

RECEIVED

2017 THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Court of Appeals

RECEIVED

AUG 21 2015

SC Court of Appeals

S.C. SUPREME COURT \_\_\_\_\_

APPEAL FROM ADMINISTRATIVE LAW COURT

Ralph King Anderson, III, Administrative Law Judge

Case No. 09-ALJ-17-0204-CC

Appellate Case No. 2012-208608

Rent-A-Center West, Inc., ..... Appellant,

v.

South Carolina Department of Revenue ..... Respondent.

**RECORD ON APPEAL  
VOLUME III**

John C. von Lehe, Jr.  
Bryson M. Geer  
Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP  
151 Meeting Street / Sixth Floor  
Post Office Box 1806 (29402-1806)  
Charleston, SC 29401-2239  
(843) 853-5200  
*Attorneys for Appellant*

Sean G. Ryan  
William J. Condon, Jr.  
South Carolina Department of Revenue  
300A Outlet Pointe Blvd. (29210)  
P.O. Box 12265  
Columbia, SC 29211  
(803) 898-5278  
*Attorneys for Respondent*

**RECORD ON APPEAL  
INDEX**

**VOLUME I**

**ORDERS AND JUDGMENTS**

Final Order and Decision dated January 6, 2012.....	3
Order Denying Motion for Reconsideration dated February 1, 2012.....	25
Order Granting Extension for Department of Revenue to File Petition for Rehearing in <i>Carmax Auto Superstores West Coast, Inc. v. South Carolina Department of Revenue</i> dated January 7, 2015 .....	28

**DETERMINATION**

Department Determination dated May 6, 2009.....	29
---	----

**MOTIONS**

RAC West's Motion for Reconsideration Under ALC Rule 29(D) and/or to Alter or Amend Under SCRCF Rule 59(e) filed January 17, 2012.....	38
---	----

**TRANSCRIPTS**

Hearing Transcript Day One dated August 10, 2011.....	104
---	-----

**VOLUME II**

Hearing Transcript Day Two dated August 11, 2011.....	225
---	-----

**EXHIBITS AND OTHER MATERIALS OR DOCUMENTS**

Field Audit Report for RAC West dated March 12, 2008 .....	340
RAC West Notice of Protest dated June 3, 2008.....	351
RAC West Amended Tax Returns 2003-2005.....	361
Trademark License Agreement dated December 31, 2002 and Amendment No. 1 to Trademark License Agreement dated December 31, 2004 .....	383
Management Services Agreement effective December 31, 2002 .....	391

Chart of RAC's Corporate Structure .....	398
Expert Opinion of Professor Richard D. Pomp .....	399
KPMG's Analysis of Rent-A-Center, Inc. Profit Distribution Dated February 2003.....	409
RAC West's Revenue by State for FYE December 31, 2004 .....	478
Sample DOR Corporate Income Tax Instructions .....	479

**VOLUME III**

Uniform Division of Income for Tax Purposes Act ("UDITPA") and Regulations .....	500
--	-----

## **Multistate Tax Compact**

### **Article IV. Division of Income**

1. As used in this Article, unless the context otherwise requires:

(a) "Business income" means income arising from transactions and activity in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business and includes income from tangible and intangible property if the acquisition, management and disposition of the property constitute integral parts of the taxpayer's regular trade or business operations.

(b) "Commercial domicile" means the principal place from which the trade or business of the taxpayer is directed or managed.

(c) "Compensation" means wages, salaries, commissions and any other form of remuneration paid to employees for personal services.

(d) "Financial organization" means any bank, trust company, savings bank, industrial bank, land bank, safe deposit company, private banker, savings and loan association, credit union, cooperative bank, small loan company, sales finance company, investment company, or any type of insurance company.

(e) "Nonbusiness income" means all income other than business income.

(f) "Public utility" means any business entity (1) which owns or operates any plant, equipment, property, franchise, or license for the transmission of communications, transportation of goods or persons, except by pipeline, or the production, transmission, sale, delivery, or furnishing of electricity, water or steam; and (2) whose rates of charges for goods or services have been established or approved by a Federal, State or local government or governmental agency.

(g) "Sales" means all gross receipts of the taxpayer not allocated under paragraphs of this Article.

(h) "State" means any State of the United States, the District of Columbia, the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, any Territory or Possession of the United States, and any foreign country or political subdivision thereof.

(i) "This State" means the State in which the relevant tax return is filed or, in the case of application of this Article to the apportionment and allocation of income for local tax purposes, the subdivision or local taxing district in which the relevant tax return is filed.

2. Any taxpayer having income from business activity which is taxable both within and without this State, other than activity as a financial organization or public utility or the rendering of purely personal services by an individual, shall allocate and apportion his net income as provided in this Article. If a taxpayer has income from business activity as a public utility but derives the greater percentage of his income

from activities subject to this Article, the taxpayer may elect to allocate and apportion his entire net income as provided in this Article.

3. For purposes of allocation and apportionment of income under this Article, a taxpayer is taxable in another State if (1) in that State he is subject to a net income tax, a franchise tax measured by net income, a franchise tax for the privilege of doing business, or a corporate stock tax, or (2) that State has jurisdiction to subject the taxpayer to a net income tax regardless of whether, in fact, the State does or does not do so.

4. Rents and royalties from real or tangible personal property, capital gains, interest, dividends or patent or copyright royalties, to the extent that they constitute nonbusiness income, shall be allocated as provided in paragraphs 5 through 8 of this Article.

5. (a) Net rents and royalties from real property located in this State are allocable to this State.

(b) Net rents and royalties from tangible personal property are allocable to this State: (1) if and to the extent that the property is utilized in this State, or (2) in their entirety if the taxpayer's commercial domicile is in this State and the taxpayer is not organized under the laws of or taxable in the State in which the property is utilized.

(c) The extent of utilization of tangible personal property in a State is determined by multiplying the rents and royalties by a fraction the numerator of which is the number of days of physical location of the property in the State during the rental or royalty period in the taxable year and the denominator of which is the number of days of physical location of the property everywhere during all rental or royalty periods in the taxable year. If the physical location of the property during the rental or royalty period is unknown or unascertainable by the taxpayer, tangible personal property is utilized in the State in which the property was located at the time the rental or royalty payer obtained possession.

6. (a) Capital gains and losses from sales of real property located in this State are allocable to this State.

(b) Capital gains and losses from sales of tangible personal property are allocable to this State if (1) the property had a situs in this State at the time of the sale, or (2) the taxpayer's commercial domicile is in this State and the taxpayer is not taxable in the State in which the property had a situs.

(c) Capital gains and losses from sales of intangible personal property are allocable to this State if the taxpayer's commercial domicile is in this State.

7. Interest and dividends are allocable to this State if the taxpayer's commercial domicile is in this State.

8. (a) Patent and copyright royalties are allocable to this State: (1) if and to the extent that the patent or copyright is utilized by the payer in this State, or (2) if and

to the extent that the patent or copyright is utilized by the payer in a State in which the taxpayer is not taxable and the taxpayer's commercial domicile is in this State.

(b) A patent is utilized in a State to the extent that it is employed in production, fabrication, manufacturing, or other processing in the State or to the extent that a patented product is produced in the State. If the basis of receipts from patent royalties does not permit allocation to States or if the accounting procedures do not reflect States of utilization, the patent is utilized in the State in which the taxpayer's commercial domicile is located.

(c) A copyright is utilized in a State to the extent that printing or other publication originates in the State. If the basis of receipts from copyright royalties does not permit allocation to States or if the accounting procedures do not reflect States of utilization, the copyright is utilized in the State in which the taxpayer's commercial domicile is located.

9. All business income shall be apportioned to this State by multiplying the income by a fraction the numerator of which is the property factor plus the payroll factor plus the sales factor and the denominator of which is three.

10. The property factor is a fraction the numerator of which is the average value of the taxpayer's real and tangible personal property owned or rented and used in this State during the tax period and the denominator of which is the average value of all of the taxpayer's real and tangible personal property owned or rented and used during the tax period.

11. Property owned by the taxpayer is valued at its original cost. Property rented by the taxpayer is valued at eight times the net annual rental rate. Net annual rental rate is the annual rental rate paid by the taxpayer less any annual rental rate received by the taxpayer from subrentals.

12. The average value of property shall be determined by averaging the values at the beginning and ending of the tax period; but the tax administrator may require the averaging of monthly values during the tax period if reasonably required to reflect properly the average value of the taxpayer's property.

13. The payroll factor is a fraction the numerator of which is the total amount paid in this State during the tax period by the taxpayer for compensation and the denominator of which is the total compensation paid everywhere during the tax period.

14. Compensation is paid in this State if:

(a) the individual's service is performed entirely within the State;

(b) the individual's service is performed both within and without the State, but the service performed without the State is incidental to the individual's service within the State; or

(c) some of the service is performed in the State and (1) the base of operations or, if there is no base of operations, the place from which the service is directed or controlled is in the State, or (2) the base of operations or the place from which the service is directed or controlled is not in any State in which some part of the service is performed, but the individual's residence is in this State.

15. The sales factor is a fraction the numerator of which is the total sales of the taxpayer in this State during the tax period and the denominator of which is the total sales of the taxpayer everywhere during the tax period.

16. Sales of tangible personal property are in this State if:

(a) the property is delivered or shipped to a purchaser, other than the United States Government, within this State regardless of the f.o.b. point or other conditions of the sale; or

(b) the property is shipped from an office, store, warehouse, factory, or other place of storage in this State and (1) the purchaser is the United States Government or (2) the taxpayer is not taxable in the State of the purchaser.

17. Sales, other than sales of tangible personal property, are in this State if:

(a) the income-producing activity is performed in this State; or

(b) the income-producing activity is performed both in and outside this State and a greater proportion of the income-producing activity is performed in this State than in any other State, based on costs of performance.

18. If the allocation and apportionment provisions of this Article do not fairly represent the extent of the taxpayer's business activity in this State, the taxpayer may petition for or the tax administrator may require, in respect to all or any part of the taxpayer's business activity, if reasonable:

(a) separate accounting;

(b) the exclusion of any one or more of the factors;

(c) the inclusion of one or more additional factors which will fairly represent the taxpayer's business activity in this State; or

(d) the employment of any other method to effectuate an equitable allocation and apportionment of the taxpayer's income.

**Multistate Tax Commission  
Allocation and Apportionment Regulations**

*Adopted February 21, 1973; as revised through August 2, 2007*

(Applicable to Article IV of the Multistate Tax Compact and to the Uniform Division of Income for Tax Purposes Act.)

*The Allocation and Apportionment Regulations were adopted by the Multistate Tax Commission on February 21, 1973.*

Reg. IV.11.(a) and (b) were revised on July 14, 1988.  
Reg. IV.18.(c).4. was added on August 8, 1997.  
Reg. IV.2.(a).(5) was added on July 27, 2001.  
Reg. IV.1.(a) and (c) were revised on August 1, 2003.  
Reg. IV.2.(a).(4) was revised on August 1, 2003.  
Reg. IV.10.(b) was revised on August 1, 2003.  
Reg. IV.11.(b) was revised on August 1, 2003.  
Reg. IV.1.(b) was revised on January 15, 2004.  
Reg. IV.17.(2) and (3) were revised on August 2, 2007.  
Reg. IV.17.(4)(C) was added on August 2, 2007.

