTLE, A LOT?

9 A. A LOT.

10 Q. A LOT. AFTER YOU HEARD THOSE GUN SHOTS AND AFTER
11 HEARING, YOU KNOW, STUFF BEING TORN UP IN THERE
12 AND THE TAPE BEING TORN AND ALL, WHAT, AFTER
13 THOSE GUN SHOTS THEN WHAT HAPPENED NEXT, ASHLEY?

14 A. THEY RAN OUT AND LEFT THE DOOR OPEN.

15 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHAT, WHAT DID YOU DO AT THAT TIME?

16 A. I CLOSED THE DOOR AND WENT IN CHARLES'S ROOM TO
17 GET HIS PHONE.

18 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU DO WHEN YOU GOT HIS
19 PHONE?

20 A. I CALLED NINE ONE ONE.

21 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU TELL THEM THAT -- WELL, LET ME
22 ASK YOU THIS, WHERE WAS MR. PRINGLE AT AT THAT
23 TIME?

24 A. HE WAS LAYING UP UNDER THE T.V.

25 Q. OKAY. LET ME SHOW YOU, AND I'M NOT GOING TO SHOW

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

233

1 YOU THE BIG PICTURE, BUT I MEAN, DO YOU SEE MR.
2 PRINGLE ON THE FLOOR HERE?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. IS THAT WHERE HE WAS?

5 THE COURT: THAT'S EXHIBIT NUMBER WHAT?

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT'S, I'M SORRY, STATE'S
7 NUMBER SEVEN, YOUR HONOR.

8 THE COURT: NUMBER SEVEN.

9 Q. IS THAT WHERE HE WAS ON THE FLOOR THERE?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. AND COULD YOU TELL IF HE HAD BEEN SHOT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. COULD YOU TELL WHERE HE HAD BEEN SHOT?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. TELL THE JURY WHERE IT LOOKED LIKE HE HAD BEEN
16 SHOT?

17 A. IN HIS LEG, IN HIS HAND AND HIS ARM.

18 Q. IT LOOKED LIKE HE HAD BEEN SHOT MORE THAN ONE
19 TIME THEN?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. AND HOW ABOUT, YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER THAT
22 YOU HEARD WHAT SOUNDED LIKE SOME TAPE BEING TORN?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. DID YOU SEE ANY EVIDENCE OF THAT ON MR. PRINGLE?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

234

1 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU SEE, ASHLEY?

2 A. I SEEN HIS MOUTH TAPED UP.

3 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT KIND OF TAPE WAS THAT?

4 A. DUCT TAPE.

5 Q. AND DID THE POLICE END UP ARRIVING OUT THERE?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, WAS MR. PRINGLE, I
8 MEAN, WAS HE RESPONSIVE, I MEAN, WAS HE MOVING
9 AROUND AT ALL, GET UP OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT?

10 A. HE LOOKED AT ME, AND THEN AFTER THAT HE JUST
11 CLOSED HIS EYES.

12 Q. AFTER THAT YOU HAD NO RESPONSE FROM HIM?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. NOW, AND THE POLICE ENDED UP ARRIVING OUT THERE?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. OKAY. AND LET ME ASK YOU, HOW WERE YOU ACTING AT
17 THAT POINT IN TIME WHEN THEY GOT THERE?

18 A. I WAS IN SHOCK.

19 Q. DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO CALL ANYBODY ELSE
20 BESIDES THE POLICE AND TELL THE WHAT HAD
21 HAPPENED?

22 A. I CALLED SHANNON.

23 Q. OKAY. DID YOU END UP GOING DOWN TO THE SHERIFF'S
24 OFFICE THAT NIGHT AND TALKING TO THE
25 INVESTIGATORS?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

235

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER TALKING TO LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, ASHLEY, DO YOU ULTIMATELY
5 REMEMBER GOING OVER THE, YOU KNOW, SEVERAL TIMES
6 OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF DAYS INTO THE SHERIFF'S
7 OFFICE AND HAVING AN OPPORTUNITY FOR LIEUTENANT
8 SHUMPERT TO SHOW YOU SEVERAL PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUPS

9
10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. --- FOR YOU TO LOOK AT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER ABOUT HOW MANY DIFFERENT LINEUPS
14 HE SHOWED YOU?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. WAS IT MORE THAN THREE?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, OUT OF THE LINEUPS HE SHOWED
19 YOU, WERE YOU ABLE TO PICK SOMEBODY OUT OF EVERY
20 LINEUP HE SHOWED YOU?

21 A. NOT EVERYONE.

22 Q. AND KIND OF ALONG THAT SAME REGARD, WHEN YOU WERE
23 SHOWN A LINEUP DID LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT TELL YOU
24 WHO TO PICK OUT?

25 A. NO, SIR.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

236

1 Q. DID HE TELL YOU YOU HAD TO PICK SOMEBODY OUT?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. DID HE IN ANYWAY SUGGEST TO YOU WHO YOU NEEDED TO
4 PICK OUT OR ANYTHING OF THAT NATURE?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. LET ME START OFF SHOWING YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED
7 AS STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THREE. LET ME ASK YOU,
8 DO YOU RECALL ON MARCH THE FIFTEENTH OF TWO
9 THOUSAND TEN, SO ABOUT THREE DAYS LATER, DO YOU
10 REMEMBER -- TWO AND A HALF DAYS LATER, DO YOU
11 REMEMBER LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT SHOWING YOU STATE'S
12 EXHIBIT NUMBER THREE?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. AND WERE YOU ABLE TO PICK ANYBODY OUT OF
15 STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THREE?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. AND WHAT NUMBER DID YOU PICK OUT?

18 A. NUMBER THREE.

19 Q. AND IN FACT, THEN, WERE YOU ABLE TO THEN FILL OUT
20 AND SIGN AN AFFIDAVIT INDICATING THAT YOU PICKED
21 OUT PHOTO NUMBER THREE?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. AND WHO WAS THAT PERSON, NOT SPECIFICALLY
24 BY NAME, BUT WHY IS IT THAT YOU PICKED OUT THAT
25 PERSON?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

237

1 A. BECAUSE HE LOOKED LIKE THE GUY WITH THE TWISTIES
2 IN HIS HAIR.

3 Q. SO, THE GUY THAT HAD COME IN, YOU KNOW, TWENTY
4 MINUTES BEFORE - - -

5 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, SHE SAID HE
6 LOOKED LIKE THE GUY WITH THE TWISTIES IN HIS HAIR.
7 AND HE'S NOW REFERRING TO AND TRYING TO FILL IN WHO
8 THAT PERSON WAS. HE CAN CERTAINLY ASK HER WHO THAT
9 PERSON WAS.

10 THE COURT: SHE HAD ALREADY IDENTIFIED SOMEONE
11 WITH TWISTIES COMING, SO IF YOU WILL JUST ASK HER
12 AGAIN.

13 Q. IS THAT THE PERSON THAT YOU DESCRIBED TO THE JURY
14 EARLIER WITH THE TWISTIES THAT HAD COME IN TWENTY
15 MINUTES OR SO - - -

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. --- BEFORE THIS INCIDENT?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. AND IN FACT, DID YOU DOCUMENT THAT THEN IN
20 YOUR AFFIDAVIT?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME
23 WE'D OFFER STATE'S NUMBER THREE INTO EVIDENCE.

24 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

25 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

238

1 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

2 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

3 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

4 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

5 THE COURT: OKAY. NO OBJECTIONS, IT IS, STATE'S
6 NUMBER THREE IS ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.

7 (State's Exhibit Three
8 marked and filed.)

9 Q. AND ASHLEY, IF YOU WOULD, IN THE, KIND OF THE
10 DESCRIPTION HERE ON THE AFFIDAVIT, WILL YOU READ
11 TO THE JURY WHAT YOU WROTE ON THERE? YOU CAN
12 HOLD IT.

13 A. "I, ASHLEY PARLSEY, AFTER CAREFUL CONSIDERATION
14 OF ALL PHOTOGRAPHS SHOWN TO ME IN THE LINEUP
15 PRESENTED TO ME BY SERGEANT SHUMPERT, HAVE
16 IDENTIFIED THE SUBJECT IN PHOTO NUMBER THREE AS
17 BEING A PERSON WHO WAS LET IN BY SHANNON. WHEN I
18 WALKED OUT MY ROOM HE ASKED FOR OLD SCHOOL AND I
19 TOLD HIM HE WASN'T HERE, AND THEN HE ASKED FOR
20 DROE, SO SHANNON TOLD OLD SCHOOL TO GET UP,
21 SOMEONE WANTS TO SEE HIM. SO, HE GOT UP AND
22 ASKED PETE FOR HIS ID BECAUSE HE SAID HE HASN'T
23 SEEN HIM BEFORE. AND PETE SAID HE CAME BEFORE
24 WITH HIS HOME BOY."

25 Q. OKAY. AND YOU REFERENCED THE GUY'S NAME AS BEING

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

239

1 PETE IN HERE?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. DID YOU KNOW WHEN THIS ALL HAPPENED, WHEN HE CAME
4 IN THERE THAT NIGHT, DID YOU KNOW HIS NAME?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. AND YOU HAD INDICATED EARLIER THAT SHANNON
7 APPEARED TO KNOW HIM?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. THE NAME, PETE, WHERE DID YOU GET THAT
10 NAME, PETE, FROM?

11 A. SHANNON.

12 Q. OKAY. SO, HE TOLD YOU WHAT HIS NAME WAS?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND MOVING ON HERE TO STATE'S
15 EXHIBIT NUMBER FOUR, ASHLEY, I SHOW YOU STATE'S
16 EXHIBIT NUMBER FOUR. DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY
17 TO VIEW THIS LINEUP ON MARCH NINETEENTH THAT WAS
18 SHOWN TO YOU BY LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. AND WERE YOU ABLE TO PICK ANYBODY OUT OF
21 THIS LINEUP?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND WHAT NUMBER DID YOU PICK OUT?

24 A. NUMBER THREE.

25 Q. OKAY. TELL THE JURY WHY IT IS THAT YOU PICKED

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

240

1 OUT NUMBER THREE?

2 A. I IDENTIFIED THAT AS THE SHOOTER BECAUSE OF HIS
3 EYES.

4 Q. THAT'S THE PERSON THAT YOU -- LET ME ASK YOU
5 THIS, DID YOU DOCUMENT ON THE AFFIDAVIT ANYTHING?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND WHAT DID YOU DOCUMENT ON THE AFFIDAVIT AS TO
8 HIM?

9 A. THAT HE WAS THE GUY THAT POINTED THE GUN AT ME.

10 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND YOU IDENTIFIED HIM THAT
11 NIGHT FOR LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. AND DID LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT YET AGAIN, I
14 MEAN, TELL YOU WHO TO PICK OUT OR THAT YOU HAD TO
15 PICK SOMEBODY OUT OF THIS LINEUP?

16 A. NO, SIR.

17 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME
18 WE'D OFFER STATE'S FOUR INTO EVIDENCE.

19 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

20 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

21 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

22 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION SUBJECT TO THE NEAL
23 VERSUS BIGGERS HEARING WE HAD ON THE TWENTY-SECOND.

24 THE COURT: I'LL NOTE, I WILL NOTE YOUR OBJECTION
25 AND MY RULING IN THAT, AND YOUR CONTINUING OBJECTION

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

241

1 TO IT.

2 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU.

3 THE COURT: OKAY. IT IS, AND THE OTHERS SUBJECT
4 TO THAT OBJECTION.

5 (State's Exhibit Four
6 marked and filed.)

7 Q. AND LASTLY, AS TO STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER FIVE - -

8 -
9 SOLICITOR SORENSON: MS. WALKER, I'M GOING TO
10 CROSS OFF MY NUMBER FOUR OF THE ID OFF OF HERE, OKAY?

11 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

12 Q. AS TO NUMBER FIVE, ASHLEY, I'M SHOWING YOU
13 STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER FIVE, DID YOU HAVE AN
14 OPPORTUNITY ALSO ON MARCH NINETEENTH TO VIEW THAT
15 PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUP?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND WERE YOU ABLE TO PICK ANYBODY OUT OF
18 THAT LINEUP?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND WHAT, WHAT PHOTOGRAPH DID YOU PICK OUT OF
21 THAT LINEUP?

22 A. NUMBER ONE.

23 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY THEN TO
24 ALSO DOCUMENT THAT IN THE ACCOMPANYING AFFIDAVIT?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

242

1 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU INDICATE IN THAT
2 AFFIDAVIT?

3 A. THAT HE WAS THE CHUBBY GUY THAT I SAW.

4 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND WHAT EXACTLY, READ FOR THE
5 JURY WHAT YOU ACTUALLY WROTE ON THE AFFIDAVIT,
6 JUST YOUR HANDWRITTEN PART.

7 A. "I, ASHLEY PARSLEY, AFTER CAREFUL CONSIDERATION
8 OF ALL PHOTOGRAPHS SHOWN TO ME IN THE LINEUP,
9 HAVE IDENTIFIED THE SUBJECT IN NUMBER ONE AS
10 BEING A PERSON WHO WORE A GREEN SHIRT THAT CAME
11 INTO OUR APARTMENT. HE IS POSSIBLE TO BEING ONE
12 OF THE GUYS THAT ENTERED THE HOUSE, AND I DIDN'T
13 COMPLETELY SEE HIS FACE."

14 Q. SO, THAT'S WHO YOU THOUGHT IT WAS, BUT YOU DIDN'T
15 GET A REAL GOOD LOOK AT HIS FACE?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. ALRIGHT. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, YOU ACTUALLY WROTE
18 ON HERE, ACTUALLY PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER FOUR, IS THAT
19 CORRECT?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU, WHEN YOU CIRCLED
22 PHOTOGRAPH -- BEFORE I GET THERE - - -

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: AT THIS TIME, YOUR HONOR
24 WE'D OFFER STATE'S NUMBER FIVE INTO EVIDENCE.

25 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

243

1 MS. ULLMAN: YOUR HONOR, I WOULD OBJECT UNDER
2 NEAL VERSUS BIGGERS ISSUES AND UNDER THE PERSONAL
3 KNOWLEDGE ISSUES THAT I'VE PREVIOUSLY BROUGHT UP.

4 THE COURT: OKAY. AND I NOTE YOUR OBJECTION FROM
5 THE HEARING ON THAT. IT IS ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.
6 THANK YOU. AND THAT OBJECTION IS PRESERVED, AS IS MR.
7 KOGER'S.

8 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

9 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

10 (State's Exhibit Five
11 marked and filed.)

12 Q. LET ME JUST -- YOU CIRCLED THE PICTURE, RIGHT, IS
13 THAT CORRECT, THAT YOU FELT WAS THE PERSON THAT
14 CAME INTO THE APARTMENT, THE CHUBBY GUY, IS THAT
15 CORRECT?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, WHEN YOU CIRCLED THAT PHOTOGRAPH,
18 WHAT NUMBER DID YOU CIRCLE WITH THE PHOTOGRAPH?

19 A. NUMBER FOUR.

20 Q. OKAY. THERE'S NO DOUBT ABOUT IT, I MEAN, WHAT
21 PHOTOGRAPH WERE YOU MEANING TO - - -

22 A. NUMBER ONE.

23 Q. OKAY. AND YOU INDICATED EARLIER THAT, WERE YOU
24 ABLE TO PICK ANYBODY ELSE OUT OF ANY OTHER
25 LINEUPS?

DIRECT - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY SOL. SORENSON

244

1 A. NO, SIR.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I BEG THE COURT'S
3 INDULGENCE.

4 THE COURT: OKAY.

5 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, MS. PARSLEY, WILL
6 YOU PLEASE ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT OTHER COUNSEL
7 HAS.

8 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU. ALRIGHT, MR.
9 LACKEY.

10 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
11 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
12 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
13 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
14 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. LACKEY

245

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ASHLEY R. PARSLEY

BY MR. LACKEY:

Q. YOU SAID EARLIER IN THE NIGHT YOU WERE IN THE
APARTMENT WITH MR. PRINGLE AND ALSO SHANNON
MITCHELL, IS THAT CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. WAS ANYBODY ELSE IN THERE AT THAT TIME?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND YOU SAID THERE WAS A SINGLE INDIVIDUAL
WHO CAME IN EARLIER THAT EVENING?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND HOW, ABOUT HOW LONG BEFORE THE ROBBERY WAS
THAT?

A. ABOUT TWENTY MINUTES.

Q. OKAY. AND YOU STATED THAT SHANNON MITCHELL KNEW
WHO THAT INDIVIDUAL WAS THAT CAME IN?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND IT WAS JUST ONE SINGLE INDIVIDUAL?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. THERE WAS ALSO A DOG IN THE HOUSE YOU
SAID?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND WHOSE DOG WAS THAT?

A. CHARLES PRINGLE'S.

Q. OKAY. AS FAR AS THE, WHAT THE STATE ENTERED INTO

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. LACKEY

246

1 EVIDENCE, YOU IDENTIFIED AN INDIVIDUAL - - -

2 THE COURT: MR. LACKEY, I DON'T MEAN TO INTERRUPT
3 YOU. WHICH ONE, JUST FOR THE RECORD?

4 Q. YOU IDENTIFIED AN INDIVIDUAL, I WAS REFERRING TO
5 STATE'S THREE.

6 THE COURT: STATE'S THREE? OKAY, SORRY.

7 MR. LACKEY: THAT'S ALRIGHT.

8 Q. YOU IDENTIFIED AN INDIVIDUAL IN A PHOTO LINEUP IN
9 STATE'S NUMBER THREE?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AND ALSO REFERRING TO STATE'S NUMBER FOUR, YOU
12 IDENTIFIED AN INDIVIDUAL IN THAT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. AND YOU PUT YOUR INITIALS BESIDE THAT ONE?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND STATE'S NUMBER FIVE, YOU IDENTIFIED AN
17 INDIVIDUAL THERE AND WROTE YOUR INITIALS BESIDE
18 IT AS WELL?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. DID YOU IDENTIFY ANYBODY ELSE IN ANY OTHER
21 PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUPS?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. DID YOU SEE -- YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER THAT YOU
24 DIDN'T SEE ANYBODY ELSE WHO CAME INTO THE
25 APARTMENT THAT NIGHT?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. LACKEY

247

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. YOU WERE FACE DOWN ON THE GROUND?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. AND YOU SAID YOU WEREN'T SURE HOW MANY
5 PEOPLE CAME IN, IS THAT CORRECT?

6 A. CORRECT.

7 MR. LACKEY: I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS, YOUR
8 HONOR.

9 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. LACKEY.

10 MS. ULLMAN, YOUR WITNESS.

11 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
12 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
13 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
14 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
15 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

248

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ASHLEY R. PARSLEY

BY MS. ULLMAN:

Q. GOOD MORNING.

A. GOOD MORNING.

Q. I SEE YOU'RE WEARING GLASSES TODAY. DO YOU
ALWAYS WEAR GLASSES?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. AND ON THE DATE OF THIS INCIDENT YOU HAD YOUR
GLASSES ON?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU SAID YOU MET CHARLES PRINGLE AT
LAY LOW'S IN SUMMERVILLE, CORRECT?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. AND THAT'S A CLUB?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. AND BY CLUB YOU MEAN A BAR, THEY SERVE ALCOHOL
THERE?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. AND YOU MET HIM THE SUNDAY BEFORE THIS, IS THAT
CORRECT?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. ALRIGHT. SO, ABOUT FIVE DAYS PREVIOUSLY, AND YOU
MET HIM ON THAT DATE. DID YOU GO TO HIS HOUSE ON
THAT DATE?

A. YES, MA'AM.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

249

1 Q. AND YOU STARTED STAYING THERE ON THAT DATE?

2 A. YES, MA'AM.

3 Q. THAT WAS THE SUNDAY PREVIOUS TO THIS, RIGHT?

4 A. YES, MA'AM.

5 Q. NOW, YOU KNEW CHARLES WAS SELLING DRUGS FROM THE
6 APARTMENT, CORRECT?

7 A. YES, MA'AM.

8 Q. AND YOU ACTUALLY HELPED HIM DO, HELPED HIM SELL
9 THE DRUGS?

10 A. YES, MA'AM.

11 Q. AND YOU ACTUALLY TOLD OTHER PEOPLE THAT YOU AND
12 CHARLES WERE SELLING DRUGS FROM THE HOUSE,
13 CORRECT?

14 A. NO, MA'AM.

15 Q. YOU DIDN'T AT SOME POINT TEXT HASSAN GADDIST AND
16 TELL HIM THAT YOU WERE LIVING IN ORANGEBURG
17 SELLING DRUGS?

18 A. NO, MA'AM.

19 Q. NOW, CHARLES PRINGLE WAS OBVIOUSLY CONCERNED FOR
20 YOUR SAFETY, HIS SAFETY AND HE GAVE YOU A PISTOL
21 FOR YOUR PROTECTION, CORRECT?

22 A. YES, MA'AM.

23 Q. AND WAS THAT THE ONLY WEAPON IN HIS HOUSE?

24 A. YES, MA'AM.

25 Q. DO YOU KNOW THAT BECAUSE YOU LOOKED OR HE TOLD

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

250

1 YOU?

2 A. HE TOLD ME.

3 Q. NOW, THE NIGHT OF THIS INCIDENT YOU ACTUALLY HAD
4 THE PISTOL OUT IN THE LIVING ROOM?

5 A. YES, MA'AM.

6 Q. AND WHEN YOU ANSWERED THE DOOR YOU HAD IT IN YOUR
7 HAND?

8 A. YES, MA'AM.

9 Q. STEPPING BACK A LITTLE BIT BEFORE THE INCIDENT
10 OCCURRED, YOU SAID YOU AND CHARLES WERE AT THE
11 HOUSE ALONE, JUST THE TWO OF YOU?

12 A. YES, MA'AM.

13 Q. AND HE WAS SLEEPING?

14 A. YES, MA'AM.

15 Q. WHAT WERE YOU DOING?

16 A. IN MY ROOM.

17 Q. YOU WERE IN YOUR ROOM?

18 A. YES, MA'AM.

19 Q. YOU SAID SOMEONE HAD COME TO THE DOOR AND YOU
20 ANSWERED THE DOOR, AND IT WAS SHANNON?

21 A. YES, MA'AM.

22 Q. ALRIGHT. WHEN SHANNON GOT THERE DID HE ASK WHERE
23 OLD SCHOOL WAS OR WHERE CHARLES PRINGLE WAS?

24 A. YES, MA'AM.

25 Q. WHAT DID YOU TELL HIM?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

251

- 1 A. HE WAS SLEEPING.
- 2 Q. AND SHANNON STUCK AROUND ANYWAY AND HUNG OUT?
- 3 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 4 Q. AND YOU HAD KNOWN HIM MAYBE FIVE DAYS, FOUR DAYS?
- 5 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 6 Q. ALRIGHT. AND YOU SAID THAT YOU GUYS SAT AND
- 7 TALKED?
- 8 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 9 Q. DID YOU GUYS SMOKE MARIJUANA TOGETHER?
- 10 A. NO, MA'AM.
- 11 Q. WHAT DID Y'ALL TALK ABOUT?
- 12 A. JUST TALKING.
- 13 Q. AND YOU HAD KNOWN HIM FOR FOUR DAYS?
- 14 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 15 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, WHILE THE TWO OF YOU WERE THERE
- 16 CHARLES STAYED IN HIS ROOM THE WHOLE TIME?
- 17 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 18 Q. AND THEN THERE WAS ANOTHER KNOCK AT THE DOOR?
- 19 A. THE DOOR BELL RANG.
- 20 Q. THE DOOR BELL RANG. YOU DIDN'T ANSWER THE DOOR
- 21 THEN?
- 22 A. NO, MA'AM.
- 23 Q. SHANNON ANSWERED THE DOOR?
- 24 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 25 Q. AND HE LET WHOEVER WAS AT THE DOOR INTO THE

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

252

1 APARTMENT?

2 A. YES, MA'AM.

3 Q. AND THAT PERSON WANTED TO BUY MARIJUANA?

4 A. YES, MA'AM.

5 Q. OKAY. DID YOU SPEAK TO THAT PERSON AT ALL?

6 A. NO, MA'AM.

7 Q. YOU DIDN'T SELL HIM THE MARIJUANA?

8 A. NO, MA'AM.

9 Q. WHY NOT?

10 A. HE ASKED FOR DROE. I DIDN'T DEAL WITH DROE.

11 Q. SO, YOU SOLD MARIJUANA BUT NOT THE SPECIAL
12 MARIJUANA?

13 A. YES, MA'AM.

14 Q. OKAY. AND SHANNON DIDN'T SELL IT TO HIM EITHER?

15 A. NO, MA'AM.

16 Q. SO, CHARLES PRINGLE WOKE UP AND CAME OUT AND
17 TALKED TO HIM?

18 A. YES, MA'AM.

19 Q. BUT HE DIDN'T SELL HIM ANY DROE EITHER, RIGHT?

20 A. NO, MA'AM.

21 Q. OKAY. AND THAT PERSON THEN LEFT?

22 A. YES, MA'AM.

23 Q. WHAT TIME DO YOU THINK HE LEFT?

24 A. PROBABLY ABOUT, PROBABLY EIGHT:FIFTY.

25 Q. OKAY. YOU SAID YOU WERE IN YOUR ROOM, CHARLES

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

253

1 WAS IN A ROOM BEFORE ALL OF THESE PEOPLE STARTED
2 COMING OVER. WHAT WERE YOU DOING, WERE YOU
3 WATCHING T.V., READING A BOOK, SLEEPING, WHAT
4 WERE YOU DOING?

5 A. I WAS LAYING DOWN.

6 Q. YOU WERE LAYING DOWN? NOW, AT ANYTIME WHILE
7 SHANNON WAS THERE WERE YOU WATCHING T.V., OR YOU
8 GUYS JUST SAT AND TALKED, WAS THERE ANYTHING
9 GOING ON IN THE APARTMENT OTHER THAN YOU TWO
10 TALKING?

11 A. NO, MA'AM.

12 Q. OKAY. NOW, AFTER SHANNON LEFT, AFTER THIS
13 UNKNOWN PERSON THAT YOU DIDN'T KNOW LEFT WITHOUT
14 HIS DROE, THERE WAS ANOTHER DOOR BELL RING, IS
15 THAT CORRECT?

16 A. CORRECT.

17 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THIS TIME YOU ANSWERED THE DOOR?

18 A. YES, MA'AM.

19 Q. AND YOU WERE IN THE LIVING ROOM?

20 A. YES, MA'AM.

21 Q. AND CHARLES PRINGLE WAS SITTING IN THE KITCHEN?

22 A. YES, MA'AM.

23 Q. I IMPLIED THAT, WAS HE SITTING IN THE KITCHEN,
24 STANDING IN THE KITCHEN, WHAT WAS HE DOING?

25 A. HE WAS STANDING IN THE KITCHEN.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

254

- 1 Q. HE WAS STANDING IN THE KITCHEN. NOW, YOU WENT TO
2 THE DOOR, YOU'VE GOT A PISTOL IN YOUR HAND?
3 A. YES, MA'AM.
4 Q. AND YOU LET WHOEVER WAS AT THAT DOOR IN THE
5 HOUSE?
6 A. YES, MA'AM.
7 Q. ALRIGHT. AND ON THAT NIGHT YOU HAD NEVER SEEN
8 THAT PERSON BEFORE?
9 A. NO, I NEVER SEEN THAT PERSON BEFORE.
10 Q. ALRIGHT. AND AS A MATTER OF FACT, HE HAD HIS
11 FACE COVERED IN SOME FASHION, CORRECT?
12 A. YES, MA'AM.
13 Q. ALRIGHT. SO, YOU OPENED THE DOOR WITH A PISTOL
14 IN YOUR HAND TO A MASKED PERSON AND LET THAT
15 PERSON IN THAT YOU DID NOT KNOW?
16 A. YES, MA'AM.
17 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, HE ALSO WANTED MARIJUANA?
18 A. YES, MA'AM.
19 Q. AND YOU WERE GOING TO HELP HIM?
20 A. YES, MA'AM.
21 Q. SO HE DIDN'T WANT THE SPECIAL KIND?
22 A. NO, MA'AM.
23 Q. OKAY. WHEN HE CAME IN AND ASKED YOU FOR
24 MARIJUANA WHAT WAS CHARLES PRINGLE DOING?
25 A. IN THE KITCHEN MAKING BAGS.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

255

- 1 Q. SO, HE WAS JUST STANDING IN THE KITCHEN THIS
2 WHOLE TIME MAKING BAGS?
- 3 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 4 Q. WHAT DOOR DID THIS PERSON COME TO, FRONT DOOR,
5 BACK DOOR?
- 6 A. FRONT DOOR.
- 7 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE IS THE FRONT DOOR, IS IT IN THE
8 LIVING ROOM OR THE BEDROOM, IN THE KITCHEN?
- 9 A. IT'S IN THE LIVING ROOM.
- 10 Q. IT'S IN THE LIVING ROOM. ALRIGHT. THE, YOU SAY
11 THIS PERSON HAD HIS FACE COVERED, SOME SORT OF
12 MASK ON HIS FACE, CAME IN, ASKED YOU FOR
13 MARIJUANA AND YOU LEANED DOWN TO GET THE
14 MARIJUANA BECAUSE IT WAS BESIDE WHERE YOU WERE
15 SITTING?
- 16 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 17 Q. ALRIGHT. AND ONCE YOU LEANED DOWN AND WEREN'T
18 LOOKING, THAT'S WHEN HE PUT A GUN IN YOUR FACE?
- 19 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 20 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHEN YOU ANSWERED THE DOOR IT WAS
21 ONE PERSON YOU LET IN?
- 22 A. IT WAS JUST ONE PERSON.
- 23 Q. OKAY. NOW, ONCE YOU LET THAT PERSON IN DID YOU
24 CLOSE THE DOOR?
- 25 A. THEY CLOSED THE DOOR.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

256

- 1 Q. SO WHOEVER CAME IN CLOSED THE DOOR BEHIND THE
2 BOTH OF YOU?
3 A. YES, MA'AM.
4 Q. OKAY. NOW, ONCE HE PUT THE GUN TO YOUR HEAD HE
5 TOLD YOU TO GET ON THE GROUND?
6 A. YES, MA'AM.
7 Q. AND YOU GOT ON THE GROUND?
8 A. YES, MA'AM.
9 Q. AND YOU LOOKED FACE DOWN?
10 A. YES, MA'AM.
11 Q. YOU NEVER TURNED RIGHT, NEVER TURNED LEFT?
12 A. NEVER TURNED.
13 Q. AND YOU HAD YOUR GLASSES ON YOUR FACE?
14 A. YES, MA'AM.
15 Q. OKAY. LOOKING AT THE CARPET YOU COULDN'T SEE AT
16 ALL WHAT WAS GOING ON, CORRECT?
17 A. CORRECT.
18 Q. YOU COULDN'T EVEN SEE PEOPLE'S SHOES?
19 A. CORRECT..
20 Q. AND YOU WEREN'T ABLE TO COUNT AT ALL HOW MANY
21 PEOPLE WERE IN THERE?
22 A. CORRECT.
23 Q. NOW, THE FIRST GUY ENTERED, YOU LAID ON THE
24 GROUND, YOU LAID THERE UNTIL EVERYBODY WAS GONE,
25 IS THAT CORRECT?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

257

- 1 A. CORRECT.
- 2 Q. ALRIGHT. AND ONCE YOU FELT EVERYONE HAD LEFT YOU
- 3 CALLED NINE ONE ONE?
- 4 A. YES, MA'AM.
- 5 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHILE SPEAKING TO DISPATCH YOU
- 6 COULDN'T GIVE ANY DESCRIPTION AT ALL OF ANY SORT
- 7 OF SUBJECTS?
- 8 A. CORRECT.
- 9 Q. YOU DIDN'T TELL THEM THERE WAS A CHUBBY PERSON IN
- 10 THE HOUSE?
- 11 A. NO, MA'AM.
- 12 Q. YOU DIDN'T TELL THEM THERE WAS A DARK SKINNED
- 13 PERSON IN THE HOUSE?
- 14 A. NO, MA'AM.
- 15 Q. YOU JUST TOLD THEM SOME PEOPLE HAD BEEN THERE TO
- 16 ROB CHARLES PRINGLE?
- 17 A. CORRECT.
- 18 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU HEARD GUN SHOTS BUT YOU HAVE NO
- 19 IDEA HOW MANY GUNS WERE THERE?
- 20 A. NO, MA'AM.
- 21 Q. NOW, SOMEONE, THIS PERSON THAT PUT A GUN TO YOUR
- 22 HEAD TOOK YOUR GUN, CORRECT?
- 23 A. CORRECT.
- 24 Q. OKAY. SO, AT THAT POINT YOU AT LEAST KNOW
- 25 THERE'S TWO GUNS IN THE HOUSE?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

258

1 A. YES, MA'AM.

2 Q. OKAY. WAS YOUR GUN LOADED?

3 A. YES, MA'AM.

4 Q. NOW, YOU TALKED A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE LIGHTS
5 WITH THE SOLICITOR, AND YOU SAID THEY WERE
6 COLORED LIGHTS. WHAT DO YOU MEAN BY THAT, WERE
7 THEY -- YOU KNOW, I WOULD CALL THESE MAYBE WHITE
8 LIGHTS. THEY'RE WEREN'T WHITE LIGHTS?

9 A. NO, MA'AM.

10 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER WHAT COLOR?

11 A. I DO NOT REMEMBER.

12 Q. OKAY. DO YOU REMEMBER COMING HERE TO COURT TO
13 TESTIFY BEFORE, BASICALLY THE WEEK OF
14 THANKSGIVING?

15 A. YES, MA'AM.

16 Q. ALRIGHT. AND AT THAT TIME YOU WERE PUT UNDER
17 OATH JUST LIKE YOU WERE HERE TODAY?

18 A. YES, MA'AM.

19 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, AT THAT TIME YOU WERE ASKED ABOUT
20 THE LIGHTING IN THE HOUSE AND I BELIEVE YOU
21 SPECIFICALLY SAID THERE WERE TWO LIGHTS, ONE WAS
22 A WHITE LIGHT AND ONE WAS A RED LIGHT. DO YOU
23 REMEMBER THAT?

24 A. NO, I DON'T REMEMBER THAT.

25 MS. ULLMAN: MAY I APPROACH THE WITNESS?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

259

THE COURT: YOU MAY.

Q. I'M GOING TO SHOW YOU -- THIS IS THE TRANSCRIPT FROM THAT HEARING WHERE YOU WERE HERE AND MS. WALKER WAS HERE WRITING DOWN EVERYTHING YOU SAID, AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT HERE. WHEN YOU WERE ASKED ABOUT THE LIGHT BULBS, WHAT DID YOU SAY WHAT COLOR THE LIGHT WAS?

A. RED.

Q. ALRIGHT. AND, AND YOU WERE ALSO SPECIFICALLY ASKED WERE THERE ANY BLUE LIGHTS IN THIS ROOM, CORRECT? AND YOU SAID?

A. NO.

Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, YOU HAD TESTIFIED THAT YOU HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO CALL SHANNON AFTER THE INCIDENT?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. WHEN DID YOU DO THAT?

A. WHEN I WAS SITTING IN THE POLICE CAR.

Q. ALRIGHT. SO, AFTER THE RESPONDING OFFICER ESCORTED YOU OUT OF THE APARTMENT YOU SAT IN THE POLICE CAR ALONE?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. AND YOU CALLED SHANNON?

A. YES, MA'AM.

Q. WHAT PHONE DID YOU USE?

A. I USED CHARLES'S PHONE.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

260

1 Q. SO, YOU HAD FOUND HIS PHONE TO CALL NINE ONE ONE
2 AND YOU KEPT HIS PHONE ON YOU?

3 A. YES, MA'AM.

4 Q. NOW, YOU MET WITH INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT LATER, I
5 GUESS EARLY MORNING SATURDAY, LATE FRIDAY NIGHT
6 AT THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE, IS THAT CORRECT?

7 A. YES, MA'AM.

8 Q. AND AT THAT TIME HE ASKED YOU WHAT HAPPENED, IS
9 THAT CORRECT?

10 A. YES, MA'AM.

11 Q. ALRIGHT. AND YOU DID WRITE A STATEMENT FOR HIM?

12 A. YES, MA'AM.

13 Q. AND YOU TOLD HIM WHAT HAD HAPPENED?

14 A. YES, MA'AM.

15 Q. AND IN THAT STATEMENT, IN YOUR DISCUSSIONS WITH
16 MR. SHUMPERT, OR INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT, EXCUSE
17 ME, YOU SAID THAT ONE PERSON CAME TO THE DOOR?

18 A. YES, MA'AM.

19 Q. HE WAS DARK SKINNED AND WORE BLUE?

20 A. YES, MA'AM.

21 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THAT'S THE ONLY DESCRIPTION YOU
22 GAVE?

23 A. CORRECT.

24 Q. ALRIGHT. YOU DIDN'T MENTION AT ALL THIS CHUBBY
25 PERSON THAT MAY HAVE COME IN?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

261

1 A. NO, MA'AM.

2 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, IN YOUR STATEMENT YOU ALSO TOLD
3 THE POLICE THAT SOMEBODY MIGHT HAVE BEEN FAMILIAR
4 BUT YOU DON'T REALLY REMEMBER WHO IT WAS AND YOU
5 DON'T THINK IT'S HIM. NOW, YOU DIDN'T DISCUSS
6 THAT ANY FURTHER, AM I CORRECT?

7 A. NO, MA'AM.

8 Q. DID YOU EVER TELL THE POLICE THE NAME OF THE
9 PERSON OR GIVE A DESCRIPTION OF THE PERSON THAT
10 YOU THOUGHT WAS FAMILIAR AND COULD HAVE BEEN
11 THERE?

12 A. NO, MA'AM.

13 Q. NOW, ON MARCH NINETEENTH YOU MET WITH
14 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT AGAIN, AM I RIGHT?

15 A. YES, MA'AM.

16 Q. AND AT THAT TIME YOU GUYS WENT OVER PHOTO
17 LINEUPS?

18 A. YES, MA'AM.

19 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER HOW MANY PHOTO LINEUPS HE SHOWED
20 YOU?

21 A. NO, I DO NOT REMEMBER.

22 Q. NOW, IN STATE'S EXHIBIT FIVE YOU CIRCLED THE
23 FIRST PERSON IN THIS, AM I CORRECT?

24 A. YES, MA'AM.

25 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, UNDER OATH TODAY YOU SAID THAT

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MS. ULLMAN

262

1 THAT WAS THE CHUBBY PERSON YOU SAID, AND THAT
2 THAT'S WHAT YOU HAD PUT ON YOUR AFFIDAVIT, BUT
3 THAT'S NOT WHAT YOU TOLD THE POLICE, AM I
4 RIGHT?

5 A. CORRECT.

6 Q. WHAT YOU TOLD THE POLICE WAS, IT'S POSSIBLE THAT
7 HE'S A PERSON THAT ENTERED THE HOUSE, YOU DIDN'T
8 SEE HIS FACE?

9 A. CORRECT.

10 Q. OKAY. AND JUST TO REITERATE, THE LIGHTS WERE
11 VERY DIM?

12 A. CORRECT.

13 Q. YOU WERE FACE DOWN?

14 A. CORRECT.

15 Q. YOU WERE NERVOUS?

16 A. YES.

17 Q. YOU HAD A GUN POINTED AT YOU?

18 A. CORRECT.

19 Q. AND THERE'S NO REAL WAY FOR YOU TO BE SURE IF THE
20 PERSON YOU PICKED OUT OF THAT LINEUP IS A PERSON
21 THAT WAS AT THE APARTMENT, AM I RIGHT?

22 A. CORRECT.

23 MS. ULLMAN: I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS, YOUR
24 HONOR.

25 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MS. ULLMAN.

1 MR. PALMER.

2 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

3 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

4 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
5 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
6 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
7 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
8 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. PALMER

264

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ASHLEY R. PARSLEY

BY MR. PALMER:

Q. WHAT KIND OF GUN DID YOU HAVE THAT NIGHT?

A. A SMITH AND WESSON PISTOL.

Q. WHAT CALIBER?

A. I DON'T KNOW.

Q. YOU DON'T KNOW?

A. NO.

Q. HOW MANY ROUNDS DID IT HOLD?

A. I DON'T KNOW.

Q. WHERE DID YOU GET IT?

A. FROM CHARLES PRINGLE.

Q. DO YOU KNOW HOW TO USE A GUN?

A. YES.

Q. HAVE YOU EVER SHOT A GUN BEFORE THAT NIGHT, HAVE
YOU EVER HELD A GUN BEFORE THAT NIGHT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. WHAT KIND OF GUN?

A. I WAS IN BASIC TRAINING IN THE ARMY.

Q. REALLY?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. HOW LONG AGO WAS THAT?

A. THAT WAS IN MARCH OF TWO THOUSAND SEVEN.

Q. OKAY. SO, WHEN DID YOU GET OUT OF THE ARMY?

A. JUNE, TWO THOUSAND SEVEN.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. PALMER

265

1 Q. AND WHAT DID YOU DO AFTER THAT?

2 A. I WENT HOME.

3 Q. WHERE IS HOME?

4 A. IT'S NOT AROUND HERE.

5 Q. WELL, TELL ME WHERE IT IS.

6 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, I WOULD OBJECT.

7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: IT'S NOT RELEVANT.

8 SOLICITOR SORENSON: MAY WE APPROACH?

9 THE COURT: YES, SIR, YOU CAN APPROACH.

10 (Whereupon, a bench conference
11 is had out of the hearing of
12 the jury and court reporter.)

13 Q. HOW DID YOU MEET MR. PRINGLE?

14 A. AT LAY LOW'S.

15 Q. AT THE TIME YOU SAID YOU MET HIM THAT NIGHT YOU
16 DECIDED TO MOVE IN WITH HIM?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. AND AT WHAT POINT DID YOU BECOME AWARE THAT HE
19 WAS DEALING WITH MARIJUANA?

20 A. THAT NIGHT.

21 Q. SO THAT BECAME YOUR JOB, DIDN'T IT?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND WHEN YOU LIVED IN HIS APARTMENT HOW MANY
24 MARIJUANA SALES DID YOU MAKE?

25 A. I DON'T KNOW.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. PALMER

266

1 Q. HOW MUCH MONEY DID YOU MAKE?

2 A. I DON'T KNOW.

3 Q. HOW MANY PEOPLE DID YOU SELE MARIJUANA TO?

4 A. I DON'T REMEMBER.

5 Q. YOU HAD A GUN IN YOUR HAND?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. WHAT WERE YOU GOING TO DO WITH THE GUN?

8 A. IT WAS LIKE A ---

9 Q. YOU COULD ALWAYS ...

10 A. --- I WAS NOT SHOOTING IT, IT WAS TO PROTECT ME.

11 Q. FROM WHAT?

12 A. IF ANYBODY TRIED TO COME IN.

13 Q. SO, THAT WAS STANDARD PROCEDURE FOR YOU, TO OPEN
14 THE DOOR WITH A GUN IN YOUR HAND?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. DID YOU EVER SHOOT THAT PARTICULAR GUN?

17 A. NO, SIR.

18 Q. NOW, I AM GOING TO ASK YOU, STATE'S EXHIBIT
19 NUMBER THREE, RIGHT HERE, THIS ONE. NOW, YOU
20 REMEMBER BACK ON NOVEMBER TWENTY-THIRD WE WERE IN
21 THIS COURTROOM TOGETHER AND YOU DESCRIBED -- HOW
22 YOU TALKED ABOUT A LIGHT SKINNED GUY CAME TO THE
23 DOOR THAT NIGHT, MEDIUM BUILD, WITH LIGHT SKIN,
24 WITH TWISTIES, AND I ASKED YOU HOW DO YOU
25 DETERMINE IF SOMEONE IS LIGHT SKINNED?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. PALMER

267

1 A. NO.

2 Q. WELL, IF I SAID YOU ANSWERED, IT'S A COMPLEXION,
3 DO YOU HAVE ANY QUESTION ABOUT THAT?

4 A. NO.

5 Q. AND THEN IF I SAID, SO THAT WAS YOUR ANSWER? IS
6 IT A COMPLEXION, A TEXTURE OR A COLOR? AND YOU
7 ANSWERED IT WAS A COLOR, DO YOU AGREE?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. AND YOU DESCRIBED THIS INDIVIDUAL THAT CAME IN
10 THAT NIGHT AS MEDIUM BUILD, LIGHT SKINNED, --
11 WITH LIEUTENANT SHUMPERT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. IT WAS A LIGHT ON, BUT THE ROOM WAS DIMLY LIT,
14 CORRECT?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND YOU REMEMBER I ASKED YOU ABOUT THAT ON
17 NOVEMBER TWENTY-THIRD OF THIS YEAR, AND I ASKED
18 YOU WHO ON THIS PAGE WAS LIGHT SKINNED, AND WHAT
19 WAS YOUR ANSWER?

20 A. NUMBER THREE.

21 Q. ANY OTHER PEOPLE YOU CONSIDERED LIGHT SKINNED ON
22 THIS PAGE?

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. SO, YOUR TESTIMONY IS, THIS ONE YOU FIGURED IS
25 THE ONLY INDIVIDUAL THAT WAS CONSIDERED TO BE

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. PALMER

268

1 LIGHT SKINNED. AND YOU REMEMBER WE TALKED ABOUT
2 THAT?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. AND THIS INDIVIDUAL YOU SAID CAME IN AND WANTED
5 TO BUY SOME DROE, AND THEN HE LEFT?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND YOU NEVER SAW THAT SAME GUY, THAT SAME
8 INDIVIDUAL AGAIN THAT NIGHT, DID YOU, OR ANYTIME
9 AFTER THAT, IS THAT CORRECT?

10 A. NO.

11 Q. AND THAT WAS YOUR TESTIMONY AS WELL ON NOVEMBER
12 TWENTY-THIRD?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. NOW, I ASKED YOU A COUPLE OF OTHER THINGS, AND I
15 AM GOING TO SHOW YOU ACTUALLY WHAT YOUR TESTIMONY
16 WAS.

17 MR. PALMER: YOUR HONOR, MAY I APPROACH THE
18 WITNESS?

19 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

20 Q. DO YOU HAVE ANY TROUBLE SEEING THAT?

21 A. NO, SIR.

22 Q. AND LOOK AT LINE FOUR. MY QUESTION WAS, "HOW
23 CLOSE DID YOU SAY YOU GOT TO HIM IN THE FEW
24 MINUTES HE WAS IN THE ROOM?" YOUR ANSWER WAS,
25 "NOT CLOSE."

