

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Court of Appeals

---

APPEAL FROM DORCHESTER COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas

Edgar W. Dickson, Circuit Court Judge

---

Case No. 2013-CP-18-00013

---

**RECEIVED**

**Jul 13 2020**

**SC Court of Appeals**

The Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of South Carolina; The Trustees of The Protestant Episcopal Church in South Carolina, a South Carolina Corporate Body; All Saints Protestant Episcopal Church, Inc.; Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church; Church of The Cross, Inc. and Church of the Cross Declaration of Trust; Church of The Holy Comforter; Church of the Redeemer; Holy Trinity Episcopal Church; Saint Luke's Church, Hilton Head; St. Bartholomew's Episcopal Church; St. David's Church; St. James' Church, James Island, S.C.; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Bennettsville, Inc.; The Church of St. Luke and St. Paul, Radcliffeboro; The Church of Our Saviour of the Diocese of South Carolina; The Church of the Epiphany (Episcopal); The Church of the Good Shepherd, Charleston, S.C.; The Church of The Holy Cross; The Church of The Resurrection, Surfside; The Protestant Episcopal Church of The Parish of Saint Philip, in Charleston, in the State of South Carolina; The Protestant Episcopal Church, The Parish of Saint Michael, in Charleston, in the State of South Carolina and St. Michael's Church Declaration of Trust; The Vestry and Church Wardens of St. Jude's Church of Walterboro; The Vestry and Church Wardens of The Church of The Parish of St. Helena and The Parish Church of St. Helena Trust; The Vestry and Church Wardens of The Parish of St. Matthew; The Vestry and Wardens of St. Paul's Church, Summerville; Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach; Trinity Episcopal Church; Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis; Vestry and Church Wardens of the Episcopal Church of The Parish of Christ Church; Vestry and Church Wardens of The Episcopal Church of the Parish of St. John's, Charleston County; and The Vestries and Churchwardens of The Parish of St. Andrews,

Respondents,

v.

The Episcopal Church (a/k/a The Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America) and The Episcopal Church in South Carolina,

Appellants.

---

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**

---

The Episcopal Church (a/k/a The Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America) and The Episcopal Church in South Carolina appeal the Orders of the Honorable Edgar W. Dickson dated June 18, 2020 (filed June 19, 2020), and July 13, 2020. Appellants received written notice of entry of the July 13, 2020 Order on July 13, 2020.

Dated: July 13, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Bert G. Utsey, III  
Bert G. Utsey, III  
PETERS, MURDAUGH, PARKER,  
ELTZROTH & DETRICK, P.A.  
P.O. Box 30968  
Charleston, SC 29417  
(843) 818-4399  
[butsey@pmped.com](mailto:butsey@pmped.com)

Thomas S. Tisdale, Jr.  
Jason S. Smith  
HELLMAN YATES & TISDALE  
105 Broad Street, Third Floor  
Charleston, South Carolina 29401  
Telephone: (843) 266-9099  
[tst@hellmanyates.com](mailto:tst@hellmanyates.com)  
[js@hellmanyates.com](mailto:js@hellmanyates.com)

Kathleen F. Monoc  
MONOC LAW, LLC  
77 Grove Street  
Charleston, South Carolina 29403  
(843) 790-8910  
[katie@monoclaw.com](mailto:katie@monoclaw.com)

*Counsel for The Episcopal Church in South  
Carolina*

/s/ Allan R. Holmes  
Allan R. Holmes  
GIBBS & HOLMES  
171 Church Street, Suite 110  
Charleston, South Carolina 29401  
Telephone: (843)722-0033  
[aholmes@gibbs-holmes.com](mailto:aholmes@gibbs-holmes.com)

David Booth Beers  
GOODWIN PROCTER, LLP  
901 New York Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
Telephone: (202) 346-4000  
[dbeers@goodwinlaw.com](mailto:dbeers@goodwinlaw.com)

Mary E. Kostel  
Chancellor to the Presiding Bishop  
The Episcopal Church  
3737 Seminary Road  
PMB 200  
Alexandria, VA 22304  
Telephone: (703) 898-8413  
[mkostel@episcopalchurch.org](mailto:mkostel@episcopalchurch.org)