*Special Industry Rules have been adopted and added to these Regulations (and further amended, where noted) as follows:*

Reg. IV.18.(d).	Construction Contractors, July 10, 1980
Reg. IV.18.(e).	Airlines, July 14, 1983
Reg. IV.18.(f).	Railroads, July 16, 1981
Reg. IV.18.(g).	Trucking Companies, July 11, 1986; amended July 27, 1989.
Reg. IV.18.(h).	Television and Radio Broadcasting, August 31, 1990; amended April 25, 1996.
Reg. IV.18.(i).	(Reserved)
Reg. IV.18.(j).	Publishing, July 30, 1993

*The Recommended Formula for the Apportionment and Allocation of Net Income of Financial Institutions was adopted November 17, 1994.*

*They are subject to adoption by each member state in accordance with its own laws and procedures.*

*The numerical references of the regulations are to Article IV of the Multistate Tax Compact and its subsections.*

**Prologue.** These Regulations are intended to set forth rules concerning the application of the apportionment and allocation provisions of Article IV of the Multistate

**Tax Compact.** The apportionment rules set forth in these Regulations are applicable to any taxpayer having business income, regardless of whether or not it has nonbusiness income, and the allocation rules set forth in these Regulations are applicable to any taxpayer having nonbusiness income, regardless of whether or not it has business income.

The only exceptions to these allocation and apportionment rules contained in these Regulations are those set forth in Regulation IV.18 pursuant to the authority of Article IV.18 of the Compact.

These Regulations are not intended to modify existing rules concerning jurisdictional standards.

**... Reg. IV.1.(a). Business and Nonbusiness Income Defined.**

(1) **Apportionment and Allocation.** Article IV.1(a) and (e) require that every item of income be classified either as business income or nonbusiness income. Income for purposes of classification as business or nonbusiness includes gains and losses. Business income is apportioned among jurisdictions by use of a formula. Nonbusiness income is specifically assigned or allocated to one or more specific jurisdictions pursuant to express rules. An item of income is classified as business income if it falls within the definition of business income. An item of income is nonbusiness income only if it does not meet the definitional requirements for being classified as business income.

(2) **Business Income.** Business income means income of any type or class, and from any activity, that meets the relationship described either in IV.1.(a).(4), the "transactional test", or (5), the "functional test". The classification of income by the labels occasionally used, such as manufacturing income, compensation for services, sales income, interest, dividends, rents, royalties, gains, operating income, nonoperating income, *etc.*, is of no aid in determining whether income is business or non-business income.

(3) **Terms Used in Definition of Business Income and in Application of Definition.** As used in the definition of business income and/or in the application of the definition,

(A) "Trade or business" means the unitary business of the taxpayer, part of which is conducted within [this State].

(B) "To contribute materially" includes, without limitation, "to be used operationally in the taxpayer's trade or business." Whether property materially contributes is not determined by reference to the property's value or percentage of use. If an item of property materially contributes to the taxpayer's trade or business, the attributes, rights or components of that property are also operationally used in that business. However, property that is held for mere financial betterment is not operationally used in the taxpayer's trade or business.

(4) **Transactional Test.** Business income includes income arising from transactions

and activity in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business.

(A) If the transaction or activity is in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business, part of which trade or business is conducted within [this State], the resulting income of the transaction or activity is business income for [this State]. Income may be business income even though the actual transaction or activity that gives rise to the income does not occur in [this State].

(B) For a transaction or activity to be in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business, the transaction or activity need not be one that frequently occurs in the trade or business. Most, but not all, frequently occurring transactions or activities will be in the regular course of that trade or business and will, therefore, satisfy the transactional test. It is sufficient to classify a transaction or activity as being in the regular course of a trade or business, if it is reasonable to conclude transactions of that type are customary in the kind of trade or business being conducted or are within the scope of what that kind of trade or business does. However, even if a taxpayer frequently or customarily engages in investment activities, if those activities are for the taxpayer's mere financial betterment rather than for the operations of the trade or business, such activities do not satisfy the transactional test. The transactional test includes, but is not limited to, income from sales of inventory, property held for sale to customers, and services which are commonly sold by the trade or business. The transactional test also includes, but is not limited to, income from the sale of property used in the production of business income of a kind that is sold and replaced with some regularity, even if replaced less frequently than once a year.

(5) **Functional test.** Business income also includes income from tangible and intangible property, if the acquisition, management, and disposition of the property constitute integral parts of the taxpayer's regular trade or business operations. "Property" includes any interest in, control over, or use in property (whether the interest is held directly, beneficially, by contract, or otherwise) that materially contributes to the production of business income. "Acquisition" refers to the act of obtaining an interest in property. "Management" refers to the oversight, direction, or control (directly or by delegation) of the property for the use or benefit of the trade or business. "Disposition" refers to the act, or the power, to relinquish or transfer an interest in or control over property to another, in whole or in part. "Integral part" refers to property that constituted a part of the composite whole of the trade or business, each part of which gave value to every other part, in a manner which materially contributed to the production of business income.

(A) Under the functional test, business income need not be derived from transactions or activities that are in the regular course of the taxpayer's own particular trade or business. It is sufficient, if the property from which the income is derived is or was an integral, functional, or operative component used in the taxpayer's trade or business operations, or otherwise materially contributed to the production of business income of the trade or business, part of which trade or business is or was conducted within this State. Property that has been converted to nonbusiness use through the

passage of a sufficiently lengthy period of time (generally, five years is sufficient) or that has been removed as an operational asset and is instead held by the taxpayer's trade or business exclusively for investment purposes has lost its character as a business asset and is not subject to the rule of the preceding sentence. Property that was an integral part of the trade or business is not considered converted to investment purposes merely because it is placed for sale.

(B) Income that is derived from isolated sales, leases, assignments, licenses, and other infrequently occurring dispositions, transfers, or transactions involving property, including transactions made in liquidation or the winding-up of business, is business income, if the property is or was used in the taxpayer's trade or business operations. (Property that has been converted to nonbusiness use (see IV.1.a.(4)(A)) has lost its character as a business asset and is not subject to the rule of the preceding sentence.) Income from the licensing of an intangible asset, such as a patent, copyright, trademark, service mark, know-how, trade secrets, or the like, that was developed or acquired for use by the taxpayer in its trade or business operations, constitutes business income whether or not the licensing itself constituted the operation of a trade or business, and whether or not the taxpayer remains in the same trade or business from or for which the intangible asset was developed or acquired.

(C) Under the functional test, income from intangible property is business income when the intangible property serves an operational function as opposed to solely an investment function. The relevant inquiry focuses on whether the property is or was held in furtherance of the taxpayer's trade or business, that is, on the objective characteristics of the intangible property's use or acquisition and its relation to the taxpayer and the taxpayer's activities. The functional test is not satisfied where the holding of the property is limited to solely an investment function as is the case where the holding of the property is limited to mere financial betterment of the taxpayer in general.

(D) If the property is or was held in furtherance of the taxpayer's trade or business beyond mere financial betterment, then income from that property may be business income even though the actual transaction or activity involving the property that gives rise to the income does not occur in [this State].

(E) If with respect to an item of property a taxpayer (i) takes a deduction from business income that is apportioned to [this State] or (ii) includes the original cost in the property factor, it is presumed that the item or property is or was integral to the taxpayer's trade or business operations. No presumption arises from the absence of any of these actions.

(F) Application of the functional test is generally unaffected by the form of the property (e.g., tangible or intangible property, real or personal property). Income arising from an intangible interest, as, for example, corporate stock or other intangible interest in a business or a group of assets, is business income when the intangible itself or the property underlying or associated with the intangible is or was an

integral, functional, or operative component to the taxpayer's trade or business operations. (Property that has been converted to nonbusiness use (see IV.1.(a).(4)(A)) has lost its character as a business asset and is not subject to the rule of the preceding sentence.) Thus, while apportionment of income derived from transactions involving intangible property as business income may be supported by a finding that the issuer of the intangible property and the taxpayer are engaged in the same trade or business, *i.e.*, the same unitary business, establishment of such a relationship is not the exclusive basis for concluding that the income is subject to apportionment. It is sufficient to support the finding of apportionable income if the holding of the intangible interest served an operational rather than an investment function of mere financial betterment.

**(6) Relationship of transactional and functional tests to U.S. Constitution.** The Due Process Clause and the Commerce Clause of the U.S. Constitution restrict States from apportioning income as business income that has no rational relationship with the taxing State. The protection against extra-territorial state taxation afforded by these Clauses is often described as the "unitary business principle." The unitary business principle requires apportionable income to be derived from the same unitary business that is being conducted at least in part in [this State]. The unitary business that is conducted in [this State] includes both a unitary business that the taxpayer alone may be conducting and a unitary business the taxpayer may conduct with any other person or persons. Satisfaction of either the transactional test or the functional test complies with the unitary business principle, because each test requires that the transaction or activity (in the case of the transactional test) or the property (in the case of the functional test) to be tied to the same trade or business that is being conducted within [this State]. Determination of the scope of the unitary business being conducted in [this State] is without regard to extent to which [this State] requires or permits combined reporting.

**(7) Nonbusiness income.** Nonbusiness income means all income other than business income.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.1.(b). Principles for Determining the Existence of a Unitary Business.**

**(1) Unitary Business Principle.**

**(A) *The Concept of a Unitary Business.*** A unitary business is a single economic enterprise that is made up either of separate parts of a single business entity or of a commonly controlled group of business entities that are sufficiently interdependent, integrated and interrelated through their activities so as to provide a synergy and mutual benefit that produces a sharing or exchange of value among them and a significant flow of value to the separate parts. This flow of value to a business entity located in this state that comes from being part of a unitary business conducted both within and without this State is what provides the constitutional due process "definite link and minimum connection" necessary for this state to apportion business income of the unitary business, even if that income

arises in part from activities conducted outside the state. The business income of the unitary business is then apportioned to this state using an apportionment percentage provided by [insert your state statute].

This sharing or exchange of value may also be described as requiring that the operation of one part of the business be dependent upon, or contribute to, the operation of another part of the business. Phrased in the disjunctive, the foregoing means that if the activities of one business either contributes to the activities of another business *or* are dependent upon the activities of another business, those businesses are part of a unitary business.

- (B) *Constitutional Requirement for a Unitary Business.* The sharing or exchange of value described in subsection (A) that defines the scope of a unitary business requires more than the mere flow of funds arising out of a passive investment or from the financial strength contributed by a distinct business undertaking that has no *operational* relationship to the unitary business.

In this State, the unitary business principle shall be applied to the fullest extent allowed by the U.S. Constitution. The unitary business principle shall not be applied to result in the combination of business activities or entities under circumstances where, if it were adverse to the taxpayer, the combination of such activities or entities would not be allowed by the U.S. Constitution.

- (C) *Separate Trades or Businesses Conducted within a Single Entity.* A single entity may have more than one unitary business. In such cases it is necessary to determine the business, or apportionable, income attributable to each separate unitary business as well as its nonbusiness income, which is specifically allocated. The business income of each unitary business is then apportioned by a formula that takes into consideration the in-state and the out-of-state factors that relate to the respective unitary business whose income is being apportioned.

- (D) *Unitary Business Unaffected by Formal Business Organization.* A unitary business may exist within a single business entity or among a commonly controlled group of business entities. The scope of what is included in a commonly controlled group of business entities is set forth in Section V below.