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. PALMER

269

- 1 A. I DON'T REMEMBER.
- 2 Q. YOU DON'T REMEMBER SAYING THAT?
- 3 A. NO.
- 4 Q. DO YOU HAVE ANY REASON TO BELIEVE THAT YOU DIDN'T
- 5 SAY THAT?
- 6 A. I DON'T REMEMBER.
- 7 Q. YOU DON'T REMEMBER?
- 8 A. I DON'T REMEMBER.
- 9 Q. AND THEN WHEN I ASKED YOU, "HOW LONG WAS HE
- 10 THERE?" AND YOU SAID, "NOT VERY LONG." DO YOU
- 11 REMEMBER SAYING THAT?
- 12 A. YES, SIR.
- 13 Q. AND THAT'S STILL YOUR TESTIMONY, THAT THE LIGHT
- 14 WAS DIM, YOU HAD NEVER SEEN THIS INDIVIDUAL
- 15 BEFORE, AND HE WASN'T THERE VERY LONG, DOES THAT
- 16 ABOUT SUM IT UP?
- 17 A. YES, SIR.
- 18 Q. AND THE ONLY GUY THAT YOU CONSIDER LIGHT SKINNED
- 19 ON THIS PAGE IS NUMBER THREE?
- 20 A. CORRECT.
- 21 Q. WHEN THERE WAS A SECOND KNOCK AT THE DOOR, THAT
- 22 WAS A DIFFERENT GUY, WASN'T IT?
- 23 A. YES, SIR.
- 24 Q. DARK SKINNED?
- 25 A. YES, SIR.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. PALMER

270

1 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU.

2 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. PALMER. MR. MELLARD.

3 MR. MELLARD: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

4 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

5 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
6 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
7 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
8 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
9 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. MELLARD

271

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ASHLEY R. PARSLEY

BY MR. MELLARD:

Q. YOU MET THIS DRUG DEALER AT A BAR?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND YOU MOVED IN WITH THIS DRUG DEALER ON
THE SAME NIGHT THAT YOU MET?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND YOU LIVED THERE ABOUT A WEEK BEFORE
THIS HAPPENED?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND YOU SOLD DRUGS DURING THAT WEEK?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND YOU CARRIED HIS PISTOL AROUND DURING THAT
WEEK?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. ALRIGHT, NOW, I BELIEVE MS. ULLMAN ASKED YOU IF
YOU WERE USING DRUGS. YOU'RE TELLING US YOU DON'T
USE DRUGS?

A. NO, I DO NOT USE DRUGS.

Q. YOU'VE NEVER USED DRUGS?

A. I HAVE, BUT NOT THEN.

Q. WELL, DID YOU USE DRUGS DURING THAT WEEK?

A. OH, YEAH, THAT WEEK.

Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DRUGS DID YOU USE EARLIER THAT
WEEK?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. MELLARD

272

1 A. MARIJUANA.

2 Q. MARIJUANA?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. ALRIGHT. AND DID YOU SMOKE THE DROE THAT WE'VE -

5

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. SO WHERE DID YOU GET THIS MARIJUANA FROM
8 THAT YOU WERE USING?

9 A. CHARLES PRINGLE.

10 Q. OKAY. AND IS THAT WHY YOU MOVED IN WITH HIM
11 BECAUSE HE WAS GIVING YOU MARIJUANA?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. SO, YOU MET HIM AT A BAR, MOVED IN, BUT IT WASN'T
14 BECAUSE OF MARIJUANA?

15 A. CORRECT.

16 MR. MELLARD: ALRIGHT. THAT'S ALL.

17 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. MELLARD.

18 ALRIGHT, MR. KOGER.

19 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
20 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
21 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
22 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
23 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. KOGER

273

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ASHLEY R. PARSLEY

BY MR. KOGER:

Q. MS. PARSLEY, YOU GAVE A STATEMENT SOON AFTER THE
INCIDENT, CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND IT WAS A COUPLE OF HOURS AFTER THE INCIDENT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. I WANT YOU TO IDENTIFY THIS FOR ME.

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. IS THAT OUR STATEMENT?

A. YES, SIR.

THE COURT: DO YOU WANT TO MAKE ...

Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DATE WAS THAT SIGNED?

A. MARCH THIRTEEN.

Q. AND AT WHAT TIME?

A. TWO:TWENTY-FIVE A.M.

MR. KOGER: YOUR HONOR, I'D LIKE TO SUBMIT THIS
AS DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT NUMBER ONE.

THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

MR. SORENSON: NO OBJECTION.

THE COURT: OKAY. IF YOU'D MARK THAT AS
DEFENDANT'S -- YOU REPRESENT MR.

MR. KOGER: MR. SHIVERS, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: OKAY. DEFENDANT SHIVERS' -- I GUESS
WE NEED TO DESIGNATE IT THAT WAY.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. KOGER

274

1 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

2 THE COURT: DEFENDANT SHIVERS, NUMBER ONE.

3 (Defendant Shivers Exhibit One
4 marked and filed.)

5 Q. OKAY. MS. PARSLEY, CAN YOU READ THIS STATEMENT
6 FOR THE COURT -- THAT IS YOUR HANDWRITING,
7 CORRECT?

8 A. CORRECT.

9 Q. READ IT FOR ME.

10 A. "I, ASHLEY PARSLEY, AM NOT UNDER ARREST NOR AM I
11 BEING DETAINED FOR CRIMINAL OFFENSES, BECAUSE
12 SOME OF THE EVENTS THAT I'M ABOUT TO MAKE KNOWN,
13 WITHOUT BEING ACCUSED OR QUESTIONED ABOUT MY
14 CRIMINAL OFFENSES REGARDING THE FACTS THAT I AM
15 ABOUT TO STATE. I VOLUNTEER THE FOLLOWING
16 INFORMATION ON MY OWN FREE WILL FOR WHATEVER
17 PURPOSE IT MAY SERVE. I AM TWENTY-THREE YEARS
18 OLD AND - - -

19 Q. MS. PARSLEY, PLEASE SLOW DOWN A LITTLE BIT SO
20 THE COURT REPORTER CAN GET IT.

21 A. OKAY. "I AM TWENTY-THREE YEARS OF AGE, AND I
22 LIVE AT MARION, SOUTH CAROLINA, TWO NINE FIVE
23 SEVEN ONE. I WENT TO THE DOOR HOLDING A PISTOL
24 AND I OPENED IT FOR A DARK SKINNED DUDE WEARING
25 BLUE. I SAT THE PISTOL DOWN AND HE ASKED FOR A

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. ROGER

275

1 NICK, SO WHILE I WAS OPENING THE DRAWER TO GET IT
2 THE DUDE PULLED OUT HIS GUN IN MY FACE AND TOLD
3 ME TO GET ON THE FLOOR. SO, I DID AS INSTRUCTED.
4 THEY STARTED RIPPING UP CHAIRS AND TALKING LOUD.
5 I WAS FACE DOWN ON THE FLOOR AND ALL OF A SUDDEN
6 I HEARD GUN SHOTS. THEN THEY LEFT WITH THE DOOR
7 OPEN, AND I CALLED NINE ONE ONE AND WAITED FOR
8 THE COPS TO GET THERE. I AM INNOCENT AND I DON'T
9 HAVE ANYTHING TO DO WITH THIS MURDER. PLEASE LET
10 ME GO HOME. CHARLES PRINGLE, A/K/A OLD SCHOOL,
11 WAS A GREAT MAN TO ME. I MET HIM AT LAY LOW'S IN
12 SUMMERVILLE LAST SUNDAY. HE TOOK ME IN HIS HOUSE
13 BECAUSE THE HOUSE I WAS LIVING AT HARLEYVILLE,
14 THE LIGHTS WENT OUT. I JUST DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY
15 SOMEONE WANTS TO KILL HIM. HE MADE SURE I ATE
16 EVERY DAY AND GAS WAS IN MY CAR, AND EVERYTHING
17 THAT WOULD MAKE ME FEEL AT HOME. THE DUDES THAT
18 SHOT HIM, ONE OF THEM LOOKED FAMILIAR BUT I DON'T
19 THINK IT'S HIM. I CAN'T BELIEVE I SAW SOMEONE
20 DIE. IT'S A VERY SCARY FEELING. I THOUGHT I WAS
21 GOING TO DIE TONIGHT BECAUSE IT WAS A GUN AT THE
22 BACK OF MY HEAD. I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY THE
23 DIDN'T BOTHER ME. I PROMISE NOT TO BE INVOLVED
24 WITH ANYMORE PEOPLE THAT IS BAD. OLD SCHOOL WAS
25 MY FRIEND."

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. KOGER

276

1 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU WOULD AGREE, SINCE YOU JUST READ
2 THIS PARTICULAR STATEMENT, THAT THE DESCRIPTION
3 OF THE SECOND PERSON THAT CAME TO THE DOOR WAS
4 DARK SKINNED AND WEARING BLUE. CORRECT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. AND YOU MADE AN IDENTIFICATION IN A
7 LINEUP A COUPLE OF DAYS LATER, CORRECT?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. WOULD YOU SAY YOU MADE THAT IDENTIFICATION ON
10 MARCH NINETEENTH?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WAS APPROXIMATELY SIX OR SEVEN
13 DAYS LATER?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY.

16 THE COURT: MR. KOGER, I DON'T MEAN TO INTERRUPT.
17 WHAT EXHIBIT IS THAT?

18 MR. KOGER: STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER FOUR.

19 THE COURT: OKAY, STATE'S NUMBER FOUR.

20 MR. KOGER: YES.

21 THE COURT: JUST SO I'LL HAVE IT STRAIGHT. THANK
22 YOU, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. AND YOU WOULD AGREE IN DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT
24 NUMBER ONE THAT YOU DID NOT MENTION THAT THE
25 PISTOL WAS A NINE MILLIMETER, CORRECT?

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. KOGER

277

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. AND YOU WOULD AGREE THAT THESE FACTS RIGHT
3 HERE WAS CLOSER, THIS STATEMENT WAS CLOSER TO THE
4 EVENT HAPPENING, CORRECT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. NOW, DO YOU RECALL YOUR TESTIMONY BACK
7 FROM THE MOTIONS HEARING ON NOVEMBER TWENTY-
8 THIRD, AS FAR AS I ASKED YOU SEVERAL QUESTIONS
9 ABOUT SKIN COLOR, CORRECT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU RECALL THAT I ASKED HOW YOU
12 WOULD CONSIDER YOUR SKIN COLOR?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. AND HOW WOULD YOU CONSIDER YOUR SKIN COLOR?

15 A. DARK SKIN.

16 Q. DO YOU RECALL, I ASKED YOU CONSIDERING
17 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT'S SKIN COLOR?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. AND HOW WOULD YOU CONSIDER HIS SKIN COLOR?

20 A. DARK SKIN.

21 Q. DO YOU RECALL ME ASKING YOU TO CONSIDER ATTORNEY
22 WISE'S SKIN COLOR?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. AND HOW WOULD YOU CONSIDER HIS SKIN COLOR?

25 A. FAIR SKIN.

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. KOGER

278

1 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU RECALL ME ASKING YOU ABOUT MY
2 DEFENDANT, MR. SHIVER'S, SKIN COLOR?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. AND HOW DID YOU CONSIDER HIS SKIN COLOR?

5 A. LIGHT SKIN.

6 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU ALSO STATED THAT THERE WAS A DOG
7 IN THE HOUSE?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. DO YOU KNOW WHAT TYPE OF DOG IT WAS?

10 A. NOT RIGHT OFF.

11 Q. WAS IT A BIG DOG?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. WAS IT FOR PROTECTION?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND I THINK YOU STATED ON THE CROSS-EXAMINATION
16 FOR ATTORNEY PALMER THAT YOU DID NOT KNOW WHAT
17 TYPE OF GUN OR REVOLVER THAT YOU HAD WAS?

18 A. CORRECT.

19 Q. OKAY. DO YOU HAVE ANY TYPE OF KNOWLEDGE OF GUNS?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. BUT YOU DIDN'T KNOW WHAT TYPE OF GUN THAT
22 WAS?

23 A. CORRECT.

24 Q. AND IT IS YOUR TESTIMONY HERE, IN STATE EXHIBIT
25 NUMBER FOUR, THAT NUMBER THREE IS A DARK SKIN

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. KOGER

279

1 PERSON?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU, I HAVE NO FURTHER
4 QUESTIONS.

5 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.

6 ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

7 MR. SORENSON: NO, SIR.

8 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU, MA'AM, YOU MAY
9 STEP DOWN. OKAY?

10 DO Y'ALL WANT TO TAKE A BREAK NOW, DO Y'ALL HAVE
11 A SHORT WITNESS? WHAT DO Y'ALL WANT TO DO?

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT'S FINE, YOUR HONOR.

13 THE COURT: YOU WANT TO TAKE A BREAK?

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THE NEXT WITNESS IS KIND OF
15 LENGTHY.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,
17 WE ARE -- IT'S ABOUT NOON. I NOTICED THE FIRST DAY --
18 WHAT I'M GOING TO ASK YOU TO DO IS, WE ARE GOING TO
19 TAKE A BREAK BUT I'M GOING TO ASK Y'ALL TO BE BACK,
20 REPORT BACK TO THE JURY ROOM AT ONE:THIRTY. AGAIN, I
21 KNOW YOU'RE GOING TO GET TIRED OF HEARING THIS, NUMBER
22 ONE, DON'T TALK AMONG YOURSELVES ABOUT WHAT YOU'VE
23 HEARD, DON'T TALK TO ANYBODY ELSE. DON'T TRY AN READ
24 ANYTHING ABOUT THIS. OKAY? OR WATCH ANYTHING ON T.V.
25 OR LISTEN TO ANYTHING ON THE RADIO. SO, I'M GOING TO

CROSS - ASHLEY R. PARSLEY BY MR. KOGER

280

1 EXCUSE Y'ALL AND ASK Y'ALL TO BE BACK IN THE JURY ROOM
2 AT ONE:THIRTY AND WE WILL PROCEED WITH THE TRIAL AT
3 THAT POINT. OKAY? THANK Y'ALL.

4 (Whereupon, the jury leaves
5 the courtroom and the following
6 takes place out of the presence
7 of the jury.)

8 BAILIFF: YOUR HONOR, ALL OF THE JURORS ARE OUT
9 OF THE COURTROOM.

10 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MA'AM. ANYTHING FROM THE
11 STATE BEFORE WE GO INTO RECESS?

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR, YOUR HONOR.
13 COULD I PUT SOMETHING ON THE RECORD VERY BRIEFLY?

14 THE COURT: SURE.

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: WITH REGARDS TO -- WE HAVE A
16 NUMBER OF SPECTATORS IN THE COURTROOM ON BOTH SIDES,
17 STATE AND DEFENSE. I JUST WANT TO INQUIRE, IS THERE
18 ANYTHING WITH REGARDS TO THE SAFETY OR WELL BEING OF
19 THE JURORS, ARE THEY BEING ESCORTED TO THEIR CARS IN
20 THE EVENING, OR ARE THEY BEING ASKED TO COME IN?

21 THE COURT: WELL, WE -- I ...

22 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THIS REALLY CAME UP TO ME
23 TODAY, I FOUND OUT AN INCIDENT THIS MORNING, THERE WAS
24 SOMETHING FOUND UNDERNEATH ONE OF THE BENCHES. IT WAS
25 AN INCIDENT DURING THE TRIAL TESTIMONY FROM ONE OF THE

THE COURT: THE JURY'S ALL BACK IN?

1 BAILIFF: THEY JUST GO BACK IN.

2 THE COURT: JUST GOT BACK? OKAY.

3 MR. MELLARD: AND YOUR HONOR, BEFORE WE CALL THE
4 JURY BACK IN I HAVE A MOTION.

5 THE COURT: OKAY.

6 COURT REPORTER: JUST ONE MOMENT, PLEASE.

7 THE COURT: WE'LL GET EVERYBODY KIND OF - - -

8 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR, I APOLOGIZE.

9 THE COURT: NO, NO, NO, I APPRECIATE IT, I'M NOT
10 COMPLAINING.

11 COURT REPORTER: I'M READY.

12 THE COURT: YOU'RE READY?

13 COURT REPORTER: EVERYBODY'S WAITING ON ME.

14 THE COURT: IS THE STATE READY TO PROCEED?

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

16 THE COURT: AND LET'S SEE, MR. MELLARD, BEFORE WE
17 GOT STARTED YOU MENTIONED TO ME THAT YOU HAD A MOTION?

18 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: YES, SIR, LET ME HEAR FROM YOU,
20 PLEASE SIR.

21 MR. MELLARD: LAST WEEK WHEN WE WERE TALKING
22 ABOUT THE TRIAL PROCEDURE, THE DEFENSE EXPRESSED SOME
23 CONCERNS ABOUT HAVING LAW ENFORCEMENT, A SIGNIFICANT
24 NUMBER OF LAW ENFORCEMENT IN THIS COURTROOM.

25 THE COURT: UH-HUH.

1 MR. MELLARD: AND I BELIEVE YOUR HONOR RULED THAT
2 YOU WOULD ALLOW OFFICERS TO SIT BEHIND THE DEFENDANTS,

3 ---

4 THE COURT: RIGHT.

5 MR. MELLARD: --- BUT YOU PUT THEM IN PLAIN
6 CLOTHES. AND THE REASON YOU PUT THEM IN PLAIN CLOTHES
7 IS SO THEY WOULD BE NOT VERY CONSPICUOUS, AND THE
8 JURY, IF THE JURY WANTED TO THINK THEY WERE POLICE
9 OFFICERS THEY COULD, BUT IF THEY DIDN'T WANT TO -- THE
10 JURY WOULDN'T KNOW WHETHER THEY WERE POLICE OFFICERS.

11 THE COURT: CORRECT.

12 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR. YOUR HONOR, TODAY WHEN
13 THE JURY WAS BEING ESCORTED OUT SOME OF THESE PEOPLE
14 WERE ESCORTING THE JURY OUT, - - -

15 THE COURT: OKAY.

16 MR. MELLARD: --- AND YOUR HONOR, YOU HAD TOLD
17 THE JURY I BELIEVE THAT, YOU KNOW, I BELIEVE THE
18 SOLICITOR HAD MADE A MOTION THAT THEY BE ESCORTED OUT
19 BY LAW ENFORCEMENT, AND SO THESE ARE THE LAW
20 ENFORCEMENT PEOPLE THAT ASSISTED IN ESCORTING THEM
21 OUT. THAT GOES AGAINST THE WHOLE POINT OF US PUTTING
22 THEM IN PLAIN CLOTHES. THE JURY NOW KNOWS THAT THESE
23 PEOPLE ARE POLICE OFFICERS. THE JURY NOW KNOWS THAT
24 THESE PEOPLE ARE SITTING BEHIND THE DEFENDANTS. I
25 BELIEVE IT SUBSTANTIALLY PREJUDICES THIS CASE, AND I

1 MOVE FOR A MISTRIAL, YOUR HONOR.

2 THE COURT: OKAY. I UNDERSTAND YOUR MOTION, AND
3 I UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE GETTING AT, BUT -- AND I --
4 IT DIDN'T CROSS MY MIND THAT THE GENTLEMEN SITTING
5 BEHIND YOU WOULD BE HELPING OUT EVEN THOUGH I'M SURE
6 THAT IT WAS, YOU KNOW, MEANT TO BE HELPFUL. I THINK
7 THE WAY WE'VE GOT EVERYTHING SET UP, I'M GOING TO NOTE
8 YOUR REQUEST FOR A MISTRIAL BUT I AM GOING TO DENY IT.
9 I'LL NOTE YOUR OBJECTION TO MY RULING.

10 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR, PLEASE DO.

11 THE COURT: OKAY, YES, SIR, AND YOUR OBJECTION IS
12 PRESERVED FOR THE RECORD.

13 YES, SIR?

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: COULD I PUT SOMETHING ON THE
15 RECORD, YOUR HONOR?

16 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I WAS ASKING SOME OF THE
18 AGENTS WHETHER THEY HAD ESCORTED THE JURORS AND THEY
19 ALL TELL ME THAT THEY DID NOT. DID YOU, GREGG,
20 ANTHONY? THE ONLY PERSONS THAT THEY ESCORTED OUT WERE
21 THE VICTIM'S FAMILY. THEY DIDN'T EVEN ESCORT OUT ANY
22 OF THE JURORS IN THIS CASE.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. WELL, MR. MELLARD, YOU SAW
24 SOME OF THE JURORS - - -

25 MR. MELLARD: WELL, I SAW THEM ESCORTING A GROUP

1 OF PEOPLE OUT. IF THEY'RE TELLING THIS COURT THAT
2 THAT IS THE VICTIM'S FAMILY, THEN I WILL ACCEPT THAT,
3 BUT I SAW THEM ESCORTING A GROUP OF PEOPLE OUT AND I
4 JUST WANTED TO BRING THAT TO THE COURT'S ATTENTION.

5 THE COURT: OKAY. AND YOU THOUGHT THEY WERE
6 JURORS? OKAY. ALRIGHT, SIR.

7 MR. MELLARD: SO, IF THEY'VE DONE NO WRONG THEN
8

9 THE COURT: OKAY. IF WE COULD JUST TRY AND MAKE
10 SURE -- I KNOW WE WANT TO KEEP THE JURY COMING IN AT
11 A, YOU KNOW, THROUGH A SEPARATE DOOR. WE'VE MADE
12 ARRANGEMENTS FOR THAT. AND YOU LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,
13 IF Y'ALL WILL, JUST, YOU KNOW, BE CAREFUL. I
14 APPRECIATE IT. OKAY? I APPRECIATE Y'ALL TRYING TO
15 HELP OUT THE VICTIM'S FAMILY AS WELL, BUT YOU KNOW,
16 WE'LL JUST KIND OF PROCEED AS WE ARE DOING. AND WE'VE
17 GOT THAT STRAIGHT THEN?

18 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYTHING ELSE FROM ANY
20 DEFENDANTS?

21 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

22 THE COURT: NOTHING ELSE? OKAY. ALRIGHT.
23 ALRIGHT, IF YOU WILL CALL THE JURY BACK IN WE'LL GET
24 READY TO GET STARTED AGAIN.

25 (Whereupon, the jury enters

1 the courtroom and the following
2 takes place in the presence
3 of the jury.)

4 THE COURT: WOULD Y'ALL CALL YOUR NEXT WITNESS?

5 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, MAY IT PLEASE THE
6 COURT?

7 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

8 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THE STATE CALLS NATHANIEL
9 HUBBARD.

10 CLERK: PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE, SIR,
11 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.

12 (Whereupon, Nathaniel Hubbard
13 is duly sworn.)

14 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT AND STATE YOUR FULL NAME FOR
15 THE COURT.

16 WITNESS: NATHANIEL HUBBARD.

17 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
18 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
19 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
20 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
21 sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - NATHANIEL HUBBARD BY SOL. SORENSON

287

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF NATHANIEL HUBBARD

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

Q. GOOD AFTERNOON, MR. HUBBARD?

A. GOOD MORNING, OR GOOD AFTER, EXCUSE ME.

Q. WOULD YOU PLEASE TELL THE JURY WHERE IT IS THAT
YOU'RE EMPLOYED?

A. WITH ALLTEL WIRELESS.

Q. OKAY. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU WORKED WITH ALLTEL
WIRELESS?

A. ROUGHLY ABOUT FIVE YEARS, JANUARY.

Q. OKAY. AND WHAT ARE YOUR CURRENT DUTIES AND
RESPONSIBILITIES THERE?

A. WELL, I'M A SALES MANAGER. I EMPLOY ROUGHLY
BETWEEN FIFTEEN AND SEVENTEEN SALES REPS. DAY TO
DAY OPERATIONS ARE, BASICALLY YOUR CELL PHONE
COMPANY, MAINTAINING RECORDS, SALES, JUST A
NUMBER OF THINGS, OPERATION OF A RETAIL STORE.

Q. OKAY. AND WHAT STORE IS IT THAT YOU WORK AT?

A. ORANGEBURG LOCATION.

Q. OKAY. THAT'S OVER NEAR THE MALL?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. THE PRINCE OF ORANGE MALL. AND AS PART OF YOUR
DUTIES HAVE ALSO BEEN DESIGNATED BY ALLTEL, BY
YOUR COMPANY YOU WORK FOR AS A RECORDS CUSTODIAN?

A. YES.

DIRECT - NATHANIEL HUBBARD BY SOL. SORENSON

288

1 Q. OKAY. AND YOU'VE BEEN SENT HERE TO COME TESTIFY
2 WITH REGARDS TO SOME RECORDS HERE TODAY?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. AND IF I COULD SHOW YOU WHAT HAS BEEN
5 MARKED AS STATE'S EXHIBITS THIRTY-FIVE, THIRTY-
6 SIX AND THIRTY-SEVEN. I ASK YOU IF YOU'VE HAD AN
7 OPPORTUNITY TO REVIEW THOSE RECORDS PRIOR TO
8 TODAY?

9 A. YES.

10 Q. OKAY. AND THOSE THREE SETS OF RECORDS THERE ARE
11 STATE'S THIRTY-FIVE, THIRTY-SIX AND THIRTY-SEVEN,
12 ARE THEY ALL KEPT IN THE REGULAR COURSE OF
13 BUSINESS WITH ALLTEL?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME
16 WE'D OFFER STATE'S THIRTY-FIVE, THIRTY-SIX AND THIRTY-
17 SEVEN INTO EVIDENCE.

18 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION, ANYTHING FROM DEFENSE?

19 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

20 MR. WISE: NO OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR.

21 MR. PALMER: I HAVEN'T REALLY SEEN THEM.

22 THE COURT: OH, I'M SORRY, I THOUGHT Y'ALL HAD
23 SEEN THOSE. I APOLOGIZE.

24 MR. PALMER: I JUST WANT TO SEE WHICH ONES
25 THEY'RE ENTERING.

DIRECT - NATHANIEL HUBBARD BY SOL. SORENSON

289

1 THE COURT: OH, OKAY.

2 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION

3 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

4 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

5 THE COURT: OKAY, THANK YOU, SIR.

6 COURT REPORTER: DID YOU TAKE THE ID OFF?

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I HAVE NOT, I'LL DO IT RIGHT
8 NOW.

9 THE COURT: THERE BEING NO OBJECTION, STATE'S
10 EXHIBITS NUMBERS THIRTY-FIVE, THIRTY-SIX AND THIRTY-
11 SEVEN ARE ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.

12 (State's Exhibits Thirty-five, Thirty-six
13 and Thirty-seven marked and filed.)

14 Q. OKAY. LET ME START -- LET ME START AND KIND OF
15 GO BACKWARDS HERE ACTUALLY. STATE'S EXHIBIT
16 NUMBER THIRTY-SEVEN, WHAT IS THAT DOCUMENT?

17 A. THIS IS BASICALLY AN ACCOUNT THAT WE WOULD PULL
18 UP ON A DAY TO DAY BASIS TO VERIFY INFORMATION ON
19 THE ACCOUNT, TELEPHONE NUMBER 803-████-2014,
20 DANIELLE MONROE. AND BASICALLY IT GIVES THE
21 STREET ADDRESS AND BASIC INFORMATION OF THE
22 ACCOUNT.

23 Q. OKAY. SO BASICALLY, THAT PHONE NUMBER, 803-████-
24 2014 BELONGS TO A YOUNG LADY BY THE NAME OF
25 DANIELLE MONROE?

DIRECT - NATHANIEL HUBBARD BY SOL. SORENSON

290

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, NOW STATE'S EXHIBIT THIRTY-FIVE,
3 TELL THE JURY WHAT THAT DOCUMENT IS?

4 A. BASICALLY, THIS IS A PREPAID ACCOUNT, SCREEN
5 SHOT, IT BELONGS TO TERIQUE WILSON, 803-████-6062,
6 AND - - -

7 Q. AND IS THAT AN ADDRESS FOR MR. WILSON?

8 A. IT IS, NINETY-THREE THIRTY-NINE OLD SIX HIGHWAY,
9 SANTEE, TWO NINE ONE ONE FIVE.

10 Q. OKAY. AND ALSO ATTACHED TO THAT I GUESS ARE THE
11 RECORDS, I BELIEVE IT'S - - I THINK THEY'RE FROM
12 MARCH TWELFTH TO MARCH FOURTEENTH OF TWO THOUSAND
13 TEN, - - -

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. --- IS THAT CORRECT?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. ALRIGHT. AND IF YOU'LL HOLD ON TO THAT FOR ONE
18 SECOND. AND STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY-SIX,
19 WHAT ABOUT THOSE RECORDS THERE, WHAT DO THEY GO
20 TO?

21 A. THIS IS ALSO A SCREEN SHOT OF A PREPAID ACCOUNT
22 BELONGING TO A PETEY CREEK, ADDRESS FIFTEEN
23 TWENTY-FIVE ASHLEY AVENUE, ORANGEBURG, TWO NINE
24 ONE ONE FIVE, CELL PHONE NUMBER 803-████-9288.

25 Q. NOW, IF I COULD BRIEFLY, JUST SO WE'LL BE ABLE TO

DIRECT - NATHANIEL HUBBARD BY SOL. SORENSON

291

1 LATER ON KIND OF UNDERSTAND WHAT THESE RECORDS.
2 ARE SHOWING, AND THESE RECORDS ALSO HAVE
3 BASICALLY THAT SAME TIME PERIOD, MARCH TWELFTH
4 THROUGH MARCH FOURTEENTH ATTACHED TO THEM, IS
5 THAT CORRECT?

6 A. YES, SIR, THEY DO.

7 Q. ALRIGHT. AND -- OKAY, I GIVE YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT
8 NUMBER THIRTY-SIX, AND I'M GOING TO HOLD ON TO
9 STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY-FIVE. THESE
10 COLUMNS THAT ARE ON THE RECORDS, ARE THEY THE
11 SAME COLUMNS ON EACH SET OF RECORDS?

12 A. YES, SIR, THEY ARE.

13 Q. OKAY. IF YOU WOULD, IF I KIND OF GO THROUGH,
14 STARTING ON THE LEFT HAND SIDE, COULD YOU
15 DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHILE I HOLD THIS ONE UP
16 HERE KIND OF WHAT EACH COLUMN IS ON THESE
17 RECORDS?

18 A. OKAY. ON THE FAR LEFT THE ORIGINATOR, THAT IS
19 BASICALLY THE NUMBER THAT CALLED, THE MOBILE CELL
20 PHONE NUMBER, WHICH IS THE THIRD COLUMN OVER, AND
21 AS YOU CAN SEE, ALL THE WAY DOWN IT'S THE SAME
22 NUMBER BECAUSE THAT'S THE CELL PHONE THAT'S
23 INITIATING THE CALL. THE SECOND COLUMN WHICH
24 SAYS, DIAL DIGIT, THAT WOULD BE THE PHONE NUMBER
25 THAT WAS CALLED BY THE THIRD COLUMN, WHICH IS THE

DIRECT - NATHANIEL HUBBARD BY SOL. SORENSON

292

1 CELL PHONE ITSELF.

2 Q. OKAY. NOW, THIS ONE UP HERE ON THE TOP OF THIS,
3 AND OBVIOUSLY THIS IS THE SAME AS I'M USING,
4 STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY-FIVE, THIS TOP ROW
5 HERE HAS A SET OF DIAL DIGITS?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. SO, THAT WOULD BE THE NUMBER THAT THIS CELL PHONE
8 CALLED, IS THAT CORRECT?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. AND IF YOU GO DOWN TO THE THIRD COLUMN IT'S GOT
11 AN ORIGINATOR NUMBER?

12 A. RIGHT.

13 Q. SO, THAT WOULD BE THE NUMBER THAT CALLED THIS
14 CELL PHONE, IS THAT CORRECT?

15 A. YES, SIR, YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND IS THAT ACTUALLY KIND OF ALSO SHOWN OVER IN
17 THE FAR RIGHT HAND CORNER WHERE IT INDICATES
18 WHETHER IT'S AN OUTGOING OR AN INCOMING PHONE
19 CALL?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, START AND END, THOSE ARE WHEN
22 THE CALL STARTED AND ENDED?

23 A. THAT IS, YES, SIR. DATE, TIME, AND DURATION OF
24 THE CALL.

25 Q. AND THE DURATION, I SEE, IS TYPICALLY A ONE OR A

DIRECT - NATHANIEL HUBBARD BY SOL. SORENSON

293

1 TWO DIGIT NUMBER?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. IS THAT IN SECONDS OR ...

4 A. DAY IS, FOR EXAMPLE, WHERE IT SAYS, DURATION, IF
5 YOU LOOK AT IT, AND IT SAYS, TWO OR ONE, ONE
6 WOULD BE A ONE MINUTE CALL, TWO WOULD BE TWO
7 MINUTES. FOR EXAMPLE, IF IT WAS TWENTY MINUTES
8 IT WOULD SAY TWENTY MINUTES.

9 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU, IF I PLACED A PHONE CALL
10 TO YOU AND, AND THAT PHONE CALL ONLY LASTED TEN
11 SECONDS, WHAT'S GOING TO SHOW UP IN THAT COLUMN?

12 A. IT WOULD BE A ONE, IT WOULD COUNT AS A ONE MINUTE
13 CALL.

14 Q. OKAY. SO ANYTHING UP TO ONE MINUTE WOULD BE A
15 MINUTE?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. AND THEN ONCE IT CLICKS OVER A MINUTE, IT WOULD
18 GO TO - - -

19 A. TWO MINUTES.

20 Q. --- TWO MINUTES?

21 A. YES, SIR. EXCUSE ME.

22 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, MR. HUBBARD,
23 PLEASE ANSWER ANY QUESTION DEFENSE MIGHT HAVE.

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY, YOUR WITNESS.

25 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, I HAVE NO QUESTIONS OF

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

THIS WITNESS.

THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR.

MS. ULLMAN?

MS. ULLMAN: NO QUESTIONS.

THE COURT: OKAY. MR. PALMER?

MR. PALMER: NO QUESTIONS.

THE COURT: MR. MELLARD?

MR. MELLARD: NO QUESTIONS.

THE COURT: MR. KOGER?

MR. KOGER: I DON'T HAVE ANY QUESTIONS.

THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR, I APPRECIATE YOU
COMING IN. YOU MAY STEP DOWN.

SOLICITOR SORENSON: MAY HE BE EXCUSED, YOUR
HONOR?

THE COURT: YES, HE MAY BE EXCUSED.

ALRIGHT, NEXT WITNESS.

SOLICITOR PASCOE: THE STATE CALLS PATRICK TYLER,
YOUR HONOR.

(Whereupon, Witness enters
the courtroom.)

CLERK: SIR, AS BEST YOU CAN, PLACE YOUR LEFT
HAND ON THE BIBLE AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.

THE COURT: AS MUCH AS YOU CAN, THAT'S FINE.
(Whereupon, Patrick Tyler
is duly sworn.)

1 CLERK: YOU CAN HAVE A SEAT AND STATE YOUR FULL
2 NAME FOR THE COURT.

3 THE COURT: GET COMFORTABLE, MR. TYLER.

4 WITNESS: PATRICK TYLER.

5 THE COURT: OKAY.

6 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
7 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
8 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
9 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
10 sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

296

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY SOLICITOR PASCOE:

Q. GOOD AFTERNOON, PATRICK.

A. GOOD AFTERNOON.

Q. AND YOUR NAME IS PATRICK TYLER?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. I NEED YOU TO DO ME A BIG FAVOR AND SPEAK UP AS
LOUDLY AS YOU CAN. YOU'VE GOT KIND OF A SOFT
VOICE SOMETIMES. ALRIGHT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S GOING TO DO ANY GOOD, BUT
YOU NEED TO SPEAK UP. ALRIGHT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. HOW OLD ARE YOU, MR. TYLER?

A. SEVENTEEN.

Q. WHEN IS YOUR BIRTHDAY?

A. JULY NINETEEN, NINETY-THREE.

Q. SOS, BACK IN MARCH, ON MARCH THE TWELFTH, HOW OLD
WERE YOU, PATRICK?

A. SIXTEEN.

Q. WHERE ARE YOU CURRENTLY HAVING TO LIVE RIGHT NOW,
PATRICK?

A. BAMBERG DETENTION CENTER.

Q. AND IS THAT BECAUSE YOU'RE CHARGED WITH THE
MURDER, BURGLARY AND ARMED ROBBERY OF CHARLES

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

297

1 PRINGLE?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. AND EVEN THOUGH YOU WERE ONLY SIXTEEN YEARS OLD
4 AT THE TIME ARE YOU BEING TREATED AS AN ADULT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. WHERE WERE YOU LIVING BACK IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR
7 BEFORE YOU GOT ARRESTED?

8 A. SANTEE, AND ASHLAND DRIVE.

9 Q. OKAY. SO, TWO DIFFERENT ADDRESSES?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AND WHO DID YOU LIVE WITH WHEN YOU STAYED IN
12 SANTEE?

13 A. MY MOTHER.

14 Q. YOUR MOTHER?

15 A. MY MOTHER.

16 Q. OKAY. AND WHO DID YOU STAY WITH WHEN YOU STAYED
17 ON ASHLAND DRIVE?

18 A. MY GRANDMOTHER.

19 Q. OKAY. WHERE IS ASHLAND DRIVE, IS THAT -- GO
20 AHEAD?

21 A. BY BROOKDALE.

22 Q. BROOKDALE?

23 A. BY BROOKDALE SCHOOL.

24 Q. OKAY. SO, CLOSER TO THE CITY THAN SANTEE,
25 OBVIOUSLY?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

298

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. AND IS YOUR MOM AND DAD PRESENT IN THE COURTROOM
3 TODAY, SEATED ON THE SECOND ROW?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. AND BECAUSE YOU'RE CHARGED WITH MURDER, ARMED
6 ROBBERY AND BURGLARY, DO YOU HAVE AN ATTORNEY?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. AND WHAT'S HIS NAME?

9 A. CARL GRANT.

10 Q. MR. CARL GRANT, AND YOUR ATTORNEY, IS HE IN THE
11 COURTROOM TODAY AS WELL?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. PATRICK, TELL THE JURY WHERE YOU WERE
14 GOING TO SCHOOL BACK IN MARCH BEFORE ALL OF THIS
15 HAPPENED?

16 A. ORANGEBURG-WILKERSON.

17 Q. AND WHAT GRADE WERE YOU IN?

18 A. ELEVENTH.

19 Q. SO, YOU WERE SIXTEEN IN THE ELEVENTH GRADE?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. ON TARGET TO GRADUATE?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND DO YOU KNOW ALL FIVE OF THE DEFENDANTS SEATED
24 IN HERE TODAY?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

299

1 Q. AND YOU KNEW ALL OF THEM BEFORE MARCH THE
2 TWELFTH?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. LET ME ASK YOU ABOUT THE FIRST ONE, CHRISTOPHER
5 COLEMAN, HOW DID YOU KNOW CHRISTOPHER COLEMAN?

6 A. I WENT TO SCHOOL WITH HIM.

7 Q. ARE ANY OF THESE DEFENDANTS YOUR AGE?

8 A. NO, SIR.

9 Q. ARE THEY OLDER OR YOUNGER THAN YOU?

10 A. THEY'RE OLDER.

11 Q. A LOT OF OLDER?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. WHAT DID CHRISTOPHER COLEMAN GO BY, WHAT NAME?

14 A. LITTLE CHRIS.

15 Q. HOW IS HE RELATED TO THE PERSON SEATED NEXT TO
16 HIM, RALPH COLEMAN?

17 A. THEY'RE BROTHERS.

18 Q. OKAY. AND TELL THE JURY HOW YOU KNEW RALPH
19 COLEMAN?

20 A. THROUGH MARIO.

21 Q. MARIO WHO?

22 A. SHIVERS.

23 Q. OKAY. AND WE'LL GET TO HIM IN A SECOND. WHERE
24 WERE RALPH AND CHRIS COLEMAN LIVING BACK IN
25 MARCH?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

300

1 A. ON WOODBINE.

2 Q. ON WOODBINE, IS THAT A STREET HERE IN ORANGEBURG?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. DO YOU KNOW THE DEFENDANT, WALTER HARRIS?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. HOW LONG HAVE YOU KNOWN WALTER HARRIS?

7 A. BASICALLY ALL OF MY LIFE.

8 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU KNEW HIM PRETTY WELL?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. WHERE DID HE LIVE BACK IN MARCH, USUALLY?

11 A. ON COLEMAN.

12 Q. AND WHAT NAME DID WALTER HARRIS GO BY?

13 A. PETE.

14 Q. DO YOU KNOW THE DEFENDANT, DANNY RYANT?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND TELL THE JURY HOW YOU KNOW DANNY RYANT?

17 A. I KNOW HIM BASICALLY ALL MY LIFE, TOO.

18 Q. AND WHAT NAME DID DANNY RYANT GO BY BACK IN MARCH
19 AND BEFORE THAT?

20 A. POKE.

21 Q. POKE? AND FINALLY, DO YOU KNOW THE DEFENDANT,
22 MARIO SHIVERS, SEATED AT THE END?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. AND TELL THE JURY WHAT NAME MARIO SHIVERS WENT
25 BY?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

301

1 A. LITTLE M.

2 Q. LITTLE M. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU KNOWN MARIO
3 SHIVERS?

4 COURT REPORTER: LITTLE M?

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: LITTLE M, YES, MA'AM.

6 A. FOR, LIKE, TWO YEARS.

7 Q. HOW OFTEN WOULD YOU HANG OUT WITH MARIO SHIVERS?

8 A. EVERY NOW AND THEN.

9 Q. HOW ARE, IF IN ANY WAY, ARE DANNY RYANT, POKE,
10 AND MARIO SHIVERS, LITTLE M, HOW ARE THEY
11 RELATED?

12 A. MARIO SHIVERS TALKS TO DANNY RYANT'S SISTER.

13 Q. OKAY. TALKS TO DANNY RYANT'S SISTER?

14 A. WELL, THAT'S HIS BABY'S MOTHER.

15 Q. OKAY. AND YOU TESTIFIED NONE OF THEM ARE YOUR
16 AGE, RIGHT?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. AND OF THE FIVE DEFENDANTS IS THERE ONE THAT YOU
19 WERE CLOSEST TO?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. WHICH ONE?

22 A. DANNY RYANT.

23 Q. NOW, I WANT TO ASK YOU ABOUT THE AFTERNOON OF
24 MARCH THE TWELFTH OF THIS YEAR. OKAY? WHO WERE
25 YOU HANGING OUT WITH THAT EARLY AFTERNOON AROUND

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

302

1 THREE, FOUR, FIVE O'CLOCK THAT FRIDAY AFTERNOON?

2 A. DARIUS GARDNER.

3 Q. OKAY. AND WHO IS DARIUS GARDNER?

4 A. A FRIEND.

5 Q. HOW DO YOU KNOW HIM?

6 A. HE GOES TO THE SAME SCHOOL.

7 Q. OKAY. O-W?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. WERE Y'ALL REAL GOOD FRIENDS BACK THEN?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AND WHERE WAS DARIUS LIVING BACK IN MARCH?

12 A. AROUND THE SAME AREA AS MY MOTHER GRANDMOTHER
13 LIVES.

14 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT AREA IS THAT AGAIN?

15 A. BY BROOKDALE.

16 Q. BROOKDALE. AND WHAT DID THE TWO OF YOU, DARIUS
17 AND YOURSELF, DO THAT LATE AFTERNOON?

18 A. WE CHILLED, HANG OUT, SMOKED AND ...

19 Q. AND WHEN YOU SAY, SMOKED, WHAT WERE Y'ALL
20 SMOKING?

21 A. MARIJUANA.

22 Q. BOTH OF YOU?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. AND WHERE DID THE TWO OF YOU END UP GOING
25 AROUND SEVEN:FIFTEEN, SEVEN:THIRTY THAT NIGHT?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

303

- 1 A. ON WOODBINE.
- 2 Q. OKAY. AND WHOSE HOUSE WAS AT WOODBINE?
- 3 A. RALPH.
- 4 Q. RALPH COLEMAN, THE DEFENDANT?
- 5 A. YES, SIR.
- 6 Q. AND WHY DID YOU GO TO THAT HOUSE?
- 7 A. BECAUSE I HAD GOT A PHONE CALL FROM DANNY SAYING
- 8 MARIO SHIVERS HAD GUNS AND I HAD WANT TO GO SEE
- 9 THEM.
- 10 Q. YOU SAY, DANNY, DANNY RYANT?
- 11 A. YES, SIR.
- 12 Q. POKE?
- 13 A. YES, SIR.
- 14 Q. AND HOW DID YOU TALK TO DANNY RYANT, WAS IT FACE
- 15 TO FACE OR A PHONE CALL?
- 16 A. THROUGH A PHONE.
- 17 Q. AFTER YOU TALKED TO DANNY RYANT BY TELEPHONE, DID
- 18 YOU TALK TO ANYBODY ELSE BY TELEPHONE?
- 19 A. YES, SIR.
- 20 Q. AND WHO WAS THAT?
- 21 A. MARIO SHIVERS.
- 22 Q. OKAY. YOU WANTED TO FIND OUT WHERE HE WAS?
- 23 A. YES, SIR.
- 24 Q. AND THAT'S WHEN YOU WENT TO WOODBINE?
- 25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

304

1 Q. WHOSE CAR DID Y'ALL TAKE TO GO TO THE WOODBINE
2 ADDRESS?

3 A. DARIUS'S MOTHER'S.

4 Q. LET ME SHOW YOU -- I'M GOING TO SHOW YOU WHAT'S
5 BEEN MARKED AS STATE'S EXHIBITS THIRTY-TWO AND
6 THIRTY-THREE.

7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AND MY UNDERSTAND, THERE'S NO
8 OBJECTION TO PUTTING THESE INTO EVIDENCE, SO I CAN GO
9 AHEAD AND MARK THEM AS EVIDENCE, YOUR HONOR, IF THAT'S
10 ALRIGHT.

11 THE COURT: NO OBJECTION?

12 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

13 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

14 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

15 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

16 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT.

18 SOLICITOR PASCOE: DO YOU WANT ME TO JUST SCRATCH
19 THAT OUT AND PUT ...

20 COURT REPORTER: IF YOU WOULD TAKE OUT THE ID.
21 THIRTY-TWO AND THIRTY-THREE?

22 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THIRTY-TWO AND THIRTY-THREE,
23 YES, MA'AM.

24 THE COURT: ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE WITHOUT
25 OBJECTION.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

305

1 (State's Exhibits Thirty-two and Thirty-three
2 marked and filed.)

3 Q. TAKE A LOOK AT STATE'S EXHIBITS THIRTY-TWO AND
4 THIRTY-THREE, DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT HOUSE?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. WHAT DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT TO BE?

7 A. THAT IS RALPH'S HOME.

8 Q. OKAY. AND IT'S THE SAME ONE THAT YOU WENT TO GO
9 MEET UP WITH MARIO AT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. ON WOODBINE. OKAY, WHEN YOU AND DARIUS
12 WENT TO THE WOODBINE ADDRESS WAS ANYBODY ELSE BUT
13 YOU AND DARIUS IN THE CAR?

14 A. NO, SIR.

15 Q. WHEN Y'ALL GOT THERE WHO WAS AT THE HOUSE AT
16 WOODBINE?

17 A. RALPH AND MARIO.

18 Q. THE DEFENDANTS, RALPH COLEMAN AND MARIO SHIVERS?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. ANYBODY ELSE THERE WHEN YOU FIRST GOT THERE AT
21 WOODBINE?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. TELL THE JURY WHAT YOU, MARIO SHIVERS, RALPH
24 COLEMAN AND DARIUS DID WHILE YOU WERE AT RALPH'S
25 PLACE ON WOODBINE?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

306

1 A. WE HANG OUT, HAD A REGULAR CONVERSATION, SMOKED
2 MARIJUANA.

3 Q. ALL FOUR OF YOU?

4 A. YES, SIR. AND THAT WAS BASICALLY IT, AND JUST
5 TALKING ABOUT GIRLS, MARIJUANA, AND THAT'S WHEN
6 WE HAD GOT ON THE SUBJECT ABOUT THE ROBBERY, BUT
7 THAT WAS AFTERWARDS.

