

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Supreme Court

---

APPEAL FROM BERKELEY COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas

The Honorable J.C. Nicholson, Jr.

---

Appellate Case No. 2020-001048

---

RECEIVED

Aug 19 2020

S.C. SUPREME COURT

Patricia Damico and Lenna Lucas, Individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated, Joshua and Brettany Beutow, Edward and Sylvia Dengg, Jonathan and Theresa Douglass, Anthony and Stacey Ray, Danny and Ellen Davis Morrow, Czara and Chad England, Bryan and Cynthia Camara, and Matthew Collins, Respondents,

v.

Lennar Carolinas, LLC, Spring Grove Plantation Development, Inc., Manale Landscaping, LLC, Super Concrete of SC, Inc., Southern Green, Inc. TJB Trucking/Leasing, LLC, Paragon Site Constructors, Inc., Civil Site Environmental and Rick Bryant, Individually, Defendants,

Of which Spring Grove Plantation Development, Inc., Manale Landscaping, LLC, Super Concrete of SC, Inc., Southern Green, Inc. TJB Trucking/Leasing, LLC, and Civil Site Environmental are Respondents.

And

Lennar Carolinas, LLC, Appellant,

v.

The Earthworks Group, Inc., Volkmar Consulting Services, LLC, Geometries Consulting, LLC, Land/Site Services, Inc., Myers Landscaping, Inc., A.C.&A. Concrete, Inc., Knight's Concrete Products, Inc., Knight's Redi-Mix, Inc., Coastal Concrete Southeast, LLC, Coastal Concrete Southeast II, LLC, Guaranteed Framing, LLC, Ozzy Construction, LLC, Construction Applicators Charleston, LLC, LA New Enterprises, LLC, Decor Corporation, DVS, Inc., Raul Martinez Masonry, LLC, Alpha Omega Construction Group, Inc., South Carolina Exteriors, LLC, Builders Firstsource Southeast Group, LLC, and Low Country Renovations and Siding, LLP, Third-Party Defendants,

Of which Volkmar Consulting Services, LLC, Land/Site Services, Inc., Myers Landscaping, Inc., A.C.&A. Concrete, Inc., Knight's Concrete Products, Inc., Knight's Redi-Mix, Inc., Coastal Concrete Southeast, LLC, Coastal Concrete Southeast II, LLC, Guaranteed Framing, LLC, Ozzy Construction, LLC, Construction Applicators Charleston, LLC, LA New Enterprises, LLC, Decor

Corporation, DVS, Inc., Raul Martinez Masonry, LLC, Alpha Omega Construction Group, Inc., South Carolina Exteriors, LLC, Builders Firstsource Southeast Group, LLC, are also Respondents.

And

Decor Corporation, Fourth Party Plaintiff,

v.

Baranov Flooring, LLC, DJ Construction Services, LLC, Creative Wood Floors, LLC, Geraldo Cunha, Ebenezer Flooring, LLC, Emmanuel Flooring and Siding, LLC, Eusi Flooring and Covering, LLC, Nicolas Flores, Alexander Martinez, Isidini Mejia, Juan Perez, N&B Construction, LLC, Jose Dias Rodrigues, Livia Sousa, Jose Paz Castro Hernandez, Divinio Aperecido Corgosinho, Ricardo Chiche, CEBS Construction, Bayshore Siding and Flooring, Sebastio Luiz de Araujo, and John Does 1-4, Fourth Party Defendants.

---

### PROOF OF SERVICE

---

I certify that I have served the Notice of Appearance on all attorneys of record and other parties by forwarding copies of the same by email and mail on August 19, 2020, addressed to:

John C. Hayes, IV  
Hayes Law Firm, LLC  
180 Meeting St., Ste. 330  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[jhayes@hayeslaw.org](mailto:jhayes@hayeslaw.org)

Jesse Sanchez  
98½ Broad Street, Ste. B  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[jesse@cssesanchezlaw.com](mailto:jesse@cssesanchezlaw.com)

Michael J. Jordan  
The Steinberg Law firm, L.L.P.  
P. O. Box 1028  
Goose Creek, SC 29445  
[mjordan@steinberglawfirm.com](mailto:mjordan@steinberglawfirm.com)

Catherine Dunn Meehan  
The Steinberg Law Firm, L.L.P.  
P. O. Box 9  
Charleston, SC 29402-0009  
[cdunn@steinberglawfirm.com](mailto:cdunn@steinberglawfirm.com)  
*Attorneys for Petitioners*