## (2) Determination of a Unitary Business

- (A) A unitary business is characterized by significant flows of value evidenced by factors such as those described in *Mobil Oil Corp. v. Vermont*, 445 U.S. 425 (1980): functional integration, centralization of management, and economies of scale. These factors provide evidence of whether the business activities operate as an integrated whole or exhibit substantial mutual interdependence. [RESERVED: See regulation concerning passive holding companies for special rules that govern the determination of whether a pure or passive holding company constitutes a part of a unitary business with one or more affiliates conducting active business

operations.] Facts suggesting the presence of the factors mentioned above should be analyzed in combination for their cumulative effect and not in isolation. A particular business operation may be suggestive of one or more of the factors mentioned above.

(B) *Description and Illustration of Functional Integration, Centralization of Management and Economies of Scale.*

1. *Functional integration:* Functional integration refers to transfers between, or pooling among, business activities that significantly affect the operation of the business activities. Functional integration includes, but is not limited to, transfers or pooling with respect to the unitary business's products or services, technical information, marketing information, distribution systems, purchasing, and intangibles such as patents, trademarks, service marks, copyrights, trade secrets, know-how, formulas, and processes. There is no specific type of functional integration that must be present. The following is a list of examples of business operations that can support the finding of functional integration. The order of the list does not establish a hierarchy of importance.
  - a. Sales, exchanges, or transfers (collectively "sales") of products, services, and/or intangibles between business activities provide evidence of functional integration. The significance of the intercompany sales to the finding of functional integration will be affected by the character of what is sold and/or the percentage of total sales or purchases represented by the intercompany sales. For example, sales among business entities that are part of a vertically integrated unitary business are indicative of functional integration. Functional integration is not negated by the use of a readily determinable market price to effect the intercompany sales, because such sales can represent an assured market for the seller or an assured source of supply for the purchaser.
  - b. *Common Marketing.* The sharing of common marketing features among business entities is an indication of functional integration when such marketing results in significant mutual advantage. Common marketing exists when a substantial portion of the business entities' products, services, or intangibles are distributed or sold to a common customer, when the business entities use a common trade name or other common identification, or when the business entities seek to identify themselves to their customers as a member of the same enterprise. The use of a common advertising agency or a commonly owned or controlled in-house advertising office does not by itself establish common marketing that is suggestive of functional integration. (Such activity, however, is relevant to determining the existence of economies of scale and/or centralization of management.)
  - c. *Transfer or Pooling of Technical Information or Intellectual Property.*

Transfers or pooling of technical information or intellectual property, such as patents, copyrights, trademarks and service marks, trade secrets, processes or formulas, know-how, research, or development, provide evidence of functional integration when the matter transferred is significant to the businesses' operations.

- d. *Common Distribution System.* Use of a common distribution system by the business entities, under which inventory control and accounting, storage, trafficking, and/or transportation are controlled through a common network provides evidence of functional integration.
- e. *Common Purchasing.* Common purchasing of substantial quantities of products, services, or intangibles from the same source by the business entities, particularly where the purchasing results in significant cost savings or where the products, services or intangibles are not readily available from other sources and are significant to each entity's operations or sales, provides evidence of functional integration.
- f. *Common or Intercompany Financing.* Significant common or intercompany financing, including the guarantee by, or the pledging of the credit of, one or more business entities for the benefit of another business entity or entities provides evidence of functional integration, if the financing activity serves an operational purpose of both borrower and lender. Lending which serves an investment purpose of the lender does not necessarily provide evidence of functional integration. (See below for discussion of centralization of management.)

2. *Centralization of Management.* Centralization of management exists when directors, officers, and/or other management employees jointly participate in the management decisions that affect the respective business activities and that may also operate to the benefit of the entire economic enterprise. Centralization of management can exist whether the centralization is effected from a parent entity to a subsidiary entity, from a subsidiary entity to a parent entity, from one subsidiary entity to another, from one division within a single business entity to another division within a business entity, or from any combination of the foregoing. Centralization of management may exist even when day-to-day management responsibility and accountability has been decentralized, so long as the management has an ongoing operational role with respect to the business activities. An operational role can be effected through mandates, consensus building, or an overall operational strategy of the business, or any other mechanism that establishes joint management.

- a. *Facts Providing Evidence of Centralization of Management.* Evidence of centralization of management is provided when common officers participate in the decisions relating to the business operations of the different segments. Centralization of management may exist when

management shares or applies knowledge and expertise among the parts of the business. Existence of common officers and directors, while relevant to a showing of centralization of management, does not alone provide evidence of centralization of management. Common officers are more likely to provide evidence of centralization of management than are common directors.

b. *Stewardship Distinguished.* Centralized efforts to fulfill stewardship oversight are not evidence of centralization of management. Stewardship oversight consists of those activities that any owner would take to review the performance of or safeguard an investment. Stewardship oversight is distinguished from those activities that an owner may take to enhance value by integrating one or more significant operating aspects of one business activity with the other business activities of the owner. For example, implementing reporting requirements or mere approval of capital expenditures may evidence only stewardship oversight.

3. *Economies of Scale.* Economies of scale refers to a relation among and between business activities resulting in a significant decrease in the average per unit cost of operational or administrative functions due to the increase in operational size. Economies of scale may exist from the inherent cost savings that arise from the presence of functional integration or centralization of management. The following are examples of business operations that can support the finding of economies of scale. The order of the list does not establish a hierarchy of importance.

a. *Centralized Purchasing.* Centralized purchasing designed to achieve savings due to the volume of purchases, the timing of purchases, or the interchangeability of purchased items among the parts of the business engaging in the purchasing provides evidence of economies of scale.

b. *Centralized Administrative Functions.* The performance of traditional corporate administrative functions, such as legal services, payroll services, pension and other employee benefit administration, in common among the parts of the business may result in some degree of economies of scale. A business entity that secures savings in the performance of corporate administrative services due to its affiliation with other business entities that it would not otherwise reasonably be able to secure on its own because of its size, financial resources, or available market, provides evidence of economies of scale.

**(3) Indicators of a Unitary Business.**

(A) *Same Type of Business.* Business activities that are in the same general line of business generally constitute a single unitary business, as, for example, a multistate grocery chain.

(B) *Steps in a Vertical Process.* Business activities that are part of different steps in a vertically structured business almost always constitute a single unitary business. For example, a business engaged in the exploration, development, extraction, and processing of a natural resource and the subsequent sale of a product based upon the extracted natural resource, is engaged in a single unitary business, regardless of the fact that the various steps in the process are operated substantially independently of each other with only general supervision from the business's executive offices.

(C) *Strong Centralized Management.* Business activities which might otherwise be considered as part of more than one unitary business may constitute one unitary business when there is a strong central management, coupled with the existence of centralized departments for such functions as financing, advertising, research, or purchasing. Strong centralized management exists when a central manager or group of managers makes substantially all of the operational decisions of the business. For example, some businesses conducting diverse lines of business may properly be considered as engaged in only one unitary business when the central executive officers are actively involved in the operations of the various business activities and there are centralized offices which perform for the business activities the normal matters which a truly independent business would perform for itself, such as personnel, purchasing, advertising, or financing.

**(4) Commonly Controlled Group of Business Entities.**

(A) Separate corporations can be part of a unitary business only if they are members of a commonly controlled group.

(B) A "commonly controlled group" means any of the following:

1. A parent corporation and any one or more corporations or chains of corporations, connected through stock ownership (or constructive ownership) with the parent, but only if—
  - a. The parent owns stock possessing more than 50 percent of the voting power of at least one corporation, and, if applicable,
  - b. Stock cumulatively possessing more than 50 percent of the voting power of each of the corporations, except the parent, is owned by the parent, one or more corporations described in subparagraph a, or one or more other corporations that satisfy the conditions of this subparagraph.
2. Any two or more corporations, if stock possessing more than 50 percent of the voting power of the corporations is owned, or constructively owned, by the same person.

3. Any two or more corporations that constitute stapled entities.

- a. For purposes of this paragraph, "stapled entities" means any group of two or more corporations if more than 50 percent of the ownership or beneficial ownership of the stock possessing voting power in each corporation consists of stapled interests.
- b. Two or more interests are stapled interests if, by reason of form of ownership, restrictions on transfer, or other terms or conditions, in connection with the transfer of one of the interests the other interest or interests are also transferred or required to be transferred.

4. Any two or more corporations, if stock possessing more than 50 percent of the voting power of the corporations is cumulatively owned (without regard to the constructive ownership rules of paragraph 1 of subsection (E) by, or for the benefit of, members of the same family. Members of the same family are limited to an individual, his or her spouse, parents, brothers or sisters, grandparents, children and grandchildren, and their respective spouses.

(C) 1. If, in the application of subsection (B), a corporation is a member of more than one commonly controlled group of corporations, the corporation shall elect to be treated as a member of only the commonly controlled group (or part thereof) with respect to which it has a unitary business relationship. If the corporation has a unitary business relationship with more than one of those groups, it shall elect to be treated as a member of only one of the commonly controlled groups with respect to which it has a unitary business relationship. This election shall remain in effect until the unitary business relationship between the corporation and the rest of the members of its elected commonly controlled group is discontinued, or unless revoked with the approval of the [state tax agency].

2. Membership in a commonly controlled group shall be treated as terminated in any year, or fraction thereof, in which the conditions of subsection (B) are not met, except as follows:

- a. When stock of a corporation is sold, exchanged, or otherwise disposed of, the membership of a corporation in a commonly controlled group shall not be terminated, if the requirements of subsection (B) are again met immediately after the sale, exchange, or disposition.
- b. The [state tax agency] may treat the commonly controlled group as remaining in place if the conditions of subsection B are again met within a period not to exceed two years.

(D) A taxpayer may exclude some or all corporations included in a "commonly controlled group" by reason of paragraph 4 of subsection (B) by showing that

those members of the group are not controlled directly or indirectly by the same interests, within the meaning of the same phrase in Section 482 of the Internal Revenue Code. For purposes of this subsection, the term "controlled" includes any kind of control, direct or indirect, whether legally enforceable, and however exercisable or exercised.

(E) Except as otherwise provided, stock is "owned" when title to the stock is directly held or if the stock is constructively owned.

1. An individual constructively owns stock that is owned by any of the following:
  - a. His or her spouse.
  - b. Children, including adopted children, of that individual or the individual's spouse, who have not attained the age of 21 years.
  - c. An estate or trust, of which the individual is an executor, trustee, or grantor, to the extent that the estate or trust is for the benefit of that individual's spouse or children.
2. Stock owned by a corporation, or a member of a controlled group of which the corporation is the parent corporation, is constructively owned by any shareholder owning stock that represents more than 50 percent of the voting power of the corporation.
3. In the application of paragraph 4 of subsection (B) (dealing with stock possessing voting power held by members of the same family), if more than 50% of the stock possessing voting power of a corporation is, in the aggregate, owned by or for the benefit of members of the same family, stock owned by that corporation shall be treated as constructively owned by members of that family in the same ratio as the proportion of their respective ownership of stock possessing voting power in that corporation to all of such stock of that corporation.
4. Except as otherwise provided, stock owned by a partnership is constructively owned by any partner, other than a limited partner, in proportion to the partner's capital interest in the partnership. For this purpose, a partnership is treated as owning proportionately the stock owned by any other partnership in which it has a tiered interest, other than as a limited partner.
5. In any case where a member of a commonly controlled group, or shareholders, officers, directors, or employees of a member of a commonly controlled group, is a general partner in a limited partnership, stock held by the limited partnership is constructively owned by a limited partner to the extent of its capital interest in the limited partnership.

