

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Supreme Court

Appellate Case No. 2020-000986

RECEIVED

Feb 12 2021

S.C. SUPREME COURT

The Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of South Carolina; The Trustees of The Protestant Episcopal Church in South Carolina, a South Carolina Corporate Body; All Saints Protestant Episcopal Church, Inc.; Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church; Church Of The Cross, Inc. and Church Of The Cross Declaration Of Trust; Church Of The Holy Comforter; Church of the Redeemer; Holy Trinity Episcopal Church; Saint Luke's Church, Hilton Head; St. Bartholomew's Episcopal Church; St. David's Church; St. James; Church, James Island, S.C.; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Bennettsville, Inc.; The Church Of St. Luke and St Paul, Radcliffeboro; The Church Of Our Saviour Of The Diocese of South Carolina; The Church Of The Epiphany (Episcopal); The Church Of The Good Shepherd, Charleston, SC; The Church Of The Holy Cross; The Church Of The Resurrection, Surfside; The Protestant Episcopal Church, Of The Parish Of Saint Philip, In Charleston, In The State Of South Carolina; The Protestant Episcopal Church, The Parish Of Saint Michael, In Charleston, In The State Of South Carolina and St. Michael's Church Declaration Of Trust; The Vestry And Church Wardens Of The Episcopal Church Of The Parish Of St. Helena and The Parish Church of St. Helena Trust; The Vestry and Church Wardens Of The Episcopal Church Of The Parish Of St. Matthew; The Vestry and Wardens Of St. Paul's Church, Summerville; Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach; Trinity Episcopal Church; Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis; Vestry and Church Wardens Of The Episcopal Church Of The Parish Of Christ Church; Vestry and Church Wardens Of The Episcopal Church Of The Parish Of St. John's, Charleston County, The Vestries And Churchwardens Of The Parish Of St. Andrews .....

Respondents,

v.

The Episcopal Church (a/k/a, The Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America); The Episcopal Church in South Carolina, .....

Appellants.

—  
**PROOF OF SERVICE**  
—

I certify that the INITIAL BRIEF OF RESPONDENTS and DESIGNATION OF MATTER TO BE INCLUDED IN THE RECORD ON APPEAL were served on all counsel of record via electronic mail, pursuant to Supreme Court Order 2020-03-20-01, § (g)(3), on February 12, 2021, and a copy of that electronic mail is attached to this certificate:

***APPELLANTS' COUNSEL:***

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <p><b><i>The Episcopal Church</i></b></p>                    | <p>Allan R. Holmes<br/>GIBBS &amp; HOLMES<br/>171 Church Street, Suite 110<br/>Charleston, SC 29401<br/>aholmes@gibbs-holmes.com</p> <p>David Booth Beers, Esquire<br/>Mary E. Kostel<br/>GOODWIN PROCTER LLP<br/>1900 N St NW<br/>Washington, DC 20036<br/>mkostel@episcopalchurch.org<br/>dbeers@goodwinlaw.com</p>  |
| <p><b><i>The Episcopal Church in South Carolina:</i></b></p> | <p>Bert G. Utsey, III<br/>CLAWSON FARGNOLI UTSEY, LLC<br/>PO Box 30968<br/>Charleston, SC 29417<br/>bert@cfulaw.com</p> <p>Thomas S. Tisdale<br/>Jason S. Smith<br/>HELLMAN, YATES &amp; TISDALE<br/>105 Broad Street, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor<br/>Charleston, South Carolina 29401<br/>tst@hellmanyates.com<br/>js@hellmanyates.com</p> <p>Kathleen F. Monoc</p> |

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  | <p>MONOC LAW LLC<br/> 77 Grove Street<br/> Charleston, SC 29403<br/> katie@monoclaw.com</p> <p>Kathleen C. Barnes<br/> Barnes Law Firm, LLC<br/> PO Box 897<br/> Hampton, SC 29924<br/> kbarnes@barneslawfirmssc.com</p> |
|--|--|