8 Q. OKAY. WELL, LET ME ASK YOU THIS, WAS THERE A
9 PARTICULAR PLACE IN THE HOUSE WHERE Y'ALL WERE
10 HANGING OUT, THE FOUR OF YOU?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. WHERE?

13 A. UNDER THE GARAGE.

14 Q. IS THAT DEPICTED IN STATE'S THIRTY-TWO?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND WAS IT JUST THE FOUR OF YOU AT THAT TIME?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. WHEN IT WAS THE FOUR OF YOU DID YOU SEE ANY GUNS,
19 WHILE DARIUS WAS STILL THERE?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. HUH?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. WHO SHOWED YOU THE GUNS?

24 A. MARIO.

25 Q. AND WHAT KIND OF GUNS DID MARIO SHIVERS SHOW YOU?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

307

- 1 A. TWO RIFLES AND A PISTOL.
- 2 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER WHAT KIND OF RIFLES THEY WERE?
- 3 A. A SKS, ONE HAD A KNIFE ON IT.
- 4 Q. ONE HAD A WHAT ON IT?
- 5 A. A KNIFE.
- 6 Q. OKAY. WHAT ABOUT THE PISTOL, DO YOU KNOW WHAT
- 7 KIND OF PISTOL IT WAS?
- 8 A. A NINE MILLIMETER.
- 9 Q. AND WHO DID THOSE GUNS BELONG TO, THE TWO SKS
- 10 RIFLES AND THE NINE MILLIMETER?
- 11 A. MARIO SHIVERS.
- 12 Q. SEATED RIGHT THERE IN THE COURTROOM?
- 13 A. YES, SIR.
- 14 Q. ON THE END? HOW LONG DID YOUR FRIEND, DARIUS,
- 15 END UP STAYING AT THE HOUSE ON WOODBINE?
- 16 A. LIKE FIFTEEN OR TWENTY MINUTES.
- 17 Q. AND WHY DID HE LEAVE?
- 18 A. BECAUSE HE SAID HE HAD SOMETHING TO DO.
- 19 Q. AND WHY DIDN'T YOU LEAVE WITH HIM?
- 20 A. I HAD WANTED TO CHILL, HANG OUT.
- 21 Q. DO YOU WISH YOU HAD GONE WITH HIM?
- 22 A. YES, SIR.
- 23 Q. AND WERE YOU SUPPOSED TO HANG OUT WITH DARIUS
- 24 THAT NIGHT?
- 25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

308

1 Q. SO, AFTER DARIUS LEFT WHO WAS HANGING OUT INSIDE
2 UNDER THAT SHED?

3 A. ME, RALPH AND MARIO.

4 Q. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, DID YOU EVEN KNOW THE
5 VICTIM, CHARLES PRINGLE, BACK IN MARCH?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. DID YOU KNOW ANYBODY BY THE NAME OF OLD SCHOOL?

8 A. NO, SIR.

9 Q. DID MARIO SHIVERS KNOW CHARLES PRINGLE BACK IN
10 MARCH?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND HOW DID MARIO KNOW CHARLES PRINGLE?

13 A. HIS FAMILY, ONE OF HIS FAMILY MEMBERS PURCHASED
14 WEED FROM HIM.

15 Q. OKAY. AND YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER YOU STARTED
16 TALKING ABOUT, WHEN Y'ALL STARTED -- LATER YOU
17 SAID, WE STARTED TALKING ABOUT THE ROBBERY. GO
18 INTO DETAIL WITH THE JURY ABOUT, WHO BROUGHT UP
19 THE TOPIC OF ROBBERY, WHO THE VICTIM WAS GOING TO
20 BE, AND WHAT WAS SAID?

21 A. MARIO HAD BROUGHT THE TOPIC AND WE WAS DISCUSSING
22 IT AMONG US THREE, SAYING THAT I WAS THE ONE
23 GOING TO GO IN THE HOUSE AND PURCHASE THE WEED
24 AND COME OUT, AND THEN THAT'S WHEN THE ROBBERY
25 WAS GOING TO TAKE PLACE.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

309

- 1 Q. OKAY. AND YOU SAID, THE THREE OF US WERE
2 DISCUSSING IT. WHO WERE THE THREE PEOPLE?
3 A. ME, MARIO AND RALPH.
4 Q. SO, INITIALLY, AT THAT INSTANCE THE THREE PEOPLE
5 THAT WERE GOING TO GO COMMIT THE ROBBERY WERE YOU
6 THREE?
7 A. YES, SIR.
8 Q. WHILE Y'ALL WERE TALKING ABOUT IT IN THE SHED DID
9 Y'ALL HAVE TRANSPORTATION TO GET TO THE - - -
10 A. NO, SIR.
11 Q. --- TO OLD SCHOOL'S HOUSE?
12 A. NO, SIR.
13 Q. OKAY. HOW DID THAT END UP HAPPENING?
14 A. CHRIS AND, I GUESS HIS FRIEND HAD CAME OVER.
15 Q. OKAY. AND -- CHRIS COLEMAN?
16 A. YES, SIR.
17 Q. AND HIS FRIEND CAME OVER? WHAT KIND OF VEHICLE
18 WAS IT?
19 A. AN EXPLORER.
20 Q. OKAY. AN SUV?
21 A. YES.
22 Q. NOW, YOU TESTIFIED YOU KNEW CHRIS BACK THEN, BUT
23 DID YOU KNOW WHO CHRIS'S FRIEND WAS, THE DRIVER?
24 A. NO, SIR.
25 Q. HAD YOU EVER SEEN HIM BEFORE?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

310

1 A. NO, SIR.

2 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER ANYONE SAYING HIS NAME?

3 A. NO, SIR.

4 Q. DID YOU EVEN KNOW ANYONE BY THE NAME OF RONNIE
5 WASHINGTON BACK THEN?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. CAN YOU JUST DESCRIBE HIM FOR THE JURY, WHAT HE
8 LOOKED LIKE AS BEST YOU CAN REMEMBER?

9 A. HEAVY SET, HAD AN AFRO I THINK, AND LIGHT SKIN.

10 Q. AND HE WAS THE DRIVER OF THE VEHICLE?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. DID YOU EVER REALLY GET A GOOD LOOK AT
13 HIM?

14 A. NO, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY.

16 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR, OR NO, SIR?

17 A. NO, SIR.

18 Q. DID -- NOW, YOU TESTIFIED THAT CHRIS COLEMAN AND
19 THIS DRIVER SHOWED UP AT WOODBINE. DID THEY EVER
20 GET OUT OF THE VEHICLE?

21 A. NO, SIR.

22 Q. OKAY. LET ME SHOW YOU WHAT'S - - -

23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AND THERE'S NO OBJECTION TO IT
24 BEING ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE, YOUR HONOR, STATE'S
25 EXHIBIT TWENTY-EIGHT.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

311

1 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR, STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER
2 -- YOU SAID TWENTY-EIGHT?

3 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

4 THE COURT: ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE WITHOUT
5 OBJECTION.

6 COURT REPORTER: ADMITTED AS STATE'S TWENTY-
7 EIGHT.

8 (State's Exhibit Twenty-eight
9 marked and filed.)

10 Q. DOES STATE'S TWENTY-EIGHT LOOK FAMILIAR?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. WHAT DOES IT LOOK LIKE?

13 A. IT WAS THE EXPLORER THAT WE DRIVE TO THE VICTIM'S
14 HOUSE.

15 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN Y'ALL GOT INTO THE EXPLORER AND
16 LEFT WOODBINE, TELL THE JURY WHO SAT WHERE AND
17 WHAT Y'ALL WERE TALKING ABOUT?

18 A. IT WAS CHRIS AND A PASSENGER IN THE FRONT. I WAS
19 BEHIND THE DRIVER, RALPH WAS IN THE MIDDLE, AND
20 MARIO WAS BEHIND THE PASSENGER FRONT.

21 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID Y'ALL TALK ABOUT IN THE
22 VEHICLE?

23 A. HOW WE WAS PLANNING TO ROB OLD SCHOOL.

24 Q. OKAY. AND WHO WAS DOING MOST OF THE TALKING AND
25 THE PLANNING?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

312

1 A. MARIO.

2 Q. MARIO SHIVERS?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. AND WHAT WAS THE PLAN NOW THAT CHRIS AND THIS
5 OTHER PERSON, THE DRIVER WHO PICKED YOU UP?

6 A. FOR ME TO GO IN THERE AND BUY THE WEED, COME OUT,
7 AND THEY WAS GOING TO COME IN AND ROB HIM.

8 Q. WHO WAS SUPPLYING THE GUNS FOR THE ROBBERY?

9 A. MARIO.

10 Q. AND WERE THEY THE THREE WEAPONS THAT YOU
11 TESTIFIED ABOUT EARLIER TODAY?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. WHERE WERE THE GUNS WHEN Y'ALL GOT INTO THE
14 EXPLORER?

15 A. THEY WAS IN THE HATCH BACK.

16 Q. YOU SAY, HATCH BACK, I GUESS IT WOULD BE LIKE
17 BACK HERE, TRUNK HATCH?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. ON THE WAY TO CHARLES PRINGLE'S PLACE ON KINGS
20 STREET, DID Y'ALL END UP PICKING, GETTING
21 SOMEBODY ELSE INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND WHO WAS THAT?

24 A. WALTER HARRIS.

25 Q. OKAY. TELL THE JURY HOW Y'ALL ENDED UP, AND WHY

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

313

1 Y'ALL GOT WALTER HARRIS INVOLVED IN IT?

2 A. BECAUSE MARIO HAD SAID WE HAD NEED ANOTHER
3 PERSON. SO, I, THAT INSTANT I TELL THEM WALTER
4 HARRIS, CALL WALTER HARRIS.

5 COURT REPORTER: SO, I GUESS WHAT? I'M SORRY.

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: HE SAID, THIS INSTANT, THAT
7 INSTANT HE SAID CALL WALTER HARRIS.

8 A. CALL WALTER HARRIS, AND THAT'S WHEN WE WAS
9 HEADING TO PICK UP HIM ON JAMISON AND BETWEEN
10 CAMPUS DRIVE.

11 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID WALTER HARRIS, WHAT NAME DOES
12 HE GO BY?

13 A. PETE.

14 Q. IS THAT THE NAME THAT MARIO USED WHEN HE SAID,
15 WE'RE GOING TO PICK UP PETE?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND DID HE CALL PETE?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. AND WHERE DID Y'ALL PICK WALTER HARRIS UP AT?

20 A. ON JAMISON AND BETWEEN, AT THE CORNER OF CAMPUS
21 DRIVE.

22 MR. LACKEY: I'M SORRY, WHAT DID HE SAY?

23 Q. SAY IT AGAIN FOR ME.

24 A. JAMISON AND AT THE CORNER OF CAMPUS DRIVE.

25 Q. CAMPUS DRIVE?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

314

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. CAMPUS DRIVE AND JAMISON?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. DID, DID THE DEFENDANT, WALTER HARRIS, HAVE A
5 WEAPON ON HIM WHEN Y'ALL PICKED HIM UP?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. TELL THE JURY WHAT KIND OF WEAPON HE HAD?

8 A. IT WAS A BLACK PISTOL.

9 Q. OKAY. DO YOU REMEMBER THE CALIBER -- DO YOU KNOW
10 THE CALIBER?

11 A. NO, SIR.

12 Q. JUST THAT IT WAS A BLACK PISTOL?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. SO, NOW THAT Y'ALL PICKED WALTER HARRIS UP, PETE,

15

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. --- TELL THE JURY WHAT THE PLAN IS AS FAR AS
18 COMMITTING THE ROBBERY, BURGLARY, AND WHO IS
19 INVOLVED?

20 A. IT WAS, WELL, CHRIS, RALPH, MARIO, ME AND PETE,
21 WALTER.

22 Q. AND WHAT'S THE PLAN?

23 COURT REPORTER: ME AND PETE AND WALTER?

24 A. WELL, I MEANT TO SAY WALTER. WELL HIS NAME IS
25 WALTER.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

315

1 SOLICITOR PASCOE: PETE, AS IN WALTER HARRIS.

2 PETE IS WALTER HARRIS.

3 COURT REPORTER: OH, OKAY.

4 Q. OKAY. AND TELL THE JURY WHAT THE PLAN WAS?

5 A. WE WAS GOING TO -- I WAS SUPPOSED TO GO AND BUY
6 THE WEED, LIKE I WAS SUPPOSED TO, AND IT WAS LIKE
7 I HAD WANTED THE WEED, AND THAT'S WHEN THEY WAS
8 GOING TO COME IN THERE AND ROB HIM. SO, AS WE
9 GOT TO THE VICTIM'S HOUSE PETE WENT IN THERE AND
10 SAID HE WAS GOING TO PEAK AT THE SCENE.

11 Q. OKAY.

12 A. AND THAT'S WHEN HE WENT AND BOUGHT THE WEED, HE
13 CAME BACK OUT, AND IT WAS, LIKE, HE AIN'T WANT TO
14 DO IT NO MORE BECAUSE HE HAD KNOW SOMEONE THAT
15 WAS IN THERE.

16 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN YOU SAY, PETE WENT IN AND BOUGHT
17 THE WEED, THAT'S WALTER HARRIS?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. AND HE KNEW SOMEBODY THAT WAS IN THERE
20 WHEN HE WENT AND BOUGHT THE WEED?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. AND THE APARTMENT COMPLEX THAT Y'ALL WERE
23 TARGETING, WHERE CHARLES PRINGLE LIVED, IS IT ON
24 THE CORNER RIGHT THERE IN STATE'S EXHIBIT SIX?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

316

1 Q. KIND OF POINT, WHEN Y'ALL FIRST GOT THERE TO BUY
2 -- WHEN WALTER HARRIS WENT IN TO BUY THE WEED,
3 WHERE WERE Y'ALL WOULD HAVE PARKED IN RELATION TO
4 THIS PICTURE FOR ME?

5 A. LIKE, ON THE SIDE OF THAT WHITE CAR.

6 Q. WAY OVER THERE?

7 A. YEAH.

8 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. SO, WALTER HARRIS GOES IN, BUYS
9 WEED, KNOWS SOMEBODY?

10 A. YES, SIR. HE CAME BACK OUT AND SAID THAT HE HAD
11 KNOW SOMEONE IN THERE SO HE AIN'T WANT TO DO IT
12 NO MORE, AND THAT'S WHEN WE WENT AND GOT DANNY
13 RYANT.

14 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S DANNY RYANT, THE SECOND TO THE
15 END?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. KNOWN AS POKE?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. ALRIGHT. TELL US ABOUT HOW, WHOSE IDEA WAS IT TO
20 GET DANNY RYANT, AND HOW DID YOU GO ABOUT IT?

21 A. MARIO.

22 Q. MARIO SHIVERS?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. HOW DID YOU CONTACT DANNY RYANT?

25 A. I CALLED HIM ON THE CELL PHONE, MY CELL PHONE.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

317

- 1 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU CALLED HIM FROM YOUR CELL PHONE?
- 2 A. YES, SIR.
- 3 Q. AND DID Y'ALL PICK DANNY RYANT UP?
- 4 A. YES, SIR.
- 5 Q. TELL THE JURY WHERE Y'ALL PICKED DANNY RYANT UP
- 6 AT?
- 7 A. AT A NIGHT CLUB CALLED THE CORNER POCKET.
- 8 Q. AND HOW FAR APPROXIMATELY IS THE CORNER POCKET
- 9 FROM CHARLES PRINGLE'S APARTMENT?
- 10 A. APPROXIMATELY THREE BLOCKS.
- 11 Q. PRETTY CLOSE, THEN?
- 12 A. YEAH.
- 13 Q. OKAY. SO, HOW LONG DID IT TAKE FOR Y'ALL TO PICK
- 14 POKE UP, DANNY RYANT?
- 15 A. THREE MINUTES.
- 16 Q. NOW, WHEN Y'ALL PICKED MR. RYANT UP WHO EXPLAINED
- 17 TO HIM WHAT WAS GOING TO GO DOWN?
- 18 A. BASICALLY ALL OF US.
- 19 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU GET IN THE EXPLORER, YOU'RE GOING
- 20 TO CHARLES PRINGLE'S, WHO'S GOING TO GO IN AND
- 21 ROB AND BURGLARIZE CHARLES PRINGLE'S HOUSE?
- 22 A. ALL OF US.
- 23 Q. INCLUDING WALTER HARRIS?
- 24 A. YES, SIR.
- 25 Q. SO, WHAT'S THE FINAL PLAN NOW TO GO IN THERE AND

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

318

1 ROB CHARLES PRINGLE'S PLACE, WHAT -- ACTUALLY,
2 JUST TELL THE JURY WHAT Y'ALL DID?

3 A. WELL, WHEN WE GOT TO THE APARTMENT COMPLEX I HAD
4 WENT IN, ME AND RALPH HAD WENT IN, AND I WAS
5 PURCHASING SOME WEED.

6 Q. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, WHEN YOU AND RALPH COLEMAN
7 WENT IN TO PURCHASE THE WEED, WERE YOU ARMED WITH
8 A WEAPON AT THAT TIME?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. WAS RALPH COLEMAN ARMED WITH A WEAPON AT THAT
11 TIME?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. WHAT WEAPON DID RALPH COLEMAN HAVE?

14 A. WALTER HARRIS'S GUN.

15 Q. OKAY. THE BLACK GUN THAT WALTER HARRIS HAD?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. WHO GAVE MR. COLEMAN THAT GUN?

18 A. WALTER.

19 Q. OKAY. WALTER HARRIS?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. GO AHEAD, TELL THE JURY WHAT HAPPENED?

22 A. SO, WHEN I WAS PURCHASING THE WEED I HAD
23 PURCHASED MY WEED AND THEN THAT'S WHEN I WAS
24 ABOUT TO LEAVE OUT THE HOUSE LIKE I WAS TOLD,
25 THAT WAS WHEN RALPH PULLED HIS GUN OUT ON THE

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

319

1 FEMALE. AND WHEN I OPENED THE DOOR THAT'S WHEN
2 EVERYBODY CAME IN WITH THE GUNS.

3 Q. OKAY. SO, THE PERSON THAT PULLED THE GUN OUT ON
4 THE FEMALE WAS RALPH COLEMAN?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. AND WHO ELSE CAME IN THE HOUSE?

7 A. LITTLE CHRIS, MARIO, DANNY AND WALTER.

8 Q. DID CHRIS COLEMAN HAVE A WEAPON?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. WHAT WEAPON DID HE HAVE?

11 A. A CHROME PISTOL, THE NINE MILLIMETER.

12 Q. AND WHOSE NINE MILLIMETER CHROME PISTOL WAS THAT?

13 A. MARIO'S.

14 Q. MARIO SHIVERS? DID DANNY RYANT HAVE A WEAPON?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. WHAT WEAPON DID DANNY RYANT HAVE?

17 A. AN SKS.

18 Q. AND WHAT WEAPON DID MARIO SHIVERS HAVE?

19 A. AN SKS.

20 Q. DID WALTER HARRIS HAVE A GUN WHEN YOU ENTERED THE
21 APARTMENT?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. AND WHAT, IF ANYTHING, DID HE HAVE?

24 A. I CAN'T RECALL.

25 Q. AND ALL OF YOU ENTERED THE HOUSE?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

320

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. WHAT DID Y'ALL DO WITH THE VICTIM?

3 A. WALTER HARRIS TAPED HIM, TAPED HIS MOUTH UP.

4 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID WALTER HARRIS TAPE CHARLES
5 PRINGLE'S MOUTH UP WITH?

6 A. DUCT TAPE.

7 Q. AND DO YOU RECOGNIZE THE PERSON IN STATE'S
8 EXHIBIT EIGHT ALREADY IN EVIDENCE?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. AND IS THAT THE VICTIM, CHARLES PRINGLE?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND DOES IT DEPICT THE DUCT TAPE THAT WALTER
13 HARRIS PUT OVER THE VICTIM'S MOUTH?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. OKAY. AT WHOSE DIRECTIONS WAS WALTER HARRIS
16 PUTTING THE DUCT TAPE ON THE VICTIM?

17 A. YOU SAID, IN WHOSE DIRECTION?

18 Q. I'M SORRY, WHO WAS TELLING WALTER HARRIS WHAT TO
19 DO?

20 A. BASICALLY EVERYBODY WAS TALKING AT THE SAME TIME,
21 SO ...

22 Q. NOW, YOU TESTIFIED ABOUT THE FOUR PEOPLE THAT HAD
23 WEAPONS, AND YOU TESTIFIED ABOUT WALTER HARRIS
24 PUTTING DUCT TAPE OVER THE VICTIM DURING THE
25 ROBBERY AND BURGLARY.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

321

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. WHAT HAPPENED NEXT?

3 A. AND THEN THAT'S WHEN WE WAS IN THE HOUSE AND
4 EVERYBODY WAS, LIKE, WHERE THE MONEY AND STUFF
5 WAS AT, AND WALTER SEARCHED THE ROOM, I SEARCHED,
6 AND THAT'S WHEN OLD SCHOOL WAS SAYING IT WAS
7 OUTSIDE. AND THEN, THAT'S WHEN I HEARD A GUN
8 SHOT, AND I GUESS THEY SHOT THE DOG. AND THAT'S
9 WHEN I WAS RUNNING OUT THE HOUSE, AND THAT'S WHEN
10 I HEARD GUN SHOTS.

11 Q. DID YOU LOOK AND SEE WHERE THE SHOTS WERE BEING
12 DIRECTED AND WHO WAS BEING SHOT?

13 A. NO, SIR, I WAS OUT THE DOOR.

14 Q. ANY IDEA HOW MANY SHOTS YOU HEARD?

15 A. LIKE, NINETEEN, TWENTY.

16 Q. AND WHAT WAS THE GIRL DOING DURING THIS WHOLE
17 TIME?

18 A. LAYING ON THE FLOOR.

19 Q. DID YOU KNOW THAT GIRL, ASHLEY PARSLEY, BEFORE
20 THAT NIGHT?

21 A. NO, SIR.

22 Q. WHAT WAS IT LIKE WHEN YOU HEARD THOSE SHOTS
23 RINGING OUT?

24 A. SCARED.

25 Q. AND WHAT HAPPENED AFTER Y'ALL, AFTER YOU RAN OUT

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

322

1 OF THE APARTMENT, WHAT HAPPENED?

2 A. AND THAT'S WHEN I WAS RUNNING TO THE TRUCK, I
3 MADE IT TO THE TRUCK, AND THAT'S WHEN EVERYBODY
4 ELSE WAS BEHIND ME, THEY GOT IN THE TRUCK, AND
5 THAT'S WHEN DANNY RYANT WAS SAYING, MAN, YOU
6 KNOW, WHY Y'ALL HAD DID THAT, YOU AIN'T HAD TO DO
7 IT LIKE THAT. AND THEN, THAT'S WHEN, IT WAS,
8 LIKE, EVERYBODY JUST BE QUIET, DON'T SAY NOTHING
9 ABOUT IT. AND THEN THAT WAS, WALTER HARRIS WAS,
10 LIKE, DROP ME OFF HOME ON COLEMAN AVENUE. SO,
11 THAT'S WHEN WE RODE, WE DROPPED WALTER HARRIS
12 OFF, AND THAT'S WHEN I GOT OUT OF THE TRUCK AND
13 WENT IN MY DIRECTION.

14 Q. OKAY. AND LET'S JUST BACK UP ONE SECOND AND THEN
15 I WANT TO GET INTO WHEN YOU AND WALTER HARRIS GOT
16 DROPPED OFF. WHAT WAS THE INTENT OF YOU, MARIO
17 SHIVERS, CHRIS COLEMAN, RALPH COLEMAN, DANNY
18 RYANT, AND WALTER HARRIS WHEN Y'ALL WENT TO
19 CHARLES PRINGLE'S HOUSE, WHAT WERE Y'ALL GOING TO
20 DO?

21 A. TO ROB HIM FOR HIS WEED, MARIJUANA AND MONEY.

22 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, TELL THE JURY WHO GOT DROPPED OFF
23 FIRST AFTER Y'ALL LEFT THE HOUSE?

24 A. WALTER HARRIS.

25 Q. AND WHERE DID HE GET DROPPED OFF AT?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

323

- 1 A. AT HIS RESIDENCE ON COLEMAN AVENUE.
- 2 Q. AND DID YOU STAY WITH THE OTHER DEFENDANTS AFTER
- 3 WALTER HARRIS GOT DROPPED OFF, DID YOU HANG OUT
- 4 WITH THEM THAT NIGHT?
- 5 A. NO, SIR.
- 6 Q. WHAT DID YOU DO?
- 7 A. I WENT IN MY DIRECTION.
- 8 Q. YOU SAY YOU WENT IN YOUR DIRECTION?
- 9 A. YEAH. I HAD GOT OUT AT WALTER HARRIS'S HOME AND
- 10 WENT WALKING IN MY DIRECTION.
- 11 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU CALL ANYBODY WHEN YOU GOT OUT
- 12 OF THE VEHICLE AT WALTER HARRIS'S?
- 13 A. YES, SIR.
- 14 Q. AND WHO DID YOU CALL?
- 15 A. DARIUS GARDNER.
- 16 Q. AND HOW LONG APPROXIMATELY DID IT TAKE TO GET
- 17 FROM THE VICTIM'S APARTMENT WHEN Y'ALL WERE
- 18 RUNNING FROM THERE TO THE AREA WHERE WALTER
- 19 HARRIS LIVES?
- 20 A. LIKE, APPROXIMATELY FIVE MINUTES.
- 21 Q. OKAY. A PRETTY BRIEF AMOUNT OF TIME, THEN?
- 22 A. YEAH.
- 23 Q. YOU TESTIFIED YOU GOT OUT AND YOU CALLED DARIUS,
- 24 WHAT WAS THE WEATHER LIKE WHEN YOU GOT OUT OF THE
- 25 VEHICLE?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

324

1 A. RAINING.

2 Q . AND WHY DID YOU CALL DARIUS WHEN YOU GOT OUT OF
3 THE VEHICLE?

4 A. BECAUSE I HAD NEEDED A RIDE, I WAS WALKING IN THE
5 RAIN.

6 Q. OKAY. DID YOU TALK TO DARIUS GARDNER?

7 A. YES.

8 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID YOU ASK HIM TO DO?

9 A. TO GIVE ME A RIDE TO SANTEE, TO MY MOTHER'S
10 HOUSE.

11 Q. OKAY. DID HE COME PICK YOU UP AFTER YOU TALKED
12 TO HIM ON THE PHONE?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. WHERE APPROXIMATELY IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD
15 DID HE PICK YOU UP AT?

16 A. LIKE, COLEMAN AND GOLF.

17 Q. AND HE GAVE YOU A RIDE TO SANTEE?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. DID Y'ALL TALK ON THE WAY TO SANTEE?

20 A. NO, SIR.

21 Q. DID YOU TELL HIM WHAT HAPPENED AT CHARLES
22 PRINGLE'S HOUSE?

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. WHY NOT?

25 A. BECAUSE I AIN'T, HE DIDN'T NEED TO KNOW ANYTHING,

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

325

1 I WAS TOLD NOT TO SAY NOTHING.

2 Q. AND ABOUT HOW LONG DID IT TAKE HIM TO GET YOU
3 HOME THAT NIGHT, TO SANTEE?

4 A. ABOUT THIRTY MINUTES.

5 Q. DID DARIUS STAY WITH YOU WHEN HE DROPPED YOU OFF
6 AT SANTEE?

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. DID YOU TRY CALLING HIM AGAIN LATER THAT NIGHT?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. AND WHY IS THAT?

11 A. I WAS TRYING TO MAKE SURE HE MADE IT HOME SAFE.

12 Q. WHY WOULD YOU, WAS THERE ANYTHING THAT MADE YOU
13 CONCERNED ABOUT TRAVEL THAT NIGHT? WHAT WAS THE
14 WEATHER LIKE?

15 A. OH, IT WAS RAINING.

16 Q. ALRIGHT. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, DID YOU HAVE
17 ANYMORE CONTACT WITH ANY OF THE FIVE DEFENDANTS
18 ON THAT NIGHT OF MARCH THE TWELFTH, AFTER THE
19 MURDER?

20 A. THAT NIGHT?

21 Q. THAT NIGHT.

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. DID YOU HAVE ANYMORE CONTACT WITH ANY OF
24 THE DEFENDANTS ON MARCH THE THIRTEENTH, OR
25 FOURTEENTH OR FIFTEENTH?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

326

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. AND WHICH DEFENDANTS DID YOU HAVE CONTACT WITH ON
3 THOSE DAYS?

4 A. MARIO SHIVERS.

5 Q. ANYBODY ELSE?

6 A. I THINK DANNY RYANT, I'M NOT SURE.

7 Q. WHICH ONE DO YOU -- OR IF -- WHICH ONE DO YOU
8 KNOW YOU SPOKE WITH AFTER MARCH THIRTEENTH OR
9 FOURTEENTH?

10 A. MARIO.

11 Q. OKAY. AND HOW DID YOU SPEAK TO MARIO SHIVERS?

12 A. WE WAS TALKING ABOUT WHAT HAD HAPPENED, AND HE
13 WAS TELLING ME HOW MANY BULLETS WAS GONE OUT OF
14 HIS PISTOL, AND I WAS TOLD NOT TO SAY NOTHING.

15 Q. AND WHICH PISTOL WAS HIS?

16 A. THE NINE MILLIMETER.

17 Q. DID YOU TALK TO ANYONE ELSE OTHER THAN MR.
18 SHIVERS AFTER THE MURDER?

19 A. YOU MEAN, ANY OF MY CO-DEFENDANTS?

20 Q. YEAH, ANY OF THEM, ANY OTHER ONES?

21 A. YES, I THINK I TALKED TO DANNY RYANT.

22 Q. OKAY. DO YOU REMEMBER WHAT THAT CONVERSATION WAS
23 ABOUT?

24 A. WELL, NOT TO SAY NOTHING.

25 Q. OKAY. HOW MANY TIMES DO YOU THINK YOU WALKED TO

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

327

- 1 MR. SHIVERS?
- 2 A. ABOUT THREE OR FOUR TIMES.
- 3 Q. ALL BY PHONE?
- 4 A. YES, SIR.
- 5 Q. NEVER FACE TO FACE?
- 6 A. NO, SIR.
- 7 Q. DID YOU WANT TO HANG OUT WITH ANY OF THE
- 8 DEFENDANTS AFTER MARCH THE TWELFTH?
- 9 A. NO, SIR.
- 10 Q. OKAY. AND WHY IS THAT?
- 11 A. BECAUSE I WAS SCARED AND . . .
- 12 Q. ALRIGHT, LET ME ASK YOU ABOUT MARCH THE
- 13 EIGHTEENTH. TELL THE JURY WHAT YOU ENDED UP
- 14 DOING ON THAT DAY, ON THURSDAY, MARCH THE
- 15 EIGHTEENTH, LESS THAN A WEEK AFTER THE MURDER OF
- 16 CHARLES PRINGLE?
- 17 A. I TURNED MYSELF IN.
- 18 Q. AND WHY DID YOU TURN YOURSELF IN TO THE POLICE?
- 19 A. BECAUSE I FELT LIKE THAT'S WHAT I HAD NEEDED TO
- 20 DO, AND I HEARD THE POLICE WAS LOOKING FOR ME.
- 21 Q. WHERE DID YOU GO TURN YOURSELF INTO?
- 22 A. ORANGEBURG COUNTY.
- 23 Q. OKAY. RIGHT THERE ON ELLIS AVENUE?
- 24 A. YES, SIR.
- 25 Q. AND WHO TOOK YOU TO THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

328

1 A. MY MOTHER.

2 Q. YOUR MOTHER?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. DID YOU MEET WITH ANYBODY AT THE SHERIFF'S
5 OFFICE?

6 A. SHUMPERT.

7 Q. YOU DID, INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT?

8 A. YES.

9 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU COOPERATE AND GIVE
10 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT A STATEMENT THAT DAY?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND LET ME SHOW YOU SOMETHING TO REFRESH YOUR
13 MEMORY, I'M NOT EVEN GOING TO MARK IT, IF THAT'S
14 OKAY, JUST -- IS THAT THE ADVICE OF RIGHTS THAT
15 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT WENT OVER WITH YOU?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. THAT'S YOUR MIRANDA RIGHTS, RIGHT? AT WHAT TIME,
18 JUST TO REFRESH YOUR MEMORY, IT WAS ON MARCH THE
19 EIGHTEENTH THAT YOU ...

20 A. FOUR:FORTY-THREE.

21 Q. FOUR:FORYT-THREE IS WHEN YOU TALKED TO
22 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. ABOUT THAT TIME. AND DID YOU TELL HIM ABOUT
25 EVERYBODY INVOLVED IN THE MURDER, ROBBERY AND

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

329

1 BURGLARY OF CHARLES PRINGLE?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, YOU KNEW WALTER HARRIS'S
4 FULL NAME BACK THEN, RIGHT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. YOU KNEW MARIO SHIVERS'S FULL NAME BACK IN MARCH?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. WHY DIDN'T YOU TELL INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT WHAT
9 THEIR FULL NAME WAS WHEN YOU FIRST GAVE YOUR
10 STATEMENT THAT DAY?

11 A. BECAUSE I WAS TOLD NOT TO SAY NOTHING.

12 Q. AND DID YOU MENTION DARIUS AT ALL TO INVESTIGATOR
13 SHUMPERT?

14 A. NO, SIR.

15 Q. AND WHY NOT?

16 A. BECAUSE HE DIDN'T HAVE NOTHING TO DO WITH IT.

17 Q. BUT YOU TOLD SHUMPERT THAT DAY THE NAMES OF THE
18 PEOPLE WHO WAS INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY, CORRECT?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. DID ANYONE SHOW YOU ANY PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUPS
21 THROUGHOUT THE WEEK TO ASK IF YOU RECOGNIZED
22 ANYBODY?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. I'M GOING TO SHOW YOU SOME PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUPS
25 JUST FOR THE PURPOSES OF IDENTIFICATION. OKAY?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

330

1 DO YOU RECOGNIZE STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-SIX?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. AND WHO DID YOU RECOGNIZE IN STATE'S EXHIBIT
4 NUMBER SEVENTY-SIX?

5 A. DANNY RYANT.

6 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S PHOTOGRAPH NUMBER TWO?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. AND DID YOU PICK HIM OUT BECAUSE HE WAS INVOLVED
9 IN THE ROBBERY?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. DID YOU ALSO FILL OUT AN AFFIDAVIT ON STATE'S
12 EXHIBIT SEVENTY-SIX?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AND AGAIN, THAT'S JUST FOR
15 IDENTIFICATION, WE'RE NOT PUTTING ANY OF THESE INTO
16 EVIDENCE.

17 (State's Exhibit Seventy-six,
18 Photographic lineup,
19 marked for identification only.)

20 Q. DO YOU RECOGNIZE STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-SEVEN?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. DID YOU PICK ANYBODY OUT IN STATE'S EXHIBIT
23 SEVENTY-SEVEN AS BEING INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY
24 AND MURDER?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

331

1 Q. WHICH ONE?

2 A. MARIO, NUMBER THREE.

3 Q. AND WHO IS NUMBER THREE?

4 A. MARIO SHIVERS.

5 Q. MARIO SHIVERS? AND DID YOU FILL OUT AN AFFIDAVIT
6 ABOUT PICKING OUT MARIO SHIVERS?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND IS MARIO SHIVERS IN THE COURTROOM
9 RIGHT NOW?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. POINT HIM OUT AS BEST YOU CAN FOR THE JURY?

12 A. OVER THERE SITTING IN THE LAST SEAT.

13 Q. IN THE LAST SEAT?

14 A. UH-HUH.

15 COURT REPORTER: THAT'S FOR ID, TOO?

16 SOLICITOR PASCOE: JUST ID, YES, MA'AM, SEVENTY-
17 SIX AND SEVENTY-SEVEN.

18 (State's Exhibit Seventy-seven,
19 photographic lineup,
20 marked for identification only.)

21 Q. AND IS DANNY RYANT WHO YOU PICKED OUT AND WAS
22 INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY, IS HE IN THE COURTROOM
23 TODAY?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. PICK HIM OUT FOR THE JURY.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

332

1 A. SITTING BEHIND (Points toward defendants)

2 Q. RIGHT NEXT TO MARIO?

3 A. SECOND TO THE LAST.

4 Q. DO YOU SEE WALTER HARRIS, PETE, IN THE COURTROOM
5 TODAY?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND HE WAS INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY AND MURDER?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. POINT HIM OUT FOR THE JURY?

10 A. (Points toward defendants)

11 Q. IS HE IN THE BLUE SHIRT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. SITTING IN THE MIDDLE?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. NOW, I'M GOING TO SHOW YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED AS
16 STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-EIGHT - - -

17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: JUST FOR IDENTIFICATION, MS.

18 HARRY DOT, IT'S JUST GOING TO BE FOR ID, OKAY?

19 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

20 THE COURT: WHAT'S THE NUMBER?

21 SOLICITOR PASCOE: SEVENTY-EIGHT, YOUR HONOR.

22 (State's Exhibit Seventy-eight,

23 photographic lineup,

24 marked for identification only.)

25 Q. WERE YOU ASKED TO SEE IF YOU RECOGNIZED ANYBODY

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

333

- 1 IN STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-EIGHT AS BEING
2 INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY AND MURDER?
3 A. YES, SIR.
4 Q. DID YOU PICK ANYBODY OUT?
5 A. YES, SIR.
6 Q. WHICH ONE?
7 A. NUMBER ONE.
8 Q. AND WHO IS NUMBER ONE?
9 A. RALPH COLEMAN.
10 Q. AND YOU FILLED OUT AN AFFIDAVIT TO THAT EFFECT ON
11 STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-EIGHT?
12 A. YES, SIR.
13 Q. AND IS RALPH COLEMAN IN THE COURTROOM TODAY?
14 A. YES, SIR.
15 Q. POINT HIM OUT FOR THE JURY.
16 A. (Points toward defendants)
17 Q. IS HE THE ONE IN THE COAT AND TIE?
18 A. YES, SIR.
19 Q. BEHIND MS. ULLMAN, OR BEHIND THE FEMALE?
20 A. YES, SIR.
21 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AGAIN, THAT'S SEVENTY-EIGHT
22 JUST FOR ID, YOUR HONOR.
23 (State's Exhibit Seventy-nine,
24 photographic lineup,
25 marked for identification only.)

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

334

- 1 Q. AND FINALLY, WITH REGARDS TO THE LINEUPS, I'M
2 GOING TO SHOW YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-NINE
3 FOR IDENTIFICATION. DID YOU RECOGNIZE ANYBODY
4 FROM THIS LINEUP AS BEING INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY
5 AND MURDER OF CHARLES PRINGLE?
- 6 A. YES, SIR.
- 7 Q. WHICH ONE?
- 8 A. NUMBER TWO.
- 9 Q. AND DID YOU PICK NUMBER TWO OUT?
- 10 A. YES, SIR.
- 11 Q. AND WHO IS NUMBER TWO?
- 12 A. CHRIS COLEMAN.
- 13 Q. AND YOU ALSO FILLED OUT AN AFFIDAVIT ON HIM AS
14 WELL?
- 15 A. YES, SIR.
- 16 Q. AND DO YOU SEE CHRISTOPHER COLEMAN WHO WAS
17 INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY AND MURDER OF CHARLES
18 PRINGLE IN THE COURTROOM?
- 19 A. YES, SIR.
- 20 Q. POINT HIM OUT FOR THE JURY.
- 21 A. THE FIRST ONE.
- 22 Q. THE FIRST ONE?
- 23 A. YES, SIR.
- 24 Q. THE WHITE SHIRT?
- 25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

335

1 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YOUR HONOR, I'M GOING TO --
2 BEFORE I FORGET, SINCE THEY'RE ID, MARK THEM ID.

3 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR, AND GIVE ME TIME TO
4 PUT THOSE ON MY LIST, TOO.

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: OKAY. OKAY. ARE YOU READY,
6 MS. HARRY DOT?

7 COURT REPORTER: I THINK SO, YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. MR. TYLER, AFTER YOU GAVE YOUR STATEMENT
9 TO INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT THAT DAY AND TOLD HIM
10 WHO WAS INVOLVED IN THE ROBBERY, DID YOU GET TO
11 GO HOME?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. YOU WERE CHARGED WITH THE MURDER, ARMED
14 ROBBERY AND BURGLARY, FIRST, THAT DAY?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. WHERE DID YOU HAVE TO GO AT THAT TIME?

17 A. JUVE - DJJ.

18 Q. OKAY. WHY DID YOU GO TO DJJ?

19 A. BECAUSE I WAS A JUVENILE.

20 Q. YOU WERE ONLY SIXTEEN AT THE TIME?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. BUT AS YOU TOLD THE JURY, YOU'RE BEING TREATED AS
23 AN ADULT, YOU'RE NOT A JUVENILE, CORRECT?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. IN FACT, AFTER YOU TURNED SEVENTEEN WHERE DID YOU

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

336

1 GO?

2 A. TO ORANGEBURG COUNTY.

3 Q. TO THE DETENTION CENTER IN ORANGEBURG?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. AND HOW LONG DID YOU STAY IN ORANGEBURG?

6 A. LIKE, THREE, TWO MONTHS.

7 Q. AND THEN THEY SHIPPED YOU TO BAMBERG?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. NOW, LET ME ASK YOU THIS, YOU TOLD THE JURY THAT
10 YOU DIDN'T EVEN HAVE A GUN DURING THE MURDER AND
11 THE ROBBERY AND BURGLARY, CORRECT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. DO YOU HAVE AN ATTORNEY, MR. CARL GRANT?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. AND YOU UNDERSTAND, THE HAND OF ONE IS THE HAND
16 OF ALL?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. OKAY. YOU KNOW THAT YOU'RE JUST AS GUILTY AS
19 ANYONE WHO PULLED THE TRIGGER AND MURDERED?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. AND EVEN THOUGH YOU'RE JUST SIXTEEN YOU'RE
22 CHARGED WITH MURDER, BURGLARY, FIRST, AND ARMED
23 ROBBERY. WITH THOSE CHARGES, YOU KNOW, YOU'RE
24 LOOKING AT A MANDATORY SENTENCE OF THIRTY YEARS
25 TO LIFE WITHOUT PAROLE, RIGHT?

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

337

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. HAVE I PROMISED YOU ANY SENTENCE FOR YOUR
3 COOPERATION?

4 A. NO, SIR.

5 Q. BUT THE ONE THING WE ARE ALLOWING YOU TO DO
6 BECAUSE OF YOUR COOPERATION BACK IN MARCH AND
7 YOUR TESTIMONY IS, WE'RE GOING TO REDUCE YOUR
8 MURDER TO VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. AND THAT REDUCES THE AMOUNT OF TIME YOU'RE
11 LOOKING AT FROM THIRTY YEARS TO LIFE WITHOUT
12 PAROLE TO FIFTEEN YEARS TO LIFE WITHOUT PAROLE?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. YOU UNDERSTAND THAT? SO, EVEN THOUGH YOU'RE
15 TESTIFYING TODAY YOU COULD STILL GET THIRTY
16 YEARS, ISN'T THAT RIGHT?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. YOU COULD STILL GET LIFE?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. SIXTEEN YEARS OLD. HAVE I OR ANYONE PROMISED YOU
21 WHAT SENTENCE YOU'RE GOING TO GET?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. AND YOU'VE BEEN TOLD THAT THE SENTENCE IS GOING
24 TO BE LEFT TOTALLY UP TO THE JUDGE, CORRECT?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

338

1 Q. IS THIS THE FIRST TIME YOU'VE EVER BEEN IN
2 TROUBLE IN GENERAL SESSIONS COURT, IN ADULT
3 COURT?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. OKAY. BUT YOU DO HAVE A JUVENILE ADJUDICATION
6 FOR WHAT, PETTY LARCENY BACK IN NOVEMBER OF O-
7 NINE?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. JUST A HANDFUL MORE QUESTIONS. OKAY? I ASKED
10 YOU SOME QUESTIONS EARLIER ABOUT THE DRIVER OF
11 THE EXPLORER?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. TO THIS DAY DO YOU PERSONALLY KNOW WHO THE DRIVER
14 IS?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. DID I SHOW YOU, I GUESS IT WAS A WEEK OR TWO AGO,
17 SEVERAL PHOTOGRAPHS OF RIFLES TO SEE IF YOU COULD
18 RECOGNIZE ANY THAT WOULD LOOK LIKE THE ONES THAT
19 WERE USED DURING THE MURDER?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. AND DID YOU PICK ONE OUT?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. LET ME SHOW YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED AS STATE'S
24 EXHIBIT SEVENTY-FIVE, IS THAT THE ONE YOU PICKED,
25 FOR JUST IDENTIFICATION, IS THIS THE ONE THAT YOU

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

339

1 PICKED OUT AS LOOKING LIKE ONE OF THE RIFLES
2 Y'ALL USED?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY.

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THAT'S JUST ID.

6 (State's Exhibit Seventy-five,
7 photograph of rifle,
8 marked for identification only.)

9 Q. YOU TESTIFIED THAT WALTER HARRIS HAD A BLACK GUN?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AND WHO DID HE LET USE IT?

12 A. RALPH.

13 (State's Exhibit Seventy-three,
14 photo of rifle,
15 marked for identification only.)

16 Q. DO YOU RECOGNIZE STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-THREE
17 FOR IDENTIFICATION?

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. DOES THAT NOT LOOK LIKE ONE OF THE GUNS THAT WAS
20 USED IN THE ROBBERY?

21 A. IT'S BLACK.

22 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE JUST
23 ASKED IF HE RECOGNIZED IT AND HE SAID, NO, SIR, AND
24 THEN HE TOLD HIM DID THAT NOT LOOK LIKE THE GUN IN THE
25 ROBBERY. HE SAID HE DIDN'T RECOGNIZE IT.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

340

1 THE COURT: I'M SORRY, DID HE SAY - - -

2 A. I DIDN'T THE GUN, BUT IT WAS BLACK.

3 THE COURT: WAIT, WAIT, HOLD ON ONE SECOND, DON'T
4 SAY ANYTHING ELSE, I NEED -- DID HE SAY, NO, SIR, HE
5 DID NOT RECOGNIZE IT?

6 MR. LACKEY: I DIDN'T, I WASN'T PAYING ATTENTION.

7 THE COURT: OKAY.

8 MR. PALMER: YOUR HONOR, HE DID.

9 THE COURT: OKAY. YOU SAID YOU DID NOT RECOGNIZE
10 THAT GUN?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 THE COURT: OKAY.

13 COURT REPORTER: I WROTE, NO, SIR.

14 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. HE SAID HE DID NOT RECOGNIZE
15 IT.

16 Q. WHAT COLOR GUN DID WALTER HARRIS HAVE?

17 A. BLACK.

18 Q. OKAY. WHAT COLOR DOES THAT LOOK LIKE?

19 A. BLACK.

20 Q. OKAY. NOW, AS YOU TESTIFIED TO EARLIER, YOU
21 DIDN'T KNOW THE MODEL OF THE GUN WALTER HARRIS
22 HAD?

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. BUT HE HAD A BLACK GUN?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

341

1 Q. LIKE STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-THREE?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. THE ONLY BRAND YOU KNEW WAS THE NINE MILLIMETER
4 CHROME GUN, CORRECT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. AND FINALLY, PATRICK, I WANT TO ASK YOU ABOUT
7 SOME PHONE CALLS YOU MADE ON MARCH THE TWELFTH.
8 WHAT WAS YOUR PHONE NUMBER BACK ON MARCH THE
9 TWELFTH?