6. In the application of paragraph 4 of subsection (B) (dealing with stock possessing voting power held by members of the same family), stock held by a limited partnership is constructively owned by a limited partner to the extent of the limited partner's capital interest in the limited partnership.

(F) For purposes of the definition of a commonly controlled group, each of the following shall apply:

1. "Corporation" means a subchapter S corporation, any other incorporated entity, or any entity defined or treated as a corporation (including but not limited to a limited liability company) pursuant to [insert your State statute].
2. "Person" means an individual, a trust, an estate, a qualified employee benefit plan, a limited partnership, or a corporation.
3. "Voting power" means the power of all classes of stock entitled to vote that possess the power to elect the membership of the board of directors of the corporation.
4. "More than 50 percent of the voting power" means voting power sufficient to elect a majority of the membership of the board of directors of the corporation.
5. "Stock possessing voting power" includes stock where ownership is retained but the actual voting power is transferred in either of the following manners:
  - a. For one year or less.
  - b. By proxy, voting trust, written shareholder agreement, or by similar device, where the transfer is revocable by the transferor.
6. In the case of an entity treated as a corporation under paragraph 1 of subsection (F), "stock possessing voting power" refers to an instrument, contract, or similar document demonstrating an ownership interest in that entity that confers power in the owner to cast a vote in the selection of the management of that entity.
7. In the general application of this section, if an entity may elect to be treated as a partnership or as a corporation under the laws of this state (or under Section 7701 of the Internal Revenue Code), and elects to be treated as a partnership, that entity shall be treated as a general partnership. If, however, contractual agreements, member agreements, or other restrictions limit the power of some or all of the members to participate in the vote of stock possessing voting power owned by that entity (similar to the restrictions of limited partners in a limited partnership), the [state tax agency] may permit or require that entity to be treated as a limited partnership.

(G) The [state tax agency] may prescribe any regulations as may be necessary or appropriate to carry out the purposes of this section, including, but not limited to, regulations that do the following:

1. Prescribe terms and conditions relating to the election described by subsection (C), and the revocation thereof.
2. Disregard transfers of voting power not described by paragraph 5 of subsection (F).
3. Treat entities not described by paragraph 2 of subsection (F) as a person.
4. Treat warrants, obligations convertible into stock, options to acquire or sell stock, and similar instruments as stock.
5. Treat holders of a beneficial interest in, or executor or trustee powers over, stock held by an estate or trust as constructively owned by the holder.
6. Prescribe rules relating to the treatment of partnership agreements which authorize a particular partner or partners to exercise voting power of stock held by the partnership.
7. Treat limited partners as constructive owners of stock possessing voting power held by the limited partnership, in proportion to their interest in the partnership.

\*\*\* Reg. IV.1.(c). **Business and Nonbusiness Income: Application of Definitions.** The following applies the foregoing principles for purposes of determining whether particular income is business or nonbusiness income. [(The examples used throughout these regulations are illustrative only and are limited to the facts they contain.)]

(1) **Rents from real and tangible personal property.** Rental income from real and tangible property is business income if the property with respect to which the rental income was received is or was used in the taxpayer's trade or business and therefore is includable in the property factor under Regulation IV.10. Property that has been converted to nonbusiness use (see IV.1.(a).(4)(A)) has lost its character as a business asset and is not subject to the rule of the preceding sentence.

[*Example (i):* The taxpayer operates a multistate car rental business. The income from car rentals is business income.

[*Example (ii):* The taxpayer is engaged in the heavy construction business in which it uses equipment such as cranes, tractors, and earth-moving vehicles. The taxpayer makes short-term leases of the equipment when particular pieces of equipment are not needed on any particular project. The rental income is business

income.

*Example (iii):* The taxpayer operates a multistate chain of men's clothing stores. The taxpayer purchases a five-story office building for use in connection with its trade or business. It uses the street floor as one of its retail stores and the second and third floors for its general corporate headquarters. The remaining two floors are held for future use in the trade or business and are leased to tenants on a short-term basis in the meantime. The rental income is business income.

*Example (iv):* The taxpayer operates a multistate chain of grocery stores. It purchases as an investment an office building in another state with surplus funds and leases the entire building to others. The net rental income is not business income of the grocery store trade or business. Therefore, the net rental income is nonbusiness income.

*Example (v):* The taxpayer operates a multistate chain of men's clothing stores. The taxpayer invests in a 20-story office building and uses the street floor as one of its retail stores and the second floor for its general corporate headquarters. The remaining 18 floors are leased to others. The rental of the eighteen floors is not done in furtherance of but rather is separate from the operation of the taxpayer's trade or business. The net rental income is not business income of the clothing store trade or business. Therefore, the net rental income is nonbusiness income.

*Example (vi):* The taxpayer constructed a plant for use in its multistate manufacturing business and 20 years later the plant was closed and put up for sale. The plant was rented for a temporary period from the time it was closed by the taxpayer until it was sold 18 months later. The rental income is business income and the gain on the sale of the plant is business income.

*Example (vii):* The taxpayer operates a multistate chain of grocery stores. It owned an office building which it occupied as its corporate headquarters. Because of inadequate space, taxpayer acquired a new and larger building elsewhere for its corporate headquarters. The old building was rented to an investment company under a five-year lease. Upon expiration of the lease, taxpayer sold the building at a gain (or loss). The net rental income received over the lease period is nonbusiness income and the gain (or loss) on the sale of the building is nonbusiness income.]

(2) **Gains or losses from sales of assets.** Gain or loss from the sale, exchange or other disposition of real property or of tangible or intangible personal property constitutes business income if the property while owned by the taxpayer was used in, or was otherwise included in the property factor of the taxpayer's trade or business. However, if the property was utilized for the production of nonbusiness income or otherwise was removed from the property factor before its sale, exchange or other disposition, the gain or loss will constitute nonbusiness income. See Regulation

IV.10.

*Example (i):* In conducting its multistate manufacturing business, the taxpayer systematically replaces automobiles, machines, and other equipment used in the business. The gains or losses resulting from those sales constitute business income.

*Example (ii):* The taxpayer constructed a plant for use in its multistate manufacturing business and 20 years later sold the property at a gain while it was in operation by the taxpayer. The gain is business income.

*Example (iii):* Same as (ii) except that the plant was closed and put up for sale but was not in fact sold until a buyer was found 18 months later. The gain is business income.

*Example (iv):* Same as (ii) except that the plant was rented while being held for sale. The rental income is business income and the gain on the sale of the plant is business income.

*Example (v):* The taxpayer operates a multistate chain of grocery stores. It owned an office building which it occupied as its corporate headquarters. Because of inadequate space, taxpayer acquired a new and larger building elsewhere for its corporate headquarters. Because the taxpayer did not intend to reoccupy the old building, the taxpayer rented the old building to an unrelated investment company under a five-year lease. Upon expiration of the lease, taxpayer sold the building at a gain (or loss). The gain (or loss) on the sale is nonbusiness income and the rental income received over the lease period is nonbusiness income.]

**(3) Interest.** Interest income is business income where the intangible with respect to which the interest was received arose out of or was created in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business operations or where the acquiring and holding the intangible is an integral, functional, or operative component of the taxpayer's trade or business operations, or otherwise materially contributes to the production of business income of the trade or business operations.

*Example (i):* The taxpayer operates a multistate chain of department stores, selling for cash and on credit. Service charges, interest, or time-price differentials and the like are received with respect to installment sales and revolving charge accounts. These amounts are business income.

*Example (ii):* The taxpayer conducts a multistate manufacturing business. During the year the taxpayer receives a federal income tax refund pertaining to the taxpayer's trade or business and collects a judgment against a debtor of the business. Both the tax refund and the judgment bear interest. The interest income is business income.

*Example (iii):* The taxpayer is engaged in a multistate manufacturing and wholesaling business. In connection with that business, the taxpayer maintains special accounts to cover such items as workmen's compensation claims, rain and storm damage, machinery replacement, etc. The moneys in those accounts are invested at interest. Similarly, the taxpayer temporarily invests funds intended for payment of federal, state and local tax obligations pertaining to the taxpayer's trade or business. The interest income is business income.

*Example (iv):* The taxpayer is engaged in a multistate money order and traveler's check business. In addition to the fees received in connection with the sale of the money orders and traveler's checks, the taxpayer earns interest income by the investment of the funds pending their redemption. The interest income is business income.

*Example (v):* The taxpayer is engaged in a multistate manufacturing and selling business. The taxpayer usually has working capital and extra cash totaling \$200,000 which it regularly invests in short-term interest bearing securities. The interest income is business income.

*Example (vi):* In January, the taxpayer sold all of the stock of a subsidiary for \$20,000,000. The funds are placed in an interest-bearing account pending a decision by management as to how the funds are to be utilized. The interest income is nonbusiness income.]

**(4) Dividends.** Dividends are business income where the stock with respect to which the dividends was received arose out of or was acquired in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business operations or where the acquiring and holding the stock is an integral, functional, or operative component of the taxpayer's trade or business operations, or otherwise materially contributes to the production of business income of the trade or business operations.

[*Example (i):* The taxpayer operates a multistate chain of stock brokerage houses. During the year, the taxpayer receives dividends on stock that it owns. The dividends are business income.

*Example (ii):* The taxpayer is engaged in a multistate manufacturing and wholesaling business. In connection with that business, the taxpayer maintains special accounts to cover such items as workmen's compensation claims, etc. A portion of the moneys in those accounts is invested in interest-bearing bonds. The remainder is invested in various common stocks listed on national stock exchanges. Both the interest income and any dividends are business income.

*Example (iii):* The taxpayer and several unrelated corporations own all of the stock of a corporation whose business operations consist solely of acquiring and processing materials for delivery to the corporate owners. The taxpayer acquired the stock in order to obtain a source of supply of materials used in its

manufacturing business. The dividends are business income.

*Example (iv):* The taxpayer is engaged in a multistate heavy construction business. Much of its construction work is performed for agencies of the federal government and various state governments. Under state and federal laws applicable to contracts for these agencies, a contractor must have adequate bonding capacity, as measured by the ratio of its current assets (cash and marketable securities) to current liabilities. In order to maintain an adequate bonding capacity the taxpayer holds various stocks and interest-bearing securities. Both the interest income and any dividends received are business income.

*Example (v):* The taxpayer receives dividends from the stock of its subsidiary or affiliate which acts as the marketing agency for products manufactured by the taxpayer. The dividends are business income.

*Example (vi):* The taxpayer is engaged in a multistate glass manufacturing business. It also holds a portfolio of stock and interest-bearing securities, the acquisition and holding of which are unrelated to the manufacturing business. The dividends and interest income received are nonbusiness income.]

**(5) Patent and copyright royalties.** Patent and copyright royalties are business income where the patent or copyright with respect to which the royalties were received arose out of or was created in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business operations or where the acquiring and holding the patent or copyright is an integral, functional, or operative component of the taxpayer's trade or business operations, or otherwise materially contributes to the production of business income of the trade or business operations.

*Example (i):* The taxpayer is engaged in the multistate business of manufacturing and selling industrial chemicals. In connection with that business, the taxpayer obtained patents on certain of its products. The taxpayer licensed the production of the chemicals in foreign countries, in return for which the taxpayer receives royalties. The royalties received by the taxpayer are business income.