**RESPONDENTS' COUNSEL:**

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p><b><i>All Saints Protestant Episcopal Church, Inc.</i></b></p> | <p>C. Pierce Campbell<br/> TURNER, PADGET, GRAHAM &amp; LANEY<br/> 319 South Irby Street,<br/> P.O. Box 5478<br/> Florence, SC 29501<br/> pcampbell@turnerpadget.com</p>                           |
| <p><b><i>Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church</i></b></p>           | <p>I. Keith McCarty<br/> McCARTY LAW FIRM, LLC<br/> P.O. Box 30055<br/> Charleston, SC 29417<br/> ikeithmccarty@gmail.com</p>  |
| <p><b><i>Church of The Cross Declaration of Trust</i></b></p>     | <p>C. Alan Runyan<br/> Andrew S. Platte<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p> |
| <p><b><i>Church of The Cross, Inc.</i></b></p>                    | <p>C. Alan Runyan<br/> Andrew S. Platte<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902</p>   |

|   |   |
|---|---|
|   | <p>arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p>   |
| <i>Church of the Holy Comforter</i>       | <p>Bess Jones DuRant<br/> Thornwell F. Sowell, III<br/> SOWELL &amp; DURANT, LLC<br/> 1325 Park Street, Suite 100<br/> Columbia, SC 29201<br/> bdurant@sowelldurant.com<br/> bsowell@sowelldurant.com</p> |
| <i>Church of the Redeemer</i>             | <p>Robert R. Horger<br/> HORGER, BARNWELL &amp; REID, LLP<br/> P.O. Drawer 329<br/> 1459 Amelia Street<br/> Orangeburg, SC 29115<br/> rhorger@hbrllp.com</p>  |
| <i>Holy Trinity Episcopal Church</i>      | <p>William A. Scott<br/> PEDERSEN &amp; SCOTT, PC<br/> 775 St. Andrews Blvd.<br/> Charleston, SC 29407<br/> bscott@pslawpc.com</p>  |
| <i>Saint Luke's Church, Hilton Head</i>   | <p>Henrietta U. Golding<br/> BURR FORMAN MCNAIR<br/> P. O. Box 336<br/> Myrtle Beach, SC 29578<br/> hgolding@burr.com</p>   |
| <i>St. Bartholomew's Episcopal Church</i> | <p>C. Pierce Campbell<br/> TURNER, PADGET, GRAHAM &amp; LANEY<br/> 319 South Irby Street,<br/> P.O. Box 5478<br/> Florence, SC 29501<br/> pcampbell@turnerpadget.com</p>                                  |
| <i>St. David's Church</i>                 | <p>Harry Roberson Easterling, Jr.<br/> EASTERLING LAW FIRM, PC<br/> 120 North Liberty Street</p>  |

|   |   |
|---|---|
|   | <p>Post Office Box 611<br/> Bennettsville, South Carolina 29512<br/> hreasterling@gmail.com</p> <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p>   |
| <i>St. James' Church, James Island, S.C.</i>                      | <p>Mark V. Evans<br/> 147 Wappoo Creek Drive, Suite 202<br/> Charleston, SC 29412<br/> mevans14@bellsouth.net</p>   |
| <i>St. Michael's Church Declaration of Trust</i>                  | <p>Henry E. Grimball<br/> WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP<br/> P.O. Box 999<br/> Charleston, SC 29402<br/> henry.grimball@wbd-us.com</p> <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p> |
| <i>St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Bennettsville, Inc.</i>         | <p>Harry R. Easterling, Jr., Esquire<br/> EASTERLING LAW FIRM, PC<br/> 120 North Liberty Street<br/> Post Office Box 611<br/> Bennettsville, South Carolina 29512<br/> hreasterling@gmail.com</p>   |
| <i>The Church of Our Saviour of the Diocese of South Carolina</i> | <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902</p>   |