10 A. [REDACTED]-6062.

11 Q. [REDACTED]-6062?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. YOU TESTIFIED EARLIER THAT YOU SPOKE WITH DANNY
14 RYANT ON THE TELEPHONE AND THAT'S WHEN YOU
15 LEARNED ABOUT MARIO HAVING GUNS?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. WHO WERE YOU CALLING AT APPROXIMATELY SIX:THIRTY-
18 THREE AND AT SIX:FORTY P.M., AT [REDACTED]-2014?

19 A. DANNY RYANT.

20 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT WAS THAT CONVERSATION ABOUT?

21 A. ABOUT MARIO HAD GUNS.

22 Q. OKAY. AND THEN YOU TESTIFIED YOU TALKED TO MARIO
23 SHIVERS ON THE TELEPHONE?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. WHO WERE YOU TALKING TO ON YOUR TELEPHONE RECORDS

DIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

342

1 BETWEEN SIX -- OR EXCUSE ME -- YEAH, SIX:FORTY-
2 SIX P.M., OFF AND ON UNTIL SEVEN:TWENTY-SIX P.M.,
3 AT [REDACTED]-6417?

4 A. MARIO SHIVERS.

5 Q. YOU TESTIFIED THAT YOU CALLED DARIUS SOMETIME
6 AFTER THE MURDER WEN YOU GOT DROPPED OFF?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. WHO DID YOU CALL AT TEN:O-TWO P.M., AT [REDACTED]-6216?

9 A. DARIUS GARDNER.

10 Q. AND THAT WAS AFTER YOU GOT DROPPED OFF?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE.

13 THE COURT: YES, SIR, TAKE YOUR TIME.

14 Q. AND WITH REGARDS TO THE TELEPHONE RECORDS -- I
15 CAN'T FIND -- IS THAT -- WHO IS TERIQUE WILSON?

16 A. MY BROTHER.

17 Q. OKAY. AND THE PHONE YOU WERE USING, IS IT IN
18 TERIQUE'S NAME?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, MR. TYLER, ANSWER
21 ANY QUESTIONS DEFENSE ATTORNEYS HAVE FOR YOU, OKAY?

22 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY?

23 MR. LACKEY: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

24 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
25 part of record has been omitted.)

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

343

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. LACKEY:

Q. MR. TYLER, IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY HERE TODAY THAT,
YOU I BELIEVE, MARIO SHIVERS -- IS IT SHIVERS OR
SHIVERS?

A. SHIVERS.

Q. MARIO SHIVERS AND RALPH COLEMAN PLANNED THIS
ROBBERY, IS THAT CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY HERE TODAY THAT THE GUNS
WERE MARIO SHIVERS'S GUNS?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY HERE TODAY THAT THE
DRIVER AND MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN COLEMAN, HAPPENED
TO PULL UP AT SOME POINT THAT DAY?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY HERE TODAY THAT THEY
PULLED UP TO WOODBINE?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. DO YOU RECALL AFTER YOUR, AFTER YOU WERE PICKED
UP BY INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT, DO YOU RECALL MAKING
A WRITTEN STATEMENT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. NOW, WAS THAT STATEMENT TRUTHFUL?

A. YES, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

344

1 MR. LACKEY: I'D LIKE TO MARK THIS AS DEFENDANT'S
2 EXHIBIT ONE.

3 COURT REPORTER: WHICH DEFENDANT'S?

4 MR. LACKEY: CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

5 THE COURT: THE DEFENDANT CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

6 COURT REPORTER: CHRISTIAN COLEMAN?

7 MR. LACKEY: YES, MA'AM.

8 COURT REPORTER: DO YOU WANT THESE CLIPPED
9 TOGETHER?

10 MR. LACKEY: YES, MA'AM, IF YOU'D JUST STAPLE
11 THOSE, THAT'S FINE.

12 COURT REPORTER: DEFENDANT CHRISTIAN COLEMAN
13 NUMBER ONE.

14 (Defendant Christian Coleman's Exhibit One
15 marked and filed.)

16 Q. MR. TYLER, LET ME HAND YOU WHAT'S JUST BEEN
17 MARKED DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT ONE FOR CHRISTIAN
18 COLEMAN. DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND WHAT IS THAT?

21 A. THE STATEMENT I WROTE.

22 Q. DID YOU WRITE THAT IN YOUR OWN HANDWRITING?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. LET ME GET YOU TO LOOK AT FOUR LINES DOWN. ISN'T
25 IT TRUE IN YOUR STATEMENT YOU WROTE HERE THAT

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

345

1 SOMEONE CAME AND PICKED YOU UP FROM BROOKDALE?

2 A. YES, SIR. THAT'S THE ONLY PART I WAS UNTRUTHFUL
3 ABOUT.

4 Q. OKAY.

5 COURT REPORTER: THAT'S THE ONLY PART WHAT?

6 A. I BEEN UNTRUTHFUL ABOUT.

7 Q. LET ME GET YOU TO FLIP ON OVER TWO OTHER PAGES,
8 THAT'S BASICALLY A LIST OF QUESTIONS AND
9 ANSWERS. DO YOU SEE THAT?

10 A. YES.

11 Q. AND WHO WROTE THAT?

12 A. I DID.

13 Q. DID YOU WRITE THE QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS OR DID
14 YOU JUST WRITE THE ANSWERS?

15 A. OH, I JUST WRITE THE ANSWERS.

16 Q. OKAY. AND WHO WROTE THE QUESTIONS?

17 A. I HAVE NO IDEA. SHUMPERT, I THINK SHUMPERT.

18 Q. OKAY. THIS IS WHEN YOU WERE INTERVIEWED BY
19 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT?

20 A. YES.

21 Q. ALRIGHT. ALRIGHT, DO YOU RECALL TESTIFYING HERE
22 TODAY THAT, YOU TESTIFIED THAT ENTERING THE
23 APARTMENT CHRISTIAN COLEMAN HAD A GUN?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. IN THIS STATEMENT, IN THIS ANSWER YOU GAVE, WHEN

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

346

1 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT ASKED YOU WHO ALL HAD GUNS,
2 WHO DID YOU ANSWER HERE?

3 A. PETE, LITTLE M, POKE AND RALPH.

4 Q. OKAY.

5 COURT REPORTER: PETE WHAT?

6 A. LITTLE M, POKE AND RALPH.

7 Q. AND LET ME DROP IT DOWN ABOUT FIVE MORE
8 QUESTIONS, IT SAYS, WHO ALL TOOK GUNS INTO THE
9 APARTMENT?

10 A. OH, YES.

11 Q. AND WHAT WAS YOUR ANSWER THERE?

12 A. LITTLE M, POKE, PETE AND RALPH.

13 Q. SO, YOU NEVER DID SAY CHRISTIAN COLEMAN HAD A
14 GUN, DID YOU?

15 A. YES, I DID. I HAD MENTIONED IT IN ONE OF MY
16 STATEMENTS.

17 Q. OKAY. BUT YOU DIDN'T WRITE IT ON HERE, IS THAT
18 CORRECT?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. NOW, YOU MENTIONED EARLIER ALSO THAT WHEN, WHEN
21 Y'ALL WERE PLANNING THIS ROBBERY THAT WAS YOU,
22 MARIO AND RALPH?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. YOU MENTIONED THAT MY CLIENT, CHRISTIAN COLEMAN,
25 AND ANOTHER INDIVIDUAL CAME AND PICKED Y'ALL UP?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

347

- 1 A. YES, SIR.
- 2 Q. AND AGAIN, DID YOU SAY THAT WAS FROM BROOKDALE OR
- 3 FROM WOODBINE?
- 4 A. WOODBINE.
- 5 Q. OKAY. SO, THEY WEREN'T SITTING AROUND TALKING
- 6 WITH Y'ALL, PLANNING THIS ROBBERY?
- 7 A. NO, SIR.
- 8 Q. AND WHEREVER THEY PICKED YOU UP FROM, THEY WERE
- 9 BOTH IN THE FRONT SEATS?
- 10 A. YES, SIR.
- 11 Q. SO, WHATEVER Y'ALL TALKED ABOUT WHEN YOU GOT IN
- 12 THE BACK SEAT, BOTH RONNIE WASHINGTON AND
- 13 CHRISTIAN COLEMAN HEARD, IS THAT CORRECT?
- 14 A. YES.
- 15 Q. AND ALL THESE GUNS THAT MARIO SHIVERS HAD, THEY
- 16 WERE IN THE BACK OF THE VEHICLE?
- 17 A. YES, SIR.
- 18 Q. THE VERY BACK?
- 19 A. YES.
- 20 Q. SO, NOT JUST IN THE BACK SEAT BUT IN THE BACK
- 21 COMPARTMENT?
- 22 A. YES, SIR.
- 23 Q. SO, POINT OUT FOR THE JURY WHERE ON THAT VEHICLE?
- 24 A. THE HATCH BACK.
- 25 Q. THE HATCH BACK. OKAY. YOU SAID THIS WHOLE DAY

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

348

1 YOU STARTED OFF BY SMOKING MARIJUANA?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. AND THEN YOU SMOKED MARIJUANA AGAIN WHEN YOU WERE
4 PLANNING THIS WHOLE THING WITH MARIO AND RALPH?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. DOES THAT MAKE YOUR MEMORY A LITTLE HAZY AT ALL
7 OR NOT?

8 A. NO, SIR.

9 Q. DO YOU SMOKE MARIJUANA A LOT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. SOLICITOR PASCOE MENTIONED THAT YOU ARE CHARGED
12 WITH THE SAME CHARGES THAT THESE FIVE INDIVIDUALS
13 ARE CHARGED WITH, IS THAT CORRECT?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. HOWEVER, HE DID STATE THAT THERE'S BEEN
16 CONSIDERATION GIVEN TO YOU FOR TESTIFYING HERE
17 TODAY, IS THAT CORRECT?

18 A. IT WAS WHAT?

19 Q. CONSIDERATION GIVEN, YOUR CHARGES HAVE ACTUALLY
20 BEEN LESSENER BECAUSE YOU'RE TESTIFYING HERE
21 TODAY, IS THAT CORRECT?

22 A. YES.

23 Q. SO, ISN'T IT TRUE TO SAY THAT YOU WILL SAY
24 WHATEVER YOU CAN SAY TODAY TO GET A BETTER DEAL
25 FOR YOURSELF?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

349

1 A. IS IT TRUE?

2 Q. UH-HUH.

3 A. NO.

4 Q. NO?

5 A. IS IT TRUE THAT WHATEVER I SAY OR - - -

6 Q. YES, SIR.

7 A. --- I COULD TELL LIES STILL. NO, IT'S NOT TRUE.

8 Q. SO YOU COULD TELL A LIE JUST AS EASY AS ANYTHING
9 ELSE?

10 A. NO. NO, SIR.

11 Q. SO, WHAT ARE YOU SAYING THEN?

12 A. YOU'RE SAYING, IF I TELL A LIE I STILL COULD GET
13 TIME DROPPED OFF? NO, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. WELL, YOU SAID YOU JUST LIED ABOUT THE
15 'BROOKDALE AND WOODBINE, DIDN'T YOU?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU KNOW THIS RONNIE WASHINGTON
18 FELLOW WHO WAS THE DRIVER, DO YOU KNOW HE WAS
19 NEVER ARRESTED?

20 A. WHAT DID YOU SAY?

21 Q. DO YOU KNOW THAT THIS SUPPOSED RONNIE WASHINGTON
22 FELLOW, DO YOU KNOW HE WAS NEVER ARRESTED FOR
23 ANYTHING?

24 A. NO, NO, SIR.

25 MR. LACKEY: I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

350

1 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.

2 MR. WISE. AND THANK YOU FOR RAISING YOUR HAND,

3 MR. WISE.

4 MR. WISE: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT?

5 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

6 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
7 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
8 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
9 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
10 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

351

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. WISE:

Q. MR. TYLER, YOU WOULD HAVE TO AGREE THAT AS YOU
SIT THERE NOW YOU ARE IN BIG TROUBLE, RIGHT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AS YOU SIT THERE RIGHT NOW YOU ARE FACING LIFE
IMPRISONMENT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. BUT MR. PASCOE HAS AGREED TO REDUCE -- TO ALLOW
YOU TO LEAD GUILTY - - -

A. YES, SIR.

Q. --- TO MANSLAUGHTER?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND THE PUNISHMENT FOR MANSLAUGHTER IS WHAT?

A. LIFE.

Q. DID YOU TALK ABOUT THE PUNISHMENT WITH MR.
PASCOE?

A. YES.

Q. SO, EVEN THOUGH AT THIS POINT YOU ARE GOING TO BE
ALLOWED TO PLEAD TO A REDUCED CHARGE, YOU STILL
WANT TO DO THE LEAST AMOUNT OF TIME YOU CAN DO,
IS THAT CORRECT?

A. NO.

Q. LET ME ASK IT THIS WAY, ---

COURT REPORTER: WHAT WAS YOUR ANSWER?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

352

1 A. NO.

2 Q. --- YOU DON'T WANT TO GO TO JAIL FOR THIRTY
3 YEARS, DO YOU?

4 A. NO, SIR.

5 Q. OKAY. WHEN THE TIMES COMES YOU WANT TO DO THE
6 LEAST AMOUNT OF TIME THAT YOU CAN?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. NOW, YOU GOT A CALL FROM MARIO
9 AND HE TOLD YOU HE HAD A LICK, RIGHT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AND WHEN HE CALLED YOU AND SAID HE HAD A LICK YOU
12 KNEW EXACTLY WHAT HE WAS TALKING ABOUT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. WHAT DID YOU KNOW THAT EXPRESSION TO MEAN?

15 A. A LICK?

16 Q. YEAH, UH-HUH.

17 A. A ROBBERY.

18 Q. A ROBBERY. SO, WHEN HE CALLED YOU AND SAID THAT
19 YOU KNEW THAT THERE WAS GOING TO BE -- YOU AND HE
20 WERE GOING TO ENGAGE IN ROBBING SOMEBODY?

21 A. NO, I CALLED HIM.

22 Q. YOU CALLED HIM, AND YOU SAID YOU HAD A LICK?

23 A. NO, I CALLED HIM AND HE TOLD ME HE HAD A LICK.

24 Q. OKAY, OKAY. DID YOU ASK HIM WHO THE VICTIM OF
25 THIS LICK WAS GOING TO BE?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

353

- 1 A. NO, SIR.
- 2 Q. WAS IT IMPORTANT WHO THE VICTIM WAS GOING TO BE?
- 3 A. YES, SIR, NO, SIR, YEAH.
- 4 Q. NO, WOULD NOT HAVE CHANGED YOUR PARTICIPATION,
- 5 YOU WOULD LICK ANYBODY WHO HE HAD IN MIND TO
- 6 LICK, RIGHT, IT DIDN'T MATTER?
- 7 A. NO, SIR.
- 8 Q. WHEN HE SAID TO YOU HE HAD A LICK DID YOU KNOW
- 9 THAT THERE WERE GOING TO BE GUNS INVOLVED?
- 10 A. NO, SIR.
- 11 Q. YOU THOUGHT HE WAS GOING TO COMMIT A ROBBERY
- 12 WITHOUT ANY WEAPONS?
- 13 A. MAYBE.
- 14 Q. WHEN YOU, WHEN YOU TALKED TO HIM ABOUT A LICK,
- 15 IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY YOU THOUGHT MAYBE YOU WOULD
- 16 DO THIS LICK WITH YOUR BARE HANDS, JUST WALK UP
- 17 AND TRY TO SCARE SOMEBODY INTO GIVING UP THEIR
- 18 PROPERTY, IS THAT YOUR TESTIMONY?
- 19 A. MAYBE.
- 20 Q. MAYBE. OKAY. IS THAT THE WAY YOU NORMALLY
- 21 COMMIT LICKS?
- 22 A. I DON'T GO AROUND COMMITTING LICKS.
- 23 Q. YOU DON'T?
- 24 A. NO.
- 25 Q. BUT WHEN MARIO CALLED YOU, YOU DIDN'T HESITATE,

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

354

1 DID YOU?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. YOU WENT WITH THEM?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. YOU DIDN'T ASK WHO WAS GOING TO BE INVOLVED?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. JUST READY TO GO?

8 A. NO, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. IT'S YOUR -- WELL, LET ME ASK YOU THIS,
10 MR. TYLER, IF YOU KNEW THAT THERE WERE GOING TO
11 BE GUNS INVOLVED, WOULD IT HAVE STOPPED YOU?

12 A. I PROBABLY WOULD HAVE THOUGHT ABOUT IT.

13 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN YOU FOUND OUT THAT THERE WERE
14 GUNS INVOLVED IT DIDN'T STOP YOU, DID IT?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. OKAY. DID YOU THINK THAT WHEN THERE WERE GOING
17 TO BE GUNS INVOLVED THAT SOMEONE WAS GOING TO BE
18 KILLED?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. AND YOU THOUGHT THAT BECAUSE YOU KNOW THAT PEOPLE
21 CAN BE ROBBED AND NOT SHOT?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. AND IT WAS NEVER YOUR INTENTION FOR SOMEBODY TO
24 GET KILLED ON THIS DAY, WAS IT?

25 A. NO, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

355

1 Q. YOU KNOW THAT YOU CAN ROB A PERSON, EVEN WITH A
2 GUN, AND NOT KILL THEM, DON'T YOU?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. ABSOLUTELY. IT IS REALLY NOT A NORMAL, TYPICAL
5 ROBBERY, EVEN WITH GUNS, TO KILL SOMEBODY, IS IT?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. I'M SORRY?

8 A. I CAN'T ...

9 Q. I'LL REPEAT THE QUESTION. IT IS, FROM YOUR
10 EXPERIENCE, THE TYPICAL ROBBERY WITH A GUN THAT
11 THE PERSON DOES NOT GET KILLED?

12 A. WELL, I HAVE NO IDEA.

13 Q. YOU DON'T KNOW. OKAY. ALRIGHT. IS IT YOUR
14 TESTIMONY THAT YOU'VE NEVER ROBBED SOMEBODY? AND
15 REMEMBER, YOU'RE UNDER OATH. ...

16 A. YOU SAY, DID I EVER ROB SOMEBODY?

17 Q. THAT'S WHAT I SAID.

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. NO, YOU'VE NEVER ROBBED ANYBODY. YOU, YOU'RE
20 FAMILIAR WITH THOSE CONVENIENCE STORY ROBBERIES
21 WHERE SOMEBODY WAS ROBBING THEM WITH A MOTORCYCLE
22 HELMET, YOU HEARD ABOUT THOSE?

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. YOU NEVER HEARD ABOUT THEM?

25 A. NO, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

356

1 Q. OKAY. WAS THIS THE FIRST TIME THAT YOU A MARIO
2 DECIDED TO ROB SOMEBODY?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. THE FIRST TIME YOU AND MARIO EVER TALKED
5 ABOUT ROBBING SOMEBODY?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. SO, IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY THAT OUT OF THE BLUE
8 MARIO CALLED YOU, SAID, I WANT TO ROB SOMEBODY,
9 AND YOU SAY, OKAY?

10 A. NO. I CALLED HIM.

11 Q. I KEEP SAYING THAT. YES, YOU CALLED MARIO, AND
12 MARIO SAYS, I WANT TO ROB SOMEBODY, AND YOU SAY,
13 OKAY, LET'S DO IT?

14 A. YES.

15 Q. NO HESITATION, NO PROBLEM, WHOEVER IT IS,
16 WHEREVER IT IS, WEAPONS OR NOT, LET'S DO IT?

17 A. YES.

18 Q. OKAY. WHEN THIS THING WENT DOWN AND MR. PRINGLE
19 WAS KILLED, WAS IT A SURPRISE TO YOU?

20 A. REALLY, I DIDN'T KNOW HE WAS DEAD.

21 Q. OKAY. WHEN HE WAS SHOT WAS IT A SURPRISE TO YOU?

22 A. I AIN'T REALLY KNOW HE WAS SHOT BECAUSE I DIDN'T
23 SEEN HIM SHOT.

24 Q. YOU DIDN'T SEE HIM SHOT?

25 A. I DIDN'T SEE NO ONE GET SHOT.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

357

1 Q. YOU DIDN'T SEE ANYONE GET SHOT?

2 A. BESIDES THE DOG.

3 Q. OKAY. THE DOG GETS SHOT, YOU'RE OUT THE DOOR,
4 THAT'S YOUR TESTIMONY?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. AND YOU DON'T KNOW WHO HAD GUNS AND FIRED
7 AT MR. PRINGLE, THAT'S YOUR TESTIMONY?

8 A. I KNOW WHO HAD GUNS BUT I DIDN'T KNOW WHO SHOT.

9 Q. OKAY. WAS THERE, WHEN YOU AND EVERYBODY ELSE
10 WERE TALKING ABOUT THIS LICK, DID YOU EVER
11 DISCUSS KILLING THE VICTIM?

12 A. NO, SIR.

13 Q. AND YOU HAD NO REASON WHEN YOU GOT INTO THE CAR
14 TO BELIEVE SOMEBODY WAS GOING TO END UP DEAD?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. NOW, YOU CALLED MARIO AND MARIO
17 DISCUSSED THIS WITH YOU BECAUSE YOU AND MARIO ARE
18 FRIENDS, RIGHT?

19 A. THAT'S FIRST, HE SAID HE HAD SOMETHING TO SHOW
20 ME.

21 Q. UH-HUH.

22 A. AND HE HAD A LICK. I TELL I WAS GOING TO COME DO
23 IT, I WAS GOING TO COME AND VISIT HIM.

24 Q. UH-HUH. MARIO SAYS HE HAS A LICK AND YOU ARE
25 GOING TO COME AND VISIT HIM?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

358

1 A. YEAH, I WAS GOING TO COME CHILL WITH HIM BECAUSE
2 HE TOLD ME TO COME CHILL WITH HIM.

3 Q. AND DO THE LICK?

4 A. NO, WE WAS COMING -- HE TOLD ME ABOUT THE LICK
5 AND THEN HE TOLD ME TO COME CHILL WITH HIM, HE
6 HAD TO TELL ME SOMETHING, HE HAD TO SHOW ME
7 SOMETHING.

8 Q. OKAY. AND IS IT A FAIR STATEMENT THAT THE REASON
9 HE TALKED TO YOU ABOUT THIS LICK IS BECAUSE YOU
10 AND HE ARE FRIEND?

11 A. NO, SIR, I DON'T KNOW WHY HE CAME AT ME AND TALK
12 ABOUT THE LICK.

13 Q. OKAY. HE JUST, SOMEBODY HE JUST PICKED AND SAID,
14 HEY?

15 A. I GUESS I WAS JUST, BECAUSE I HAD CALLED HIM, AND
16 HE WAS, LIKE, LET'S SEE IF HE WILL DO IT, I
17 GUESS.

18 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND JUST SO WE'RE CLEAR, WHEN
19 YOU WENT INTO MR. PRINGLE'S APARTMENT YOU DID NOT
20 HAVE A GUN WITH YOU?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. OKAY, VERY GOOD. WHEN WALTER HARRIS WENT INTO
23 THE APARTMENT AND SAW THAT THERE WAS A GUN, WHO
24 SAID, WE NEED ANOTHER GUN?

25 A. MARIO.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

359

1 Q. MARIO SHIVERS. AND AT THAT POINT DID YOU SAY,
2 WAIT A MINUTE, YOU'RE GETTING TOO MANY GUNS
3 INVOLVED, I'M LEAVING. DID YOU SAY THAT?

4 A. NO. I WAS THINKING ABOUT IT, THOUGH.

5 Q. BUT YOU DIDN'T?

6 A. YES.

7 Q. YOU THOUGHT HAVING ANOTHER GUN WAS A GOOD THING,
8 DIDN'T YOU?

9 A. NO. BASICALLY, I - - -

10 COURT REPORTER: NO, WHAT?

11 A. NO, SIR.

12 Q. WHEN THEY WENT AND -- THEY LEFT THE APARTMENT AND
13 THEY WENT TO GET ANOTHER GUN, DID YOU SAY, YOU
14 KNOW WHAT, I'M -- YOU DIDN'T SAY, I'M GOING TO
15 LEAVE, THIS IS TOO MUCH?

16 A. I DID HAD MENTIONED TO MARIO THAT I THINK WE
17 SHOULDN'T DO THIS.

18 Q. OKAY. WHEN THEY MENTIONED THAT THEY NEEDED
19 ANOTHER GUN, AT THAT POINT DID YOU THINK THAT THE
20 VICTIM OF THIS LICK WAS GOING TO BE SHOT?

21 A. NO, SIR.

22 Q. OKAY. WHY DID YOU THINK THEY NEEDED ANOTHER GUN?

23 A. THEY, NO ONE HAD NEEDED ANOTHER GUN. THEY SAID
24 THEY HAD NEEDED ANOTHER PERSON, BECAUSE WALTER
25 HARRIS SAID HE AIN'T WANT TO DO IT NO MORE.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

360

1 Q. SO, THEY JUST NEEDED A PERSON, NOT A GUN, THAT'S
2 YOUR TESTIMONY?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. NOW, I THINK ON DIRECT
5 EXAMINATION YOU TESTIFIED THAT THERE WERE FOUR
6 GUNS INVOLVED, TWO HAND GUNS AND TWO RIFLES?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND WALTER, I THINK YOU SAID ON DIRECT
9 EXAMINATION, GAVE HIS GUN TO RALPH?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. OKAY. DO YOU REMEMBER -- WELL, YOU HAVE YOUR
12 STATEMENT IN FRONT OF YOU, IN YOUR STATEMENT DO
13 YOU REMEMBER SAYING THAT DANNY AND MARIO AND
14 CHRISTIAN AND WALTER CAME IN WITH GUNS OUT?
15 WOULD YOU LIKE FOR ME TO SHOW YOU WHERE THAT IS?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY.

18 MR. WISE: I'M SORRY, YOUR HONOR, MAY I APPROACH
19 THE WITNESS?

20 THE COURT: SURE. IF YOU'LL GIVE HIM AN
21 OPPORTUNITY TO READ IT, TOO.

22 Q. DO YOU SEE WHAT I JUST POINTED TO, DIRECTED YOUR
23 ATTENTION TO?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. OKAY. SO, IN YOUR STATEMENT THAT YOU MADE,

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

361

1 TRUTHFUL STATEMENT YOU SAID, DANNY RYANT, MARION,
2 CHRISTIAN AND PETE CAME IN WITH GUNS OUT?

3 A. YES.

4 Q. FOUR PEOPLE, FOUR GUNS, CORRECT?

5 A. YES.

6 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU ALSO SAID WHEN YOU -- LET ME BACK
7 UP, PATRICK, WHO SAID, GO TO THE CORNER POCKET TO
8 GET DANNY RYANT?

9 A. I MENTIONED IT.

10 Q. YOU MENTIONED IT?

11 A. YEAH, BECAUSE THEY ASKED, WELL, WHERE WAS POKE.

12 Q. AND WHY DID THEY NEED POKE?

13 A. BECAUSE THEY HAD NEEDED ANOTHER PERSON.

14 Q. OKAY.

15 COURT REPORTER: ARE YOU SAYING P-O-P-E, POPE, OR
16 P-O-L-K?

17 A. P-O-K-E.

18 Q. PATRICK, AFTER THIS HAPPENED YOU SPOKE TO SOME OF
19 YOUR FRIENDS HERE, DIDN'T YOU?

20 A. I SPOKE TO MARIO.

21 Q. YOU SPOKE TO MARIO?

22 A. AND DANNY RYANT.

23 Q. AND DANNY RYANT. OKAY, VERY GOOD. AND YOU KNEW
24 THE POLICE WERE LOOKING FOR YOU, DIDN'T YOU?

25 A. NOT -- THAT DAY I TURNED MYSELF IN I KNOW THE

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

362

1 POLICE BEEN LOOKING FOR ME.

2 Q. YOU DIDN'T THINK THE POLICE WERE LOOKING FOR YOU
3 BEFORE THAT DAY?

4 A. I HAD NO IDEA.

5 Q. YOU THOUGHT YOU GOT AWAY, DIDN'T YOU?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. YOU THOUGHT YOU WERE GOOD ON THIS MURDER, DIDN'T
8 YOU?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. SO, THEN WHEN YOU HEAR THE POLICE ARE
11 LOOKING FOR YOU, THAT'S WHEN YOU GO DOWN AND TALK
12 TO THE POLICE?

13 A. YES, I TURNED MYSELF IN.

14 Q. UH-HUH. AND MR. GRANT IS YOUR LAWYER?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. A GOOD LAWYER, RIGHT?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. HE'S GOOD, IN FACT, I WOULD GET HIM IF I WERE IN
19 TROUBLE. WHEN DID YOU HIRE HIM?

20 A. HUH?

21 Q. WHEN DID YOU HIRE HIM?

22 A. I DIDN'T HIRE HIM, MY MOTHER HIRED HIM.

23 Q. YOUR MOTHER HIRED HIM. WHEN DID SHE HIRE HIM?

24 A. I CAN'T RECALL.

25 Q. BEFORE OF AFTER YOU WENT TO THE POLICE?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

363

1 A. AFTERWARDS.

2 Q. AFTERWARDS. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT YOUR
3 RELATIONSHIP WITH RALPH COLEMAN. IT'S YOUR
4 TESTIMONY THAT YOU WENT INTO THIS THING WITH
5 RALPH, YOU AND RALPH WALKED INTO THE APARTMENT
6 TOGETHER?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND WHO SAID THAT, WHO DIRECTED YOU TO GO
9 IN THERE WITH RALPH?

10 A. WHO DIRECTED ME?

11 Q. YEAH, WHO'S CALLING THE SHOTS, WHO ARE THE
12 STRINGS HERE?

13 A. OH, MARIO SAY, GO IN AND BUY THE WEED, LIKE, I
14 WAS SUPPOSED TO BUY THE WEED, AND COME OUT.

15 Q. SO, IT'S MARIO'S PLAN TO DO ALL THIS?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND DID YOU ASK HIM WHY HE
18 WANTED YOU AND RALPH TO DO SOMETHING TOGETHER?

19 A. RALPH, IT WAS JUST ME AT FIRST, AND RALPH JUST
20 WAS, LIKE, I'LL GO IN THERE WITH YOU.

21 Q. RALPH VOLUNTEERED TO GO IN?

22 A. YEAH, HE VOLUNTEERED.

23 Q. OKAY. OKAY, I WANT TO SHOW YOU SOMETHING ON YOUR
24 STATEMENT AGAIN. OKAY, SEE RIGHT HERE? IT
25 STARTS WITH, "EVERYBODY WAS," YOU SEE WHAT I'M

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

364

1 REFERRING TO? IN YOUR STATEMENT WHAT YOU SAY
2 WAS, EVERYBODY WAS, LIKE, YOU AND RALPH GOING
3 TOGETHER?

4 A. YES.

5 Q. OKAY, WHO IS THAT EVERYBODY? WHO IS EVERYBODY
6 THAT WAS LIKE THAT?

7 A. MARIO.

8 Q. UH-HUH.

9 A. WELL, THEY, THEY AIN'T SAY NOTHING ABOUT THAT. I
10 AIN'T KNOW, BUT I JUST WRITE THAT IN THERE, THAT
11 RALPH HAD VOLUNTEERED.

12 Q. YOU JUST WROTE THAT?

13 A. I AIN'T JUST WROTE IT, I WAS SCARED AT THE MOMENT
14 AND I WAS JUST WRITING WHAT I COULD TELL YOU.

15 Q. OKAY. YOU WERE SCARED WHEN YOU WROTE THAT,
16 RIGHT?

17 A. I WAS SCARED WHEN I WROTE THE STATEMENT.

18 Q. WHY WERE YOU SCARED?

19 A. BECAUSE I WAS TOLD NOT TO SAY NOTHING.

20 Q. OKAY. WHEN YOU WROTE THAT STATEMENT YOU KNEW YOU
21 WERE IN TROUBLE?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. DID DETECTIVE SHUMPERT SCARE YOU? DID HE
24 SCARE YOU?

25 A. YES.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

365

1 Q. HE DID SCARE YOU. WHY DID HE SCARE YOU?

2 A. I WAS SCARED TO TALK TO THE POLICE.

3 Q. OKAY. DID HE THREATEN YOU?

4 A. NO, SIR.

5 Q. OKAY. DID HE PULL A WEAPON ON YOU?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. SMACK YOU AROUND?

8 A. NO, SIR.

9 Q. DID HE TREAT YOU NICE?

10 A. HE TREATED ME LIKE, IT WAS HIS JOB, YOU KNOW.

11 Q. HE WAS OKAY WITH YOU?

12 A. YEAH.

13 Q. WHAT WERE YOU AFRAID OF?

14 A. TO TALK TO THE POLICE AND I WAS TOLD NOT TO SAY
15 NOTHING.

16 Q. OKAY. IT IS FAIR TO SAY THAT YOU AND RALPH WERE
17 NOT FRIENDLY, YOU AND RALPH WEREN'T FRIENDS,
18 THAT'S AN ACCURATE STATEMENT, ISN'T IT?

19 A. YEAH.

20 Q. YOU AND CHRISTIAN ARE FRIENDS?

21 A. NO, NOT REALLY. I KNOW HIM.

22 Q. YOU KNOW HIM?

23 | A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. BUT THEN, IF YOU JUST KNOW CHRISTIAN AND YOU'RE
25 NOT FRIENDLY WITH HIM, YOU'RE EVEN LESS FRIENDLY

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

366

1 WITH RALPH, RIGHT?

2 A. I GUESS YOU COULD SAY.

3 Q. I'M SORRY?

4 A. I GUESS YOU COULD SAY.

5 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. BUT IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY THAT YOU
6 PARTICIPATED IN THIS ROBBERY WITH A GUY YOU JUST
7 DON'T KNOW MUCH ABOUT, IS THAT YOUR TESTIMONY, IS
8 THAT WHAT YOU WANT THEM TO BELIEVE?

9 A. NO.

10 Q. NO. OKAY. YOU'VE HAD SOME PROBLEMS WITH RALPH IN
11 THE PAST, HAVEN'T YOU?

12 A. NO.

13 Q. OKAY. DID THERE COME A TIME WHEN YOU AND RALPH
14 GOT INTO A FIGHT BECAUSE OF SOME, SOME WORDS THAT
15 WERE SAID BETWEEN YOU AND HIS BROTHER, ACTUALLY A
16 PHYSICAL FIGHT, YOU AND RALPH?

17 A. NO, SIR.

18 Q. THAT NEVER HAPPENED?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. DID THERE COME A TIME WHEN YOU AND ONE OF
21 RALPH'S COUSINS HAD A CONFRONTATION AT A CLUB,
22 AND THE COUSIN AND YOU HAD THE FIGHT? DO YOU
23 KNOW WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT, A COUSIN NAMED PUCK,
24 DOES THAT NAME RING A BELL TO YOU?

25 A. NO, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

367

- 1 Q. THAT NAME DOESN'T RING A BELL. FIGHT WITH A
2 COUSIN OF RALPH'S, YOU NEVER HEARD OF IT,
3 SOMETHING LIKE THAT NEVER HAPPENED?
- 4 A. I CAN'T RECALL IT, IF YOU MENTION THE NIGHT CLUB
5 I PROBABLY COULD RECALL.
- 6 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AFTER THIS ALL WENT DOWN YOU
7 DIDN'T GO TO THE POLICE, DID YOU?
- 8 A. NO, SIR.
- 9 Q. NOW, IT'S YOUR TESTIMONY YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT
10 HAPPENED BECAUSE YOU WEREN'T IN THERE, BUT LOTS
11 OF SHOTS WERE FIRED?
- 12 A. YES, SIR.
- 13 Q. AND THE FACT THAT THIS ROBBERY OCCURRED AND SHOTS
14 WERE FIRED, THAT DIDN'T TROUBLE YOU AT ALL, DID
15 IT?
- 16 A. YES, IT DID, BUT I WAS TOLD NOT TO SAY NOTHING.
- 17 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S WHY YOU DIDN'T GO TO THE
18 POLICE?
- 19 A. AT FIRST, YEAH.
- 20 Q. OKAY. THE WHOLE SHOOTING THING SURPRISED YOU BUT
21 IT DIDN'T REALLY BOTHER YOU, DID IT? THAT'S
22 PROBABLY WHAT HAPPENS WHEN -- THAT KIND OF THING
23 CAN HAPPEN.
- 24 A. YES, IT BOTHERED ME.
- 25 Q. OKAY. AND YOU HAD A WEEK BETWEEN, A LITTLE LESS

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

368

1 THAN A WEEK BETWEEN THE TIME THIS THING HAPPENED
2 AND YOU MADE UP THAT STATEMENT, RIGHT?

3 A. YES, WHEN I WROTE THE STATEMENT.

4 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. WHEN EVERYBODY WAS ARRESTED AND
5 CHARGED YOU KNEW THAT IT WAS GOING TO BE
6 IMPORTANT FOR YOU TO GET IN HERE AND MAKE A DEAL,
7 DIDN'T YOU?

8 A. WHAT HAPPENED?

9 Q. OKAY. AFTER EVERYBODY IS ARRESTED AND CHARGED,
10 YOU KNEW IT WAS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT FOR YOU TO
11 BE FIRST IN LINE TO TELL YOUR STORY AND OFFER TO
12 TESTIFY TO THE, FOR THE PROSECUTION?

13 A. I AGREED TO TESTIFY BECAUSE I WROTE A STATEMENT,
14 AND TOLD THEM WHAT HAPPENED. I DID WHAT WAS
15 RIGHT.

16 Q. YOU DID WHAT WAS RIGHT?

17 A. YEAH. I TOLD THEM WHAT HAPPENED.

18 Q. YOU DID WHAT WAS RIGHT?

19 A. YEAH.

20 Q. YOU WERE INVOLVED IN A ROBBERY WHERE SOMEBODY WAS
21 KILLED?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. WHEN DID YOU GROW A CONSCIENCE?

24 A. HUH? I GREW A CONSCIENCE WHEN I WROTE THE
25 STATEMENT AND TOLD THEM WHAT HAPPENED.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

369

1 Q. UH-HUH, THE STATEMENT THAT SAYS, FOUR GUNS AND
2 FOUR OTHER PEOPLE HAD THEM, THAT'S STATEMENT,
3 RIGHT?

4 A. YES.

5 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, OKAY.

6 MR. WISE: YOUR HONOR, MAY I HAVE ONE MOMENT?

7 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

8 MR. WISE: THAT'S ALL.

9 THE COURT: OKAY, THANK YOU, MR. WISE.

10 NOW, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I KNOW WE'RE IN THE
11 MIDDLE OF CROSS-EXAMINATION OF MR. TYLER, AND NORMALLY
12 I WOULD LIKE TO FINISH THE CROSS-EXAMINATION BEFORE WE
13 TAKE A BREAK, BUT I ALSO TOLD Y'ALL WHEN Y'ALL SIGNED
14 ON TO BE JURORS THAT WE'LL GO AN HOUR TO AN HOUR AND A
15 HALF BEFORE WE TAKE A BREAK, AND WE'VE GONE OVER AN
16 HOUR AND A HALF. SO, WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS, I'M
17 GOING TO LET Y'ALL STEP INTO THE JURY ROOM WHILE WE
18 TAKE A SHORT BREAK. REMEMBER WHAT I'M GOING TO REPEAT
19 OVER AND OVER, YOU CANNOT TALK ABOUT THIS CASE AMONG
20 YOURSELVES. OKAY? ALRIGHT, Y'ALL ARE EXCUSED TO THE
21 JURY ROOM.

22 (Whereupon, the jury retires
23 to the jury room and the following
24 takes place out of the presence
25 of the jury.)

1 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. TYLER, YOU'VE BEEN ON
2 THAT JURY STAND FOR A WHILE. WE'RE TAKING A BREAK.
3 YOU CANNOT TALK TO ANYBODY ABOUT YOUR TESTIMONY.
4 OKAY? IN OTHER WORDS, RIGHT NOW IT'S -- WE'RE GOING
5 TO PICK UP JUST AS IF WE'RE GOING ON, BUT YOU ARE
6 ALLOWED TO TAKE A BREAK. IF YOU NEED A GLASS OF
7 WATER, IF YOU NEED SOMETHING LIKE THAT WE'LL LET YOU
8 HAVE THAT. OKAY? AND IF YOU NEED TO STAND UP AND
9 STRETCH YOU'RE WELCOME TO DO THAT. OKAY?

10 WE'RE GOING TO BE IN RECESS AND THEN WHEN WE COME
11 BACK IN, MR. PALMER, HE'LL BE YOUR WITNESS. OKAY?
12 AND WE'LL BE IN RECESS FOR ABOUT FIFTEEN MINUTES.

13 (Recess)

14 (Go to Volume Two for continuation
15 of this trial.)

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA

COURT OF GENERAL SESSIONS

COUNTY OF ORANGEBURG

FIRST JUDICIAL CIRCUIT

VOLUME TWO OF THREE

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA)

TRANSCRIPT OF RECORD

versus)

DATE:

DECEMBER 10 - 17, 2010

CHRISTIAN COLEMAN,)

CASE NOS.

2010-GS-38-802, 803, 805

RALPH BERNARD COLEMAN)

2010-GS-38-808, 810, 811

WALTER LEE HARRIS,)

2010-GS-38-812, 813, 814

DANNY RYANT, JR.,)

2010-GS-38-817, 818, 819

MARIO MONTEZ SHIVERS)

2010-GS-38-822, 823, 824

DEFENDANTS)

BEFORE:

HONORABLE EDGAR DICKSON, PRESIDING JUDGE

AND A JURY.

APPEARANCES:

DAVID M. PASCOE, ESQUIRE
SOLICITORDONALD N. SORENSON, ESQUIRE
ASSISTANT SOLICITOR
FOR THE STATERICHARD LACKEY, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT CHRISTIAN COLEMANJILLIAN ULLMAN AND MARK WISE, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT RALPH BERNARD COLEMANSCOTT PALMER, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT WILLIE HARRISDOUGLAS MELLARD, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT DANNY RYANT, JR.JOSHUA KOGER, ESQUIRE
FOR DEFENDANT, MARIO MONTEZ SHIVERSHARRY A. WALKER (MRS.)
COURT REPORTER, FIRST JUDICIAL CIRCUIT
POST OFFICE BOX 127
ROWESVILLE, SOUTH CAROLINA 291331

I N D E X

(See Volume One for complete index.)

1 DATE:

2 DECEMBER 14, 2010

3 (Continued from Volume One.)

4 (The following takes place
5 out of the presence of the jury.)

6 THE COURT: SOLICITOR PASCOE, DID YOU WANT TO
7 TELL ME SOMETHING?

8 SOLICITOR PASCOE: AN ISSUE HAS BEEN BROUGHT UP
9 BY THE DEFENSE THAT IS RELEVANT BECAUSE THEY'RE
10 THINKING ABOUT WANTING TO PUT IN MORE EVIDENCE. I'M
11 GOING TO LET MS., I'M GOING TO LET JILL EXPLAIN IT.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. MS. ULLMAN.

13 MS. ULLMAN: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. AS YOU KNOW,
14 OBVIOUSLY, THE DEFENSE CLOSING, WHAT ORDER THE
15 CLOSINGS ARE DONE IS BASED UPON WHETHER DEFENSE PUTS
16 ANY EVIDENCE INTO, OR ANYTHING INTO THE RECORD. I
17 WOULD ARGUE TO THIS COURT THAT AS WE STAND HERE WE ARE
18 ALL SEPARATE LAWYERS REPRESENTING SEPARATE DEFENDANTS.
19 I UNDERSTAND THAT WE COLLECTIVELY POOLED A JURY, BUT
20 THAT WAS TO TRY TO KEEP OUR STRIKES AS FAIR AS
21 POSSIBLE BECAUSE BY STATUTE WE WERE REDUCED.

22 THE COURT: I UNDERSTAND. OKAY.

23 MS. ULLMAN: MY POINT IN SAYING ALL THAT IS, AT
24 THIS POINT NOBODY AT THIS TABLE HAS OFFERED ANY
25 EVIDENCE INTO THE RECORD EXCEPT FOR JOSH KOGER. HE

1 ENTERED A PIECE OF EVIDENCE, I BELIEVE IT WAS
2 SOMEBODY'S STATEMENT. THE POINT IS, HE ENTERED A
3 PIECE OF EVIDENCE, IT WAS ENTERED IN AS DEFENDANT
4 SHIVERS'S EXHIBIT ONE, I BELIEVE, AND AT THIS POINT
5 NONE OF US HAVE CHOSEN TO PUT ANY EVIDENCE IN.
6 SOLICITOR SORENSON TELLS ME THAT HE KNOWS OF SOME CASE
7 THAT SAYS IF ANY DEFENDANT IN A JOINT TRIAL PUTS IN
8 EVIDENCE THEN ALL OF THE DEFENDANTS HAVE WAIVED THEIR
9 FINAL CLOSING. OBVIOUSLY, - - -

10 THE COURT: I THINK THERE IS A CASE THAT SAYS
11 THAT.

12 MS. ULLMAN: OBVIOUSLY, WE WOULD OBJECT TO THAT.
13 I UNDERSTAND THERE IS A CASE, BUT FOR THE RECORD AND
14 FOR APPEALS WE WOULD OBJECT TO THAT. DUE PROCESS --
15 THIS IS A SEPARATE TRIAL, AND I DON'T UNDERSTAND HOW
16 JOSH KOGER ENTERING EVIDENCE INTO THE RECORD COULD
17 AFFECT MY ABILITY TO CLOSE LAST. WE HAVE NOT
18 DISCUSSED WHAT EVIDENCE I WILL BRING TO THE RECORD.
19 OBVIOUSLY, EVIDENCE HE PUTS INTO THE RECORD COULD HURT
20 MY CLIENT, COULD HELP MY CLIENT, BUT EITHER WAY, WE'RE
21 NOT SITTING HERE AS A TEAM, WE ARE SITTING HERE
22 SEPARATED EXCEPT FOR MR. WISE AND I, AND - - -

23 THE COURT: I'M GLAD TO KNOW HE KNOWS THAT.

24 MS. ULLMAN: --- HIM ENTERING EVIDENCE IS GOING
25 TO RUIN OUR CHANCES. SO, IF YOUR HONOR IS GOING TO

1 DENY MY MOTION TO ALLOW US TO HAVE FINAL CLOSE AS LONG
2 AS WE DON'T SEPARATELY ENTER OUR OWN EVIDENCE WE NEED
3 TO KNOW THAT BEFORE WE CONTINUE ON, BECAUSE THAT MAY
4 CHANGE ALL OF OUR VIEWS ON WHAT WE DO AND DON'T ENTER.

5 MR. MELLARD: AND YOUR HONOR, I'D LIKE TO JOIN
6 THIS MOTION. MR. RYANT WOULD BE OF THE OPINION HIS
7 TRIAL STRATEGY SHOULD NOT BE DICTATED BY OTHER
8 DEFENDANTS IN THIS CASE. IT SHOULD BE DICTATED BY HIS
9 OWN ATTORNEY.