*Example (ii):* The taxpayer is engaged in the music publishing business and holds copyrights on numerous songs. The taxpayer acquires the assets of a smaller publishing company, including music copyrights. These acquired copyrights are thereafter used by the taxpayer in its business. Any royalties received on these copyrights are business income.

*Example (iii):* Same as example (ii), except that the acquired company also held the patent on a method of producing digital audio recordings. The taxpayer does not manufacture or sell digital audio recordings. Any royalties received on the patent would be nonbusiness income.]

\*\*\* Reg. IV.1.(d). **Proration of Deductions.** In most cases, an allowable deduction of a

taxpayer will be applicable to only the business income arising from a particular trade or business or to a particular item of nonbusiness income. In some cases, an allowable deduction may be applicable to the business incomes of more than one trade or business and/or to several items of nonbusiness income. In such cases, the deduction shall be prorated among those trades or businesses and those items of nonbusiness income in a manner which fairly distributes the deduction among the classes of income to which it is applicable.

(1) **Year to year consistency.** In filing returns with this state, if the taxpayer departs from or modifies the manner of prorating any such deduction used in returns for prior years, the taxpayer shall disclose in the return for the current year the nature and extent of the modification.

(2) **State to state consistency.** If the returns or reports filed by a taxpayer with all states to which the taxpayer reports under Article IV of this Compact or the Uniform Division of Income for Tax Purposes Act are not uniform in the application or proration of any deduction, the taxpayer shall disclose in its return to this state the nature and extent of the variance.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.2.(a). Definitions.**

(1) "Taxpayer" means [each state should insert the definition in Article II.3. or the definition in its own tax laws].

(2) "Apportionment" refers to the division of business income between states by the use of a formula containing apportionment factors.

(3) "Allocation" refers to the assignment of nonbusiness income to a particular state.

(4) "Business activity" refers to the transactions and activities occurring in the regular course of a particular trade or business of a taxpayer or to the acquisition, management, and disposition of property that constitute integral parts of the taxpayer's regular trade or business operations.

[Ed. Note: The term "business activity" is used in the following MTC regulations:

- IV.1.(b), *example*;
- IV.2.(b).(1);
- IV.3.(a).;
- IV.3.(a).(1);
- IV.3.(a).(2);
- IV.3.(b).(1);
- IV.3.(b).(1)(A);

- IV.3.(b).(1)(B);
- IV.3.(b).(1)(B), *example*;
- IV.3.(b).(2);
- IV.3.(b).(2), *example (i)*;
- IV.3.(b).(2), *example (iv)*;
- IV.3.(c).;
- IV.18.(a).;
- IV.18.(a).(3);
- IV.18.h.(4)(iii)A.2.;
- IV.18.(j).(1);
- IV.18.(j).(3)(i)B.2.;
- IV.18.(j).(3)(i)B.3.; and
- The financial institution apportionment principles to the extent that States adopt the uniformity recommendation as a regulation that is folded into the existing MTC regulations and thereby picks up the floating definition of "business activity".]

(5) "Gross receipts" are the gross amounts realized (the sum of money and the fair market value of other property or services received) on the sale or exchange of property, the performance of services, or the use of property or capital (including rents, royalties, interest and dividends) in a transaction which produces business income, in which the income or loss is recognized (or would be recognized if the transaction were in the United States) under the Internal Revenue Code. Amounts realized on the sale or exchange of property are not reduced for the cost of goods sold or the basis of property sold. Gross receipts, even if business income, do not include such items as, for example:

- 1) repayment, maturity, or redemption of the principal of a loan, bond, or mutual fund or certificate of deposit or similar marketable instrument;
- 2) the principal amount received under a repurchase agreement or other transaction properly characterized as a loan;
- 3) proceeds from issuance of the taxpayer's own stock or from sale of treasury stock;
- 4) damages and other amounts received as the result of litigation;
- 5) property acquired by an agent on behalf of another;
- 6) tax refunds and other tax benefit recoveries;
- 7) pension reversions;
- 8) contributions to capital (except for sales of securities by securities dealers);
- 9) income from forgiveness of indebtedness; or
- 10) amounts realized from exchanges of inventory that are not recognized by the Internal Revenue Code.

Exclusion of an item from the definition of "gross receipts" is not determinative of its character as business or nonbusiness income. Nothing in this definition shall be construed to modify, impair or supersede any provision of Section IV.18.

--- Reg. IV.2.(b)(1). Application of Article IV: Apportionment. If the business

activity in respect to any trade or business of a taxpayer occurs both within and without this state, and if by reason of such business activity the taxpayer is taxable in another state, the portion of the net income (or net loss) arising from such trade or business which is derived from sources within this state shall be determined by apportionment in accordance with Article IV.9. to IV.17.

... **Reg. IV.2.(b)(2). Application of Article IV: Combined Report.** If a particular trade or business is carried on by a taxpayer and one or more affiliated corporations, nothing in Article IV or in these regulations shall preclude the use of a "combined report" whereby the entire business income of such trade or business is apportioned in accordance with Article IV.9. to IV.17.

... **Reg. IV.2.(b)(3). Application of Article IV: Allocation.** Any taxpayer subject to the taxing jurisdiction of this state shall allocate all of its nonbusiness income or loss within or without this state in accordance with Article IV.4. to IV.8.

... **Reg. IV.2.(c). Consistency and Uniformity in Reporting.**

(1) **Year to year consistency.** In filing returns with this state, if the taxpayer departs from or modifies the manner in which income has been classified as business income or nonbusiness income in returns for prior years, the taxpayer shall disclose in the return for the current year the nature and extent of the modification.

(2) **State to state consistency.** If the returns or reports filed by a taxpayer for all states to which the taxpayer reports under Article IV of this Compact or the Uniform Division of Income for Tax Purposes Act are not uniform in the classification of income as business or nonbusiness income, the taxpayer shall disclose in its return to this state the nature and extent of the variance.

... **Reg. IV.3.(a). Taxable in Another State: In General.** Under Article IV.2. the taxpayer is subject to the allocation and apportionment provisions of Article IV if it has income from business activity that is taxable both within and without this state. A taxpayer's income from business activity is taxable without this state if the taxpayer, by reason of such business activity (i.e., the transactions and activity occurring in the regular course of a particular trade or business), is taxable in another state within the meaning of Article IV.3.

(1) **Applicable tests.** A taxpayer is taxable within another state if it meets either one of two tests: (1) By reason of business activity in another state, the taxpayer is subject to one of the types of taxes specified in Article IV.3.(1), namely: A net income tax, a franchise tax measured by net income, a franchise tax for the privilege of doing business, or a corporate stock tax; or (2) By reason of such business activity, another state has jurisdiction to subject the taxpayer to a net income tax, regardless of whether or not

the state imposes such a tax on the taxpayer.

(2) **Producing nonbusiness income.** A taxpayer is not taxable in another state with respect to a particular trade or business merely because the taxpayer conducts activities in that other state pertaining to the production of nonbusiness income or business activities relating to a separate trade or business.

**... Reg. IV.3.(b). Taxable in Another State: When a Corporation Is "Subject to" a Tax under Article IV.3.(1).**

(1) A taxpayer is "subject to" one of the taxes specified in Article IV.3.(1) if it carries on business activities in a state and the state imposes such a tax thereon. Any taxpayer which asserts that it is subject to one of the taxes specified in Article IV.3.(1) in another state shall furnish to the [tax administrator] of this state upon his/her request evidence to support that assertion. The [tax administrator] of this state may request that such evidence include proof that the taxpayer has filed the requisite tax return in the other state and has paid any taxes imposed under the law of the other state; the taxpayer's failure to produce such proof may be taken into account in determining whether the taxpayer in fact is subject to one of the taxes specified in Article IV.3.(1) in the other state.

**Voluntary tax payment.** If the taxpayer voluntarily files and pays one or more of such taxes when not required to do so by the laws of that state or pays a minimal fee for qualification, organization or for the privilege of doing business in that state, but

(A) does not actually engage in business activity in that state, or

(B) does actually engage in some business activity not sufficient for nexus and the minimum tax bears no relationship to the taxpayer's business activity within such state, the taxpayer is not "subject to" one of the taxes specified within the meaning of Article IV.3.(1).

*Example:* State A has a corporation franchise tax measured by net income for the privilege of doing business in that state. Corporation X files a return and pays the \$50 minimum tax, although it carries on no business activity in State A. Corporation X is not taxable in State A.

(2) The concept of taxability in another state is based upon the premise that every state in which the taxpayer is engaged in business activity may impose an income tax even though every state does not do so. In states which do not, other types of taxes may be imposed as a substitute for an income tax. Therefore, only those taxes enumerated in Article IV.3.(1) which may be considered as basically revenue raising rather than regulatory measures shall be considered in determining whether the taxpayer is "subject to" one of the taxes specified in Article IV.3.(1) in another state.

*Example (i):* State A requires all nonresident corporations which qualify or register in State A to pay to the Secretary of State an annual license fee or tax for the privilege of doing business in the state regardless of whether the privilege is in fact exercised. The amount paid is determined according to the total authorized capital stock of the corporation; the rates are progressively higher by bracketed amounts. The statute sets a minimum fee of \$50 and a maximum fee of \$500. Failure to pay the tax bars a corporation from utilizing the state courts for enforcement of its rights. State A also imposes a corporation income tax. Nonresident Corporation X is qualified in State A and pays the required fee to the Secretary of State but does not carry on any business activity in State A (although it may utilize the courts of State A). Corporation X is not "taxable" in State A.

*Example (ii):* Same facts as Example (i) except that Corporation X is subject to and pays the corporation income tax. Payment is prima facie evidence that Corporation X is "subject to" the net income tax of State A and is "taxable" in State A.

*Example (iii):* State B requires all nonresident corporations qualified or registered in State B to pay to the Secretary of State an annual permit fee or tax for doing business in the state. The base of the fee or tax is the sum of (1) outstanding capital stock, and (2) surplus and undivided profits. The fee or tax base attributable to State B is determined by a three factor apportionment formula. Nonresident Corporation X which operates a plant in State B, pays the required fee or tax to the Secretary of State. Corporation X is "taxable" in State B.

*Example (iv):* State A has a corporation franchise tax measured by net income for the privilege of doing business in that state. Corporation X files a return based upon its business activity in the state but the amount of computed liability is less than the minimum tax. Corporation X pays the minimum tax. Corporation X is subject to State A's corporation franchise tax.

\*\*\* Reg. IV.3.(c). **Taxable in Another State: When a State Has Jurisdiction to Subject a Taxpayer to a Net Income Tax.** The second test, that of Article IV.3.(2), applies if the taxpayer's business activity is sufficient to give the state jurisdiction to impose a net income tax by reason of such business activity under the Constitution and statutes of the United States. Jurisdiction to tax is not present where the state is prohibited from imposing the tax by reason of the provisions of Public Law 86-272, 15 U.S.C.A. §§ 381-385. In the case of any "state" as defined in Article IV.1.(h), other than a state of the United States or political subdivision thereof, the determination of whether the "state" has jurisdiction to subject the taxpayer to a net income tax shall be made as though the jurisdictional standards applicable to a state of the United States applied in that "state." If jurisdiction is otherwise present, that "state" is not considered as being without jurisdiction by reason of the provisions of a treaty between that "state" and the United States.