|  |   |
|--|---|
|  | <p>arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p>   |
| <p><b><i>The Church of St. Luke and St. Paul,<br/> Radcliffeboro</i></b></p>               | <p>David B. Marvel<br/> DAVID B. MARVEL, LLC<br/> P.O. Box 22734<br/> Charleston, SC 29413<br/> dave@marvel.lawyer</p>  |
| <p><b><i>The Church of The Epiphany<br/> (Episcopal)</i></b></p>                           | <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p> |
| <p><b><i>The Church of the Good Shepherd,<br/> Charleston, S.C.</i></b></p>                | <p>John Furman Wall, III<br/> 140 Wando Reach Court<br/> Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464<br/> walljohn@bellsouth.net</p>   |
| <p><b><i>The Church of The Holy Cross</i></b></p>  | <p>C. Pierce Campbell<br/> TURNER, PADGET, GRAHAM &amp; LANEY<br/> 319 South Irby Street,<br/> P.O. Box 5478<br/> Florence, SC 29501<br/> pcampbell@turnerpadget.com</p>                                |
| <p><b><i>The Church of The Resurrection,<br/> Surfside</i></b></p>                         | <p>William A. Bryan<br/> BRYAN &amp; HAAR<br/> P.O. Box 14860<br/> Surfside Beach, SC 29587<br/> billbryan@bryanandhaar.net</p>   |
| <p><b><i>The Protestant Episcopal Church in<br/> the Diocese of South Carolina</i></b></p> | <p>David Spence Cox<br/> BARNWELL WHALEY PATTERSON &amp; HELMS,<br/> LLC<br/> 288 Meeting Street<br/> Charleston, SC 29401</p>  |

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  | <p>dcox@barnwell-whaley.com</p> <p>Henrietta U. Golding<br/> Burr Forman McNair<br/> P. O. Box 336<br/> Myrtle Beach, SC 29578<br/> hgolding@burr.com</p> <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> Runyan &amp; Platte, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p> <p>Charles H. Williams<br/> Williams &amp; Williams<br/> P.O. Box 1084<br/> Orangeburg, SC 29116-1084<br/> chwilliams@williamsattys.com</p> <p>Thomas C. Davis<br/> Harvey &amp; Battery, PA<br/> PO Box 1107<br/> 1001 Craven Street (29902)<br/> Beaufort, SC 29901-1107<br/> tdavis@harveyandbattey.com</p> |
| <p><b><i>The Protestant Episcopal Church of<br/> The Parish of Saint Philip, in<br/> Charleston, in the State of South<br/> Carolina</i></b></p> | <p>W. Foster Gaillard<br/> Womble, Bond &amp; Dickinson, LLP<br/> P.O. Box 999<br/> Charleston, SC 29402<br/> Foster.gaillard@wbd-us.com</p> <p>G. Mark Phillips<br/> Nelson Mullins Riley &amp; Scarborough,<br/> LLP<br/> PO Box 1806<br/> Charleston, SC 29402<br/> mark.phillips@nelsonmullins.com</p> <p>C. Alan Runyan, Esquire<br/> Andrew S. Platte, Esquire<br/> Runyan &amp; Platte, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239</p>  |

|   |  |
|---|--|
|   | <p>Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p>  |
| <p><b><i>The Protestant Episcopal Church,<br/> The Parish of Saint Michael, in<br/> Charleston, in the State of South<br/> Carolina</i></b></p> | <p>Henry E. Grimball<br/> WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP<br/> P.O. Box 999<br/> Charleston, SC 29402<br/> henry.grimball@wbd-us.com</p> <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p>  |
| <p><b><i>The Trustees of The Protestant<br/> Episcopal Church in South Carolina</i></b></p>   | <p>David Cox, Esquire<br/> BARNWELL WHALEY PATTERSON &amp; HELMS,<br/> LLC<br/> 288 Meeting Street<br/> Charleston, SC 29401<br/> dcox@barnwell-whaley.com</p> <p>Henrietta U. Golding<br/> BURR FORMAN MCNAIR<br/> P. O. Box 336<br/> Myrtle Beach, SC 29578<br/> hgolding@burr.com</p> <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p> <p>Charles H. Williams<br/> WILLIAMS &amp; WILLIAMS<br/> P.O. Box 1084<br/> Orangeburg, SC 29116-1084<br/> chwilliams@williamsattys.com</p> |