10 THE COURT: AND I DO UNDERSTAND YOUR MOTION, I
11 REALLY DO.

12 MR. KOGER: JUDGE, I'D LIKE TO BE HEARD ON IT,
13 TOO.

14 THE COURT: YES, SIR. I WASN'T GETTING READY TO
15 RULE ANYWAY, BUT THANK YOU.

16 MR. KOGER: OKAY. BASICALLY, I DIDN'T CONSULT
17 WITH ANY OTHER OF THE OTHER COUNSEL AT THE TABLE WHEN
18 I SUBMITTED EVIDENCE BECAUSE I REPRESENT MR. SHIVERS,
19 AND I'M GOING TO DO WHAT'S BEST FOR MR. SHIVERS. SO,
20 I DID NOT CONSULT WITH THEM. SO, I GUESS I WOULD JOIN
21 IN WITH THEIR MOTION FOR THEM TO BE ABLE TO MAKE THAT
22 FINAL OR LAST ARGUMENT.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. BUT MR. KOGER, YOU
24 UNDERSTAND, IF I GO ALONG WITH JUST, EVEN WITH IT
25 BEING SEPARATE LIKE THAT, OKAY, AND YOU'RE DOING THAT,

1 THEN WHAT YOU'RE SAYING TO ME IS, I WOULD BE ABLE TO
2 LET THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE CLOSE WITH REGARD TO YOUR
3 CLIENT, RIGHT?

4 MR. KOGER: RIGHT.

5 THE COURT: OKAY, SINCE YOU'VE PUT IN EVIDENCE.

6 MR. KOGER: I'LL GO FIRST.

7 THE COURT: WELL, I MEAN, YOU DON'T ACTUALLY GET
8 TO GO FIRST, BUT I MEAN - - -

9 MR. KOGER: RIGHT.

10 THE COURT: --- BUT THE SOLICITOR WOULD CLOSE
11 AFTER YOU.

12 MR. KOGER: RIGHT.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. BUT THE OTHER DEFENDANTS ARE
14 SAYING THAT WHAT'S HAPPENING IS, THEY WANT TO BE
15 ALLOWED TO CLOSE AFTER THAT. RIGHT, YEAH. OKAY.

16 MR. KOGER: FIVE SEPARATE TRIALS, YOUR HONOR.

17 THE COURT: WELL, I UNDERSTAND FIVE SEPARATE
18 TRIALS, BUT -- AND IF Y'ALL -- DO Y'ALL NEED ME TO
19 RULE ON THAT BEFORE WE GO ANY FURTHER WITH THE
20 QUESTIONING HERE TODAY?

21 MS. ULLMAN: I WOULD APPRECIATE THAT IF I'M GOING
22 TO ENTER ...

23 THE COURT: AND WHAT I NEED TO DO, I'VE GOT SOME
24 OF THAT EVIDENCE IN MY -- I MEAN, SOME OF THOSE CASES
25 IN MY OFFICE, I'VE JUST GOT TO TRY AND LOOK THEM UP,

1 AND IF ANYBODY'S GOT -- MR. SORENSON, DO YOU HAPPEN TO
2 HAVE THAT CASE?

3 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I'M LOOKING RIGHT NOW, YOUR
4 HONOR.

5 THE COURT: OKAY. IF NOT, I THINK I'VE GOT IT IN
6 MY OFFICE AND I CAN LOOK IT UP. BECAUSE WE'VE HAD
7 THAT ISSUE BEFORE. WE HAVEN'T HAD IT WITH MULTIPLE
8 DEFENDANTS, SO I NEED TO SEE WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO
9 ABOUT THAT. SO, IT WILL TAKE ME A FEW MINUTES TO LOOK
10 THAT UP BECAUSE I NEED TO SEE.

11 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I CAN GIVE YOU THE CITES AT
12 LEAST.

13 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, SIR. HAVE YOU GOT THE
14 CITES?

15 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I BELIEVE THERE'S TWO OF
16 THEM, STATE VERSUS SMITH, 693 SOUTHEASTERN, SECOND,
17 415, - - -

18 THE COURT: DO YOU MIND, DO YOU HAVE THE SOUTH
19 CAROLINA CITE?

20 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR, IT'S 387 SOUTH
21 CAROLINA 619.

22 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: AND THAT I BELIEVE CITES A
24 STATE VERSUS CROWE, WHICH IS 258 SOUTH CAROLINA 258, I
25 THINK THAT'S RIGHT.

1 THE COURT: OKAY.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: BUT BASICALLY THAT DEALS
3 WITH THE LOSS OF THE RIGHT TO LAST ARGUMENT IF EITHER
4 DEFENDANT OFFERS ANY EVIDENCE, JUST BECAUSE ANOTHER
5 DEFENDANT, BUT BASICALLY THAT WOULD BE TWO SUFFICIENT
6 GROUNDS TO SEVER THE CHARGES, THE CASES.

7 THE COURT: RIGHT. OKAY. IF Y'ALL WILL BEAR
8 WITH ME FOR ABOUT ANOTHER TEN OR FIFTEEN MINUTES, I
9 JUST NEED TO PULL THE CASES, AND I WILL COME BACK AND
10 MAKE A RULING ON YOUR MOTION. OKAY? OKAY. DOES
11 ANYBODY - I'M ASSUMING EVERYBODY IS JOINING IN ON
12 THIS MOTION, IS THAT CORRECT?

13 MR. LACKEY: THAT'S CORRECT, YOUR HONOR.

14 MR. PALMER: YOUR HONOR, THAT'S CORRECT.

15 THE COURT: OKAY.

16 MR. PALMER: I JUST DIDN'T WANT TO GO THROUGH A
17 BUNCH OF ...

18 THE COURT: NO, I APPRECIATE THAT, I APPRECIATE
19 THAT. YOU DID GOOD, YOU DID GOOD BEING READY TO GET
20 STARTED. THANK YOU, SIR.

21 (Recess)

22 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MS. ULLMAN, I KNOW YOU MADE
23 THE MOTION AND WANTED ME TO MAKE THE DETERMINATION
24 ABOUT THE ORDER OF CLOSING ARGUMENTS SO THAT -- AND I
25 KNOW THAT ALL THE OTHER DEFENDANTS JOINED IN THIS. I

1 CERTAINLY HAVE IT ON THE RECORD. AND ABOUT THE
2 UNFAIRNESS OF ONE DEFENDANT BINDING THE OTHER
3 DEFENDANTS TO HAVING TO GIVE UP THE ABILITY TO CLOSE
4 LAST WHEN ONE DEFENDANT OUT OF FIVE INTRODUCES
5 EVIDENCE.

6 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. AND I UNDERSTAND THAT WAS
8 ALSO, EVEN IF YOU DIDN'T SAY IT, IT WAS ALSO IMPLICIT
9 FOR Y'ALL'S ARGUMENTS FOR SEVERANCE WHICH I HEARD
10 EARLIER, IS THAT CORRECT?

11 MS. ULLMAN: HONESTLY, YOUR HONOR, IT WAS NOT IN
12 MY ARGUMENT FOR SEVERANCE BECAUSE I HAD ABSOLUTELY NO
13 IDEA THAT THIS COULD HAPPEN. I ASSUMED THAT THE
14 DEFENDANT HAD A RIGHT TO CLOSE IF HE DIDN'T INTRODUCE
15 EVIDENCE, SINCE THIS IS A SEPARATE TRIAL FOR ALL FIVE
16 WHERE THE STATE HAS JOINED IT BASICALLY FOR EFFICIENCY
17 AND MONEY PURPOSES.

18 THE COURT: RIGHT.

19 MS. ULLMAN: THEY'RE THE INNOCENT PARTIES SITTING
20 HERE. THE STATE HAS THE BURDEN. THEM DOING THIS HAS
21 ALLOWED THEM TO CAUSE US TO BASICALLY WORK AS A TEAM,
22 WHICH WE SHOULD NOT HAVE TO BE FORCED TO DO. WE'VE
23 HAD TO COLLECTIVELY PULL THE JURY, WE'VE NOW BASICALLY
24 HAVE TO COLLECTIVELY DECIDE WHAT EVIDENCE IS AND ISN'T
25 COMING, BUT UNFORTUNATELY, WE DIDN'T KNOW THAT

1 PREVIOUSLY, SO MR. KOGER ENTERED EVIDENCE ON HIS
2 CLIENT'S BEHALF AS HE IS ETHICALLY SUPPOSED TO DO. HE
3 IS ETHICALLY BOUND TO REPRESENT MARIO SHIVERS, NOT ALL
4 FIVE OF THESE DEFENDANTS, AS I'M ONLY BOUND TO
5 REPRESENT RALPH COLEMAN. SO, I UNDERSTAND THAT THE
6 SOUTH CAROLINA SUPREME COURT HAS STATED THAT THIS IS
7 ALLOWED, BUT I WOULD ARGUE THAT UNDER THE UNITED
8 STATES CONSTITUTION THAT ALLOWS, THAT REQUIRES THAT A
9 DEFENDANT HAVE A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL TRIAL, HIS DAY IN
10 COURT, DUE PROCESS, I WOULD SAY THAT THE STATE BEING
11 ALLOWED TO JOIN ALL OF THIS HAS THROWN ALL OF THAT OUT
12 OF THE WINDOW AND WE ARE NOW FORCED TO WORK AS A TEAM,
13 AND WE CERTAINLY SHOULD NOT HAVE TO DO THAT.

14 THE COURT: YES, MA'AM, NO, I UNDERSTAND THAT.
15 AND I UNDERSTAND THAT EVEN THOUGH YOU DIDN'T MAKE IT
16 AS PART OF YOUR SEVERANCE MOTION, IT SHOULD GO ALONG
17 AS ANOTHER REASON FOR SEVERANCE.

18 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND JUST TO CLARIFY,
20 IT WAS A COURT OF APPEALS DECISION. OKAY? THE ONE
21 I'M LOOKING AT IS STATE VERSUS SMITH, WHICH IS COURT
22 OF APPEALS.

23 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

24 THE COURT: OKAY? SO, IT HASN'T GONE UP TO THE
25 SUPREME COURT WITH REGARD TO THIS ISSUE APPARENTLY.

1 OKAY? AND I DON'T KNOW WHETHER THEY'VE ASKED FOR A
2 REHEARING ON THAT OR NOT. OKAY? BUT ACCORDING TO THE
3 STATE VERSUS SMITH CASE, ANY ONE DEFENDANT IN A
4 JOINTLY TRIED CASE CAUSES ALL OF THE DEFENDANTS BEING
5 TRIED TOGETHER TO LOSE THE RIGHT TO, YOU KNOW, TO END
6 CLOSING. THOUGH I AM, ON THE RECORD, VERY SYMPATHETIC
7 TO YOUR ARGUMENT AND TO YOUR POSITION, I'M ALSO
8 CHARGED WITH STANDING BY THE LAW AS IT IS INTERPRETED.
9 I AM GOING TO RULE THAT THE SOLICITOR IS GOING TO GET
10 THE FINAL CLOSING HERE. I AM GOING TO NOTE THE
11 OBJECTION THAT ALL OF Y'ALL HAVE TO MY RULING, EVEN
12 MR. KOGER, YOU KNOW, AS TO MY RULING SO THAT THAT IS
13 PRESERVED FOR APPEAL. I THINK Y'ALL HAVE AN
14 INTERESTING ARGUMENT, AND AT THIS STAGE IN THE
15 PROCEEDING THE ONLY THING THAT HAS BEEN INTRODUCED IS
16 WHAT -- A STATEMENT MADE BY - - -

17 MS. ULLMAN: ASHLEY PARSLEY, YOUR HONOR.

18 THE COURT: RIGHT. OKAY. BY THE DEFENDANT.
19 OKAY. ALRIGHT, SO NOW WE KNOW HOW TO -- EVERYBODY
20 KNOWS HOW TO PROCEED? OKAY, THANK YOU. ALRIGHT,
21 ANYTHING FROM THE STATE?

22 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYTHING ELSE FROM THE
24 DEFENDANTS?

25 MR. KOGER: JUDGE, - - -

1 THE COURT: YES, SIR, MR. KOGER.

2 MR. KOGER: --- I WOULD LIKE TO PUT ON THE
3 RECORD, OF COURSE, WE, YOU JUST RULED ON THIS
4 PARTICULAR ISSUE, BUT JUST TO REITERATE, NOW THAT
5 ESSENTIALLY WE WILL HAVE TO WORK ON THE TEAM WITH ANY
6 ADDITIONAL PIECES OF EVIDENCE, THAT'S GOING TO BECOME
7 HAIRY BECAUSE IT MAY COME A POINT THAT SOME OF THESE
8 DEFENDANTS' INTEREST MAY BECOME CONTRADICTORY.

9 THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

10 MR. KOGER: AND I JUST WANT TO PLACE THAT ON THE
11 RECORD.

12 THE COURT: YES, SIR. NO, I UNDERSTAND IT. I AM
13 AWARE OF THAT. THAT WAS ONE OF THE INHERENT RISKS IN
14 ME DENYING THE SEVERANCE MOTION. OKAY. SO, I'M AWARE
15 OF THAT.

16 MR. KOGER: THANK YOU.

17 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. ANYTHING ELSE FROM
18 ANY OF THE DEFENDANTS?

19 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

20 MS. ULLMAN: NO, YOUR HONOR.

21 MR. LACKEY: NO, YOUR HONOR.

22 MR. MELLARD: NO, YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: OKAY. IS THE JURY READY? YOU CAN
24 BRING THE JURY BACK IN.

25 (Whereupon, the jury enters

1 the courtroom and the following
2 takes place in the presence
3 of the jury.)

4 THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WE HAD SOME
5 MORE THINGS WE NEEDED TO GO OVER BEFORE I COULD GET
6 Y'ALL BACK IN HERE. WE ARE NOW GETTING READY TO
7 CONTINUE WITH THE TESTIMONY OF MR. TYLER.

8 AND MR. TYLER, I JUST NEED TO REMIND YOU, YOU
9 ARE STILL UNDER OATH. ALRIGHT, SIR? OKAY.

10 AND NOW, YOUR WITNESS.

11 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR, MAY IT PLEASE
12 THE COURT.

13 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

14 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
15 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
16 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
17 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
18 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

384

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. PALMER:

Q. MR. TYLER, I WANT TO ASK YOU FIRST, SIR, TO TELL
ME EXACTLY WHY YOU'RE HERE IN COURT TODAY?

A. BECAUSE I'M BEING CHARGED WITH MURDER.

Q. OKAY. THAT'S WHY YOU'RE HERE IN COURT TODAY?

A. YES, SIR, AND TO TESTIFY.

Q. YOU'RE HERE TO GET A DEAL, AREN'T YOU?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. BE HONEST. YOU KNOW THIS IS GOING TO HELP YOU?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. YOU DON'T KNOW THIS IS GOING TO HELP YOU?

A. NO, SIR, BECAUSE I'M FACING LIFE STILL.

Q. AND YOU THINK YOU'RE GOING TO GET LIFE EVEN AFTER
TESTIFYING IN COURT TODAY?

A. MAYBE.

Q. MAYBE NOT. DO YOU AGREE?

A. MAYBE NOT. MAYBE, MAYBE NOT.

Q. BUT YOU THINK THIS GOING TO HELP YOU, DON'T YOU?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, I HAVE SOME QUESTIONS ABOUT YOUR
TESTIMONY. SPECIALLY, WOULD YOU AGREE WITH THIS
STATEMENT? WHEN THIS ROBBERY WAS BEING PLANNED
YOU WERE IN ON THE PLAN?

A. YES, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

385

1 Q. YOU WERE THERE?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. YOU WERE THERE WITH MR. SHIVERS AND MR. RYANT?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. AND THE OTHER GUY THAT LEFT THAT'S NOT A
6 DEFENDANT, DARIUS?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 MR. MELLARD: I'LL HAVE TO OBJECT TO THAT
9 QUESTION. I DON'T BELIEVE IT'S ACCURATE AS TO WHO WAS
10 THERE DURING THE PLANNING. I BELIEVE HE SAID MR.
11 RYANT WAS THERE DURING THE PLANNING.

12 THE COURT: THAT WAS WHAT HIS QUESTION WAS.

13 MR. MELLARD: I DON'T -- THAT'S BEEN BROUGHT OUT
14 IN HIS TESTIMONY. I THINK THAT'S NOT ACCURATE, YOUR
15 HONOR.

16 MR. PALMER: YOUR HONOR, I JUST ASKED THE
17 QUESTION.

18 THE COURT: YEAH, HE JUST ASKED THE QUESTION.
19 YOU GET TO, YOU KNOW, STILL CROSS-EXAMINE AND CLEAR
20 THAT UP. OKAY.

21 Q. AND YOU WERE IN THE VEHICLE WHEN IT FIRST WENT
22 OVER TO THE APARTMENT WHERE THIS HAPPENED?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. AND AT SOME POINT WALTER HARRIS DIDN'T
25 WANT TO DO IT ANYMORE?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

386

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. THAT WAS YOUR TESTIMONY, WASN'T IT?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. THAT WAS AFTER HE WENT IN THE FIRST TIME, - - -

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. --- ACCORDING TO YOUR TESTIMONY, AND BOUGHT THE
7 WEED?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. AND HE CAME OUT AND SAID, I DON'T WANT TO DO THIS
10 ANYMORE?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND AS I UNDERSTAND YOUR TESTIMONY, AT SOME POINT
13 AFTER THAT YOU DECIDED YOU DIDN'T WANT TO DO IT
14 ANYMORE?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. AND WHEN WAS THAT?

17 A. WHEN WE WAS GOING BACK TOWARDS THE VICTIM'S HOUSE
18 THE SECOND TIME.

19 Q. ALRIGHT. AND SO, WHAT DID YOU DO TO GET YOURSELF
20 OUT OF IT?

21 A. NOTHING.

22 Q. WHAT DID YOU WANT TO DO TO GET YOURSELF OUT OF
23 IT?

24 A. LEAVE.

25 Q. WHY DIDN'T YOU LEAVE?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

387

1 A. I DON'T KNOW.

2 Q. WELL, NOW, I THOUGHT YOU TOLD SOME OF THESE OTHER
3 LAWYERS THAT YOU WERE SCARED?

4 A. I WAS SCARED.

5 Q. WHO WERE YOU SCARED OF?

6 A. OF THE SITUATION.

7 COURT REPORTER: I'M SORRY, I DIDN'T HEAR YO.

8 A. I WAS SCARED OF THE SITUATION THAT WAS ABOUT TO
9 OCCUR.

10 Q. YOU WERE SCARED OF THE SITUATION. I NEED AN
11 EXPLANATION ON THAT, SIR.

12 A. I WAS SCARED TO GO ROB THE VICTIM.

13 Q. ALRIGHT. YOU WEREN'T SCARED OF ANYONE IN THAT
14 TRUCK WITH YOU?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. AND NOBODY TOLD YOU THAT YOU HAD TO GO ALONG, IS
17 THAT YOUR TESTIMONY?

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. THAT'S NOT YOUR TESTIMONY?

20 A. WELL, YOU SAY, NO OTHERS, YEAH, YOU'RE SAYING --
21 REPEAT WHAT YOU SAID AGAIN?

22 Q. I SAID, NOBODY TOLD YOU YOU HAD TO GO ALONG WITH
23 THIS PLAN EVEN AFTER YOU DIDN'T WANT TO?

24 A. NO, SIR, THERE WAS MARIO SHIVERS SAYING IT WAS
25 GOING TO BE STRAIGHT. THE ONLY THING YOU'RE

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

388

1 GOING TO DO IS BUY THE WEED.

2 COURT REPORTER: HE WAS GOING TO BE WHAT?

3 A. ALRIGHT.

4 Q. IT WAS GOING TO BE ALRIGHT, AND WHAT DID YOU
5 INTERPRET THAT TO MEAN?

6 A. LIKE, I WAS GOING TO BE ALRIGHT.

7 Q. CAN YOU EXPLAIN THAT ANSWER, WHAT DO YOU MEAN BY
8 ALRIGHT?

9 A. HE SAID I WAS JUST GOING IN THERE JUST TO BUY THE
10 MARIJUANA.

11 Q. ALRIGHT. AND SO, DID YOU INTERPRET THAT TO MEAN
12 YOU WEREN'T GOING TO GET IN TROUBLE FOR THIS?

13 A. YES.

14 Q. OKAY. AND AT SOME POINT AFTER THAT, OBVIOUSLY,
15 YOU DID GET IN TROUBLE?

16 A. YES.

17 Q. AND THAT BRING US TO MY QUESTION AS TO WHY YOU'RE
18 HERE TODAY. YOU'RE TRYING TO MINIMIZE YOUR
19 TROUBLE, AREN'T YOU?

20 A. NO, SIR, I'M STILL IN THE SAME TROUBLE THEY'RE
21 IN.

22 Q. NOW, THESE GUYS, YOU'VE ALREADY TESTIFIED, SOME
23 OF THEM YOU WENT TO SCHOOL WITH, SOME OF THEM YOU
24 GREW UP WITH, SOME OF THEM YOU HUNG OUT WITH, AND
25 YOU'RE HERE TESTIFYING AGAINST THESE GUYS FOR ONE

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

389

1 REASON, TO HELP YOU, YES OR NO?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, SO EVEN THOUGH YOU DIDN'T WANT TO
4 GO IN THE APARTMENT, YOU WENT IN WITH WHO?

5 A. RALPH.

6 Q. WITH RALPH. YOU AND RALPH WENT IN. DID YOU OR
7 DID YOU NOT KNOW THAT HE HAD A WEAPON?

8 A. YES.

9 Q. YOU DID KNOW?

10 A. YES.

11 Q. AND YOU WENT IN THERE ANYWAY?

12 A. YES.

13 Q. YOU WENT THROUGH THE DOOR?

14 A. YES.

15 Q. WHO IS THE FIRST PERSON YOU SAW?

16 A. OLD SCHOOL.

17 Q. FIRST YOU SAW OLD SCHOOL?

18 A. YES.

19 Q. AND WHERE WAS HE IN THE APARTMENT?

20 A. HE WAS IN THE KITCHEN.

21 Q. NOW, YOU DIDN'T KNOW OLD SCHOOL, DID YOU?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. WAS THIS THE FIRST TIME YOU HAD SEEN OLD SCHOOL?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. OKAY. AND WAS HE INTRODUCED TO YOU AS OLD

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

390

1 SCHOOL?

2 A. YES, I WAS TOLD THAT HIS NAME WAS OLD SCHOOL.

3 Q. BY WHOM?

4 A. MARIO.

5 Q. OKAY. THAT WAS BEFORE YOU ENTERED THE BUILDING?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. SO, HIS BACK WAS TO YOU AND HE WAS WHERE,
8 OLD SCHOOL?

9 A. IN THE KITCHEN.

10 Q. HOW FAR AWAY WAS HE?

11 A. HE WAS, LIKE, BETWEEN THE LIVING ROOM AND THE
12 KITCHEN.

13 Q. AND YOU DIDN'T SEE ANYBODY ELSE?

14 A. YES, A FEMALE.

15 Q. WELL, WHO WAS THE FEMALE?

16 A. I DON'T KNOW.

17 Q. WHAT DID SHE LOOK LIKE?

18 A. KIND OF HARD TO TELL, I CAN'T RECALL.

19 Q. DID YOU SPEAK WITH THE FEMALE?

20 A. YES, I HAD BOUGHT THE WEED FROM THE FEMALE.

21 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT, WHAT WAS THE WEED -- EXCUSE ME,
22 WHAT WAS THE FEMALE DOING BESIDES SELLING YOU
23 WEED?

24 A. JUST SELLING THE WEED, THAT'S IT.

25 Q. IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE YOU REMEMBER ABOUT HER

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

391

1 THAT GAVE YOU ANY KIND OF CONCERN?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. OKAY. AND WAS IT OLD SCHOOL OR THE FEMALE THAT
4 OPENED THE DOOR?

5 A. THE FEMALE.

6 Q. ALRIGHT. AND YOU WALKED PAST HER?

7 A. YES, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. AND NOW, SHE LET YOU IN, CORRECT?

9 A. YES, SIR. YOU COULD SAY, YES, SIR.

10 Q. ALRIGHT. SO, YOU BOUGHT THE WEED, AND HOW MUCH
11 WEED DID YOU BUY?

12 A. LIKE, A QUARTER, OR LIKE -- I CAN'T EVEN RECALL.

13 Q. IS A QUARTER A QUARTER OUNCE?

14 A. YES.

15 Q. AND THAT'S HOW MONEY IS IT WORTH?

16 A. LIKE, THIRTY DOLLARS.

17 Q. AND YOU GAVE HER THE MONEY?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. WHERE DID YOU GET THE MONEY?

20 A. HUH?

21 Q. WHERE DID YOU GET THE MONEY?

22 A. I CAN'T RECALL.

23 Q. WAS IT YOUR MONEY?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. OKAY. AND SO, UP TO NOW, UP TO THIS POINT IN

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

392

1 YOUR TESTIMONY IT WAS YOUR JOB IN THIS WHOLE PLAN
2 TO GO IN AND BUY THE WEED?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. AND YOU KNEW MR. COLEMAN HAD A GUN?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. AND THEN WHAT HAPPENED?

7 A. THAT'S WHEN MR. COLEMAN PULLED THE GUN OUT ON
8 HER.

9 Q. ON WHO?

10 A. THE FEMALE.

11 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID HE MAKE HER DO?

12 A. GET ON THE FLOOR.

13 Q. ALRIGHT. AND WHERE WAS SHE FACING WHEN SHE GOT
14 ON THE FLOOR?

15 A. FACING THE FLOOR.

16 Q. SO, WHAT WERE YOU DOING AT THIS TIME?

17 A. I WAS WALKING OUT THE DOOR.

18 Q. YOU WERE WALKING OUT THE DOOR?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. THEN WHAT HAPPENED?

21 A. AND THEN, THAT'S WHEN EVERYBODY CAME IN WITH THE
22 GUNS.

23 Q. ALRIGHT. AND SO, DID YOU CONTINUE TO LEAVE?

24 A. OH, NO, SIR.

25 Q. YOU STAYED IN?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

393

- 1 A. YES, SIR.
- 2 Q. WHY DID YOU DO THAT?
- 3 A. I DON'T KNOW.
- 4 Q. YOU DON'T KNOW?
- 5 A. NO, SIR.
- 6 Q. WHAT WAS GOING THROUGH YOUR MIND?
- 7 A. I DON'T KNOW.
- 8 Q. WHAT DID YOU THINK WAS GOING TO HAPPEN?
- 9 A. I DON'T KNOW.
- 10 Q. YOU JUST STOOD THERE?
- 11 A. YES, SIR.
- 12 Q. ANYTHING IN YOUR HANDS?
- 13 A. NO, SIR.
- 14 Q. WHAT ABOUT THE WEED, WHERE WAS IT?
- 15 A. IN MY POCKET.
- 16 Q. OKAY. NOW, THIS STATEMENT YOU GAVE ON MARCH
- 17 EIGHTEENTH, DO YOU REMEMBER MAKING THAT
- 18 STATEMENT?
- 19 A. YES, SIR.
- 20 Q. WHERE WERE YOU WHEN YOU MADE IT?
- 21 A. ORANGEBURG COUNTY.
- 22 Q. OKAY. AND YOU SAID SOMETHING ABOUT MR. HARRIS,
- 23 DIDN'T YOU?
- 24 A. WHO?
- 25 Q. HARRIS, WALTER HARRIS.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

394

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. WHAT DID YOU SAY ABOUT HIM IN YOUR STATEMENT?

3 A. I SAID THAT HE TAPED THE DUDE'S MOUTH, OLD
4 SCHOOL'S MOUTH, THE VICTIM'S MOUTH.

5 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU WERE THERE WHEN THAT HAPPENED?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND YOU WERE THERE WHEN THE SHOTS STARTED, IS
8 THAT YOUR TESTIMONY?

9 A. WELL, ONE OF THE SHOTS.

10 Q. ONE OF THE SHOTS?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. SO, YOU WERE ABLE TO GET OUT BEFORE ANY OTHER
13 SHOTS WERE FIRED?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. HOW MUCH TIME TOOK PLACE BETWEEN THE FIRST SHOT
16 AND THE TIME YOU LEFT THE DOOR?

17 A. LIKE THAT, REAL QUICK.

18 Q. SO, YOU MUST HAVE GOT OUT OF THERE IN A HURRY?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND HOW FAR AWAY FROM THE DOOR WERE YOU WHEN THE
21 OTHER SHOTS STARTED?

22 A. LIKE, I WAS JUST GETTING OFF THE STEPS.

23 Q. OKAY. SO, WHEN YOU HEARD THAT SHOT YOU WERE
24 TURNED AROUND GOING OUT THE DOOR, IS THAT WHERE
25 YOU WERE?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

395

- 1 A. YES, SIR.
- 2 Q. OKAY.
- 3 A. I WAS OUT.
- 4 Q. WHERE WERE YOU GOING TO GO?
- 5 A. WELL, I RAN BACK TO THE TRUCK, THE VEHICLE THAT
- 6 WE CAME IN?
- 7 Q. WHY THE TRUCK?
- 8 A. IT HAD BEEN POURING DOWN RAIN.
- 9 Q. OKAY. SO, YOU DIDN'T WANT TO GET WET?
- 10 A. WELL, - - -
- 11 Q. AT THAT POINT WAS IT YOUR INTENTION TO LEAVE?
- 12 A. YES.
- 13 Q. BUT YOU DIDN'T WANT TO GET WET SO YOU STAYED, IS
- 14 THAT RIGHT?
- 15 A. YES. BUT I DIDN'T, IT WASN'T THAT THAT I STAYED.
- 16 I DON'T KNOW WHY I STAYED.
- 17 Q. OKAY. NOW, WE TALKED ABOUT THE GUN THAT YOU SAY
- 18 WALTER HARRIS GAVE TO - - -
- 19 A. RALPH.
- 20 Q. --- AND THAT'S THE GUN THAT RALPH TOOK IN WHEN
- 21 YOU FIRST WENT IN?
- 22 A. YES.
- 23 Q. IS THAT CORRECT?
- 24 A. YES.
- 25 Q. YOU'RE SURE?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

396

1 A. YES.

2 Q. OKAY. SO, AT THAT POINT YOUR TESTIMONY IS, TO
3 YOUR KNOWLEDGE, WALTER LEE HARRIS DID NOT HAVE A
4 GUN?

5 A. YES. HE DIDN'T HAVE - NO, SIR, HE DIDN'T HAVE A
6 GUN.

7 Q. OKAY. NOW, ON YOUR MARCH EIGHTEENTH STATEMENT,
8 I'M GOING TO ASK YOU, I'M LOOKING ON PAGE TWO OF
9 DEFENDANT AFFIDAVIT, AND I'M JUST GOING TO POINT
10 IT OUT HERE, DO YOU REMEMBER BEING ASKED THAT
11 QUESTION? CAN YOU READ THAT, SIR?

12 A. "WHEN, ALL TOOK GUNS INTO THE HOUSE APARTMENT."

13 Q. DOES IT NOT SAY WHO ALL TOOK GUNS INTO THE
14 APARTMENT?

15 A. "LITTLE M, POKE, PETE AND RALPH."

16 Q. AND THAT'S YOUR HANDWRITING WHERE IT SAYS, A, FOR
17 ANSWER?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. OKAY. SO, IN THE STATEMENT YOU'RE SAYING,
20 LITTLE M, POKE, PETE, WHO YOU UNDERSTAND TO BE
21 WALTER HARRIS, - - -

22 A. YES.

23 Q. --- AND RALPH, YOU SPELLED IT R-A-F-F, RALPH
24 COLEMAN, CORRECT?

25 A. UH-HUH.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

397

1 Q. YOU'RE SAYING IN THIS STATEMENT THAT THOSE FOUR
2 HAD GUNS?

3 A. UH-HUH.

4 Q. BUT IN YOUR TESTIMONY YOU'RE SAYING, PETE DIDN'T
5 HAVE A GUN, HE GAVE IT TO RALPH?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. SO, WHICH IS CORRECT?

8 A. HE GAVE HIS GUN TO RALPH.

9 Q. OKAY. SO, NOW YOU'RE SAYING, DESPITE MAKING THE
10 STATEMENT ON MARCH EIGHTEENTH, NOW YOUR TESTIMONY
11 IS THAT PETE GAVE THE GUN TO RALPH?

12 A. I DID HAD MENTIONED THAT, THOUGH. I DID HAD
13 MENTIONED THAT PETE GAVE THE GUN TO RALPH IN THE
14 STATEMENT, IF I'M NOT MISTAKEN.

15 Q. CAN YOU POINT THAT OUT FOR ME, SIR?

16 THE COURT: CAN YOU HAND THAT TO HIM SO HE CAN
17 READ IT BETTER?

18 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR, I'M SORRY.

19 THE COURT: IT WOULD JUST BE EASIER FOR YOU TO
20 READ IT, AND GIVE HIM A CHANCE TO REVIEW IT, MR.
21 PALMER.

22 A. IT'S NOT IN THERE, SIR.

23 Q. IT'S NOT IN THERE. BUT YOU DO RECALL, YOU
24 THOUGHT IT WAS IN THERE, DIDN'T YOU?

25 A. YES, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

398

1 Q. OKAY. WELL, I'M GOING TO ASK YOU ABOUT ANOTHER
2 PART OF THIS QUESTION AND ANSWER THING. NOW, I
3 UNDERSTAND FROM YOUR DIRECT TESTIMONY, WHEN THE
4 SOLICITOR WAS EXAMINING YOU, DID YOU NOT SAY THAT
5 YOU HAVE KNOWN PETE YOUR WHOLE LIFE?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. HOW HAVE YOU KNOWN HIM, DID Y'ALL GROW UP
8 TOGETHER?

9 A. WELL, BASICALLY, WE GROWED UP IN THE SAME AREA.

10 Q. OKAY. AND YOU'VE BEEN KNOWING HIM YOUR WHOLE
11 LIFE, IS THAT CORRECT?

12 A. YEAH.

13 Q. OKAY. NOW, WHEN YOU WERE ASKED IN THIS
14 STATEMENT, YOU WERE DOWN AT LAW ENFORCEMENT, THE
15 QUESTION WAS, SIR, AND I'M READING FROM THIS, "DO
16 YOU KNOW PETE'S REAL NAME?" WHAT WAS OUR ANSWER?

17 A. "NO".

18 Q. YOU'RE TELLING THIS COURT THAT EVEN THOUGH YOU
19 GREW UP WITH THIS MAN, YOU DON'T KNOW HIS REAL
20 NAME?

21 A. I DID COME FORWARD AND SAY, TOLD, LIKE, ON MARCH
22 TWENTIETH, I CAME FORWARD AND TOLD MR. SHUMPERT
23 HIS REAL NAME.

24 COURT REPORTER: TOLD WHAT?

25 A. PETE'S REAL NAME, TOLD SHUMPERT PETE'S REAL NAME.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

399

1 Q. DID YOU DO THAT IN WRITING?

2 A. I THINK SO.

3 Q. AND IS THAT, SIR, BECAUSE YOU FOUND OUT HIS REAL
4 NAME AFTER ALL THOSE YEARS, OR YOU SUDDENLY
5 REMEMBERED IT?

6 A. YEAH, I SUDDENLY REMEMBERED IT.

7 Q. OH, YOU SUDDENLY REMEMBERED IT, SO THEN YOU
8 DECIDED TO CHANGE YOUR STATEMENT TO THE POLICE,
9 IS THAT CORRECT?

10 A. I AIN'T NEVER, I NEVER DID CHANGE IT.

11 Q. WELL, YOU JUST TESTIFIED, SIR, THAT YOU DIDN'T
12 KNOW PETE'S REAL NAME, AND YOU SAID THAT IN AN
13 AFFIDAVIT. AND YOU UNDERSTAND WHAT AN AFFIDAVIT
14 IS, RIGHT?

15 A. IT'S A STATEMENT, RIGHT, YEAH.

16 Q. YOU UNDERSTAND, IT'S A SWORN STATEMENT?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. AND THIS, THIS PARTICULAR ONE WAS SIGNED BY A
19 NOTARY. DO YOU UNDERSTAND THAT?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. DO YOU UNDERSTAND WHAT THAT MEANS?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. WHAT DOES IT MEAN?

24 A. WELL, YOU JUST SAID IT, A SWORN STATEMENT.

25 Q. IT'S A SWORN STATEMENT. IT MEANS YOU'RE TELLING

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

400

1 THE TRUTH, RIGHT?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. SO, IN THIS SWORN STATEMENT YOU SAID YOU DIDN'T
4 KNOW PETE'S NAME, AND YOU SAID A FEW DAYS LATER,
5 YOU MADE ANOTHER STATEMENT INFORMATION DETECTIVE
6 SHUMPERT OF WHAT PETE'S REAL NAME WAS, CORRECT?
7 TELL ME IF I'M WRONG.

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AND THE TRUTH IS THAT YOU DID KNOW WHAT
10 PETE'S REAL NAME WAS, EVEN BACK THEN, DIDN'T YOU?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. AND YOU JUST SAID NO TO PROTECT YOURSELF, RIGHT?

13 A. NOT REALLY, I WAS TOLD NOT TO SAY NOTHING.

14 Q. BY WHOM?

15 A. MARIO.

16 Q. OKAY.

17 A. AND EVERYONE ELSE.

18 Q. AND WHAT WAS YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT WOULD
19 HAPPEN IF YOU DID SAY SOMETHING?

20 A. I DON'T KNOW.

21 Q. I MEAN, WERE YOU AFRAID OF THESE GUYS?

22 A. I WAS JUST TOLD NOT TO SAY NOTHING.

23 Q. OKAY. AND NOW YOU'RE HERE IN COURT TODAY SAYING
24 LOTS OF THINGS?

25 A. YES.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

401

1 Q. SO, WHAT CHANGED?

2 A. I'M TRYING TO DO WHAT'S RIGHT.

3 Q. DO WHAT'S RIGHT FOR YOU, CORRECT?

4 A. NO, FOR EVERYONE, MY FAMILY, THEIR FAMILY.

5 Q. HOW IS YOUR TESTIFYING GOING TO BENEFIT YOUR
6 FAMILY? I JUST, I WANT TO KNOW.

7 A. THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. I'M DOING WHAT'S RIGHT
8 FOR THEM, WHAT THEY FEEL IS RIGHT.

9 Q. OKAY. BUT THE ANSWER, SIR, IS, THAT IT'S GOING
10 TO BENEFIT YOUR FAMILY BY LESSENING YOUR
11 PUNISHMENT, ISN'T IT?

12 A. WHAT DID YOU SAY AGAIN?

13 Q. THAT'S WHAT YOU WANT OUT OF THIS, DON'T YOU?

14 A. LESSEN MY WHAT?

15 Q. YOUR PUNISHMENT.

16 A. NO, NOT REALLY, I UNDERSTAND I'M BEING CHARGED
17 WITH THE SAME THING THEY'RE BEING CHARGED WITH,
18 AND I COULD GET LIFE JUST AS THEY COULD GET LIFE.

19 Q. BUT YOU DON'T BELIEVE YOU'LL GET LIFE, DO YOU?

20 A. MAYBE.

21 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. NOW, AT SOME POINT YOU TESTIFIED
22 YOU MENTIONED TO MARIO SHIVERS, QUOTE, "WE
23 SHOULDN'T DO THIS," UNQUOTE, RIGHT?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. WHAT WAS HIS RESPONSE?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

402

- 1 A. YOU'RE GOING TO BE STRAIGHT, MAN, JUST, THE ONLY
2 THING YOU'RE DOING IS GOING TO BUY WEED.
- 3 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU BELIEVE THAT THAT'S ALL THAT
4 WAS GOING TO HAPPEN?
- 5 A. YES, SIR.
- 6 Q. HAVE YOU BOUGHT WEED BEFORE?
- 7 A. YES, SIR.
- 8 Q. DID YOU FIND IT NECESSARY TO TAKE A WEAPON WITH
9 YOU?
- 10 A. NO, SIR.
- 11 Q. NO? OKAY. WHY THIS TIME YOU THOUGHT YOU NEEDED
12 ONE?
- 13 A. BECAUSE WE WAS GOING TO ROB THE DUDE.
- 14 Q. OKAY. I THOUGHT YOU JUST SAID YOU JUST THOUGHT
15 YOU WERE GOING TO GO BUY WEED?
- 16 A. I WAS TOLD TO GO BUY WEED, YEAH, THAT WAS THE
17 WHOLE PLAN.
- 18 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. YOU THOUGHT THAT WAS GOING TO BE
19 JUST YOUR ONLY INVOLVEMENT?
- 20 A. YES, SIR.
- 21 Q. SO, WHY DIDN'T YOU LEAVE AFTER YOU BOUGHT THE
22 WEED?
- 23 A. I DID LEFT.
- 24 Q. WELL, YOU SAID YOU STAYED.
- 25 A. I GOT DROPPED OFF AT WALTER HARRIS'S HOUSE, AND I

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

403

1 WENT IN MY OWN DIRECTION.

2 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, THE SOLICITOR SHOWED YOU A HAND
3 GUN?

4 A. YES, SIR.

5 Q. YOU SAID YOU DON'T RECOGNIZE IT. THAT'S YOUR
6 TESTIMONY, RIGHT?

7 A. YES, YES, SIR.

8 Q. AND THE ONLY THING THAT YOU DO RECOGNIZE IS, IT'S
9 BLACK?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. NOW, YOU WOULD AGREE WITH ME, SIR, I MEAN, YOU'VE
12 SEEN OTHER GUNS, RIGHT?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. YOU'VE BEEN IN PAWN SHOPS AND LOOKED AT THE GUN
15 COUNTER?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. LOTS OF GUNS ARE BLACK, AREN'T THEY?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. SO, YOU CAN'T IDENTIFY THIS GUN AS THE ONE THAT
20 ANYBODY IN THIS GROUP HAD, CORRECT?

21 A. I JUST KNOW IT WAS A BLACK GUN.

22 Q. OKAY.

23 A. I CAN'T RECALL WHAT TYPE OF CALIBER IT WAS.

24 Q. AND YOUR TESTIMONY WAS, YOU DIDN'T RECOGNIZE THIS
25 GUN, YOU'RE NOT CHANGING THAT, ARE YOU?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

404

1 A. OH, NO, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. OKAY. NOW, THIS INCIDENT
3 HAPPENED, THIS, WHATEVER IT WAS, ON MARCH
4 TWELFTH, IS THAT YOUR RECOLLECTION?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. AND THE FIRST STATEMENT YOU MADE WAS ON MARCH,
7 WHAT EIGHTEENTH?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. SIX DAYS LATER?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AFTER YOU HAD FOUND OUT THE POLICE WERE LOOKING
12 FOR YOU?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. AND SO, THAT'S WHEN YOU DECIDED TO MAKE A
15 STATEMENT?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. AND THE PURPOSE OF MAKING THE STATEMENT WAS TO
18 TRY AND GET YOURSELF OUT OF TROUBLE?

19 A. I WAS JUST TELLING THEM WHAT HAPPENED.

20 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. NOW, IN BETWEEN THE NIGHT THIS
21 HAPPENED AND AS YOU SIT HERE TODAY, YOU HAVE NOT
22 SPOKEN OR HEARD FROM WALTER HARRIS. IS THAT A
23 TRUE STATEMENT?

24 A. YES, THAT'S TRUE.

25 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU, SIR.

1 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, MR. MELLARD.

2 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

3 THE COURT: YES, SIR, YOUR WITNESS.

4 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
5 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
6 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
7 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
8 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. MELLARD

406

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. MELLARD:

Q. IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING WHEN YOU WERE UP HERE YOU
SAID YOU HAD NEVER PARTICIPATED IN A ROBBERY
BEFORE?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. SO, YOU HAVE PARTICIPATED IN A ROBBERY BEFORE?

A. NEVER.

Q. YOU NEVER PARTICIPATED IN A ROBBERY BEFORE, NEVER
ROBBED ANY GAS STATION, NEVER DID ANYTHING?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. OKAY. SO, YOU CONSIDER YOURSELF A LAW ABIDING
CITIZEN?

A. WHAT DO YOU MEAN BY THAT?

Q. DO YOU FOLLOW THE LAW?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. YOU FOLLOW THE LAW. ALRIGHT, WELL, LET'S TALK
ABOUT YOUR LAW FOLLOWING ACTIVITIES HERE. NOW,
ON MARCH TWELFTH, YOU SMOKED MARIJUANA WITH
DARIUS GARDNER, IS THAT CORRECT?

A. AND THAT'S FOLLOWING THE LAW, SMOKING MARIJUANA
IS LEGAL?

A. YES, IT'S LEGAL IN CALIFORNIA.

Q. OKAY. AND LET'S LOOK AROUND HERE. I THINK THIS
IS SOUTH CAROLINA. IS IT LEGAL HERE IN SOUTH

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. MELLARD

407

1 CAROLINA?

2 A. OH, NO, SIR.

3 Q. IT'S NOT LEGAL HERE IN SOUTH CAROLINA. IF IT WAS
4 LEGAL HERE IN SOUTH CAROLINA YOU WOULDN'T HAVE TO
5 GO TO PEOPLE'S PLACES AND ROB THEM, RIGHT?

6 A. TRUE.

7 Q. OKAY. SO, SMOKING MARIJUANA WITH DARIUS GARDNER,
8 NOT LEGAL. AND THEN YOU CALLED UP MARIO SHIVERS.
9 AND THE REASON YOU SAID YOU CALLED UP MARIO
10 SHIVERS IS BECAUSE YOU SAID HE HAD A GUN,
11 CORRECT?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. ALRIGHT. AND AS A LAW ABIDING CITIZEN WHAT DO
14 YOU NEED A GUN FOR?

15 A. I JUST WANTED TO SEE IT.

16 Q. YOU JUST WANTED TO SEE IT. YOU'D NEVER SEEN A
17 GUN BEFORE?

18 A. YES, I DON'T SEEN PLENTY OF GUNS, SEVERAL GUNS.

19 Q. YOU'VE SEEN PLENTY OF GUNS?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. SO, WHAT WAS IT ABOUT THIS GUN THAT YOU WERE SO
22 INTERESTED IN SEEING?

23 A. BASICALLY, HE TOLD ME TO COME OVER THERE TO SEE
24 IT.

25 Q. ALRIGHT. YOU CALLED HIM UP BECAUSE HE HAD A GUN?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. MELLARD

408

- 1 A. YEAH.
- 2 Q. SO, WHAT IS IT ABOUT THIS GUN THAT'S SO
- 3 WONDERFUL?
- 4 A. BUT I DIDN'T MENTION THE GUN TO HIM.
- 5 Q. UH-HUH.
- 6 A. HE MENTIONED IT TO ME.
- 7 Q. ALRIGHT.
- 8 A. BUT HE AIN'T MENTIONED IT TO ME, HE JUST TOLD ME
- 9 TO COME OVER HE'S GOT SOMETHING TO SHOW ME.
- 10 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DID HE SHOW YOU WHEN YOU GOT
- 11 THERE?
- 12 A. GUNS.
- 13 Q. HE SHOWED YOU GUNS. HE SHOWED YOU THREE GUNS,
- 14 CORRECT?
- 15 A. YES, SIR.
- 16 Q. SKS?
- 17 A. YES, SIR.
- 18 Q. ANOTHER SKS?
- 19 A. YES, SIR.
- 20 Q. AND A NINE MILLIMETER, RIGHT?
- 21 A. YES, SIR.
- 22 Q. NOW, LET ME ASK YOU'RE SMOKING MARIJUANA WITH
- 23 DARIUS GARDNER, DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE?
- 24 A. NO, SIR.
- 25 Q. OKAY. AND THEN, WHEN YOU AND MARIO WERE LOOKING

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. MELLARD

409

1 AT THIS GUN DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. THEN YOU SAID THAT YOU, MARIO, RALPH
4 AND DARIUS, Y'ALL SMOKED DOPE, WHICH, IF IT WAS
5 CALIFORNIA I GUESS YOU'D BE OKAY WITH IT, SINCE
6 IN SOUTH CAROLINA IT'S ILLEGAL. WHEN YOU DID
7 THAT DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE WHEN Y'ALL WERE
8 SITTING THERE SMOKING DOPE?