James Lynn Werner  
Jenna K. McGee  
Katon E. Dawson, Jr.  
Parker, Poe, Adams & Bernstein, LLP  
P.O. Box 1509  
Columbia, SC 29201  
[jennamcgee@parkerpoe.com](mailto:jennamcgee@parkerpoe.com)  
[jimwerner@parkerpoe.com](mailto:jimwerner@parkerpoe.com)  
[katondawson@parkerpoe.com](mailto:katondawson@parkerpoe.com)  
*Attorneys for Respondent Lennar Carolinas, LLC*

Shanna Milcetek Stephens  
Wade Coleman Lawrimore  
Anderson Reynolds & Stephens, LLC  
P.O. Box 87  
Charleston, SC 29402  
[sstephens@arlawsc.com](mailto:sstephens@arlawsc.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent A.C.&A Concrete, Inc.*

Stephen L. Brown  
Catherine H. Chase  
Young Clement Rivers, LLP  
P.O. Box 993  
Charleston, SC 29402  
[sbrown@ycrlaw.com](mailto:sbrown@ycrlaw.com)  
[cchase@ycrlaw.com](mailto:cchase@ycrlaw.com)  
*Attorneys for Respondent Alpha  
Omega Construction Group, Inc.*

Preston B. Dawkins, Jr.  
Aiken Bridges, P.A.  
P.O. Drawer 1931  
Florence, SC 29503  
[pbd@aikenbridges.com](mailto:pbd@aikenbridges.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent  
Alpha Omega Construction  
Group, Inc.*

Stephen P. Hughes  
Howell Gibson and Hughes, P.A.  
P.O. Box 40  
Beaufort, SC 29901  
[sphughes@hphpa.com](mailto:sphughes@hphpa.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent Builders  
FirstSource-Southeast Group, LLC*

Kathy A. Carlsten  
N. Keith Emge  
Carlock Copeland & Stair, LLP  
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[kcarlsten@carlockcopeland.com](mailto:kcarlsten@carlockcopeland.com)  
[kemge@carlockcopeland.com](mailto:kemge@carlockcopeland.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent Civil Site  
Environmental, Inc.*

Brent M. Boyd  
Brian Lincoln Craven  
Rogers Edward Harrell, III  
Everett Augustus Kendall, II  
Timothy J. Newton  
Murphy & Grantland, P.A.  
P.O. Box 6648 4406-B Forest Dr.  
Columbia, SC 29260  
[bboyd@murphygrantland.com](mailto:bboyd@murphygrantland.com)  
[bcraven@murphygrantland.com](mailto:bcraven@murphygrantland.com)  
[rharrell@murphygrantland.com](mailto:rharrell@murphygrantland.com)  
[rkendall@murphygrantland.com](mailto:rkendall@murphygrantland.com)  
[tnewton@murphygrantland.com](mailto:tnewton@murphygrantland.com)  
*Attorney for Respondents Coastal  
Concrete Southeast, LLC and Coastal  
Concrete Southeast II, LLC*

David S. Cobb  
Turner Padget  
P.O. Box 22129  
Charleston, SC 29413  
[dcobb@turnerpadget.com](mailto:dcobb@turnerpadget.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent Construction  
Applicators Charleston, LLC*

Carmen Vaughn Ganjehsani  
Samia Nettles  
Richardson Plowden & Robinson, P.A.  
P.O. Box Drawer  
7788 Columbia, SC 29201  
[snettl@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:snettl@richardsonplowden.com)  
[cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:cganjehsani@richardsonplowden.com)  
*Attorneys for Respondent Decor  
Corporation*

(Via first class mail)  
Edward and Sylvia Dengg  
238 Maywood Drive  
Moncks Corner, SC 29461  
*Pro Se Respondents*

S. Markey Stubbs  
Baker Ravenel Bender  
P.O. Box 8057  
Columbia, SC 29202  
[mstubbs@brblegal.com](mailto:mstubbs@brblegal.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent DVS, Inc.*

Alan R. Belcher, Jr.  
111 Coleman Blvd., Suite 300 Mount  
Pleasant, SC 29464  
[abelcher@hallboothsmith.com](mailto:abelcher@hallboothsmith.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent  
Guaranteed Framing, LLC*

Christine Companion Varnado  
The Seibels Law Firm  
38 Broad Street, Suite 200  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[cvarnado@seibelsfirm.com](mailto:cvarnado@seibelsfirm.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent Guaranteed  
Framing, LLC*

Derek M. Newberry  
Hall Booth Smith, P.C.  
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 550  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[dnewberry@hallboothsmith.com](mailto:dnewberry@hallboothsmith.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent Guaranteed  
Framing, LLC*