*Counsel for The Episcopal Church*

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In the Court of Appeals

---

APPEAL FROM DORCHESTER COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas

Edgar W. Dickson, Circuit Court Judge

---

Case No. 2013-CP-18-00013

---

**RECEIVED**

**Jul 13 2020**

**SC Court of Appeals**

The Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of South Carolina; The Trustees of The Protestant Episcopal Church in South Carolina, a South Carolina Corporate Body; All Saints Protestant Episcopal Church, Inc.; Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church; Church of The Cross, Inc. and Church of the Cross Declaration of Trust; Church of The Holy Comforter; Church of the Redeemer; Holy Trinity Episcopal Church; Saint Luke's Church, Hilton Head; St. Bartholomew's Episcopal Church; St. David's Church; St. James' Church, James Island, S.C.; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Bennettsville, Inc.; The Church of St. Luke and St. Paul, Radcliffeboro; The Church of Our Saviour of the Diocese of South Carolina; The Church of the Epiphany (Episcopal); The Church of the Good Shepherd, Charleston, S.C.; The Church of The Holy Cross; The Church of The Resurrection, Surfside; The Protestant Episcopal Church of The Parish of Saint Philip, in Charleston, in the State of South Carolina; The Protestant Episcopal Church, The Parish of Saint Michael, in Charleston, in the State of South Carolina and St. Michael's Church Declaration of Trust; The Vestry and Church Wardens of St. Jude's Church of Walterboro; The Vestry and Church Wardens of The Church of The Parish of St. Helena and The Parish Church of St. Helena Trust; The Vestry and Church Wardens of The Parish of St. Matthew; The Vestry and Wardens of St. Paul's Church, Summerville; Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach; Trinity Episcopal Church; Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis; Vestry and Church Wardens of the Episcopal Church of The Parish of Christ Church; Vestry and Church Wardens of The Episcopal Church of the Parish of St. John's, Charleston County; and The Vestries and Churchwardens of The Parish of St. Andrews,

Respondents,

v.

The Episcopal Church (a/k/a The Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America) and The Episcopal Church in South Carolina,

Appellants.

---

PROOF OF SERVICE

---

The undersigned certifies that this day he served a copy of the foregoing Notice of Appeal on the Respondents via electronic mail addressed to counsel of record:

The Hon. Edgar W. Dickson  
Judge, First Judicial Circuit  
Post Office Box 1949  
Orangeburg, SC 29116-1949  
[edicksonj@sccourts.org](mailto:edicksonj@sccourts.org); [edicksonlc@sccourts.org](mailto:edicksonlc@sccourts.org);

Francis M. Mack, Esq.  
656 Fort Motte Road  
Saint Matthews, SC 29135  
[fmack@windstream.net](mailto:fmack@windstream.net)

C. Pierce Campbell, Esq.  
TURNER, PADGET, GRAHAM & LANEY  
319 South Irby Street, P.O. Box 5478  
Florence, SC 29501  
[pcampbell@turnerpadget.com](mailto:pcampbell@turnerpadget.com)

Allan P. Sloan, III, Esq.  
PIERCE, SLOAN, WILSON, KENNEDY & EARLY, LLC  
321 East Bay Street; P.O. Box 22437  
Charleston, SC 29413  
[chipsloan@piercesloan.com](mailto:chipsloan@piercesloan.com)

Thomas C. Davis, Esq.  
HARVEY & BATTEY, PA  
1001 Craven Street  
Beaufort, SC 29901  
[tdavis@harveyandbattey.com](mailto:tdavis@harveyandbattey.com)

C. Alan Runyan, Esq.  
Andrew S. Platte, Esq.  
RUNYAN & PLATTE, LLC  
2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239  
Beaufort, SC 29902  
[arunyan@runyanplatte.com](mailto:arunyan@runyanplatte.com); [aplatte@runyanplatte.com](mailto:aplatte@runyanplatte.com)

Susan MacDonald, Esq.  
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP  
BNC Bank Corporate Center, Suite 300  
3751 Robert M. Grissom Parkway  
Myrtle Beach, SC 29577  
[susan.macdonald@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:susan.macdonald@nelsonmullins.com)

John Furman Wall, Esq.  
140 Wando Reach Court  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
[walljohn@bellsouth.net](mailto:walljohn@bellsouth.net)

G. Mark Phillips, Esq.  
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP  
Liberty Center, Suite 600  
151 Meeting Street  
Charleston, SC 29401-2239  
[mark.phillips@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:mark.phillips@nelsonmullins.com)

Mark V. Evans, Esq.  
147 Wappoo Creek Drive, Ste. 202  
Charleston, SC 29412  
[mevans14@bellsouth.net](mailto:mevans14@bellsouth.net)