9 A. NO, SIR.

10 Q. OKAY. AND THEN MARIO SHOWED YOU THE SKS AND
11 ANOTHER SKS, A NINE MILLIMETER, DANNY RYANT
12 WASN'T THERE?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. OKAY. MARIO BROUGHT UP THE TOPIC OF ROBBERY?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. HE BROUGHT IT UP AND RALPH AND YOU WERE THERE?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. AND DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. I BELIEVE Y'ALL PLANNED TO GO ROB THIS
21 PLACE, YOU WERE SUPPOSED TO GO IN AND THEN THEY
22 WERE SUPPOSED TO COME IN AFTER YOU AND THE
23 ROBBERY WOULD OCCUR, CORRECT?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE WHEN Y'ALL WERE PLANNING

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. MELLARD

410

1 * THAT?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. ALRIGHT. THEN, I BELIEVE YOU SAID CHRIS AND HIS
4 FRIEND CAME OVER IN AN SUV?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE WHEN THAT HAPPENED?

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THEN YOU AND CHRIS AND PATRICK AND
9 RALPH AND MARIO AND A DRIVER, ACCORDING TO YOUR
10 TESTIMONY - - -

11 A. I AM PATRICK.

12 Q. OH, I'M SORRY. ALRIGHT, SO YOU, CHRIS, RALPH,
13 MARIO AND THE DRIVER, ALRIGHT, LET ME MAKE SURE,
14 ONE, TWO, THREE, FOUR, FIVE, CORRECT?

15 A. YES, SIR.

16 Q. ALRIGHT. TALKED ABOUT ROBBING OLD SCHOOL?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. OKAY. AND YOU SAID MARIO WAS DOING MOST OF THE
19 TALKING?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. ALRIGHT. DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE?

22 A. NO, SIR.

23 Q. OKAY. ARE YOU BORED, DO YOU NEED TO TAKE A
24 LITTLE BREAK HERE? I SAW YOU YAWNING.

25 A. I'M SORRY.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. MELLARD

411

1 Q. ARE YOU OKAY? OKAY.

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OBJECTION, HE'S BADGERING
3 THE WITNESS, YOUR HONOR.

4 MR. MELLARD: I JUST ASKED HIM IF HE WANTS A
5 BREAK. THAT'S FINE, I'LL MOVE ON.

6 THE COURT: YES, SIR, IF YOU'LL MOVE ON. THANK
7 YOU, SIR.

8 Q. THEN YOU SAID THAT YOU WENT TO GET WALTER HARRIS?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 Q. DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE?

11 A. NO, SIR.

12 Q. ALRIGHT. WALTER HARRIS BROUGHT A GUN?

13 A. YES, SIR.

14 Q. DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. ALRIGHT. AND THEN YOU WENT TO OLD SCHOOL'S HOUSE
17 AND WALTER HARRIS WENT IN?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. AND DANNY RYANT WASN'T THERE?

20 A. NO, SIR.

21 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, DANNY RYANT WASN'T PART OF THE
22 PLANNING OF THIS ROBBERY, WAS HE?

23 A. NO, SIR.

24 Q. ALRIGHT. AND DANNY RYANT DIDN'T SUPPLY ANY OF
25 THE GUNS, DID HE?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. MELLARD

412

1 A. NO, SIR.

2 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING YOU'RE
3 TESTIFYING YOU PICKED DANNY RYANT UP FROM THE
4 CORNER POCKET?

5 A. YES, I AIN'T PICK HIM UP, THE DRIVER PICKED HIM
6 UP.

7 Q. THE DRIVER PICKED HIM, UP, YOU WERE IN THE
8 VEHICLE WITH THE DRIVER?

9 A. I WAS JUST A PASSENGER.

10 Q. JUST A PASSENGER?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. ALRIGHT. AND IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING, AND YOU TELL
13 ME IF I'M WRONG, BUT IT TAKES ABOUT TWO MINUTES
14 TO GET FROM THE CORNER POCKET TO OLD SCHOOL'S
15 HOUSE?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. IS THAT ABOUT RIGHT? ALRIGHT. AND I BELIEVE
18 YOU'VE BEEN ASKED ABOUT WHY YOU'RE HERE TO
19 TESTIFY.

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. MOST PEOPLE HAVE ASKED YOU ABOUT THAT. AND YOU
22 SAID YOU TURNED YOURSELF IN TO THE POLICE?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. OKAY. BUT WHEN YOU TURNED YOURSELF IN TO THE
25 POLICE, YOU KNEW THE POLICE WERE LOOKING FOR YOU?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. MELLARD

413

1 A. YEAH, THAT DAY.

2 Q. YEAH, YOU KNEW THEY WERE LOOKING FOR YOU?

3 A. YEAH, THAT'S WHY I TURNED MYSELF IN.

4 Q. RIGHT. AND YOU KNEW THEY WERE LOOKING FOR YOU
5 BECAUSE OF THIS MURDER, CORRECT?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND YOU'RE TELLING EVERYBODY HERE WHAT THE POLICE
8 WANT TO HEAR, ISN'T THAT CORRECT?

9 A. YES, SIR.

10 MR. MELLARD: ALRIGHT, THANK YOU.

11 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MR. MELLARD.

12 ALRIGHT, MR. KOGER.

13 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
14 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
15 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
16 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
17 sequential continuation of record.)

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

414

CROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. KOGER:

Q. NOW, MR. TYLER, YOU GAVE THIS STATEMENT ON MARCH
-- LET ME GET THIS STRAIGHT HERE.

MR. KOGER: I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE, YOUR
HONOR.

THE COURT: TAKE YOUR TIME, MR. KOGER.

Q. ON MARCH EIGHTEENTH, CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S APPROXIMATELY, I THINK ATTORNEY
PALMER STATED, ABOUT SIX DAYS AFTER THE INCIDENT,
CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. NOW, WHEN IT CAME TO YOU AGREEING TO
TESTIFY FOR THE STATE IN THIS MATTER DID YOU
CONTACT THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE, OR THE
SOLICITOR'S OFFICE CONTACTED YOU?

A. MY LAWYER CONTACTED ME.

Q. YOUR LAWYER CONTACTED YOU?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND WHEN DID YOUR LAWYER CONTACT YOU ABOUT
POSSIBLY TESTIFYING FOR THE STATE?

A. LIKE, I CAN'T EVEN RECALL, SIR.

Q. EXCUSE ME?

A. I CAN'T RECALL, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

415

1 Q. WAS IT THE MONTH OF MARCH?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. WAS IT THE MONTH OF APRIL?

4 A. NO, SIR.

5 Q. WAS IT MAY?

6 A. NO, SIR.

7 Q. WAS IT JUNE?

8 A. I CAN'T RECALL, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. WAS IT DURING THE SUMMER?

10 A. I CAN'T RECALL.

11 Q. WAS IT HOT OUTSIDE?

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: OBJECTION, ASKED AND

13 ANSWERED, HE CAN'T RECALL. I'M ALSO HESITANT BECAUSE
14 HE MIGHT BE GOING INTO COMMUNICATIONS BETWEEN HIM AND
15 HIS LAWYER, MR. GRANT. HE'S ALREADY REPEATEDLY, HE
16 CAN'T RECALL.

17 THE COURT: WELL, HE HAS ANSWERED THAT HE CANNOT
18 RECALL, AND I UNDERSTAND YOU'RE TRYING TO PIN HIM DOWN
19 TO SOME TIME, BUT HE SEEMS TO NOT RECALL, MR. KOGER,
20 SO IF YOU WILL MOVE ON, PLEASE, SIR.

21 Q. BUT YOU DID NOT CONTACT HIM IN MARCH, SOON AFTER
22 YOU TURNED YOURSELF IN?

23 A. SIR?

24 Q. YOU DID NOT CONTACT THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE IN
25 MARCH SOON AFTER YOU TURNED YOURSELF IN, CORRECT?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

416

- 1 A. NO, SIR.
- 2 Q. OKAY. NOW, HOWEVER, WHATEVER TIME FRAME THAT YOU
- 3 AND THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE MADE CONTACT, WHERE
- 4 DID THE TWO OF Y'ALL MEET?
- 5 A. BAMBERG.
- 6 Q. I'M SORRY?
- 7 A. I CAN'T RECALL, SIR.
- 8 Q. SOME PLACE IN BAMBERG?
- 9 A. I CAN'T RECALL.
- 10 Q. YOU CAN'T RECALL. WAS IT THE DETENTION CENTER?
- 11 A. I KNOW I WAS LOCKED UP.
- 12 Q. LOCKED UP IN BAMBERG?
- 13 A. SOMEWHERE.
- 14 Q. OKAY. BECAUSE THAT'S WHERE YOU ARE BEING KEPT
- 15 UNTIL TRIAL, BAMBERG, SOUTH CAROLINA, CORRECT?
- 16 A. I BEEN TO DJJ IN COLUMBIA, ORANGEBURG AND
- 17 BAMBERG.
- 18 Q. OKAY. IS BAMBERG THE MOST RECENT DETENTION
- 19 CENTER YOU WERE KEPT BEFORE COMING TO COURT
- 20 TODAY?
- 21 A. YES, SIR.
- 22 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND DO YOU RECALL WHEN YOU WERE
- 23 TRANSPORTED TO BAMBERG?
- 24 A. OH, YES, SIR.
- 25 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN WERE YOU TRANSPORTED TO BAMBERG?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

417

1 A. RIGHT ABOUT ONE, TWO MONTHS, LIKE TWO MONTHS.

2 Q. ABOUT TWO MONTHS AGO?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. SO, WOULD IT BE SAFE TO SAY THAT YOU WERE
5 TRANSPORTED TO BAMBERG PROBABLY IN SEPTEMBER?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. DID YOU TALK TO THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE
8 ABOUT TESTIFYING BEFORE THE MONTH OF SEPTEMBER?

9 A. I CAN'T RECALL.

10 Q. OKAY. YOU CAN'T RECALL. OKAY. HOW MANY TIMES
11 BETWEEN SEPTEMBER AND NOW HAVE YOU TALKED WITH
12 THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE ABOUT TESTIFYING IN THIS
13 PARTICULAR CASE?

14 A. LIKE, THREE TIMES.

15 Q. THREE TIMES. OKAY. AND DURING THOSE
16 CONVERSATIONS THAT YOU HAD WITH THE SOLICITOR'S
17 OFFICE WHAT WAS THE CONTENT OF THOSE
18 CONVERSATIONS?

19 A. TO SEE IF I WANT TO TESTIFY, COOPERATE.

20 Q. TO SEE WHETHER YOU WOULD HAVE COOPERATED,
21 CORRECT?.

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. WAS THERE EVER A QUESTION WHETHER YOU WOULD
24 COOPERATE?

25 A. YES, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

418

- 1 Q. OKAY. AND WHY DID YOU HESITATE TO COOPERATE AT
2 FIRST, JUST BASED ON WHAT YOU JUST STATED?
3 A. BECAUSE -- I DON'T KNOW.
4 Q. OKAY. SO YOU SAID THE FIRST TIME YOU MET YOU
5 WERE HESITANT ABOUT COOPERATING?
6 A. YES, SIR.
7 Q. OKAY. YOU MET A SECOND TIME, CORRECT?
8 A. YES, SIR.
9 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT WERE YOUR FEELINGS THE SECOND
10 TIME ABOUT TESTIFYING IN THIS PARTICULAR CASE?
11 A. I THINK MY MOTHER CAME UP HERE AND SHE WAS
12 TELLING ME SHE THINK I NEED TO TESTIFY, DO WHAT I
13 HAVE TO DO, AND JUST TELL YOUR PART.
14 Q. NOW, YOU SAY UP HERE, DO YOU MEAN BAMBERG OR UP
15 HERE IN ORANGEBURG?
16 A. ORANGEBURG.
17 Q. OKAY. SO, ACCORDING TO YOUR TESTIMONY THERE WAS
18 A THIRD MEETING WITH THE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE
19 WHETHER YOU SHOULD COOPERATE AND TESTIFY OR NOT,
20 CORRECT?
21 A. THAT WAS THE SECOND MEETING, I THINK.
22 Q. OKAY. BUT YOU MIGHT HAVE MET A THIRD TIME,
23 CORRECT?
24 A. MAYBE.
25 Q. MAYBE. OKAY. NOW, DURING EITHER ONE OF THESE

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

419

1 MEETINGS, THE FIRST, SECOND OR THIRD MEETING, DID
2 IT COME UP ABOUT REDUCTION IN CHARGES IN EXCHANGE
3 FOR YOUR TESTIMONY?

4 A. REDUCING MY CHARGES?

5 Q. YES.

6 A. YES.

7 Q. OKAY. AND DID THAT COME UP IN THE FIRST MEETING,
8 THE SECOND MEETING, OR THE THIRD MEETING?

9 A. THE FIRST.

10 Q. THE FIRST MEETING. OKAY. DID IT COME UP AGAIN
11 IN THE SECOND MEETING?

12 A. NO, SIR. I ALREADY KNOW WHAT THE CIRCUMSTANCES
13 WAS.

14 Q. DID IT COME UP AGAIN IN THE THIRD MEETING?

15 A. NO, SIR.

16 Q. WAS THE IDEA OF REDUCTION OF CHARGES A FACTOR IN
17 YOU TESTIFYING HERE TODAY?

18 A. NO, SIR, STILL I'M BEING CHARGED WITH THE SAME
19 THING THEY'RE BEING CHARGED WITH STILL.

20 Q. I KNOW YOU REPEATED THAT SEVERAL TIMES TO SEVERAL
21 DIFFERENT ATTORNEYS. AND I'M GOING TO ASK YOU A
22 FIFTH TIME, DO YOU HAVE AN EXPECTATION THAT YOU
23 WILL GET LESS TIME BY TESTIFYING HERE TODAY?

24 A. NO, SIR.

25 Q. WOULD YOU BE SURPRISED IF YOU GOT THE MAXIMUM

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

420

1 AMOUNT OF TIME AFTER TESTIFYING HERE TODAY?

2 A. NO, SIR.

3 Q. WOULD YOU BE SHOCKED IF YOU GOT THE MAXIMUM
4 AMOUNT OF TIME AFTER TESTIFYING HERE TODAY?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. YOU WOULDN'T BE SHOCKED. YOU WOULDN'T BE
7 DISAPPOINTED?

8 A. NO, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. THIS IS JUST OUT OF THE GOODNESS OF YOUR
10 HEART RIGHT HERE?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. OKAY. AND YOU ARE THE SAME PERSON THAT WAS ON
13 THE SCENE THAT PARTICULAR EVENING, CORRECT, OF
14 THE ROBBERY, OF THE MURDER, OF THE BURGLARY,
15 FIRST, CORRECT?

16 A. WHAT DO YOU MEAN, LIKE, THE SAME, DID I CHANGE
17 OVER THE PAST TIME WHEN I WAS LOCKED UP?

18 Q. NO. I'M TALKING ABOUT, YOU'RE THE SAME PERSON,
19 YOU'RE CHARGED WITH THE SAME OFFENSE ON THIS
20 INCIDENT THAT HAPPENED ON MARCH TWELFTH OF TWO
21 THOUSAND TEN, PATRICK TYLER, CORRECT?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. ALRIGHT. AND YOU WERE THE SAME PERSON THAT
24 DIDN'T LEAVE THE SCENE AND PARTICIPATED IN
25 EVERYTHING, CORRECT?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

421

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT. AND YOU'RE NOT HERE TRYING TO
3 MINIMIZE YOUR RESPONSIBILITY, BUT YOU'RE TAKING
4 RESPONSIBILITY FOR IT?

5 A. YEAH, SO I AIN'T MINIMIZING NOTHING IF I'M TAKING
6 RESPONSIBILITY OF IT.

7 Q. OKAY. NOW, AND I THINK EITHER ATTORNEY PALMER OR
8 ATTORNEY WISE WENT OVER YOUR LENGTH OF TIME THAT
9 YOU HAVE KNOWN THE CO-DEFENDANTS IN THIS
10 PARTICULAR CASE, AND I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE I
11 HAVE MY NOTES RIGHT. I THINK YOU STATED THAT YOU
12 HAVE KNOWN WALTER HARRIS ALL OF YOUR LIFE,
13 CORRECT?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. BECAUSE MR. HARRIS IS OLDER?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. AND I THINK YOU TESTIFIED TO KNOWING DANNY
18 RYANT ALL OF HIS LIFE?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. OKAY. AND I THINK YOU, AND CORRECT ME IF I'M
21 WRONG NOW, WITH CHRISTIAN COLEMAN AND RALPH
22 COLEMAN, I THINK YOU TESTIFIED YOU DON'T KNOW
23 THEM SO WELL, I MEAN, TELL ME YOUR RELATIONSHIP
24 WITH THEM?

25 A. I WENT TO SCHOOL WITH CHRIST.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

422

- 1 Q. OKAY.
- 2 A. AND I KNOW RALPH LIKE THIS, BEING JUST FROM BEING
- 3 AROUND.
- 4 Q. OKAY. AND I THINK YOU TESTIFIED KNOWING MARIO
- 5 SHIVERS FOR ONLY TWO YEARS?
- 6 A. YES, AROUND ABOUT TWO YEARS.
- 7 Q. NOW, LET ME ASK YOU A QUESTION OR TWO AND I'M
- 8 GOING TO SIT DOWN HERE. YOU STATED ON THE RECORD
- 9 THAT YOU MADE A PHONE CALL TO MR. SHIVERS ON THAT
- 10 PARTICULAR EVENING?
- 11 A. YES, SIR.
- 12 Q. OKAY. WHAT IS THAT NUMBER?
- 13 A. SIXTY-FOUR SEVENTEEN, I THINK.
- 14 Q. IT'S SIXTY-FOUR SEVENTEEN?
- 15 A. YES.
- 16 Q. AND WHAT'S THE FIRST THREE DIGITS?
- 17 A. LIKE, IF I'M NOT MISTAKEN, THREE O EIGHT OR EIGHT
- 18 SIX O.
- 19 COURT REPORTER: THREE O EIGHT WHAT?
- 20 A. OR EIGHT SIX O.
- 21 Q. IT IS YOUR TESTIMONY THAT THE PURPOSE OF YOU
- 22 TESTIFYING HERE TODAY IS NOT TO GAIN ANY TYPE OF
- 23 BENEFIT IN RELATION TO YOUR CHARGES AND YOUR
- 24 SENTENCE?
- 25 A. NO, SIR.

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

423

1 Q. AND THAT IF THE MAXIMUM IS IMPOSED ON ALL THREE
2 OF OUR CHARGES, THEN YOU WOULD NOT BE SHOCKED AND
3 YOU WOULD NOT BE SURPRISED?

4 A. NO, SIR.

5 Q. AND JUST A MATTER OF HOUSEKEEPING HERE, ATTORNEY
6 PALMER, -- DO YOU RECOGNIZE THAT, DEFENDANT'S
7 EXHIBIT - - -

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT IS THIS?

10 A. THE STATEMENT THAT I WROTE ON MARCH EIGHTEEN.

11 Q. AND THIS IS THE SAME STATEMENT THAT ATTORNEY
12 PALMER AND THE OTHER ATTORNEYS HAVE QUESTIONED
13 YOU UPON?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 MR. KOGER: YOUR HONOR, I'D LIKE TO ENTER THIS
16 INTO EVIDENCE, YOUR HONOR.

17 THE COURT: HOW IS IT MARKED RIGHT NOW?

18 MR. KOGER: IT'S DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT NUMBER ONE
19 FOR, FOR, IS THAT CHRISTIAN? CHRISTIAN COLEMAN.

20 THE COURT: CHRISTIAN? OKAY. ANY OBJECTION FROM
21 THE STATE?

22 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IT NEEDS TO BE DEFENSE
23 EXHIBIT NUMBER TWO FOR MARIO SHIVERS, YOUR HONOR.

24 THE COURT: YOU REPRESENT MR. SHIVERS, IS THAT
25 CORRECT?

CROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

424

1 MR. KOGER: THAT'S CORRECT.

2 THE COURT: OKAY. YEAH, IF WE'LL MARK IT FOR
3 DEFENSE EXHIBIT NUMBER TWO FOR MARIO SHIVERS. THANK
4 YOU, SIR. WE NEED TO HAVE IT IN THAT ORDER.

5 MR. KOGER: OKAY. I HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

6 COURT REPORTER: JUST A MOMENT.

7 (Defendant Shivers Exhibit Number Two
8 marked and filed.)

9 THE COURT: BEAR WITH HER. NOW, YOU DON'T HAVE
10 ANY OTHER QUESTIONS?

11 MR. KOGER: NO MORE QUESTIONS.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR.

13 ALRIGHT, ANYTHING ON REDIRECT?

14 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, THANK YOU, SIR.

15 THE COURT: ALRIGHT.

16 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NOT TOO MUCH. ARE YOU READY,
17 MS. HARRY DOT?

18 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

19 SOLICITOR PASCOE: COULD I SEE MR. SHIVERS'S
20 NUMBER TWO?

21 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

22 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
23 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
24 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
25 required by the Court.)

REDIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

425

REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY SOLICITOR PASCOE:

Q. JUST A HANDFUL OF QUESTIONS, MR. TYLER, OKAY?
PATRICK, DO YOU REMEMBER BEING QUESTIONED BY MR.
MELLARD ABOUT DANNY RYANT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND OF ALL THE DEFENDANTS THAT WERE CLOSEST TO
YOU, WHICH ONE WERE YOU CLOSEST WITH?

A. DANNY RYANT.

Q. AND DO YOU WANT TO HAVE TO TESTIFY AGAINST HIM
TODAY?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. AND AS YOU TESTIFIED TO EARLIER, YOU'RE DOING
THIS BECAUSE IT'S THE RIGHT THING TO DO?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND HE WAS MOCKING YOU, CALLING YOU MR. LAW
ABIDING CITIZEN, BUT YOU TOLD - - -

MR. MELLARD: I OBJECT.

SOLICITOR PASCOE: THAT'S WHAT HE DID.

THE COURT: OKAY. LET ME HEAR, DID YOU NOT ASK
THAT?

MR. MELLARD: I WAS NOT MOCKING HIM, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: OKAY. WELL, YOU WERE QUESTIONING HIM
ABOUT BEING A LAW ABIDING CITIZEN.

Q. QUESTIONING YOU ABOUT BEING A LAW ABIDING

REDIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

426

1 CITIZEN?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. WHO TOLD YOU ABOUT MARIO SHIVERS'S GUNS?

4 A. DANNY RYANT.

5 Q. WHO ALSO WAS INTERESTED IN THOSE GUNS?

6 A. WHO ELSE WAS INTERESTED?

7 Q. UH-HUH. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, WHAT GUN DID DANNY

8 RYANT HAVE WHEN Y'ALL WENT AND COMMITTED THE

9 ROBBERY?

10 A. THE SKS.

11 Q. THE SKS. THAT'S NOT VERY LAW ABIDING EITHER, IS

12 IT, GOING INTO SOMEBODY'S HOUSE WITH AN SKS?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. MR. LACKEY ASKED YOU A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS EARLY

15 ON ABOUT YOUR STATEMENT THAT YOU GAVE TO

16 INVESTIGATOR SHUMPERT. REMEMBER THOSE QUESTIONS?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. AND HE ASKED YOU SPECIFICALLY IN DEFENSE EXHIBIT

19 NUMBER TWO, - - -

20 COURT REPORTER: WHICH - - -

21 THE COURT: DEFENDANT SHIVERS'S NUMBER TWO,

22 RIGHT?

23 SOLICITOR PASCOE: SHIVERS NUMBER TWO, YES, SIR.

24 AND DO WE NEED, DO WE LEAVE THAT, THE NUMBER ONE OF

25 MR. LACKEY'S, DO WE LEAVE THAT ON? WE LEAVE IT ON FOR

REDIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

427

1 NOW MAYBE? WE'LL JUST LEAVE IT ON FOR NOW.

2 Q. ALRIGHT, HE ASKED YOU SOME QUESTIONS - - -

3 THE COURT: WELL, THAT WAY IF IT COMES BACK ON
4 THE RECORD WHEN DECLARING THE RECORD WE'LL HAVE IT
5 IDENTIFIED BOTH WAYS FOR THE RECORD, IN THE RECORD, SO
6 WE NEED TO LEAVE THEM BOTH IN THERE. JUST LEAVE IT
7 IN AS IS, MS. HARRY DOT.

8 Q. AND HE SAID SPECIFICALLY, MR. LACKEY IN HIS
9 QUESTION, YOU NEVER SAID ANYTHING ABOUT CHRIS
10 HAVING A GUN? REMEMBER THAT?

11 A. YES, SIR.

12 Q. THAT'S NOT TRUE, IS IT?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. YOU DID SAY IN YOUR STATEMENT THAT CHRIS HAD A
15 GUN?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. IN AT LEAST TWO PLACES, DIDN'T YOU?

18 A. YES, SIR.

19 Q. AND, IN FACT, ON PAGE ONE, THAT'S IN YOUR
20 HANDWRITING, IS THIS YOUR HANDWRITING?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. AND DID YOU WRITE, "THAT'S WHEN POKE, LITTLE M,
23 AND LITTLE CHRIS AND PETE COME IN WITH GUNS"?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 Q. SO, YOU DID SAY CHRIS HAD A GUN?

REDIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

428

1 A. YES, SIR.

2 Q. AND YOU SAID IT AGAIN ON STATE'S EXHIBIT SEVENTY-
3 NINE, JUST TO REFRESH YOUR MEMORY, ON MARCH
4 TWENTY-THIRD, YOU TOLD THE POLICE THAT CHRIS HAD
5 A GUN, DIDN'T YOU?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. ON YOUR AFFIDAVIT?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. SO, IT'S NOT TRUE TO SAY, IT'S DISHONEST TO SAY
10 THAT YOU NEVER TOLD THE POLICE THAT CHRIST HAD A
11 GUN?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. YOU DID TELL THE POLICE CHRIS HAD A GUN?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. IT'S ALSO NOT TRUE, WHEN MR. WISE WAS QUESTIONING
16 YOU AND HE TRIED TO GET YOU TO SAY THAT YOU NEVER
17 SAID IN YOUR STATEMENT THAT RALPH COLEMAN NEVER
18 HAD A GUN. THAT'S NOT TRUE, IS IT?

19 A. NO, SIR.

20 Q. YOU DID TELL THE POLICE THAT RALPH HAD A GUN,
21 DIDN'T YOU?

22 A. YES, SIR.

23 Q. SO, THAT'S NOT TRUE WHEN A LAWYER GETS UP HERE
24 AND ASKS THAT, THAT'S A LIE, BECAUSE YOU SAID - -

25

REDIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

429

1 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE'S ASKING
2 QUESTIONS THAT -- ALL THE LAWYERS HERE ARE ASKING
3 QUESTIONS, THEY'RE NOT TESTIFYING, THEREFORE, THEY'RE
4 NOT LYING. HE ASKED A QUESTION AND PATRICK TYLER
5 ANSWERED IT.

6 SOLICITOR PASCOE: IT IS - - -

7 THE COURT: WELL, JUST WAIT A SECOND. IF YOU'LL
8 JUST ASK HIM TO CLARIFY THOSE POINTS.

9 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I WILL, YES, SIR.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. JUST DO THAT. WE DON'T NEED
11 CHARACTERIZATION.

12 Q. DID YOU SAY ON PAGE TWO IN YOUR STATEMENT THAT
13 RALPH HAD A GUN?

14 A. YES, SIR.

15 Q. NOT CORRECT TO SAY THAT YOU NEVER TOLD THE POLICE
16 THAT RALPH HAD A GUN, RIGHT?

17 A. YES, SIR.

18 Q. A LOT OF US NEED TO GET A CONSCIENCE, DON'T WE,
19 MR. PATRICK, MR. TYLER?

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 MR. PALMER: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. FIRST OF
22 ALL, HE'S LEADING THIS WITNESS ALL OVER THE PLACE, AND
23 IT'S HIS WITNESS. HE SHOULD -- THIS IS SUPPOSED TO BE
24 REDIRECT.

25 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I'M USING HIS STATEMENTS.

REDIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

430

1 THE COURT: HE'S GOING OVER THE STATEMENTS THAT
2 WERE MADE. I'M GOING TO ALLOW IT, I WILL NOTE YOUR
3 OBJECTION TO THAT.

4 MR. PALMER: I'M JUST, YOUR HONOR, I DON'T THINK
5 THAT LAST QUESTION HAD ANYTHING TO DO WITH A
6 STATEMENT.

7 THE COURT: I UNDERSTAND. IT DOESN'T HAVE ANY
8 RELEVANCE, SO WE WILL STRIKE THAT FROM THE RECORD.
9 OKAY?

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR.

12 Q. MR. PALMER CONTINUALLY ASKED YOU ABOUT MR.
13 HARRIS'S ROLE IN THIS ROBBERY. WHO PUT THE TAPE
14 OVER CHARLES PRINGLE'S MOUTH?

15 A. WALTER HARRIS.

16 Q. OKAY. AND FINALLY, JUST TO CLARIFY, BECAUSE YOU
17 WERE ASKED AT LEAST FIVE TIMES WHY YOU WERE
18 TESTIFYING AND ABOUT THE DEAL, ANY DEAL?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. YOU'RE CHARGED WITH BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. YOU HAVE TO PLEAD GUILTY STRAIGHT UP TO BURGLARY
23 IN THE FIRST DEGREE, DON'T YOU?

24 A. YES, SIR.

25 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, WHERE IS THE

REDIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

431

1 QUESTION? THAT WAS A STATEMENT.

2 Q. DON'T YOU?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 Q. DO YOU HAVE TO PLEAD GUILTY STRAIGHT UP TO
5 BURGLARY IN THE FIRST DEGREE?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. EVEN THOUGH YOU DIDN'T HAVE A GUN?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. ARE YOU CHARGED WITH ARMED ROBBERY?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. DO YOU HAVE TO PLEAD STRAIGHT UP TO ARMED
12 ROBBERY, EVEN THOUGH YOU DIDN'T HAVE A GUN?

13 A. NO, SIR.

14 Q. AS PART, ARE YOU GOING TO PLEAD GUILTY TO ARMED
15 ROBBERY?

16 A. OH, YES, SIR.

17 Q. OKAY. NO DEALS, RIGHT, ON YOUR SENTENCE?

18 A. NO, SIR.

19 Q. THE ONLY THAT YOU ARE ALLOWED TO DO IS INSTEAD OF
20 PLEADING TO MURDER YOU'RE GOING TO PLEAD TO A
21 LESSER CHARGE OF MANSLAUGHTER, STRAIGHT UP,
22 CORRECT?

23 A. YES, SIR.

24 Q. SO, INSTEAD OF LOOKING AT THIRTY YEARS TO LIFE,
25 YOU'RE GOING TO LOOK AT FIFTEEN YEARS TO LIFE

REDIRECT - PATRICK TYLER BY SOL. PASCOE

432

1 WITHOUT PAROLE?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 Q. HAVE THERE BEEN ANY DEALS WHATSOEVER BETWEEN ME
4 AND YOU ABOUT WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO GET?

5 A. NO, SIR.

6 Q. WHO IS GOING TO SENTENCE YOU?

7 A. THE JUDGE.

8 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I BEG THE COURT'S INDULGENCE.

9 THAT'S ALL I HAVE, THANK YOU, MR. TYLER.

10 THE COURT: YES, SIR, ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY,

11 ANYTHING ON RECROSS?

12 MR. LACKEY: JUST BRIEFLY, YOUR HONOR.

13 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
14 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
15 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
16 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
17 sequential continuation of record.)

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

433

RECROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. LACKEY:

Q. THIS STATEMENT SHOULD BE -- THIS STATEMENT THAT
WE'VE BEEN REFERRING TO, WHICH IS NOW - - -
THE COURT: IT'S DEFENDANT SHIVERS'S - - -

Q. DEFENDANT'S SHIVERS NUMBER TWO WHICH HAS BEEN
MOVED INTO EVIDENCE AND WHICH THE JURY WILL HAVE
TO SEE IN THE JURY ROOM AT THE CLOSE OF THIS
CASE, THE FACT IS, YOU'VE ALREADY TESTIFIED THAT
YOU LIED SEVERAL TIMES IN THIS STATEMENT, ISN'T
THAT CORRECT?

A. YES, I BEEN UNTRUTHFUL.

Q. YOU'VE BEEN UNTRUTHFUL.

A. IN SOME PARTS.

Q. THAT MEANS LIE?

A. YES.

Q. WHAT WAS THAT?

A. YES.

Q. YES. AND THE JURY WILL ALSO GET TO SEE WHEN THEY
SEE THIS THAT MIRACULOUSLY, YOU DIDN'T, YOU WERE
THE ONLY MAN THAT DIDN'T HAVE A GUN IN HIS HAND
THE WHOLE TIME?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE SAYING HERE TODAY?

A. YES, SIR.

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. LACKEY

434

1 COURT REPORTER: WHAT'S YOUR ANSWER?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 MR. LACKEY: THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

4 THE COURT: THANK YOU, SIR.

5 WAS IT, IT WAS YOU, MR. WISE, OR -- IT'S MR.

6 WISE, YES, SIR, I'M SORRY.

7 MR. WISE: I WOULD LIKE TO REMAIN HERE IF THAT'S
8 OKAY.

9 THE COURT: OKAY.

10 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
11 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
12 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
13 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
14 sequential continuation of record.)

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

435

RECROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. WISE:

Q. PATRICK, JUST TWO QUESTIONS. HOW MANY GUNS WERE THERE INVOLVED?

A. FOUR.

Q. FOUR GUNS, IS THAT IT? POKE HAD A GUN, MARIO HAD A GUN, CHRIS HAD A GUN, PETE HAD A GUN, AND RALPH HAD A GUN, ISN'T THAT WHAT YOUR STATEMENT SAYS?

A. PETE DID HAVE A GUN.

Q. YEAH, PETE HAD A GUN.

A. SO THAT WAS FIVE.

Q. OKAY.

A. BUT HE GAVE HIS GUN TO SOMEONE, SO THAT MAKES FOUR.

Q. OKAY, SO YOU - - -

A. I'M JUST SAYING, HE DID HAVE A GUN IN HIS POSSESSION AT A POINT IN TIME.

Q. OKAY. SO, YOU SAY JUST -- AND YOU CAN LOOK AT YOUR STATEMENT, THAT'S NUMBER TWO, YOU WERE INSIDE AND RALPH PULLED OUT A GUN?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. THAT'S WHAT YOU SAID?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND THEN, POKE, MARIO, CHRIS AND PETE CAME

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. WISE

436

1 IN WITH THEIR GUNS PULLED OUT, THAT'S WHAT YOU
2 SAID, RIGHT?

3 A. YES, SIR.

4 MR. WISE: OKAY, THANK YOU.

5 THE COURT: MR. PALMER.

6 MR. PALMER: BRIEFLY, BRIEFLY, YOUR HONOR.

7 THE COURT: TAKE, MR. PALMER, YOU HAVE AS MUCH
8 TIME AS YOU NEED.

9 MR. PALMER: THANK YOU.

10 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
11 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
12 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
13 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
14 sequential continuation of record.)

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

437

RECROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. PALMER:

Q. I JUST, I WANT TO ASK YOU ABOUT A COUPLE OF
THINGS YOU SAID WHEN THE SOLICITOR JUST NOW ASKED
YOU ABOUT DUCT TAPE.

A. YES, SIR.

Q. YOUR STATEMENT HERE, SIR, IS, DOWN AT THE BOTTOM,

- - -

THE COURT: YOU'RE REFERRING TO NUMBER TWO?

MR. PALMER: I'M REFERRING TO NUMBER TWO FOR
SHIVERS - - -

THE COURT: DEFENDANT SHIVERS. OKAY. THANK YOU,
SIR.

MR. PALMER: --- THAT'S BEEN ENTERED, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: YES, SIR, I JUST WANTED THE JURY TO
BE AWARE.

Q. THE SECOND LINE FROM THE BOTTOM, AND I'VE GOT MY
THUMB BY IT, DO YOU REMEMBER WRITING THAT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND IF I READ IT TO YOU, WILL YOU TELL ME WHETHER
OR NOT IT'S ACCURATE? YOU SAID, "PETE TAPED HIS
MOUTH AND HE WAS GOING TO TAPE HIS HANDS. BUDDY"
WHO'S BUDDY?

A. OLD SCHOOL.

Q. WHY DO YOU CALL HIM BUDDY?

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

438

1 A. THAT'S JUST A SLANG.

2 Q. OKAY. "BUDDY WAS, LIKE, GET THE F" NOT TO USE
3 THE PROFANITY, "OFF OF ME AND MY MAMA, AND THEN
4 HE WAS GETTING UP. THAT'S WHEN ALL THE GUN SHOTS
5 WENT OFF."

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. IS THAT WHAT YOU PUT IN YOUR STATEMENT?

8 A. YES, SIR.

9 Q. YOU ACTUALLY HEARD OLD SCHOOL SAY THAT?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AND THAT WAS WHEN YOU WERE ON THE WAY OUT OF THE
12 DOOR?

13 A. NO, HE DIDN'T SAY THAT THEN. HE WAS, LIKE, GET
14 THE F OFF ME, THAT WAS, LIKE, WHEN WE FIRST CAME
15 IN. I WAS JUST MAKING THE LONG STORY SHORT WHEN
16 I WAS WRITING THAT.

17 Q. WELL, IN YOUR STATEMENT YOU SAY, "PETE TAPED HIS
18 MOUTH AND HE WAS GOING TO TAPE HIS HANDS. BUDDY
19 WAS, LIKE, GET THE F OFF ME."

20 A. YES, SIR.

21 Q. SO, HOW COULD HE HAVE SAID THAT AFTER PETE TAPED
22 HIS MOUTH?

23 A. LIKE YOU SEE ON THE PICTURE RIGHT THERE, OF HIS
24 MOUTH, HIS MOUTH WASN'T TAPED ALL THE WAY UP.

25 Q. SO, YOU'RE SAYING HE SAID THIS AND YOU HEARD IT

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

439

1 AFTER THE MOUTH WAS TAPED, IS THAT YOUR STORY?

2 A. THAT'S, YOU COULD SEE THE PICTURE.

3 Q. I'M ASKING YOU, SIR.

4 A. THE PICTURE, YES, SIR.

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YOUR HONOR, OBJECTION.

6 THAT'S NOT HIS STORY. HE SAID THAT HIS MOUTH WAS NOT
7 TAPED ALL THE WAY. HE'S TELLING THE ATTORNEY, LOOK AT
8 THE PICTURE TO FIND THE TRUTH. AND THEN HE SAYS
9 SOMETHING ELSE.

10 MR. PALMER: YOUR HONOR, I'M NOT ASKING HIM TO
11 REFER TO AN EXHIBIT, I'M ASKING HIM WHAT HE, HIS
12 TESTIMONY IS.

13 THE COURT: OKAY. I UNDERSTAND. I UNDERSTAND.
14 WHAT WAS YOUR QUESTION AGAIN?

15 MR. PALMER: MY TESTIMONY -- MY QUESTION WAS --

16
17 THE COURT: NOT YOUR TESTIMONY, YOUR QUESTION.

18 MR. PALMER: MY QUESTION WAS, YOUR HONOR, WHETHER
19 OR NOT THIS MAN RECALLS, OR I CAN ASK HIM AGAIN,

20 Q. YOUR TESTIMONY IN YOUR STATEMENT IS, IS THAT MR.
21 OLD SCHOOL SAID, GET THE F OFF OF ME - - -

22 A. AND HE ALSO SAID EVERYTHING WAS OUTSIDE, TOO.
23 YES, SIR.

24 Q. WHAT?

25 A. HE WAS TELLING, WHEN EVERYONE WAS ASKING HIM

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. PALMER

440

1 WHERE EVERYTHING WAS AT, HE WAS SAYING, OUTSIDE,
2 WITH THE TAPE OVER HIS MOUTH, TOO.

3 Q. WHERE IS THAT IN YOUR STATEMENT?

4 COURT REPORTER: HE WAS SAYING WHAT?

5 A. IT WAS OUTSIDE.

6 COURT REPORTER: HE IS OUTSIDE?

7 A. NO, THE STUFF, WHAT WE CAME TO ROB HIM FOR, HIS
8 MONEY AND HIS DRUGS WERE OUTSIDE.

9 Q. WHERE IS THAT IN YOUR STATEMENT?

10 A. IT SHOULD BE IN THERE.

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YOUR HONOR, I'LL STIPULATE IN
12 HIS STATEMENT, BUT HE TESTIFIED TO IT, SO WE DON'T
13 HAVE TO WAIT A HALF HOUR.

14 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING ELSE, MR. PALMER?

15 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

16 THE COURT: OKAY.

17 MR. MELLARD?

18 MR. MELLARD: I DON'T HAVE ANY QUESTIONS BUT I
19 MAY HAVE A MATTER OF LAW TO TAKE UP WITH THE COURT
20 AFTER MR. KOGER.

21 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT. MR. KOGER.

22 MR. KOGER: BRIEFLY, YOUR HONOR.

23 THE COURT: YES, SIR, YES, SIR.

24 MR. KOGER: MAY IT PLEASE THE COURT.

25 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

RECROSS - PATRICK TYLER BY MR. KOGER

441

RECROSS-EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER

BY MR. KOGER:

Q. MR. TYLER, YOU TESTIFIED TO REDIRECT THAT YOU'RE
PLEADING GUILTY TO VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER EVEN
THOUGH YOU DIDN'T HAVE A GUN?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND YOU TESTIFIED YOU'RE PLEADING GUILTY TO
BURGLARY, FIRST, EVEN THOUGH YOU DIDN'T HAVE A
GUN?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. AND YOU'RE PLEADING GUILTY TO ARMED ROBBERY EVEN
THOUGH YOU DIDN'T HAVE A GUN, RIGHT?

A. YES, SIR.

Q. OKAY. FROM YOUR DISCUSSIONS WITH YOUR ATTORNEY,
DO YOU HAVE TO HAVE A GUN TO BE FOUND GUILTY OF
VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER, BURGLARY, FIRST, AND
ARMED ROBBERY?

A. NO, SIR.

Q. OKAY. AND YOU CAN BE CONVICTED OF THESE OFFENSES
UNDER THE HAND OF ONE, THE HAND OF ALL, CORRECT?

A. YES, SIR.

MR. KOGER: THANK YOU. NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, THANK YOU, SIR. YOU
CAN STEP DOWN, YOU'RE EXCUSED. THANK YOU, MR. TYLER,
I APPRECIATE IT.

1 ALRIGHT, I KNOW YOU'VE GOT -- I HAVEN'T
2 FORGOTTEN, MR. MELLARD, I'M NOT GOING TO LET IT GO TOO
3 FAR, OKAY? I JUST WANTED TO -- ALRIGHT, YOU DON'T
4 HAVE A SHORT WITNESS, DO YOU? PROBABLY NOT?

5 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, SIR.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. WHAT WE'LL DO IS, LADIES AND
7 GENTLEMEN -- OH, GO AHEAD.

8 MR. MELLARD: ARE YOU GOING TO BREAK FOR THE DAY
9 OR ...

10 THE COURT: THAT'S WHAT I'M THINKING ABOUT.

11 MR. MELLARD: MAY WE APPROACH?

12 THE COURT: SURE.

13 (Whereupon, a bench conference
14 is had out of the hearing of
15 the jury and court reporter.)

16 THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I KNOW YOU'VE
17 HEARD MR. MELLARD SAY HE HAD A POINT OF LAW HE WANTED
18 TO TAKE UP WITH ME, AND WE'VE GOT SOME OTHER WITNESSES
19 THAT WE COULD DO OR AT LEAST GET STARTED ON, BUT SINCE
20 IT IS NEARLY FIVE O'CLOCK, WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS,
21 I'M GOING TO GO AHEAD AND TAKE A ~~BE~~ WE'RE GOING TO
22 TAKE A BREAK THIS AFTERNOON, I'M GOING TO EXCUSE Y'ALL
23 AND LET Y'ALL GO HOME. Y'ALL NEED TO COME BACK HERE
24 AT NINE O'CLOCK IN THE MORNING AGAIN, REPORT BACK IN
25 THE JURY ROOM AS YOU ARE DIRECTED TO DO. I WANT TO

1 REMIND YOU AGAIN, OKAY, YOU CANNOT READ ANYTHING ABOUT
2 THIS CASE, YOU CANNOT LISTEN TO ANYTHING ABOUT THIS
3 CASE, YOU CAN'T TALK AMONG YOURSELVES AND YOU CAN'T
4 TALK TO ANYBODY ELSE ABOUT THIS CASE. DO Y'ALL
5 UNDERSTAND THAT? OKAY. ALRIGHT, Y'ALL ARE EXCUSED.
6 BE BACK IN THE JURY ROOM AT NINE O'CLOCK IN THE
7 MORNING. OKAY? THANK YOU.

8 (Whereupon, the jury leaves
9 the courtroom and the following
10 takes place out of the presence
11 of the jury.)

12 MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, THIS IS A -- DURING THE
13 SOLICITOR'S EXAMINATION OF PATRICK TYLER I BELIEVE I
14 HEARD HIM SAY THAT VOLUNTARY MANSLAUGHTER CARRIES
15 FIFTEEN YEARS TO LIFE.

16 THE COURT: UH-HUH.

17 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, I DIDN'T SAY THAT, HE SAID
18 THAT.

19 MR. MELLARD: HE SAID IT?

20 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YEAH, I DID NOT SAY THAT.
21 WHAT I SAID WAS, WHEN YOU LOOK AT ALL YOUR CHARGES
22 YOU'RE LOOKING AT FIFTEEN TO LIFE.

23 MR. MELLARD: OKAY. THAT'S, I JUST WANTED TO
24 CLARIFY THAT.

25 THE COURT: ANYTHING ELSE?

1 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR, I THOUGHT THEY WERE SAYING
2 THAT THAT'S WHAT THEY TOLD HIM THAT IT CARRIED. SO, I
3 JUST WANTED -- AND I THINK WHAT THEY'RE SAYING IS,
4 HE'S GROUPING ALL OF HIS CHARGES TOGETHER.

5 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING ELSE FROM THE
6 STATE?

7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, SIR.

8 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYTHING FROM ANY OF THE
9 DEFENDANTS BEFORE WE BREAK?