*Example:* Corporation X is actively engaged in manufacturing farm equipment in State A and in foreign country B. Both State A and foreign country B impose a net income tax but foreign country B exempts corporations engaged in manufacturing farm equipment. Corporation X is subject to the jurisdiction of State A and foreign country B.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.9. Apportionment Formula.** All business income of each trade or business of the taxpayer shall be apportioned to this state by use of the apportionment formula set forth in Article IV.9. The elements of the apportionment formula are the property factor (see Regulation IV.10.), the payroll factor (see Regulation IV.13.) and the sales factor (see Regulation IV.15.) of the trade or business of the taxpayer.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.10.(a). Property Factor: In General.** The property factor of the apportionment formula for each trade or business of the taxpayer shall include all real and tangible personal property owned or rented by the taxpayer and used during the tax period in the regular course of the trade or business. The term "real and tangible personal property" includes land, buildings, machinery, stocks of goods, equipment, and other real and tangible personal property but does not include coin or currency. Property used in connection with the production of nonbusiness income shall be excluded from the property factor. Property used both in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business and in the production of nonbusiness income shall be included in the factor only to the extent that the property is used in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business. The method of determining that portion of the value to be included in the factor will depend upon the facts of each case. The property factor shall include the average value of property includable in the factor. See Regulation IV.12.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.10.(b). Property Factor: Property Used for the Production of Business Income.** Property shall be included in the property factor if it is actually used or is available for or capable of being used during the tax period in the regular course of the trade or business of the taxpayer. Property held as reserves or standby facilities or property held as a reserve source of materials shall be included in the factor. For example, a plant temporarily idle or raw material reserves not currently being processed are includable in the factor. Property or equipment under construction during the tax period (except inventoriable goods in process) shall be excluded from the factor until such property is actually used in the regular course of the trade or business of the taxpayer. If the property is partially used in the regular course of the trade or business of the taxpayer while under construction, the value of the property to the extent used shall be included in the property factor. Property used in the regular course of the trade or business of the taxpayer shall remain in the property factor until its permanent withdrawal is established by an identifiable event such as its conversion to the production of nonbusiness income, its sale, or the lapse of an extended period of time (normally, five years) during which the property is no longer held for use in the trade or business.

*[Example (i):* Taxpayer closed its manufacturing plant in State X and held the

property for sale. The property remained vacant until its sale one year later. The value of the manufacturing plant is included in the property factor until the plant is sold.

*Example (ii):* Same as above except that the property was rented until the plant was sold. The plant is included in the property factor until the plant is sold.

*Example (iii):* Taxpayer closed its manufacturing plant and leased the building under a five-year lease. The plant is included in the property factor until the commencement of the lease.

*Example (iv):* The taxpayer operates a chain of retail grocery stores. Taxpayer closed Store A, which was then remodeled into three small retail stores such as a dress shop, dry cleaning, and barber shop, which were leased to unrelated parties. The property is removed from the property factor on the date on which the remodeling of Store A commenced.]

**--- Reg. IV.10.(c). Property Factor: Consistency in Reporting.**

(1) **Year to year consistency.** In filing returns with this state, if the taxpayer departs from or modifies the manner of valuing property or of excluding property from or including property in the property factor used in returns for prior years, the taxpayer shall disclose in the return for the current year the nature and extent of the modification.

(2) **State to state consistency.** If the returns or reports filed by the taxpayer with all states to which the taxpayer reports under Article IV of this Compact or the Uniform Division of Income for Tax Purposes Act are not uniform in the valuation of property and in the exclusion of property from or the inclusion of property in the property factor, the taxpayer shall disclose in its return to this state the nature and extent of the variance.

**--- Reg. IV.10.(d). Property Factor: Numerator.** The numerator of the property factor shall include the average value of the real and tangible personal property owned or rented by the taxpayer and used in this state during the tax period in the regular course of the trade or business of the taxpayer. Property in transit between locations of the taxpayer to which it belongs shall be considered to be at the destination for purposes of the property factor. Property in transit between a buyer and seller which is included by a taxpayer in the denominator of its property factor in accordance with its regular accounting practices shall be included in the numerator according to the state of destination. The value of mobile or movable property such as construction equipment, trucks or leased electronic equipment which are located within and without this state during the tax period shall be determined for purposes of the numerator of the factor on the basis of total time within the state during the tax period. An automobile assigned to a traveling employee shall be included in the numerator of the factor of the state to which the employee's compensation is assigned under the payroll factor or in the numerator of the state in which the automobile is licensed.

\*\*\* Reg. IV.11.(a). Property Factor: Valuation of Owned Property.

(1) Property owned by the taxpayer shall be valued at its original cost. As a general rule, "original cost" is deemed to be the basis of the property for federal income tax purposes (prior to any federal adjustments) at the time of acquisition by the taxpayer and adjusted by subsequent capital additions or improvements thereto and partial disposition thereof, by reason of sale, exchange, abandonment, etc. However, capitalized intangible drilling and development costs shall be included in the property factor whether or not they have been expensed for either federal or state tax purposes. [This last sentence was added on July 14, 1988.]

*Example (i):* The taxpayer acquired a factory building in this state at a cost of \$500,000 and, 18 months later, expended \$100,000 for major remodeling of the building. Taxpayer files its return for the current taxable year on the calendar-year basis. Depreciation deduction in the amount of \$22,000 was claimed with respect to the building on the return for the current taxable year. The value of the building includable in the numerator and denominator of the property factor is \$600,000; the depreciation deduction is not taken into account in determining the value of the building for purposes of the factor.

*Example (ii):* During the current taxable year, Corporation X merges into Corporation Y in a tax-free reorganization under the Internal Revenue Code. At the time of the merger, Corporation X owns a factory which X built five years earlier at a cost of \$1,000,000. X has been depreciating the factory at the rate of two percent per year, and its basis in X's hands at the time of the merger is \$900,000. Since the property is acquired by Y in a transaction in which, under the Internal Revenue Code, its basis in Y's hands is the same as its basis in X's hands, Y includes the property in Y's property factor at X's original cost, without adjustment for depreciation, i.e. \$1,000,000.

*Example (iii):* Corporation Y acquires the assets of Corporation X in a liquidation by which Y is entitled to use its stock cost as the basis of the X assets under Section 334(b)(2) of the 1954 Internal Revenue Code (i.e. stock possessing 80 percent control is purchased and liquidated within two years). Under these circumstances, Y's cost of the assets is the purchase price of the X stock, prorated over the X assets.

If the original cost of property is unascertainable, the property is included in the factor at its fair market value as of the date of acquisition by the taxpayer.

(2) Inventory of stock of goods shall be included in the factor in accordance with the valuation method used for federal income tax purposes.

(3) Property acquired by gift or inheritance shall be included in the factor at its basis for determining depreciation for federal income tax purposes.

\*\*\* Reg. IV.11.(b). Property Factor: Valuation of Rented Property.

(1) **Multiplier and subrentals.** Property rented by the taxpayer is valued at eight times its net annual rental rate. The net annual rental rate for any item of rented property is the annual rental rate paid by the taxpayer for the property less the aggregate annual subrental rates paid by subtenants of the taxpayer. (See Regulation IV.18.(a) for special rules when the use of such net annual rental rate produces a negative or clearly inaccurate value or when property is used by the taxpayer at no charge or is rented at a nominal rental rate.) Subrents are not deducted when they constitute business income because the property which produces the subrents is used in the regular course of a trade or business of the taxpayer when it is producing such income. Accordingly there is no reduction in its value.

*Example (i):* The taxpayer receives subrents from a bakery concession in a food market operated by the taxpayer. Since the subrents are business income, they are not deducted from rent paid by the taxpayer for the food market.

*[Example (ii):* The taxpayer rents a 5-story office building primarily for use in its multistate business, uses three floors for its offices and subleases two floors to various other businesses on a short-term basis because it anticipates it will need those two floors for future expansion of its multistate business. The rental of all five floors is integral to the operation of the taxpayer's trade or business. Since the subrents are business income, they are not deducted from the rent paid by the taxpayer.]

*Example (iii):* The taxpayer rents a 20-story office building and uses the lower two stories for its general corporation headquarters. The remaining 18 floors are subleased to others. The rental of the eighteen floors is not incidental to but rather is separate from the operation of the taxpayer's trade or business. Since the subrents are nonbusiness income they are to be deducted from the rent paid by the taxpayer.]

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.12. Property Factor: Averaging Property Values.** As a general rule, the average value of property owned by the taxpayer shall be determined by averaging the values at the beginning and ending of the tax period. However, the [tax administrator] may require or allow averaging by monthly values if that method of averaging is required to properly reflect the average value of the taxpayer's property for the tax period.

Averaging by monthly values will generally be applied if substantial fluctuations in the values of the property exist during the tax period or if property is acquired after the beginning of the tax period or disposed of before the end of the tax period.

*Example:* The monthly value of the taxpayer's property was as follows:

January	\$2,000	July	\$15,000
February	2,000	August	17,000

March	3,000	September	23,000
April	3,500	October	25,000
May	4,500	November	13,000
June	<u>10,000</u>	December	<u>2,000</u>
	\$25,000		\$95,000
		Total	<u>\$120,000</u>

The average value of the taxpayer's property includable in the property factor for the income year is determined as follows:

$$\frac{\$120,000}{12} = \$10,000$$

Averaging with respect to rented property is achieved automatically by the method of determining the net annual rental rate of such property as set forth in Reg. IV.11.(b).

\*\*\* Reg. IV.13.(a). Payroll Factor: In General.

(1) The payroll factor of the apportionment formula for each trade or business of the taxpayer shall include the total amount paid by the taxpayer in the regular course of its trade or business for compensation during the tax period.

(2) The total amount "paid" to employees is determined upon the basis of the taxpayer's accounting method. If the taxpayer has adopted the accrual method of accounting, all compensation properly accrued shall be deemed to have been paid. Notwithstanding the taxpayer's method of accounting, compensation paid to employees may, at the election of the taxpayer, be included in the payroll factor by use of the cash method if the taxpayer is required to report such compensation under that method for unemployment compensation purposes. The compensation of any employee on account of activities which are connected with the production of nonbusiness income shall be excluded from the factor.

[*Example (i)*]: The taxpayer uses some of its employees in the construction of a storage building which, upon completion, is used in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business. The wages paid to those employees are treated as a capital expenditure by the taxpayer. The amount of those wages is included in the payroll factor.

*Example (ii)*: The taxpayer owns various securities which it holds as an investment separate and apart from its trade or business. The management of the taxpayer's investment portfolio is the only duty of Mr. X, an employee. The salary paid to Mr. X is excluded from the payroll factor.]

... **Reg. IV.13.(b). Payroll Factor: Denominator.** The denominator of the payroll factor is the total compensation paid everywhere during the tax period. Accordingly, compensation paid to employees whose services are performed entirely in a state where the taxpayer is immune from taxation, for example, by Public Law 86-272, is included in the denominator of the payroll factor.

*Example:* A taxpayer has employees in its state of legal domicile (State A) and is taxable in State B. In addition the taxpayer has other employees whose services are performed entirely in State C where the taxpayer is immune from taxation under the provisions of Public Law 86-272. As to these latter employees, the compensation will be assigned to State C where their services are performed (i.e., included in the denominator but not the numerator of the payroll factor) even though the taxpayer is not taxable in State C.