James Kent Lehman, Esquire  
PO Box 11070  
Columbia, SC 29211  
[jim.lehman@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:jim.lehman@nelsonmullins.com)

William A. Scott, Esq.  
PEDERSEN & SCOTT, PC  
775 St. Andrews Blvd.  
Charleston, SC 29407  
[bscott@pslawpc.com](mailto:bscott@pslawpc.com)

David L. DeVane, Esq.  
110 N. Main Street  
Summerville, SC 29483  
[david@devanemacklaw.com](mailto:david@devanemacklaw.com)

David B. Marvel, Esq.  
DAVID B. MARVEL, LLC  
P.O. Box 22734  
Charleston, SC 29413  
[dave@marvel.lawyer](mailto:dave@marvel.lawyer)

Henry E. Grimball, Esquire  
WOMBLE Bond Dickison (US) LLP  
P.O. Box 999  
Charleston, SC 29402  
[henry.grimball@wbd-us.com](mailto:henry.grimball@wbd-us.com)

Peter Brandt Shelbourne, Esq.  
SHELBOURNE LAW FIRM  
131 E. Richardson Avenue  
Summerville, SC 29483  
[brandt@shelbournelaw.com](mailto:brandt@shelbournelaw.com)

David S. Cox, Esq.  
BARNWELL WHALEY PATTERSON & HELMS, LLC  
288 Meeting Street, Suite 200  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[dcox@barnwell-whaley.com](mailto:dcox@barnwell-whaley.com)

Charles H. Williams, Esq.  
WILLIAMS & WILLIAMS  
P.O. Box 1084  
Orangeburg, SC 29116-1084  
[chwilliams@williamsattys.com](mailto:chwilliams@williamsattys.com)

Henrietta U. Golding, Esq.  
BURR FORMAN & McNAIR  
P.O. Box 336  
Myrtle Beach, SC 29578  
[hgolding@burr.com](mailto:hgolding@burr.com)

Robert R. Horger, Esq,  
HORGER, BARNWELL & REID, LLP  
P.O. Drawer 329  
1459 Amelia Street  
Orangeburg, SC 29115  
[rhorger@hbrllp.com](mailto:rhorger@hbrllp.com)

Thornwell F. Sowell, Esq,  
Bess J. DuRant, Esq.  
SOWELL & DuRANT, LLC  
1325 Park Street, Suite 100  
Columbia, SC 29201  
[bsowell@sowelldurant.com](mailto:bsowell@sowelldurant.com)  
[bdurant@sowelldurant.com](mailto:bdurant@sowelldurant.com)

Joseph C. Wilson, IV, Esq.  
JOSEPH C., WILSON LAW FIRM, LLC  
PO Box 178  
Folly Beach, SC 29439  
[jcamwilsoniv@gmail.com](mailto:jcamwilsoniv@gmail.com)

William A. Bryan, Esq.  
BRYAN & HAAR  
P.O. Box 14860  
Surfside Beach, SC 29587  
[billbryan@bryanandhaar.net](mailto:billbryan@bryanandhaar.net)

I. Keith McCarty, Esq.  
McCARTY LAW FIRM, LLC  
P.O. Box 30055  
Charleston, SC 29417  
[ikeithmccarty@gmail.com](mailto:ikeithmccarty@gmail.com)

Harry Easterling, Jr., Esq.  
120 North Liberty Street  
Post Office Box 611  
Bennettsville, SC 29512  
[hreasterling@gmail.com](mailto:hreasterling@gmail.com)

W. Foster Gaillard, Esq.  
WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP  
P.O. Box 999  
Charleston, SC 29402  
[foster.gaillard@wbd-us.com](mailto:foster.gaillard@wbd-us.com)

Edward P. Guerard, Jr.  
1106 Port Harbor Court  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
[tguerardjr@gmail.com](mailto:tguerardjr@gmail.com)

C. Mitchell Brown, Esq.  
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH  
1320 Main Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Post Office Box 11070  
Columbia, SC 29211-1070  
[mitch.brown@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:mitch.brown@nelsonmullins.com)

John B. Williams, Esquire  
WILLIAMS & HULST, LLC  
209 East Main Street  
Moncks Comer, SC 29461  
[jbw@williamsandhulst.com](mailto:jbw@williamsandhulst.com)

/s/ Bert G. Utsey, III

Bert G. Utsey, III  
Attorney for Appellants

July 13, 2020  
Charleston, South Carolina