10 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

11 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

12 MR. PALMER: NO, SIR.

13 MR. MELLARD: NO, SIR.

14 MR. KOGER: NO, SIR.

15 THE COURT: OKAY. WE'LL BE BACK HERE AND WE'LL
16 START TESTIMONY AT NINE. OH, I'M SORRY.

17 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, I'M SORRY, ONE
18 THING WE PROBABLY CAN TAKE UP JUST REAL BRIEFLY IS THE
19 REST OF THESE PHOTOGRAPHS THAT WE MARKED, WHETHER
20 THERE'S ANY OBJECTION TO ANY OF THEM.

21 THE COURT: YEAH, IF Y'ALL WANT TO LOOK IT OVER
22 AND POINT OUT ...

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I MEAN, SOME OF THEM ARE
24 ALREADY IN EVIDENCE, BUT SOME OF THEM ARE STILL JUST
25 MARKED FOR ID.

1 THE COURT: OKAY. IF YOU DON'T MIND, Y'ALL LOOK
2 THEM OVER. EVERYBODY ELSE CAN LEAVE THE COURTROOM.
3 SO IF Y'ALL WANT TO -- WE'LL HANG AROUND AND Y'ALL
4 LOOK OVER THE PHOTOGRAPHS AND TELL ME WHICH ONES YOU
5 HAVE AN OBJECTION TO, IF ANY.

6 (Whereupon, all attorneys
7 examine State's photographs.)

8 THE COURT: HAVE YOU LOOKED AT ALL OF THE PHOTOS,
9 MS. ULLMAN?

10 MS. ULLMAN: I HAVE, YOUR HONOR.

11 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND DO YOU HAVE AN
12 OBJECTION TO SOME OF THEM?

13 MS. ULLMAN: I DO.

14 THE COURT: OKAY, WHICH ONES?

15 COURT REPORTER: I NEED NUMBERS.

16 MS. ULLMAN: YES, MA'AM, IF YOU'LL GIVE ME JUST
17 ONE SECOND I'LL GIVE THOSE, HE'S PUTTING THEM IN
18 ORDER.

19 THE COURT: OKAY, YOU'RE OBJECTING TO?

20 MS. ULLMAN: I'M GOING TO LIST YOU A BUNCH OF
21 NUMBERS BECAUSE MY OBJECTION IS PRETTY MUCH THE SAME
22 TO ALL OF THEM.

23 THE COURT: OKAY.

24 MS. ULLMAN: STATE'S THIRTEEN, FOURTEEN, FIFTEEN,
25 SIXTEEN, SEVENTEEN, EIGHTEEN, NINETEEN, TWENTY,

1 TWENTY-ONE, TWENTY-TWO, TWENTY-THREE, TWENTY-FOUR,
2 TWENTY-FIVE, TWENTY-SIX. BASICALLY, THIRTEEN THROUGH
3 TWENTY-SIX, INCLUSIVE. YOUR HONOR, THE BASIS OF MY
4 OBJECTION IS NUMEROUS REASONS. FIRST OFF BEING, ALL
5 OF THE PICTURES THAT I JUST LISTED HAVE, I'LL SHOW YOU
6 THIS ONE, THIS IS STATE'S TWENTY-THREE, ALL OF THESE
7 YELLOW MARKERS IN THERE THAT ARE NUMBERED, I
8 UNDERSTAND THAT THOSE MARKERS ARE SHOWING WHERE
9 BULLETS OR BULLET CASINGS OR EVIDENCE OF SOME SORT HAS
10 BEEN FOUND. MY ISSUE WITH THIS PICTURE AND ALL THE
11 OTHER ONES THAT HAVE THESE MARKERS IS, THESE MARKERS
12 DO NOTHING BUT BRING ATTENTION TO HOW MANY WERE FOUND.
13 CERTAINLY, A PERSON CAN LOOK AT THIS, AND I'LL PASS
14 THIS UP, YOUR HONOR, SO YOU CAN SEE IT, NEXT TO THESE
15 MARKERS ARE, WITH MY LACK OF KNOWLEDGE I'LL SAY,
16 COPPER APPEARING, METAL PIECES. I CERTAINLY THINK THE
17 JURY COULD SEE THOSE WITHOUT THOSE MARKERS THERE.
18 SPECIFICALLY, YOUR HONOR, IN -- EXCUSE ME -- IN
19 PICTURES FIFTEEN AND SIXTEEN WE'VE GOT THESE SAME
20 EXACT MARKERS ON THE SAME EXACT COUCH, ON THE SAME
21 EXACT THING, THAT'S CUMULATIVE. AND AGAIN, ALL OF
22 THESE PICTURES HAVE THESE YELLOW MARKERS IN THERE AND
23 I WOULD SAY THAT THEY'RE USING THESE TO EXCITE THE
24 JURY TO BRING EXTREME ATTENTION TO ALL OF THIS STUFF
25 THAT WAS IN HERE. THEY'RE GOING TO GET IN THROUGH

1 GERALD CARTER THAT THERE WERE SHELL CASINGS, BULLETS,
2 ALL OF THAT STUFF FOUND. THEY'RE IN THE PICTURES,
3 THEY DON'T NEED TO BOLSTER THE EVIDENCE WITH THESE
4 YELLOW TAGS.

5 THE OTHER ISSUE I HAVE WITH THE YELLOW TAGS, YOUR
6 HONOR, IS, THEY ARE LISTING OUT EVIDENCE.

7 THE COURT: THEY'RE WHAT?

8 MS. ULLMAN: THEY'RE LISTING, THEY'RE MARKING
9 EVIDENCE THROUGHOUT THE WHOLE APARTMENT. AND WHEN I
10 SAY, EVIDENCE, DIFFERENT THINGS, DIFFERENT PARTS OF
11 THE EVIDENCE, WHERE THE MARIJUANA WAS THAT THEY FOUND,
12 THE DUCT TAPE THAT THEY FOUND, SHELL CASINGS THAT THEY
13 FOUND, SCALES THAT THEY FOUND. NOT ALL OF THIS
14 EVIDENCE IS PROBATIVE AT ALL IN REGARDS TO WHETHER ANY
15 OF THESE CLIENTS, AND CERTAINLY, RALPH COLEMAN,
16 MURDERED, ARMED ROBBED, OR - - -

17 MR. PALMER: BURGLARIZED.

18 MS. ULLMAN: --- BURGLARIZED, THANK YOU, THIS
19 PERSON AT ALL. IT'S BASICALLY, AGAIN, JUST TO EXCITE
20 THE JURY.

21 ALSO, YOUR HONOR, I'VE BEEN GIVEN A COPY OF ALL
22 THESE PICTURES PLUS MANY, MANY, MANY MORE PICTURES.
23 IN GOING THROUGH ALL OF MY COPIES WHAT I FOUND IS, ALL
24 OF THESE PICTURES WITH THE YELLOW MARKERS, AND AGAIN,
25 THEY MADE SURE TO FIND EVERY PICTURE THAT HAS LOTS OF

1 YELLOW MARKERS TO SHOW TO THE JURY. ALL OF THESE
2 PICTURES ARE FOUND WITHOUT THESE YELLOW MARKERS. NOW,
3 THAT DOESN'T MEAN THAT THE EVIDENCE ISN'T THERE, THEY
4 HAVE THIS EXACT PICTURE WITH THE BULLET CASINGS AND
5 WHATEVER ELSE THESE YELLOW MARKERS ARE MARKING,
6 WITHOUT THOSE MARKERS THERE. SO, THEY CERTAINLY COULD
7 ENTER INTO EVIDENCE A PICTURE THAT DOESN'T HAVE
8 STATE'S EVIDENCE, I DON'T KNOW IF EVIDENCE IS THE
9 APPROPRIATE WORD, BUT STUFF CLUTTERED UP THAT THE
10 STATE ADDED IN. THIS IS CERTAINLY NOT AN ACCURATE
11 DEPICTION OF WHAT ANYBODY SAW WHEN THEY ARRIVED, IT'S
12 AN ACCURATE DEPICTION OF WHAT WAS SEEN AFTER GERALD
13 CARTER WENT THROUGH AND FOUND WHAT HE FELT WAS
14 EVIDENCE. IT CERTAINLY COULD EXCITE THE JURY, IT
15 CERTAINLY HAS A CUMULATIVE EFFECT - - -

16 THE COURT: CAN I SEE THEM ALL?

17 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

18 THE COURT: THANK YOU, MA'AM.

19 MS. ULLMAN: AND JUST TO ILLUSTRATE, EXCUSE ME,
20 TO SHOW MY REASONING BEHIND THIS, I UNDERSTAND THE
21 PURPOSE OF THE PICTURES IS TO SHOW THE BULLETS THAT
22 THEY FOUND. AND THEY CERTAINLY CAN GET THAT EVIDENCE
23 IN THROUGH GERALD CARTER AND THEY HAVE PICTURES THAT
24 WOULD SHOW THAT EVIDENCE THAT DON'T HAVE THESE YELLOW
25 MARKERS.

1 ALSO, THEY'RE TRYING TO SHOW THAT THE ROOM WAS IN
2 DISARRAY, THAT IT'S BEEN GONE THROUGH, THAT THE COUCH
3 CUSHIONS AND EVERYTHING ELSE HAD BEEN TORN UP. AND
4 YOUR HONOR, STATE'S TWELVE, STATE'S ELEVEN, STATE'S
5 TEN, STATE'S NINE, STATE'S SEVEN, ALL OF THAT EVIDENCE
6 IS SHOWN WITHOUT THESE YELLOW MARKERS. NOW, THE
7 YELLOW MARKERS DOESN'T -- WITHOUT THE YELLOW MARKERS
8 DOESN'T MEAN THAT THE EVIDENCE ISN'T THERE, IT JUST
9 MEANS THAT THE STATE'S MARKING OF THAT EVIDENCE ISN'T
10 THERE. SO, AGAIN, I WOULD SAY THAT IT'S CUMULATIVE,
11 IT COULD EXCITE THE JURY, IT DOES NOT HAVE ANY VALUE
12 AT ALL TO PROVE ANY ELEMENT OF THIS CRIME MORE OR LESS
13 LIKELY, AND THEY CAN CERTAINLY USE PICTURES THAT THEY
14 HAVEN'T, WHEN I SAY, TAMPERED WITH THE SCENE I DON'T
15 MEAN THAT IN A BAD WAY, - - -

16 THE COURT: I KNOW WHAT YOU MEAN, BUT - - -

17 MS. ULLMAN: --- BUT HAVEN'T CHANGED THE SCENE IN
18 ANY FASHION.

19 THE COURT: RIGHT.

20 MS. ULLMAN: SO, THAT WOULD BE THE BASIS FOR MY
21 OBJECTION.

22 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU. ANYTHING, MR.
23 SORENSEN?

24 SOLICITOR SORENSON: IF I COULD JUST ADDRESS A
25 COUPLE OF THINGS. I WOULD POINT OUT, YOUR HONOR, AND

1 AS MS. ULLMAN INDICATED, SHE'S GOTTEN COPIES OF ALL OF
2 THESE. THEY PROBABLY TOOK, I'M GUESSING, IN EXCESS OF
3 TWO HUNDRED AND TWENTY, I GUESS ABOUT TWO HUNDRED AND
4 TWENTY-NINE PHOTOGRAPHS OF THE SCENE OUT THERE. I
5 MEAN, OBVIOUSLY, I'M NOT TRYING TO INTRODUCE TWO
6 HUNDRED AND TWENTY-NINE PHOTOGRAPHS INTO EVIDENCE.
7 I'VE ATTEMPTED TO GO THROUGH THERE AND DO MY BEST TO
8 BASICALLY SHOW ALL OF THE EVIDENCE IN AS FEW
9 PHOTOGRAPHS AS I COULD. SO, THEREFORE, YOU KNOW, I'VE
10 CHOSEN PHOTOGRAPHS THAT SHOWED A LOT OF THE EVIDENCE
11 IN THEM, TRYING TO GET DIFFERENT ANGLES TO ULTIMATELY
12 COVER, YOU KNOW, ALL OF THE SHELL CASINGS AND ALL OF
13 THE PROJECTILES THAT WERE FOUND. I CAN'T HELP IT THAT
14 MR. PRINGLE WAS SHOT TWENTY-FOUR TIMES AND THAT, YOU
15 KNOW, THERE ARE TWENTY-FOUR SHELL CASINGS AND
16 PROJECTILES FOUND WITHING A FAIRLY SMALL ROOM. I MEAN,
17 AND THEREFORE, THAT LEADS TO A WHOLE LOT OF MARKERS.
18 YOU KNOW, I JUST CAN'T SEE HOW THE PRESENCE OF THOSE
19 YELLOW MARKERS, HOW THAT SOMEHOW WOULD INFLAME A JURY.
20 I MEAN, I JUST, I DON'T THINK I'VE EVER HEARD THAT
21 BEFORE. BUT, AND ULTIMATELY, YOUR HONOR, IT'S GOING
22 TO HELP TO AID, BECAUSE I'VE ALSO GOT MARKED TO USE
23 WITH LIEUTENANT CARTER A CRIME SCENE DIAGRAM THAT HE
24 DID THAT HE THEN BASICALLY CORRELATES THOSE NUMBERED
25 MARKERS ON THE DIAGRAM HE DID. AND I THINK THAT'S NOT

1 ONLY GOING TO AID, I MEAN, IT'S NOT ONLY GOING TO AID
2 HIM IN HIS TESTIMONY, BUT I THINK IT WILL AID THE JURY
3 IN KIND OF ORIENTING, YOU KNOW, WHERE THESE ITEMS
4 WERE LOCATED AT, THE VARIOUS SHELL CASINGS AND
5 PROJECTILES.

6 THE COURT: OKAY. I SEE. OKAY.

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: SO, I MEAN, I JUST DON'T SEE
8 HOW THOSE, YOU KNOW, AS I SAID, THERE ARE TWO HUNDRED
9 AND TWENTY-NINE PHOTOGRAPHS, I BELIEVE, THEY TOOK OUT
10 THERE AT THE SCENE THAT NIGHT, AND YOU KNOW, ~~AND~~

11 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR. ANYTHING ELSE
12 IN REPLY?

13 MS. ULLMAN: JUST IN RESPONSE, OUR HONOR, MY
14 BIGGEST ISSUE IS THE MARKERS BECAUSE OF THE NUMBERS. I
15 UNDERSTAND HE WAS SHOT TWENTY-FOUR TIMES AND THAT
16 CERTAINLY IS NOT MR. SORENSON'S FAULT, BUT THEY'VE GOT
17 LOTS OF THINGS MARKED, SOME THAT ARE NOT EVIDENCE AT
18 ALL INVOLVING THIS CASE, SUCH AS THE MARIJUANA THEY
19 FOUND, THE SCALES THAT THEY FOUND, THE MONEY THAT THEY
20 FOUND. AND IN SOME OF THOSE PICTURES WE'VE GOT, LIKE,
21 ITEM NUMBER FORTY-FIVE, AND IT COULD MISLEAD THE JURY
22 INTO BELIEVING THAT THERE WERE FORTY-FIVE BULLETS AND
23 FORTY-FIVE SHELL CASINGS, OR FORTY-FIVE SOMETHING BAD
24 THAT RELATES TO THESE DEFENDANTS THAT HAS NOTHING TO
25 DO WITH THEM AT ALL, BECAUSE SOME OF IT WAS

1 IRRELEVANT.

2 THE COURT: YES, MA'AM, I UNDERSTAND THAT, AND I,
3 YOU KNOW, AND I'LL NOTE YOUR OBJECTION, - - -

4 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

5 THE COURT: --- BUT I'M NOT GOING TO DISALLOW
6 THOSE PHOTOGRAPHS IN FOR THAT REASON.

7 MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, - - -

8 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

9 MR. MELLARD: --- I WOULD LIKE TO BE HEARD ON
10 THIS.

11 THE COURT: OKAY.

12 MR. MELLARD: MY ARGUMENT IS PROBABLY A LITTLE
13 DIFFERENT.

14 THE COURT: WELL, I HOPE SO, SINCE I'VE ALREADY
15 RULED ON THAT ONE, I HOPE IT WILL BE A LITTLE
16 DIFFERENT.

17 MR. MELLARD: WHAT I'M ARGUING ABOUT IS THE
18 ADMISSIBILITY AT THIS TIME OF, I GUESS IT WOULD BE
19 STATE'S, WHAT WAS IT, THIRTEEN THROUGH TWENTY-SIX?

20 COURT REPORTER: WHAT?

21 MR. MELLARD: THIRTEEN THROUGH TWENTY-SIX, THAT
22 SHOW THE SHELL CASINGS.

23 THE COURT: THE SAME PICTURES, THE SAME
24 PHOTOGRAPHS?

25 MR. MELLARD: THE SAME, SAME PHOTOGRAPHS.

1 THE COURT: OKAY. YOUR TAKE ON IT IS?

2 MR. MELLARD: MY OBJECTION AT THIS TIME IS, IT
3 WOULD BE MISLEADING UNLESS THERE IS EXPLANATION FROM A
4 WITNESS AS TO WHAT THESE ARE. SO, I'M NOT CONSENTING
5 TO IT OR, THE ADMISSIBILITY UNTIL IT'S PROVEN WHAT
6 THESE THINGS ARE.

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, WELL, HE'S GOING TO HAVE
8 SOMEBODY COME IN AND -- THE ONLY THING YOU'RE SAYING
9 IS, YOU WANT HIM TO HAVE SOMEBODY TO COME IN AND
10 IDENTIFY WHAT FORTY-FIVE IS, WHAT TWO IS, WHAT THREE
11 IS?

12 MR. MELLARD: RIGHT.

13 SOLICITOR SORENSON: WELL, OBVIOUSLY, I MEAN,
14 I'VE GOT TO PUT, I MEAN, YOU'VE GOT TO GO IN STEPS,
15 YOU'D GOT TO HAVE THE PERSON THAT COLLECTED IT BEFORE
16 YOU CAN HAVE THE PERSON THAT TESTED IT, I MEAN - - -

17 THE COURT: RIGHT.

18 SOLICITOR SORENSON: --- THAT'S JUST A FACT OF
19 LIFE.

20 MR. MELLARD: MY UNDERSTAND IS, THOUGH, THAT
21 YOU'VE RULED THAT THEY WERE GOING TO COME IN, AND I
22 WAS JUST ...

23 THE COURT: WELL, I'VE RULED, -- WELL, I DIDN'T
24 RULE -- WELL, I RULED THAT I'M NOT DISALLOWING THEM
25 BECAUSE THEY WOULD SOMEHOW INFLAME THE JURY. THAT, I

1 DON'T SEE THAT AT ALL, I SEE IT AS MARKINGS OF
2 EVIDENCE. SO, I'M LETTING IT IN FOR THAT REASON, YOU
3 KNOW.

4 MR. MELLARD: SUBJECT TO SOMEBODY ACTUALLY
5 PUTTING THE EVIDENCE - - -

6 THE COURT: YEAH, I MEAN, HE'S STILL GOT TO GET
7 SOMEBODY TO COME IN AND IDENTIFY THEM.

8 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I MEAN, THE ACTUAL SHELL
9 CASINGS AND ALL THAT, WE PREMARKED THEM AND THEY SAID
10 THEY DIDN'T -- THEY'RE ALL IN EVIDENCE.

11 THE COURT: RIGHT.

12 SOLICITOR SORENSON: SO, I MEAN, THE ACTUAL
13 ITEMS, I DON'T SEE HOW A PHOTOGRAPH OF WHERE IT WAS
14 LOCATED, I MEAN - - -

15 THE COURT: THE ONLY THING HE'S SAYING IS, HE'S
16 NOT CONSENTING TO THE ADMISSION OF THESE PHOTOGRAPHS
17 AT THIS TIME UNTIL YOU PUT THE GUY UP.

18 MR. MELLARD: THAT'S RIGHT.

19 THE COURT: AND THEN IF HE MAKES AN OBJECTION,
20 I'LL MAKE A RULING AT THAT TIME.

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I'D JUST LIKE TO POINT OUT,
22 THOUGH, THAT THE ITEMS OF EVIDENCE THAT ARE DEPICTED
23 ARE ALREADY IN EVIDENCE.

24 THE COURT: AND MR. SORENSON, I UNDERSTAND THAT.
25 THEY'VE ALREADY AGREED TO THAT, BUT WE'LL JUST DEAL

1 WITH IT AT THAT TIME. OKAY?

2 ANY OBJECTION FROM ANY OF THE OTHER DEFENDANTS?

3 MR. LACKEY?

4 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

5 THE COURT: MR. PALMER?

6 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY, MR. KOGER?

8 MR. KOGER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

9 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, SIR.

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: CAN I JUST PUT ALL THE,
11 BECAUSE THERE ARE SEVERAL OTHER PHOTOGRAPHS THAT I
12 BELIEVE WERE NOT OBJECTED TO ALL.

13 THE COURT: RIGHT.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: SO, THAT WOULD BE STATE'S.
15 EXHIBIT SEVEN - - -

16 COURT REPORTER: JUST A MOMENT, LET ME FIND
17 THOSE.

18 THE COURT: OKAY. THE ONES THAT ARE NOT OBJECTED
19 TO IF YOU WOULD GO AHEAD AND ...

20 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I'M GOING TO GO AHEAD AND
21 CROSS THE ID OFF OF THEM. THAT'S ACTUALLY -- SEVEN IS
22 ALREADY IN, I'M SORRY, BUT NINE - - -

23 COURT REPORTER: WAIT. OKAY, THAT'S IN?

24 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NINE IS IN WITHOUT
25 OBJECTION, TEN IS IN WITHOUT OBJECTION - - -

1 COURT REPORTER: ARE YOU STRIKING IT OFF FOR ME?

2 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I'M CROSSING THEM OFF,

3 YES, MA'AM, NINE, TEN, ELEVEN AND TWELVE.

4 THE COURT: SO, PHOTOGRAPHS NINE, TEN, ELEVEN AND
5 TWELVE ARE IN WITHOUT OBJECTION.

6 (State's Exhibit Nine, Ten, Eleven
7 and Twelve marked and filed.)

8 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NUMBER TWENTY-SEVEN.

9 COURT REPORTER: WAIT A MINUTE, LET ME GET TO
10 THAT. I'VE GOT IT.

11 (State's Exhibit Twenty-seven
12 marked and filed.)

13 SOLICITOR SORENSON: HAVE YOU GOT IT?

14 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

15 THE COURT: MR. PASCOE LEAVES YOU TO DO THE DIRTY
16 WORK, DOESN'T HE?

17 SOLICITOR SORENSON: HE DOESN'T HANDLE EVIDENCE.
18 AND THEN, TWENTY-NINE, THIRTY AND THIRTY-ONE.

19 THE COURT: TWENTY-NINE, THIRTY AND THIRTY-ONE.

20 COURT REPORTER: OKAY.

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: AND THEN WE'VE GOT ...

22 THE COURT: THOSE PHOTOGRAPHS ARE ALL IN WITHOUT
23 OBJECTION, IS THAT CORRECT? I'M NOT HEARING ANY
24 OBJECTION SO I'M TAKING THIS ALL AS NO OBJECTION.

25 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

1 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

2 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

3 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

4 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

5 (State's Exhibits Twenty-nine, Thirty
6 and Thirty-one marked and filed.)

7 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THIRTEEN THROUGH TWENTY-SIX
8 THAT ARE, I MEAN, - - -

9 THE COURT: THEY'RE JUST MARKED FOR ID RIGHT NOW.
10 (State's Exhibits Thirteen through Twenty-six,
11 photographs,
12 marked for identification only.)

13 SOLICITOR SORENSON: I HAVEN'T MARKED THEM YET,
14 SO I WOULD OFFER THEM SO THEY CAN OBJECT - - -

15 COURT REPORTER: NOW?

16 SOLICITOR SORENSON: NO, NO, MA'AM. SO, THEY CAN
17 PLACE THEIR OBJECTION ON THE RECORD AT THE APPROPRIATE
18 TIME.

19 THE COURT: WELL, MR. MELLARD MAY NOT OBJECT.

20 SOLICITOR SORENSON: HE MAY NOT, YES, SIR.

21 THE COURT: HE MAY NOT, HE JUST WANTS YOU TO PUT
22 UP YOUR EXPERT TO IDENTIFY THEM, OR YOUR WITNESS TO
23 IDENTIFY THEM. I BELIEVE THAT'S CORRECT. IS THAT
24 RIGHT, MR. MELLARD?

25 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

22 THE COURT: OKAY. IF Y'ALL JUST MAKE SURE WE'VE
23 GOT EVERYTHING IN EVIDENCE, EVERYTHING SAFE. OKAY?
24 ALRIGHT, THANK Y'ALL, Y'ALL HAVE A WONDERFUL EVENING,
25 GET SOME REST, AND I'LL SEE Y'ALL AT NINE O'CLOCK IN

1 THE MORNING. OKAY? THANK YOU.

2 (Recess for the day.)

3 DATE:

4 DECEMBER 15, 2010

5 THE COURT: MS. HARRY DOT, ARE WE READY?

6 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. WHERE IS MR. PALMER? OH, MR.
8 PALMER, IT'S SO GOOD TO SEE YOU.

9 MR. PALMER: I HAVE ONE REQUEST, JUDGE.

10 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

11 MR. PALMER: DO YOU OBJECT TO ME GETTING A CUP OF
12 COFFEE REAL QUICK?

13 THE COURT: WELL, THIS IS ONLY GOING TO TAKE A
14 SECOND.

15 MR. PALMER: OKAY.

16 THE COURT: AND THEN YOU CAN GET AS MANY CUPS OF
17 COFFEE AS YOU WANT, IF THERE'S ANYTHING BACK THERE, I
18 THINK THERE MIGHT BE SOME GROWING, STALE DONUTS YOU
19 CAN HAVE.

20 OKAY. MR. RICHLAND TOLD ME THAT ONE OF THE
21 JURORS WANTED TO TALK TO ME. OKAY? THE JUROR THAT
22 WANTS TO TALK TO ME IS THE LADY THAT HAS, I THINK I
23 MENTIONED TO Y'ALL EARLIER, HAD SURGERY, AND WAS
24 HAVING A PROBLEM, AND LIKE THAT. SO, I -- BUT I DO
25 NOT KNOW WHAT SHE WANTS TO TALK TO ME ABOUT. OKAY?

1 BUT BEFORE I TALK TO HER I WANTED TO MAKE SURE Y'ALL
2 KNEW ABOUT IT. OKAY? AND I DON'T KNOW IF Y'ALL WANT
3 TO BE PRESENT, OR HOW -- DO Y'ALL JUST WANT ME TO GO
4 TALK TO HER AND THEN COME BACK OUT HERE AND TELL Y'ALL
5 WHAT'S GOING ON OR WHAT?

6 MR. PALMER: I'D BE HAPPY WITH THAT.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. IS THERE ANY PROBLEM WITH ME
8 JUST TALKING TO HER AND THEN COMING BACK OUT AND
9 REPORTING TO Y'ALL?

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT'S FINE, YOUR HONOR.

11 THE COURT: NO OBJECTION FOR ANYONE THEN?

12 MR. LACKEY: NO, SIR.

13 MS. ULLMAN: NO, OBJECTION.

14 MR. PALMER: NO OBJECTION.

15 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

16 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

17 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ALRIGHT, MR. PALMER, IF YOU
18 WANT TO GO AHEAD -- IF ANYBODY WANTS TO GET COFFEE, GO
19 AHEAD AND GET IT.

20 (Whereupon, the Judge leaves
21 the courtroom and then
22 returns to the courtroom.)

23 THE COURT: THE JUROR THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IS
24 MS. JAMES, MS. KIA JAMES, AND SHE'S THE ONE THAT I
25 MENTIONED TO Y'ALL EARLIER HAD SURGERY, AND WE NEEDED

1 TO, YOU KNOW, PAY ATTENTION IN CASE, YOU KNOW, SHE
2 NEEDED TO TAKE FREQUENT BREAKS OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT.
3 BUT THAT'S NOT THE PROBLEM. HER PROBLEM IS THAT SHE
4 WORKS FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE, AND PART OF HER
5 JOBS ARE -- IS THAT CONVICTIONS?

6 LAW CLERK: COMMERCE.

7 THE COURT: IT'S COMMERCE? BUT SHE HAS TO DO IN
8 HOME VISITS WITH PEOPLE IN THAT AREA. IT IS COMMERCE.
9 AND FOR SOME REASON VISIT WITH INMATES' FAMILIES AND
10 THINGS LIKE THAT, AND SHE HAS TO DO A LOT OF IN HOME
11 INTERVIEWS. AND SHE DOESN'T HAVE ANYBODY WITH HER
12 WHEN SHE GOES FOR THE INTERVIEWS. AND IT IS IN THE
13 AREA AROUND WHERE THE PEOPLE INVOLVED IN THIS CASE
14 LIVE. AND HER CONCERN IS THAT WHEREAS SHE MIGHT NOT
15 REMEMBER THE FAMILY MEMBERS OR WHO THE WITNESSES WERE,
16 OR THINGS LIKE THAT, SHE'S CONCERNED THAT THEY WILL
17 REMEMBER HER. AND IT'S SOMETHING THAT HAS BOTHERED HER
18 ALL NIGHT, AND THAT'S JUST WHAT HER SITUATION IS RIGHT
19 NOW. I GET THE IMPRESSION FROM TALKING WITH HER THAT
20 IT IS A VERY LEGITIMATE CONCERN WITH HER, AND THAT IT
21 WILL HAVE SOME, YOU KNOW, -- THAT'S GOING TO BE
22 SOMETHING SHE'S GOING TO BE THINKING ABOUT WHILE SHE'S
23 TRYING TO MAKE A DETERMINATION AS TO WHAT TO DO IN
24 THIS CASE, WHEN THE CASE FINALLY GOES BACK TO THE
25 JURY. SO, WHAT I WANT TO KNOW FROM Y'ALL IS WHAT

1 Y'ALL, WHAT SUGGESTIONS Y'ALL HAVE.

2 MR. MELLARD: YOUR HONOR, HAS SHE EXPRESSED THESE
3 CONCERNS TO ANY OTHER MEMBERS OF THIS JURY?

4 THE COURT: I HAVE NOT ASKED HER THAT BUT I WILL
5 DOUBLE CHECK THAT. OKAY? BECAUSE THAT, THAT WOULD --
6 AND IF YOU WANT ME TO, DO Y'ALL WANT TO BRING HER OUT
7 HERE AND WE CAN ASK HER SOME QUESTIONS?

8 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

9 THE COURT: OKAY. IS THAT ALRIGHT WITH Y'ALL?

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YEAH, I THINK AS LONG AS
11 YOU'RE THE ONE ASKING THE QUESTIONS.

12 THE COURT: YEAH, OKAY. OKAY. WOULD YOU BRING
13 HER OUT?

14 (Whereupon, Juror Kia James
15 enters the courtroom.)

16 THE COURT: OH, COME ON OUT, MS. JAMES. I'M
17 GOING TO PUT YOU ON THE WITNESS STAND. AND I'M SORRY
18 TO DO THAT BUT, MS. JAMES, WOULD YOU MIND PUTTING YOUR
19 LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND,
20 PLEASE, MA'AM?

21 (Whereupon, Juror Kia James
22 is duly sworn.)

23 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
24 part of record has been omitted.)

EXAM, IN CAMERA, JUROR KIA JAMES BY THE COURT

463

EXAMINATION, IN CAMERA, OF JUROR KIA JAMES

BY THE COURT:

Q. ALRIGHT, AND MS. JAMES, WHAT I HAVE DONE IS, I HAVE EXPRESSED YOUR CONCERNS TO THE ATTORNEYS INVOLVED, AND I THINK I TOLD THEM CORRECTLY, AND I WANT YOU TO CORRECT ME IF I'VE MISSED IT.

A. OH, UH-HUH.

Q. AS PART OF YOUR DUTIES, AND YOU WORK FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE?

A. YES, S IR.

Q. BUT YOU DO IN HOME VISITS AND SOMETHING LIKE INMATE VISITS?

A. YES, I DO, AT CORRECTIONAL FACILITIES.

Q. AND I FORGOT TO ASK YOU WHY YOU DO THESE VISITS? I MEAN, I KNOW IT'S PART OF YOUR JOB BUT WHAT IS THE - - -

A. WELL, IT'S IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE CENSUS BUREAU, SO WE GATHER STATISTICAL DATA.

Q. OKAY. AND IT'S A PERMANENT JOB THAT YOU HAVE?

A. YES, IT IS.

Q. OKAY. AND BY DOING THESE -- AND YOU SAID YOU DO THESE IN HOME INTERVIEWS IN THE AREA AROUND WHERE THE WITNESSES AND THE DEFENDANTS LIVE?

A. AS A MATTER OF FACT, YOUR HONOR, EVERY STREET, ROAD NAME THAT YOU NAMED, I'VE HAD INTERVIEWS AT

EXAM. IN CAMERA, JUROR KIA JAMES BY THE COURT

464

1 THOSE PARTICULAR LOCATIONS.

2 Q. OKAY. AND YOU GO, AND NOBODY IS WITH YOU?

3 A. WE'RE NOT ALLOWED TO TAKE ANYONE WITH US.

4 Q. AND YOU DON'T HAVE ANY KIND OF PROTECTION WITH
5 YOU?

6 A. WE'RE NOT ALLOWED TO CARRY ANY PROTECTION.

7 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU'VE EXPRESSED TO ME THAT THIS IS
8 A CONCERN OF YOURS?

9 A. YES.

10 Q. THAT THEY'RE GOING TO REMEMBER YOU, AND YOU'RE
11 NOT GOING TO REMEMBER THEM?

12 A. EXACTLY.

13 Q. I FORGOT TO ASK YOU, HAVE YOU EXPRESSED ANY OF
14 YOUR CONCERNS TO ANY MEMBER OF THE JURY BACK
15 THERE?

16 A. NO, SIR, I HAVE NOT DISCUSSED ANYTHING ABOUT
17 THIS.

18 Q. SO, YOU HAVEN'T TALKED ABOUT ANYTHING WITH
19 ANYBODY?

20 A. NOT AT ALL.

21 Q. OKAY. JUST LIKE I DIRECTED?

22 A. EXACTLY.

23 Q. OKAY. GOOD, GOOD, I'M GLAD TO SEE Y'ALL -- IT'S
24 ALWAYS NICE TO KNOW THEY'RE FOLLOWING MY --
25 EVERYBODY'S FOLLOWING MY DIRECTIONS BACK THERE.

EXAM. IN CAMERA, JUROR KIA JAMES BY THE COURT

465

1 BUT NOW, BECAUSE YOU ARE NOW -- I KNOW WHEN WE
2 STARTED THE CASE YOU DIDN'T HAVE ANY IDEA OTHER
3 THAN THE CHARGES WERE AGAINST THESE FIVE YOUNG
4 MEN, BUT YOU DIDN'T KNOW WHO THEY WERE, YOU
5 DIDN'T KNOW WHERE THEY LIVED, YOU DIDN'T KNOW
6 ANYTHING ABOUT THEM?

7 A. NO, SIR.

8 Q. OKAY. NOW, THE FACT THAT YOU NOW KNOW SOMETHING
9 ABOUT THEM, AND YOU KNOW WHERE THEY LIVE, DO YOU
10 THINK THAT'S GOING TO AFFECT YOUR ABILITY TO
11 RENDER A FAIR AND IMPARTIAL VERDICT WHEN YOU'RE
12 BACK THERE MAKING A DETERMINATION?

13 A. ONLY INsofar AS MY PERSONAL SAFETY IN THE FUTURE
14 IS CONCERNED, AS FAR AS MAYBE FAMILY MEMBERS, ANY
15 TYPE OF RETRIBUTION, YOU KNOW, FROM THAT ANGLE,
16 BUT AS FAR AS MAKING THE DECISIONS THAT I
17 POSSIBLY HAVE TO MAKE, NO, I WOULDN'T HAVE A
18 PROBLEM WITH THAT.

19 Q. BUT YOU'RE STILL -- SO, YOU THINK, I MEAN, SO
20 YOU THINK YOU CAN STAY ON THE JURY?

21 A. UH.

22 Q. BUT YOU'RE TELLING ME YOU'D RATHER NOT BE ON THE
23 JURY?

24 COURT REPORTER: DOES THAT MEAN, YES?

25 A. I DON'T -- LET ME ...

EXAM. IN CAMERA, JUROR KIA JAMES BY THE COURT

466

1 Q. WELL, TO THIS QUESTION, DO YOU THINK YOU CAN STAY
2 ON THE JURY?

3 A. WELL, THAT'S WHAT I'M SAYING, I DIDN'T FINISH
4 HEARING YOUR QUESTION.

5 Q. YES, MA'AM. DO YOU THINK THE FACT THAT YOU'RE
6 WORRIED ABOUT ANY RETRIBUTION IN THE FUTURE OR
7 ANYTHING LIKE THAT, IS THAT GOING TO AFFECT THE
8 WAY YOU MAKE A DETERMINATION ON THIS?

9 A. NO, BUT I WILL BE SCARED IN THE FUTURE BECAUSE OF
10 WHAT I POSSIBLY MAY HAVE TO DO.

11 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT.

12 THE COURT: ANYTHING ELSE? DO Y'ALL WANT TO
13 EXCUSE HER AND THEN WE'LL TALK ABOUT IT AND I'LL BRING
14 HER BACK OUT HERE IF WE NEED TO?

15 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

16 THE COURT: OKAY. MS. JAMES, I'M GOING TO LET
17 YOU GO AND STEP BACK INTO MY OFFICE RIGHT NOW FOR JUST
18 A SECOND, IF YOU DON'T MIND.

19 (Whereupon, Juror Kia James
20 leaves the courtroom and the
21 following takes place out of
22 her presence.)

23 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD, DOES THAT - - -

24 MR. MELLARD: WELL, YOUR HONOR, I MEAN, IT'S
25 OBVIOUS THAT SHE'S ALREADY MADE UP HER MIND REGARDING

1 HOW SHE'S GOING TO VOTE IN THIS CASE. AND THE VERY
2 FACT THAT SHE'S EXPRESSING CONCERNS ABOUT RETRIBUTION
3 IS INDICATIVE THAT SHE'S ALREADY DISREGARDED YOUR
4 INSTRUCTIONS NOT TO MAKE UP HER MIND, AND HAS ALREADY
5 MADE UP HER MIND.

6 THE COURT: WELL, THAT COULD HAVE BEEN THE WAY I
7 PHRASED THE QUESTION, TOO, MORE THAN HER MAKING UP HER
8 MIND. BUT I DO APPRECIATE YOUR CONCERN ABOUT THAT.
9 BUT NOW, THE OPTION IS, IF Y'ALL ARE IN AGREEMENT AND
10 I LET HER GO, THEN THE NEXT QUESTION IS, IT LOOKS LIKE
11 THE FIRST ALTERNATE IS MR. LOVETTE. IS THAT -- SO,
12 THAT'S WHAT I'M TRYING TO FIND OUT FROM Y'ALL. DO
13 Y'ALL NEED -- WHAT'S THE STATE'S POSITION REGARDING
14 THIS?

15 SOLICITOR PASCOE: SHE'S A GOOD JUROR, I HATE TO
16 LOSE HER, BUT I'VE GOT TO BE HONEST, I - - -

17 THE COURT: I UNDERSTAND THAT, I MEAN, I THINK
18 SHE'S A GOOD JUROR, TOO, BUT I AM ALSO CONCERNED ABOUT
19 HER SITUATION.

20 SOLICITOR PASCOE: I AM, TOO. I DISAGREE WITH
21 MR. MELLARD JUST ON ONE THING. I DON'T NECESSARILY
22 THINK THAT SHE'S MADE UP HER MIND, BUT IT IS WITHOUT A
23 DOUBT, SHE, FROM HER HESITANCY AND HER ANSWERS TO
24 QUESTIONS, YOU CAN OBVIOUSLY TELL THAT SHE WOULD HAVE
25 A HARD TIME PUTTING THAT ASIDE IN TRYING TO RENDER A

1 VERDICT. SO, I WOULD AGREE WITH MR. MELLARD THAT SHE
2 PROBABLY NEEDS TO BE EXCUSED, THAT SHE DOES NEED TO BE
3 EXCUSED.

4 THE COURT: OKAY. NOW, IF SHE IS GOING TO BE
5 EXCUSED, ARE YOU, IS IT YOUR POSITION THAT MR. LOVETTE
6 IS THE NEXT PERSON?

7 SOLICITOR PASCOE: LET ME CHECK TO MAKE SURE HE'S
8 NEXT ON THE LIST, YOUR HONOR.

9 THE COURT: WAYNE P. LOVETTE.

10 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR, HE'S THE FIRST
11 ALTERNATE.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, MR. LACKEY, WHAT'S
13 YOUR POSITION?

14 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME I WOULD
15 HAVE NO OBJECTION TO HER BEING EXCUSED.

16 THE COURT: MS. ULLMAN OR MR. WISE, WHO WANTS TO
17 RESPOND? MS. ULLMAN, YOU'VE BEEN POINTED TO BY MR.
18 WISE.

19 MS. ULLMAN: I WOULD ACTUALLY ASK YOUR HONOR TO
20 LET ALL OF US TALK FOR A MOMENT, BECAUSE WE PICKED
21 THIS JURY TOGETHER AND WE NEED TO DISCUSS IT.

22 THE COURT: I'LL BE GLAD TO LET Y'ALL TALK FOR A
23 MINUTE, AND I'LL STEP INTO THAT ROOM AND I'LL LET
24 Y'ALL TALK. OKAY?

25 MS. ULLMAN: THANK YOU.

1 (Whereupon, the Judge steps
2 out of the courtroom, after
3 which the Judge returns to
4 the courtroom.)

5 THE COURT: MS. HARRY DOT, ARE YOU READY?

6 COURT REPORTER: I'M READY.

7 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, MS. ULLMAN, WE TOOK A
8 BREAK SO THAT Y'ALL COULD DISCUSS THIS SITUATION.

9 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

10 THE COURT: AND WHAT HAVE Y'ALL -- I'M ASSUMING,
11 SINCE SHE MENTIONED IT, YOU ARE THE LEADER OF THE
12 PACK.

13 MS. ULLMAN: WE AGREE THAT SHE SHOULD BE EXCUSED,
14 BUT WE ALSO WOULD ASK THE COURT TO BASICALLY PUT BOTH
15 OF THE ALTERNATES BACK INTO THE HOPPER TODAY AND PICK
16 ~~MR.~~ MR. MELLARD AND MR. KOGER BOTH HAVE BEEN IN COURTS
17 WHERE THAT HAS HAPPENED WHEN AN ISSUE OF THE ALTERNATE
18 CAME UP, THERE WAS MORE OF A CHOICE THAN JUST THE
19 FIRST PERSON PICKED OUT.

20 THE COURT: AND IN THE BACK OF MY MIND, I THINK
21 THAT'S WHAT WE DO IN A CRIMINAL CASE, BUT I WAS GOING
22 TO CHECK THE LAW ON THAT. BUT WHAT IS YOUR POSITION
23 WITH THAT?

24 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, SIR. WE -- SINCE WE'VE
25 BEEN DOING IT, PICKING JURIES THIS WAY, THE CLERK'S

1 COME UP WITH A LIST, YOU GO BY THE NUMBER. I KNOW,
2 LIKE IN DEATH PENALTY CASES JURIES ARE DONE, I IMAGINE
3 IF THAT'S WHAT YOU DO IN A DEATH PENALTY CASE THAT'S
4 THE WAY YOU DO IT IN EVERY CASE, YOU GO BY THE NUMBER.
5 THEY'VE ALREADY COME UP WITH A NUMBER, ORDER IN WHICH
6 THEY COME IN, AND THAT'S WHAT YOU GO BY. I WOULD ADD
7 THAT EVEN BACK WHEN THEY USED TO USE THE HOPPER, WHICH
8 THEY DON'T USE ANYMORE - - -

9 THE COURT: WAIT A MINUTE. OKAY, RULE FORTY-
10 SEVEN SAYS, ALTERNATE JURORS IN THE ORDER IN WHICH
11 THEY'RE CALLED SHALL REPLACE THE JURORS WHO PRIOR TO
12 THE TIME -- AND I'LL CHECK TO SEE IF IT'S ANY
13 DIFFERENT FOR CRIMINAL. AND I APPRECIATE Y'ALL'S
14 REQUEST. I'M GOING TO GO ALONG WITH THE ORDER IN
15 WHICH THEY WERE PICKED, AND I WILL NOTE YOUR OBJECTION
16 TO THAT, NOT PUTTING THEM IN THE HOPPER. I THINK
17 THAT'S -- MR. MELLARD, AND MR. KOGER, Y'ALL WANTED ME
18 TO PUT THEM BACK IN THE HOPPER?

19 MR. KOGER: YES, YOUR HONOR, AND JUST TO NOTE FOR
20 THE COURT, YOU READ THE PARTICULAR RULE, BUT AS RECENT
21 AS AUGUST OF THIS YEAR, WHEN THEY HAD A JURY TRIAL
22 OVER IN BARNWELL, THE COURT USED A CIGAR BOX, WHEN THE
23 ISSUE CAME UP THEY PUT THEM BACK IN THE CIGAR BOX AND
24 PICKED THEM OUT IN ORDER.

25 THE COURT: AND I UNDERSTAND, WITH THE CIGAR BOX,

471

1 YOU KNOW. I WOULD HAVE DONE THE SAME THING. AND IT'S
2 SOMETHING IN THE BACK OF MY MIND THAT REMINDS ME OF
3 DOING THAT WITH THE CIGAR BOX SITUATION, BUT I THINK
4 WITH THE COMPUTER SITUATION I'M GOING TO GO ALONG WITH
5 THE WAY, WITH RULE FORTY-SEVEN, AND I'LL NOTE YOUR
6 OBJECTION TO ME DOING IT IN THAT MANNER. OKAY.

7 NOW, WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS, I'M GOING TO LET
8 MS. JAMES GO, AND WE WILL MOVE MR. LOVETTE INTO HER
9 SEAT. OKAY?

10 ANYTHING ELSE BEFORE WE BRING THE JURY OUT?

11 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, YOUR HONOR.

12 THE COURT: ANYTHING ELSE FROM ANY OF THE
13 DEFENDANTS?

14 MR. LACKEY: NO, YOUR HONOR.

15 MS. ULLMAN: NO, SIR.

16 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

17 MR. MELLARD: NO, YOUR HONOR.

18 MR. KOGER: NO, SIR.

19 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. DOES SHE NEED TO TURN OVER
20 ANYTHING TO OR -- OKAY. ALRIGHT.

21 MS. WALKER, THESE ARE MY NOTES, WHICH ARE NOT
22 VERY GOOD, BUT IF YOU'D MAKE THAT COURT'S NUMBER ONE
23 SO WE'LL REMEMBER HOW WE GOT PAST THAT HERE.

24 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

25 (Court's Exhibit One

1 marked and filed.)

2 THE COURT: I'M GOING TO ADVISE THE COURT THAT
3 THE JUROR LEFT DUE TO SOME PERSONAL ISSUES. IS THAT
4 ALRIGHT WITH THE STATE?

5 SOLICITOR PASCOE: YES, SIR.

6 THE COURT: IS THAT ALRIGHT WITH THE DEFENDANTS?

7 MR. LACKEY: YES, SIR.

8 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR.

9 MR. PALMER: YES, SIR.

10 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

11 MR. KOGER: YES, SIR.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. ANYBODY THAT WANTED TO BE IN
13 THE AUDIENCE, ARE THEY READY TO COME BACK IN? THEY
14 CAN COME ON BACK IN BEFORE I GET THE JURY IN, I DON'T
15 WANT THEM WALKING IN ONCE THE JURY GETS HERE.

