

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
IN THE SUPREME COURT

**RECEIVED**

**Mar 26 2021**

**S.C. SUPREME COURT**

---

APPEAL FROM CHARLESTON COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas

G. Thomas Cooper, Jr., Circuit Court Judge

---

Supreme Court Case No. 2020-000445

Appellate Case No. 2016-001140

Case No. 2011-CP-10-00387

---

PCS Nitrogen, Inc. .... Petitioner,

vs.

Continental Casualty Company, Admiral Insurance Company,  
United States Fire Insurance Company, Certain Underwriters at  
Lloyd's London, the Aviva Companies, the Winterthur  
Companies, Certain London Market Insurance Companies,  
Providence Washington Insurance Company (as successor in  
Interest by way of Merger to Seaton Insurance Company, f/k/a  
Unigard Security Insurance, f/k/a Unigard Mutual Insurance  
Company), Berkshire Hathaway Specialty Insurance Company  
(f/k/a Stonewall Insurance Company), Lexington Insurance  
Company, Starr Indemnity & Liability Company (f/k/a Republic  
Insurance Company), and First State Insurance Company,

..... Respondents.

**PROOF OF SERVICE**

I certify that I have served the Brief of Respondents on all attorneys of record via electronic mail only, on this the 26th day of March 2021, addressed to all attorneys as shown below:

Wm. Howell Morrison, Esq.  
Sarah Spruill, Esq.  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, P.A.  
One North Main, Second Floor  
Greenville, SC 29601  
(864) 240-32—  
hmorrison@hsblaw.com  
sspruill@hsblaw.com  
*Attorneys for Petitioner PCS Nitrogen, Inc.*

Michael H. Ginsberg, Esq.  
Matthew R. Divelbiss, Esq.  
Jones Day  
500 Grant Street, 45th Floor  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
(412) 391-3939  
mhginsberg@jonesday.com  
mrdivelbiss@jonesday.com  
*Attorneys for Petitioner PCS Nitrogen, Inc.*

J. R. Murphy, Esq.  
Wesley Brian Sawyer, Esq.  
Murphy & Grantland, P.A.  
P.O. Box 6648  
Columbia, SC 29260  
(803) 782-4100  
jrmurphy@murphygrantland.com  
wsawyer@murphygrantland.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent Admiral Insurance Co.*

John S. Favate, Esq.  
Hardin, Kundla, McKeon & Poletto  
673 Morris Avenue  
Springfield, NJ 07081  
(973) 912-5222  
jfavate@hkmp.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent United States Fire Ins. Co. (for policy no. 5401893627)*

Christian Stegmaier, Esq.  
Collins & Lacy, P.C.  
P.O. Box 12487  
Columbia, SC 29211  
(803) 256-2660  
swallinger@collinsandlacy.com  
cstegmaier@collinsandlacy.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent United States Fire Insurance Company (for policy no. 5401893627)*

Morgan S. Templeton, Esq.  
Wall Templeton & Haldrup, P.A.  
P.O. Box 1200  
145 King Street, Suite 300 (29401)  
Charleston, SC 29402  
(843) 329-9500  
Morgan.templeton@walltempleton.com  
*Attorney for Respondent Continental Casualty Co.*

Richard McDermott, Esq.  
Seth M. Jaffe, Esq.  
Hinkhouse Williams Walsh, LLP  
180 North Stetson Avenue, Suite 3400  
Chicago, IL 60601  
(312) 784-5400  
rmcdermott@hww-law.com  
sjaffe@hww-law.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's of London, Certain Aviva Companies, Certain Winterthur Companies, Berkshire Hathaway Specialty Insurance Company (f/k/a Stonewall Insurance Company), Starr Indemnity & Liability Company (f/k/a/ Republic Insurance Company), New London Reinsurance Company Limited and The Scottish Lion Insurance*

*Company Limited (identified as among the Certain London Insurance Companies)*

Edward K. Pritchard, III, Esq.  
Pritchard Law Group, LLC  
P.O. Box 630  
Charleston, SC 29402  
(843) 722-3300  
epritchard@pritchardlawgroup.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's of London, Certain Aviva Companies, Certain Winterthur Companies, Berkshire Hathaway Specialty Insurance Company (f/k/a Stonewall Insurance Company), Starr Indemnity & Liability Company (f/k/a/ Republic Insurance Company), New London Reinsurance Company Limited and The Scottish Lion Insurance Company Limited (identified as among the Certain London Insurance Companies)*

John C. Bonnie, Esq.  
Steve Rapp, Esq.  
Weinberg Wheeler Hudgins Gunn & Dial, LLC  
3344 Peachtree Road NE, Suite 2400  
Atlanta, GA 30326  
(404) 876-2700  
jbonnie@wwhgd.com  
SRapp@wwhgd.com  
*Attorney for Respondent Lexington Insurance Company*

Elizabeth J. Palmer, Esq.  
Rosen, Rose & Hagood, LLC  
151 Meeting Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
(843) 577-6726  
epalmer@rrhlawfirm.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent Providence Washington Insurance Company (as Successor in Interest by way of Merger to Seaton Insurance Company, f/k/a Unigard Security Insurance Company, f/k/a Unigard Mutual Insurance Company)*

Molly Poag, Esq.  
Harry Lee, Esq.  
Steptoe & Johnson, LLP  
1330 Connecticut Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
(202) 429-8091  
mpoag@steptoe.com  
hlee@steptoe.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent Providence Washington Insurance Company (as Successor in Interest by way of Merger to Seaton Insurance Company, f/k/a Unigard Security Insurance Company, f/k/a Unigard Mutual Insurance Company)*

Paul Parker, Esq.  
Wayne S. Karbal, Esq.  
Karbal Cohen Economou Silk & Dunne, LLC  
150 S. Wacker Drive, Suite 1700  
Chicago, IL 60606  
(312) 431-3623  
pparker@karballaw.com  
wkarbal@karballaw.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent First State Insurance Company*

John T. Lay, Esq.  
Laura W. Jordan, Esq.  
Gallivan, White & Boyd, P.A.  
1201 Main Street, Suite 1200  
Columbia, SC 29201  
jlay@gwblawfirm.com  
ljordan@gwblawfirm.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent Certain London Market Insurance Companies*

R. Michael Ethridge, Esq.  
Suzanne E. Deters, Esq.  
Ethridge Law Group 1100  
Queensborough Blvd., Suite 200 Mt.  
Pleasant, SC 29464  
methridge@ethridgelawgroup.com  
sdeters@ethridgelawgroup.com  
*Attorneys for Respondent First State  
Insurance Company*

Helen Franzese, Esq.  
Foran Glennon (UK), LLP  
11 Leadenhall Street  
London, EC3V 1LP  
+44 (0) 20 3530 7754  
hfranzese@foranglenon.co.uk  
*Attorneys for Respondent Certain London  
Market Insurance Companies*



---

Patrick F. Hofer (*pro hac vice*)  
Clyde & Co US LLP  
1775 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 400  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
(202) 747-5110

*Counsel for Respondent Continental  
Casualty Company*