|  |   |
|--|---|
|  | <p>Thomas C. Davis<br/> HARVEY &amp; BATTERY, PA<br/> PO Box 1107<br/> 1001 Craven Street (29902)<br/> Beaufort, SC 29901-1107<br/> tdavis@harveyandbattey.com</p>                                      |
| <p><i>The Vestries and Churchwardens of<br/> The Parish of St. Andrews</i></p>   | <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p> |
| <p><i>The Vestry and Church Wardens of<br/> St. Jude's Church of Walterboro</i></p>  | <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p> |
| <p><i>The Vestry and Church Wardens of<br/> The Church of The Parish of St.<br/> Helena and The Parish Church of<br/> St. Helena Trust</i></p> | <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p> |
| <p><i>The Vestry and Church Wardens of<br/> The Parish of St. Matthew</i></p>  | <p>Francis Marion Mack<br/> 656 Fort Motte Road<br/> Saint Matthews, SC 29135<br/> fmmack@windstream.net</p>  |
| <p><i>The Vestry and Wardens of St.<br/> Paul's Church, Summerville</i></p>  | <p>P. Brandt Shelbourne<br/> SHELBOURNE LAW FIRM<br/> 131 E. Richardson Avenue<br/> Summerville, SC 29483<br/> brandt@shelbournelaw.com</p>   |

|  |   |
|--|---|
|  |   |
| <b><i>Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach</i></b>   | <p>James K. Lehman<br/> NELSON MULLINS RILEY &amp; SCARBOROUGH,<br/> LLP<br/> PO Box 11070<br/> Columbia, SC 29211<br/> jim.lehman@nelsonmullins.com</p> <p>Susan MacDonald, Esquire<br/> NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY &amp; SCARBOROUGH,<br/> LLP<br/> BNC Bank Corporate Center, Suite 300<br/> 3751 Robert M. Grissom Parkway<br/> Myrtle Beach, SC 29577<br/> susan.macdonald@nelsonmullins.com</p> |
| <b><i>Trinity Episcopal Church</i></b>   | <p>Andrew Spencer Platte<br/> C. Alan Runyan<br/> RUNYAN &amp; PLATTE, LLC<br/> 2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239<br/> Beaufort, SC 29902<br/> arunyan@runyanplatte.com<br/> aplatte@runyanplatte.com</p>   |
| <b><i>Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis</i></b>  | <p>P. Brandt Shelbourne<br/> SHELBOURNE LAW FIRM<br/> 131 E. Richardson Avenue<br/> Summerville, SC 29483<br/> brandt@shelbournelaw.com</p> <p>John B. Williams<br/> Williams &amp; Hulst, LLC<br/> PO Box 1288<br/> Moncks Corner, SC 29461<br/> jbw@williamsandhulst.com</p>  |
| <b><i>Vestry and Church Wardens of the Episcopal Church of The Parish of Christ Church</i></b> | <p>Allan P. Sloan, III<br/> Pierce, Sloan, Kennedy &amp; Early, LLC<br/> PO Box 22437<br/> Charleston, SC 29413<br/> chipsloan@piercesloan.com</p>  |

***Vestry and Church Wardens of The  
Episcopal Church of the Parish of  
St. John's, Charleston County***

Andrew Spencer Platte  
C. Alan Runyan  
RUNYAN & PLATTE, LLC  
2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239  
Beaufort, SC 29902  
arunyan@runyanplatte.com  
aplatte@runyanplatte.com

s/C. Alan Runyan  
*Counsel for Respondents*

## Lambert, Grayson

---

**From:** Lambert, Grayson  
**Sent:** Friday, February 12, 2021 3:13 PM  
**To:** 'aholmes@gibbs-holmes.com'; 'dbeers@goodwinlaw.com'; 'tst@hellmanyates.com'; 'js@hellmanyates.com'; 'katie@monoclaw.com'; 'kbarnes@barneslawfirmssc.com'; 'bert@cfulaw.com'; 'mkostel@episcopalchurch.org'  
**Cc:** 'Alan Runyan'; 'Andrew Platte'; 'C. Mitchell Brown (mitch.brown@nelsonmullins.com)'; Golding, Henrietta; 'pcampbell@turnerpadget.com'; 'tdavis@harveyandbattey.com'; 'ikeithmccarty@gmail.com'; 'bdurant@sowelldurant.com'; 'Biff Sowell'; 'rhorger@hbrllp.com'; 'bscott@pslawpc.com'; 'hreasterling@gmail.com'; 'mevans14@bellsouth.net'; 'henry.grimball@wbd-us.com'; 'dave@marvel.lawyer'; 'walljohn@bellsouth.net'; 'billbryan@bryanandhaar.net'; 'dcox@barnwell-whaley.com'; 'chwilliams@williamsattys.com'; 'Foster.gaillard@wbd-us.com'; 'mark.phillips@nelsonmullins.com'; 'fmmack@windstream.net'; 'brandt@shelbournelaw.com'; 'jim.lehman@nelsonmullins.com'; 'susan.macdonald@nelsonmullins.com'; 'jbw@williamsandhulst.com'; 'chipsloan@piercesloan.com'  
**Subject:** RE: The Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of South Carolina, et al. v. The Episcopal Church, et al. - Appellate Court Case No. 2020-000986  
**Attachments:** No. 2020-000986 - Initial Brief of Respondents.pdf; No. 2020-000986 - Respondents's Designation of Matter for the Record on Appeal.pdf