Steven I. Smith  
Zachary J. Closser  
Samuel M. Wheeler  
Smith Closser, P.A.  
P.O. Box 405878  
Charleston, SC 29423-0578  
[ssmith@scnlaw.com](mailto:ssmith@scnlaw.com)  
[zclosser@scnlaw.com](mailto:zclosser@scnlaw.com)  
[swheeler@scnlaw.com](mailto:swheeler@scnlaw.com)  
*Attorneys for Respondents Knight's  
Concrete Products, Inc. and Knight's  
Redi-Mix, Inc.*

Erin D. Dean  
Tupper Grimsley & Dean, P.A.  
P.O. Box 2055  
Beaufort, SC 29901-2055  
[edean@tgdpa.com](mailto:edean@tgdpa.com)  
*Attorney for Respondents  
LA Now Enterprises, LLC, and  
Raul Martinez Masonry, LLC*

John E. Rogers, II  
The Ward Law Firm, P.A.  
P.O. Box 5663  
Spartanburg, SC 29304  
[jrogers@wardfirm.com](mailto:jrogers@wardfirm.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent Land/Site  
Services, Inc.*

Francis Heyward Grimball  
James H. Elliott  
Richardson Plowden & Robinson, P.A.  
235 Magrath Darby Blvd., Ste. 100  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
[fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:fhgrimball@richardsonplowden.com)  
[jelliott@richardsonplowden.com](mailto:jelliott@richardsonplowden.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent  
Manale Landscaping, LLC*

(Via first class mail)  
Third Party Defendant  
Myers Landscaping, Inc.  
c/o Joseph H. Myers, Registered Agent  
Myers Landscaping, Inc.  
382 Big Bird Lane  
Summerville, SC 29486

David Cooper Cleveland  
Trey Matthew Nicolette  
Clawson & Staubes, LLC  
126 Seven Farms Drive, #200  
Charleston, SC 29402  
[david@cslaw.com](mailto:david@cslaw.com)  
[treyn@cslaw.com](mailto:treyn@cslaw.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent  
Myers Landscaping, Inc.*

Thomas F. Dougall  
William A. Collins, Jr.  
Michael Kalwajtys  
Dougall & Collins  
1700 Woodcreek Farms Road, Ste. 100  
Elgin, SC 29045  
[tdougall@dougallfirm.com](mailto:tdougall@dougallfirm.com)  
[wcollins@dougallfirm.com](mailto:wcollins@dougallfirm.com)  
[mkalwajtys@dougallfirm.com](mailto:mkalwajtys@dougallfirm.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent  
Ozzy Construction, LLC*

(Via first class mail)  
Anthony and Stacey Ray  
107 Loch Circle  
Hampton, VA 23669  
*Pro Se Respondents*

Jenny C. Honeycutt  
P.O. Box 13466  
James Island, SC 29422  
[jenny@besthoneycutt.com](mailto:jenny@besthoneycutt.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent  
South Carolina Exteriors, LLC*

R. Trippett Boineau, III  
Heath McAlvin Stewart, III  
John Adam Ribock  
McAngus, Goudelock & Courie, LLC  
P.O. Box 12519  
Columbia, SC 29211  
[Trippett.boineau@mgclaw.com](mailto:Trippett.boineau@mgclaw.com)  
[Heath.stewart@mgclaw.com](mailto:Heath.stewart@mgclaw.com)  
[Adam.ribock@mgclaw.com](mailto:Adam.ribock@mgclaw.com)  
*Attorneys for Respondent Spring  
Grove Plantation Development, Inc.*

R. Patrick Flynn  
Michael Allen  
Pope Flynn, LLC  
P.O. Box 70  
Charleston, SC 29402  
[pflynn@popeflynn.com](mailto:pflynn@popeflynn.com)  
[mallen@popeflynn.com](mailto:mallen@popeflynn.com)  
*Attorneys for Respondent Super  
Concrete of SC, Inc.*

David Shuler Black  
Howell Gibson & Hughes, P.A.  
P.O. Box 40  
Beaufort, SC 29901-0040  
[dblack@hgpha.com](mailto:dblack@hgpha.com)  
*Attorney for Respondent TJB  
Trucking/Leasing, LLC*

Ronald G. Tate, Jr.  
R. Batten Farrar  
Gallivan, White & Boyd, P.A.  
P.O. Box 10589  
Greenville, SC 29603  
[rtate@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:rtate@gwblawfirm.com)  
[bfarrar@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:bfarrar@gwblawfirm.com)  
*Attorneys for Respondent Volkmar  
Consulting Services, LLC*

s/Cherryl E. Garner  
Cherryl E. Garner  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, P.A.