16 ALRIGHT, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, WE'RE GETTING
17 READY TO GET STARTED ON THIS TRIAL AGAIN TODAY. LET
18 ME REMIND YOU THAT THERE IS GOING TO BE NO TALKING,
19 NO PASSING OF NOTES BACK THERE. OKAY. NOBODY IS
20 GOING TO MAKE ANY NOISE, NOBODY IS GOING TO MAKE ANY
21 COMMENTS, NOBODY IS GOING TO ROLL THEIR EYES OR
22 ANYTHING LIKE THAT WHILE THE WITNESSES ARE TESTIFYING.
23 IF ANYBODY MISUNDERSTANDS OR DOES NOT BELIEVE THAT
24 THEY CAN COMPLY WITH WHAT I'VE JUST TOLD YOU, YOU WILL
25 NEED TO LEAVE NOW, OKAY. NOW, IF ANYBODY DOESN'T

1 COMPLY YOU WILL BE ESCORTED OUT OF THE COURTROOM
2 IMMEDIATELY, AND BROUGHT BACK BEFORE ME SO THAT WE CAN
3 DISCUSS THIS MATTER AT THE END OF THE DAY, BECAUSE YOU
4 HAVE NOW BEEN TOLD. EVERYBODY, I WANT TO MAKE SURE
5 THAT EVERYBODY UNDERSTANDS THAT. LET ME SEE YOU
6 SHAKING YOUR HEADS, EVERYBODY. OKAY. THANK YOU.

7 ALRIGHT, ANYTHING ELSE FROM THE DEFENDANTS BEFORE
8 I BRING THE JURY OUT?

9 MR. PALMER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

10 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU.

11 ANYTHING FROM THE STATE BEFORE I BRING THE JURY
12 OUT?

13 SOLICITOR PASCOE: NO, SIR, YOUR HONOR.

14 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, IF YOU'LL GO AHEAD
15 AND BRING THE JURY OUT, PLEASE.

16 AND MS. JACKSON, IF YOU'D GET MR. LOVETTE TO SIT
17 WITH THE JURY.

18 (Whereupon, the jury enters
19 the courtroom and the following
20 takes place in the presence
21 of the jury.)

22 THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, I HOPE Y'ALL
23 HAD A GOOD EVENING. I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT NOBODY
24 ON THE JURY PANEL READ ANYTHING IN THE PAPER, SAW
25 ANYTHING ON THE T.V. OR ON THE INTERNET, OR HEARD

1 ANYTHING ON THE RADIO ABOUT THIS TRIAL? IF YOU DID I
2 NEED FOR YOU TO RAISE YOUR HAND. OKAY. NOBODY IS
3 RAISING THEIR HAND. OKAY. HAS ANYBODY TRIED TO
4 CONTACT ANY OF Y'ALL TO DISCUSS THIS CASE AWAY FROM
5 THE COURTHOUSE? OKAY, IF SO, I NEED FOR YOU TO RAISE
6 YOUR HAND. OKAY, NO ONE IS RAISING THEIR HAND.

7 ALRIGHT, NOW, Y'ALL WILL NOTICE, MS. JAMES IS NOT
8 PRESENT. SHE HAD TO TALK WITH ME, SHE HAD SOME
9 PERSONAL ISSUES SO I HAD TO EXCUSE HER FROM THE JURY
10 TRIAL, AND MR. LOVETTE, THAT MEANS, CONGRATULATIONS,
11 YOU ARE NOW A MEMBER OF THE JURY PANEL. OKAY? THANK
12 YOU, SIR. I KNOW YOU'VE BEEN PAYING ATTENTION FROM
13 THE BACK ROW, AND SO, YOU ARE READY TO STEP IN AS A
14 JUROR. OKAY?

15 ALRIGHT, I THINK WE'RE READY TO BEGIN.

16 MR. PASCOE, DO YOU WANT TO CALL YOUR NEXT ---

17 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

18 THE COURT: --- OR MR. SORENSON, WHO'S ---

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THAT WOULD BE ME.

20 THE COURT: OKAY. MR. SORENSON.

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THE STATE CALLS LIEUTENANT
22 GERALD CARTER.

23 THE COURT: OKAY.

24 CLERK: SIR, PLACE YOUR LEFT HAND ON THE BIBLE
25 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT.

1 (Whereupon, Gerald David Carter
2 is duly sworn.)

3 CLERK: HAVE A SEAT, AND STATE YOUR FULL NAME FOR
4 THE COURT.

5 WITNESS: GERALD DAVID CARTER.

6 (NOTE: Blank lines on this page do not indicate any
7 part of record has been omitted. Headers on testimony
8 pages and hard page breaks between testimony are now
9 required by the Court. See next ensuing page for
10 sequential continuation of record.)

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

476

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GERALD DAVID CARTER

BY SOLICITOR SORENSON:

Q. LIEUTENANT CARTER, IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY
WHERE YOU ARE EMPLOYED?

A. I'M EMPLOYED AT THE ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S
OFFICE.

Q. OKAY. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN WITH THE
SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

A. EIGHTEEN YEARS THIS MARCH COMING.

Q. ALRIGHT. AND IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY WHAT
YOUR CURRENT DUTIES ARE WITH THE SHERIFF'S
OFFICE?

A. I HOLD THE RANK OF LIEUTENANT AND I RUN CRIME
SCENE OPERATIONS FOR ORANGEBURG COUNTY SHERIFF'S
OFFICE.

Q. AND HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN EMPLOYED IN THAT
CAPACITY THERE?

A. APPROXIMATELY SIX YEARS.

Q. OKAY. IF YOU WOULD, TELL THE JURY JUST KIND OF
BRIEFLY YOUR TRAINING THAT YOU'VE HAD WITH
REGARDS TO OUR CURRENT DUTIES?

A. WELL, FORMAL TRAINING, I'VE HAD AROUND A THOUSAND
HOURS OF FORMAL TRAINING WHICH INCLUDES FOUR
HUNDRED HOURS OF TRAINING AT THE NATIONAL
FORENSIC ACADEMY WHICH I ATTENDED LAST SUMMER,

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

477

1 AND I GRADUATED FROM THERE. I'M A CERTIFIED
2 CRIME SCENE INVESTIGATOR, CERTIFIED THROUGH THE
3 INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION FOR IDENTIFICATION.
4 I'VE HAD NUMEROUS CLASSES ON RECONSTRUCTION OF
5 CRIME SCENES, BLOOD STAIN ANALYSIS, PROCESSING OF
6 CRIME SCENES AT VARIOUS COLLEGES AND SCHOOLS
7 AROUND THE COUNTRY.

8 Q. OKAY. AND DO PART OF YOUR DUTIES ALSO INVOLVE
9 NOT ONLY COLLECTING LATENT FINGERPRINTS AT CRIME
10 SCENES BUT ALSO COMPARING THEM TO KNOWN STANDARDS
11 OF PEOPLE ALSO?

12 A. YES, SIR, I'M A TRAINED PRINT EXAMINER.

13 Q. OKAY. AND HOW MANY OVER -- YOU SAID YOU HAD BEEN
14 EMPLOYED IN YOUR CURRENT CAPACITY FOR ABOUT SIX
15 YEARS, IS THAT CORRECT?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. BEFORE THAT, THE TWELVE YEARS BEFORE THAT WHAT
18 WERE YOUR DUTIES THOSE TWELVE YEARS INITIALLY
19 WITH THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE?

20 A. THE THREE, THREE AND A HALF YEARS PRIOR TO GOING
21 INTO THE CRIME SCENE UNIT I WAS A CRIMINAL
22 INVESTIGATOR FOR ORANGEBURG COUNTY. THE LAST
23 YEAR THERE I WAS IN VIOLENT CRIMES, PRIMARILY
24 ASSAULTS AND HOMICIDES. PRIOR TO GOING INTO
25 INVESTIGATIONS I WORKED PATROL, I HAD PATROL

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

478

1 DUTIES FOR MY FIRST EIGHT YEARS. THE LAST FOUR
2 YEARS OF THAT I WAS IN A SUPERVISORY CAPACITY AND
3 WAS A LIEUTENANT FOR PATROL WHEN I TRANSFERRED TO
4 INVESTIGATIONS.

5 Q. AND YOUR CURRENT DUTIES NOW, I GUESS YOU
6 TYPICALLY RESPOND TO CRIME SCENES AND PROCESS
7 THEM FOR ANY EVIDENCE THAT MAY BE THERE?

8 A. YES, SIR, THAT'S MY PRIMARY RESPONSIBILITY NOW,
9 IS TO RESPOND TO AND PROCESS CRIME SCENES FOR ANY
10 EVIDENCE THAT MIGHT BE AT THE SCENE.

11 Q. DO YOU HAVE ANY IDEA OVER THE LAST SIX YEARS AS A
12 CRIME INVESTIGATOR HOW MANY CRIME SCENES YOU'VE
13 RESPONDED TO AND PROCESSED?

14 A. ACTUAL CRIME SCENES WOULD BE A COUPLE HUNDRED AT
15 LEAST. I HAVE PROCESSED EIGHTY DEATH SCENES. OF
16 THE EIGHTY, THIRTY-EIGHT WERE HOMICIDES.

17 Q. AND HAVE YOU HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO COME AND
18 TESTIFY IN COURT BEFORE ABOUT YOUR FINDINGS OF
19 THOSE CRIME SCENES?

20 A. YES, SIR, I HAVE.

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME
22 WE'D OFFER LIEUTENANT CARTER AS AN EXPERT IN THE FIELD
23 OF CRIME SCENE PROCESSING.

24 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. ANYTHING FROM THE
25 DEFENDANTS?

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

479

1 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

2 THE COURT: MS. ULLMAN?

3 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

4 MR. PALMER: WE'LL STIPULATE HE'S QUALIFIED, YOUR
5 HONOR.

6 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

7 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

8 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, HE IS SO QUALIFIED AS A
9 CRIME SCENE - - -

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: PROCESSING, OR CRIME SCENE
11 INVESTIGATOR.

12 THE COURT: --- CRIME SCENE INVESTIGATOR. OKAY.
13 THANK YOU.

14 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

15 Q. NOW, LIEUTENANT CARTER, I WANT TO TURN YOUR
16 ATTENTION BACK TO THE NIGHT OF MARCH THE TWELFTH
17 OF THIS YEAR. DID YOU HAVE AN OCCASION TO
18 RESPOND OUT TO A HOMICIDE AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE
19 KINGS ROAD HERE IN ORANGEBURG?

20 A. YES, SIR, I DID.

21 Q. OKAY. AND WOULD YOU DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHAT,
22 I MEAN, WHAT'S LOCATED AT SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS
23 ROAD?

24 A. SIX THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD IS A SET OF
25 APARTMENTS. THE INCIDENT OCCURRED IN ONE OF THE

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

480

1 APARTMENTS, SIX THIRTY-FIVE.

2 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SIX,
3 LIEUTENANT, DOES THAT DEPICT THE LOCATION OF SIX
4 THIRTY-FIVE KINGS ROAD, THE APARTMENT THAT YOU
5 RESPONDED TO THAT NIGHT?

6 A. YES, SIR, IT DOES.

7 Q. OKAY. IF YOU WOULD, POINT OUT TO THE JURY WHERE
8 THAT APARTMENT IS LOCATED?

9 A. MAY I STEP DOWN?

10 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, CAN HE STEP
11 DOWN?

12 THE COURT: YOU MAY STEP DOWN.

13 A. THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. THIS WOULD BE A
14 PHOTOGRAPH OF THE APARTMENT I PROCESSED THAT
15 NIGHT. THE INCIDENT ACTUALLY OCCURRED, IT'S TWO
16 DOORS, THE ONE ALL THE WAY AT THE END, THAT'S SIX
17 THIRTY-FIVE, AND THAT'S WHERE THE INCIDENT
18 OCCURRED.

19 COURT REPORTER: SOLICITOR, WOULD YOU TURN THAT
20 MIKE TOWARD THE JURY, PLEASE, SIR?

21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: HE'S GOING TO SIT BACK DOWN
22 IN JUST A MINUTE.

23 COURT REPORTER: BUT THIS ONE -- ALRIGHT, THANK
24 YOU.

25 Q. ALRIGHT, LIEUTENANT, NOW, IF YOU WOULD, WHEN YOU

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

481

1 GOT THERE THAT NIGHT, WOULD YOU KIND OF DESCRIBE
2 FOR THE JURY WHAT THE CONDITION OF THE SCENE WAS
3 WHEN YOU ARRIVED THAT NIGHT?
4 A. THERE WERE NUMEROUS EMERGENCY RESPONSE UNITS IN
5 THE PARKING LOT. I WAS BRIEF BY OFFICER
6 WESTBERRY AS TO, AS ONE OF THE FIRST RESPONDING
7 OFFICERS, AS TO WHAT THEY RESPONDED TO. AS I
8 ENTERED THE APARTMENT, IF YOU WOULD, THE CRIME
9 SCENE ITSELF, IT WAS DIMLY LIT, THERE WAS A BLACK
10 LIGHT IN THE CEILING FAN IN THE LIVING ROOM. AS
11 YOU GO THROUGH THE FRONT DOOR YOU GO INTO THE DEN
12 OR LIVING ROOM AREA. YOU COULD STILL SEE. THE
13 VICTIM WAS IN FRONT OF THE DOOR ACROSS THE ROOM
14 LYING FACE UP. WITH A FLASH LIGHT INITIALLY I
15 COULD SEE THERE WERE NUMEROUS SHELL CASINGS AND
16 OTHER EVIDENCE. I HAD ANOTHER INVESTIGATOR WHO
17 BASICALLY STOOD BY TO HELP ME AS MUCH AS HE
18 COULD. WE FOUND A REGULAR LIGHT BULB TO PLACE
19 INTO THE CEILING LIGHT SO WE COULD SEE BETTER.
20 THEN IT BECAME MORE APPARENT THE NUMEROUS NUMBER
21 OF SHELL CASINGS THAT WERE ON THE FLOOR AND OTHER
22 EVIDENCE THAT YOU COULD SEE READILY. AS I
23 CHECKED THE REST OF THE APARTMENT THERE WERE
24 OTHER ITEMS OF EVIDENCE IN THE KITCHEN AREA THAT
25 MAY OR MAY NOT HAVE BEEN RELATED TO THE, THE

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

482

1 SHOOTING ITSELF BUT ITEMS THAT I NEEDED TO
2 DOCUMENT. THERE WAS A DOG IN THE KITCHEN. HE WAS
3 ATTACHED TO A CEMENT BLOCK IN THE KITCHEN AREA.
4 AS I SURVEYED THE REST OF THE RESIDENCE THERE WAS
5 A BATHROOM AREA AND TWO BEDROOM AREAS. IN
6 PARTICULAR, THE SHOOTING INCIDENT ITSELF, I
7 DIDN'T FIND ANY EVIDENCE IN THESE ROOMS, THE BATH
8 ROOM OR THE BEDROOMS THAT SEEMED TO PERTAIN TO
9 THE SHOOTING ITSELF.

10 Q. OKAY. NOW, LET ME ASK YOU, DID YOU HAVE AN
11 OPPORTUNITY TO -- HOW MANY DOORWAYS INTO THE
12 APARTMENT WERE THERE?

13 A. ACTUALLY, INTO THE APARTMENT THERE'S TWO, IT'S A
14 FRONT DOOR AND A BACK DOOR. THE FRONT DOOR
15 ENTERED INTO THE DEN OR LIVING ROOM AREA WHERE
16 THE VICTIM WAS LYING ON THE FLOOR.

17 Q. AND THEN, THE BACK DOOR?

18 A. INTO THE KITCHEN AREA.

19 Q. OKAY. AND WERE YOU ABLE TO DETERMINE WHETHER
20 THERE WAS ANY FORCED ENTRY INTO EITHER OF THOSE
21 DOORWAYS?

22 A. NO, SIR, THERE DIDN'T APPEAR TO BE ANY FORCED
23 ENTRY TO THE FRONT DOOR, AND THAT WAS THE DOOR
24 THAT I ENTERED. THE BACK DOOR WAS LOCKED AND
25 SEALED AND THERE WAS NO DAMAGE TO IT.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

483

1 Q. ALRIGHT. NOW, WHAT -- AT THAT POINT IN TIME, AT
2 FIRST YOU KIND OF DID YOUR INITIAL WALK THROUGH
3 AND JUST, I GUESS, KIND OF EVALUATING WHAT ITEMS
4 OF EVIDENCE MAY BE IN THE HOUSE, IS THAT CORRECT?

5 A. YES, SIR.

6 Q. OKAY. WHAT, WHAT DID YOU THEN DO AFTER YOU DID
7 THAT KIND OF INITIAL WALK THROUGH, HOW DID YOU
8 THEN GO ABOUT PROCESSING THE SCENE?

9 A. ONCE I COMPLETED THE INITIAL WALK THROUGH SO I
10 COULD KIND OF SEE WHAT I WAS DEALING WITH, THEN I
11 PHOTOGRAPHED THE ENTIRE SCENE, TAKING WHAT WE
12 CALL GENERAL PHOTOS WITHOUT TOUCHING ANYTHING,
13 JUST AS I FOUND IT.

14 Q. OKAY. AND AFTER YOU TOOK THOSE KIND OF INITIAL,
15 GENERAL PHOTOGRAPHS OF THE SCENE WHAT WAS THE
16 NEXT STEP YOU TOOK?

17 A. THE NEXT STEP WOULD BE TO ACTUALLY MARK THE
18 EVIDENCE THAT I FOUND AT THAT POINT WITH PLASTIC,
19 WITH YOUR TYPICAL PLASTIC MARKERS THAT ARE
20 NUMBERED, AND I WOULD GO THROUGH AND TRY TO
21 CHRONOLOGICALLY, AS I WALKED THROUGH THE ROOM,
22 MARK THE EVIDENCE. AND ONCE IT'S ALL MARKED THEN
23 I WOULD PHOTOGRAPH EVERYTHING AGAIN.

24 Q. AND DID YOU DO THAT IN THIS CASE?

25 A. YES, SIR, I DID.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

484

- 1 Q. OKAY. AND AFTER THOSE ITEMS WERE THEN
2 PHOTOGRAPHED WITH THE YELLOW MARKERS, WHAT THEN
3 WOULD YOU HAVE DONE?
- 4 A. ONCE I'VE MARKED THEM, DOCUMENTED THEM, SOME
5 MEASUREMENTS WOULD BE TAKEN, BECAUSE THE SCENE
6 WOULD ALSO BE DOCUMENTED BY A SKETCH. ONCE I
7 DOCUMENTED THE SCENE AS WE FOUND IT THE NEXT STEP
8 WOULD BE COLLECTION.
- 9 Q. OKAY. AND THAT WAS DONE IN THIS CASE?
- 10 A. YES, SIR, IT WAS.
- 11 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND DURING ALL OF THIS WAS MR.
12 PRINGLE, WAS HE STILL ON THE SCENE, HIS BODY?
- 13 A. YES, SIR.
- 14 Q. OKAY. AND ULTIMATELY, WHEN YOU WERE DONE
15 COLLECTING ALL OF THE EVIDENCE WAS HE THEN
16 REMOVED FROM THE SCENE?
- 17 A. ACTUALLY, WHAT WE DID IN THIS CASE, BECAUSE IT
18 WAS SO MUCH EVIDENCE, I COLLECTED ALL OF THE
19 EVIDENCE THAT WOULD BE DISTURBED BY TRANSPORTING
20 HIS BODY. SO THERE ACTUALLY WAS SOME EVIDENCE
21 LEFT TO BE COLLECTED WHEN I INFORMED THE CORONER
22 THAT THEY COULD MOVE THE BODY AND TRANSPORT HIM.
- 23 Q. ALRIGHT. AND I'M GOING TO KIND OF GO AND TALK IN
24 A FEW MINUTES ABOUT THAT EVIDENCE MORE
25 SPECIFICALLY. LET ME ASK YOU THIS, DID YOU HAVE

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

485

1 AN OPPORTUNITY TO PROCESS ANY OF THE SCENE OUT
2 THERE IN THE APARTMENT LOOKING FOR ANY
3 FINGERPRINTS?

4 A. YES, SIR, I DID. BASED ON THE, WHAT I FOUND AT
5 THE SCENE, ALL, OR MOST OF THE EVIDENCE WAS IN
6 THE LIVING ROOM. I PROCESSED THE LIVING ROOM AREA
7 SPECIFICALLY THE FRONT DOOR WHERE IT APPEARED
8 EVERYBODY WHO CAME IN ENTERED OR LEFT THROUGH THE
9 FRONT DOOR FOR FINGERPRINTS.

10 Q. OKAY. AND DID YOU HAVE ANY SPECIFIC INFORMATION
11 ABOUT ANYTHING ELSE THAT SOMEBODY HAD
12 SPECIFICALLY TOUCHED INSIDE THE RESIDENCE?

13 A. NO, SIR, NOT THAT I CAN RECALL. THERE WAS -- THE
14 INFORMATION I GOT FROM INVESTIGATORS DID NOT
15 SPECIFY ANYWHERE ELSE IN THE HOUSE THAT ANY
16 SUSPECTS HAD GONE TO.

17 Q. OKAY. AND IN PROCESSING THAT FRONT DOOR AREA
18 WERE YOU ABLE TO RETRIEVE ANY USEABLE LATENT
19 PRINTS OFF OF THAT DOOR AREA?

20 A. NO, SIR, NOT IN THIS CASE.

21 Q. OKAY. AND EXPLAIN TO THE JURY, I MEAN, IS THAT,
22 I MEAN, IN YOUR EXPERIENCE, IN YOUR SIX YEARS
23 EXPERIENCE, I MEAN, IS THAT COMMON, UNCOMMON?

24 A. IT'S ACTUALLY FAIRLY COMMON. THERE'S A
25 MISCONCEPTION THAT IF YOU TOUCH SOMETHING THERE'S

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

486

1 GOING TO BE FINGERPRINTS. THAT'S A
2 MISCONCEPTION. FINGERPRINTS ARE BASICALLY
3 IMPRESSIONS LEFT FROM RESIDUE ON YOUR FINGERS.
4 OBVIOUSLY, IF YOU'RE WEARING GLOVES YOU'RE NOT
5 GOING TO LEAVE A PRINT. IF YOU DON'T HAVE
6 SUFFICIENT RESIDUE ON YOUR FINGERS TO LEAVE AN
7 IMPRESSION IT'S NOT GOING TO LEAVE A FINGERPRINT,
8 AT LEAST NOT AN IDENTIFIABLE ONE. IF YOU HAVE
9 TOO MUCH RESIDUE OF ANY KIND, ANYTHING -- IT'S
10 AGAIN AN IDENTIFIABLE PRINT MAY NOT BE LEFT.
11 THERE'S A LOT OF REASONS WHY YOU MIGHT NOT FIND A
12 PRINT, WHICH WOULD INCLUDE WHAT I'VE JUST
13 DESCRIBED AS WELL AS THE SURFACE, THE TEXTURE, IS
14 IT ROUGH, IS IT SMOOTH, AND PRINTS, YOU KNOW, CAN
15 BE WIPED OFF, THEY'RE FRAGILE, YOU HAVE TO BE
16 CAREFUL WITH THAT KIND OF EVIDENCE. AND ONCE IT'S
17 PLACED ON AN OBJECT IT'S NOT PERMANENT, NORMALLY.

18 Q. SO, IF SOMEBODY HAD TOUCHED, LET'S SAY, A DOOR
19 HANDLE OR A DOOR KNOB AND SOMEBODY ELSE CAME
20 ALONG AFTER THEM AND TOUCHED THE DOOR KNOB WOULD
21 THAT POTENTIALLY DISTURB A PRINT?

22 A. IT IS POSSIBLE THAT SOMEBODY ELSE ENTERING OR
23 EXITING, EVEN OFFICERS WHO HAVE TO CLEAR A
24 RESIDENCE TO MAKE IT SAFE MAY INADVERTENTLY, THEY
25 COULD INADVERTENTLY, YOU KNOW, WIPE A PRINT OFF A

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

487

1 DOOR KNOB OR SOMETHING. IT'S POSSIBLE.

2 Q. NOW, YOU HAD INDICATED THAT PART OF YOUR DUTIES
3 ALSO OUT THERE IN PROCESSING AND DOCUMENTING THE
4 CRIME SCENE WOULD HAVE BEEN TO PREPARE A KIND OF
5 A SKETCH OF THE CRIME SCENE, IS THAT CORRECT?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. AND WAS THAT DONE IN THIS CASE?

8 A. YES, SIR, IT WAS.

9 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY-
10 FOUR. IS THAT AN ENLARGEMENT OF ONE OF THE
11 SKETCHES THAT YOU PREPARED IN THIS CASE?

12 A. YES, SIR, THAT IS THE, THAT IS A SKETCH I
13 PREPARED.

14 Q. AND WOULD THIS AID YOU IN KIND OF EXPLAINING TO
15 THE JURY WHERE KIND OF NOT ONLY THE LAYOUT OF THE
16 APARTMENT BUT ALSO WHERE ITEMS OF EVIDENCE WERE
17 FOUND WITHIN THE APARTMENT?

18 A. YES, IT WOULD.

19 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME
20 WE'D OFFER STATE'S THIRTY-FOUR INTO EVIDENCE.

21 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

22 COURT REPORTER: THIRTY-FOUR?

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THIRTY-FOUR.

24 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

25 MR. PALMER: NONE FROM US, YOUR HONOR.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

488

1 MR. LACKEY: NO OBJECTION.

2 MS. ULLMAN: NO OBJECTION.

3 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

4 MR. KOGER: NO OBJECTION.

5 THE COURT: ALRIGHT, STATE'S THIRTY-FOUR ENTERED
6 WITHOUT OBJECTION.

7 (State's Exhibit Thirty-four
8 marked and filed.)

9 Q. ALRIGHT, LIEUTENANT, BEFORE I GET YOU TO STEP
10 DOWN I WANT TO LET YOU, I'M HANDING YOU STACK THE
11 PHOTOGRAPHS TO REVIEW, STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBERS
12 EIGHT THROUGH TWENTY-SEVEN. SOME OF THEM ARE
13 ALREADY IN EVIDENCE, BUT SOME OF THEM AREN'T. IF
14 YOU COULD JUST KIND OF FLIP THROUGH THEM REAL
15 QUICK.

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 Q. ARE THESE ALL PHOTOS, LIEUTENANT CARTER, THAT YOU
18 TOOK OUT THERE AT THE SCENE THAT NIGHT?

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. AND IT WOULD ACTUALLY BE ITEMS SEVEN THROUGH
21 TWENTY-SEVEN. AND DO THEY FAIRLY AND ACCURATELY
22 DEPICT THE SCENE AS YOU FOUND IT WHEN YOU ARRIVED
23 ON THE SCENE THAT NIGHT?

24 A. YES, SIR, THEY DO.

25 Q. AND SOME OF THEM ALSO AFTER YOU THEN PLACED THE

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

489

1 MARKERS AS YOU DESCRIBED EARLIER?

2 A. YES, SIR.

3 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, AT THIS TIME
4 WE'D OFFER -- SOME OF THESE ARE IN EVIDENCE, BUT
5 BASICALLY, WE WOULD OFFER STATE'S SEVEN THROUGH
6 TWENTY-SEVEN INTO EVIDENCE.

7 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU, SIR. ALRIGHT, ANY
8 OBJECTION FROM ANY OF THE DEFENDANTS?

9 MR. LACKEY: YOUR HONOR, WE HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO
10 TAKE A LOOK AT THOSE YESTERDAY AT THE END OF THE DAY I
11 HAVE NO OBJECTION ON BEHALF OF MY CLIENT.

12 THE COURT: OKAY. AND MS. ULLMAN, I NOTE YOUR
13 OBJECTION FROM YESTERDAY THAT I RULED ON.

14 MS. ULLMAN: YES, SIR, I WAS JUST GOING TO SAY I
15 RENEW MY OBJECTION.

16 THE COURT: ALRIGHT. THAT IS SO NOTED IN THE
17 RECORD.

18 MR. PALMER: I'VE SEEN THEM, JUDGE, I'VE GOT NO
19 OBJECTION.

20 THE COURT: MR. MELLARD?

21 MR. MELLARD: NO OBJECTION.

22 THE COURT: AND MR. KOGER?

23 MR. KOGER: I'VE REVIEWED THEM, YOUR HONOR, AND I
24 HAVE NO OBJECTION.

25 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT, THEY ARE ALL INTO

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

490

EVIDENCE, SEVEN THROUGH TWENTY-SEVEN.

SOLICITOR SORENSON: IT LOOKS LIKE THIRTEEN
THROUGH TWENTY-SIX ARE THE ONES THAT WERE NOT - - -

THE COURT: CORRECT.

SOLICITOR SORENSON: --- PREVIOUSLY, SO I'M GOING
TO CROSS THE ID OFF OF THOSE REAL QUICK.

THE COURT: OKAY.

COURT REPORTER: THIRTEEN THROUGH WHAT?

SOLICITOR SORENSON: TWENTY-SIX.

COURT REPORTER: STATES'S THIRTEEN THROUGH
TWENTY-SIX.

(State's Exhibits Thirteen through Twenty-six
marked and filed.)

THE COURT: MR. SORENSON, WHILE YOU'RE DOING
THAT, ARE YOU GOING TO ASK LIEUTENANT CARTER TO STEP
DOWN AND GO OVER THE CRIME SCENE?

SOLICITOR SORENSON: YES, SIR.

THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, JUST SO Y'ALL
UNDERSTAND, WHEN HE ASKS LIEUTENANT TO STEP DOWN, SOME
OF THE DEFENSE ATTORNEYS MAY MOVE OVER THERE SO THEY
CAN SEE WHAT'S GOING ON. THEY'RE NOT LEAVING THE
BUILDING OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT, THEY'RE JUST TRYING TO
SEE EXACTLY WHAT YOU'RE SEEING. SO, THEY MAY GET UP
AND MOVE IN MASS, OR MAYBE JUST ONE OR TWO, BUT I
WANTED Y'ALL TO BE AWARE OF THAT BEFORE IT HAPPENS.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

491

1 OKAY? ALRIGHT.

2 Q. ALRIGHT, LIEUTENANT, BEFORE -- I'M GOING TO GET
3 YOU TO STEP DOWN IN A SECOND TO DO WHAT HIS HONOR
4 JUST TOLD THE JURY ABOUT, BUT I'M GOING TO ASK
5 YOU BEFORE WE GET TO THAT POINT THOUGH, IN YOUR
6 PROCESSING THAT APARTMENT THAT EVENING, DID YOU
7 FIND ANY DRUGS IN THE APARTMENT?

8 A. YES, SIR, WE DID.

9 Q. OKAY. AND ARE YOU AWARE OF WHERE THAT STUFF WAS
10 FOUND?

11 A. SIR?

12 Q. ARE YOU AWARE OF WHERE THOSE ITEMS WERE LOCATED?

13 A. OH, YES, SIR.

14 Q. AND TELL THE JURY, PLEASE, WHERE?

15 A. IN THE LIVING ROOM ON THE FLOOR BETWEEN A COFFEE
16 TABLE AND THE VICTIM THERE WAS A RED ZIP LOCK
17 BAG, A REALLY SMALL ONE.

18 Q. AND IS THAT IN STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVEN - - -

19 A. YES, SIR.

20 Q. --- WHERE MY FINGER IS?

21 A. YES, SIR.

22 Q. AND WHAT DID THAT, THAT LITTLE RED BAGGIE HAVE,
23 HAVE IN IT?

24 A. IT HAD A PLANT MATERIAL WHICH APPEARED TO BE
25 MARIJUANA.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

492

- 1 Q. OKAY. ALRIGHT, AND HOW ABOUT IN THE KITCHEN
2 AREA, ANY ITEMS FOUND IN THE KITCHEN AREA?
- 3 A. YES, SIR, THERE WERE, THERE WAS A BAGGIE IN THE -
4 - ACTUALLY, IT WAS THE CABINETS ABOVE THE STOVE
5 AREA, ONE OF THE CABINETS HAD A BAGGIE WITH WHAT
6 APPEARED -- IT WAS PLANT MATERIAL AGAIN, AND IT
7 APPEARED TO BE MARIJUANA SEEDS. IN THE CABINET
8 DIRECTLY ABOVE THE STOVE THERE WERE SEVERAL JARS,
9 GLASS JARS THAT HAD BAGGIES WITHIN THEM THAT HELD
10 PLANT MATERIAL AGAIN THAT APPEARED TO BE
11 MARIJUANA.
- 12 Q. OKAY. AND HOW ABOUT, I'VE ALSO GOT NOTED, ON
13 TOP OF THE MICROWAVE?
- 14 A. YES, SIR, THERE WAS ANOTHER, SOME MORE PLANT
15 MATERIAL ON TOP OF THE MICROWAVE OVEN ITSELF
16 WHICH IS IN THE SAME AREA WHICH APPEARS TO BE
17 MARIJUANA.
- 18 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YOUR HONOR, MAY I HAVE HIM
19 STEP DOWN?
- 20 THE COURT: YOU MAY.
- 21 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.
- 22 Q. OBVIOUSLY, LIEUTENANT, YOU NEED TO MAKE SURE YOU
23 KEEP YOUR VOICE UP NICE AND LOUD SO EVERYBODY CAN
24 HEAR YOU.
- 25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

493

1 Q. I DON'T THINK THAT WILL BE A PROBLEM. IS THIS
2 ALRIGHT FOR YOU OR HOW DO YOU WANT TO - - -

3 A. THAT'S FINE WITH ME.

4 THE COURT: MAKE SURE EVERYBODY ON THE JURY CAN
5 SEE.

6 Q. AND I GUESS, IF I COULD GET YOU, BEFORE I START
7 GOING THROUGH THE PHOTOGRAPHS AND EVIDENCE WITH
8 YOU, IF YOU WOULD, JUST KIND OF, KIND OF ORIENT
9 THE JURY TO WHAT THEY'RE LOOKING AT AS FAR AS
10 WHERE -- YOU TESTIFIED ABOUT THERE BEING TWO
11 DOORS INTO THE APARTMENT, KIND OF WHERE THEY'RE
12 LOCATED, WHAT THE ROOMS ARE AND SO FORTH?

13 A. YES, SIR. THIS IS A SKETCH AND I PREPARED TO
14 DOCUMENT THE SCENE OF THE ENTIRE APARTMENT. THIS
15 IS THE LIVING ROOM AREA. RIGHT HERE THERE WAS AN
16 OPENING, THERE'S NO DOOR BETWEEN THE LIVING ROOM
17 AND THE KITCHEN, THERE'S JUST AN OPEN AREA RIGHT
18 HERE. THIS IS THE FRONT DOOR, IT'S IN THIS
19 CORNER OF THE APARTMENT, IT LEADS INTO THE LIVING
20 ROOM AREA. AS YOU GO INTO THE KITCHEN THERE'S
21 THE BACK DOOR. IT'S IN THE OPPOSITE CORNER IN THE
22 APARTMENT. AS YOU COME DOWN IT'S A KIND OF A
23 HALLWAY, IT'S NOT REALLY A HALL BUT IT'S AN OPEN
24 AREA WHICH LEADS TO, FROM THE LIVING ROOM LEADS
25 INTO THE BATHROOM AREA, A BEDROOM ON THIS CORNER

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

494

1 OF THE RESIDENCE, AND THEN THERE ARE CLOSETS
2 RIGHT IN THE MIDDLE AND A SECOND BEDROOM WOULD BE
3 ON THE RIGHT SIDE AS YOU COME THROUGH. AS YOU
4 CAN SEE, WE HAVE, THE EVIDENCE IS MARKED, MOST OF
5 IT IS RIGHT HERE IN THE LIVING ROOM, A LITTLE BIT
6 IN THIS OPEN AREA BETWEEN THE BATHROOM AND THE
7 BEDROOMS.

8 Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU HAD INDICATED THAT WHEN YOU
9 ARRIVED ON THE SCENE MR. PRINGLE WAS STILL THERE?

10 A. YES, SIR.

11 Q. AND IS HE, IS THERE DOCUMENTATION IN THE DIAGRAM
12 OF WHERE HE WAS LOCATED AT WHEN YOU ARRIVED ON
13 THE SCENE?

14 A. YES, SIR. THIS IS A PROPORTIONAL REPRESENTATION
15 OF WHERE I FOUND HIM IN THE SCENE. WE HAD A
16 COUCH HERE, THERE WAS A T.V. STAND WITH A FLAT
17 SCREEN T.V. HERE, AND OF COURSE, I'VE ALREADY
18 EXPLAINED, THIS IS THE KITCHEN AREA, AND THIS IS
19 WHERE HIS BODY WAS IN RELATIONSHIP TO THE OBJECTS
20 IN THE ROOM.

21 Q. OKAY. AND I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER
22 EIGHT, THEN, IS THAT THE CONDITION IN HOW YOU
23 FOUND HIM WHEN YOU ARRIVED ON THE SCENE THAT
24 NIGHT?

25 A. YES, SIR.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

495

1 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, LOOKING AT THE, IN THE LIVING
2 ROOM AREA, WHAT ITEMS OF FURNITURE WERE LOCATED
3 IN THE LIVING ROOM AREA?

4 A. AS YOU COME THROUGH THE FRONT DOOR, AGAINST THIS
5 WALL, I GUESS KIND OF TO YOUR LEFT THERE WAS A
6 FULL SIZED COUCH. AS YOU COMING INTO THE FRONT
7 DOOR TO YOUR RIGHT THERE WAS A BIG SQUARE COFFEE
8 TABLE. AGAINST THE WALL THERE WAS AN END TABLE
9 IN THE CORNER, A LOVE SEAT, AND THAT WAS -- WELL,
10 OVER HERE YOU HAVE YOUR T.V. AGAIN, WHERE IT WAS
11 SITTING ON THE T.V. STAND, IT'S A FLAT SCREEN
12 T.V. ON THE TOP OF THAT, AND I BELIEVE IT WAS A
13 VCR, OR MAYBE A GAME SYSTEM OR SOMETHING INSIDE
14 THE CABINET. AND THAT WAS THE FURNISHING IN THE
15 LIVING ROOM.

16 Q. OKAY. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER
17 ELEVEN, DOES THAT KIND OF SHOW THOSE ITEMS?

18 A. THAT SHOWS THE LOVE SEAT, THE COFFEE TABLE AND
19 THE CORNER OF THE COUCH.

20 Q. OKAY. LET ME JUST ASK YOU, AND YOU'VE GOT THAT
21 NOTED AS AN END TABLE, AND ACTUALLY - - -

22 COURT REPORTER: I'M SORRY, I DIDN'T HEAR YOU.

23 Q. YOU'VE GOT THAT NOTED AS AN END TABLE, IS THAT
24 ACTUALLY A CHAIR THAT'S IN THE CORNER THERE?

25 A. YES, SIR, IT APPEARS TO BE. I DON'T KNOW, I'M

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

496

1 LOOKING AT THE BACK OF MY PICTURE. I DON'T KNOW
2 IF IT'S SOMETHING BEHIND THE CHAIR, BUT WHAT YOU
3 CAN SEE IN THE PICTURE IS A CHAIR.

4 Q. OKAY. SO, IT COULD BE A LITTLE KIND OF END TABLE
5 BEHIND THAT CHAIR?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. OKAY. LET ME ASK YOU, WHEN YOU ARRIVED ON THE
8 SCENE THAT NIGHT WHAT, SPECIFICALLY WITH REGARDS
9 TO THE COUCH AND THE LOVE SEAT, WHAT WERE THE
10 CONDITION OF THOSE ITEMS?

11 A. THE CUSHIONS WERE THROWN OFF OF THEM OR UPTURNED,
12 THEY WERE, THEY HAD BEEN PULLED OFF THE COUCHES
13 AND TURNED UP.

14 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER TEN, WHAT
15 ITEM IS THAT DEPICTED IN STATE'S EXHIBIT TEN?

16 A. THAT IS THE COUCH AS I FOUND IT WITH THE CUSHIONS
17 PULLED OFF OF IT.

18 Q. OKAY. AND DOES IT HAVE SOME OF THE SLATS
19 UNDERNEATH IT KIND OF TORN UP?

20 MS. ULLMAN: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR, HE'S
21 TESTIFYING.

22 Q. WHAT DOES IT APPEAR TO HAVE ALSO DONE TO THE
23 SLATS ON IT?

24 A. THERE WERE SOME WOODEN SLATS APPARENTLY, IT LOOKS
25 LIKE THEY WERE UNDER THE CUSHIONS AND THEY WERE

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

497

1 BROKEN, ONE OF THEM, AT LEAST ONE OF THEM IS
2 BROKEN.

3 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER SEVEN,
4 WHAT PIECE OF FURNITURE IS DEPICTED IN THAT?

5 A. SPECIFICALLY, THE COFFEE TABLE AND THE LOVE SEAT,
6 AND THE CUSHIONS HAVE BEEN PULLED UP ON THE LOVE
7 SEAT.

8 Q. IS THAT THE CONDITION YOU FOUND THE LOVE SEAT
9 WHEN YOU ARRIVED THERE?

10 A. YES, SIR, IT IS.

11 Q. ALRIGHT. AND SPECIFICALLY, LOOKING AT THE
12 CUSHIONS, DID YOU OBSERVE ANY DAMAGE TO THE
13 CUSHIONS?

14 A. ALL OF THE CUSHIONS HAD WHAT LOOKED TO BE LIKE
15 SLITS CUT IN THEM, POSSIBLY SOMEBODY LOOKING IN
16 THE CUSHIONS. IT COULD HAVE BEEN THAT, CUTTING
17 THE CUSHIONS OPEN TO LOOK INSIDE, BUT ALL OF THE
18 CUSHIONS WERE IN THAT CONDITION.

19 Q. ALRIGHT. LET ME START GOING AROUND HERE, YOUR
20 ITEM NUMBER ONE THAT YOU'VE GOT DOCUMENT ON
21 THERE, WHAT IS THAT ITEM?

22 A. THAT'S A PARTIAL ROLL OR A PIECE OF ROLL OF GRAY
23 DUCT TAPE, AND THAT WAS FOUND BETWEEN THE, THIS
24 IS THE FRONT DOOR, IT WAS IN THE LIVING ROOM
25 BETWEEN THE COFFEE TABLE AND THE WALL.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

498

1 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBITS NUMBERS THIRTEEN
2 AND FOURTEEN, DOES THAT SHOW ONE OF THE KIND OF
3 ORIENTING IT AND THEN ANOTHER KIND OF UP CLOSE?

4 A. YEAH. THE ONE PICTURE JUST LETS YOU SEE WHAT IT
5 IS, AND THE OTHER PICTURE DOES GIVE YOU SOME
6 ORIENTATION IN THE ROOM, HOW CLOSE IT WAS TO
7 DIFFERENT OBJECTS.

8 Q. AND DID YOU COLLECT THAT ROLL OF DUCT TAPE?

9 A. YES, SIR, I DID.

10 Q. I'M SHOWING YOU STATE'S EXHIBIT NUMBER THIRTY-
11 EIGHT, IS THAT THAT ROLL OF DUCT TAPE, IT'S KIND
12 OF STILL STICKING TO THE SIDE OF THE BAG, BUT IS
13 THAT THE ROLL OF DUCT TAPE YOU COLLECTED?

14 A. YES, SIR, IT IS.

15 Q. OKAY. IS THAT YOUR HANDWRITING AND ALL ON IT?

16 A. YES, SIR.

17 SOLICITOR SORENSON: LET ME CHECK WITH THE COURT
18 REPORTER ONE SECOND. YOU'VE GOT THIRTY-EIGHT IN THERE,
19 RIGHT?

20 COURT REPORTER: YES, SIR.

21 THE COURT: STATE'S THIRTY-EIGHT'S ALREADY BEEN
22 ADMITTED?

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: YEAH, I THINK WE HAD MOVED A
24 WHOLE BUNCH OF THESE IN THE OTHER DAY, IT'S MY
25 UNDERSTANDING AT LEAST.

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

499

1 COURT REPORTER: I HAVE IT CHECKED OFF.

2 THE COURT: I KNOW THE DEFENSE ATTORNEYS, Y'ALL
3 ARE SITTING OVER THERE. THESE, THE ITEMS THAT HE'S
4 GOING THROUGH NOW, BEGINNING WITH NUMBER THIRTY-EIGHT,
5 Y'ALL HAVE ALREADY HAD A CHANCE TO LOOK AT THEM?

6 MR. PALMER: ON BEHALF OF MR. HARRIS, THE ANSWER
7 IS YES, YOUR HONOR, I LOOKED AT THEM LAST WEEK. SO
8 FAR THERE'S NO OBJECTION.

9 THE COURT: OKAY. ALRIGHT.

10 MS. ULLMAN: THAT'S TRUE FOR MR. RALPH COLEMAN
11 ALSO.

12 COURT REPORTER: I'M SORRY, I CANNOT HEAR YOU
13 THAT FAR AWAY.

14 THE COURT: I BELIEVE THAT'S TRUE FOR ALL OF THE
15 DEFENDANTS, IS THAT CORRECT?

16 MR. LACKEY: THAT'S CORRECT.

17 MR. MELLARD: YES, SIR.

18 MR. KOGER: YES, SIR.

19 THE COURT: OKAY. THANK YOU, APPRECIATE IT.
20 ALRIGHT.

21 (State's Exhibit Thirty-eight
22 marked and filed.)

23 SOLICITOR SORENSON: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

24 THE COURT: YES, SIR.

25 Q. LET ME ASK YOU, YOU HAD TALKED EARLIER,

DIRECT - GERALD DAVID CARTER BY SOL. SORENSON

500

1 LIEUTENANT, ABOUT FINDING IN THAT AREA, I BELIEVE
2 THE WAY YOU DESCRIBED IT THERE WERE, YOU KNOW,
3 NUMEROUS SHELL CASINGS AND OTHER EVIDENCE THAT
4 WAS FOUND IN THE LIVING ROOM AREA, IS THAT
5 CORRECT?

6 A. YES, SIR.

7 Q. DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY SPECIFICALLY AS TO
8 INITIALLY TALKING ABOUT THE SHELL CASINGS, DID
9 YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO DOCUMENT AND COLLECT
10 ALL OF THE SHELL CASINGS THAT YOU FOUND OUT IN
11 THE LIVING ROOM AREA?

12 A. YES, SIR.

13 Q. OKAY. AND IF YOU WOULD JUST BRIEFLY FOR THOSE OF
14 US WHO MAY NOT KNOW WHAT A SHELL CASING IS, CAN
15 YOU KIND OF DESCRIBE FOR THE JURY WHAT A SHELL
16 CASING IS FIRST?

17 A. A SHELL CASING IS A COMPONENT OR PART OF WHAT WE
18 WOULD COMMONLY CALL A BULLET.

19 COURT REPORTER: A PART OF WHAT?

20 SOLICITOR SORENSON: A BULLET.

21 A. THE CASING WOULD ACTUALLY HOLD THE GUN POWDER AND
22 THE BULLET, OR PROJECTILE, THE SOLID PIECE OF
23 THE BULLET WOULD THEN BE INSERTED INTO THE TOP OF
24 THE CASING. THE CASING WOULD ALSO CONTAIN A
25 PRIMER WHICH ONCE STRUCK BY THE HAMMER OF A -- A