

THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
In The Supreme Court

---

RECEIVED

Apr 23 2021

S.C. SUPREME COURT

APPEAL FROM DORCHESTER COUNTY  
Court of Common Pleas  
Edgar W. Dickson, Circuit Court Judge

---

Appellate Case No. 2020-000986

---

The Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of South Carolina; The Trustees of The Protestant Episcopal Church in South Carolina, a South Carolina Corporate Body; All Saints Protestant Episcopal Church, Inc.; Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church; Church of The Cross, Inc. and Church of the Cross Declaration of Trust; Church of The Holy Comforter; Church of the Redeemer; Holy Trinity Episcopal Church; Saint Luke's Church, Hilton Head; St. Bartholomew's Episcopal Church; St. David's Church; St. James' Church, James Island, S.C.; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Bennettsville, Inc.; The Church of St. Luke and St. Paul, Radcliffeboro; The Church of Our Saviour of the Diocese of South Carolina; The Church of the Epiphany (Episcopal); The Church of the Good Shepherd, Charleston, S.C.; The Church of The Holy Cross; The Church of The Resurrection, Surfside; The Protestant Episcopal Church of The Parish of Saint Philip, in Charleston, in the State of South Carolina; The Protestant Episcopal Church, The Parish of Saint Michael, in Charleston, in the State of South Carolina and St. Michael's Church Declaration of Trust; The Vestry and Church Wardens of St. Jude's Church of Walterboro; The Vestry and Church Wardens of The Church of The Parish of St. Helena and The Parish Church of St. Helena Trust; The Vestry and Church Wardens of The Parish of St. Matthew; The Vestry and Wardens of St. Paul's Church, Summerville; Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach; Trinity Episcopal Church; Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis; Vestry and Church Wardens of the Episcopal Church of The Parish of Christ Church; Vestry and Church Wardens of The Episcopal Church of the Parish of St. John's, Charleston County; and The Vestries and Churchwardens of The Parish of St. Andrews

..... Respondents,

v.

The Episcopal Church (a/k/a The Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America) and The Episcopal Church in South Carolina,

..... Appellants.

---

PROOF OF SERVICE

---

The undersigned certifies that this day he served a copy of the AMENDED DESIGANTION OF MATTER TO BE INCLUDED IN THE RECORD ON APPEAL via electronic mail addressed to counsel of record:

Francis M. Mack, Esq.  
656 Fort Motte Road  
Saint Matthews, SC 29135  
[fmmack@windstream.net](mailto:fmmack@windstream.net)  
Attorney for Vestry/Wardens – Episcopal Church/St. Matthews Parish

C. Pierce Campbell, Esq.  
TURNER, PADGET, GRAHAM & LANEY  
319 South Irby Street, P.O. Box 5478  
Florence, SC 29501  
[pcampbell@turnerpadget.com](mailto:pcampbell@turnerpadget.com)  
Attorneys for All Saints Protestant Episcopal Church, Inc, St. Bartholomews Episcopal Church, Church of the Holy Cross

Allan P. Sloan, III, Esq.  
PIERCE, SLOAN, WILSON, KENNEDY & EARLY, LLC  
321 East Bay Street; P.O. Box 22437  
Charleston, SC 29413  
[chipsloan@piercesloan.com](mailto:chipsloan@piercesloan.com)  
Attorneys for Vestry/Wardens/Epis. Church/Parish of Christ

Thomas C. Davis, Esq.  
HARVEY & BATTEY, PA  
1001 Craven Street  
Beaufort, SC 29901  
[tdavis@harveyandbattey.com](mailto:tdavis@harveyandbattey.com)  
Attorneys for Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church