### Counsel:

One email address for Appellants' counsel was incorrect. It is corrected here, and the brief and record designations are attached again.

---

**From:** Lambert, Grayson  
**Sent:** Friday, February 12, 2021 3:09 PM  
**To:** 'aholmes@gibbs-holmes.com' <aholmes@gibbs-holmes.com>; 'mkostel@goodwinlaw.com' <mkostel@goodwinlaw.com>; 'dbeers@goodwinlaw.com' <dbeers@goodwinlaw.com>; 'tst@hellmanyates.com' <tst@hellmanyates.com>; 'js@hellmanyates.com' <js@hellmanyates.com>; 'katie@monoclaw.com' <katie@monoclaw.com>; 'kbarnes@barneslawfirmssc.com' <kbarnes@barneslawfirmssc.com>; 'bert@cfulaw.com' <bert@cfulaw.com>  
**Cc:** 'Alan Runyan' <arunyan@runyanplatte.com>; Andrew Platte <aplatte@runyanplatte.com>; C. Mitchell Brown (mitch.brown@nelsonmullins.com) <mitch.brown@nelsonmullins.com>; Golding, Henrietta <hgolding@burr.com>; 'pcampbell@turnerpadget.com' <pcampbell@turnerpadget.com>; 'tdavis@harveyandbattey.com' <tdavis@harveyandbattey.com>; 'ikeithmccarty@gmail.com' <ikeithmccarty@gmail.com>; 'bdurant@sowelldurant.com' <bdurant@sowelldurant.com>; Biff Sowell <bsowell@sowelldurant.com>; 'rhorger@hbrllp.com' <rhorger@hbrllp.com>; 'bscott@pslawpc.com' <bscott@pslawpc.com>; 'hreasterling@gmail.com' <hreasterling@gmail.com>; 'mevans14@bellsouth.net' <mevans14@bellsouth.net>; 'henry.grimball@wbd-us.com' <henry.grimball@wbd-us.com>; 'dave@marvel.lawyer' <dave@marvel.lawyer>; 'walljohn@bellsouth.net' <walljohn@bellsouth.net>; 'billbryan@bryanandhaar.net' <billbryan@bryanandhaar.net>; 'dcox@barnwell-whaley.com' <dcox@barnwell-whaley.com>; 'chwilliams@williamsattys.com' <chwilliams@williamsattys.com>; 'Foster.gaillard@wbd-us.com' <Foster.gaillard@wbd-us.com>; 'mark.phillips@nelsonmullins.com' <mark.phillips@nelsonmullins.com>; 'fmmack@windstream.net' <fmmack@windstream.net>; 'brandt@shelbournelaw.com' <brandt@shelbournelaw.com>; 'jim.lehman@nelsonmullins.com' <jim.lehman@nelsonmullins.com>; 'susan.macdonald@nelsonmullins.com' <susan.macdonald@nelsonmullins.com>; 'jbw@williamsandhulst.com' <jbw@williamsandhulst.com>; 'chipsloan@piercesloan.com' <chipsloan@piercesloan.com>

**Subject:** The Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of South Carolina, et al. v. The Episcopal Church, et al. - Appellate Court Case No. 2020-000986

Counsel:

Please find attached Respondents' initial brief and designation of matter for the record on appeal.

Regards,  
Grayson Lambert