... **Reg. IV.13.(c). Payroll Factor: Numerator.** The numerator of the payroll factor is the total amount paid in this state during the tax period by the taxpayer for compensation. The tests in Article IV.14. to be applied in determining whether compensation is paid in this state are derived from the Model Unemployment Compensation Act. Accordingly, if compensation paid to employees is included in the payroll factor by use of the cash method of accounting or if the taxpayer is required to report such compensation under that method for unemployment compensation purposes, it shall be presumed that the total wages reported by the taxpayer to this state for unemployment compensation purposes constitute compensation paid in this state except for compensation excluded under Regulation IV.13.(a). to IV.14. The presumption may be overcome by satisfactory evidence that an employee's compensation is not properly reportable to this state for unemployment compensation purposes.

... **Reg. IV.14. Payroll Factor: Compensation Paid in This State.** Compensation is paid in this state if any one of the following tests, applied consecutively, are met:

- (1) The employee's service is performed entirely within the state.
- (2) The employee's service is performed both within and without the state, but the service performed without the state is incidental to the employee's service within the state. The word "incidental" means any service which is temporary or transitory in nature, or which is rendered in connection with an isolated transaction.
- (3) If the employee's services are performed both within and without this state, the employee's compensation will be attributed to this state:
  - (A) if the employee's base of operations is in this state; or
  - (B) if there is no base of operations in any state in which some part of the service

is performed, but the place from which the service is directed or controlled is in this state;  
or

(C) if the base of operations or the place from which the service is directed or controlled is not in any state in which some part of the service is performed but the employee's residence is in this state.

The term "place from which the service is directed or controlled" refers to the place from which the power to direct or control is exercised by the taxpayer.

The term "base of operations" is the place of more or less permanent nature from which the employee starts his work and to which he customarily returns in order to receive instructions from the taxpayer or communications from his customers or other persons or to replenish stock or other materials, repair equipment, or perform any other functions necessary to the exercise of his trade or profession at some other point or points.

**\*\*\* Reg. IV.15.(a). Sales Factor: In General.**

(1) Article IV.1.(g) defines the term "sales" to mean all gross receipts of the taxpayer not allocated under paragraphs (5) through (8) of Article IV. Thus, for the purposes of the sales factor of the apportionment formula for each trade or business of the taxpayer, the term "sales" means all gross receipts derived by the taxpayer from transactions and activity in the regular course of the trade or business. The following are rules for determining "sales" in various situations:

(A) In the case of a taxpayer engaged in manufacturing and selling or purchasing and reselling goods or products, "sales" includes all gross receipts from the sales of such goods or products (or other property of a kind which would properly be included in the inventory of the taxpayer if on hand at the close of the tax period) held by the taxpayer primarily for sale to customers in the ordinary course of its trade or business. Gross receipts for this purpose means gross sales less returns and allowances, and includes all interest income, service charges, carrying charges, or time-price differential charges incidental to such sales. Federal and state excise taxes (including sales taxes) shall be included as part of such receipts if the taxes are passed on to the buyer or included as part of the selling price of the product.

(B) In the case of cost plus fixed fee contracts, such as the operation of a government-owned plant for a fee, "sales" includes the entire reimbursed cost plus the fee.

(C) In the case of a taxpayer engaged in providing services, such as the operation of an advertising agency or the performance of equipment service contracts or research and development contracts, "sales" includes the gross receipts from the performance of such services, including fees, commissions, and similar items.

(D) In the case of a taxpayer engaged in renting real or tangible property, "sales" includes the gross receipts from the rental, lease, or licensing the use of the property.

(E) In the case of a taxpayer engaged in the sale, assignment, or licensing of intangible personal property such as patents and copyrights, "sales" includes the gross receipts therefrom.

(F) If a taxpayer derives receipts from the sale of equipment used in its business, those receipts constitute sales. For example, a truck express company owns a fleet of trucks and sells its trucks under a regular replacement program. The gross receipts from the sales of the trucks are included in the sales factor.

(2) **Exceptions.** In some cases certain gross receipts should be disregarded in determining the sales factor in order that the apportionment formula will operate fairly to apportion to this state the income of the taxpayer's trade or business. See Regulation IV.18.(c).

(3) **Year to year consistency.** In filing returns with this state, if the taxpayer departs from or modifies the basis for excluding or including gross receipts in the sales factor used in returns for prior years, the taxpayer shall disclose in the return for the current year the nature and extent of the modification.

(4) **State to state consistency.** If the returns or reports filed by the taxpayer with all states to which the taxpayer reports under Article IV of this Compact or the Uniform Division of Income for Tax Purposes Act are not uniform in the inclusion or exclusion of gross receipts, the taxpayer shall disclose in its return to this state the nature and extent of the variance.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.15.(b). Sales Factor: Denominator.** The denominator of the sales factor shall include the total gross receipts derived by the taxpayer from transactions and activity in the regular course of its trade or business, except receipts excluded under Regulation IV.18.(c).

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.15.(c). Sales Factor: Numerator.** The numerator of the sales factor shall include gross receipts attributable to this state and derived by the taxpayer from transactions and activity in the regular course of its trade or business. All interest income, service charges, carrying charges, or time-price differential charges incidental to such gross receipts shall be included regardless of (1) the place where the accounting records are maintained or (2) the location of the contract or other evidence of indebtedness.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.16.(a). Sales Factor: Sales of Tangible Personal Property in This State.**

(1) Gross receipts from sales of tangible personal property (except sales to the United States Government; see Regulation IV.16.(b)) are in this state:

(A) if the property is delivered or shipped to a purchaser within this state regardless of the f.o.b. point or other conditions of sale; or

(B) if the property is shipped from an office, store, warehouse, factory, or other place of storage in this state and the taxpayer is not taxable in the state of the purchaser.

(2) Property shall be deemed to be delivered or shipped to a purchaser within this state if the recipient is located in this state, even though the property is ordered from outside this state.

*Example:* The taxpayer, with inventory in State A, sold \$100,000 of its products to a purchaser having branch stores in several states, including this state. The order for the purchase was placed by the purchaser's central purchasing department located in State B. \$25,000 of the purchase order was shipped directly to purchaser's branch store in this state. The branch store in this state is the purchaser within this state with respect to \$25,000 of the taxpayer's sales.

(3) Property is delivered or shipped to a purchaser within this state if the shipment terminates in this state, even though the property is subsequently transferred by the purchaser to another state.

*Example:* The taxpayer makes a sale to a purchaser who maintains a central warehouse in this state at which all merchandise purchases are received. The purchaser reships the goods to its branch stores in other states for sale. All of the taxpayer's products shipped to the purchaser's warehouse in this state constitute property delivered or shipped to a purchaser within this state.

(4) The term "purchaser within this state" shall include the ultimate recipient of the property if the taxpayer in this state, at the designation of the purchaser, delivers to or has the property shipped to the ultimate recipient within this state.

*Example:* A taxpayer in this state sold merchandise to a purchaser in State A. Taxpayer directed the manufacturer or supplier of the merchandise in State B to ship the merchandise to the purchaser's customer in this state pursuant to purchaser's instructions. The sale by the taxpayer is in this state.

(5) When property being shipped by a seller from the state of origin to a consignee in another state is diverted while en route to a purchaser in this state, the sales are in this state.

*Example:* The taxpayer, a produce grower in State A, begins shipment of perishable produce to the purchaser's place of business in State B. While en route, the produce is diverted to the purchaser's place of business in this state in which state the taxpayer is subject to tax. The sale by the taxpayer is attributed to this state.

(6) If the taxpayer is not taxable in the state of the purchaser, the sale is attributed to this state if the property is shipped from an office, store, warehouse, factory, or other place of storage in this state.

*Example:* The taxpayer has its head office and factory in State A. It maintains a branch office and inventory in this state. Taxpayer's only activity in State B is the solicitation of orders by a resident salesman. All orders by the State B salesman are sent to the branch office in this state for approval and are filled by shipment from the inventory in this state. Since the taxpayer is immune under Public Law 86-272 from tax in State B, all sales of merchandise to purchasers in State B are attributed to this state, the state from which the merchandise was shipped.

(7) If a taxpayer whose salesman operates from an office located in this state makes a sale to a purchaser in another state in which the taxpayer is not taxable and the property is shipped directly by a third party to the purchaser, the following rules apply:

(A) If the taxpayer is taxable in the state from which the third party ships the property, then the sale is in that state.

(B) If the taxpayer is not taxable in the state from which the property is shipped, then the sale is in this state.

*Example:* The taxpayer in this state sold merchandise to a purchaser in State A. Taxpayer is not taxable in State A. Upon direction of the taxpayer, the merchandise was shipped directly to the purchaser by the manufacturer in State B. If the taxpayer is taxable in State B, the sale is in State B. If the taxpayer is not taxable in State B, the sale is in this state.

\*\*\* Reg. IV.16.(b). **Sales Factor: Sales of Tangible Personal Property to the United States Government in This State.** Gross receipts from sales of tangible personal property to the United States Government are in this state if the property is shipped from an office, store, warehouse, factory, or other place of storage in this state. For the purposes of this regulation, only sales for which the United States Government makes direct payment to the seller pursuant to the terms of a contract constitute sales to the United States Government. Thus, as a general rule, sales by a subcontractor to the prime contractor, the party to the contract with the United States Government, do not constitute sales to the United States Government.

*Example (i):* A taxpayer contracts with General Services Administration to deliver X number of trucks which were paid for by the United States Government. The sale is a sale to the United States Government.

*Example (ii):* The taxpayer, as a subcontractor to a prime contractor with the

National Aeronautics and Space Administration, contracts to build a component of a rocket for \$1,000,000. The sale by the subcontractor to the prime contractor is not a sale to the United States Government.

**... Reg. IV.17. Sales Factor: Sales Other Than Sales of Tangible Personal Property in This State**

(1) **In general.** Article IV.17. provides for the inclusion in the numerator of the sales factor of gross receipts from transactions other than sales of tangible personal property (including transactions with the United States Government); under this section, gross receipts are attributed to this state if the income producing activity which gave rise to the receipts is performed wholly within this state. Also, gross receipts are attributed to this state if, with respect to a particular item of income, the income producing activity is performed within and without this state but the greater proportion of the income producing activity is performed in this state, based on costs of performance.

(2) **Income producing activity: defined.** The term "income producing activity" applies to each separate item of income and means the transactions and activity engaged in by the taxpayer in the regular course of its trade or business for the ultimate purpose of producing that item of income. Such activity includes transactions and activities performed on behalf of a taxpayer, such as those conducted on its behalf by an independent contractor. Accordingly, income producing activity includes but is not limited to the following:

(A) The rendering of personal services by employees or by an agent or independent contractor acting on behalf of the taxpayer or the utilization of tangible and intangible property by the taxpayer or by an agent or independent contractor acting on behalf of the taxpayer in performing a service.

(B) The sale, rental, leasing, licensing or other use of real property.

(C) The rental, leasing, licensing or other use of tangible personal property.

(D) The sale, licensing or other use of intangible personal property.

The mere holding of intangible personal property is not, of itself, an income producing activity.

(3) **Costs of performance: defined.** The term "costs of performance" means direct costs determined in a manner consistent with generally accepted accounting principles and in accordance with accepted conditions or practices in the trade or business of the taxpayer to perform the income producing activity which gives rise to the particular item of income. Included in the taxpayer's cost of performance are taxpayer's payments to an agent or independent contractor for the performance of personal services and utilization of tangible and intangible property which give rise to the particular item of

income.