C. Alan Runyan, Esq.  
Andrew S. Platte, Esq.  
RUNYAN & PLATTE, LLC  
2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239  
Beaufort, SC 29902  
[arunyan@runyanplatte.com](mailto:arunyan@runyanplatte.com); [aplatte@runyanplatte.com](mailto:aplatte@runyanplatte.com)  
Attorneys for Protestant Episcopal Church In The Diocese Of South Carolina, Church Of The Cross, Inc. and Church Of The Cross Declaration of Trust, Church Of Our Savior, Of The Diocese of South Carolina, Protestant Episcopal Church, Parish Of Saint Phillip, Protestant Episcopal Church, Parish Of Saint Michael, In, Vestry/Wardens-Episcopal/St Helena/St. Helena Trust, St. David's Church, Vestry/ Wardens-Episcopal/Parish of St. John's Chas Cty, Church of the Epiphany (Episcopal), Trinity Episcopal Church, Edisto Island, Vestry/Wardens – Episcopal Church/St. Jude's of Walterboro

Susan MacDonald, Esq.  
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP  
BNC Bank Corporate Center, Suite 300  
3751 Robert M. Grissom Parkway  
Myrtle Beach, SC 29577  
[susan.macdonald@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:susan.macdonald@nelsonmullins.com)  
Attorneys for Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach

John Furman Wall, Esq.  
140 Wando Reach Court  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
[walljohn@bellsouth.net](mailto:walljohn@bellsouth.net)  
Attorney for Church Of The Good Shepherd, Charleston, SC

G. Mark Phillips, Esq.  
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP  
Liberty Center, Suite 600  
151 Meeting Street  
Charleston, SC 29401-2239  
[mark.phillips@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:mark.phillips@nelsonmullins.com)  
Attorneys for Protestant Epis.Ch, Parish Of Saint Phillip

Mark V. Evans, Esq.  
147 Wappoo Creek Drive, Ste. 202  
Charleston, SC 29412  
[mevans14@bellsouth.net](mailto:mevans14@bellsouth.net)  
Attorneys for St James' Church, James Island, S. C.

James Kent Lehman, Esquire  
PO Box 11070  
Columbia, SC 29211  
[jim.lehman@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:jim.lehman@nelsonmullins.com)  
Attorney for Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach

William A. Scott, Esq.  
PEDERSEN & SCOTT, PC  
775 St. Andrews Blvd.  
Charleston, SC 29407  
[bscott@pslawpc.com](mailto:bscott@pslawpc.com)  
Attorney for Holy Trinity Episcopal Church

David L. DeVane, Esq.  
110 N. Main Street  
Summerville, SC 29483  
[david@devanemacklaw.com](mailto:david@devanemacklaw.com)  
Attorney for Church Of St. Luke and St. Paul, Radcliffeboro

David B. Marvel, Esq.  
DAVID B. MARVEL, LLC  
P.O. Box 22734  
Charleston, SC 29413  
[dave@marvel.lawyer](mailto:dave@marvel.lawyer)  
Attorney for Church Of St. Luke and St. Paul, Radcliffeboro

Henry E. Grimball, Esquire  
WOMBLE Bond Dickison (US) LLP  
P.O. Box 999  
Charleston, SC 29402  
[henry.grimball@wbd-us.com](mailto:henry.grimball@wbd-us.com)  
Attorneys The Protestant Episcopal Church, The Parish Of St. Michael, In Charleston, In The State of South Carolina and St. Michael's Church Declaration Of Trust

Peter Brandt Shelbourne, Esq.  
SHELBOURNE LAW FIRM  
131 E. Richardson Avenue  
Summerville, SC 29483  
[brandt@shelbournelaw.com](mailto:brandt@shelbournelaw.com)  
Attorneys for Vestry/Wardens - St. Paul's Church, Summerville, Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis

David S. Cox, Esq.  
BARNWELL WHALEY PATTERSON & HELMS, LLC  
288 Meeting Street, Suite 200  
Charleston, SC 29401  
[dc Cox@barnwell-whaley.com](mailto:dc Cox@barnwell-whaley.com)  
Attorneys for Protestant Episcopal Church In The Diocese Of South Carolina, Trustees of Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of SC

Charles H. Williams, Esq.  
WILLIAMS & WILLIAMS  
P.O. Box 1084  
Orangeburg, SC 29116-1084  
[chwilliams@williamsattys.com](mailto:chwilliams@williamsattys.com)  
Attorneys for Protestant Episcopal Church In The Diocese Of South Carolina, Trustees of Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of SC

Henrietta U. Golding, Esq.  
BURR FORMAN & McNAIR  
P.O. Box336  
Myrtle Beach, SC 29578  
[hgolding@burr.com](mailto:hgolding@burr.com)

Attorneys for Protestant Episcopal Church In The Diocese Of South Carolina, Saint Luke's Church, Hilton Head, Trustees of Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of SC

Robert R. Horger, Esq.  
HORGER, BARNWELL & REID, LLP  
P.O. Drawer 329  
1459 Amelia Street  
Orangeburg, SC 29115  
[rhorger@hbrllp.com](mailto:rhorger@hbrllp.com)  
Attorneys for Church Of The Redeemer

Thornwell F. Sowell, Esq,  
Bess J. DuRant, Esq.  
SOWELL & DuRANT, LLC  
1325 Park Street, Suite 100  
Columbia, SC 29201  
[bsowell@sowelldurant.com](mailto:bsowell@sowelldurant.com)  
[bdurant@sowelldurant.com](mailto:bdurant@sowelldurant.com)  
Attorneys for Church Of The Holy Comforter

Joseph C. Wilson, IV, Esq.  
JOSEPH C., WILSON LAW FIRM, LLC  
PO Box 178  
Folly Beach, SC 29439  
[jcamwilsoniv@gmail.com](mailto:jcamwilsoniv@gmail.com)  
Attorneys for Vestry/Wardens/Epis.Church/Parish of Christ

William A. Bryan, Esq.  
BRYAN & HAAR  
P.O. Box 14860  
Surfside Beach, SC 29587  
[billbryan@bryanandhaar.net](mailto:billbryan@bryanandhaar.net)  
Attorneys for Church of the Resurrection, Surfside

I. Keith McCarty, Esq.  
McCARTY LAW FIRM, LLC  
P.O. Box 30055  
Charleston, SC 29417  
[ikeithmccarty@gmail.com](mailto:ikeithmccarty@gmail.com)  
Attorneys for Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church

Harry Easterling, Jr., Esq.  
120 North Liberty Street  
Post Office Box 611  
Bennettsville, SC 29512  
[hreasterling@gmail.com](mailto:hreasterling@gmail.com)  
Attorneys for St. Davids Church, St. Paul's Episcopal Church/Bennettsville, Inc

W. Foster Gaillard, Esq.  
WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP  
P.O. Box 999  
Charleston, SC 29402  
[foster.gaillard@wbd-us.com](mailto:foster.gaillard@wbd-us.com)  
Attorneys for Protestant Epis.Ch, Parish Of Saint Phillip

Edward P. Guerard, Jr.  
1106 Port Harbor Court  
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464  
[tguerardjr@gmail.com](mailto:tguerardjr@gmail.com)  
Attorneys for Vestry/Wardens/Epis. Church/Parish of Christ

C. Mitchell Brown, Esq.  
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH  
1320 Main Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Post Office Box 11070  
Columbia, SC 29211-1070  
[mitch.brown@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:mitch.brown@nelsonmullins.com)  
Attorneys for The Protestant Episcopal Church In The Diocese of South Carolina; and The Trustees of the Protestant Episcopal Church of South Carolina, a South Carolina Corporate Body

John B. Williams, Esquire  
WILLIAMS & HULST, LLC  
209 East Main Street  
Moncks Comer, SC 29461  
[jbw@williamsandhulst.com](mailto:jbw@williamsandhulst.com)  
Attorneys for Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis

*/s/ Bert G. Utsey, III*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Bert G. Utsey, III  
Attorney for Appellants

April 23, 2021  
Charleston, South Carolina

**From:** [Hilda Davis](#)  
**To:** [FMMack@windstream.net](mailto:FMMack@windstream.net); [pcampbell@turnerpadget.com](mailto:pcampbell@turnerpadget.com); [chipsloan@piercesloan.com](mailto:chipsloan@piercesloan.com); Tom Davis; Alan Runyan; Andrew Platte; Susan MacDonald; [waijohn@bellsouth.net](mailto:waijohn@bellsouth.net); Mark Phillips; [mevans14@bellsouth.net](mailto:mevans14@bellsouth.net); Jim Lehman; [bscott@pslawpc.com](mailto:bscott@pslawpc.com)"; [david@devanemacklaw.com](mailto:david@devanemacklaw.com); [dave@marvel.lawyer](mailto:dave@marvel.lawyer); [henry.grimball@wbd-us.com](mailto:henry.grimball@wbd-us.com); Shelbourne, Brandt; David Cox; Charles Williams; Golding, Henrietta; [rhoger@hbrlp.com](mailto:rhoger@hbrlp.com); [bsowell@sowelldurant.com](mailto:bsowell@sowelldurant.com); [bdurant@sowelldurant.com](mailto:bdurant@sowelldurant.com); [jcamwilsoniv@gmail.com](mailto:jcamwilsoniv@gmail.com); [BillBryan@bryanandhaar.net](mailto:BillBryan@bryanandhaar.net); [ikeithmccarty@gmail.com](mailto:ikeithmccarty@gmail.com); [hreasterling@gmail.com](mailto:hreasterling@gmail.com); Gaillard, Foster; [tquerardjr@gmail.com](mailto:tquerardjr@gmail.com); Mitch Brown; [jbw@williamsandhulst.com](mailto:jbw@williamsandhulst.com)  
**Cc:** [Thomas Tisdale](mailto:Thomas.Tisdale); [Jason Smith](mailto:Jason.Smith); [katie@monocroberts.com](mailto:katie@monocroberts.com); [kbarnes@barneslawfirm.com](mailto:kbarnes@barneslawfirm.com); [aholmes@gibbs-holmes.com](mailto:aholmes@gibbs-holmes.com); [dbeers@goodwinlaw.com](mailto:dbeers@goodwinlaw.com); [Mary Kostel](#); [Bert Utsey](#)  
**Subject:** The Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of South Carolina, et al. v. The Episcopal Church, et al. - Appellate Case No. 2020-000986  
**Date:** Friday, April 23, 2021 11:28:03 AM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[Amended Designations.pdf](#)  
[ROA 4853A - Transcript of Nov.19, 2018 pg. 47.pdf](#)  
[ROA 4853B - Transcript of Nov 19, 2018 pg. 48.pdf](#)  
[Proof Svc - Amended Designation.pdf](#)

---

Dear Counsel,

Attached is an Amended Designation of Matter To Be Included In The Record On Appeal, together with pages ROA 4853A and ROA 4853B added to Volume XI of the ROA.

You may download the complete Volume XI (with pages ROA 4853A and ROA 4853B) utilizing the following link: <https://www.dropbox.com/t/qAh9nKOCujAPLWh9>

Kind regards,



Hildegard L. Davis  
Legal Assistant to Bert G. Utsey, III  
706 Orleans Road, Suite 101  
Charleston, SC 29407  
(843) 970-2700 office  
(843) 823-7523 direct  
[hilda@cfulaw.com](mailto:hilda@cfulaw.com)

***This e-mail and the information transmitted contains PRIVILEGED and CONFIDENTIAL information and is the property of the sender. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination or copying of this information, or the taking of any action in reliance on the content of this information, is strictly prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify sender immediately and delete the original transmittal of this information.***