**(4) Application.**

**(A) In general.** Receipts (other than from sales of tangible personal property) in respect to a particular income producing activity are in this state if:

- (a) the income producing activity is performed wholly within this state; or
- (b) the income producing activity is performed both in and outside this state and a greater proportion of the income producing activity is performed in this state than in any other state, based on costs of performance.

**(B) Special rules.** The following are special rules for determining when receipts from the income producing activities described below are in this state:

(a) Gross receipts from the sale, lease, rental or licensing of real property are in this state if the real property is located in this state.

(b) Gross receipts from the rental, lease, or licensing of tangible personal property are in this state if the property is located in this state. The rental, lease, licensing or other use of tangible personal property in this state is a separate income producing activity from the rental, lease, licensing or other use of the same property while located in another state; consequently, if property is within and without this state during the rental, lease or licensing period, gross receipts attributable to this state shall be measured by the ratio which the time the property was physically present or was used in this state bears to the total time or use of the property everywhere during that period.

*Example:* Taxpayer is the owner of 10 railroad cars. During the year, the total of the days during which each railroad car was present in this state was 50 days. The receipts attributable to the use of each of the railroad cars in this state are a separate item of income and shall be determined as follows:

$$\frac{(10 \times 50)}{3650} = 500 \times \text{Total Receipts} = \text{Receipts Attributable to this State}$$

(c) Gross receipts for the performance of personal services are attributable to this state to the extent that such services are performed in this state. If services relating to a single item of income are performed partly within and partly without this state, the gross receipts from the performance of such services shall be attributable to this state only if the greater proportion of the services was performed in the state, based on costs of performance. Usually, where services are performed partly within and partly without this state, the services performed in each state will constitute a separate income producing activity; in such cases, the gross receipts from the performance of services attributable to this state shall be measured by the ratio which the time spent in performing the services in this state bears to the total time spent in performing the services everywhere. Time spent in performing services includes the amount of time expended in the performance of a contract or other obligation which gives rise to such gross receipts. Personal service not

directly connected with the performance of the contract or other obligation, as for example time expended in negotiating the contract, is excluded from the computations.

*Example (i):* Taxpayer, a road show, gave theatrical performances at various locations in State X and in this state during the tax period. All gross receipts from performances given in this state are attributed to this state.

*Example (ii):* The taxpayer, a public opinion survey corporation, conducted a poll by means of its employees in State X and in this state for the sum of \$9,000. The project required 600 man-hours to obtain the basic data and prepare the survey report. Two hundred of the 600 man hours were expended in this state. The receipts attributable to this state are \$3,000.

$$\frac{200}{600} \times \$9,000 = \$3,000$$

**(C) Services on Behalf of Taxpayer.** An income producing activity performed on behalf of a taxpayer by an agent or independent contractor is attributed to this state if such income producing activity is in this state.

(a) Such income producing activity is in this state:

(i) when the taxpayer can reasonably determine at the time of filing that the income producing activity is actually performed in this state by the agent or independent contractor, but if the activity occurs in more than one state, the location where the income producing activity is actually performed shall be deemed to be not reasonably determinable at the time of filing under (4)(C)(a)(i);

(ii) if the taxpayer cannot reasonably determine at the time of filing where the income producing activity is actually performed, when the contract between the taxpayer and the agent or independent contractor indicates it is to be performed in this state and the portion of the taxpayer's payment to the agent or contractor associated with such performance is determinable under the contract;

(iii) if it cannot be determined where the income producing activity is actually performed and the agent or independent contractor's contract with the taxpayer does not indicate where it is to be performed, when the contract between the taxpayer and the taxpayer's customer indicates it is to be performed in this state and the portion of the taxpayer's payment to the agent or contractor associated with such performance is determinable under the contract; or

(iv) if it cannot be determined where the income producing activity is actually performed and neither contract indicates where it is to be performed or the portion of the payment associated with such performance, when the domicile of the taxpayer's customer is in this state. If the taxpayer's customer is not an individual, "domicile" means commercial domicile.

(b) If the location of the income producing activity by an agent or independent contractor, or the portion of the payment associated with such performance, cannot be determined under (4)(C)(a)(i) through (4)(C)(a)(iii), or the taxpayer's customer's domicile cannot be determined under (4)(C)(a)(iv), or, although determinable, such income producing activity is in a state in which the taxpayer is not taxable, such income producing activity shall be disregarded.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.18.(a). Special Rules: In General.** Article IV.18. provides that if the allocation and apportionment provisions of Article IV do not fairly represent the extent of the taxpayer's business activity in this state, the taxpayer may petition for or the tax administrator may require, in respect to all or any part of the taxpayer's business activity, if reasonable:

- (1) separate accounting;
- (2) the exclusion of any one or more of the factors;
- (3) the inclusion of one or more additional factors which will fairly represent the taxpayer's business activity in this state; or
- (4) the employment of any other method to effectuate an equitable allocation and apportionment of the taxpayer's income.

Article IV.18. permits a departure from the allocation and apportionment provisions of Article IV only in limited and specific cases. Article IV.18. may be invoked only in specific cases where unusual fact situations (which ordinarily will be unique and non recurring) produce incongruous results under the apportionment and allocation provisions contained in Article IV.

In the case of certain industries such as air transportation, rail transportation, ship transportation, trucking, television, radio, motion pictures, various types of professional athletics, and so forth, the foregoing regulations in respect to the apportionment formula do not set forth appropriate procedures for determining the apportionment factors. Nothing in Article IV.18. or in this Regulation IV.18. shall preclude [the tax administrator] from establishing appropriate procedures under Article IV.10. to 17. for determining the apportionment factors for each such industry, but such procedures shall be applied uniformly.

\*\*\* **Reg. IV.18.(b). Special Rules: Property Factor.** The following special rules are established in respect to the property factor of the apportionment formula:

- (1) If the subrents taken into account in determining the net annual rental rate under Regulation IV.11.(b) produce a negative or clearly inaccurate value for any item of property, another method which will properly reflect the value of rented property may be required by the [tax administrator] or requested by the taxpayer.

In no case, however, shall the value be less than an amount which bears the same ratio to the annual rental rate paid by the taxpayer for the property as the fair market value of that portion of the property used by the taxpayer bears to the total fair market value of the rented property.

*Example:* The taxpayer rents a 10-story building at an annual rental rate of \$1,000,000. Taxpayer occupies two stories and sublets eight stories for \$1,000,000 a year. The net annual rental rate of the taxpayer must not be less than two-tenths of the taxpayer's annual rental rate for the entire year, or \$200,000.

(2) If property owned by others is used by the taxpayer at no charge or rented by the taxpayer for a nominal rate, the net annual rental rate for the property shall be determined on the basis of a reasonable market rental rate for the property.

--- **Reg. IV.18.(c). Special Rules: Sales Factor.** The following special rules are established in respect to the sales factor of the apportionment formula:

(1) Where substantial amounts of gross receipts arise from an incidental or occasional sale of a fixed asset used in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business, those gross receipts shall be excluded from the sales factor. For example, gross receipts from the sale of a factory or plant will be excluded.

(2) Insubstantial amounts of gross receipts arising from incidental or occasional transactions or activities may be excluded from the sales factor unless their exclusion would materially affect the amount of income apportioned to this state. For example, the taxpayer ordinarily may include in or exclude from the sales factor gross receipts from transactions such as the sale of office furniture, business automobiles, etc.

(3) Where the income producing activity in respect to business income from intangible personal property can be readily identified, the income is included in the denominator of the sales factor and, if the income producing activity occurs in this state, in the numerator of the sales factor as well. For example, usually the income producing activity can be readily identified in respect to interest income received on deferred payments on sales of tangible property (Regulation IV.15.(a)(1)(A)) and income from the sale, licensing or other use of intangible personal property (Regulation IV.17.(2)(D)).

Where business income from intangible property cannot readily be attributed to any particular income producing activity of the taxpayer, the income cannot be assigned to the numerator of the sales factor for any state and shall be excluded from the denominator of the sales factor. For example, where business income in the form of dividends received on stock, royalties received on patents or copyrights, or interest received on bonds, debentures or government securities results from the mere holding of the intangible personal property by the taxpayer, the dividends and interest shall be excluded from the denominator of the sales factor.

(4) (A) Where gains and losses on the sale of liquid assets are not excluded from the sales factor by other provisions under Reg. IV.18.(c), such gains or losses shall be treated as provided in this subsection. This subsection does not provide rules relating to the treatment of other receipts produced from holding or managing such assets. If a taxpayer holds liquid assets in connection with one or more treasury functions of the taxpayer, and the liquid assets produce business income when sold, exchanged or otherwise disposed, the overall net gain from those transactions for each treasury function for the tax period is included in the sales factor. For purposes of this subsection, each treasury function will be considered separately.

(B) For purposes of this subsection, a liquid asset is an asset (other than functional currency or funds held in bank accounts) held to provide a relatively immediate source of funds to satisfy the liquidity needs of the trade or business. Liquid assets include foreign currency (and trading positions therein) other than functional currency used in the regular course of the taxpayer's trade or business; marketable instruments (including stocks, bonds, debentures, options, warrants, futures contracts, etc.); and mutual funds which hold such liquid assets. An instrument is considered marketable if it is traded in an established stock or securities market and is regularly quoted by brokers or dealers in making a market. Stock in a corporation which is unitary with the taxpayer, or which has a substantial business relationship with the taxpayer is not considered marketable stock.

(C) For purposes of this subsection, a treasury function is the pooling and management of liquid assets for the purpose of satisfying the cash flow needs of the trade or business, such as providing liquidity for a taxpayer's business cycle, providing a reserve for business contingencies, business acquisitions, etc. A taxpayer principally engaged in the trade or business of purchasing and selling instruments or other items included in the definition of liquid assets set forth herein is not performing a treasury function with respect to income so produced.

(D) Overall net gain refers to the total net gain from all transactions incurred at each treasury function for the entire tax period, not the net gain from a specific transaction.

(E) Examples.

*Example (i).* A taxpayer manufactures various gift items. Because of seasonal variations, the taxpayer must keep liquid assets available for later inventory acquisitions. Because the manufacturer wants to obtain a return on available funds, the manufacturer acquires liquid assets, which are held and managed in State A. The net gain resulting from all gains and losses on the sale of the liquid assets for the tax year will be reflected in the denominator of the sales factor and in the numerator of State A.

*Example (ii).* A stockbroker acts as a dealer or trader for its own account in its ordinary course of business. Some of the instruments sold are liquid assets. This subsection does not operate to classify those sales as attributable to a

treasury function.

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Court of Appeals

RECEIVED  
AUG 21 2015  
SC Court of Appeals

APPEAL FROM ADMINISTRATIVE LAW COURT

Ralph King Anderson, III, Administrative Law Judge

Case No. 09-ALJ-17-0204-CC

Appellate Case No. 2012-208608

Rent-A-Center West, Inc., ..... Appellant,


v.

South Carolina Department of Revenue ..... Respondent.

CERTIFICATE OF COUNSEL

The undersigned certifies that the foregoing Record on Appeal contains all material proposed to be included by any of the parties and not any other material.

NELSON MULLINS RILEY & SCARBOROUGH LLP

By:   
John C. Von Lehe, Jr. (SC Bar No. 5719)  
Bryson M. Geer (SC Bar No. 13606)  
151 Meeting Street / Sixth Floor  
Post Office Box 1806 (29402-1806)  
Charleston, SC 29401-2239  
(843) 853-5200

Attorneys for Rent-A-Center West, Inc.

Charleston, South Carolina  
August 20, 2015